THE RESTRUCTURING OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT WITH SPECIFIC REFERENCE TO THE CITY OF TSHWANE

by

BELINDA HAVENGA

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements of the degree

Doctor Philosophiae (Public Administration)

In the Faculty Humanity

University of Pretoria

SUPERVISOR: PROF. DR. D.J. FOURIE

PRETORIA

OCTOBER 2002

© University of Pretoria
This research seeks to build a conceptual framework that can assist in guiding the process of local government restructuring and the impact thereof on the community it serves. The framework emphasizes looking beyond the legislative framework and evaluating the restructuring of local government to include all deliberate and purposive courses of action that are intended to lead to new or modified systems of local government, to significant arrangements for redistributing responsibilities for major developmental functions, and to increased public participation in policy-making and action at a local level.

In order to meet the objectives of this investigation, a literature study was undertaken. Salient themes regarding the restructuring of local government were located in existing legislation, public administration texts, in management theories and in research studies.

The aims of this study were to:

a) analyze the emergence of local government in South Africa, which contributed to the manifestation of the apartheid value system and the separation of racial communities;

b) clarify the need for local government restructuring to address imbalances and inequities of past legislation;

c) identify the administrative and legislative processes which culminated in the formulation of a legislative local government restructuring model;

d) assess the impact of the local government restructuring model on local authorities, with specific reference to the City of Tshwane; and

e) identify and evaluate international restructuring principles and experience against South African local government restructuring, with specific reference to the City of Tshwane and to draw conclusion.
In achieving these five research objectives, the aim of this thesis was to recommend a local government category for the City of Tshwane, which would ensure that the intended purpose of local government restructuring is met in an efficient and democratic manner.

The recommended local government category for the City of Tshwane in the final restructuring phase is premised on less local government and strengthened local authorities that will preserve local community identity for residents and businesses and promote the efficient use of resources. In order to ensure efficient and democratic regional service delivery, the establishment of a City of Tshwane Services Board is recommended.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The Almighty God created all of mankind as spiritual beings – in his image. What we make of our human experience is a matter of personal choice. Some acquire knowledge and wisdom as they progress along the path of life others choose to pursue it more deliberately, being aware of the fact that life has an eternal dimension.

The journey of discovering knowledge and wisdom is a challenging path. It takes one through dark valleys of uncertainty and to exhilarating heights of celebration and joy. There are opportunities for rest along the way – stops to question and silently reason, but they are in reality intersections of uncertainty and exit roads to end the journey. It is the solidarity moments of questioning and reasoning where one discovers that choices are decided by value judgement of the jury in one’s soul.

I met many people along the way, and made valuable friends. A special word of “thank you”, Professor Dr. David Fourie, for your excellent promotion and supervision. This study would not have been possible without your active guidance and support.

My husband, Lukas, thank you for your trust and encouragement throughout the challenging study years.

My parents, Carol and Tots, thank you for your guidance and support.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## CHAPTER 1: RESEARCH PROBLEM AND RESEARCH DESIGN

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1. INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2. PROBLEM STATEMENT AND HYPOTHESIS</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3. RESEARCH AIMS AND OBJECTIVES</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4. RESEARCH APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5. CLARIFICATION OF TERMINOLOGY</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.1. APARTHEID</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.2. CITY OF TSHWANE METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITY</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.3. DEMOCRACY</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.4. GOVERN</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.5. GOVERNANCE</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.6. GREATER PRETORIA METROPOLITAN AREA (GPMA)</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.7. LOCAL AUTHORITY</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.8. LOCAL GOVERNMENT</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.9. METROPOLIS AND METROPOLITAN AREA</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.10. MUNICIPAL ADMINISTRATION</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.11. MUNICIPAL COUNCIL</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.12. MUNICIPAL GOVERNMENT</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.13. MUNICIPALITY</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.14. PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.15. RACIAL CATEGORISATION</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.16. RESTRUCTURING</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5.17. URBANIZATION</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6. STRUCTURE OF RESEARCH</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7. CONCLUSION</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 2: A CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENT

2.1. INTRODUCTION 22

2.2. ORIGINS AND CHARACTERISTICS OF URBAN AREAS 23

2.3. SOVEREIGNTY AND GOVERNMENT 25

2.4. SPHERES OF GOVERNMENT IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN CONTEXT 26
  2.4.1. CENTRAL/NATIONAL GOVERNMENT 28
  2.4.2. PROVINCIAL/REGIONAL GOVERNMENT 28
  2.4.3. MUNICIPAL/LOCAL GOVERNMENT 28

2.5. AN INTRODUCTION TO PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION 29
  2.5.1. DEFINING PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION 30
  2.5.2. PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION APPROACHES 30
    2.5.2.1. CLOETE: TRADITIONAL APPROACH 31
    2.5.2.1.1. CRITICISM OF CLOETE'S APPROACH 36
    2.5.2.2. SCHWELLA: INNOVATIVE APPROACH 37
    2.5.2.3. AN ADAPTATION OF THE CLOETE-SCHWELLA APPROACH 43
  2.5.3. NORMATIVE GUIDELINES OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION 45

2.6. CONCLUSION 49
CHAPTER 3: THE ROLE AND PURPOSE OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT

3.1. INTRODUCTION 50

3.2. DEFINING A LOCAL GOVERNMENT 50
3.2.1. LOCAL AUTHORITY 54

3.3. LOCAL GOVERNMENT DEMOCRACY 55
3.3.1. LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND DEMOCRATIC VALUES 55

3.4. THE SIGNIFICANCE OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT 57
3.4.1. TRAINING GROUND FOR MASS POLITICAL EDUCATION 58
3.4.2. TRAINING GROUND FOR POLITICAL LEADERSHIP 59
3.4.3. FACILITATION OF GOVERNMENT ACCOUNTABILITY 60

3.5. THE STRUCTURE OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT 62
3.5.1. THE COUNCIL 63
3.5.1.1. THE COUNCIL CHAIRPERSON AND THE SECRETARY 64
3.5.2. THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE 65
3.5.3. SPECIAL AND STANDING COMMITTEES OF COUNCIL 67
3.5.4. THE CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER 70
3.5.5. THE STAFF OF A LOCAL GOVERNMENT 71
3.5.6. THE DEPARTMENTAL HEADS 72

3.6. CONCERNS IN RESTRUCTURING LOCAL GOVERNMENT 73
3.6.1. PRINCIPLES OF GOOD GOVERNMENT 74
3.6.2. PRINCIPLE OF MEGAPOLITICS AND INCREASING GLOBALIZATION 77
3.6.3. LEGAL PRINCIPLES 79
3.6.4. THE URBAN ENVIRONMENT 80
3.6.5. THE SOCIO-POLITICAL DIMENSION 81
3.6.5.1. A SOCIO-POLITICAL SYSTEM ANALYSIS 82
3.6.6. PRINCIPLES OF BALANCED APPLICATION OF ALL
CHAPTER 4: THE RESTRUCTURING OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT IN SOUTH AFRICA: A HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE UP TO 1994

4.1. INTRODUCTION 90

4.2. EMERGENCE OF LOCAL AUTHORITIES 91

4.3. DEVELOPMENT OF LOCAL AUTHORITIES FOR THE URBAN AREAS POPULATED BY NON-WHITES 94
4.3.1. BLACK URBAN AREAS 94
4.3.2. COLOURED AND INDIAN AREAS 98

4.4. REGIONALISED STRUCTURES FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENT 99

4.5. RESTRUCTURING OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT: 1990-1994 102
4.5.1. COUNCIL FOR THE CO-ORDINATION OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AFFAIRS 102
4.5.2. CONSTITUTION OF THE REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA ACT (ACT 200 OF 1993) 105
4.5.3. LOCAL GOVERNMENT NEGOTIATING FORUM (LGNF) 107
4.5.4. THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT DEMOCRATIZATION PROCESS 111

4.6. CONCLUSION 112
# CHAPTER 5: THE RESTRUCTURING OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT IN SOUTH AFRICA IN THE PRE-INTERIM AND INTERIM PHASES

## 5.1. INTRODUCTION

## 5.2. APPLICATION OF THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT TRANSITION ACT (ACT 209 OF 1993) IN THE PRE-INTERIM PHASE

### 5.2.1. APPOINTED COUNCILS

### 5.2.2. LOCAL NEGOTIATED FORUMS

### 5.2.3. TRANSITIONAL MODELS

### 5.2.4. EXEMPTIONS FROM THE PRE-INTERIM PHASE

### 5.2.5. PROVINCIAL COMMITTEES

### 5.2.6. DEMARCATION BOARDS

### 5.2.7. CATEGORIES OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT

#### 5.2.7.1. METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT

## 5.3. INTERIM PHASE: ELECTED COUNCILS

### 5.3.1. VOTER QUALIFICATIONS

### 5.3.2. POWERS AND FUNCTIONS OF LOCAL GOVERNMENTS

### 5.3.3. DECISION-MAKING

### 5.3.4. ADMINISTRATION

### 5.3.5. WARD COUNCILS

### 5.3.6. RURAL LOCAL GOVERNMENT

### 5.3.7. THE CONSTITUTIONAL STATUS OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT

## 5.4. EVALUATING THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT NEGOTIATION FORUM AND THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT TRANSITION ACT (ACT 209 OF 1993)

### 5.4.1. REPRESENTATIVITY

### 5.4.2. ACCOUNTABILITIVITY

### 5.4.3. LACK OF GUIDELINES
5.4.4. HETEROGENEITY VERSUS HOMOGENEITY OF DELEGATIONS 145

5.4.5. THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT TRANSITION ACT (LGTA) – POORLY FRAMED LEGISLATION 145

5.4.6. METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT 146

5.5. CONCLUSION 146

CHAPTER 6: RESTRUCTURING OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT IN SOUTH AFRICA TOWARDS THE FINAL PHASE

6.1. INTRODUCTION 148

6.2. EMERGENCE OF THE FINAL CONSTITUTION 148

6.3. CONSTITUTION OF THE REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA, ACT 108 OF 1996 150

6.3.1. LOCAL GOVERNMENT 152

6.3.2. OBJECTIVES AND DEVELOPMENT DUTIES OF MUNICIPALITIES 156

6.3.3. ESTABLISHMENT OF MUNICIPALITIES 158

6.3.4. DEMARCATION OF BOUNDARIES 160

6.3.5. TRANSITIONAL ARRANGEMENTS 164

6.4. THE WHITE PAPER ON LOCAL GOVERNMENT 165

6.5. LOCAL GOVERNMENT MUNICIPAL STRUCTURES ACT, ACT 117 OF 1998 166
6.5.1. CATEGORIES OF LOCAL AUTHORITIES 167

6.6. CO-OPERATIVE GOVERNANCE 169

6.7. CONCLUSION 170

CHAPTER 7: RESTRUCTURING OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT IN THE GREATER PRETORIA AREA IN THE PRE-INTERIM PHASE

7.1. INTRODUCTION 174

7.2. NATURE AND HISTORY OF METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT AND ADMINISTRATION 175

7.2.1. DIMENSIONS OF METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT SYSTEMS 177

7.3. LOCAL GOVERNMENT NEGOTIATIONS OF THE GREATER PRETORIA REGION 179

7.4. GREATER PRETORIA METROPOLITAN NEGOTIATING FORUM 181

7.5. THE TRANSITIONAL METROPOLITAN COUNCIL AND THE PRETORIA REGIONAL SERVICES COUNCIL 186

7.5.1. SIGNING OF AGREEMENT 190

7.6. RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE METROPOLITAN COUNCIL AND THE SUBSTRUCTURES 192

7.7. EVALUATING THE PRE-INTERIM PHASE 194

7.8. RESTRUCTURING OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT IN
CHAPTER 8: AN INTRODUCTION TO THE GREATER PRETORIA METROPOLITAN AREA IN THE INTERIM PHASE (1 NOVEMBER 1995 UP TO 5 DECEMBER 2000)

8.1. INTRODUCTION 202

8.2. LOCAL SPHERE OF GOVERNMENT IN THE INTERIM PHASE 203

8.3. PRETORIA IN NATIONAL SOCIO-ECONOMIC CONTEXT 203
8.3.1. BROAD DIMENSIONS OF METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT 206
8.3.2. FINANCIAL STATUS OF LOCAL AUTHORITIES IN THE GREATER PRETORIA AREA 208
8.3.3. COUNCILLOR REPRESENTATION 209
8.3.4. HUMAN RESOURCE STRUCTURES 210
8.3.5. DETAILED FINANCIAL ANALYSIS AND TRENDS 211
8.3.5.1. SALARIES 212
8.3.6. LEVIES AND RATES 213
8.3.7. INTERGOVERNMENTAL TRANSFERS OF FUNDS 213
8.3.8. ANALYSIS OF WARDS AND VOTERS 215

8.4. CONCLUSION 217
CHAPTER 9: EVALUATING THE THREE CATEGORIES OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT FOR THE FINAL RESTRUCTURING PHASE IN THE CITY OF TSHWANE

9.1. INTRODUCTION

9.2. CATEGORIES OF LOCAL AUTHORITIES

9.3. EVALUATING A CATEGORY A LOCAL GOVERNMENT: INTERPRETATION OF THE CRITERIA FOR THE IDENTIFICATION OF THE NODAL POINTS

9.3.1. APPLICATION OF THE CRITERIA FOR THE IDENTIFICATION OF THE NODAL POINTS

9.3.2. EVALUATION OF FINDINGS

9.4. EVALUATING A COMBINED CATEGORY B/C LOCAL GOVERNMENT

9.4.1. INTERVIEW FRAMEWORK

9.4.2. INTERVIEW SUMMARY

9.5. EVALUATING LOCAL GOVERNMENT CATEGORIES according to restructuring principles

9.5.1. APPLICATION OF PRINCIPLES

9.5.2. LOCAL GOVERNMENT SECESSION TREND

9.5.3. LOCAL GOVERNMENT ACCESSIBILITY

9.5.4. COST EFFICIENCY OF GOVERNMENT AMALGAMATIONS

9.5.5. INCREASED COST ESCALATION

9.6. CONCLUSION
CHAPTER 10: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION: THE RESTRUCTURING OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT WITH SPECIFIC REFERENCE TO THE CITY OF TSHWANE

10.1. INTRODUCTION 251

10.2. PROVING THE HYPOTHESIS 254

10.3. RECOMMENDATIONS 257

10.3.1. RECOMMENDATIONS BASED ON THE METHODOLOGY OF THE STUDY 257

10.3.1.1. FURTHER RESEARCH AND STUDIES 257

10.3.1.2. GEOGRAPHICAL LIMITATION 258

10.3.1.3. TIME FRAME 258

10.3.2. RECOMMENDATIONS BASED ON THE RESULTS OF THE STUDY 258

10.3.2.1. LOCAL AUTHORITIES 259

10.3.2.2. CITY OF TSHWANE SERVICES BOARD 260

10.3.2.2.1. MEMBERSHIP OF THE CITY OF TSHWANE SERVICES BOARD 261

10.3.2.2.2. OTHER CONSIDERATIONS 263

10.3.2.2.3. SERVICE RESPONSIBILITY OF THE CITY OF TSHWANE SERVICES BOARD 264

10.3.2.2.4. FINANCING THE CITY OF TSHWANE SERVICES BOARD 267

10.3.2.2.5. RELATIONSHIPS 268

10.3.2.2.6. SUB-COMMITTEES 268

10.3.2.2.7. COMBINING THE OPTIONS 269

10.3.2.2.8. DIVISION OF POWERS AND DUTIES BETWEEN THE CITY OF TSHWANE SERVICES BOARD AND THE LOCAL AUTHORITIES 273

10.4. CONCLUSION 281
# BIBLIOGRAPHY

## 1. PUBLISHED SOURCES

1.1. BOOKS

1.2. JOURNALS AND PERIODICALS

1.3. ENCYCLOPEDIA

1.4. GOVERNMENT PUBLICATIONS

1.4.1. ACTS OF PARLIAMENT

## 2. UNPUBLISHED SOURCES

2.1. OFFICIAL PUBLICATIONS AND CORRESPONDENCE

2.2. DISCUSSION DOCUMENTS

2.3. REPORTS

2.4. WORKSHOPS, SEMINARS, CONFERENCES AND PROJECTS

2.5. SPEECHES AND DEBATES

2.6. DISSERTATIONS AND THESSES

2.7. NEWSLETTERS AND PAMPHLETS

2.8. NEWSPAPERS

2.9. SURVEYS AND STATISTICS

2.10. INTERNET
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LIST OF MAPS</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MAP 1.1.: DEPICTING THE GREATER PRETORIA METROPOLITAN AREA – BOUNDARY CONTEXT</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES</td>
<td>PAGE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIGURE 2.1: SPHERES OF GOVERNMENT IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN CONTEXT</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIGURE 2.2: CLOETE: TRADITIONAL APPROACH</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIGURE 2.3: SCHWELLA'S PUBLIC MANAGEMENT MODEL</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIGURE 2.4: COMPONENTS OF THE TOTAL ENVIRONMENT OF A SYSTEM</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIGURE 2.5: DYNAMIC RESPONSE MODEL OF A SYSTEM</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>LEGISLATIVE AND ADMINISTRATIVE PROVISIONS FOR URBAN BLACKS (1923-1982)</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>COMPOSITION OF THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT NEGOTIATION FORUM (LGNF)(a)</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>POPULATIONS OF THE LARGEST SA METROPOLITAN AREAS (a)</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>PEAK HOUR PUBLIC TRANSPORT NODAL SPLIT (a)</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>POPULATION IN THE GPMC AREA AND METROPOLITAN LOCAL AUTHORITY AREAS (a)</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>COMPARATIVE 1996/97 (NON-LOAN BASED) INCOME FIGURES FOR THE FOUR PRETORIA LOCAL AUTHORITIES (a)</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>FINANCIAL DETAILS: PRETORIA 1996/97 AND 1997/98 (a)</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>FINANCIAL CALCULATIONS: PRETORIA 1996/97 AND 1997/98 (A)</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9A</td>
<td>INTERGOVERNMENTAL TRANSFER OF FUNDS: GPA 1996/1997(a)</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9B</td>
<td>INTERGOVERNMENTAL TRANSFER OF FUNDS: GPA 1997/1998 (a)</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>VOTER STATISTICS BY WARD: GPA 1995 (a)</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE 11: A VS B NUMBERS AND VOTES BY WARD:
GPA 1995 (a) 216

TABLE 12: A CONURBATION FEATURING AREAS OF HIGH POPULATION DENSITY (a) 229

TABLE 13: A CONURBATION FEATURING AN INTENSE MOVEMENT OF PEOPLE, GOODS AND SERVICES(a) 230

TABLE 14: A CONURBATION FEATURING EXTENSIVE DEVELOPMENT (a) 231

TABLE 15: A CENTRE OF ECONOMIC ACTIVITY (a) 232

TABLE 16: A COMPLEX AND DIVERSE ECONOMY (a) 233

TABLE 17: LOCAL AUTHORITY BUDGETS (a) 234

TABLE 18: COMPARATIVE IMPACTS OF TWO METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT APPROACHES 249

TABLE 19: OPTIONS FOR THE ORGANIZATION OF THE CITY OF TSHWANE SERVICES BOARD 272

TABLE 20: FUNCTIONAL DIVISION BETWEEN THE CITY OF TSHWANE SERVICES BOARD AND THE THREE LOCAL AUTHORITIES 275