

THE RESTRUCTURING OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT WITH SPECIFIC REFERENCE TO THE CITY OF TSHWANE

by

BELINDA HAVENGA

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements of the degree

Doctor Philosophiae (Public Administration)

In the Faculty Humanity

University of Pretoria

SUPERVISOR: PROF. DR. D.J. FOURIE

PRETORIA
OCTOBER 2002

SUMMARY

This research seeks to build a conceptual framework that can assist in guiding the process of local government restructuring and the impact thereof on the community it serves. The framework emphasizes looking beyond the legislative framework and evaluating the restructuring of local government to include all deliberate and purposive courses of action that are intended to lead to new or modified systems of local government, to significant arrangements for redistributing responsibilities for major developmental functions, and to increased public participation in policy-making and action at a local level.

In order to meet the objectives of this investigation, a literature study was undertaken. Salient themes regarding the restructuring of local government were located in existing legislation, public administration texts, in management theories and in research studies.

The aims of this study were to:

- a) analyze the emergence of local government in South Africa, which contributed to the manifestation of the apartheid value system and the separation of racial communities;
- b) clarify the need for local government restructuring to address imbalances and inequities of past legislation;
- c) identify the administrative and legislative processes which culminated in the formulation of a legislative local government restructuring model;
- d) assess the impact of the local government restructuring model on local authorities, with specific reference to the City of Tshwane; and
- e) identify and evaluate international restructuring principles and experience against South African local government restructuring, with specific reference to the City of Tshwane and to draw conclusion.



In achieving these five research objectives, the aim of this thesis was to recommend a local government category for the City of Tshwane, which would ensure that the intended purpose of local government restructuring is met in an efficient and democratic manner.

The recommended local government category for the City of Tshwane in the final restructuring phase is premised on less local government and strengthened local authorities that will preserve local community identity for residents and businesses and promote the efficient use of resources. In order to ensure efficient and democratic regional service delivery, the establishment of a City of Tshwane Services Board is recommended.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The Almighty God created all of mankind as spiritual beings – in his image. What we make of our human experience is a matter of personal choice. Some acquire knowledge and wisdom as they progress along the path of life others choose to pursue it more deliberately, being aware of the fact that life has an eternal dimension.

The journey of discovering knowledge and wisdom is a challenging path. It takes one through dark valleys of uncertainty and to exhilarating heights of celebration and joy. There are opportunities for rest along the way – stops to question and silently reason, but they are in reality intersections of uncertainty and exit roads to end the journey. It is the solidarity moments of questioning and reasoning where one discovers that choices are decided by value judgement of the jury in one's soul.

I met many people along the way, and made valuable friends. A special word of "thank you", Professor Dr. David Fourie, for your excellent promotion and supervision. This study would not have been possible without your active guidance and support.

My husband, Lukas, thank you for your trust and encouragement throughout the challenging study years.

My parents, Carol and Tots, thank you for your guidance and support.



TABLE OF CONTENTS PAGE

CHAP	TER 1: RESEARCH PROBLEM AND RESEARCH DI	ESIGN
1.1.	INTRODUCTION	1
1.2.	PROBLEM STATEMENT AND HYPOTHESIS	4
1.3.	RESEARCH AIMS AND OBJECTIVES	7
1.4.	RESEARCH APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY	8
1.5.	CLARIFICATION OF TERMINOLOGY	8
1.5.1.	APARTHEID	8
1.5.2.	CITY OF TSHWANE METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITY	9
1.5.3.	DEMOCRACY	10
1.5.4.	GOVERN	11
1.5.5.	GOVERNANCE	11
1.5.6.	GREATER PRETORIA METROPOLITAN AREA (GPMA)	12
1.5.7.	LOCAL AUTHORITY	14
1.5.8.	LOCAL GOVERNMENT	14
1.5.9.	METROPOLIS AND METROPOLITAN AREA	15
1.5.10	MUNICIPAL ADMINISTRATION	15
1.5.11	.MUNICIPAL COUNCIL	15
1.5.12	.MUNICIPAL GOVERNMENT	15
1.5.13	.MUNICIPALITY	16
1.5.14	PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION	17
1.5.15	RACIAL CATEGORISATION	17
1.5.16	RESTRUCTURING	17
1.5.17	URBANIZATION	18
1.6.	STRUCTURE OF RESEARCH	18
1.7.	CONCLUSION	21



CHAPTER 2: A CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENT

2.1.	INTRODUCTION	22
2.2.	ORIGINS AND CHARACTERISTICS OF URBAN AREAS	23
2.3.	SOVEREIGNTY AND GOVERNMENT	25
2.4.	SPHERES OF GOVERNMENT IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN	
	CONTEXT	26
2.4.1.	CENTRAL/NATIONAL GOVERNMENT	28
2.4.2.	PROVINCIAL/REGIONAL GOVERNMENT	28
2.4.3.	MUNICIPAL/LOCAL GOVERNMENT	28
2.5.	AN INTRODUCTION TO PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION	29
2.5.1.	DEFINING PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION	30
2.5.2.	PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION APPROACHES	30
2.5.2.	1. CLOETE: TRADITIONAL APPROACH	31
2.5.2.	1.1. CRITICISM OF CLOETE'S APPROACH	36
2.5.2.	2. SCHWELLA: INNOVATIVE APPROACH	37
2.5.2.	3. AN ADAPTATION OF THE CLOETE-SCHWELLA	
	APPROACH	43
2.5.3.	NORMATIVE GUIDELINES OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION	45
2.6.	CONCLUSION	49



CHAPTER 3: THE ROLE AND PURPOSE OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT

3.1.	INTRODUCTION	50
3.2.	DEFINING A LOCAL GOVERNMENT	50
3.2.1.	LOCAL AUTHORITY	54
3.3.	LOCAL GOVERNMENT DEMOCRACY	55
3.3.1.	LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND DEMOCRATIC VALUES	55
3.4.	THE SIGNIFICANCE OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT	57
3.4.1.	TRAINING GROUND FOR MASS POLITICAL EDUCATION	58
3.4.2.	TRAINING GROUND FOR POLITICAL LEADERSHIP	59
3.4.3.	FACILITATION OF GOVERNMENT ACCOUNTABILITY	60
3.5.	THE STRUCTURE OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT	62
3.5.1.	THE COUNCIL	63
3.5.1.	1. THE COUNCIL CHAIRPERSON AND THE	
	SECRETARY	64
3.5.2.	THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE	65
3.5.3.	SPECIAL AND STANDING COMMITTEES OF COUNCIL	67
3.5.4.	THE CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER	70
3.5.5.	THE STAFF OF A LOCAL GOVERNMENT	71
3.5.6.	THE DEPARTMENTAL HEADS	72
3.6.	CONCERNS IN RESTRUCTURING LOCAL GOVERNMENT	Г73
3.6.1.	PRINCIPLES OF GOOD GOVERNMENT	74
3.6.2.	PRINCIPLE OF MEGAPOLITICS AND	
	INCREASING GLOBALIZATION	77
3.6.3.	LEGAL PRINCIPLES	79
3.6.4.	THE URBAN ENVIRONMENT	80
3.6.5.	THE SOCIO-POLITICAL DIMENSION	81
3.6.5.	1. A SOCIO-POLITICAL SYSTEM ANALYSIS	82
3.6.6.	PRINCIPLES OF BALANCED APPLICATION OF ALL	



112

	CRITERIA		87
3.7.	CONCLUSIO	N	87
СНАР	TER 4:	THE RESTRUCTURING OF LOCAL GOVERN SOUTH AFRICA: A HISTORICAL PERSPECTO 1994	
4.1.	INTRODUCT	TION	90
4.2.	EMERGENC	E OF LOCAL AUTHORITIES	91
4.3.		ENT OF LOCAL AUTHORITIES FOR AREAS POPULATED BY NON-WHITES	94
4.3.1.	BLACK URB	AN AREAS	94
4.3.2.	COLOURED	AND INDIAN AREAS	98
4.4.	REGIONALIS	SED STRUCTURES FOR LOCAL	
	GOVERNME	ENT	99
		URING OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT: 1990-1994 OR THE CO-ORDINATION OF LOCAL	102
4.5.0		ENT AFFAIRS	102
4.5.2.	ACT (ACT 20	TION OF THE REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA	105
152	`	,	107
		'ERNMENT NEGOTIATING FORUM (LGNF) GOVERNMENT DEMOCRATIZATION	107
	PROCESS		111

4.6. CONCLUSION



CHAPTER 5: THE RESTRUCTURING OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT IN SOUTH AFRICA IN THE PRE-INTERIM AND INTERIM PHASES

5.1.	INTRODUCTION	115
5.2.	APPLICATION OF THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT	
	TRANSITION ACT (ACT 209 OF 1993) IN THE	
	PRE-INTERIM PHASE	116
5.2.1.	APPOINTED COUNCILS	116
5.2.2.	LOCAL NEGOTIATED FORUMS	118
5.2.3	TRANSITIONAL MODELS	120
5.2.4	EXEMPTIONS FROM THE PRE-INTERIM PHASE	124
5.2.5	PROVINCIAL COMMITTEES	124
5.2.6.	DEMARCATION BOARDS	125
5.2.7.	CATEGORIES OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT	127
5.2.7.	1. METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT	128
5.3.	INTERIM PHASE: ELECTED COUNCILS	134
5.3.1.	VOTER QUALIFICATIONS	135
5.3.2.	POWERS AND FUNCTIONS OF LOCAL GOVERNMENTS	137
5.3.3.	DECISION-MAKING	138
5.3.4.	ADMINISTRATION	138
5.3.5.	WARD COUNCILS	139
5.3.6.	RURAL LOCAL GOVERNMENT	140
5.3.7.	THE CONSTITUTIONAL STATUS OF LOCAL	
	GOVERNMENT	142
5.4.	EVALUATING THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT	
	NEGOTIATION FORUM AND THE LOCAL	
	GOVERNMENT TRANSITION ACT (ACT 209 OF 1993)	143
5.4.1.	REPRESENTATIVITY	144
5.4.2.	ACCOUNTABLILITY	144
5.4.3.	LACK OF GUIDELINES	144



5.4.4.	HETEROGENEITY VERSUS HOMOGENEITY OF	
	DELEGATIONS	145
5.4.5.	THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT TRANSITION ACT (LGTA) -	
	POORLY FRAMED LEGISLATION	145
5.4.6.	METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT	146
5.5.	CONCLUSION	146
CHAF	TER 6: RESTRUCTURING OF LOCAL GOVERN SOUTH AFRICA TOWARDS THE FINAL PHA	
6.1.	INTRODUCTION	148
6.2.	EMERGENCE OF THE FINAL CONSTITUTION	148
6.3.	CONSTITUTION OF THE REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA,	
	ACT 108 OF 1996	150
6.3.1.	LOCAL GOVERNMENT	152
6.3.2.	OBJECTIVES AND DEVELOPMENT DUTIES OF	
	MUNICIPALITIES	156
6.3.3.	ESTABLISHMENT OF MUNICIPALITIES	158
6.3.4.	DEMARCATION OF BOUNDARIES	160
6.3.5.	TRANSITIONAL ARRANGEMENTS	164
6.4.	THE WHITE PAPER ON LOCAL GOVERNMENT	165
6.5.	LOCAL GOVERNMENT MUNICIPAL STRUCTURES ACT,	
	ACT 117 OF 1998	166



6.5.1.	CATEGORIE	ES OF LOCAL AUTHORITIES	167
6.6.	CO-OPERAT	TIVE GOVERNANCE	169
6.7.	CONCLUSIO	DN	170
CHAP	TER 7:	RESTRUCTURING OF LOCAL GOVERNME GREATER PRETORIA AREA IN THE PR PHASE	
7.1.	INTRODUCT	TION	174
	GOVERNME	ID HISTORY OF METROPOLITAN ENT AND ADMINISTRATION IS OF METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT	175
	SYSTEMS		177
7.3.		PRETORIA REGION	179
7.4.	GREATER F	PRETORIA METROPOLITAN NEGOTIATING	181
	AND THE P	SITIONAL METROPOLITAN COUNCIL RETORIA REGIONAL SERVICES COUNCIL F AGREEMENT	186 190
7.6.		SHIP BETWEEN THE METROPOLITAN ND THE SUBSTRUCTURES	192
7.7.	EVALUATII	NG THE PRE-INTERIM PHASE	194
7.8.	RESTRUCT	URING OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT IN	



7.8.1.	MOVING TOWARDS THE INTERIM PHASE POWERS AND FUNCTIONS OF THE METROPOLITAN	196
	COUNCIL AND METROPOLITAN LOCAL COUNCILS	196
7.9.	CONCLUSION	199
СНАР	TER 8: AN INTRODUCTION TO THE GREATER IN METROPOLITAN AREA IN THE INTERII (1 NOVEMBER 1995 UP TO 5 DECEMBER 20	W PHASE
8.1.	INTRODUCTION	202
8.2.	LOCAL SPHERE OF GOVERNMENT IN THE INTERIM PHASE	203
8.3. 8.3.1.	PRETORIA IN NATIONAL SOCIO-ECONOMIC CONTEXT BROAD DIMENSIONS OF METROPOLITAN	203
8.3.2.	GOVERNMENT FINANCIAL STATUS OF LOCAL AUTHORITIES IN THE	206
	GREATER PRETORIA AREA	208
8.3.3.	COUNCILLOR REPRESENTATION	209
8.3.4.	HUMAN RESOURCE STRUCTURES	210
8.3.5.	DETAILED FINANCIAL ANALYSIS AND TRENDS	211
8.3.5.	1. SALARIES	212
8.3.6.	LEVIES AND RATES	213
8.3.7.	INTERGOVERNMENTAL TRANSFERS OF FUNDS	213
8.3.8.	ANALYSIS OF WARDS AND VOTERS	215

217

8.4. CONCLUSION



CHAPTER 9: EVALUATING THE THREE CATEGORIES OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT FOR THE FINAL RESTRUCTURING

PHASE IN THE CITY OF TSHWANE

9.1.	INTRODUCTION	219
9.2.	CATEGORIES OF LOCAL AUTHORITIES	220
9.3.	EVALUATING A CATEGORY A LOCAL	
	GOVERNMENT: INTERPRETATION OF THE CRITERIA	
	FOR THE IDENTIFICATION OF THE NODAL POINTS	221
9.3.1.	APPLICATION OF THE CRITERIA FOR THE	
	IDENTIFICATION OF THE NODAL POINTS	228
9.3.2.	EVALUATION OF FINDINGS	234
9.4.	EVALUATING A COMBINED CATEGORY	
	B/C LOCAL GOVERNMENT	235
9.4.1.	INTERVIEW FRAMEWORK	236
9.4.2.	INTERVIEW SUMMARY	239
9.5.	EVALUATING LOCAL GOVERNMENT CATEGORIES	
	ACCORDING TO RESTRUCTURING PRINCIPLES	240
9.5.1.	APPLICATION OF PRINCIPLES	241
9.5.2.	LOCAL GOVERNMENT SECESSION TREND	244
9.5.3.	LOCAL GOVERNMENT ACCESSIBILITY	245
9.5.4.	COST EFFICIENCY OF GOVERNMENT	
	AMALGAMATIONS	246
9.5.5.	. INCREASED COST ESCALATION	247
9.6.	CONCLUSION	248



CHAPTER 10: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION: THE RESTRUCTURING OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT WITH SPECIFIC REFERENCE TO THE CITY OF TSHWANE

10.1. INTRO	DDUCTION	251
10.2. PROV	ING THE HYPOTHESIS	254
10.3. RECO	MMENDATIONS	257
10.3.1.RECO	MMENDATIONS BASED ON THE	
METH	ODOLOGY OF THE STUDY	257
10.3.1.1. FU	RTHER RESEARCH AND STUDIES	257
10.3.1.2. GE	OGRAPHICAL LIMITATION	258
10.3.1.3. TIN	ME FRAME	258
10.3.2.RECO	MMENDATIONS BASED ON THE RESULTS	
OF TH	IE STUDY	258
10.3.2.1.	LOCAL AUTHORITIES	259
10.3.2.2.	CITY OF TSHWANE SERVICES BOARD	260
10.3.2.2.1.	MEMBERSHIP OF THE CITY OF TSHWANE	
	SERVICES BOARD	261
10.3.2.2.2.	OTHER CONSIDERATIONS	263
10.3.2.2.3.	SERVICE RESPONSIBILITY OF THE CITY OF	
	TSHWANE SERVICES BOARD	264
10.3.2.2.4.	FINANCING THE CITY OF TSHWANE SERVICES	
	BOARD	267
10.3.2.2.5.	RELATIONSHIPS	268
10.3.2.2.6.	SUB-COMMITTEES	268
10.3.2.2.7.	COMBINING THE OPTIONS	269
10.3.2.2.8.	DIVISION OF POWERS AND DUTIES BETWEEN	
	THE CITY OF TSHWANE SERVICES BOARD	
	AND THE LOCAL AUTHORITIES	273
10.4 CONC	CLUSION	281



BIBLIOGRAPHY		284
1.	PUBLISHED SOURCES	284
1.1.	BOOKS	284
1.2.	JOURNALS AND PERIODICALS	293
1.3.	ENCYCLOPEDIA	294
1.4.	GOVERNMENT PUBLICATIONS	295
1.4.1.	ACTS OF PARLIAMENT	295
2.	UNPUBLISHED SOURCES	297
2.1.	OFFICIAL PUBLICATIONS AND CORRESPONDENCE	297
2.2.	DISCUSSION DOCUMENTS	298
2.3.	REPORTS	300
2.4.	WORKSHOPS, SEMINARS, CONFERENCES AND	
	PROJECTS	304
2.5.	SPEECHES AND DEBATES	305
2.6.	DISSERTATIONS AND THESES	306
2.7.	NEWSLETTERS AND PAMPHLETS	306
2.8.	NEWSPAPERS	307
2.9.	SURVEYS AND STATISTICS	309
2.10.	INTERNET	310



<u>LIST OF MAPS</u> <u>PAGE</u>

MAP 1.1.: DEPICTING THE GREATER PRETORIA

METROPOLITAN AREA – BOUNDARY CONTEXT 13



<u>LIST OF FIGURES</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
FIGURE 2.1: SPHERES OF GOVERNMENT IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN CONTEXT	27
FIGURE 2.2: CLOETE: TRADITIONAL APPROACH	32
FIGURE 2.3: SCHWELLA'S PUBLIC MANAGEMENT MODEL	39
FIGURE 2.4: COMPONENTS OF THE TOTAL ENVIRONMENT OF A SYSTEM	84
FIGURE 2.5: DYNAMIC RESPONSE MODEL OF A SYSTEM	86



LIST OF TABLES		
TABLE 1:	LEGISLATIVE AND ADMINISTRATIVE PROVISIONS FOR URBAN BLACKS (1923-1982)	97
TABLE 2:	COMPOSITION OF THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT NEGOTIATION FORUM (LGNF)(a)	109
TABLE 3:	POPULATIONS OF THE LARGEST SA METROPOLITAN AREAS (a)	204
TABLE 4:	PEAK HOUR PUBLIC TRANSPORT NODAL SPLIT (a)	205
TABLE 5:	POPULATION IN THE GPMC AREA AND METROPOLITAN LOCAL AUTHORITY AREAS (a)	207
TABLE 6:	COMPARATIVE 1996/97 (NON-LOAN BASED) INCOME FIGURES FOR THE FOUR PRETORIA LOCAL AUTHORITIES (a)	208
TABLE 7:	FINANCIAL DETAILS: PRETORIA 1996/97 AND 1997/98 (a)	212
TABLE 8:	FINANCIAL CALCULATIONS: PRETORIA 1996/97 AND 1997/98 (A)	213
TABLE 9A:	INTERGOVERNMENTAL TRANSFER OF FUNDS: GPA 1996/1997(a)	214
TABLE 9B:	INTERGOVERNMENTAL TRANSFER OF FUNDS: GPA 1997/1998 (a)	215
TABLE 10:	VOTER STATISTICS BY WARD: GPA 1995 (a)	216



TABLE 11:	A VS B NUMBERS AND VOTES BY WARD: GPA 1995 (a)	216
TABLE 12:	A CONURBATION FEATURING AREAS OF HIGH POPULATION DENSITY (a)	229
TABLE 13:	A CONURBATION FEATURING AN INTENSE MOVEMENT OF PEOPLE, GOODS AND SERVICES(a)	230
TABLE 14:	A CONURBATION FEATURING EXTENSIVE DEVELOPMENT (a)	231
TABLE 15:	A CENTRE OF ECONOMIC ACTIVITY (a)	232
TABLE 16:	A COMPLEX AND DIVERSE ECONOMY (a)	233
TABLE 17:	LOCAL AUTHORITY BUDGETS (a)	234
TABLE 18:	COMPARATIVE IMPACTS OF TWO METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT APPROACHES	249
TABLE 19:	OPTIONS FOR THE ORGANIZATION OF THE CITY OF TSHWANE SERVICES BOARD	272
TABLE 20:	FUNCTIONAL DIVISION BETWEEN THE CITY OF TSHWANE SERVICES BOARD AND THE THREE LOCAL AUTHORITIES	275