The marginalized stories of people who live in poverty: a pastoral narrative approach to community transformational development.

By

Semape Jacob Manyaka

Submitted in fulfillment for the degree

of

PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR

With specialization in the field

of

PASTORAL FAMILY THERAPY

In the

FACULTY OF THEOLOGY

DEPARTMENT OF PRACTICAL THEOLOGY

Of the

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

UNDER SUPERVISION

Of

PROF. J C MULLER

August 2010
Acknowledgements

I wish to thank the following people who have journeyed with me in the journey of completing this research project:

Prof. Muller whose patience and wisdom, gave me such great advice

My wife Catherine without her support, this journey would not be possible. Most of the time, I spent sleepless nights.

My Children, Tshegofatso, Tebogo, and Phenyo, you were the source of my inspiration.

Willow Manor Christian Center, the church where I work, thanks for allowing me to continue with this research process.

Sandra Duncan who helped me with the proofreading of my work

Amanda Richter who journeyed with me and she assisted me in a big way.

Above all, I would like to thank the almighty who gave me the strength to start and complete this assignment.
Dedication

I dedicate this PhD to my beautiful wife Catherine who was patient with me when I was spending sleepless nights during my study, also to my children, Tshegofatso. Tebogo, and Phenyo whom sometimes I did not spend enough quality time.

Declaration

I Semape Jacob Manyaka, declare that The marginalized stories of people who live in poverty: a pastoral narrative approach to community transformational development is my work. Every reference used has been properly acknowledged accordingly. The work has never been submitted for attainment of a degree in any faculty of the university.
Abstract

In this research process, my objectives were as follows; firstly, to explore the relationship between identity formation and poverty and secondly to explore the role of the church in combating the effects of poverty in the lives of those who live in poverty stricken communities. A Narrative approach was used to gather data from the community. I listened to the stories of those people who live in poverty. Seven movements were used as the methodology for this research (Muller 2005:81-86).

As a practical theologian, I positioned myself within postfoundationalist theology. In this position I avoided foundation epistemology which seeks the absolute truth as well as anti or nonfoundational epistemology which promotes relativism. As I mentioned earlier postfoundationalist practical theology is always thinking in a specific context and can also go beyond that specific context into interdisciplinary thinking.

Starting from a specific context into an interdisciplinary context, we found that the concept of poverty has been described as a discourse meaning that it went from poverty as a lack of resources into linguistics, poverty as lack of capabilities or poverty being political. By taking multidimension method to eradicate poverty one needs to apply a multidimensions approach. The stories from Nellmapius affirmed that poverty influences identity formation. The following effects were identified: low self-esteem, stress, depression, lack of self-acceptance and hopelessness.
The church has the capacity as the biggest membership and with the most awareness organization in most communities that has the attention of many people. The church is able to preach hope for people in what seems to be hopelessness and encourage the poor to rise out of their poverty. It can facilitate the poor and the government to work together to change their lives.
Key concepts

Postmodernism

Social constructionism

Postfoundationalism

Narrative approach

Poverty

Identity formation

Development

Transformation

Church

Co-researchers
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**Chapter 1: Positioning**

1.1 Introduction .......................................................... 1
1.2 Motivation ............................................................. 2
1.3 Research gap .......................................................... 3
1.4 Research problem .................................................... 5
1.4.1 What is identity? .................................................... 5
1.4.2 Formation of identity .............................................. 6
1.4.2.1 Marcia’s identity status ..................................... 7
1.4.2.2 Grotevant’s process of Model of identity ............... 8
1.4.2.3 Berzonky’s identity styles .................................. 8
1.4.2.4 Identity formation as social construction .............. 10
1.5 Biblical perspectives on identity formation .................. 14
1.5.1 God’s image and likeness in man ............................ 14
1.5.2 The fall of man ..................................................... 17
1.5.3 The nature of sin .................................................. 18
1.5.4 The result of sin ................................................... 19
1.5.5 Righteousness ....................................................... 19
1.6 Research objectives .................................................. 21
1.7 Paradigmatic approach .............................................. 22
1.7.1 Introduction

1.7.2 Paradigms shifting: moving between two worlds

1.7.2 Modernist’s epistemology

1.7.2 Postmodernist’s epistemology

1.7.3 Language

1.7.4 Discourse definition

1.7.5 Deconstruction

1.7.6 Transversal rationality

1.8. Social constructionism

1.9 Theological positioning

1.9.1 Theology

1.9.2 Post-modern theology

1.9.3 Postfoundationism: Beyond conflict and consonance

1.9.4 Practical theology

1.9.5 Exploring practical wisdom understanding

1.9.6 Postfoundationalist practical theology

1.10 Narrative theory, Recoeur and hermeneutics

1.10.1 Narrative research

1.11 Social constructionism and postfoundationalism

1.12 Ethical positioning

1.13 Research design
1.13.1 Specific context is defined
1.13.2 In-context experiences are listened and described
1.13.3 Interpretations of experiences are made, described, and developed in collaboration with co-researchers
1.13.4 A description of experiences as continually informed by traditions of interpretations
1.13.5 A reflection on religion and spirituality aspect, especially as it is understood and experienced in a specific situation
1.13.6 A description of experience, thickened through interdisciplinary investigation
1.13.7 The development of alternative interpretations that points beyond the local community
1.14 Profiles of my co-researchers
1.14.1 Miss JM
1.14.2 Mr. S. and Mrs. Z
1.14.3 Mr. T and Mrs. T
1.14.4 Mr. P
1.14.5 Mr. TN
1.14.6 Mr. JR
1.14.7 Mrs. J
1.15. Journey of my life story
1.15.1 Why share my life story?
1.16 The context of Nellmapius
1.16.1 Population 61
1.16.2 Economic aspect 61
1.16.3 Educational aspect 61
1.16.4 Health aspect 62
1.16.5 Early childhood development centers 62
1.16.6 Taverns 62
1.17 Outlines of Chapters 62

Chapter 2: Description of the problem 64

2.1 Introduction 64
2.2 Definition of poverty 66
2.2.1 Poor people’s definition of poverty 66
2.2.2 Definition of poverty by non poor people 71
2.2.3 Poverty as a discourse 73
2.3 Global poverty 74
2.4 Poverty trap or structural poverty 75
2.5 Africa 78
2.6 South Africa 79
2.6.1 Apartheid 80
2.6.2 Legacy of apartheid 82
2.6.2.1 Exclusion of the poor from the riches of the land 83
2.6.3 The history of inequality in South Africa 84
Chapter 3: Community transformation

3.1 Introduction

3.2 Transformation as an action

3.2.1 Defining the concept of transformation

3.2.2 Transformation on an individual level

3.2.3 Social transformation

3.2.4 Transformation as a story of action in the bible

3.3 Development

3.3.1 Defining the concept of development

3.3.2 Economic development

3.3.3 Post-development theory

3.3.4 What is the post-development?

3.4 Developing and empowering the community

3.4.1 Defining the concept empowerment

3.4.2 Four elements of empowerment

3.4.3 Empowerment through education

3.4.4 Researcher’s reflection on empowerment

3.4.4.1 Increasing the capacity

3.4.4.2 Dignified decent life

3.4.4.3 Freedom of choice

3.4.4.4 Participation in the process of empowerment
Chapter 4: Experiences are listened to and described

4.1. Introduction

4.2. How did I choose them?

4.3. How did I collect the data

4.3.1 The questions have asked the co-researchers are as follows

4.4 Language used

4.1.1 Mr. P’s story

4.1.2 Mr. P’s understanding of poverty

4.1.3 Mr. P’s identified causes of poverty in an African context

4.1.3.1 Bantu education as a cause of poverty

4.1.3.2 Mindset has impact on our lives

4.1.3.3 Laziness as a cause of poverty

4.1.3.4 Environment has impact on the lives of people

4.1.3.5 Researcher’s thoughts on Mr. P’s narratives

4.2 Mrs J’s narratives

4.2.1 Mrs. J’s view on causes of poverty

4.2.1.1 Environment as a cause of poverty

4.2.1.2 Poverty is a chain

4.2.1.3 Grants

4.2.1.4 HIV/AIDS

4.2.1.5 Education and the mother tongue
4.4.1.6 Grants to 14yrs causes poverty

4.4.1.7 Drugs addiction are results of poverty

4.4.1.8 Crime is caused by being in poverty

4.4.1.9 Teenage pregnancy caused by being living in poverty

4.4.1.10 Things are very expensive

4.4.1.11 Poverty has level

4.4.1.12 It kills the family of a person

4.4.1.13 Poverty makes people to feel hopeless

4.4.1.14 Change is always possible

4.4.1.15 Spirituality and God’s presence

4.4.1.16 Researcher’s thoughts on Mrs. T’s narrative

4.5 Mr. JR’s view on poverty

4.5.1 Describing poverty

4.5.2 Mr. JR’s view on causes of poverty

4.5.3 Some of the impacts of poverty

4.5.4 How to eradicate poverty

4.5.5 Mr. JR’s experience of God presence

4.5.6 Researcher’s thoughts on Mr. JR’s narratives

4.6 Mr. T’s story

4.6.1 Unemployment causes poverty

4.6.2 Poverty causes stress and depression
4.6.3 Budgeting system
4.6.4 Peer group pressure forced to live wrongly
4.6.5 People who live in poverty need a lot of motivation
4.6.6 Effective education must be given in mother tongue
4.6.7 People feel that prayer is useless
4.6.8 Poverty comes from God
4.7 Mr. TN's story
4.7.1 Mr. TN's view on poverty
4.7.1.1 Parents's divorce affects children negatively
4.7.1.2 Lack of willingness
4.7.1.3 Curse upon Africans
4.7.1.4 To continue in poverty is a choice
4.7.1.5 Willingness to go to school
4.7.1.6 Making right decisions
4.7.1.7 Most Africans (blacks) lack initiatives
4.7.1.8 Stop blaming apartheid
4.7.1.9 Researcher's thoughts on Mr. TN's narrative
4.8 Mr. S's story
4.8.1 Describing poverty
4.8.1.1 Spiritual needs
4.8.1.2 Physical needs
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.8.1.3 Emotional needs</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8.1.4 Social needs</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8.2 Causes of poverty</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8.3 Impact of poverty</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8.4 Spiritual</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8.5 Eradication of poverty</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8.6 Researcher’s thoughts on Mr. S’ narratives</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9 Mrs. Z’s story</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9.1 Mrs. Z’s view on causes of poverty</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9.1.1 Mindset can cause and also can make us succeed</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9.1.2 Laziness as a cause of poverty</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9.1.3 The root of poverty is spiritual</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.10 Researcher’s view on poverty</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.10.1 In Childhood</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.10.2 As a man, husband, and father</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.10.3 As a Christian and pastor</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.11 The themes identifies in the context and conversing with literature and other disciplines</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.11.1 Bantu Education Act as a cause of poverty</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.11.1.1 Personal responsibility</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.11.2 Poverty is not only materials</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.11.3 New perspective on social grants for the needy 188
4.11.4 Environment as a cause of poverty 189
4.11.5 The church as a vehicle for community transformation 190
4.12 Conclusion 190

Chapter 5: Description of experiences, thicken through interdisciplinary investigation 192

Investigation 192
5.1 Introduction 192
5.2 Postfoundationalist or interdisciplinary 193
5.3 Interdisciplinary conversation 194
5.4 Mr. Lekola’s view (Education) 195
5.4.1 When reading the stories of co-researchers what do you think their concerns be? 195
5.4.2 Mr. Lekola: How would you formulate your discipline’s unique perspective on these concerns and why is it important that this perspective be heard at the interdisciplinary table? 196
5.4.3 Mr. Lekola: Why do you think your perspective will be understood and appreciated by researchers from other disciplines? 196
5.5. Pastor A. Spaumer’s view (Church) 197
5.5.1 Pastor A. Spaumer: When reading the story of co-researchers what do you think would be their concerns be? 197
5.5.2 Pastor A. Spaumer: How would you formulate your unique discipline’s perspective on these concerns and why is it important that this perspective be heard at the interdisciplinary table?  

5.5.3 Pastor A. Spaumer: Why do you think your perspective will be understood and appreciated by researchers from other disciplines?  

5.6 Ms Freeman’s view (Social work)  

5.6.1 Ms Freeman: When reading the story of co-researchers, what do you think would their concerns be?  

5.6.2 Ms Freeman: How would you formulate your discipline’s unique perspective on these concerns and why is it important that this perspective be heard at the interdisciplinary table?  

5.6.3 Ms Freeman: Why do you think your perspective will be understood and appreciated by researchers from other disciplines?  

5.7 Ms Magakwe’s view (Nursing)  

5.7.1 Ms Magakwe: When reading the story of co-researchers, what do you think would their concerns be?  

5.7.2 Ms Magakwe: How would you formulate your unique’s discipline perspective on these concerns and why is it important that this perspective be heard at the interdisciplinary table?  

5.7.3 Ms Magakwe: Why do you think your perspective will be understood and appreciated by researchers from other discipline?  

5.8 Researcher’s reflection on interdisciplinary  

5.9 Reflection on God’s presence
Chapter 6: Alternative interpretation pointing beyond the local context

6.1 Introduction

6.2 Postfoundationalism or interdisciplinary

6.3 Voices involve in creating the new story

6.4 An alternative story

6.4.1 Poverty

6.5. Suggested outcomes for community transformation that can be taken beyond specific

6.5.1 Development

6.5.2 Empowerment

6.5.2.1 Empowering the individuals

6.5.3 Transformation

6.5.4 Poverty and stress

6.5.5 Stigma and poverty

2.5.6 Sustainable community transformation

2.6.6.1 Ownership of the poverty alleviation projects

6.5.7 Self help

6.5.8 The church and the community transformation

6.5 Community transformation strategy
6.8 Equipping the poor people with skills for community transformation 220

6.9 Poverty has a negative impact on identity formation 221

1.10 Future research 222

Chapter 7: Reflection 223

7.1 Introduction 223

7.2 How did feel before research project 223

7.3 How did I feel during the research project 223

7.4 How did I feel after the research project 224

7.5 Positioning 224

7.6 Narrative approach 225

7.7 Excitement of the new story 226

7.8 Identity formation and poverty 226

7.9 Empowerment 227

7.10 Conclusion 227

Bibliography 229