EXPERIENCES OF DIVERSITY IN A SOUTH AFRICAN PUBLIC SCHOOL

by

RAKGADI SOPHY PHATLANE

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree

PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR

in

EDUCATION MANAGEMENT

Department of Education Management and Policy Studies

Faculty of Education

University of Pretoria

SOUTH AFRICA

Supervisor: Professor Dr M T Sehoole

Co-supervisors: Professor Dr J L Beckmann
Professor Dr B Smit

MARCH 2007
DECLARATION OF ORIGINALITY

I, RAKGADI SOPHY PHATLANE, declare that this thesis, Experiences of Diversity in a South African Public School, is my own work and that all sources used or quoted have been acknowledged and have been indicated by references.

-------------------------------------                                                  -----------------------------
- Ms R S Phatlane                                                  Date
SUMMARY

For many observers - both inside and outside the country - South Africa’s bloodless transition from the minority white domination of the apartheid era to democracy represented a political miracle of no mean significance. An important difference between the period before 1994 and the subsequent period is that the old divisions into which society was compartmentalised - Whites, Blacks, Indians and Coloureds - have disappeared. In their place there is a more integrated society, albeit with multiple diversities. Theoretically, therefore, the contours and racially-based dividing lines which were artificially created by apartheid have ceased to exist. Practically, however, such divisions still persist - both at societal and at school levels. The reason for this is that the deep-seated distrust of the ‘other’ could not be wiped out overnight - nor could integration take place without deliberate state intervention.

Thus, using an ethnographic case study research design, this thesis - *Experiences of diversity in a South African Public School* - contributes to the contemporary debate on desegregation, racial integration and cultural diversification of the learning environment. It traces the progress of a former Whites-only Afrikaans medium high school to determine the success or failure of the education department’s declared goal of ensuring racial integration at school level. The study concludes that contrary to the findings of other recent research projects on desegregation in South Africa, school integration and the social cohesion of learners are possible if a proper enabling environment is created.

Undertaken at a specific school, the study does not claim that the findings are a trend in other schools as well, although that cannot be totally ruled out in schools similar to the one studied. Most learners at this school have, reasonably, crossed the racial divide and have realised that they cannot exist independently from one another anymore - even when this seems to contradict the expectations of their parents.

**Key words:** desegregation, diversity, education, experiences, integration, race, learners, racism, re-segregation, segregation
GLOSSARY OF WORDS

Antiracist education - Education that addresses critical thinking skills and openly discusses tensions and contradictions in society and validates the needs, concerns and experiences of students, whatever their background.

Assimilation - The process whereby a minority group gradually adopts the customs and attitudes of the dominant/prevailing culture.

Desegregation - The process of formally ending racial segregation.

Diversity - The fact/quality of being diverse; difference, a point or respect in which things differ. Depending on who you are, the meaning of ‘diversity’ may differ.

Ethnography - The branch of anthropology that deals with the scientific description of specific human cultures; a form of research focusing on the sociology of meaning through close field observation of sociocultural phenomena.

Experiences - A ‘how-to-self-help’ knowledge base to answer questions on control, management and understanding the ‘self’; helping one deal, learn, know and master the self; emotions through the senses or mind.

Integration - The bringing of people of different racial or ethnic groups into unrestricted and equal association in society or in an organization.

Multiculturalism - An ideology advocating that society should consist of, or at least allow and include, distinct cultural groups with equal status. Multiculturalism is a term often used to describe the cultural and ethnic diversity of a nation and argues that diversity is a positive force for a society’s nationhood.

Public School - A primary (Grade R - Grade 7) or secondary (Grade 8 – Grade 12) school in South Africa which is supported by public funds and provides education to the children of a community.
**Race** - A local geographic or global human population distinguished as a more or less distinct group by genetically transmitted physical features.

**Racism** - The belief that race accounts for differences in human character or ability and that one particular race is superior to others.

**Re-segregation** - When intrusive, race-based, federally-imposed controls are removed (most frequently through lawsuits), then school admissions, employer hiring, and housing patterns are once again freely determined by democratic citizen choice.

**Segregation** – The legal separation of different races in daily life.
DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated to my beloved sister, Margaret Makashila Matabane, and my mother-in-law, Talitha Nkhabane Phatlane - both of whom did not live to see a doctor in their family.

Mma waka montedi, Salenyana’a Mmarena, ke re Pheladi! Le šomile la nthekela seleiti, lena, le papa, Tatiane, Tšakala Maesela Mohumanti wa bo Ngwato- Serogole. Go lena ke re Montshepetša bošego! Le go Masanika, kera ou sesi, ke re Ngwato Mosadi, Mpedi’a Mmamakatane’a ditlou! O se fetše ka nna mokgaga o mošweu le bošego!
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am not able to mention the names of all the people who - directly and indirectly, and through personal and professional engagement - contributed to the successful completion of this thesis, but I thank all of them for sharing their experiences and expertise with me. I want to thank the Almighty because I know that ‘the beginning of wisdom is to fear God’.

The following institutions and individuals provided the necessary resources for the successful completion of this project, The University of Pretoria (UP), The National Research Foundation (NRF), South Africa-Netherlands Research Programme on Alternatives in Development (SANPAD) and The Centre for Evaluation and Assessment at the University of Pretoria.

The staff of the University of Pretoria library, the staff of the National Library of South Africa in Pretoria and the staff of The Human Sciences Research Council Library went out of their way to provide the assistance I needed. Lastly, I would also like to thank the following people individually:

- My supervisor, Professor Chika Sehoole for the encouraging professional engagement. Professor Sehoole, I greatly appreciate your hard work and academic engagement with my work.

- My co-supervisor, Professor Johan Beckmann for his professional advice throughout this study. Professor Beckmann, thank you for believing in me.

- My co-supervisor, Professor Brigitte Smit for her expert advice on the research methodology section of the thesis. Professor Smit, your meticulous attention to detail has influenced mine.

- My mentor, Professor Mokubung Nkomo for motivating and mentoring my research process and progress; and for financial assistance. Professor Nkomo, your standards shaped my own!
• Professor Sarah Howie for financial assistance. Professor Howie, thank you for picking up the pieces when things were just about to fall apart!

• Professor Jonathan Jansen, for taking a personal interest in my work. Professor Jansen, there are not many Deans like you!

• Professor Walter Greyvenstein for editing this thesis.

• My family, Steve, Nkoromane, Ditsepu and Talitha, for your constant, unconditional love and support.
## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ANC</td>
<td>African National Congress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AWB</td>
<td>Afrikaner Weerstand Beweging(^1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DoE</td>
<td>Department of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDM</td>
<td>Mass Democratic Movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEPI</td>
<td>National Education Policy Investigation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NP</td>
<td>National Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OS</td>
<td>Observation Schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA</td>
<td>South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SASA</td>
<td>South African Schools Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SGB</td>
<td>School Governing Body</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SJ1</td>
<td>The first School Journal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SJ2</td>
<td>The second School Journal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMT</td>
<td>School Management Team</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UKZN</td>
<td>University of KwaZulu-Natal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA</td>
<td>The United States of America</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^1\) Africaner Resistance Movement
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 3.5</td>
<td>Diversity within the sample of learners</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.1:</td>
<td>The growth in learners’ enrolment, 1995-1998 and 2004</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

- DECLARATION OF ORIGINALITY i
- SUMMARY AND KEY WORDS ii
- GLOSSARY OF WORDS iii
- DEDICATION v
- ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS vi-
- LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS viii
- LIST OF TABLES ix
- TABLE OF CONTENTS x

## CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCING THE INQUIRY 1

1.1 Introduction 1  
1.2 Justification of the study 4  
1.3 Analysis of the research problem 10  
1.4 Interest in this area of research 12  
1.5 Research approach 13  
1.6 The research site: Van den Berg High School 16  
1.7 Limitations of the study 21  
1.8 Delimitation of the study 23  
1.9 Overview of the study 24

## CHAPTER 2: REVIEWING THE LITERATURE IN SEARCH OF THEORY 26

### PART I: DEBATES ON RACE, RACISM, SEGREGATION, DESEGREGATION AND INTEGRATION

2.1 Introduction 26  
2.2 Conceptual base 26

### PART II: THE HISTORY OF SEGREGATION AND DESEGREGATION IN SOUTH AFRICA 37

2.3 The origins and forms of racial segregation in South African education 37  
2.3.1 Education in the pre-apartheid period 38  
2.3.2 Education during apartheid - Bantu Education 41  
2.3.3 The post-apartheid desegregation policies and practices 48

### PART III: REVIEW OF BOTH NATIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL LITERATURE ON DIVERSITY AND SCHOOL DESEGREGATION 52
CHAPTER 3: FINDING MY WAY THROUGH THE RESEARCH

3.1 Introduction 64
3.2 The qualitative Research paradigm 64
3.3 Social constructivism and interpretive paradigms 66
3.4 Research Design 68
3.5 Research methodology 73
   3.5.1 Site selection 73
   3.5.2 Sampling of participants 75
   3.5.3 Other considerations about the sample 77
3.6 Data Collection and rationale for choice of methods 78
   3.6.1 Document Analysis 79
   3.6.2 Direct Observations 80
   3.6.3 Participant observation 82
   3.6.4 Limitations of participant observation 87
   3.6.5 Interviews 88
   3.6.6 Dynamics of the interviews 90
   3.6.7 Data management 92
   3.6.8 Data analysis 92
   3.6.9 Content analysis 95
3.7 Methodological norms 97
   3.7.1 Trustworthiness, dependability, transferability and credibility 97
3.8 Ethical considerations 99
3.9 Conclusion 101

CHAPTER 4: THE METAMORPHOSIS OF A DESEGREGATING SCHOOL 103

4.1 Introduction 103
4.2 The national context 103
4.3 The school context 104
4.3.1 The egg stage 105
4.3.2 The larva stage 110
4.3.3 The pupa stage 114
4.4 Notable incidents of racial tension at Van Den Berg high School 119
   4.4.1 The rugby match incident 119
   4.4.2 The stabbing incident 120
   4.4.3 White boys’ petition on hairstyle 121
   4.4.4 Black learners’ memorandum on racist staff 124
   4.4.5 Persistent discrimination: Stereotypes among the parents, the teachers and the learners 126
   4.4.6 The newspaper clipping about retaining Afrikaans as the only language of instruction 135
CHAPTER 5: THE ADULT STAGE: IS CLOSE PROXIMITY JOY OR PAIN?

5.1 Introduction 138
5.2 The role of leadership in integration 139
5.3 Some progressive initiatives to make desegregation possible 142
  5.3.1 A change in the school’s language policy 142
  5.3.2 Attempts to change the school’s name 147
5.3.3 The desegregation of the School Governing Body 151
5.4 Learners’ awareness of their changed environment 153
  5.4.1 Academic integration 156
  5.4.2 Integration through sport 158
  5.4.3 Social relations 160
    5.4.3.1 Extra-ordinary friendship 163
5.5 Conclusion 167

CHAPTER 6: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS: IS INTEGRATION THE ANSWER?

6.1 Introduction 175
6.2 Overview 175
6.3 Findings 179
  6.3.1 Introduction 179
  6.3.2 Findings from scanning the literature on integration 179
  6.3.3 Contrast within the data 180
  6.3.4 Shift in mindsets 181
  6.3.5 Economic impact on the process of desegregation 182
  6.3.6 Resistance to change followed by acceptance of change 183
  6.3.7 The composition of staff and the curriculum 184
  6.3.8 Learners think differently from their parents 185
  6.3.9 The issue of language 186
  6.3.10 The role of leadership in school integration 187
6.4 Recommendations 188
  6.4.1 General recommendations 188
    6.4.1.1 Sport 188
    6.4.1.2 Staffing issues and integration 189
    6.4.1.3 School name change 190
    6.4.1.4 Desegregated residential areas 191
    6.4.1.5 Diversity learning programmes 192
    6.4.1.6 Virtues in a diverse environment 192
  6.4.2 Recommendations for further research 193

BIBLIOGRAPHY 195
APPENDIX 1 Description of learner participants

APPENDIX 2 Interview Protocol

APPENDIX 3 Ethical Clearance from the University of Pretoria

APPENDIX 4 Permission granted from the Gauteng Department of Education

APPENDIX 5 Permission from the school and a copy of the consent form

APPENDIX 6 Kaleidoscope of desegregation in most South African Schools

APPENDIX 7 Demographics of learners at Van Den Berg High School from the School’s EMIS data of 2004