

# TEACHERS' IMPLEMENTATION OF AN ASSET-BASED INTERVENTION FOR SCHOOL-BASED PSYCHOSOCIAL SUPPORT

#### **Mathilda Christina Loots**

## UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA 2011



## TEACHERS' IMPLEMENTATION OF AN ASSET-BASED INTERVENTION FOR SCHOOL-BASED PSYCHOSOCIAL SUPPORT

by

#### **Mathilda Christina Loots**

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

## PHILOSOPHIA DOCTOR in EDUCATIONAL PSYCHOLOGY

Department of Educational Psychology
Faculty of Education
University of Pretoria
South Africa

Supervisor: Professor Dr. Liesel Ebersöhn

Co-Supervisors: Professor Dr. Ronél Ferreira & Professor Dr. Irma Eloff

**PRETORIA** 

2011



#### Acknowledgements

- To the participating teachers in my study, thank you for letting me into your worlds.
   You have taught me about life's assets, resilience and hope.
- To Liesel, thank you for being my mentor throughout this endeavour. Your creativity, enthusiasm, passion and zest for research (and life) were a great inspiration and will always be.
- To Ronél, thank you for wetting my appetite for research and nurturing me on my PhD journey. You've been blessed with an eye for detail - thank you for opening my eyes as well.
- To Irma, thank you for believing in me, providing me with scholarly guidance and cheering me all the way to the podium.
- To Hermien, my co-researcher, for all the rewarding hours of reflection about life and research while travelling by car. I appreciate your moral support.
- To Cobus, the love in my life and my pillar of strength. Thank you for all your encouragement, motivation and support in pursuit of my dream. You are the best!
- To Meiring and Miemie, my dear parents, thank you for believing in me every step of this long journey. Your unconditional love and prayers provided me with freedom and courage to fly. You mean the world to me.
- To Bertie and Leonie, my parents in law, thank you for embracing me as a daughter and supporting and encouraging me all the way.
- To my brothers, Hennie and Abraham, thank you for always being there when your sister needed you. We make a great trio.
- To all my brothers and sisters in law, thank you for your interest in my studies and your support along the road.
- To all my friends over the past years, thank you for balancing my life with good company, wine and food.
- Above all, I want to thank the Lord for this opportunity and all the amazing people that shared this journey with me.



#### **Declaration of Authorship**

I, Mathilda Christina Loots, declare that

### Teachers' implementation of an asset-based intervention for school-based psychosocial support

•	rk and that all sources and citations from literature a acknowledged in-text and referenced in full.
Signature:	

Date:



#### TABLE OF CONTENTS

#### **CHAPTER 1**

#### Introducing the study

1.1	Introduction and background to the study	Page
1.2	Purpose of the study	2
1.3	Rationale of the study	3
1.3.1	Why teachers?	3
1.3.2	Why psychosocial support?	5
1.3.3	Why the asset-based approach?	6
1.3.4	Why a comparative case study design, with participatory rural appraisal (PRA) principles?	
1.4	Theoretical assumptions of STAR	8
1.5	Clarification of key concepts	8
1.5.1	Asset-based approach	8
1.5.2	Psychosocial support and resilience	9
1.5.3	School-community context	10
1.6	Contributions of the study	12
1.7	Summary of the framework of the research process	13
1.8	Outline of chapters	16



### CHAPTER 2 Literature review as background to the study

		Page
2.1	Introduction	19
2.2	Asset-based approach as theoretical framework	20
2.2.1	Positive psychology as overarching ethos	21
2.2.2	Asset-based approach	23
2.2.3	Asset-based approach as window on different systems	29
2.2.4	Asset-based community development (ABCD)	30
2.2.5	Contextual dependencies as potential challenge of the asset-based approach	31
2.2.6	Reviewing studies conducted within the framework of the asset-based approach	33
2.3	Assumptions underpinning community psychology relevant to the study	38
2.4	Barriers and resources in communities	41
2.4.1	Socio-economic barriers prevalent in South African communities	42
2.4.2	Resilience in communities	47
2.4.3	Schools and teachers as protective resources	50
2.4.4	School-based community support	54
2.5	Changing roles of teachers	57
2.5.1	Community, citizenship and pastoral role	58
2.5.2	Additional stressors of teaching	63
2.5.3	Teachers' resilience in dealing with stressors	68
2.6	Conclusion	69



### CHAPTER 3 Research methodology and strategy

		Page
3.1	Introduction	70
3.2	Paradigmatic assumptions	71
3.2.1	Methodological paradigm	71
3.2.2	Applying participatory rural appraisal (PRA) principles	72
3.2.3	Meta-theoretical paradigm	75
3.3	Research process	77
3.3.1	The current study within STAR intervention	78
3.3.2	Research process in the current study	78
3.3.3	Intervention phase	79
3.4	Research design	92
3.4.1	Comparative case study	92
3.4.2	Selection of cases	97
3.4.3	Selection of participants	99
3.5	Data collection	100
3.5.1	Focus groups	101
3.5.2	Observation	106
3.5.3	Visual documentation	109
3.5.4	Intervention artefacts: asset maps and visual data	116
3.6	Data analysis and interpretation	117
3.6.1	Constructivist grounded theory of thematic analysis and interpretation	117
3.6.2	The process of data analysis and interpretation	118
3.7	Quality criteria of the study	122
3.7.1	Credibility	123
3.7.2	Transferability	124
3.7.3	Dependability	125
3.7.4	Confirmability	125
3.7.5	Authenticity	127



3.8	Ethical considerations	128
3.8.1	Expertise of the researcher	128
3.8.2	Confidentiality, anonymity and trust	129
3.8.3	Positional discrepancies	130
3.8.4	Cultural and language differences	132
3.8.5	Sensitive information obtained	133
3.8.6	The role of the researcher	134
3.9	Conclusion	138



#### Theme 1: Teachers using an asset-based approach for psychosocial support

4.1	Introduction	Page
7.1	Introduction.	140
4.2	Subtheme 1.1: Teachers identifying assets	148
4.2.1	Category1: Identifying individual assets	148
4.2.2	Category 2: Identifying community assets	151
4.3	Subtheme 1.2: Teachers mobilising assets	157
4.3.1	Category 1: Mobilising individuals' assets	157
4.3.2	Category 2: Mobilising natural and environmental resources	170
4.3.3	Category 3: Mobilising physical resources	178
4.3.4	Category 4: Mobilising assets by building networks and partnerships	184
4.4	Subtheme 1.3: Teachers managing the asset-based process	197
4.4.1	Category 1: Identifying additional assets	197
4.4.2	Category 2: Revising existing strategies and planning new strategies	198
4.4.3	Category 3: Envisioning new possibilities and outcomes	201
4.5	Literature control: Positioning the findings within existing literature	202
4.5.1	Confirmation of existing knowledge with regard to teachers' implementation of the asset-based approach.	203
4.5.2	Contradictions in existing knowledge with regard to teachers' implementation of the asset-based approach	216
4.5.3	Silences in existing knowledge with regard to teachers' implementation of	210
<b>4.3.</b> 3	the asset-based approach	218
4.6	Insight in the way teachers implement the asset-based approach for	
	psychosocial support	221
4.7	Conclusion	225



#### Theme 2: Teachers addressing barriers resourcefully

		Page
5.1	Introduction	226
5.2	Teachers acknowledging and addressing barriers	227
5.3	Subtheme 2.1: Stressors of teaching	235
5.3.1	Category1: Workload and related time constraints of teaching	235
5.3.2	Category 2: Attrition of group members	242
5.3.3	Category 3: Low levels of parental involvement and communication	247
5.3.4	Category 4: Context-specific factors	249
5.4	Subtheme 2.2: Barriers related to social and/or economic factors	257
5.4.1	Category 1: HIV/AIDS-related barriers	257
5.4.2	Category 2: Financial constraints due to poverty and unemployment	271
5.4.3	Category 3: Child abuse	279
5.5	Literature control: Positioning the findings within existing literature	281
5.5.1	Confirmation of existing knowledge with regard to barriers acknowledged and addressed by teachers	281
5.5.2	Contradictions in existing knowledge with regard to the way teachers acknowledged and addressed barriers	304
5.5.3	Silences in existing knowledge with regard to the way teachers acknowledged and addressed barriers	309
5.6	Insight in the way teachers address barriers resourcefully	313
5.7	Conclusion	318



#### Theme 3: Teachers' demonstrated asset-based competencies

6.1	Introduction	Page 319
6.2	Subtheme 3.1: Positive identity formation	327
6.2.1	Category 1: Personal growth and reflective thinking	327
6.2.2	Category 2: Commitment	329
6.2.3	Category 3: Optimism	332
6.2.4	Category 4: Pride in their accomplishments	333
6.2.5	Category 5: feelings of competence and enhanced self-confidence	338
6.3	Subtheme 3.2: Group effectiveness skills	340
6.3.1	Category 1: Group communication skills	340
6.3.2	Category 2: Roles and responsibilities within a group	343
6.3.3	Category 3: Positive group relations	348
6.4	Subtheme 3.3: Management skills	353
6.4.1	Category 1: Goal setting and monitoring skills	353
6.4.2	Category 2: Problem-solving skills	361
6.4.3	Category 3: Networking skills	362
6.4.4	Category 4: Leadership skills	363
6.4.5	Category 5: Agency towards pastoral support and care	369
6.5	Literature control: Positioning the findings within existing literature	373
6.5.1	Confirmation of existing knowledge on teachers' demonstrated asset-based competencies	374
6.5.2	Contradictions in existing knowledge with regard to teachers' demonstrated asset-based competencies	390
6.5.3	Silences in existing knowledge with regard to teachers' demonstrated asset-based competencies	393
6.6	Insight in teachers' demonstrated asset-based competencies	394
6.6.1	Positive psychological states as building blocks of positive identity formation	394
6.6.2	Dynamic interplay between asset-based competencies within the framework of the self-determination theory	396
6.7	Conclusion	402



#### **Conclusions and recommendations**

7.1	Introduction	Page 403
/ <b>.1</b>	Introduction.	403
7.2	Revisiting theoretical assumptions	403
7.3	Theorising the primary research question of the study	409
7.4	Theoretical contributions of the study	412
7.4.1	Asset-based approach	412
7.4.2	Resilience and school-based psychosocial support	413
7.5	Limitations of the study	415
7.5.1	Selection of participating teachers	415
7.5.2	Complexity of teachers' competencies	416
7.5.3	Differences with regard to language and culture	417
7.5.4	The role of the researcher	418
7.6	Recommendations	418
7.6.1	Recommendations for future research	418
7.6.2	Recommendations for practice	421
7.6.3	Recommendations for future training and development	421
7.7	Final Reflection	422

------

.



#### LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1	Summarised outline of literature review and theoretical assumptions	20
Figure 3.1	An example of a personal dedication card of one of the participating teachers in School 2	90
Figure 3.2	A geographic presentation of the locality of the four case studies	98
Figure 4.1	A schematic presentation of the process that was followed in order to generate insight in the way teachers use an asset-based approach for psychosocial support	141
Figure 4.2	The way in which participating teachers implemented the asset-based approach to address vulnerability in terms of psychosocial support	222
Figure 4.3	Teachers as change agents for asset-based psychosocial support	224
Figure 5.1	A schematic presentation of the process that was followed in order to generate insight in the way teachers address barriers resourcefully	227
Figure 5.2	Schematic presentation of teachers' asset-based orientation towards addressing barriers resourcefully	317
Figure 6.1	A schematic presentation of the process that was followed in order to generate insight in teachers' asset-based competencies	320
Figure 6.2	An example of a dedication card of one of the teachers in school 1 that was created during intervention session 5	331
Figure 6.3	The dynamic relationship between positive psychological states as building blocks of positive identity formation	395
Figure 6.4	Building blocks of asset-based competencies	399
Figure 6.5	Asset-based competencies within the framework of self-determination theory	401
Figure 7.1	Theorising the primary research question of the study	410



#### LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1	Framework of the research process that was followed in the current study	14
T 11 2 1		
Table 3.1	An outline of the research methodology and process	70
Table 3.2	Summary of the sessions conducted during the intervention phase of the research study	80
Table 3.3	Summary of the rationale behind the convenient sampling for each case	97
Table 3.4	Summary of the data collection and documentation process	100
Table 3.5	Summary of the dates of the baseline information focus groups conducted in each case	105
Table 3.6	Summary of the dates of the follow-up focus groups conducted in each case	105
Table 4.1	Summary of Theme 1's subthemes, categories, inclusion indicators and exclusion indicators	142
Table 4.2	Summarised comparison between the results of asset-mobilisation in the four school-community contexts that participated in the study	195
Table 5.1	Summary of Theme 2's subthemes, categories, inclusion indicators and exclusion indicators	231
Table 5.2	Summarised table of informal surveys conducted amongst participating teachers on the approximate numbers of orphans in 2005 and 2009 in relation with the approximate number of children in their schools	260
Table 6.1	Summary of Theme 3's subthemes, categories, inclusion indicators and exclusion indicators	321
Table 7.1	HIV/AIDS-related barriers identified by teachers from four school-community contexts	406
Table 7.2	Stressors to teaching identified by teachers from four schools	407



#### **ADDENDA**

Addenda: see compact disc

- Addendum A: Documents related to the research methodology and strategy
  - A1 Summary of concluded research within STAR
  - A2 Summary of STAR's funded research projects and the duration thereof
  - A3 Schedule of workshop / intervention sessions conducted at the four schools
  - A4 Summary of the particulars of participating teachers in each case
  - A5 Summary of the selection and number of participants in each case
  - A6 Focus group
  - A7 Video clip showing the context of each of the participating communities
- Addendum B Documents related to data analysis and interpretation
  - B1 Examples of the researcher's thematic data analysis
  - B2 Examples of the co-researcher's thematic data analysis
  - B3 Examples of researcher notes during the process of refining broad themes into specific categories
  - B4 The meaning making process that was followed in order to present insight in the way teachers reportedly addressed barriers resourcefully, as presented in Theme 2
  - B5 Extract from audiovisual data captured at the Hartbeespoort dam seminar.
- Addendum C Official documentation
  - C1 Ethical clearance certificate
  - C2 Example of an informed consent form (participants)
  - C3 Example of an informed consent form (principals)
  - C4 Consent letter from Eastern Cape Department of Education
  - C5 Consent letter from Mpumalanga Department of Education
  - C6 Consent letter from Gauteng Department of Education



#### Addendum D Newspaper articles

- D1 A newspaper article on School 1's vegetable garden, titled "'Mama Garden' plants a field of hope", published in the *Weekend Post*.
- D2 A newspaper article on School 1's HIV/AIDS Support and Information Centre, titled "Teachers build together against AIDS", published in the *Port Elizabeth Express*.



#### **ABSTRACT**

Against the background of various socio-economic barriers in many South African school-community contexts, I compared how teachers in four schools implemented an asset-based intervention aimed at school-based psychosocial support. The working assumption was that teachers could act as protective resources in implementing the asset-based approach (following their participation in STAR<sup>1</sup>) to promote psychosocial support in their school-community contexts.

The four schools were conveniently selected as information-rich cases to participate in the research study. The four cases comprised one informal settlement primary school in the Eastern Cape, two urban primary schools in Gauteng and one rural secondary school in Mpumalanga. Purposeful sampling was used to select ten participating teachers (n=40) in each school. Methodologically, the study followed a qualitative paradigm and a comparative case study design, implementing participatory rural appraisal (PRA) principles. The asset-based approach was used as theoretical framework. Multiple data gathering (focus groups, observation and intervention artefacts) and documentation procedures (verbatim transcripts, field notes, research journal and visual data) were implemented over a period of three years. Following constructivist grounded theory analysis, three main themes emerged: teachers using an asset-based approach for psychosocial support; teachers addressing barriers resourcefully; and teachers' demonstrated asset-based competencies.

The findings of the current study confirm that schools as part of unique systems are interrelated in terms of networks that mobilise assets, irrespective of the context. Teachers experience and prioritise a) socio-economic barriers (HIV/AIDS, financial constraints due to poverty and unemployment, and child abuse) and b) stressors of teaching (workload and related time constraints, attrition of group members, low levels of parent involvement, as well as context-specific factors). Teachers' identification of barriers is determined by school contexts. Across school contexts teachers identified a) internal assets in their classrooms, the school context and in their communities together with b) community resources (physical resources, natural and environmental resources, community organisations and institutions). In psychosocial support, teachers mobilised identified assets and resources to ameliorate the impact of barriers. Teachers therefore promoted resilience by means of psychosocial support.

=

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Supportive Teachers, Assets and Resilience



The characteristics of school-based psychosocial support include identifying assets, prioritising barriers, mobilising assets to ameliorate the presence of barriers and establishing systemic networks and partnerships. When providing psychosocial support, teachers demonstrated asset-based competencies (positive identity formation, group effectiveness skills and management skills) signified as internal protective resources.

By dynamically engaging in the challenges of their school-community contexts, teachers demonstrated self-determination (Deci & Ryan, 1985, 2002; Ryan & Deci, 2000, 2002) In the process, teachers displayed and actualised asset-based competencies, which in turn fulfilled the underlying psychological needs of competence, relatedness and autonomy. When they implemented the asset-based approach, it seemed to enhance teachers' sense of coherence (Antonovsky, 1987) as they viewed the existence of barriers as being comprehensible, manageable and meaningful. Teachers were able to address barriers at an intrapersonal and interpersonal level as well as by deploying management skills. The three levels on which teachers addressed barriers correlate with their asset-based competencies. Their asset-based competency of positive identity formation was utilised to address barriers on an intrapersonal level; their group effectiveness skills addressed barriers on a level of administrating barriers efficiently.

The study provides empirical evidence to broaden the current knowledge bases of the asset-based approach, resilience and school-based psychosocial support. The study contributes to the existing knowledge base of the asset-based approach by firstly highlighting social capital in school-community contexts as potential outcome of the implementation of the asset-based approach. Secondly, the study introduces asset-based competencies, as well as the dynamic relationship between these competencies and fundamental psychological needs (competence, relatedness and autonomy) as signified in self-determination theory (Deci & Ryan, 1985, 2002; Ryan & Deci, 2000, 2002). Lastly, the study conjectures the interconnectedness between the asset-based approach and a sense of coherence, in the sense that implementation of the asset-based approach could result in enhanced eustress (Simmons & Nelson, 2005) and sense of coherence (Antonovsky, 1987, 1993) when faced with and addressing barriers.



Within the context of the existing knowledge base of resilience in schools and school-based psychosocial support, the findings suggest that resilience in schools could be promoted by teacher-driven psychosocial support initiatives. Firstly, the study signifies greater insight in teachers' perspective on the potential assets and resources available in school-community contexts that could be mobilised for psychosocial support and the promotion of resilience. Secondly, the findings suggest empirical evidence that teachers (in a school context) can mobilise resources so that schools may serve as protective resources to promote resilience through school-based psychosocial support. Thirdly, the study contributes to new insight in possible barriers that teachers could encounter on a daily basis as well as the sort of psychosocial support that could be expected from similar school-based interventions. Lastly, the study provides insight into potential ways in which teachers can address barriers on an intrapersonal and interpersonal level and by deploying management skills.

#### **Key concepts:**

- Asset-based approach
- Assets and resources
- Barriers
- Community
- Pastoral role of teachers
- Positive psychology
- Protective resources
- Psychosocial support
- Resilience
- School-community context