A PROFILE ON ALCOHOL CONSUMPTION AMONG SOUTH AFRICAN DENTISTS – A DENTIST’S PERSPECTIVE

DR JH OLIVIER

Student number: 71006398

Submitted for the partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree PhD (General Human Sciences)

In the
FACULTY OF HUMANITIES
DEPARTMENT OF SOCIAL WORK AND CRIMINOLOGY
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

PROMOTER: DR CL CARBONATTO

April 2008

© University of Pretoria
DECLARATION

Full name:  ___Jan Hendrik Olivier___________________________________________

Student Number: ___71006398______________________________________________

Degree/Qualification: ___PhD General Human Sciences________________________

Title of thesis/dissertation: ___A profile on alcohol consumption among South African Dentists – A dentist’s perspective________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

I declare that this thesis / dissertation is my own original work. Where secondary material is used, this has been carefully acknowledged and referenced in accordance with university requirements.

I understand what plagiarism is and am aware of university policy in this regard.

________________________________    21 October 2008
SIGNATURE               DATE
Acknowledgements

Many people have unwittingly played an important role in my decision to write a PhD thesis on this subject, and I wish to thank them all. The fact that I am a dentist, and involved in the natural sciences did not discourage me from tackling a subject that actually belongs to the social sciences. Firstly I owe thanks to the Faculty of Humanities, Department of Social Work and Criminology at the University of Pretoria for allowing me the opportunity to be a student in their faculty. I sincerely appreciate their support. A special thanks to the Departmental Head, Professor Lombard, for arranging my registration in her department, and to Doctor Charlene Carbonatto, my promoter, for her dedicated assistance. I also want to express my gratitude to Jacque Summerville from the Department of Statistics, University of Pretoria for assisting me with the statistical analysis of the quantitative research findings.

I want to thank Amanda Coetzer for editing this thesis in such a professional and friendly way.

I also owe thanks to Professors’ Neels du Preez and Theuns Oberholzer, as well as the rest of the staff of the Department of Operative Dentistry, School of Dentistry, University of Limpopo, Medunsa Campus, for their support, understanding and encouragement which inspired me to complete this thesis.

I want to express my gratitude to all my colleagues who willingly participated in this research, because without respondents this type of research is impossible.

Last, but definitely not the least, I want to thank my wife Louise and my children Janine, Janie and Jan for their continuous support and encouragement, especially when my courage failed me.
Abstract

A profile on alcohol consumption among South African dentists – A dentist’s perspective: JH Olivier

Background

This study investigated alcohol use linked to the stress of a selected sample of South African dentists. The only other related topic in South Africa, that the researcher could find, was done in 1996 at the University of Stellenbosch. The literature suggests that prevalence studies of substance use and abuse rarely include dentists.

Methods

A dominant quantitative approach with a less dominant qualitative approach was utilized. The quantitative-descriptive design (survey with a questionnaire) was used to obtain data with regard to biographical/background information, stress and coping, quantity and frequency of alcohol use, and dysfunction as a result of alcohol use among a randomly selected sample of 110 South African dentists with a response rate of 70%. The respondents’ perspective on alcohol use linked to the stress of the dental profession with recommendations were also obtained.

For the qualitative data collection, the researcher utilized the collective case study. He planned semi-structured interviews with an interview schedule with five dentists that have already had treatment for alcohol abuse or were self-characterized as problem drinkers. Unfortunately, two of the respondents who characterized themselves as heavy alcohol users died before they could be interviewed. Because of ethical reasons and the sensitivity of the topic they could not be replaced.
Findings

The quantitative study indicated that: (1) the respondents experienced significant amounts of occupational stress (2) the majority of the respondents do physical exercise to reduce their stress (3) a great number of respondents socialize with friends to reduce their stress (4) some respondents actually use alcohol to reduce their stress (5) stress levels of the respondents in private practice and stress levels of the respondents in other sectors are the same (6) alcohol consumption of male and female dentists is the same (7) respondents who reported less areas of stress consumed more alcohol than those who reported more areas of stress (8) a great number of the respondents experience high stress levels but do not use alcohol, or they only use alcohol to socialize (9) less than 3% of the respondents reported that alcohol use has affected their work as a dentist (10) the majority of the respondents believe that some dentists consume alcohol as a coping mechanism concerning social anxiety, occupational stress and personal factors.

The qualitative study indicated that: (1) the habit of alcohol use that may lead to alcohol dependency starts at university (2) the respondents, who had treatment for alcohol dependency, experienced high levels of occupational stress (3) the respondents link their dependency directly to the stress and strain of their profession.

Conclusions

There are more intense and less intense stressors among South African dentists and there are some dentists that consume alcohol to relieve the stress and strain of their profession. However, the majority only use alcohol as a way of socializing. Less than 3% of the respondents reported that alcohol use has affected their work as a dentist.
Recommendations

Modules on coping mechanisms linked to the stress and strain of the dental profession should be included in the curricula at dental schools.

The compulsory CPD programme of the HPCSA should include stress management and healthy coping mechanism courses.

Key words:

Dentists
Occupational stress
Alcohol consumption
Quantitative approach
Qualitative approach
Survey
Case study
Social anxiety
Personal factors
Stress management.
# Table of contents

Declaration  i  
Acknowledgements  ii  
Abstract  iii  

## Chapter 1: General introduction

1.1 Introduction  1  
1.2 Problem formulation  9  
1.3 Purpose, goal and objectives  11  
  1.3.1 Purpose  12  
  1.3.2 Goal  12  
  1.3.3 Objectives  13  
1.4 Underlying research questions  13  
1.5 Research approach  14  
1.6 Type of research  15  
1.7 Research design and methodology  15  
  1.7.1 Research design  16  
    1.7.1.1 Quantitative research design  16  
    1.7.1.2 Qualitative research design  16  
  1.7.2 Data collection methods and techniques  17  
    1.7.2.1 Quantitative data collection  18  
    1.7.2.2 Qualitative data collection  18  
  1.7.3 Method of data analysis  19  
    1.7.3.1 Quantitative data analysis  19  
    1.7.3.2 Qualitative data analysis  19  
1.8 Pilot study, testing the data collection instruments, feasibility  21  
1.9 Research population, sample and sampling methods  22  
  1.9.1 Universe  22
1.9.2 Research population
1.9.3 Delimitation of the study
1.9.4 Research sample
1.9.5 Research sampling methods and procedures
   1.9.5.1 Quantitative sampling
   1.9.5.2 Qualitative sampling
1.10 Ethical aspects
   1.10.1 Harm to experimental subjects
   1.10.2 Informed consent
   1.10.3 Deception
   1.10.4 Confidentiality
   1.10.5 Action and competence of researcher
   1.10.6 Cooperation with contributors
   1.10.7 Release of findings and publications
   1.10.8 Debriefing of subjects
1.11 Definition of key concepts
   1.11.1 Dentist and dentistry
   1.11.2 Alcohol consumption
   1.11.3 Alcoholism
   1.11.4 Addiction
   1.11.5 Occupational stress
1.12 Limitations of the study
1.13 Content of the thesis

Chapter 2: Alcohol use, abuse, and alcoholism

2.1 Introduction
2.2 Definition of key terms
   2.2.1 Alcoholism (alcohol dependency)
   2.2.2 Alcohol abuse
   2.2.3 Addiction
2.2.4 Medical, psychiatric and psychological terms

2.3 Alcoholism

2.4 Models, theories and classifications to explain alcoholism

2.4.1 The moralistic theory of substance dependency

2.4.2 The medical model (theory) of substance dependency

2.4.3 The genetic theory of substance dependency

2.4.4 The psychiatric classification of substance dependency

2.4.5 The psychological model of addiction

2.4.6 Other models to explain drinking behaviour

2.5 The effects of alcohol

2.5.1 Behavioural effects of alcohol

2.5.2 Psychological consequences of alcohol

2.5.2.1 Neurosis and personality disorder

2.5.2.2 Schizophrenia, alcohol hallucinosis and pathological jealousy

2.5.3 Physical consequences of alcohol abuse

2.5.3.1 Effects on the digestive system

2.5.3.2 Effects on the cardiovascular and respiratory system

2.5.3.3 Haematological, musculoskeletal, endocrine and metabolic disorders

2.5.3.4 Effects on the central nervous system

2.6 The pharmacological and nutritional impact of alcohol (ethanol)

2.7 Alcohol use and abuse in South Africa

2.8 Summary
Chapter 3: Factors in the dental profession that cause occupational stress, anxiety and burnout

3.1 Introduction

3.2 Definition of key concepts
3.2.1 Dentist and Dentistry
3.2.2 Stress (Definition)
3.2.3 Occupational stress
3.2.4 Burnout (Definition)
3.2.5 Anxiety

3.3 Stress

3.4 Burnout

3.5 Occupational stress factors in the dental profession
3.5.1 Economic stressors
3.5.2 Practice management and stress
3.5.3 Job satisfaction and stress
3.5.4 Dental procedures and stress, as well as overall stress
3.5.5 Age and stress
3.5.6 Working environment and stress
3.5.7 Personality (individual aspects) and stress
3.5.8 General health and stress

3.6 Management of stress

3.7 Summary

Chapter 4: The phenomenon of alcohol consumption and alcohol related problems among dentists

4.1 Introduction

4.2 Definition of key concepts
4.2.1 Alcohol consumption
4.2.2 Alcohol abuse
Chapter 5: Empirical findings from the quantitative phase of the study

5.1 Introduction

5.2 Research methodology for the quantitative approach
   5.2.1 Type of research, research approach and design
   5.2.2 Research questions
   5.2.3 Objectives
   5.2.4 Methods of data collection
      5.2.4.1 Quantitative data collection
   5.2.5 Sample (Sampling method)
      5.2.5.1 Quantitative sampling
   5.2.6 Method of data analysis
      5.2.6.1 Quantitative data analysis

5.3 Research findings of the quantitative phase
   5.3.1 Biographical data of the respondents
      5.3.1.1 Gender
      5.3.1.2 Age group
      5.3.1.3 Marital status
      5.3.1.4 The provinces of the RSA represented
      5.3.1.5 The South African population groups represented
      5.3.1.6 Current form of full time practice
      5.3.1.7 Undergraduate qualifications
      5.3.1.8 Post graduate qualifications
5.4 Background information of the respondents

5.4.1 Parent(s) / Guardian(s)

5.4.2 Number of towns lived in and number of schools attended

5.4.3 Health of the respondents during their first 18 years of life

5.4.4 The financial positions of the families who raised the respondents

5.4.5 Alcohol habits of the respondents female and male guardians

5.4.6 Drug habits of the respondents female and male guardians

5.4.7 Relationship with parent(s) / guardian(s)

5.4.8 Components of relationship with parent(s) guardian(s)

5.4.8.1 Components of the relationship with female parent / guardian

5.4.8.2 Components of the relationship with male parent / guardian

5.4.9 Childhood and school career

5.5 Stress and coping with stress

5.5.1 Alcohol or other substances used as a dental student

5.5.2 Positive effects of alcohol for dental students

5.5.3 Causes of stress in the dental profession

5.5.4 Reasons for currently using alcohol

5.5.5 Measures that the respondents use to relieve stress

5.5.6 Stress in private dental practice compared to stress in other sectors

5.6 History of alcohol use or abuse and dysfunction

5.6.1 Alcohol consumption among this sample

5.6.2 Quantity and frequency of alcohol use per month

5.6.3 Alcohol consumption on weekend days

5.6.4 Alcohol consumption on weekdays
5.6.5 Comparison of alcohol consumption by stress category
5.6.6 The effect of alcohol on work as a dentist.
5.6.7 How alcohol has affected the personal lives of the respondents
5.6.8 How alcohol has affected personal functioning
5.6.9 The effect of alcohol on the health of the respondents
5.7 How dentists perceive alcohol use of other dentists
5.7.1 Alcohol use by dental students
5.7.2 Alcohol use to relieve stress derived from doing dentistry
5.7.3 Occupational stress, personal factors and alcohol use
5.8 Future recommendations
5.8.1 Suggestions of what should be included in dental curricula
5.8.2 Suggestions for dentists to manage or alleviate stress
5.8.3 Other recommendations specified by the respondents
5.9 Summary of the quantitative findings

Chapter 6: Empirical findings from the qualitative phase of the study

6.1 Introduction
6.2 Research methodology for the qualitative approach
6.2.1 Type of research, research approach and design
6.2.2 Goal
6.2.3 Objectives
6.2.4 Research questions
6.2.5 Methods of data collection
   6.2.5.1 Qualitative data collection
6.2.6 Sample (Sampling method)
   6.2.6.1 Qualitative sampling
6.2.7 Method of data analysis
6.2.7.1 Qualitative data analysis  

6.3 Categories, themes and sub themes derived from the interviews  
6.3.1 Category 1: Alcohol dependency and treatment  
6.3.2 Category 2: Background information of respondents  
6.3.3 Category 3: Stress in the dental profession and alcohol use  
6.3.4 Category 4: Quantity and frequency of alcohol use  
6.3.5 Category 5: Coping mechanisms  
6.3.6 Category 6: Recommendations  

6.4 Summary of the qualitative phase of the study  
6.4.1 Category history of alcohol dependency and treatment  
6.4.2 Category background information of the respondents  
6.4.3 Category stress factors and alcohol use  
6.4.4 Category quantity and frequency of alcohol use  
6.4.5 Category coping mechanisms  
6.4.6 Category recommendations  

Chapter 7: Summary, conclusions and recommendations

7.1 Introduction  

7.2 Summary of the research methodology  
7.2.1 The selection of a researchable topic  
7.2.2 Goal of the research  
7.2.3 Objectives.  
7.2.4 Research questions.  

7.3 Planning phase  

7.4 Implementation phase  

7.5 Interpretation phase  

7.6 Conclusions  
7.6.1 Dentistry as a stressful profession  
7.6.2 Stress relieving methods  
7.6.3 Quantity and frequency of alcohol consumption
7.6.4 Adverse effects of alcohol consumption 256
7.6.5 General beliefs 257
7.6.6 Training of dentists 259
7.7 Recommendations 259
  7.7.1 Dental curricula 259
  7.7.2 Managing and alleviating stress 261
  7.7.3 Dental practice 263
  7.7.4 Specific recommendations 264
7.8 Closing remarks 265
# List of Tables

## Chapter 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 1: Medical, psychiatric and psychological terms</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2: Comparison ICD-10 (WHO, 1987) and DSM-IV (APA, 1987, 1994)</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3: Alcohol content of a standard drink in various countries</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 5

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 1: Distribution of the provinces of South Africa where the respondents mostly grew up and attended school</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2: Current form of full time practice</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3: Parents / guardians with whom the respondents grew up</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4: Financial positions of the families who raised the respondents</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5: Alcohol habits of the female guardian of the respondents during their childhood</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6: Alcohol habits of the respondents male guardian during their childhood</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7: Prescription drugs used on a regular basis by the respondents parent(s) / guardian(s)</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 8: Street drugs from drug dealers used on a regular basis by the respondents parent(s) / guardian(s)</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 9: The relationship the respondents had with their parent(s) / guardian(s) during their childhood</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 10: The components of the relationship the respondents had with their female parent / guardian during their childhood</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 11: The components of the relationship the respondents had with their male parent/guardian during their childhood

Table 12a: Aspects concerning the respondents childhood and school career.

Table 12b: The reasons why the respondents used/abused alcohol as dental students

Table 13: The respondents reported the following causes of stress in the dental profession

Table 14: The reasons why the respondents are currently using alcohol

Table 15: Measures that the respondents take to reduce their stress

Table 16: How the use of alcohol has affected the respondents work as a dentist

Table 17: How the personal lives of the respondents have been influenced by alcohol

Table 18: How alcohol has affected the functioning in the respondents personal lives

Table 19: How alcohol use/abuse has affected the health of the respondents

Table 20: Other ways of how alcohol has affected the health of the respondents

Table 21: The viewpoint of the respondents concerning alcohol consumption among dental students

Table 22: The viewpoint of the respondents concerning alcohol consumption among dentists

Table 23: The viewpoint of the respondents concerning social anxiety, occupational stress and personal factors, linked to alcohol consumption, among dentists

Table 24: Recommendations of what should be included in dental curricula to prepare students to manage stress in dental practice.
Table 25: Recommendations for dentists to manage or alleviate stress 169
Table 26: Other recommendations specified by the respondents 170

Chapter 6

Table 1: Illustrated discussion of category 1: History of alcohol dependency and treatment for alcohol dependency 191
Table 2: Illustrated discussion of category 2: Background information of the family who raised the respondents. 198
Table 3: Illustrated discussion of category 3: Stress factors in the dental profession linked to alcohol use. 208
Table 4: Illustrated discussion of category 4: Quantity and frequency of alcohol use. 218
Table 5: Illustrated discussion of category 5: Coping mechanisms 223
Table 6.1: Illustrated discussion of category 6 theme 1: Dental curricula and stress of the dental profession (recommendations) 226
Table 6.2: Illustrated discussion of category 6 theme 2: Coping with stress.(recommendations) 228

Chapter 7

Table 1: The research process followed in this study 241
List of Figures

Chapter 5

Figure 1: Gender of respondents 113
Figure 2: Age group of the respondents 114
Figure 3: Marital status of the respondents 116
Figure 4: The South African population group to which the respondents belong 118
Figure 5: Undergraduate qualifications 120
Figure 6: Post graduate qualifications in dentistry. 121
Figure 7: Number of towns, cities and villages that the respondents lived in 124
Figure 8: The number of primary schools the respondents attended 125
Figure 9: The number of secondary schools the respondents attended 125
Figure 10: Use or over-use (abuse) of alcohol or any other substances as a dental student: 139
Figure 11: The number of dentists that had 5 or more drinks at least on 1 occasion per month in the last year 150
Figure 12: The number of dentists that had 5 or more drinks at least on 5 occasions per month in the last year 150
Figure 13: The number of weekend days they drink alcohol on average 152
Figure 14: The number of alcoholic drinks they drink on average on a weekend day (Friday to Sunday) 152
Figure 15: The number of weekdays (Monday-Thursday) they drink alcohol on average 154
Figure 16: The number of alcoholic drinks they drink on average on a weekday (Monday – Thursday). 154
Appendices

Appendix A: Ethical clearance 282
Appendix B: Letter of informed consent 283
Appendix C: Questionnaire 287
Appendix D: Interview schedule 301