THE IMPLEMENTATION, MONITORING AND MANAGEMENT OF AN EFFECTIVE LEGAL DEPOSIT SYSTEM FOR SOUTH AFRICA

by

Cecilia Elizabeth Penzhorn

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree
DPhil (Information Science)

Department of Information Science
Faculty of Engineering, Built Environment and Information Technology
University of Pretoria

April 2007
Summary

The aim of this study is to explore the issues surrounding the implementation, monitoring and management of legal deposit in South Africa.

Legal deposit is a statutory obligation which requires that a producer of any type of publication which is available to the public, be it a commercial, public or private organisation or an individual, deposit one or more copies of the publication with a recognised national institution.

The Legal Deposit Act of 1997 governs the deposit of publications in South Africa. Section 8 of the Legal Deposit Act makes provision for the constitution of a Legal Deposit Committee to oversee the implementation of the Act. This Committee, which consists of a broad spectrum of role players, expressed a need for an investigation into the many issues and questions relating to the provision of publications subject to legal deposit as required by the Legal Deposit Act. Although the Legal Deposit Act, at the time of its promulgation in 1998, was one of the first in the world to make provision for the deposit of electronic publications, this study focuses mainly on the legal deposit of books as this was identified by the Committee as an area of immediate and critical concern.

The study begins with a comprehensive literature study to obtain sufficient theoretical information on legal deposit and of the problems and issues surrounding the subject internationally and in South Africa.

- An overview of elements and issues covered in legal deposit legislation provides the background against which the investigation into the state of legal deposit and its implementation is undertaken.

With the aim of contextualising South African legislative issues, a
comparative study of legislation in the United Kingdom, Australia, Malaysia and South Africa is also undertaken.

- A discussion of the stages and activities involved in legal deposit, the need for monitoring and enforcement procedures and the external and internal factors that influence the way in which legal deposit is implemented in a country, provides an overall understanding of the legal deposit process.

- The implementation of legal deposit also depends on the committed participation of various role players. The individual roles and needs of these stakeholders in the legal deposit process are identified.

The empirical investigation was conducted in two stages. The first phase of the study involved a survey to explore the attitudes, opinions and actions of publishers and legal deposit libraries, as the two main role players, to determine how these factors affect the successful implementation of legal deposit in South Africa. This forms the bulk of the study. The second phase of the study consisted of a feasibility study to determine the state of compliance with legal deposit in the country.

The outcomes of the empirical study were used to identify gaps and weaknesses in the current legal deposit system. This formed the basis to make recommendations for the improvement of procedures, methods and services. Areas critical to the successful implementation of a legal deposit system are highlighted.

The study concludes with a view to the future. The importance of implementing a sustainable system of legal deposit on which the development of an effective system for the legal deposit of electronic publications can be built, is stressed.
Keywords

Legal deposit
Legal Deposit Act
Legal Deposit Committee
Legal deposit institutions
Legal deposit legislation
Legal deposit libraries
National Library of South Africa
Publishers
South Africa
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank the many people who contributed towards making this thesis possible.

My supervisor Professor Retha Snyman, and co-supervisor Prof. Maritha Snyman, for their expert supervision and guidance. Without their unfailing support and continuous input this thesis would not have been completed.

Prof. Peter Lor, who initiated the project and started me on the way towards conducting the research.

Dr. Francis Galloway who provided valuable advice and information on publishing and publishers no matter how often I asked her.

The Legal Deposit Committee for providing financial assistance enabling me to travel around the country to conduct the interviews with publishers and the legal deposit libraries.

Ncami Dlamini for doing the endless checking of publication lists.

The staff at the National Library, Pretoria Campus, for their friendliness and willingness to help whenever I used their facilities.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES.....................................................................................................................vi
LIST OF FIGURES....................................................................................................................vi

1 BACKGROUND TO THE INVESTIGATION ...........................................................................1
  1.1 INTRODUCTION .............................................................................................................1
  1.2 PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF THE STUDY ......................................................................2
  1.3 RESEARCH PROBLEM ..................................................................................................3
    1.3.1 Statement of the problem ......................................................................................3
    1.3.2 Research goals ......................................................................................................4
  1.4 RESEARCH STRATEGY AND METHODOLOGY .........................................................5
    1.4.1 Literature survey ..................................................................................................6
    1.4.2 First phase: survey research .................................................................................6
    1.4.3 Phase two: feasibility studies .............................................................................7
    1.4.4 Analysis and interpretation of data .......................................................................8
  1.5 VALUE OF THE STUDY ..............................................................................................9
  1.6 DIVISION OF CHAPTERS ..........................................................................................11

2 LEGAL DEPOSIT LEGISLATION .......................................................................................13
  2.1 INTRODUCTION ..........................................................................................................13
  2.2 BACKGROUND TO LEGAL DEPOSIT .........................................................................15
    2.2.1 What is legal deposit? ..........................................................................................15
      2.2.1.1 The statutory/legal nature of the legal deposit arrangement .........................15
      2.2.1.2 The preservation function of the legal deposit system ..................................15
      2.2.1.3 Recording the information/creating bibliographies .....................................16
      2.2.1.4 Access to and availability of deposited material ........................................17
    2.2.2 Origin of legal deposit ..........................................................................................17
    2.2.3 Evolvement of legal deposit ................................................................................18
      2.2.3.1 Legal deposit and censorship .......................................................................19
      2.2.3.2 Obtaining trade privileges ...........................................................................19
      2.2.3.3 Copyright privileges .....................................................................................20
      2.2.3.4 From personal enrichment to national importance ....................................20
  2.3 LEGISLATION .............................................................................................................21
    2.3.1 Introduction ..........................................................................................................21
    2.3.2 Legal deposit in the United Kingdom .................................................................23
    2.3.3 Legal deposit in Australia ....................................................................................24
    2.3.4 Legal deposit in Malaysia ....................................................................................26
    2.3.5 Legal deposit in South Africa...............................................................................27
  2.4 ISSUES COVERED IN LEGAL DEPOSIT LEGISLATION .............................................29
    2.4.1 Introduction ..........................................................................................................29
    2.4.2 Objectives of legal deposit ...................................................................................29
    2.4.3 Origin of the publication .......................................................................................30
    2.4.4 Places of deposit ..................................................................................................31
    2.4.5 Number of copies to be deposited .......................................................................32
    2.4.6 Costs .....................................................................................................................34
    2.4.7 When / how soon after publication should material be deposited? ....................35
    2.4.8 Who should deposit? ...........................................................................................35
    2.4.9 Type and scope of material that must be deposited .............................................36
      2.4.9.1 General types of material .............................................................................36
      2.4.9.2 Legal deposit of non-print material ...............................................................41
      2.4.9.3 Government publications .............................................................................45
      2.4.9.4 Copyright and legal deposit .........................................................................47
4.4.2 The Constitution ...........................................................................................................88
4.4.3 Freedom of expression and free access to information ........................................89
4.4.4 Intellectual property rights and copyright ..........................................................90
4.4.5 Creation of National Information Policies ..........................................................92
4.4.6 Creation of National Book Policies ......................................................................92
4.5 ROLE PLAYERS IN SOUTH AFRICA .........................................................................93
4.5.1 South African depository institutions as role players ...........................................93
  4.5.1.1 National Library of South Africa (NLSA) .............................................................93
  4.5.1.2 Manguang Library Services, Bloemfontein ..........................................................95
  4.5.1.3 Msunduzi Municipal Library, Pietermaritzburg .....................................................95
  4.5.1.4 Library of Parliament .........................................................................................95
  4.5.1.5 National Film, Video and Sound Archives .........................................................96
  4.5.1.6 Official Publications Depositories (OPDs) .........................................................97
4.5.2 Publishers as role players in legal deposit in South Africa ......................................99
  4.5.2.1 Introduction .......................................................................................................99
  4.5.2.2 Book publishing in South Africa .......................................................................99
4.5.3 The state as role player in legal deposit in South Africa ........................................102
  4.5.3.1 The Constitution .................................................................................................102
  4.5.3.2 Access to information .......................................................................................103
  4.5.3.3 Intellectual property rights ................................................................................103
  4.5.3.4 National Information Policy .............................................................................104
  4.5.3.5 National Book Policy .......................................................................................105
  4.5.3.6 DAC (Department of Arts and Culture) ..............................................................106
4.5.4 Other supporting role players in legal deposit in South Africa ................................106
  4.5.4.1 Statutory bodies .................................................................................................106
  4.5.4.2 Professional and other associations/bodies ........................................................107
4.6 SUMMARY ..................................................................................................................109

5 RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY ..................................................................110
5.1 BACKGROUND TO THE RESEARCH PROJECT ......................................................110
  5.1.1 Introduction ..........................................................................................................110
  5.1.2 Research philosophy ............................................................................................111
5.2 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY ..................................................................................112
  5.2.1 Research approaches .............................................................................................112
  5.2.2 Research methods .................................................................................................114
5.3 CONDUCTING PHASE ONE .....................................................................................115
  5.3.1 Introduction ..........................................................................................................115
  5.3.2 Survey research .....................................................................................................115
    5.3.2.1 Choice of the survey instrument ..................................................................115
    5.3.2.2 Defining the population ................................................................................117
    5.3.2.3 The sampling process ...................................................................................118
  5.3.3 Collection of data ...................................................................................................121
    5.3.3.1 Qualitative interviewing ...............................................................................121
    5.3.3.2 Constructing the survey instrument ..............................................................123
    5.3.3.3 Administering the survey instrument ............................................................126
    5.3.3.4 Data analysis .................................................................................................128
  5.3.4 Evaluation of research approach and methods of the qualitative study .................129
    5.3.4.1 Issues surrounding reliability and validity ....................................................130
    5.3.4.2 Other issues pertaining to quality of methods and research results ..........135
5.4 IMPLEMENTING PHASE TWO .....................................................................................138
  5.4.1 Introduction ..........................................................................................................138
  5.4.2 Pilot/feasibility studies ...........................................................................................139
    5.4.2.1 Defining the elements included in the study .................................................140
    5.4.2.2 Sampling procedures .....................................................................................143
  5.4.3 Collection and analysis of data .............................................................................146
    5.4.3.1 Using ISBN lists ..........................................................................................146
    5.4.3.2 Using book reviews ......................................................................................147
    5.4.3.3 Using SACat Database on Sabinet Online .................................................147
5.4.4 Evaluation of research methods and techniques used for the second phase of the study .......................................................... 148
5.4.5 Other attempts at obtaining compliance figures .......................................... 150

6 RESEARCH OUTCOMES ......................................................................................... 154

6.1 INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................ 154

6.2 OUTCOMES OF INTERVIEWS WITH PUBLISHERS AND LIBRARIES ................. 154

6.2.1 General questions asked ....................................................................................... 155

6.2.2 Questions concerning the purpose of legal deposit ............................................. 157

6.2.3 Opinions on the major issues covered in legal deposit legislation ..................... 160

6.2.4 Questions asked about communication between publishers and libraries .......... 165

6.2.5 Issues concerning the libraries specifically ......................................................... 166

6.2.6 Responses to general open-ended questions ....................................................... 170

6.2.6.1 Specific suggestions for tracing non-compliant publishers ................................ 170

6.2.6.2 Further general suggestions for tracing errant publishers ................................ 172

6.2.6.3 Other issues emerging from the open-ended questions .................................. 173

6.2.6.4 Final opinions about legal deposit ................................................................. 176

6.3 RESULTS OBTAINED FROM THE FEASIBILITY STUDY ..................................... 177

6.3.1 Analysis procedures ............................................................................................. 177

6.3.2 Findings ................................................................................................................ 178

6.3.2.1 Average compliance percentages: Table 6.1 ............................................... 179

6.3.2.2 Comparative compliance figures: Figure 6.1 ............................................. 179

6.3.2.3 Comparative compliance levels of smaller publishers: Figure 6.2 ............... 180

6.3.2.4 Comparative distribution of compliance averages: Figure 6.3 .................... 181

6.4 DISCUSSION OF OUTCOMES ............................................................................. 181

6.4.1 Interviews ............................................................................................................ 182

6.4.2 Feasibility study .................................................................................................. 183

6.4.3 Remarks on other efforts to obtain compliance information ............................ 183

6.5 SUMMARY ............................................................................................................. 184

7 ASSESSMENT AND RECOMMENDATIONS ................................................................ 186

7.1 INTRODUCTION .................................................................................................... 186

7.2 LEGAL DEPOSIT IMPLEMENTATION ................................................................ 187

7.2.1 Introduction ........................................................................................................ 187

7.2.2 Issues covered by legislation ............................................................................. 187

7.2.2.1 Number of copies to be delivered and costs of delivering .......................... 187

iv
7.2.2  Time of delivery ................................................................................................................. 189
7.2.3  Monitoring of compliance with legal deposit ................................................................. 191
  7.2.3.1  Mechanisms for identifying legal deposit material and tracing non-complying publishers...
  .................................................................................................................................................... 192
  7.2.3.2  Supporting structures/mechanisms ............................................................................... 197
  7.2.3.3  Measurement of compliance ........................................................................................ 200
  7.2.3.4  Organisational and managerial factors affecting the implementation of legal deposit .... 202
  7.2.3.5  Policies and procedures ............................................................................................... 202
  7.2.3.6  Communication ........................................................................................................... 203
  7.2.3.7  Promotion and marketing ............................................................................................. 205
7.2.4  Factors affecting the successful implementation of legal deposit .................................... 210
  7.2.4.1  Technological issues ..................................................................................................... 210
  7.2.4.2  Copyright ...................................................................................................................... 211
  7.2.4.3  Attitude towards legal deposit ..................................................................................... 213
  7.2.4.4  Economic and political factors ..................................................................................... 213
7.3  SUMMARY .............................................................................................................................. 214

8  LOOKING TOWARDS THE FUTURE .................................................................................. 215
8.1  ISSUES FOR FURTHER CONSIDERATION ...................................................................... 215
  8.1.1  Introduction .................................................................................................................... 215
  8.1.2  Legal Deposit Technical Sub-committee Action Plan ..................................................... 216
  8.1.3  Legal deposit of government publications ................................................................. 218
  8.1.4  Legal deposit of electronic material ............................................................................... 219
8.2  CHALLENGES FOR THE FUTURE OF LEGAL DEPOSIT IN SOUTH AFRICA ......... 223
8.3  CONCLUDING COMMENTS ............................................................................................... 226

9  BIBLIOGRAPHY ..................................................................................................................... 228

APPENDIX A: LEGAL DEPOSIT ACT ..................................................................................... 258
APPENDIX B: REGULATIONS UNDER THE LEGAL DEPOSIT ACT ..................................... 262
APPENDIX C: OUTLINE OF INTERVIEW SCHEDULE FOR PUBLISHERS ......................... 265
APPENDIX D: OUTLINE OF INTERVIEW SCHEDULE FOR LIBRARIES ............................... 267
APPENDIX E: BRITISH LIBRARY HOME PAGE ..................................................................... 269
APPENDIX F: VARIOUS PAGES FROM NATIONAL LIBRARY OF AUSTRALIA WEBSITE .... 270
APPENDIX G: EXAMPLES OF PAGES ON NLSA SITE ......................................................... 271
APPENDIX H: LEGAL DEPOSIT INFORMATION FOUND ON NATAL SOCIETY SITE .......... 274
APPENDIX I: COMPOSITE PICTURE OF SABOOKNEWS ONLINE SHOWING PAMPHLET WITH LEGAL DEPOSIT INFORMATION ............................................................ 275
LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1  Comparison of legal deposit legislation in four countries..........................51
Table 6.1  Average percentages of publications received as legal deposit.................179

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 6.1  Comparative average percentages of the three categories of publication lists used in the feasibility studies..............................................................180

Figure 6.2  Comparison of compliance averages of small commercial publishers and small/private publishers with 620 ISBNs..................................................180

Figure 6.3  Comparative representation of the averages of compliance of large, medium and small publishers in the overall sample of records checked......................181