

**THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN GOVERNMENT POLICY AND
MANAGEMENT PRACTICES AT FURTHER EDUCATION AND
TRAINING COLLEGES**

by

NTLANTLA JOSIAH MOYO

submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

in the subject

EDUCATIONAL MANAGEMENT, LAW AND POLICY

at the

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

SUPERVISOR: DR. F.J NIEUWENHUIS

JULY 2007

DECLARATION

Student Number: 23313596

I herein declare that THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN GOVERNMENT POLICY AND MANAGEMENT PRACTICES AT FURTHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING COLLEGES is my own work and that all the sources that I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references

Mr. J.N. Moyo

July 2007

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I should like to pass my sincerest gratitude to individuals who made this thesis possible through their support and encouragement. Let me thank:

- ▶ the OMNIPOTENT for wisdom and strength to triumph during the stormy days of this study
- ▶ Dr Jan Nieuwenhuis my supervisor who patiently and professionally guided and helped me through my development during this study
- ▶ DIMAKATSO TSOSANE my step-daughter, for typing some of the chapters for me
- ▶ the UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA for its excellent support and its contribution towards my personal and academic development
- ▶ all MY TEACHERS from Primary through to college and university for their contribution towards my intellectual development
- ▶ my congenial wife THATO, my beautiful daughter LEHLOHONOLO and my handsome son NHLANHLA MOYO Jr for your understanding when I spent long hours studying. You are the pillar of my life and lastly
- ▶ my sweet little daughter Phili-Botshelo for being my girl

**Education makes people easy to lead, but difficult to drive; easy to govern, but impossible to enslave
(Henry Brougham)**

**The man (or woman) who can make hard things easy, is the educator
(Ralph Waldo Emerson)**

**Try not to become a man of success, but rather a man of value
(Albert Einstein)**

To my three children, Lehlohonolo, Nhlanhla Jr, and Phili-Botshelo

SUMMARY

THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN GOVERNMENT POLICY AND MANAGEMENT PRACTICES AT FURTHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING COLLEGES

This study aims to explain the relationship between FET policy origination and management practices at college level in Gauteng. Empirical evidence shows that there exist a gap between policy and practice. Literature points out that since 1994 South Africa has passed laws that created favorable conditions for policy development.

The success or failure of government FET policies can be judged at college level. According to research some managers in former technical colleges lack skills and knowledge to successfully implement government transformation initiatives. Lack of management capacity at college level is cited as the reason for the non-implementation of policy. Policy makers derive policy from political, social and economic imperatives and infuse this with theoretical sources that describe how the policy process works and are often less sensitive to the practical conditions in which the policy is to be implemented. Conversely, policy implementers are primarily guided by contextual and systemic considerations as they implement policy.

In this thesis it is argued that understanding the processes of policy development and implementation can assist in explaining the relationship between government policy and management practices at college level. The study interrogates policy intentions by analyzing the original meaning of FET policy from the originators' perspective and juxtaposes this with the understanding of policy implementation from the implementers' perspective and describe the relationship between intended and implemented policy.

A qualitative research design using semi-structured interviews to gather data from participants was used. Purposive sampling was used to select participants from policy originators and college managers. Six main themes were distilled from the data collected: centralization vis-a vis decentralization; resources; structures; curriculum; governance, and strategic planning. Findings revealed how issues of power and authority affect policy development and implementation. The study establishes that policy implementers need capacity, power and authority to plan and make decisions on policy implementation, but decision-makers at higher levels of the system often subjugate these powers. For policy implementation to match policy intentions policy implementers need capacity and authority to understand, plan and make policy implementation decisions.

Key words

1. Policy origination
2. Management practices
3. Transformation
4. Governance
5. Policy implementation
6. Policy intentions
7. Resources
8. Centralization
9. Decentralization
10. Structures

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION, PROBLEM FORMULATION, AIM AND RESEARCH DESIGN

1.1	INTRODUCTION	1
1.2	BACKGROUND	2
1.3	RATIONAL OF THE STUDY	3
1.4	POLICY DEVELOPMENT AND POLICY IMPLEMENTATION DILEMMA	8
1.5	PROBLEM STATEMENT	14
1.6	AIM OF THE STUDY	15
1.6.1	Research aim and objectives	15
1.7	RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	16
1.7.1	The Research Strategies	16
1.7.2	Units of Analysis	17
1.7.3	Data Collection	18
1.7.3.1	Collecting qualitative data	18
1.8	CHAPTER REVIEW	21

CHAPTER 2

POLICY CONCEPTUALIZATION AND IMPLEMENTATION

2.1	INTRODUCTION	23
2.2	DEFINING PUBLIC POLICY	24
2.3	THE PROCESS OF POLICY MAKING	28
2.3.1	The Democratic Process	29
2.3.2	The Centralization/Decentralization Process	30

2.3.3	The Legislative Process	33
2.3.4	The Bureaucratic Process	35
2.3.5	The Executive Process	35
2.3.6	Role players in the process of policy making	36
2.3.6.1	Official policy makers	36
2.3.6.2	Unofficial policy makers	37
2.3.4	Stages in policy making	38
2.4	THE PROCESS OF COMMUNICATING POLICY	41
2.4.1	The written word	44
2.4.2	The spoken word	45
2.4.3	The media	45
2.5	THE PROCESS OF PUBLIC POLICY IMPLEMENTATION	46
2.5.1	Resources	48
2.5.2	Policy interpretation and translation	49
2.5.3	The context	51
2.5.4	Educational managers and policy	53
2.6	CHAPTER REVIEW	54

CHAPTER 3

THE INTERNATIONAL PERSPECTIVE ON FURTHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING POLICY

3.1	INTRODUCTION	56
3.2	VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING POLICY DEVELOPMENT: AN INTERNATIONAL PERSPECTIVE	58
3.3	THE INTERNATIONAL COMMUNITY AND SKILLS DEVELOPMENT	60
3.3.1	Vocational Education and Training policy development and globalization	61
3.3.2	Skills development approaches	63

3.4	VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING POLICY AND THE INFORMAL ECONOMY	66
3.5	A VISION FOR VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING	68
3.5.1	Poverty	69
3.5.2	Youth unemployment	70
3.5.3	Accessibility	70
3.5.4	Flexibility	70
3.5.5	HIV/AIDS	71
3.6	ARTICULATION BETWEEN VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING AND THE BROADER EDUCATION AND TRAINING	72
3.7	SKILLS DEVELOPMENT IN AFRICA	73
3.7.1	National governments and VET policy development	75
3.8	FURTHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING IN SOUTH AFRICA	76
3.8.1	Further Education and Training policy process in South Africa	80
3.8.2	Building the new FET system	83
3.8.3	Skills development policies in South Africa	84
3.8.4	The national development vision :2014	84
3.8.5	Sector Educational and Training Authorities and Learnerships	85
3.9	THE FUTURE OF VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING	87
3.9.1	Challenges for VET	87
3.9.2	Emerging policy and research agenda for TVET	89
3.9.3	VET as a demand-led approach	90
3.9.4	Key issues for the future of VET	91
3.10	CHAPTER REVIEW	91

CHAPTER 4

THE RESEARCH DESIGN

4.1	INTRODUCTION	94
4.2	RESEARCH DESIGN	95
4.2.1	Qualitative Research	98
4.2.2	Characteristics of Qualitative Research	99
4.2.2.1	Qualitative method of data collection	99
4.2.2.2	Human as instrument	100
4.2.2.3	Data collection in the natural setting	100
4.2.2.4	An exploratory and descriptive focus	101
4.2.2.5	Early and ongoing inductive data analysis	101
4.2.2.6	Purposive sampling	101
4.2.2.7	Ethical measures	102
4.3	RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	103
4.3.1	Literature review	103
4.3.2	Target population	103
4.3.3	Sampling	104
4.3.4	Gaining access	106
4.3.5	Trustworthiness	107
4.4	DATA COLLECTION METHODS	111
4.4.1	Individual interviews	111
4.5	DATA PROCESING AND ANALYSIS	113
4.5.1	Preparation for data analysis	114
4.5.2	Analyzing qualitative data	114
4.5.2.1	Hermeneutics analysis	115
4.5.2.2	Content analysis	115
4.5.2.3	Discourse analysis	117
4.5.3	Data interpretation	118
4.6	CHAPTER REVIEW	120

CHAPTER 5

DATA PRESENTATION AND INTERPRETATION

5.1	INTRODUCTION	121
5.2	DATA PRESENTATION	122
5.2.1	Major themes	122
5.3	VIEWS OF PARTICIPANTS	122
5.3.1	Theme 1: Centralization & Decentralization	125
5.3.1.1	Centralization	125
5.3.1.2	Decentralization	127
5.3.2	Theme 2: Managing Resources	129
5.3.2.1	Acquisition and utilization – being entrepreneurial	130
5.3.2.2	Cost-effectiveness and efficiency	134
5.3.2.3	Human resources capacity building	135
5.3.3	Theme 3: Structures	137
5.3.3.1	Management Structures	139
5.3.3.2	Composition	140
5.3.3.3	Functionality	140
5.3.4	Theme 4: Managing the curriculum	142
5.3.4.1	The old curriculum	143
5.3.4.2	The new responsive curriculum	145
5.3.4.3	Curriculum delivery	146
5.3.5	Theme 5: Managing governance	147
5.3.5.1	Developing relationships with stakeholders	149
5.3.5.2	Autonomy	151
5.3.5.3	Staffing	153
5.3.6	Theme 6: Strategic Planning	153
5.3.6.1	National – level planning	154
5.3.6.2	Provincial-level planning	155
5.3.6.3	College-level planning	156

5.3.6.4 Strategy implementation	158
5.4 FINDINGS	159
5.4.1 Theme 1: Centralization vis-a-vis decentralization	159
5.4.1.1 Centralization	159
5.4.1.2 Decentralization	160
5.4.2 Theme 2: Resources	162
5.4.3 Theme 3: Structures	163
5.4.4. Theme 4: The curriculum	164
5.4.5 Theme 5: Governance	165
5.4.6 Theme 6: Planning	166
5.5 CHAPTER REVIEW	167

CHAPTER 6

THE RELATIONSHIP AND CONCLUSIONS

6.1 INTRODUCTION	168
6.2 THE RELATIONSHIP	171
6.2.1 Centralization vis-a-vis decentralization	171
6.2.2 Resources	173
6.2.3 Structures	174
6.2.4 The curriculum	175
6.2.5 Governance	175
6.2.6 Planning	176
6.3 CONCLUSION	177
6.3.1 Understanding policy	177
6.3.2 Policy implications for management practices in Gauteng colleges	178
6.3.3 Policy interpretation by college managers	178
6.3.4 Implementation of policy by college managers	179
6.3 CONCLUDING REMARKS	180
7. BIBLIOGRAPHY	184

LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURE 2.1	Common policy making model	40
FIGURE 2.2	Steps in the less linear policy making model	40
FIGURE 4.1	Research design	97
FIGURE 5.1	Further Education and Training Management Structure	130
FIGURE 5.2	Governance at national level	139
FIGURE 5.3	Governance at provincial level	140
FIGURE 5.4	Governance at college level	141

LIST OF TABLES

TABLE 1.1:	Recommendations made in the NBI report	7
TABLE 2.1	The ‘stream’ approach to policy-making in South Africa	55
TABLE 2.2	Steps in the common model of policy making process	39
TABLE 3.1	The new paradigm: Emerging challenges for VET	89
TABLE 4.1	Qualitative data analysis stages	106

LIST OF ANNEXURES

1.	ANNEXURE A:	Interview schedule for policy originators	200
2.	ANNEXURE B:	Interview schedule for college managers	206
3.	ANNEXURE C:	Letter granting permission to conduct research	210
4.	ANNEXURE D:	Ethics Clearance Certificate	212