THE LIFE EXPERIENCES AND UNDERSTANDINGS
OF CHILDREN AS CITIZENS IN A DEMOCRATIC
SOUTH AFRICA

by

Ina Joubert (J C)

August 2007

Faculty of Education
University of Pretoria
THE LIFE EXPERIENCES AND UNDERSTANDINGS OF CHILDREN AS CITIZENS IN A DEMOCRATIC SOUTH AFRICA

by

Ina Joubert (J C)

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR

in

LEARNING SUPPORT, GUIDANCE AND COUNSELLING

Department of Educational Psychology
University of Pretoria
SOUTH AFRICA

Supervisor: Professor Liesel Ebersohn
Co-supervisor: Professor Irma Eloff

2007
DEDICATION

For my own children and for the children of South Africa.

Different faces
Many races
Different people
Many places
The past behind us
The future and freedom in front of us

For children of Africa
We stand together
In these troubled times
We stand together
We come from one land but we are so different
Yet, we stand together.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This research was a challenging and demanding journey, but I did not travel it alone; I was supported along the way by God, people and support systems. I wish to express my sincere appreciation and gratitude to:

The nine-year-old learners who participated enthusiastically in sharing their experiences, and provided data that formed the basis and thrust of this research. The principal of the school and teachers of the Foundation Phase, especially the Head of Department – Foundation Phase, who gave their support and cooperation.

Liesel Ebersöhn and Irma Eloff who supervised this work by providing academic input, intellectual stimulus and technical guidance, each in their own unique way. Their scholarly leadership assisted me at times when I felt confused by the excess of information and data and did not recognize emerging insights.

Jonathan Jansen, Theo Möller and Marilise Lombard who acted as critical readers and gave thought-provoking criticism. Rinelle Evans who gave initial direction through stimulating questions.

Annalie Botha who acted as research assistant and took time to engage with my research endeavours and uncertainties and provided meaningful contributions. She also shared my excitement during the data collection phase when the participating children inspired with their passion for life. Retha van Wyk and Jaco Joubert assisted with the drama technique and gave a special dimension of youthful energy and unique approach to the research. Karin Scrooby assisted with information searches.

Elsabé Olivier who acted as information specialist and who offered her professional expertise.

The University of Pretoria for financial support in the form of a bursary.

Susan Fourie who assisted with the transcriptions, Hester van der Walt for her meticulous editing and Johan Slabbert for assistance in compiling the compact disc.

My husband Jaco who assisted by photographing data for the compact disc, my children Kristien and husband Rooies, Louise and husband Louis, Jaco (jr) and Barry for their encouragement, patience and support. My family, friends and colleagues for their prayers, motivation and interest. Soli Deo Gloria!
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

DEDICATION.................................................................................................................................iii

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS................................................................................................................iv

DECLARATION OF AUTHORSHIP AND COPYRIGHT WAIVER............................................ix

ABSTRACT .....................................................................................................................................x

CHAPTER 1. Overview: Children, citizenship and citizenship education in the global and South African context ................................................................................................................................. 1

1.1 Introduction............................................................................................................................. 1

1.2 Rationale ................................................................................................................................. 2

1.3 Contextualising this study ...................................................................................................... 9

1.3.1 Historicity of citizenship education .................................................................................. 9

1.3.2 South Africa and citizenship education .............................................................................. 12

1.4 Explanation of core concepts ............................................................................................... 19

1.4.1 The life experiences and understandings of children ....................................................... 19

1.4.2 Children as citizens .......................................................................................................... 19

1.4.3 Democratic South Africa ............................................................................................... 20

1.5 Unit of analysis ..................................................................................................................... 21

1.6 Research design and methodology ..................................................................................... 23

1.6.1 Data collection methods and instruments ....................................................................... 26

1.6.2 Data analysis .................................................................................................................. 28

1.7 Anticipated research constraints ........................................................................................ 29

1.8 Outline and organization of the inquiry .............................................................................. 31

CHAPTER 2. Literature review: Young children, citizenship and citizenship education......... 33

2.1 Introduction............................................................................................................................. 33

2.2 Young children, citizenship and citizenship education ....................................................... 34

2.2.1 Studies on citizenship in the global context ................................................................... 35

2.2.2 Studies on citizenship in the local context ...................................................................... 41

2.3 The conceptual framework: A tool for explanation and justification ............................... 44

2.3.1 Citizenship .................................................................................................................... 45

2.3.2 Citizenship and democracy ............................................................................................ 50

2.3.3 Citizenship education ..................................................................................................... 51
2.3.4 Citizenship education and globalization ............................................................... 57
2.3.5 Theories promoted by Dewey and Waghid related to citizenship education............. 58
2.3.6 Theories related to the young child and citizenship education .................................. 65
2.4 Concluding remarks .................................................................................................. 67

CHAPTER 3. Research design and methodology: Participatory into data gathering .......... 69
3.1 Introduction .............................................................................................................. 69
3.2 Paradigmatic considerations ................................................................................... 69
3.2.1 Qualitative paradigm ............................................................................................ 69
3.2.2 Interpretative paradigm ........................................................................................ 70
3.2.3 Participatory principles in methodology .............................................................. 71
3.3 Research design ...................................................................................................... 73
3.4 Participants and research site ................................................................................. 73
3.5 Research process ..................................................................................................... 74
3.5.1 Informal data collection strategies ........................................................................ 74
3.5.2 Formal data collection strategies .......................................................................... 76
3.5.3 Personal role in research process ......................................................................... 77
3.5.4 Data collection methods and instruments ............................................................. 79
3.5 Data analysis ........................................................................................................... 92
3.6 Strategies for enhancing the validity of this study ..................................................... 93
3.7 Conclusion ................................................................................................................ 97

CHAPTER 4. Data analysis: Voices of the participating children as citizens in democratic South Africa ............................................................................................................. 98
4.1 Introduction .............................................................................................................. 98
4.2 Explanation of data analysis process ....................................................................... 100
4.3 Results of the theme analysis .................................................................................. 102
4.3.1 Theme 1: Learners' identification of themselves as child citizens ......................... 103
4.3.2 Theme 2: Learners living as child citizens in the local community....................... 116
4.3.3 Theme 3: Learners living as child citizens in the democratic dispensation of South Africa ........................................................................................................... 127
4.3.4 Theme 4: Learners' desire for change in securing their future ......................... 141
4.4 Concluding remarks on main findings ..................................................................... 148
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1: Citizenship education through time .................................................................11
Table 1.2: Comparison of recent issues of citizenship education in selected democracies........17
Table 1.3: Summary of methodological choices and strategies...........................................25

Table 3.1: Summary of data collection and data capturing methods....................................81
Table 3.2: Instruments, limitations and enrichment of validity ............................................96

Table 4.1: Summary of themes and related categories .......................................................99
Table 4.2: The relationship between data from each research instrument and the themes.......100

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1: Interrelatedness of concepts regarding democratic identity ..............................50
Figure 2.2: Conceptual framework .....................................................................................67

ADDENDA (See Compact Disc)

1: Democratic values
2: Characteristics of the modern nation-state
3: National Curriculum
4: Official documentation
5: Mediation of research activities
6: Implementation of National Curriculum
7: Pilot studies
8: Examples of data
9: Verification
10: Phases of data analysis
11: Citizenship Context Diagram
DECLARATION OF AUTHORSHIP AND COPYRIGHT WAIVER

I declare that this work is my own and that it has been written in my own words. All citations from literature have been acknowledged in-text and referenced in full.

I understand that all rights with regard to intellectual property in the work vest in the University of Pretoria who has the right to produce, distribute and/or publish the work in any manner considered fit.

My supervisors and I agree that, subject to the authorization of the University as owner of all intellectual property rights in this work, the approved version may be placed in the UpeTD archive with the following status:

Release the entire work immediately for worldwide access.

Signature                                      Date
ABSTRACT

This inquiry is the exploration and understanding of a case study: the nine-year-old learners of an inner-city school in South Africa and their experiences of democratic South Africa as citizens. Their expressions informed me on how they perceived their democratic identities and their understandings of their citizenship. From the acquired understandings and identities I sought to extend the current conceptions of citizenship education. This study was informed by the interpretivist paradigm and guided by a conceptual framework.

The literature on citizenship and citizenship education concerning the young child highlighted associated concepts and theories. I employed Dewey’s theory on building a learning community and Waghid’s expansion of compassion and imaginative action. Theories used concerning young children and their construction of citizenship were the postcolonial and transforming society theory, informing that children as young as nine years can engage in notions such as citizenship and democracy. From the literature, I identified the knowledge, skills and values needed for a child to participate as an active and accountable citizen; content also offered by the South African national curriculum. This curriculum envisages the future citizen as the responsible citizen who will embrace democratic values in their everyday lives and contribute to nation-building. The data collection methods and data collection instruments were designed in a child-centred way to facilitate self-expression. The constructivist grounded theory analysis assisted in generating significant insights.

The nine-year-old learners expressed their identification with the South African democracy and its values such as social justice, which aligned with the South African ideal of social cohesion and nation-building. However, they expressed little knowledge about and no active participation in democratic processes. They expressed concern about their unsafe neighbourhood and the social injustices they encountered in their community. The young learners expressed the desire for change to transform South Africa into a ‘better nation’ to secure their and other citizens’ future.

Key findings confirmed statements made by scholars in this field: citizenship education has to acknowledge the life experiences of children in order to be meaningful (thus contextualize citizenship) and to assist young children to contribute to democracy. However, the democracy can
only be sustained and strengthened if the learners are knowledgeable about democratic processes and possible threats to these processes. In addition, young children need to be participants in the democracy and not only observers. The nine-year-old learners expressed the passion to do what is expected of them but seemingly lacked the participatory skills and opportunities they needed.

**KEYWORDS:** Young South African children’s citizenship experiences, democratic identity, citizenship education, democratic values, Dewey’s building a learning community, Waghid’s compassion and imaginative action, postcolonial theory, transforming society theory, high social awareness, lack of participation, lack of democratic knowledge