

**THE INFLUENCE OF EDUCATORS' LIFE EXPERIENCES  
ON CLASSROOM DISCIPLINE PRACTICES**

**BY**

**SOANE JOYCE MOHAPI**

**Thesis**

**Submitted in accordance with the requirements for the degree**

**PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR**

**in the**

**DEPARTMENT: EDUCATION MANAGEMENT and POLICY STUDIES**

**in the**

**FACULTY OF EDUCATION**

**At the**

**UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA**

**2007**

**Supervisor: DR J NIEUWENHUIS**

## DECLARATION

I declare that “**The influence of educators’ life experiences on classroom discipline practices**” is my own work and that all the sources I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references.

.....  
**SJ MOHAPI (Mrs)**

.....  
**DATE**

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

A great deal of credit goes to my husband, Dr WMB Mohapi, for always being so understanding; he was my inspiration for the entire duration of my study. I am also most grateful to my promoter Dr J Nieuwenhuis, who made himself available for hours of discussion; he provided me with clear direction on how should I approach my studies.

I wish to thank Mr F Mthombeni, for providing me with invaluable technical assistance. My gratitude also goes to Dr Bridget Theron-Bushell for her professional language revision and editing of my final manuscript.

To my son, Tshepo, and my brothers and sisters, Marlin, Alpheus, Jeaneth, Simon, Mapula and Dr. Moche, I extend my deep appreciation for their patience and understanding when they had to miss much time with me so that this project could be completed. I also thank my parents John and Motlatsi Moche, for their encouragement and prayers; for always caring and for ensuring that I was able to achieve the best in life.

A very special word of thanks goes to my senior colleague Mrs Khomotso Catherine Masango for supporting me throughout my studies. I am of course also indebted to the nine educators who formed an integral part of this study. To a considerable extent this research represents their collected lived experience.

Finally, I offer all honour and my humble, heartfelt thanks to God Almighty for His mercy and blessings; and for giving me the strength to complete this study

## DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated to the loving memory of my grandfather Nicodemus Khamane Matseke, whose indomitable spirit and encouragement served as a source of inspiration and determination in overcoming many academic and professional hurdles.

## ABSTRACT

The primary purpose of this study was to investigate how the life experiences of educators impact upon classroom discipline. The study considered the present situation regarding classroom discipline practice. As circuit manager directly involved with schools I was concerned to see that there were dysfunctional schools in my area because of the failure to manage classroom discipline effectively.

The findings of the study indicate that classroom discipline practices can be improved if we understand the life experiences of educators. A qualitative narrative approach was applied and narrative interviews, observation and lived stories of educators were used to gather data from nine participants. All these educators were drawn from one circuit in the Nkangala Department of Education, a region in Mpumalanga Province, and are teaching in secondary schools. Purposive sampling was used to select the nine participants; all were prepared to share their lived experiences and ultimately, data analysis provided cogent answers to the research hypothesis.

The research focused on issues such as recent South African studies conducted on discipline and corporal punishment, theories of discipline, how lived experiences impact on current behaviour.

From what I have observed and heard, it has become clear, as is set out in this thesis, that the classroom discipline practices implemented by educators are indeed influenced by their own classroom experiences when they themselves were learners.

### **KEY WORDS**

Lived experiences

Current behaviour;

Corporal punishment

Classroom discipline practices

Positive approach to discipline

Current classroom discipline practices

## ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

SASA:	South African Schools' Act
SMT:	School Management Team
SGB:	School Governing Body
SADTU:	South African Democratic Teachers' Union
STD:	Secondary Educators' Diploma
REQV:	Relative Education Qualification Value
RCL:	Representative Council of Learners
HOD:	Head of Department
PAD:	Positive Approach to Discipline
PAT:	Preferred Activity Time
EMASA:	Education Management Association of South Africa

## LIST OF TABLES

<b>TABLE</b>	<b>PAGE NUMBER</b>
TABLE 1: Pass rates for grade 12 learners in a number of schools in Nkangala Region	12
TABLE 2: Summary of studies conducted on school discipline in South Africa	13
TABLE 3: Chart for rules and consequences	32
TABLE 4: Kohlberg six moral stages	63
TABLE 5: Participants' profiles	83
TABLE 6: Background information of sample educators	116
TABLE 7: Significant incidents in participants' past	162
TABLE 8: Research findings	180

## LIST OF FIGURES

<b>FIGURE</b>	<b>PAGE NUMBER</b>
Figure 1: The constant comparative methods and continuous method refinement of categories	90
Figure 2: Discipline versus punishment	120
Figure 3: Forms of discipline at home and at school	121
Figure 4: Words used by participants when describing the form of discipline to which they were exposed	123
Figure 5: Lessons learnt from being disciplined at home and at School	124
Figure 6: Infringements participants were punished for at home and at school	128
Figure 7: Dealing with problematic learners	131

## LIST OF APPENDICES

APPENDIX	HEADING	PAGE NUMBER
Appendix: A	Observation template	205
Appendix: B	Observing school environment, time spent for teaching and learning, school resources and discipline	206
Appendix: C	List of questions asked of nine participants during the interviews	208
Appendix: D	Transcript of follow-up interviews conducted	211
Appendix: E	Coding and categorizing interview responses Semi-structured interview	223
Appendix: F	Transcripts and re-telling participants' lived stories	298
Appendix: G	1. Request letter to the Regional Director 2. Request letter to the SGB, Management & Staff	311
Appendix: H	Response letter from the Regional Director	312
Appendix: I	Consent letters to the participating educators	314
Appendix: J	Interviewee details	316
Appendix: K	Circuit and Regional grade 12 performance (1995-2006)	320
Appendix: L1 - L2	Map of Nkangala Region of Mpumalanga Education Department	321



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>ITEM NUMBER</b>	<b>ITEM</b>	<b>PAGE NUMBER</b>
<b>CHAPTER 1</b>	<b>ORIENTATION, PROBLEM STATEMENT, LITERATURE REVIEW AND RESEARCH APPROACH</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1	Orientation	1
1.2	Problem statement	2
1.3	Literature review	4
1.3.1	What is discipline?	4
1.3.2	What does research conducted in recent years in South Africa tell us about school discipline?	7
1.4	Delimitation of the study	15
1.5	Research objectives	16
1.6	Research method	16
1.6.1	Description of sample	16
1.6.2	Research instrument	17
1.6.3	Collection of data	17
1.6.4	Narrative research	18
1.7	Outline of chapters	19
1.8	Conclusion	19



<b>CHAPTER 2</b>	<b>THEORIES OF SCHOOL DISCIPLINE</b>	<b>21</b>
2.1	Introduction	21
2.2	Behaviourists	22
2.2.1	Skinnerian model	22
2.2.2	Kounin's model	28
2.2.3	Canter's assertive behavioural model	30
2.3	Cognitivists	33
2.3.1	William Glasser's theory of educational transformation	34
2.3.2	Gordon international model of effective training	37
2.3.3	Dreikurs's mistaken goal model	38
2.4	Constructivists	41
2.4.1	Ginott's congruent communication model	42
2.5	Hybrid theories of school discipline	45
2.5.1	Jones's management model	46
2.5.2	Curwin and Mendler's model	47
2.6	Conclusion	48



<b>CHAPTER 3</b>	<b>THE INFLUENCE OF LIVED EXPERIENCES ON CURRENT BEHAVIOUR</b>	<b>PAGE NUMBER</b>
3.1	Introduction	50
3.2.	Historical overview of the South African context	50
3.2.1	Educators in changing South African society	55
3.3	Theoretical framework	57
3.3.1	Psychoanalytic Theory	57
3.3.2	Learning Theory	58
3.3.3	Social Learning Theory	59
3.3.4	Bronfenbrenner's Ecological Model of human development	60
3.3.5	Vygotsky's Socio-cultural Theory	62
3.3.6	Theories of moral development	62
3.4	How lived experiences influence current behaviour	65
3.4.1	The impact of cultural influences	66
3.4.2	African practices and cultural African self	72
3.5	Conclusion	75



<b>CHAPTER 4</b>	<b>RESEARCH DESIGN</b>	<b>77</b>
4.1	Introduction	77
4.2	Qualitative research	78
4.2.1	Choice of narrative approach	80
4.3	Research procedure	81
4.3.1	Sampling	81
4.4	Data collection techniques	83
4.4.1	Semi structures and narrative interviews	83
4.4.2	Observation	85
4.4.3	Educators' lived experiences	87
4.4.4	Field texts	88
4.5	Procedure for data analysis	89
4.5.1	Data analysis	89
4.5.2	Transcribing data from narrative interviews	91
4.5.3	Grouping of qualitative data	91
4.5.4	Coding and categorising	92
4.6	Ethical considerations	92
4.7	Credibility and trustworthiness	93
4.8	Triangulation and Crystallization	96
4.9	Conclusion	97



<b>CHAPTER 5</b>	<b>A CONTENT ANALYSIS OF INTERVIEWS CONDUCTED</b>	<b>98</b>
5.1	Introduction	98
5.2	Background information of the three sample schools	99
5.2.1	School invironment	99
5.2.2	School enrolment and class size	103
5.2.3	School governance	104
5.3	Research procedure	111
5.3.1	Observation	112
5.3.2	Field texts	115
5.4	Data analysis and interpretation of semi structured interviews	115
5.4.1	Background information on the nine sample educators	115
5.5	Participants' view on school discipline	117
5.5.1	Definition of discipline	117
5.5.2	Discipline versus punishment	118
5.5.3	How were participants disciplined as learners	121
5.5.4	Lessons learnt from the discipline they received at home and at school	123
5.5.5	Infringements participants were punished for	126
5.5.6	Dealing with problematic learners	129
5.6	Conclusion	132



<b>CHAPTER 6</b>	<b>NARRATIVE ANALYSIS OF EDUCATORS' LIVED STORIES</b>	<b>134</b>
6.1	Introduction	134
6.2	Procedure in analysing participants' experiences	135
6.2.1	Tau's lived experiences	136
6.2.2	Nkwe's lived experiences	138
6.2.3	Nare's lived experiences	140
6.2.4	Phala's lived experiences	143
6.2.5	Tlou's lived experiences	146
6.2.6	Tholo's lived experiences	148
6.2.7	Tshukudu's lived experiences	151
6.2.8	Kwena's lived experiences	153
6.2.9	Phuti's lived experiences	156
6.3	Analysis and interpretation of participants' classroom discipline practices and experiences	158
6.3.1	The impact of corporal punishment on participants' current classroom discipline practices	159
6.3.2	Significant incidents in participants' past	162
6.3.3	Current behaviour in terms of classroom discipline practices.	163
6.3.4	Aspiration for the future	166
6.4	Conclusion	168



<b>CHAPTER 7</b>	<b>CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION</b>	170
7.1	Introduction	170
7.1.1	Statement of the problem	171
7.1.2	Delimitation of the study	172
7.1.3	Research objectives	172
7.1.4	Method	173
7.1.5	Research findings	173
7.2	A possible way forward	181
7.3	Conclusion	184