University of Pretoria etd – Homann, D (2005)

A critical analysis of the process of transformation of the city planning function in the city of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality

by

Desirée Homann

Submitted in fulfillment of part of the requirements for the degree of Master of Town and Regional Planning in the Faculty of Engineering, the Built Environment and Information Technology, University of Pretoria

Study leader: Prof MC Oranje

2005

To my parents,
Herman and Esther Tesner,
who gave me roots
and my husband,
Martin,
who gives me wings.

CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1: About the study

1.1 Purpose of the study or problem statement 1
1.2 Type of study 1
1.3 Focus of the study 6
1.4 Drawing the line: Defining the scope of the study 7
1.5 Structure of the study 10
1.6 Value of the study 10

CHAPTER 2: Employing the powerful art of storytelling

2.1 The default genre of human experience 11
2.2 The “narrative turn” in planning theory 13
2.3 The story and the telling of it 15
2.4 The powerful and, sometimes, invisible narrator 16
2.5 Who sees, who tells? Narrator and focalizer 16
2.6 Closure: the persuasive ending? 17
2.7 Telling seeking or becoming the truth 17
2.8 Telling it as I see it 18

CHAPTER 3: Study methodology

3.1 A qualitative approach 20
3.2 Observation 20
3.3 Interviews 22
3.4 Literature survey 24
3.5 Is it OK to do this? The question of ethics 25

CHAPTER 4: The political and legislative framework of Local Government transformation in South Africa

4.1 A basket of legislation enabling democratic local government 27
4.2 A handful of noble principles 29
4.3 A closer look at the Municipal Systems Act (MSA) 31

4.4 Extrapolating legislative principles to the inner workings of the municipality 33

CHAPTER 5: Framework for analysis

5.1 A slice of planning theory 36
5.1.1 The call for communicative action 37
5.1.2 A penchant for practice 39
5.1.3 Power, politics and planning 41
5.2 Organizational theory – vignettes from a vast domain 47
5.2.1 Management and communication – tools to turn legislative ideals into reality 47
5.2.2 Organizational change 50
5.2.3 Diversity 55
5.2.4 Bureaucracy 57
5.2.5 Managerialism 62

CHAPTER 6: How the planning function for the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality came about

6.1 The end of an era 64
- *Mike Yates celebrates an ending*
- *The Amund Beneke process*
- *Administrative Units and Divisions*

6.2 Belinda and the Core Team 75
- *A transparent and participative process*
- *Belinda's Work Plan*

6.3 Indications of turbulence and uncertainty 89
- *Rumours of a crack in the top structure*
- *Regions all up in the air*
- *Backlog in applications tackled*
- *An ambitious synergy*

6.4 Establishing the Task Teams 99
- *Identifying the Task Team leaders*

- *Racial equity*
- *City Planning Restructuring (CPR) employee audit*
- *Task Teams given their orders*
- *Core Team visits and the purpose structure workshop*
- *The Task Teams meet the challenge*
- *An uneasy relationship with the existing managers*

6.5 A new organizational structure upsets the Task Team applecart 113
- *An anxious Core Team*
- *Survival instinct – the Core Team's continuation plan*
- *Mike Yates' brief stint as a General Manager*
- *Verna Nel usurps the throne*
- *A new strategic planning function*
- *Regional spatial planning at the coalface*
- *City Planning all at sea*
- *An old division prevails*

6.6 From leaderless chaos to a semblance of normality 159
- *White negativity*
- *Frustrated gatekeepers*
- *A glimmer of light around Christmas*
- *Yet problems persist*
- *Conspiracy theory*
- *Pencil placements and prejudice*
- *A bitter complaint and a frank assessment*
- *Nava speaks and is spoken to*
- *An impressive performance*

6.7 Conclusion 174

6.8 ALLOW ME TO BE WHIMSICAL – TWO ALTERNATIVE ENDINGS 179

6.9 OUT TAKES 183

CHAPTER 7: Analysis – spotting the emerging truths

7.1 Introduction 189

7.2 First, a little confession 190
7.3 Addressing theory's blind spot 190
7.4 Democracy in practice 191
7.5 It's all about the power 193
7.5.1 Power in a managerialist environment 193
7.5.2 Different types/origins of power 194
7.5.3 A comparative reading of Flyvbjerg's power propositions 195
7.5.4 Planners in need of re-orientation 199
7.6 The importance of communication confirmed 201
7.7 Batho Phele? I think not 203
7.8 The more things change… 205
7.9 Conclusion 207

BIBLIOGRAPHY 209

ANNEXURE A: Questionnaire for structured interviews 224
ANNEXURE B: Glossary of key legislation 226
ANNEXURE C: Larger reproduction of figures 227

List of figures

Figure i	City Planning purpose structure proposed by the Amund Beneke group in April 2001	74
Figure ii	Newsletter distributed at Nomgqibelo's road show Meetings of 14 and 15 May 2001	80
Figure iii	City Planning functions from the work plan compiled by Belinda van der Merwe, 8 May 2001	86
Figure iv	Structure of Core Team and Task Teams	98
Figure v	City Planning Restructuring Employee Audit Form	103
Figure vi	Approved macro organizational structure for the Housing Directorate as on 1 July 2001	122
Figure vii	Proposed new macro organizational structure: Housing Directorate, as on 7 August 2001	136
Figure viii	Strategic spatial planning process derived from generic strategic planning processes	141
Figure ix	Extract from City Planning – a rough guide (CTMM, 2001ss)	145
Figure x	Proposed structure for the City Planning Department, August 2001	156
Figure xi	Proposed interim structure for the City Planning function, October 2001	157

MEMBERS OF THE CAST