Using Internet resources and e-learning modalities for training learners in Nutrition for people living with HIV and AIDS in South Africa

by

Leonie Steyn

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements of the degree

Doctor Philosophiae (Information Science)

In the Faculty of Engineering, Building Environment and Information Technology
University of Pretoria
Pretoria

Supervisor: Prof. J.C. Cronjé
Co-supervisor: Prof. T.J.D. Bothma

October 2004
Acknowledgement

I wish to thank the following people:

- My supervisor, Prof. Johannes Cronjé.
- My co-supervisor, Prof. Theo Bothma.
- The Statistics Department of the University of Pretoria and Elana Mauer for processing of the data.
- My husband André, Gato (my faithful cat) and colleagues for their support.
- Roger Loveday for the editing and all his support during the study.
- Andries du Plessis for his assistance in the initial design of the website.
- All the learners involved in the study.
Abstract

Title: Using Internet resources and e-learning modalities for training learners in Nutrition for people living with HIV and AIDS in South Africa

Candidate: Leonie Steyn
Supervisor: Prof JC Cronjé
Co-Supervisor: Prof TJD Bothma
Department: Information Science
Degree: D Phil (Information Science)

This thesis reports on a study conducted to investigate the design, development and implementation of a learning website as part of a distance education course comprising a combination of media and technology. The website functions as a tool for teaching distance education postgraduate adult learners mostly from previously disadvantaged communities whatever knowledge of nutrition they need to manage the symptoms and general health of people living with human immunodeficiency virus infection and acquired immune deficiency syndrome. Before ascertaining such factors, the limitations and concerns associated with the teaching and learning of the learners in question had to be established. The research problem is narrowed down to eight sub-questions in order to establish possible solutions. These sub-questions can be categorised as follows:

- Pressures on South African distance higher education institutions, and Internet and computer technology as a solution
- Interface design
- Web usability
- Utilization of a combination of media and technology

The study addresses each sub-question by means of an analysis of the published literature, by analysing how the findings of the project shed light on each research sub-question, and how each sub-question illuminated (in a wider sense) the remaining sub-questions, and the research question in general.

The answers to the research sub-questions will permit the researcher to determine how the teaching of adult learners from previously disadvantaged communities in the field of nutrition and HIV and AIDS could be made more effective by utilizing a distance education course that comprises a combination of media and technologies. This will then in turn lead to the formulation of strategies and guidelines for the design, development and implementation of e-learning as part a combination
of media and technology in order to offer effective postgraduate distance education courses for developing countries.

The results of the study could lead to the following possible applications:

- A post-graduate distance education course comprising a combination of media and technology
- A flexible, self-paced distance education course
- An interactive learning website
- Instant access to learning content
- Offering authentic and reliable information
- An alternative medium of offering content

Key words:

constraints; distance education; e-learning; HIV and AIDS; interface design; learning website; media; nutrition; technology; web usability.
Table of Contents

Abstract ............................................................................................................................................ i
Acknowledgement ......................................................................................................................... iii
Table of content............................................................................................................................... iv
List of tables .................................................................................................................................. viii
List of Figures................................................................................................................................. xii

Chapter 1: Overview and orientation

1.1 Introduction ........................................................................................................................... 1
1.2 Background ........................................................................................................................... 1
1.3 Rationale for the study .......................................................................................................... 4
1.3.1 Need for research............................................................................................................... 5
1.4 Research problem and questions ......................................................................................... 6
1.5 Research approach............................................................................................................... 8
1.5.1 Literature review............................................................................................................. 8
1.5.2 Data collecting methods ................................................................................................. 9
1.5.3 Subjects of the study ...................................................................................................... 11
1.5.4 Limitations of the study ............................................................................................... 11
1.6 Significance of the research................................................................................................ 11
1.6.1 Structure of the thesis................................................................................................... 12
1.7 Summary............................................................................................................................. 13

Chapter 2: Literature review

2.1 Introduction ......................................................................................................................... 14
2.2 Analysis of reported research per research question ........................................................... 15
2.2.1 Pressures on distance higher education ......................................................................... 15
  ❑ Conclusion.............................................................................................................................. 20
2.2.2 Learning opportunities provided through the Internet and e-learning ......................... 21
  ❑ Background on the nutrition and HIV and AIDS course ..................................................... 21
  ❑ Application of technology .................................................................................................. 23
  ❑ What value can e-learning add to distance education? ....................................................... 24
  ❑ When is the application of technology in education meaningful? .................................... 33
  ❑ What benefits does e-learning offer distance education? .................................................. 38
  ❑ Reported positive and negative aspects of e-learning modules .................................... 44
  ❑ Conclusion.............................................................................................................................. 46
2.2.3 Internet and e-learning constraints ............................................................................... 47
  ❑ Conclusion.............................................................................................................................. 53
2.2.4 Interface design principles ............................................................................................ 54
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.5 Web usability principles</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is web usability?</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.6 Theoretical perspectives and adult learner perceptions</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theoretical perspective</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.7 Suitable media and technology for the delivery of distance education</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.8 The design of a distance education course</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Chapter 3: Research project – The learning website**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Introduction</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Instructional design process</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1 Assessment/Analysis phase</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Needs analysis assessment</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goal analysis</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target population analysis</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Task analysis</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content analysis</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instructional strategy analysis</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Media analysis</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Situation analysis</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2 The design phase</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interface design</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3 The development phase</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Production processes</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Layout of the website</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.4 Implementation phase</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.5 Evaluation phase</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formative evaluation</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summative evaluation</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Research methodology</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1 Data collection procedure</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2 Data collection methods</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3 Description of data analysis</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.4 Evaluation and testing</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interviews, formal and informal discussions</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Usability testing</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 4: Research results

4.1 Introduction ....................................................................................................................... 145
4.2 Questionnaire A: Learner profile ....................................................................................... 145
4.3 Questionnaire B: Formative evaluation of the website .................................................... 152
  4.3.1 How did you (the learner) experience the screen display of the website? ..................... 153
  4.3.2 How did you (the learner) experience the text layout of the website? ...................... 156
  4.3.3 How did you (the learner) experience the language and terminology of the website? .. 158
  4.3.4 How did you experience the graphics and colour of the website? ................................. 160
  4.3.5 How did you (the learner) experience the content of the website? .............................. 162
  4.3.6 How did you (the learner) experience the navigation and interaction within the website? ................................................................................................................... 164
  4.3.7 How did you (the learner) experience the learning of the website? ............................. 168
  4.3.8 Read the statements below and give your (the learner's) view on the website .......... 170
  4.3.9 How did you (the learner) experience the online format of the exercises? ................ 172
  4.3.10 General statements .................................................................................................... 174
4.4 Questionnaire C: Summative evaluation ........................................................................ 176
  4.4.1 How did you experience working with the website? ................................................... 176
  4.4.2 What is your (the learner's) view on the website? ...................................................... 179
  4.4.3 Do you use e-mail to communicate with your lecturers and fellow learners? .......... 181
  4.4.4 Would you prefer to have your study guides and tutorial letters available online? ...... 182
  4.4.5 Would you (the learner) prefer to send your assessment activities by e-mail? ......... 183
  4.4.6 Would you (the learner) prefer to receive the marked assessments back by e-mail? .. 183
  4.4.7 Combination of media and technology learners would prefer for their studies ...... 185
  4.4.8 Preferred modes of communications ........................................................................... 187
  4.4.9 Would you prefer to receive instruction through a combination of media and technology? .................................................................................................................. 188
  4.4.10 Which of the following formats would you prefer to have available for instruction? .... 189
4.5 Hypothesis ........................................................................................................................ 190
  4.5.1 Methods of testing hypotheses.................................................................................... 190
      • The Chi-square test ($\chi^2$) .......................................................................................... 190
  4.5.2 Hypotheses concerning the e-learning website ......................................................... 190
  4.5.3 Differences between sub-groups .................................................................................. 193
      • Age groups .................................................................................................................. 194
      • Sex ............................................................................................................................... 197
      • Computer access ....................................................................................................... 202
Chapter 5: Conclusion and recommendations

5.1 Introduction ....................................................................................................................... 219
5.2 Findings and results collected from the research ............................................................. 220
5.2.1 Pressures on distance higher education ....................................................................... 220
5.2.2 The value that e-learning can add to a distance education course............................ 223
5.2.3 Internet and e-learning constraints ............................................................................. 224
5.2.4 Interface design .......................................................................................................... 230
5.2.5 Web usability principles ............................................................................................. 232
5.2.6 Theoretical perspectives and learner perceptions ....................................................... 237
5.2.7 Delivering distance education by means of a combination of media and technology... 239
  Q Advantages ..................................................................................................................... 239
  Q Limitations .................................................................................................................... 241
5.2.8 Design and development of a distance education course ........................................ 242
  Q Features of a nutrition and HIV and AIDS course comprising a combination of 
    media and technology ................................................................................................... 242
5.3 Discussion ......................................................................................................................... 244
5.3.1 Methodological reflection .......................................................................................... 244
5.3.2 Substantive reflection ................................................................................................. 245
5.4 Scientific reflection .......................................................................................................... 253
5.4.1 What I learned from the study .................................................................................... 253
5.4.2 Strategies for the design and development of a distance education course using a 
    combination of media and technology ........................................................................... 256
5.5 Recommendations ............................................................................................................ 258
5.5.1 Recommendations for introducing policy and practice ............................................. 258
5.5.2 Recommendations for further research ..................................................................... 259
5.5.3 Recommendations for further development .............................................................. 259
5.6 Conclusion ........................................................................................................................ 260

REFERENCES ............................................................................................................................ 261
APPENDIX A .............................................................................................................................. 283
APPENDIX B .............................................................................................................................. 286
APPENDIX C .............................................................................................................................. 295
APPENDIX D .............................................................................................................................. 301
APPENDIX E .............................................................................................................................. 306
List of Figures

Figure 3.1: Individual knowledge construction model ................................................................. 97
Figure 3.2: Step-by-step formulation of instruction .......................................................................... 100
Figure 3.3: The home page of the website ..................................................................................... 120
Figure 3.4: The information page .................................................................................................. 121
Figure 3.5: Visual indicators of where learners are in the website .................................................. 122
Figure 3.6: An assignment page .................................................................................................... 123
Figure 3.7: Multiple-choice questions ........................................................................................... 124
Figure 4.1: Screen display: Visual impression ................................................................................ 154
Figure 4.2: Screen display: Organisation of screens and information .......................................... 154
Figure 4.3: Screen display: General screen features ...................................................................... 155
Figure 4.4: Text layout of website .................................................................................................. 157
Figure 4.5: Text layout of website (continued) .............................................................................. 157
Figure 4.6: The language and terminology used in the website ..................................................... 159
Figure 4.7: The language and terminology used in the website (continued) ................................ 159
Figure 4.8: The use of graphics and colour in the website ............................................................ 161
Figure 4.9: Content of the website .................................................................................................. 163
Figure 4.10: Navigation and interaction of the website ................................................................... 165
Figure 4.11: Navigation and interaction of the website (continued) ............................................. 166
Figure 4.12: Learners’ experience of learning the website ............................................................. 169
Figure 4.13: Learners’ view of the website ...................................................................................... 171
Figure 4.14: Learners’ views of the online format of exercises ....................................................... 173
Figure 4.15: Learners’ views on general statements concerning the website ................................. 175
Figure 4.16: How learners experienced working with the website ............................................... 177
Figure 4.17: How learners experienced the website (continued) .................................................. 178
Figure 4.18: Learners’ view on working with the website ............................................................ 180
Figure 4.19: Learners’ response on using e-mail as means of communication .............................. 181
Figure 4.20: Learners’ responses to having study material available online .................................. 182
Figure 4.21: Learners’ response on sending assessments by e-mail ............................................. 183
Figure 4.22: Learners’ responses to receiving marked assessments by e-mail ............................... 184
Figure 4.23: Media and technologies learners prefer to use during their studies ........................... 186
Figure 4.24: Learners’ preferred mode of communication .............................................................. 187
Figure 4.25: Instruction offered through a combination of media and technology ....................... 188
Figure 4.26: Preferred forms of media and technology used for instruction ................................. 189
Figure 4.27: Percentage responses for categories age groups (≤29 years and younger and ≥30 years and older) and learners views on their computer literacy ......................................... 196
Figure 4.28: Percentage responses for the sex categories and the question concerning mode of presenting the study material ............................................................................................................. 200
Figure 4.29: Percentage responses in the sex categories to the question concerning instruction through a combination of media and technology ................................. 201

Figure 4.30: Percentage responses for categories computer access and no computer access and the statement: I have access to the Internet. ............................................. 203

Figure 4.31: Percentage responses in the categories computer access and no computer access to the statement: The website was easy to use. ............................................. 204

Figure 4.32: Percentage responses in the categories computer access and no computer access to the question concerning instruction through a combination of media and technology.................................................................................................. 205

Figure 4.33: Percentage responses in the categories computer literate and computer illiterate to the statement: I have access to a computer for my studies. ..................... 207

Figure 4.34: Percentage responses in the categories computer literate and computer illiterate to the statement: I have access to the Internet................................................................. 209

Figure 4.35: Percentage responses in the categories computer literate and computer illiterate to the statement: The website was easy to use ............................................. 210

Figure 4.36: Percentage responses in the categories computer literate and computer illiterate to the question: I would prefer to receive instruction through a combination of media and technology. ................................................................. 211

Figure 4.37: Percentage responses in the categories Internet access and no Internet access to the statement: The website was easy to use ............................................. 213

Figure 4.38: Percentage responses in categories Internet access and no Internet access to the question: Will you use e-mail to communicate with lecturers and fellow learners? ................................................................. 214

Figure 5.1: A page of the learning website .................................................................................... 234
List of Tables

Table 1.1: Research question ............................................................................................................... 7
Table 1.2: Research hypothesis ........................................................................................................ 8
Table 1.3: Research instruments used for this study ......................................................................... 9
Table 1.4: Research questions evaluation matrix ............................................................................. 10
Table 1.5: Structure of the thesis .................................................................................................... 13
Table 2.1: Descriptions of distance education .................................................................................. 16
Table 2.2: Elements that define distance education ......................................................................... 17
Table 2.3: What learners need and want from distance education .................................................. 18
Table 2.4: A description of some e-learning concepts and features .............................................. 26
Table 2.5: Descriptions of e-learning concepts used in reference to individual learners ............... 29
Table 2.6: Descriptions of e-learning concepts used in reference to group activities .................... 31
Table 2.7: Principal features of an online learning community ....................................................... 33
Table 2.8: Examples of research that indicated that e-learning was found to deliver significantly better results than conventional training ............................................... 36
Table 2.9: Examples of research that found no significant difference between e-learning and conventional training ........................................................................................................ 37
Table 2.10: Positive and negative aspects of e-learning courses .................................................... 45
Table 2.11: Questions that can help one to identify and provide solutions to constraints that can affect learners in an e-learning situation ................................................................ 48
Table 2.12: Questions that can help one to identify and provide solutions to technology constraints that will affect learners in an e-learning situation .................................... 49
Table 2.13: A summary of the TOC concepts .................................................................................... 51
Table 2.14: The five focussing steps of the TOC ............................................................................ 52
Table 2.15: Interface features .......................................................................................................... 54
Table 2.16: Factors that need to be considered when developing user-centred websites ............... 56
Table 2.17: Aspects of user interface design: page design and layout .......................................... 58
Table 2.18: Aspects of user interface design: visual design and text presentation ....................... 60
Table 2.19: Aspects of user interface design: information processing ........................................... 62
Table 2.20: Quality attributes of usability ......................................................................................... 65
Table 2.21: Usability issues and website design ................................................................................. 67
Table 2.22: Usability and website design (Continued) ..................................................................... 69
Table 2.23: Criteria that users adopted for deciding whether or not to use a website .................... 72
Table 2.24: Some differences between objectivism and constructivism ....................................... 75
Table 2.25: Gagne’s Conditions of Learning Theory ....................................................................... 77
Table 2.26: Carroll’s Minimalist Theory ......................................................................................... 79
Table 2.27: Vygotsky’s Theory of Social Cognitive Development ............................................... 81
Table 2.28: Constructs of web-based attitudes .................................................................................. 84
Table 2.29: Advantages and limitations of a range of technologies used for distance education

Table 3.1: The seven types of front-end analysis covered in this study

Table 3.2: Personal and demographic information of learners

Table 3.3: Components of adult learning

Table 3.4: Questions and responses regarding the suitability of the subject matter for online delivery

Table 3.5: Media and technology selected for the nutrition and HIV and AIDS course

Table 3.6: Learner constraints identified during the needs analysis and possible solutions concerning learner computer and technology needs

Table 3.7: Learner and staff constraints identified during the needs analysis and the possible solutions that can have an influence on the effectiveness of e-learning and the Internet as part of a distance education course

Table 3.8: Infrastructure and organisational constraints identified during the needs analysis, and possible solutions concerning infrastructure and organisation

Table 3.9: Overview of production tools, specifications and processes

Table 3.10: Basic usability testing design steps

Table 3.11: Data collection procedures

Table 3.12: Research questions and attributes addressed by the website

Table 4.1: Educational background of learners

Table 4.2: Professional background of learners

Table 4.3: Study methods and circumstances

Table 4.4: Computer and technology access

Table 4.5: Hypotheses tested using the Chi-square test

Table 4.6: Hypotheses tested using the Binomial test for proportions

Table 4.7: Chi-square test results for significant differences between the responses to the listed variables of the age groups 29 years and younger and 30 years and older

Table 4.8: Percentage responses for categories age groups (≤29 years and younger and ≥30 years and older) and learners’ views on their computer literacy

Table 4.9: Chi-square test results for significant differences between the responses of male and female learners with regard to the listed variables

Table 4.10: Percentage responses for the sex categories and the question concerning availability of study material online

Table 4.11: Percentage responses for the sex categories and the question concerning instruction through a combination of media and technology

Table 4.12: Chi-square test results for significant differences between learners with access to a computer for their studies and those without access

Table 4.13: Percentage responses in the categories computer access and no computer access and the statement: I have access to the Internet
Table 4.14: Percentage responses in categories computer access and no computer access to the statement: The website was easy to use. ................................................................. 204
Table 4.15: Percentage responses in the categories computer access and no computer access to the statement concerning instruction through a combination of media and technology ............................................................................................................. 205
Table 4.16: Chi-square test results for significant differences between learners with access to a computer for their studies and without access, with regard to the listed variables ........................................................................................................................................................................ 206
Table 4.17: Percentage responses in the categories computer literate and computer illiterate to the statement concerning learners that have access to a computer for their studies ........................................................................................................................................................................ 207
Table 4.18: Percentage responses in the categories computer literate and computer illiterate to the statement: I have access to the Internet ........................................................................................................................................................................ 208
Table 4.19: Percentage responses for the categories computer literate and computer illiterate to the statement: The website was easy to use ........................................................................................................................................................................ 210
Table 4.20: Percentage responses in the categories computer literate and computer illiterate to the statement: I would prefer to receive instruction through a combination of media and technology ........................................................................................................................................................................ 211
Table 4.21: Chi-square test results for significant differences between learners with access to the Internet and those without Internet access, with regard to the listed variables ..... 212
Table 4.22: Percentage responses in the categories Internet access and no Internet access to the statement: The website was easy to use ........................................................................................................................................................................ 213
Table 4.23: Percentage responses in categories Internet access and no Internet access to the question: Will you use e-mail to communicate with lecturers and fellow learners? .... 214
Table 4.24: A summary of the suggestions indicated by the research questions and the research ........................................................................................................................................................................ 217
Table 5.1: An integrated summary of the adult learner profile as reported by the literature and the results of this research ........................................................................................................................................................................ 221
Table 5.2: What the learners needed and required from distance education and how and to what extend the course met these needs and requirements ........................................................................................................................................................................ 222
Table 5.3: Learner constraints identified during the needs analysis and possible solutions concerning learner computer and technology needs ........................................................................................................................................................................ 226
Table 5.4: Learner and staff constraints identified during the needs analysis and the possible solutions that can have an influence on the effectiveness of e-learning and the Internet as part of a distance education course. ........................................................................................................................................................................ 227
Table 5.5: Infrastructure and organisational constraints identified during the needs analysis, and possible solutions concerning infrastructure and organisation ........................................................................................................................................................................ 228
Table 5.6: Factors that need to be considered when developing user-centred learning websites ........................................................................................................................................................................ 231
Table 5.7: Personal and demographic information of learners ........................................................................................................................................................................ 233
Table 5.8: Usability principles and the implementation of such principles to the nutrition and HIV and AIDS learning website .......................................................... 235
Table 5.9: How the nutrition and HIV and AIDS course addressed the learning theories applicable to e-learning .......................................................................................... 238
Table 5.10: The features of the combination of media and technology used in the nutrition and HIV and AIDS distance education course ...................................................... 243
Table 5.11: Typical media and technology used in distance education .................................. 248
Table 5.12: Positive aspects of e-learning courses .................................................................... 249
Table 5.13: Negative aspects of e-learning modules ................................................................. 250