

**PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENT AS A PUBLIC
POLICY IMPLEMENTATION TOOL IN THE
SOUTH AFRICAN PUBLIC SERVICE**

THOLUMUZI BRUNO LUTHULI

2005

**PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENT AS A PUBLIC
POLICY IMPLEMENTATION TOOL IN THE
SOUTH AFRICAN PUBLIC SERVICE**

by

THOLUMUZI BRUNO LUTHULI

**A Thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements
for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)**

in Public Affairs

**at the School of Public Management and Administration in the
Faculty of Economic and Management Sciences**

**University of Pretoria
Pretoria
South Africa**

**Supervisor: Professor Dr. Jerry O. Kuye
University of Pretoria
Pretoria
South Africa**

**©
2005**

ABSTRACT

Policy implementation in South Africa has not been as successful as the policy formulation phase. In the last ten years of democracy and the shift from apartheid minority white rule to the present majority rule, a lot has been achieved. Among the achievements is the ability to formulate policies directed at integrating society and the fragmented administrative systems. While the performance of government organisations has not been as good as anticipated, several mechanisms, though insufficient, have been put in place to assist with policy implementation and in an attempt to make government more efficient and effective in delivering public services.

This research considers whether having a performance measurement and management system to oversee and evaluate the organisational side of performance might address the question of service delivery in the public service. Both policy implementation mechanisms, those referred to as alternative service delivery methods and strategy implementation using performance measurement as a tool are considered. The finding of this research project is that an improvement in policy implementation and strategy deployment using a performance measurement system, will lead to an increase in the current levels of service delivery. Two cases are considered, one, a city government of Tshwane, where performance management is mandatory in terms of the Municipal Systems Act (1999), and the National Department of Labour, which, through its own recognizance, has implemented a performance measurement system.

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this report is my own unaided work and that, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person nor material which, to a substantial extent, has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma of a University or other institute of higher learning, except where due acknowledgement has been made in the text.

Tholumuzi Bruno Luthuli

Date

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My greatest thanks go to my supervisor, Professor Jerry Kuye, without whom this work would not have been completed. To my family, especially my children who I could not be with all the time, suffered as a result while I was working on this research project, I hope this work will be inspirational and a challenge. My thanks are also directed to Mr Dick Bvuma from Department of Public Service and Administration, Mr Mcezi Mnisi of the City of Tshwane and Ms Mongo Phukela of the Department of Labour. These individuals have provided an abundance of factual material as well as many helpful comments.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT.....	li
DECLARATION.....	lii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	iv
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	v
LIST OF FIGURES.....	xiv
ABBREVIATIONS.....	xv
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND INFORMATION	
BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY.....	1
THE SOUTH AFRICAN PUBLIC SERVICE IN CONTEXT.....	5
SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY.....	6
AIMS AND OBJECTIVES OF THE RESEARCH.....	8
PROBLEM STATEMENT.....	9
THE RESEARCH QUESTIONS.....	10
STRUCTURE AND OUTLINE OF THE REPORT.....	11
CLARIFICATION OF KEY CONCEPTS.....	12
Accountability.....	12
Budget.....	13
Economy.....	14
Effectiveness.....	15
Efficiency.....	15
Goal.....	16
Input.....	16

Organ of state.....	17
Output.....	17
Performance indicator.....	17
Performance management.....	18
Performance measurement.....	19
Process.....	19
Public Financial Management.....	19
Public Administration.....	20
Risk.....	21
System.....	21
Targets.....	21
BACKGROUND ARGUMENTS.....	22
Neo-liberalism and the welfare state.....	22
The New Public Management Paradigm.....	24
The public service transformation agenda.....	24
The role of central agencies.....	25
Accountability requirements.....	27
The influence of the private sector.....	29
From budgeting to planning and accounting.....	30
Operationalizing mechanisms.....	31
Performance management: a need for a holistic approach	33
Problems with implementing policy and strategy.....	34
The need for alignment and leadership in performance.....	35
CONCLUSION.....	35
CHAPTER TWO: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	
INTRODUCTION.....	38
RATIONALE FOR CHOICE.....	39
The Department of Labour.....	42
The City of Tshwane.....	43
OBJECTIVITY AND THE TYPE OF RESEARCH.....	44
Science and objectivity.....	45
RESEARCH WITHIN HUMANITIES, ADMINISTRATION AND MANAGEMENT	50

THE RESEARCH STRATEGY.....	51
Data gathering.....	53
Data presentation and analysis.....	55
SIGNIFICANCE OF THE METHODOLOGY.....	57
THE PROBLEM STATEMENT AND METHODOLOGY.....	58
THE RESEARCH QUESTION.....	58
VALIDITY AND RELIABILITY TESTS.....	59
SCOPE AND THE NATURE OF THE THESIS.....	60
LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY.....	61
CONCLUSION.....	62
CHAPTER THREE: PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENT IN PERSPECTIVE	
INTRODUCTION.....	64
THE CHALLENGES OF THE SOUTH AFRICAN PUBLIC SERVICE.....	66
RATIONALE FOR A PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENT SYSTEM IN THE PUBLIC SERVICE.....	67
COMPARATIVE LITERATURE ON PUBLIC SECTOR EFFICIENCY AND EFFECTIVENESS.....	69
The role of the state.....	69
Transformation and public service reform.....	73
The influence of the New Public Management (NPM) and the post-bureaucratic era.....	74
Performance measurement, management and budgeting.....	76
ACCOUNTABILITY.....	79
The Constitutional requirements.....	79
Accountability and the South African Parliament.....	80
Operational performance, accountability and resource allocation.....	81

PUBLIC MANAGEMENT,POLITICS AND ADMINISTRATIVE EFFICIENCY	83
PUBLIC MANAGEMENT AND ORGANISATIONAL THEORY.....	84
THE THEORETICAL FOUNDATIONS OF POLICY IMPLEMENTATION...	87
PRODUCTIVITY IN THE PUBLIC SECTOR.....	92
APPROACHES TO PERFORMANCE IMPROVEMENT.....	94
FROM POLICY TO STRATEGY: IMPLEMENTATION FOR SUCCESS.....	96
Policy implementation and performance management.....	96
The value of plans in management in the public service.....	97
Scenario planning as implementation strategy.....	99
The need to map strategy.....	100
THE SOFTER SIDE OF PERFORMANCE.....	100
People and performance.....	102
Financial rewards motivate philosophy.....	104
Creating an alignment.....	106
Change management and the administrative culture.....	107
Organisational design and structure.....	109
Leadership.....	110
THE MANAGEMENT OF CONFLICT	114
CONCLUSION.....	115
CHAPTER FOUR: POLICY IMPLEMENTATION AND PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENT	
INTRODUCTION.....	119
PROBLEMS WITH POLICY IMPLEMENTATION IN SOUTH AFRICA.....	121
SELECTED IMPLEMENTATION MODELS: AN ANALYSIS.....	123

INNOVATION AND UTILISING THE OPPORTUNITY SPACE.....	125
THE ROLE OF CENTRAL AGENCIES IN GOVERNMENT POLICY IMPLEMENTATION.....	126
THE SOUTH AFRICAN PUBLIC POLICY ENVIRONMENT.....	128
INSTITUTIONALISING PARTICIPATION AND POLICY ANALYSIS IN SOUTH AFRICA.....	131
ACCOUNTABILITY FOR ENSURING SUCCESS.....	135
Accountability, policy implementation and the different stakeholders.....	135
Accountability in municipalities.....	136
TECHNIQUES FOR POLICY IMPLEMENTATION.....	137
Contributions made by the NPM to policy implementation.....	138
WPPSD (<i>Batho Pele</i>): Contributions to policy implementation.....	140
The customer driven approach to performance improvement.....	143
Implementation through public private partnerships.....	144
The Multi-Purpose Community Centres.....	146
PRODUCTIVITY IMPROVEMENT AS A TOOL FOR POLICY IMPLEMENTATION.....	146
Total Quality Management.....	148
Excellence Awards.....	149
The Balanced Scorecard.....	151
Process re-engineering and improvement	153
Benchmarking for improvement.....	154
PLANNING AND FORECASTING FOR POLICY IMPLEMENTATION.....	157
COSTING POLICY BEFORE IMPLEMENTATION.....	159
RESULTS AND PERFORMANCE BASED BUDGETING APPROACHES....	160
Performance budgeting.....	162
Activity based costing and budgeting.....	163

Outcome based budget.....	165
PERFORMANCE AGREEMENTS, ADMINISTRATIVE ACCOUNTABILITY AND AGENCY ARRANGEMENTS.....	167
THE INFLUENCE OF THE DONOR COMMUNITY ON POLICY AND PROGRAMME EFFICIENCY REQUIREMENTS.....	170
PROJECT MANAGEMENT IN POLICY IMPLEMENTATION	171
THE ROLE OF MONITORING AND EVALUATION IN POLICY ANALYSIS..	172
POLICY MODIFICATION AND FEEDBACK.....	174
PUBLIC POLICY IMPLEMENTATION AND RISK.....	174
Risk management and the audit function	176
Key principles underlying effective risk management.....	179
CONCLUSION.....	180
CHAPTER FIVE: PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENT IN PUBLIC ORGANISATIONS	
INTRODUCTION.....	182
STRATEGY DEPLOYMENT	183
Situational analysis for a successful performance based strategy.....	187
Mapping and cascading the strategy to ensure alignment.....	190
IMPLEMENTING THE STRATEGY THROUGH MEASUREMENT.....	193
Goal and objective setting.....	194
Planning and budgeting for strategy implementation.....	195
Developing performance measures.....	195
Setting targets.....	198
Crafting performance indicators.....	199
Balancing measures.....	201

PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENT DATA IN PERSPECTIVE.....	202
Data collection, analysis and performance information.....	204
Appropriateness and accuracy of data collected.....	204
Developing information infrastructure.....	205
STRATEGY IMPLEMENTATION AS A RISK MANAGEMENT TOOL.....	208
PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENT: THE HUMAN FACTOR.....	211
LINKING PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENT TO THE REWARD PROCESS.	214
IDENTIFYING AND MEASURING PERFORMANCE GAPS.....	215
ESTABLISHING ACCOUNTABILITY AT ALL LEVELS OF THE ORGANISATION.....	215
CHOOSING BETWEEN CONTROLLING AND COMMUNICATING.....	216
NEED FOR ALIGNMENT TO OTHER ORGANISATIONAL SYSTEMS.....	218
A framework for creating alignment.....	218
Linking output to outcome.....	219
Knowledge, skills and competence.....	219
Structural complexities.....	220
Systems.....	221
Behaviour change, culture and performance.....	222
Performance, ethics and human behaviour.....	224
Planning and performance management as a leadership tool.....	225
INTERNATIONAL OVERVIEW.....	226
REVIEWING, REPORTING AND TAKING ACTION.....	233
CONCLUSION.....	238
CHAPTER SIX: CONCLUSION, RECOMMENDATIONS AND AREAS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH	
INTRODUCTION	241

CHALLENGES WITH IMPLEMENTING POLICY.....	244
General conditions for successful implementation of policy.....	244
Considering the different stakeholders and accompanying factors.....	246
Getting the process and implementation mechanisms in place.....	247
Aligning government planning from the centre.....	247
Organisational capacity.....	248
Availability of resources.....	250
Management in public organisations.....	251
THE ROLE OF STRATEGIC PLANNING IN POLICY IMPLEMENTATION..	253
PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT AND MEASUREMENT IN STRATEGY IMPLEMENTATION	255
Objectives and goals.....	257
Creating the strategic alignment.....	258
Mapping the strategy.....	261
Ensuring appropriate performance measures and indicators.....	263
Creating a balance.....	267
Targets.....	268
DATA COLLECTION ANALYSIS AND REPORTING: THE CHALLENGES.	269
Advantages of having an information management system.....	272
PEOPLE AND PERFORMANCE.....	273
Motivation and performance.....	273
Performance related pay.....	274
COMMUNICATION IN PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENT AND MANAGEMENT.....	277
Good governance, communication and consultation.....	278
Feedback and review in performance measurement.....	280
STRUCTURE, ORGANISATIONAL DESIGN, STRATEGY AND PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENT AND MANAGEMENT.....	282

CULTURE CHANGE IN PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENT AND MANAGEMENT.....	285
LEADERSHIP AND ORGANISATIONAL PERFORMANCE.....	287
MANAGEMENT OF CONFLICT.....	289
POST STRATEGY IMPLEMENTATION: EVALUATING THE STRATEGY AND THE PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENT SYSTEM.....	290
INTEGRATING MULTIPLE PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT SYSTEMS: A SYSTEMS APPROACH.....	292
WHOSE RESPONSIBILITY IS IT TO MEASURE PERFORMANCE?.....	293
Central agency versus decentralisation.....	295
The role of the Productivity Institutes.....	295
AREAS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH.....	297
CONCLUSION.....	298
BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	301

ANNEXURES

ANNEXURE A: The requirements of a Performance Measurement System

ANNEXURE B: Performance Measurement Process Model

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1	Philosophy of Science and theory of society.....	46
Figure 2.2	Positivism and phenomenology.....	49
Figure 3.1	The public service productivity process.....	92
Figure 3.2	Seeking commitment.....	98
Figure 3.3	A framework for performance management.....	105
Figure 4.1	Relationships in a project finance structure for PPP.....	145
Figure 4.2	The European Foundation Quality Excellence Model.....	150
Figure 4.3	The Balanced Scorecard.....	152
Figure 4.4	Control chart: Performance Indicator	154
Figure 4.5	Policy planning assumptions.....	158
Figure 4.6	Guidelines for managing risk.....	178
Figure 6.1	The public manager in policy implementation.....	252
Figure 6.2	Linking planning to operations.....	255
Figure 6.3	Strategic alignment.....	259
Figure 6.4	Developing performance measures.....	266
Figure 6.5	Possible financial allocation based on a 5% budget.....	276

ACRONYMS

BENSA	Benchmark South Africa
CAPAM	Commonwealth Association for Public Administration and Management
CBA	Cost-Benefit-Analysis
CEO	Chief Executive Officer
CPSI	Centre for Public Service Innovation
DEA	Data Envelopment Analysis
DoL	Department of Labour
DPSA	Department of Public Service and Administration
DPLG	Department of Provincial and Local Government
DTI	Department of Trade and Industry
EEA	Employment Equity Act
FOSAD	Forum of South Africa Directors General
GEAR	Growth Equity and Redistribution Strategy
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GPRA	(USA's) Government Performance and Results Act
HoD	Head of Department
IDP	Integrated Development Plan

IPP	Integrated Implementation Plan
IPSP	Inter-Provincial Support Programme
KPI	Key Performance Indicator
MDG	Millennium Development Goals
MPCC	Multi-Purpose Community Centre
NA	National Assembly
NCOP	National Council of Provinces
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NMTF	National Medium Term Expenditure Estimate
NPM	The New Public Management
NEDLAC	National Economic and Labour Council
OECD	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
PGDS	Provincial Growth and Development Strategy
PFMA	Public Finance Management Act, 2000
PPBS	Planning, Programming and Budgeting Systems
PPP	Public Private Partnerships
PSC	Public Service Commission
PSCBC	Public Service Coordinating Bargaining Council

PSR	Public Service Regulations
RDP	Reconstruction and Development Programme
SALGA	South African Local Government Association
SAMDI	South African Management Development Institute
SANDF	South African National Defence Force
SAPS	South African Police Service
TQM	Total Quality Management
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
USA	United States of America
WPTPS	White Paper on the Transformation of the Public Service
WPTPSD	White Paper on Transforming Public Service Delivery
WPLG	White Paper on Local Government
WPPSHRM	White Paper on the Public Service Human Resources Management
ZBB	Zero Based Budgets