AN IMPACT ANALYSIS OF SOUTH AFRICA'S NATIONAL STRATEGY FOR THE DEVELOPMENT AND PROMOTION OF SMMEs

CLEMENT STANLEY CHALERA

(Student Number: 2339623)

AN IMPACT ANALYSIS OF SOUTH AFRICA'S NATIONAL STRATEGY FOR THE DEVELOPMENT AND PROMOTION OF SMMEs

by

CLEMENT STANLEY CHALERA

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

PHILISOPHIAE DOCTOR (PhD)

In the
DEPARTMENT OF MARKETING AND COMMUNICATION
MANAGEMENT
FACULTY OF ECONOMIC AND MANAGEMENT SCIENCES

At the UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

PROMOTER: PROFESSOR RONÉL RENSBURG

Pretoria May 2006

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This research report, to reach this final form, is built on the experiences, knowledge and sacrifices of many people. It will indeed be difficult for me to mention them all, but I would like to mention those who had gone the extra mile with me:

Thulani Nkwananzi, Morwesi More, Sunday Mahlangu and Mzwandile Masina from the Department of Trade and Industry.

Keabecoe (KB) Motlhoioa, Phinnah Mukwevho and Sibongile Msibi from Ntsika Enterprise Promotion Agency.

Sizwe Tati and Tello May from Khula Enterprise Finance Limited.

Dann Morgan, Lemmy Mduli, Annoinette Baepi and Stan Mathabatha from Gauteng, Mpumalanga, North West and Limpopo provincial SMME desks respectively.

Kanyo Gqulu, Tshepo Tjatjie and Sibongile Dlamini from the Department of Minerals and Energy (DME).

Sipho Mseleku, Patrick Silo and Vusi Nthlapo from National African Federated Chamber of Commerce.

Virginia Banda (Gerina) for her assistance in the coding and analyzing of the study's questionnaire and for undoubted support when I needed it most.

My promoter, Professor Ronél Rensburg, for her guidance during the entire period of the study.

All the owners of the small black economic empowerment mining companies who participated in the study by responded to the study's questionnaire.

May the good Lord bless them all.

DEDICATION

I dedicate this research study to two special people in my life: my mother, **Naphumisa** and my son, **Tiyamike.**

It is my mother who, since my childhood, implanted into me the realization of the power of knowledge and perseverance.

Omai, ku Matenje kale-kale, munanena kuti, "Mwana wanga, limbikila sukulu, tsiku linatu amenewa adzakugwadirani".

It is because of those powerful prophetic words and whatever you have provided me physically, mentally and morally since that day you brought me into this world, I dedicate this work to you, *Wokwathu!!!*

To my son Tiyamike: "I failed you dismally as a parent during the time I was conducting this study. It is for your courage and uncompromising love and trust you have in me as a father that I also dedicate this work to you, *Tiya!!!*"

AN IMPACT ANALYSIS OF SOUTH AFRICA'S NATIONAL STRATEGY FOR THE DEVELOPMENT AND PROMOTION OF SMMEs

Abstract

This study explores the effectiveness of the South African National Strategy for the development and promotion of small businesses in South Africa, where it first evaluates the effectiveness of the instructional framework created under the government's National Strategy i.e. Centre for Small Business Promotion, Ntsika Enterprise Promotion Agency and Khula Enterprise Finance Limited for the attainment of the government's National Strategy's objectives of job creation, income generation and economic growth from an economic point of view. It also investigates the government's National Strategy's effectiveness with regard to services provision by both the financial service providers and non-financial service providers including the recipients of such services i.e. the SMMEs themselves from a business management perspective with regard to the success factors of functional areas of management. The study also evaluates some government departments which are not incorporated in the government's National Strategy's institutional framework and other business organizations all of which are engaged in small business development initiatives. The study further evaluates some parastatal organizations and provincial SMME desks in relation to the government's National Strategy. Lastly the study evaluates the impact the government's National Strategy has had on the small black economic empowerment mining companies as a sector, specifically if the government's National Strategy has created an enabling environment for them to succeed in their small-scale mining operations.

Job creation and growth of the small business sector will remain one of South Africa's most urgent needs. Most severe social and economic ills result directly from inadequate progress in both these domains. Since the first democratic elections of 1994, an intensive process had been undertaken to address the urgent need for job creation and income generation, particularly among the majority black population. From these processes, policies were formulated, institutions created and funds allocated in the quest for these goals.

While opinions may differ widely on the most effective measure to achieve steady progress, one factor has not been placed in doubt, namely that the richest source of job creation may come, not from the country's big business sector, but from the small and medium enterprise sector. This reality is hardly unique to South Africa alone, but a proven fact in virtually every country developed and less developed alike.

According to the study there seems to be a consensus that job creation ranks among the country's most urgent priorities, along with AIDS, crime and education. High unemployment remains the obstacle to the country's long-term social, economic and political stability. The government's National Strategy was meant to address all these issues as it is a web that links many economic and social sectors of the country. Job creation in the all-important small business sector is not just an "industry" issue; it cuts across many different policy areas, from individual livelihoods, economic development, political empowerment, human resource development, market development and physical infrastructure.

The government's National Strategy, according to the study, is not perceived as a "strategy" as such, which would imply an integrated national plan linking all programmes at the national and regional level to achieve defined goals. It is however, seen as an array of independent, largely uncoordinated programmes, aimed at a common set of social and economic goals.

A critical flaw in the government's National Strategy, the study had also shown, is its failure to "segment its market", namely to realistically differentiate its support among its two principal target groups - micro/survivalist enterprises and small/medium businesses - each with distinctly different needs. The government's National Strategy also appears to have suffered from several internal contradictions especially with regard to the institutions created under its institutional framework.

With regard to the implementation of the government's National Strategy, the study has noted that the National Strategy seems to be leaderless and not effectively coordinated. The National Strategy also seems to have spawned an explosion of programmes and service providers, frequently duplicating other national and regional programmes. The Centre for Small Business Promotion within the DTI seems not to be playing the role it was intended to play while Ntsika's centralised/standardised mode of operation makes adaptation of training to diverse local groups and needs very difficult and Khula's programmes seem to have fallen short of their objectives, despite an effective and professional internal organization.

Contrary to its design, provinces and municipalities do not play a major policy or operational role in the government's National Strategy yet these are typically most informed and connected to local businesses and often have better understanding of the needs and success factors.

With regard to the small black economic empowerment mining sector, the study has revealed that the government's National Strategy has not been utilized effectively by this sector and because of this the government's National Strategy has not played a pivotal role in creating an enabling environment for small-scale miners to fully succeed in their small-scale mining operations.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter	1:	IN	TRO	DU	ICT	10	N
---------	----	----	------------	----	------------	----	---

on apro-		Page
1.1	Introduction	1
1.2	Background to the study	2
1.3	Purpose and objectives of the study	9
1.3.1	Purpose of the study	9
1.3.2	Objectives of the study	11
1.4	Problem statement	14
1.5	Delimitation of the study	16
1.6	Research design	17
1.6.1	Type of study	18
1.6.2	Propositions/assumptions	19
1.6.3	Research methodology	19
1.6.4	Sample design of the study	20
1.7	Possible findings of the study	21
1.8	Structure of the study	22
1.9	Summary	24

Chapter 2: SOUTH AFRICA'S POLITICAL BACKGROUND AND ITS LEGACY

2.1	Introduction	25
2.2	Political background	25
2.3	Discriminatory measures	26
2.3.1	Land reservation	26
2.3.2	Job reservation	28
2.3.3	Education	30
2.4	Legacy of discrimination	32
2.4.1	Inequality	32
2.4.2	Economic growth	33
2.5	The impact of the legacy on the small business	
	sector	34
2.6	The government effort to address the apartheid's	
	legacy	35
0.7	Operation	00
2.7	Conclusion	36
Chapter	3: THE SMME SECTOR IN SOUTH AFRICA	
•		
3.1	Introduction	37
3.2	Main functions of SMMEs	38

3.3	Structural features of the South African economy	/
	and its implications for SMME growth	39
3.3.1	The apartheid legacy	39
3.3.2	International experience in dealing with such legacy	40
3.3.3	Way forward for South Africa	41
3.4	Can SMME resolve the unemployment problem?	_
	a theoretical consideration	42
3.4.1	Capital, productivity and demand for labour	42
3.4.2	Labour markets, wage rates and productivity	43
3.4.3	Role of the high productivity in labour markets	43
3.4.4	Role of the micro-enterprises and the SME sector	44
3.5	Size, profile and performance of South Africa's	
	SMME economy	48
3.5.1	Introduction	48
3.5.2	Numbers of SMMEs in various size categories	49
3.5.3	Sectoral structures of South Africa's SMMEs	51
3.5.3.1	Current sectoral profile	52
3.5.3.2	Sectoral dynamics	54
3.5.4	Ethnic structure of South Africa's SMME	59
3.5.4.1	"Black business"	59
3.5.4.2	Racial discrimination by sector	60
3.5.4.3	Cross-racial partnerships	60
3.5.5	Geographical location of South Africa's SMMEs	61
3.5.5.1	Rural and urban SMMEs	61
3.5.5.2	Evidence of untapped potential in rural areas	63

3.5.6	SMMEs' contribution to the economy	64
3.5.6.1	SMMEs' contribution to employment	64
3.5.6.2	SMMEs' contribution to the GDP	67
3.5.6.3	SMMEs' contribution to investment	69
3.5.7	Statistical data on SMME – conclusions and	
	recommendations	70
3.5.7.1	Direction for data collection	71
3.5.7.2	Direction for data presentation	72
3.5.7.3	Direction for data analysis	73
3.6	Conclusion	74
•	r 4: INTERNATIONAL, REGIONAL AND LOCAL IENCES IN SMME DEVELOPMENT	
4.1	SMMEs as major employment creators – evidence from industrialized countries	; 75
4.2	SMMEs as major employment creators – the experience in Africa	76
4.3	Employment creation through SMMEs – South Africa's debate	78
4.3.1	Government's perspective: SMMEs as a vehicle to tackle	
	the problem of unemployment	78
4.3.2	Government initiative: Supply-side policy to promote	
	SMMEs	79

4.4	Conclusion	81
Chapte	r 5: SOUTH AFRICA'S STRATEGY FOR THE	
DEVEL	OPMENT AND PROMOTION OF THE SMME SECT	OR
5.1	The evolution of the SMME policy framework	82
5.2	The development of institutions to facilitate SM	ME
	development	86
5.2.1	Department of Trade and Industry and its related	
	institutions	87
5.2.1.1	Centre for Small Business Promotion	89
5.2.1.2	Ntsika Enterprise Promotion Agency	90
5.2.1.3	Khula Enterprise Finance Limited	92
5.2.1.4	Provincial SMME desks	94
5.3	Conclusion	95
Chapte	r 6: SOUTH AFRICA'S MINING INDUSTRY OVERV	'IEW
6.1	Introduction	96
6.2	Structure of the mining industry	97
6.2.1	The private sector	98
6.2.1.1	Black economic empowerment mining companies	99
6.2.1.2	Chamber of mines	102
6.2.1.3	South African Mining Development Association	103
6.2.2	The government	103

6.3	South Africa's mining industry strengths	105
6.4	Minerals exploration	107
6.5	Communication, infrastructure and labour	108
6.6	The industry's role in national economy	110
6.7	Mineral production and sales in 2004	112
6.8	Mineral beneficiation	114
6.9	South Africa's imports of mineral products	115
6.10	Forecast of minerals exports for 2004 to 2009	116
6.11	Regional co-operation – (SADC)	118
6.12	Conclusion	120
Chaptei	r 7: TYPE OF STUDY	
7.1	Introduction	121
7.2	Qualitative data of the study	121
7.3	Qualitative data analysis of the study	122
7.4	The interactive nature of the study process	124

7.5	Conclusion	124
-	8: PROBLEM STATEMENT, RESEARCH OBJECTIVE OPOSITIONS	ES
8.1	Introduction	125
8.2	Problem statement	126
8.3	Objectives of the study	128
8.4	Research propositions	131
8.4.1	Testing the effectiveness of the institutions created within	
	the framework of the government's National Strategy	132
8.4.2	Testing the effectiveness of the government's National	
	Strategy	134
8.4.3	Testing of other institutions influencing small business	
	development	136
8.4.4	Testing of parastatal organizations and provincial SMME	
	desks	137
8.4.5	Testing of small black economic empowerment mining	
	companies	139
8.5	Conclusion	142
Chapter	9: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	
9.1	Introduction	144

9.2	Research design	146	
9.2.1	Assessment of the institutions created within the framewo	ork	
	of the government's National Strategy	147	
9.2.1.1	Centre for the Small Business Promotion	148	
9.2.1.2	Ntsika Enterprise Promotion Agency	149	
9.2.1.3	Khula Enterprise Finance Limited	150	
9.2.2	Assessment of the effectiveness of the government's		
	National Strategy	152	
9.2.3	Assessment of other institutions influencing small busine	es:	
	development	155	
9.2.4	Assessment of the role of parastatal enterprises and		
	provincial SMME desks	156	
9.2.4.1	Parastatal organizations	156	
9.2.4.2	Provincial SMME desks	157	
9.2.5	Small black economic empowerment mining companies	158	
9.2.5.1	Assessment of small black economic empowerment mining		
	companies	158	
9.3	Scope of the study	160	
9.4	Research methodology of the first phase of the		
	study	163	
9.4.1	Objectives	165	
9.4.2	Population and Sample	168	
9.4.2.1	Centre for Small Business Promotion	168	
9.4.2.2	Ntsika	169	
9.4.2.3	Khula	169	

9.4.2.4	Financial service providers	169
9.4.2.5	Non-financial service providers	170
9.4.2.6	Small, medium and micro enterprises	171
9.4.2.7	Other institutions influencing small business development	171
9.4.2.8	Parastatal organizations	172
9.4.2.9	Provincial SMME desks	172
9.4.3	Information required	172
9.4.4	Sampling	173
9.5	Research methodology of the second phase of	
	the study	174
9.5.1	Objectives	175
9.5.2	Population and sample	175
9.5.3	Information required	175
9.6	Conclusion	176
Chapter	10: RESEARCH RESULTS AND ANALYSIS	
10.1	Introduction	178
10.2	Research frame work	178
10.3	Research findings of the first phase of the study	178
10.3.1	Centre for Small Business Promotion	178
10.3.1.1	Analysis of mission and objectives of the CSBP	178
10.3.1.2	Analysis of the structure and activities of the CSBP	181
10.3.1.3	Analysis of the performance of CSBP activities	182

10.3.1.4	Related observations and findings	184
10.3.1.5	Research proposition with regard to the CSBP	185
10.3.1.6	Study findings with regard to the CSBP	186
10.3.2	Ntsika Enterprise Promotion Agency	187
10.3.2.1	Analysis of Ntsika's objectives and mission	187
10.3.2.2	Analysis of the structure of Ntsika	189
10.3.2.3	Ntsika's success in meeting its programme objectives	191
10.3.2.4	Ntsika's monitoring and evaluation	201
10.3.2.5	Related observation and findings	203
10.3.2.6	Research proposition with regard to Ntsika	207
10.3.2.7	Study findings with regard to Ntsika	207
10.3.3	Khula Enterprise Limited	210
10.3.3.1	Analysis of Khula mission and objectives	211
10.3.3.2	Analysis of Khula's programmes and their performance	214
10.3.3.3	Related observation and findings	220
10.3.3.4	Research proposition with regard to Khula	222
10.3.3.5	Study findings with regard to Khula	223
10.3.4	Analysis of the effectiveness of the National Strategy	225
10.3.4.1	Summary of the findings	226
10.3.4.2	Research propositions with regard to the effectiveness	
	of the government's National Strategy	233
10.3.4.3	Study findings with regard to the effectiveness of the	
	government's National Strategy	234
10.3.5	Analysis of other institutions influencing small business	
	development	237
10.3.5.1	Overall findings	237

10.3.5.2	Awareness of the government's National Strategy and its	
	institutions	243
10.3.5.3	Perceived strengths and weaknesses of the government's	
	National Strategy and its institutions	245
10.3.5.4	Effects of the government's National Strategy on the opera	ations
	of these organizations	250
10.3.5.5	Collaboration with the government's National Strategy's	
	institutions	251
10.3.5.6	Research propositions with regard to other institutions	
	influencing small business development	253
10.3.5.7	Study findings with regard to other institutions influencing	l
	small business development	254
10.3.6	Analysis on the role of parastatal organizations and proving	cial
	SMME desks	255
10.3.6.1	Observation on parastatal enterprises	257
10.3.6.2	Observation on provincial SMME desks	261
10.3.6.3	Research propositions with regard to parastatal enterprise	s
	and provincial SMME desks	264
10.3.6.4	Study findings with regard to parastatal enterprises and	
	provincial SMME desks	264
10.4	Study of the small black economic empowerment	
	mining companies	267
10.4.1	Study findings with regard to small black economic	
	empowerment mining companies	267
10.4.2	Research propositions with regard to small black economic	С
	empowerment companies	270
10.4.3	Testing the propositions of the of the study with regard to	
	small black economic empowerment mining companies	271

10.5	Conclusion	274
Chapter	11: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	
11.1	Introduction	275
11.2	Centre for Small Business Promotion	275
11.2.1	Principal conclusion	275
11.2.2	Principal recommendation	277
11.3	Ntsika Enterprise Promotion Agency	278
11.3.1	Principal conclusion	278
11.3.2	Principal recommendation	279
11.4	Khula Enterprise Finance Limited	282
11.4.1	Principal conclusion	282
11.4.2	Principal recommendation	283
11.5	Effectiveness of the National Strategy	284
11.5.1	Principal conclusion	284
11.5.2	Principal recommendation	284
11.6	Other institutions influencing small business	
	development	286
11.6.1	Principal conclusion	286
11.6.2	Principal recommendation	287
11.7	Parastatal enterprises and provincial SMME desks	289

11.7.1	Principal conclusion on parastatal enterprises	289
11.7.2	Principal conclusion on provincial SMME desks	289
11.7.3	Principal recommendation on parastatal enterprises	290
11.7.4	Principal recommendation on provincial SMME desks	291
11.8	Small Black Economic Empowerment mining	
	companies	293
11.8.1	Principal conclusion	293
11.9	Overview conclusion of the study	296
11.9.1	Introduction	296
11.9.2	SMME policies as part of a wider framework	297
11.9.2.1	Macroeconomic policy and its impact on SMME growth	297
11.9.3	The labour market and SMMEs	299
11.9.3.1	Labour regulation and employment dynamics	299
11.9.3.2	Flexibility of labour	300
11.9.3.3	Future research on labour and SMMEs	300
11.9.4	Capital markets and future intermediation	301
11.9.4.1	Some policy framework guidelines	301
11.9.4.2	Future research needs	302
11.9.5	Trade and market structures	305
11.10	Conclusion	306

FIGURES, TABLES, REFERENCES, APPENDIXES AND ABBREVIATIONS.

		Page
8	LIST OF FIGURES	xvi
9	LIST OF TABLES	xvii
10	REFERENCES	308
11	APPENDIXES	
11.1	Appendix One: Questionnaire	325
11.2	Appendix Two: Ntsika's non-financial service providers interviewed	332
11.3	Appendix Three: Khula's financial service provide interviewed	rs 333
11.4	Appendix Four: SMMEs interviewed	334
11.5	Appendix Five: Provincial and Financial Affairs departments interviewed	336
11.6	Appendix Six: Provincial Public Works department interviewed	ts 337
11.7	Appendix Seven: Parastatal enterprises	338
11.8	Appendix Eight: Provincial SMME desks	339
11.9	Appendix Nine: List of small mining companies	340

11.10	Appendix Ten: Proposed job structure and small business promotion	341
12	GLOSSARY OF ABBREVIATIONS	xix

LIST OF FIGURES

		Page
Figure 5.1:	Institutional framework of the Government's National Strategy for the development and promotion of SMMEs	s 87
Figure 6.1:	Commodities associated with small black economic empowerment mining companies (2003)	s 101
Figure 6.2:	Geographical distribution of small black economic empowerment mining companies (2003)	s 102
Figure 6.3:	South Africa's mining industry: Employment by sector, 2003	nt 111
Figure 6.4:	South Africa's mining industry: Remunerat by sector, 2003	ion 112
Figure 9.1:	Scope of the research process	161
Figure 9.2:	Final research framework followed in the study	163

LIST OF TABLES

		Page
Table 3.1:	Different indicators for the size of the SMM sector	E 50
Table 3.2:	Ntsika statistics on the sectoral distribution South Africa's enterprises	of 53
Table 3.3:	Primary, secondary and tertiary economy depending on enterprise size	54
Table 3.4:	Sectoral distribution of start-ups and new firms compared to the total distribution of South Africa's enterprises	58
Table 3.5:	Registration and de-registrations of CC's a Pty's by sector (1990-2000)	nd 58
Table 3.6:	PDI share according to various studies	60
Table 3.7:	Racial distribution of firm ownership by Sector	61
Table 3.8:	Distribution of SMMEs according to locatio (Ntsika)	n 62
Table 3.9:	Distribution of SMMEs according to locatio (GEM)	n 62
Table 3.10:	Untapped potential of "opportunity entrepreneurship"	63

Table 3.11:	Contribution to employment by firm size – overview	65
Table 3.12:	Contribution to GDP by size – overview	68
Table 3.13:	SMMEs contribution to nominal gross fixed capital formation, 2000	l 70
Table 10.1:	Opinion on government's provision of the necessary support for small business on 1 to 10 point scale	269

GLOSSARY OF ABBREVIATIONS:

ARM: African Rainbow Minerals

BBSEE: Broad Based Socio-Economic Empowerment

BBSEEC: Broad-Based Socio-Economic Empowerment Charter

BDS: Business Development Services

BEE: Black Economic Empowerment

BONI: Business Opportunities National Initiative

BONIs: Business Opportunities National Initiatives

BRAIN: Business Referral and Information Network

CBO: Community Based Organization

CC: Close Corporation

CCs: Close Corporations

CET: Contractor Entrepreneurship Training

CGIC: Credit Guarantee Insurance Corporation

CSBP: Centre for Small Business Promotion

CSDF: Corporate SMME Development Forum

CSIR: Council for Scientific and Industrial Research

DBSA: Development Bank of Southern Africa

DET: Department of Education and Training

DME: Department of Minerals and Energy

DTI: Department of Trade and Industry

EMIA: Export Marketing and Investment Assistance Scheme

EEZ: Emerging Enterprise Zone

FRD: Foundation for Research Development

GA: Get Ahead

GCC: Gold Crisis Committee

GDP: Gross Domestic Products

GEAR: Growth, Employment and Redistribution

HDSA: Historically Disadvantaged South African

HDSAs: Historically Disadvantaged South Africans

IDC: Industrial Development Corporation

IDT: Independent Development Trust

ILO: International Labour Organisation

ISS: Institutional Support Services

JSE: Johannesburg Securities Exchange

LBSC: Local Business Service Center

LBSCs: Local Business Service Centers

MAC: Manufacturing Advisory Centre

MACs: Manufacturing Advisory Centers

MDB: Mineral Development Branch

MED: Management and Entrepreneur Development

MMD: Matrix Marketing Databanks

NAFCOC: National African Federated Chamber of Commerce

NEPA: Ntsika Enterprise Promotion Agency

NGO: Non Governmental Organization

NGOs: Non Governmental Organizations

NMC: New Mining Corporation

NPC: National Population Census

NSBA: National Small Business Act

NSBC: National Small Business Council

NSC: National Steering Committee

OECD: Organization of Economic Co-operation and Development

PDI: Previously Disadvantaged Individual

PDIs: Previously Disadvantaged Individuals

PhD: Philisophiae Doctor (Latin)

PGMs: Platinum-Group Metals

RBSA: Reserve Bank of South Africa

RDP: Reconstruction and Development Programme

RFI: Retail Finance Intermediary

RFIs: Retail Finance Intermediaries

SABS: South African Bureau of Standards

SACOB: South African Chamber of Business

SADC: Southern African Development Community

SAR: South African Receiver of Revenue

SBDC: Small Business Development Corporation

SBEEM: Small Black Economic Empowerment Mining

SME: Small Medium Enterprise

SMEs: Small Medium Enterprises

SMME: Small, Medium and Micro Enterprise

SMMEs: Small, Medium and Micro Enterprises

SSA: Statistics of South Africa

SSP: Skills Support Programme

TAC: Tender Advice Centre

TACs: Tender Advice Centres

TPMAC: Technopreneur Programme and Manufacturing Assistance

Centre

TPMACs: Technopreneur Programme and Manufacturing Assistance

Centres

UIF: Unemployment Insurance Fund

USA: United States of America

VAT: Value Added Tax