Cognitive emotion regulation, proactive coping and resilience in adult survivors of child sexual abuse

by

Beverley Buckley-Willemse

submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

Philosophiae Doctor
(Educational Psychology)
in the
Faculty of Education
at the

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

Promotor

Dr Salome Human-Vogel

South Africa 2011

© University of Pretoria
If you are distressed by anything external, the pain is not due to the thing itself, but to your estimate of it; and this you have the power to revoke at any moment.

Marcus Aurelius (Meditations, 175 A.D.)
This piece of work has opened my eyes, broken my heart and, after a long, emotional journey, it has given me incredible hope. Hope in the strength of women who have been hurt beyond what anyone should ever be expected to endure and yet emerge with a resilience that demands the highest respect. My life has changed because of these eight women’s lives of faith and strength and the millions who have similar stories to tell. Never will I doubt the power of God to make beautiful vessels from shattered pieces of heart and soul.

I would like to dedicate this thesis to the two most honourable men I know – my father and my husband. I thank them for their love, respect and protection and pray that my two sons will follow in their footsteps.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Apart from giving God all the glory for His guidance and steadfastness throughout this long, tough journey, I would like to thank the following people who contributed to the completion of this study:

- Dr Salome Human-Vogel for her very professional assistance throughout. I really appreciated the immediate feedback to any question, no matter how small. Most of all she taught me to question until the answer falls clearly into place, never to be satisfied until it is perfect and, best of all, she shared her exceptional academic knowledge with the confidence that any student can admire. I could not have asked for a better supervisor. Thank you for making a PhD student out of me!

- Bianca, Caron, Christie, Colleen, Jenny, Jolene, Lindi and Shelly! Thank you for taking time to share your pain and your strength so that others might be able to benefit from your sharing.

- The amazing support from my friends and family who are too many to mention, but I would like to mention the following by name because of their daily help, understanding, inspiration and prayers: My amazing Dad and Mom, Bevan, Shaun-Ryan, Thuli, Maria and my sister, Nolene.

- My husband, Ian, for believing in me when I really did not believe it was possible to carry on! Thank you for the many years that you have patiently supported my academic ventures! Without your understanding, none of this would be possible! Thank you for the support I know you will give in the future.
SUMMARY

Researchers have not been able to ascertain how survivors of childhood trauma, especially sexual abuse, develop resilience. To explore resilience and what influences its development, this mixed-method study investigated the roles of cognitive emotion regulation and proactive coping by using a critical-realistic ontology.

The data was collected from eight women (between ages 25 and 56) who considered themselves to be resilient survivors of severe child sexual abuse. Harvey’s (2000) Multidimensional Trauma Recovery and Resiliency Interview (MTRR-I), the Cognitive Emotion Regulation Questionnaire (Garnefski, Kraaij & Spinhoven, 2002) and Greenglass’s (1999) Proactive Coping Inventory were used to gather the data necessary to determine whether resilience is influenced by cognitive emotion regulation strategies and proactive coping and to attempt to define what could be considered as traits of resilience in survivors or child sexual abuse. Through thematic analysis, approximately 50 *a-priori* codes were generated and grouped into 23 themes using the Atlas.ti program.

The objective of this study is to explore the relationship between cognitive emotion regulation, proactive coping and resilience in order to better understand, and develop intervention processes that can provide survivors of child sexual abuse and other trauma with the resources needed to be more resilient. Although causality could not be determined between these variables, it became evident that the more often a participant employs adaptive cognitive emotion regulation strategies and the higher the scores on the Proactive Coping Inventory are, the more resilient the participant tends to be. The participants who displayed higher levels of resilience also verbalised that they felt they had dealt with the abuse and had managed to move on in their lives. Even though all the participants considered themselves to be resilient, half of them were functioning at a noticeably lower rate of resilience than the others. All the participants claimed to rely on spiritual strength in some way and attribute their resilience to their faith in God. The higher the levels of resilience, the more the
participants used adaptive cognitive emotion regulation strategies and proactive coping; and the more optimistic their views of the future and the more they considered their lives to be meaningful. Because the study was based on the ecological model of human development (Bronfenbrenner, 1995, 2005,) the interplay of the proximal environment, the individual, the social context and the changes that have taken place over time, were all taken into consideration because resilience, cognitive emotion regulation and proactive coping skills all develop within and between the same systems in which an individual develops. However, Bronfenbrenner (2005) states that the family is no longer taking the responsibility for the upbringing of children as it should and that other settings in society have had to step in to fulfil the role. One aspect of mental health is the ability to develop spiritually and since schools may not include religious instruction because it is the responsibility of the family, it happens that children are not being developed spiritually and this could influence the way in which individuals deal with traumatic childhood experiences.

resilience
child sexual abuse
cognitive emotion regulation
proactive coping
survivors
ecological model
spiritual strength
CLEARANCE CERTIFICATE

DEGREE AND PROJECT
PhD
Cognitive emotion regulation, proactive coping and resilience in adult survivors of childhood sexual abuse

INVESTIGATOR(S)
Beverley Buckley-Willemsen

DEPARTMENT
Educational Psychology

DATE CONSIDERED
26 August 2011

DECISION OF THE COMMITTEE
APPROVED

Please note:
For Masters applications, ethical clearance is valid for 2 years
For PhD applications, ethical clearance is valid for 3 years.

CHAIRPERSON OF ETHICS COMMITTEE
Prof L Ebersohn

DATE
26 August 2011

CC
Jeannie Beukes
Dr Human-Vogel

This ethical clearance certificate is issued subject to the following conditions:
1. A signed personal declaration of responsibility
2. If the research question changes significantly so as to alter the nature of the study, a new application for ethical clearance must be submitted
3. It remains the students’ responsibility to ensure that all the necessary forms for informed consent are kept for future queries.

Please quote the clearance number in all enquiries.
Cognitive emotion regulation, proactive coping and resilience in adult survivors of child sexual abuse

by

Beverley Buckley-Willemse

submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

Philosophiae Doctor
(Educational Psychology)

in the

Faculty of Education

at the

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

I herewith declare that I language edited the above document.

M.B.BRADLEY
Tel 072 369 5149
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## CHAPTER ONE: Introduction, rationale, research design and chapter planning

1.1 INTRODUCTION ................................................................. 2
1.2 BACKGROUND .............................................................. 3
1.3 ASSUMPTIONS IN THIS STUDY ......................................... 4
1.4 RATIONALE ................................................................. 4
1.5 RESEARCH QUESTIONS .................................................... 5
1.6 CONTESTUALISING THE CORE CONCEPTS ......................... 6
  1.6.1 Child sexual abuse ......................................................... 6
  1.6.2 Resilience ................................................................. 6
  1.6.3 Emotional regulation ..................................................... 7
  1.6.4 Proactive coping .......................................................... 8
1.7 RESEARCH PARADIGM ...................................................... 9
1.8 RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY ......................... 10
  1.8.1 Ethical requirements ....................................................... 10
  1.8.2 Biographical data .......................................................... 12
  1.8.3 Instruments ............................................................... 12
    1.8.3.1 Multidimensional Trauma Recovery and Resiliency Interview ........... 12
    1.8.3.2 Cognitive Emotion Regulation Questionnaire (CERQ) ......................... 13
    1.8.3.3 Greenglass’s Proactive Coping Inventory (PCI) .................... 13
  1.8.4 Sample selection ......................................................... 14
1.9 DATA COLLECTION AND ANALYSIS .................................... 14
  1.9.1 Data collection ............................................................ 14
  1.9.2 Data analysis .............................................................. 15
    1.9.2.1 MTRR-I ............................................................ 15
    1.9.2.2 CERQ analysis ..................................................... 15
    1.9.2.3 PCI analysis ....................................................... 16
1.10 QUALITY CRITERIA .......................................................... 16
  1.10.1 Trustworthiness .......................................................... 17
  1.10.2 Transferability ............................................................ 17
  1.10.3 Credibility ............................................................... 17
1.11 LIMITATIONS ............................................................... 18
CHAPTER TWO: Sexual abuse: Context, definition, characteristics and symptoms

2.1 INTRODUCTION............................................................................................... 20
2.2 SEXUAL ABUSE IN A SOUTH AFRICAN CONTEXT ...................................... 20
2.3 DEFINING SEXUAL ABUSE............................................................................. 22
2.4 CHARACTERISTICS OF CHILD SEXUAL ABUSE........................................... 23
2.5 SYMPTOMS OF CHILD SEXUAL ABUSE IN ADULT SURVIVORS.............. 24
2.6 CONCLUSION .................................................................................................. 25

CHAPTER THREE: Analysing, conceptualising and exploring resilience, proactive coping and cognitive emotion regulation strategies

3.1 INTRODUCTION .............................................................................................. 28
3.2 RESILIENCE RESEARCH ............................................................................... 28
3.2.1 Introduction .............................................................................................. 28
3.2.2 Conceptualising resilience ........................................................................... 29
  3.2.2.1 Overview .............................................................................................. 29
  3.2.2.2 Spaccarelli and Kim’s (1995) Transactional Model ................................ 29
  3.2.2.3 Harvey’s (2007) ecological understanding of resilience in research ...... 30
  3.2.2.4 The domains of resilience of the MTRR-I ............................................. 32
  3.2.2.5 Shen’s (2009) Cumulative Stress Model............................................. 34
  3.2.2.6 Protective outcomes following abuse ............................................... 34
3.2.3 A conceptual framework for resilience......................................................... 35
3.2.4 The importance of research research ............................................................ 38
3.3 PROACTIVE COPING ........................................................................................ 39
3.3.1 Stress and coping research.......................................................................... 39
  3.3.2 Overview .................................................................................................. 40
  3.3.2.2 Utilising and accumulating resources .................................................... 41
  3.3.2.3 Taking responsibility for the future by fulfilling personal goals .......... 42
  3.3.2.4 Factors that threaten proactive coping ................................................. 43
3.3.3 Proactive survivors of child sexual abuse ...................................................... 44
3.4 COGNITIVE EMOTION REGULATION STRATEGIES....................................... 47
3.4.1 Gross’s (2007) process model of emotion regulation................................. 48
  3.4.1.1 Selection and modification of the situation ........................................... 48
3.4.1.2 Attentional deployment........................................................................... 49
3.4.1.3 Cognitive change.................................................................................... 49
3.4.1.4 Response-focused emotion regulation .................................................. 50
3.4.2 Gross’s theory of cognitive change ............................................................ 50
3.4.2.1 Reappraisals ........................................................................................ 50
3.4.2.2 Suppression ........................................................................................ 51
3.4.3 Garnefski’s nine cognitive emotion regulation strategies .............................. 51
3.4.3.1 Introduction ........................................................................................ 51
3.4.3.2 Cognitive emotion regulation strategies .................................................. 51
3.5 CONCLUSION ............................................................................................. 53

CHAPTER FOUR: Research methodology

4.1 INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................... 55
4.2 RESEARCH PARADIGM: CRITICAL REALISM .......................................... 55
4.3 MIXED-METHOD APPROACH ..................................................................... 56
4.4 DATA COLLECTION STRATEGIES .............................................................. 57
4.4.1 Ethical considerations .............................................................................. 57
  4.4.1.1 Introduction ....................................................................................... 57
  4.4.1.2 Voluntary participation ...................................................................... 58
  4.4.1.3 Informed consent ............................................................................. 58
  4.4.1.4 Anonymity, confidentiality and privacy ................................................. 59
  4.4.1.5 Safety in participation ................................................................. 59
4.4.2 Participants ............................................................................................. 60
  4.4.2.1 Sample selection ............................................................................. 60
  4.4.2.2 Sample recruitment ......................................................................... 61
  4.4.2.3 Sample structure ............................................................................. 61
4.4.3 Instruments ............................................................................................. 61
  4.4.3.1 Semi-structured interview (MTRR-I)..................................................... 61
  4.4.3.2 The Cognitive Emotion Regulation Questionnaire.............................. 64
  4.4.3.3 The Proactive Coping Inventory ........................................................ 66
4.4.4 Data collection process .......................................................................... 67
4.4.5 Data analysis .......................................................................................... 68
  4.4.5.1 Semi-structured interview (MTRR-I)..................................................... 68
  4.4.5.2 The Cognitive Emotion Regulation Questionnaire.............................. 68
  4.4.5.3 The Proactive Coping Inventory ........................................................ 68
4.5 SUMMARY ........................................................................................................ 69

CHAPTER FIVE: Participants’ stories

5.1 INTRODUCTION .............................................................................................. 71
5.2 BIANCA ............................................................................................................ 71
5.3 CARON ............................................................................................................ 78
5.4 CHRISTIE ...................................................................................................... 84
5.5 COLLEEN ..................................................................................................... 88
5.6 JENNY .......................................................................................................... 91
5.7 JOLENE ........................................................................................................ 94
5.8 LINDI .......................................................................................................... 98
5.9 SHELLY ...................................................................................................... 105
5.10 SUMMARY .................................................................................................. 108

CHAPTER SIX: Data Analysis

6.1 DATA ANALYSIS PROCESS ......................................................................... 113
6.1.1 The thematic analysis .............................................................................. 113
6.2 RESILIENCE IN SURVIVORS OF CHILD SEXUAL ABUSE ......................... 114
6.2.1 Background: Process-Person-Context-Time model ................................... 114
6.2.2 Discussion of domains of the MTRR-I ....................................................... 119
   6.2.2.1 Domain I of MTRR-I: Authority over memory ..................................... 119
   6.2.2.2 Domain II of MTRR-I: The integration of memory and affect ............ 121
   6.2.2.3 Domain III of MTRR-I: Affect tolerance and regulation ....................... 122
   6.2.2.4 Domain IV of MTRR-I: Symptom mastery and positive coping .......... 124
   6.2.2.5 Domain V of MTRR-I: Self-esteem ...................................................... 125
   6.2.2.6 Domain VI of MTRR-I: Self-cohesion ................................................ 129
   6.2.2.7 Domain VII of MTRR-I: Safe attachment .......................................... 130
   6.2.2.8 Domain VIII of MTRR-I: Meaning making ........................................ 133
6.2.3 Summary .................................................................................................. 134
6.3 COGNITIVE EMOTION REGULATION STRATEGIES (CERQ) ................. 136
6.3.1 Data analysis ............................................................................................ 136
6.3.2 Cognitive emotion regulation strategies as observed in the interview data ... 138
   6.3.2.1 Acceptance ....................................................................................... 138
   6.3.2.2 Other-blame ................................................................................... 141
6.3.2.3 Positive reappraisal ................................................................. 143
6.3.2.4 Positive refocusing ................................................................. 144
6.3.2.5 Putting into perspective ......................................................... 146
6.3.2.6 Refocus on planning .............................................................. 148
6.3.2.7 Self-blame ............................................................................ 149
6.3.2.8 Rumination ............................................................................ 150
6.3.2.9 Catastrophising ................................................................. 154
6.3.3 Conclusions ........................................................................ 157
6.4 PROACTIVE COPING ................................................................. 157
6.4.1 Data analysis ........................................................................ 157
6.4.2 Discussion of elements of proactive coping ....................... 158
6.4.2.1 Background ...................................................................... 158
6.4.2.2 Resources ........................................................................ 159
6.4.2.3 Taking responsibility for the future by fulfilling personal goals 163
6.4.3 Conclusions ........................................................................ 168
6.6 SUMMARY ................................................................................ 168

CHAPTER 7: Discussion of results, recommendations and limitations

7.1 INTRODUCTION ........................................................................ 171
7.2 OVERVIEW ............................................................................ 171
7.3 DISCUSSION OF THE FINDINGS IN TERMS OF THE RESEARCH QUESTIONS ........................................................................ 174
7.3.1 What cognitive emotion regulation strategies do resilient survivors of child sexual abuse employ? ................................................................. 174
7.3.2 How does proactive coping influence the cognitive emotion regulation strategies used by survivors of child sexual abuse? .................................................... 177
7.3.3 What constitutes resilience in adult survivors of child sexual abuse? ............... 180
  7.3.3.1 Interpreting resilience through the Process-Person-Context-Time model .................................................................................................................. 180
  7.3.3.2 Interpreting resilience at the hand of the MTRR-I ...................... 183
7.3.4 New considerations in the light of these data .................................................... 185
  7.3.4.1 Resilience from a psychopathological perspective ...................... 185
  7.3.4.2 A family resilience framework ........................................... 186
7.3.5 What is the relationship between cognitive emotion regulation, proactive coping and resilience in adult survivors of child sexual abuse? ........................................ 187

7.4 CONTRIBUTIONS OF THE STUDY .................................................................................. 188

7.4.1 Consistency with other studies ..................................................................................... 188

7.4.2 Contributions to existing knowledge ............................................................................. 188

7.5 RECOMMENDATIONS ..................................................................................................... 190

7.5.1 Recommendations for research .................................................................................. 190

7.5.2 Recommendations for practice .................................................................................... 192

7.6 LIMITATIONS .................................................................................................................. 192

7.7 RESEARCHER’S REFLECTION ....................................................................................... 193

BIBLIOGRAPHY
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 3.1 Conceptual framework ........................................................................................................... 37
Figure 3.2 A process model of emotional regulation ..................................................................................... 48
Figure 6.1 Graphical representation of the Process-Person-Context factors of Bronfenbrenner’s PPCT model (1998) .................................................................................. 118
Figure 6.2 Relationship between spectrum of emotion, spiritual strength and dealing with abuse ................................................................................................................................. 123
Figure 6.3 Relationship between low self-esteem, self-cohesion and participants who have dealt with their abuse .................................................................................................................. 126
Figure 6.4 Comparing the elements of symptom mastery and safe attachment ........................................... 133
Figure 6.5 Patterns of total scores for all participants of the different cognitive emotion regulation strategies on CERQ ........................................................................................................ 137
Figure 6.6 Comparison of the CERQ scores, especially acceptance ............................................................. 139
Figure 6.7 CERQ scores comparing other-blame to self-blame ...................................................................... 142
Figure 6.8 CERQ scores comparing rumination and positive refocusing ....................................................... 145
Figure 6.9 Comparison of the CERQ scores for the different adaptive strategies, especially putting into perspective and refocus on planning ........................................................................ 147
Figure 6.10 CERQ scores comparing adaptive strategies to self-blame ......................................................... 151
Figure 6.11 CERQ scores comparing adaptive cognitive emotion regulation strategies to self-blame and rumination ........................................................................................................ 153
Figure 6.12 CERQ scores comparing adaptive cognitive emotion regulation strategies to self-blame, rumination and catastrophising ................................................................. 156
Figure 6.13 Proactive Coping Inventory scores ................................................................................................ 158
Figure 6.14 Comparison of the different proactive coping tenets ..................................................................... 165
Figure 7.1 Adaptive and less adaptive cognitive emotion regulation strategies according to Category 1 and 2 .......................................................................................................................... 177
Figure 7.2 Summary of levels of resilience and number of times participant indicated dealing with abuse .............................................................................................................................. 184
LIST OF TABLES

Table 4.1  Participant profiles.................................................................................... 62
Table 5.1  Traumatic life events of participants....................................................... 110
Table 6.1  The interaction of the proximal environment (process) ......................... 115
Table 6.2  The characteristics of the individual (person)........................................ 116
Table 6.3  The social context of the individual (context) ............................................. 117
Table 6.4  Elements of symptom mastery and positive coping ............................... 124
Table 6.5  Elements of safe attachment – Domain VII of MTRR-I .......................... 131
Table 6.6  Elements of meaning making (MTRR-I) in context of CERQ and PCI .. 134
Table 6.7  Summary of participants’ levels of resilience based on data from MTRR-I ......................................................................... 135
Table 6.8  Cognitive emotion regulation strategies (scores) ................................... 137
Table 6.9  The PCI scores....................................................................................... 157
Table 6.10  A summary of whether the participant is accumulating available resources .......................................................... 159
Table 6.11  Summary of participants’ taking responsibility for the future by fulfilling personal goals ................................................................. 164
Table 7.1  Severity of child sexual abuse among participants ............................... 178

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A:  Colour-coded thematic analyses ....................................................... 207
APPENDIX B:  The flyer.......................................................................................... 213
APPENDIX C:  Informed consent forms.................................................................. 214
APPENDIX D:  The Cognitive Emotion Regulation Questionnaire....................... 219
APPENDIX E:  The Proactive Coping Inventory ..................................................... 221
APPENDIX F:  The Multidimensional Trauma Recovery and Resiliency Interview (MTRR-I) .............................................................. 222
APPENDIX G:  MP3 disc of audio interviews............................................................ 230
APPENDIX H:  Data disc with transcribed interviews............................................. 231