

Integration and learners' feelings of belonging in a desegregated former House of Delegates school

by

Ramodungoane James Tabane

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree

PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR

in

EDUCATIONAL PSYCHOLOGY

Department of Educational Psychology

Faculty of Education

University of Pretoria

South Africa

Promoter: Dr. Salomé Human-Vogel

Co-promoter: Professor Mokubung Nkomo

SEPTEMBER 2009



UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

Rutang bana ditaola le se ye natšo badimong

Sepedi idiom

(Own translation: "Educate the children so that your wisdom does not die with you")



SERETO

Ke rena batho ba Tabane a botlotlo ngwana wa modisa wa dira tša makgowa

Ke ba bo nenge nenge a sebata,
Ke batho ba ba boago booka,
Ke booka bja tlopo, bja o ka medupi e a na

Ke batho ba khenesa bosahlane, thwadi a mosadi a di botša, tša mme a thota

Re boa sešhonkwane sa tlou kgatla, se re se mpona, sa inama inama

Ke ba mmakheepe kha ho rema,
Ke bonakga go ya go boya ya ba motshotsho,
Nke ke mongwe a bona magaladigaladi,
Ke ba bo mmantabole a Phaleng

Re boa tswetla ga Ramapulana
Re bina tlou selema
Re di mbezi raboyane

Booka wee!!!

Ke! Tabane a bodiša bo tholo, mmutla ke mošimanyane
Ke! Tlou sešhonkwaneng sa kgatla khunwane sa re sempona sa inama inama
E re ke mohwe a bona mohwehadi

Ba re ke bo mantabole a Phaleng
Re boa tswetla ga Ramapulana
Re bina tlou selema

Ke! Setlogolo as ditlogolo tša mokaba mmaleihlo lerotolwa ke lengwe
Tau etswa seokodibeng sa mmamerithi mebedi



Ke! Tšhukudu mpe ya bo ramaite, Tšhukudu mpe etswa lehloding
Go tšwa ka madi a se gotšwa
Ke! ba go tseba go gošoga thebele, go roka ba sa gotsebe
Bakone Wee!

Ke! Setlogo sa mantšha o tlogele phatla e šhale le beng
Ke morwa mologadi, mologa ditshetlo, le maano oa loga
A tšea pheta a e romela leboa

Ke pšhantla phiri seteatea le noka ya kwenane.
Ke Ramodungoane wa matladi papago makgeledisa.

Tlou!



DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated to my beloved wife, Nokulunga Tabane, and to motivate our three sons, Lulamile, Otshegofaditse (Nogakgolo ya magoge, mmapa le kokotla, makgolo wa dinoga ka moka, Moloto. Malesela) and Pheny (Pshantla phiri seteatea le noka ya kwenane, Ramodungoane a matladi papago makgeledisa, Matlhako); my mother Mahlogobaba Rahab Tabane; my grand mother Mantsha Mapula Viginia Tabane and to the entire Tabane family and relatives – all of whom stood by me to finally see a **Philosophiae Doctor** in the family.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

To my heavenly father, God of whom through his strength and wisdom I learned to accept that I am what I am because of his grace (2 Cor. 10:15).

I am unable to mention the names of all those who contributed to the successful completion of this thesis, but I would like to thank all of them for sharing their experiences, assisting me in shaping this thesis and supporting me during tough times.

My thanks go to:

- Dr. Salome Human-Vogel for her expert supervision and much needed support. “Modimo a go atšetše”.
- Professor Mokubung Nkomo for your excellent support and guidance throughout this research. “Rena re leboga, ge modimo a refile lena”
- The National Research Foundation (NRF) for the much needed financial support
- Personnel of the University of Pretoria’s library (Groenkloof Campus) for providing me with the space and resources to do my work.
- Professor Venitha Pillay. Ke le boga kudu.
- The Gauteng Department of Education and the school concerned for granting me permission to conduct research in the schools.

My gratitude goes to my pillars in life:

- Koko wa ka, Mantsha; Mma wa ka Mahlogobaba; my two sisters Mmalesolo and Dinonyane for your undoubtful support through out my studies.
- Carol and Dr. Trevor Coombe for all their ever reliable support.

Mošomo wo, ke wa go hlohleletsa my nephews, Mpho Ramodungoane Theko; Tshwanelo Phaleng Bangwa; Nompumelelo Bangwa le lena bo Rehauhetswe, Shibe, Mahlogonolo, Raisibe, Dimpho, Koketso, Shalate, Rhulani, Lola, McDonald, Reabetswe, Mojalefa, Kalewa, Kegoratile, Mothlapa and Amogelang, to you all I would like to say:

“Kodumela moepathutse ga go lehumo le letšwang kgauswi”

Go dikgopolo tše botse ka Bro. Johnny Ngobeni, “Dankie Baas” and Koko Raisibe Olivia Ngoasheng.



DECLARATION OF ORIGINALITY

I Ramodungoane James Tabane, declare that this thesis, **Integration and learners' feelings of belonging in a desegregated former House of Delegates school**, is my own work and that all sources used or quoted have been acknowledged and have been indicated by references.

Mr. R. J Tabane

Date

SUMMARY

The first South African democratic general election of 1994 precipitated the eradication of South Africa's separate and unequal education system. The presidential tenure of Nelson Rolihlahla Mandela brought much hope that the majority of South Africans would not have thought possible. The new era carried, among other promises, the transformation of South African policies, to ensure that all South African children would have access to a school of their choice and that no child would be turned away from school on grounds of race, ethnicity, class and/ or religion. School desegregation has been one of the means of attaining social cohesion and ensuring that all learners have access to all South African schools.

School desegregation can be said to have been taking place on at least five (5) or more (taking also to consideration that there are typologies of ethnic and/ or religion desegregations taking place) different levels or typologies. These typologies are equally important as the African-to-White school migrations that have been taking place in South Africa.

Thus, using a case study, this thesis- **Integration and learners' feelings of belonging in a desegregated former House of Delegates school**- contributes to the debates on social cohesion; desegregation and integration of the learning environment bestowed with diverse learner and teacher populations. It however traces the experiences of Black and Indian learners in a desegregated former House of Delegates school to determine the successes and possible challenges of ensuring social cohesion and racial integration at a school level. The study concludes that social cohesion and school integration is possible when the focus is learner-centered, the school environment is enabling and that feelings of belonging and integration are intertwined and it is challenging to achieve one without the other.

Undertaken at a specific school context, this study does not claim that the findings are a trend in other schools although this cannot be ruled out in similar school and context. Learners in this study seemed not to be constrained by the racial classifications but defined and formed friendships along their likes, commonness, and future aspirations.

Key words: belonging, social cohesion, integration, desegregation, race, learners, House of Delegates, diversity, assimilation, Interactive Qualitative Analysis

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

1.1	Introduction	1
1.2	School desegregation in South Africa	2
1.3	Social cohesion	3
1.4	Rationale and problem formulation	6
1.5	Aim of the study	9
1.6	Research question	11
1.7	Research Design	11
1.7.1	Case Study	11
1.7.2	Research Site	12
1.7.3	Participants	13
1.7.4	Data collection and analysis	13
1.8	Limitations	15
1.9	Central concepts in the study	17
1.9.1	Social cohesion	17
1.9.2	Integration	17
1.9.3	Belonging	18
1.9.4	Racial descriptions as used in this study	19
1.10	Chapter planning	19



CHAPTER TWO

RACIAL INTEGRATION AND SENSE OF BELONGING

2.1	Introduction	20
2.2	Racial integration in South African schools	21
2.2.1	Historical-political context	21
2.2.2	Desegregation of education- a brief overview	22
2.2.3	Desegregation integration and social cohesion	23
2.2.4	Integration and inclusion	26
2.3	Social cohesion	28
2.3.1	Introduction	28
2.3.2	Identity, belonging and mental health	29
2.3.2.1	Social constructions of race	29
2.3.2.2	Racial identity, belonging and mental health	32
2.3.3	Approaches to the study of social cohesion	36
2.3.3.1	Individual indicators of social cohesion	38
2.3.3.2	Group indicators of social cohesion	41
2.3.3.2.1	Group Membership	41
2.3.3.2.2	Community belonging	42
2.3.3.2.3	Feeling at home in the community	45
2.4	Conclusion	48



CHAPTER THREE

INTERACTIVE QUALITATIVE ANALYSIS

RESEARCH DESIGN

3.1	Introduction	50
3.2	Interactive Qualitative Analysis (IQA)	50
3.2.1	IQA as a hybrid qualitative research design	50
3.2.2	Philosophical assumptions	51
3.2.2.1	The ontological perspective in IQA	51
3.2.2.2	The epistemological perspective in IQA	52
3.3	IQA Research design	54
3.3.1	Research site and context	54
3.3.2	Participants	55
3.3.3	Data Collection	56
3.3.3.1	Phase One: Focus group	56
	a. Issue Statement	57
	b. Theoretical coding: democratic protocol	60
	c. Affinity relationship table (ART)	61
	(i) Pareto and conflict analysis	62
	d. Interrelationship diagram (IRD)	67
	e. System influence diagram (SID)	70
	(i) Rationalisation process	72
3.3.3.3.	Phase Two: In-depth interviews	78



3.4	Rigour	80
3.5	Ethical consideration	81
3.6	Summary	82

CHAPTER FOUR

PHASE TWO DATA ANALYSIS, RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

4. 1	Introduction	83
4.2	Phase Two Overview	84
4.3	Discussion	86
4.3.1	Primary Driver: School as a welcoming space (SWP)	86
4.3.2	Primary Driver: Belonging (Bel)	95
4.3.3	Secondary Driver: Respect (Res)	101
4.3.4	Secondary Driver: Security (Sec)	107
4.3.5	Secondary Outcome: Equality in the way we relate and/ or socialise (EqS)	113
4.3.6	Secondary Outcome: Tender, love and care (TLC)	119
4.3.7	Secondary Outcome: Motivation (Mot)	124
4.3.8	Primary Driver: Freedom (Fre)	134
4.4	Summary	139



CHAPTER FIVE

DISCUSSION OF RESULTS, IMPLICATIONS, CONTRIBUTION OF STUDY AND LIMITATIONS

5.1	Introduction	140
5.2	Discussion of results	141
5.2.1	Aim of study	141
5.2.2	Research question	141
5.2.3	Summary of main findings	142
5.3	Contribution of study and implication of findings	144
5.4	Limitations	152
5.4.1	Introduction	152
5.4.2	Research Design	152
5.4.3	Methodology	155
5.5	Recommendations for further study	156



LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1: Affinities	60
Table 3.2: Pareto Analysis	63
Table 3.3: Conflicting relationships	65
Table 3.4: Interrelationship Diagram	68
Table 3.5: Interrelationship with affinities descending order of delta	70
Table 3.6: Rationalisation process	75
Table 3.7: Checking or re-arranging SIDs	109

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 3.1: Complex SID	71
Figure 3.2: Uncluttered SID	74
Figure 3.3: Uncluttered SID	75
Figure 3.4: Uncluttered SID with added and removed links	76
Figure 3.5: Clean SID	76
Figure 4.1: Clean SID	84
Figure 5.1: Visual presentation	143