A MANAGERIAL FRAMEWORK FOR THE ENABLEMENT OF THE PERFORMANCE OF VIRTUAL KNOWLEDGE WORKERS

by

KAREN LUYT

Submitted in partial fulfilment for the degree

PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR
(Organisational Behaviour)

in the

FACULTY OF ECONOMIC AND MANAGEMENT SCIENCES

at the

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

Supervisor: Prof K.J. Stanz
Co-Supervisor: Prof S.M. Nkomo

PRETORIA AUGUST 2012

© University of Pretoria
ABSTRACT

A MANAGERIAL FRAMEWORK FOR THE ENABLEMENT OF THE PERFORMANCE OF VIRTUAL KNOWLEDGE WORKERS

by

KAREN LUYT

SUPERVISOR: Prof K.J. Stanz
CO-SUPERVISOR: Prof S.M. Nkomo
DEPARTMENT: Department of Human Resource Management
DEGREE: PhD (Organisational Behaviour)

With the increasing use of mobile technologies in modern organisations, managers are facing the dilemma of having to manage the performance of individuals who are removed from their direct sphere of control, while using performance management principles that have not necessarily been adapted to accommodate this. The study investigated, analysed and described the management and measurement of the performance of these virtual knowledge workers from the perspective of the manager, with the aim of proposing a new conceptual framework to assist managers in this task. In addition, the study identified the organisational context and individual contribution required to support such a framework.

The study used a constructivist grounded theory framework, with the aim of building theory through an inductive approach rather than testing existing theory. An embedded, multiple-case study research design was used to execute the study, comprising five companies in the Information and Communications Technology and related sectors in South Africa. Quantitative and qualitative data were collected at the organisational, team and individual levels. In total, 39 interviews were qualitatively...
analysed using content analysis aided by ATLAS.ti. The 163 questionnaires were quantitatively analysed using descriptive statistical methods. Thereafter, within-case and cross-case analyses were performed to extract themes and to propose a conceptual framework for the enablement of the performance of virtual knowledge workers.

The research uncovered four key findings. The first finding was that the concept of "virtual" in the term virtual worker is often misunderstood, and that the definition should be applied on a continuum of virtuality, leading to the concept of perceived and true virtuality. The second finding was that true virtuality influences how performance is perceived, and how deliverables and metrics contribute to perceived, actual and true performance. The third finding was that parameters affecting virtual performance include organisational, contextual, and customer factors, as well as the managerial approach itself. The manager needs to become the mediator for these parameters, thereby fulfilling the role of enabler of virtual performance. The fourth finding was that the visual or face-to-face element still remains important when managing the performance of virtual knowledge workers.

The study makes a significant contribution on a theoretical level by extending existing theoretical models regarding virtual distance and the management of dispersed teams into a much more comprehensive model. This concentric performance enablement model for virtual knowledge workers shows how the manager acts as enabler for the true performance of the virtual knowledge workers. On a methodological level, the research demonstrates how an embedded, multiple-case study, executed on three levels of analysis, and based on a grounded theory approach, can be executed to develop theoretical insights into the complex phenomenon of enabling the performance of virtual knowledge workers; and lastly the study has also made a contribution on the level of practice, by giving managers a conceptual framework and practical recommendations on how to manage and enable the performance of virtual knowledge workers.

**KEYWORDS:** Virtual worker; Knowledge worker; Performance management, Management Framework; E-leadership; Virtual Performance (Perceived and true performance); Degrees of virtuality (True virtuality); Sociomateriality.
I, Karen Luyt, declare that “A Managerial Framework for the Enablement of the Performance of Virtual Knowledge Workers” is my own unaided work both in content and execution. All the resources I used for this study are cited and referred to in the list of references by means of a comprehensive referencing system. Apart from the normal guidance from my study leaders, I have received no assistance, except as stated in the acknowledgements.

I declare that the content of this thesis has never before been used for any other qualification at any tertiary institute.

_________________________________
Karen Luyt
2012-08-31
# CONTACT DETAILS

## Student information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student Name</th>
<th>Mrs Karen Luyt</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Student Number</td>
<td>86423623</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Email Address</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Kluyt01@gmail.com">Kluyt01@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contact Number</td>
<td>+27 82 895 2289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Degree</td>
<td>PhD (Organisational Behaviour)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Supervisor Information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Home department</th>
<th>Human Resource Management</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Supervisor</td>
<td>Prof K. J. Stanz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervisor’s e-mail address</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Karel.Stanz@up.ac.za">Karel.Stanz@up.ac.za</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervisor’s contact number</td>
<td>+27 12 420 3074</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co-Supervisor</td>
<td>Prof S.M. Nkomo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co-supervisor’s e-mail address</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Stella.Nkomo@up.ac.za">Stella.Nkomo@up.ac.za</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co-supervisor's contact number</td>
<td>+27 12 420 4664</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DEDICATION

To my husband Rick, who has supported me all the way a thousand times over!
I would like to acknowledge the following individuals and organisations that have made this research possible:

- I would like to sincerely thank my two supervisors, Prof Karel Stanz and Prof Stella Nkomo, for being the guiding lights in this research maze: Karel, as supervisor and study lead, setting the overall strategy, providing additional research links, and being available at home, over Skype and on email. Stella, as co-supervisor, helping me keep the focus on the research objectives, and constantly reminding me to “follow the process”. Also for the detailed feedback on in-progress chapters and unscheduled calls when confirmation was needed.

- My husband, Rick. Without your support this journey would definitely not have been possible.

- To the companies who so graciously allowed me to take a look into their day-to-day workings, I hope that this work also gives something back that they will be able to re-integrate into their organisational context.

- To everybody who has participated in this study – especially the managers and company representatives who provided time for the interviews, as well as those individuals that answered my (not so short) questionnaires – Thank you for your time and your invaluable comments. This framework is by you, for you.

- To my editor, Marion, thanks for uplifting my work, for all the encouragement during the process and for last-minute edits when delivery of documents stretched the agreed timelines.

- Thanks also to Anette Krabbendam and Lezanne Janse van Rensburg who assisted with the transcriptions – it really saved me a lot of time.

- To my family and friends – thanks for your patience and support over the last two-and-a-half years.

- Thank you also to my employer who gave me the financial support, and my managers who really supported me during these years, allowing me the flexible hours required to complete the study.

- There have been so many others who have enabled me to complete this work by giving me support in some small or large way – thank you!
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

1  STUDY BACKGROUND ..............................................................................................................1

1.1  INTRODUCTION ..................................................................................................................1

1.1  BACKGROUND AND RESEARCH MOTIVATION .................................................................2

1.2  PROBLEM STATEMENT .......................................................................................................6

1.3  PURPOSE STATEMENT .......................................................................................................6

1.4  RESEARCH OBJECTIVES ...................................................................................................6

1.5  CONTRIBUTIONS OF THE RESEARCH .............................................................................7

1.6  RESEARCH SCOPE AND APPROACH ...............................................................................8

1.7  ASSUMPTIONS ...................................................................................................................9

1.8  DEFINITION OF KEY TERMS ...........................................................................................10

1.9  THESIS STRUCTURE ..........................................................................................................14

1.10  SUMMARY ......................................................................................................................17

2  RESEARCH APPROACH AND DESIGN .................................................................................18

2.1  INTRODUCTION ................................................................................................................18

2.2  RESEARCH PARADIGM AND PHILOSOPHY ...................................................................20

2.3  INQUIRY STRATEGY AND BROAD RESEARCH DESIGN ...............................................23

2.3.1  The Research Type .......................................................................................................23

2.3.2  Strategy of Inquiry .......................................................................................................25

2.3.3  Research Approach ......................................................................................................29

2.4  DESIGN: RESEARCH METHODS .......................................................................................30

2.4.1  Research Setting and Selection of Cases ......................................................................30

2.4.2  Entrée and Establishing Researcher Roles ..................................................................32

2.4.3  Elements of the Embedded, Multiple-Case Study Design ........................................32

2.4.4  Textual and Qualitative Data Analysis .......................................................................37

2.4.5  Numerical and Quantitative Data Analysis ................................................................40

2.5  ASSESSING THE RIGOUR OF THE RESEARCH DESIGN ...............................................41

2.5.1  Trustworthiness in Qualitative Research ......................................................................41

2.5.2  Sources of Bias .............................................................................................................43

2.6  RESEARCH ETHICS ............................................................................................................45

2.7  SUMMARY ..........................................................................................................................48

3  INITIAL LITERATURE REVIEW ............................................................................................51

3.1  INTRODUCTION ................................................................................................................51

3.2  CONCEPTS OF PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT ............................................................52

3.2.1  Traditional Approaches and Historic Overview ............................................................52
5.3.1 Virtual Status in Companies ............................................................ 124
5.3.2 Virtual Work Reasons and Advantages ........................................ 127
5.3.3 Virtual Work Arrangements ......................................................... 131
5.3.4 Virtual Work Limitations and Challenges .................................... 134
5.4 MANAGING VIRTUAL PERFORMANCE (RO1) ............................ 136
5.4.1 Managing Performance ................................................................. 136
5.4.2 Managing Non-Performance ......................................................... 168
5.4.3 Main Challenges ........................................................................ 173
5.4.4 Technology and Systems ............................................................. 176
5.5 PARAMETERS AFFECTING PERFORMANCE (RO2A+B+C) .......... 179
5.5.1 Organisational and Contextual Parameters (RO2a) .................... 179
5.5.2 Managerial Parameters (RO2b) .................................................. 187
5.5.3 Individual Parameters (RO2c) ..................................................... 204
5.6 SUMMARY ..................................................................................... 212
5.6.1 Virtual Work (Context) ................................................................. 213
5.6.2 Managing the Performance of Virtual Knowledge Workers (RO1) 214
5.6.3 Parameters Affecting Performance and Outputs (RO2) ............... 217
5.6.4 Themes Identified ........................................................................ 222
6 DATA INTERPRETATION ................................................................. 224
6.1 INTRODUCTION ............................................................................. 224
6.2 THEME 1: UNDERSTANDING “VIRTUAL” IN VIRTUAL WORK ....... 225
6.2.1 Theme Introduction .................................................................... 225
6.2.2 Virtual Work Perceptions ............................................................ 226
6.2.3 Additional Definitions of Virtuality .............................................. 229
6.2.4 Consolidation of Theme 1 Concepts: Virtuality ......................... 236
6.3 THEME 2: PERCEIVED, ACTUAL AND TRUE PERFORMANCE .... 237
6.3.1 Theme Introduction .................................................................... 237
6.3.2 Managing Performance ............................................................... 238
6.3.3 Performance Management ......................................................... 244
6.3.4 Trust and Perceived Performance .............................................. 250
6.3.5 Consolidation of Theme 2 Concepts: Managing Performance ...... 252
6.4 THEME 3: PARAMETERS AFFECTING PERFORMANCE ............. 254
6.4.1 Theme Introduction .................................................................... 254
6.4.2 Organisational Impact ................................................................. 255
6.4.3 Contextual Parameters ................................................................. 257
6.4.4 Customer Impact ....................................................................... 259
6.4.5 Individual’s Contribution ............................................................. 261
6.4.6 Manager as Enabler ................................................................. 264
6.4.7 Consolidation of Theme 3 Concepts: Parameters impacting ....... 279
6.5 THEME 4: FACE TO FACE INTERACTION – IMPORTANCE OF THE VISUAL .................................................................................. 280
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1-1: Model for actions of individual and manager showing technology impact .......................................................... 5
Figure 1-2: Case study process ............................................................................................................................... 15
Figure 1-3: Detail chapter map .............................................................................................................................. 17
Figure 2-1: Research design elements ................................................................................................................ 19
Figure 2-2: Research paradigms for analysis of social theories ........................................................................ 22
Figure 2-3: Case study components .................................................................................................................... 27
Figure 2-4: Case study process ............................................................................................................................ 28
Figure 2-5: Embedded units of analysis in a single case study ............................................................................. 34
Figure 2-6: Interrelationship of units of data collection ...................................................................................... 34
Figure 2-7: Grounded theory roadmap ................................................................................................................. 39
Figure 2-8: Research design elements: summary .................................................................................................. 49
Figure 3-1: The context of performance appraisals ............................................................................................. 53
Figure 3-2: Basic conceptual framework .............................................................................................................. 68
Figure 3-3: Questionnaire and semi-structured interview components ............................................................ 69
Figure 3-4: Semi-structured interview components .......................................................................................... 73
Figure 4-1: Response rates for teams in Alpha ..................................................................................................... 79
Figure 4-2: Response rate per company ............................................................................................................ 80
Figure 4-3: Data collection sequence ................................................................................................................ 82
Figure 4-4: Levels of analysis ............................................................................................................................. 88
Figure 4-5: Cross-case analysis .......................................................................................................................... 90
Figure 4-6: Example: Code network ................................................................................................................... 94
Figure 4-7: Example graphs on case level (L3/L5) .............................................................................................. 102
Figure 4-8: Example clustered column chart .................................................................................................... 102
Figure 4-9: Virtual status perception graph example .......................................................................................... 105
Figure 5-1: Companies, teams and study size .................................................................................................... 113
Figure 5-2: Individuals’ perceptions on “Work from Home” policy ................................................................. 116
Figure 5-3: Individuals’ perceptions on “Flexible Hours” policy ....................................................................... 116
Figure 5-4: Are HR procedures to evaluate performance fair? ......................................................................... 119
Figure 5-5: Technology for virtual workers (Case comparison) ..................................................................... 119
Figure 5-6: Organisational technologies supportive of virtual work? ............................................................... 120
Figure 5-7: Training received for use of IT technologies? ................................................................................. 121
Figure 5-8: Organisational positioning: Policies, actual way of work and size .............................................. 124
Figure 5-9: Virtual status perception ................................................................................................................ 125
Figure 5-10: Virtual status calculation .............................................................................................................. 125
Figure 6-15: Impact Parameter Model: Manager’s Approach ...................... 278
Figure 6-16: Impact Parameter Model: Consolidated. ............................... 280
Figure 6-17: Repeat of Figure 1-1 ............................................................... 289
Figure 6-18: Concentric performance enablement model for virtual knowledge workers ................................................................. 290
Figure 13-1: Letter for organisational approval (template – page 1) ........ 379
Figure 13-2: Letter for organisational approval (template – page 2) ....... 380
Figure 13-3: Online folder structure per company .................................. 383
Figure 13-4: Research information ............................................................. 384
Figure 13-5: Letter for manager page 1 and 2 (example) ......................... 385
Figure 13-6: Manager informed consent form (example) ......................... 387
Figure 13-7: HR interview schedule ......................................................... 388
Figure 13-8: IT interview schedule ........................................................... 388
Figure 13-9: Manager interview schedule ............................................... 389
Figure 13-10: Example page of the interview guide ................................. 389
Figure 14-1: Code network: “Virtual work: Arrangements” .................... 400
Figure 14-2: Code network: “Limitations and Challenges” - Impossible .. 400
Figure 14-3: Code network: “Limitations and Challenges” – Possible ... 401
Figure 14-4: Code Network: “Manage performance” – Detail .................. 402
Figure 14-5: Code network: “Manage performance: Metrics” ................. 403
Figure 14-6: Code network: “Specific deliverables” (Timing) ................. 404
Figure 14-7: Code network: “Specific deliverables” (Location) ............... 405
Figure 14-8: Code network: “Specific Deliverables: Knowledge Work” ...... 406
Figure 14-9: Code network: “IT Technology: Systems” .......................... 407
Figure 14-10: Code network: Manager: General remote work” ............. 408
Figure 14-11: Code network: “Manager: Responsibilities” ..................... 409
Figure 15-1: Actual vs. perceived virtuality – theory map (“True Virtuality”) ..... 411
Figure 15-2: Actual vs. perceived performance model (“True Performance”) .... 412
Figure 15-3: Impact Parameter Model: Consolidated ............................... 413
Figure 15-4: Concentric performance enablement model for virtual knowledge workers ................................................................. 414
**LIST OF TABLES**

Table 1-1: Research objectives and sub-objectives .................................................... 7
Table 2-1: Research philosophy summary ................................................................. 21
Table 2-2: Research type options and selections summary ........................................ 23
Table 2-3: Case study definition and application to study ......................................... 26
Table 2-4: Summary of sampling, data collection and data analysis ....................... 35
Table 2-5: Trustworthiness (rigour) in research design .......................................... 43
Table 2-6: Additional ethical elements for primary data ........................................... 46
Table 3-1: External effects of the performance objectives ....................................... 63
Table 3-2: Nonstandard versus standard workers ................................................... 64
Table 3-3: Questions with specific literature references ......................................... 69
Table 4-1: Levels of analysis per case .................................................................. 88
Table 4-2: Execution of grounded theory principles .............................................. 94
Table 4-3: Example: Code list: Limitations and challenges ..................................... 95
Table 4-4: Word count extract example .................................................................. 98
Table 4-5: Quote count extract example for “Virtual work reason” ..................... 98
Table 4-6: Question category coding ..................................................................... 100
Table 4-7: Calculated columns ............................................................................. 100
Table 4-8: Question to graph abbreviation mapping (MP3) .................................... 103
Table 4-9: Question to graph abbreviation mapping (MP4) .................................... 103
Table 4-11: Response counts for virtual status perception .................................. 104
Table 5-1: Company summary and comparison ..................................................... 122
Table 5-2: Code list: “Virtual work: Reason” and “Virtual work: Advantage” ........ 128
Table 5-3: Code list: “Virtual work: Limitations and Challenges” ....................... 135
Table 5-4: Code List: “Performance: Manage: Initiate” ...................................... 139
Table 5-5: Code List: “Performance: Manage: Plan” .......................................... 140
Table 5-6: Code List: “Performance: Manage: Execute” .................................... 140
Table 5-7: Code List: “Performance: Manage: Monitor” ..................................... 142
Table 5-8: Code List: “Performance: Manage: Control” ..................................... 144
Table 5-9: Code List: “Performance: Manage: Interval” ..................................... 144
Table 5-10: Code List: “Specific Deliverables” (Location and Timing) .............. 149
Table 5-11: Code list: “Specific Deliverable: Knowledge Work” ......................... 152
Table 5-12: Code List: “Performance: Metrics” .................................................. 153
Table 5-13: Co-occurrence of “Specific deliverable” and “Metric” ..................... 155
Table 5-14: Co-occurrence: “Knowledge Work” and “Performance: Metrics” .... 156