OPTIONS FOR URBAN SERVICE DELIVERY IN SOUTH AFRICA WITH SPECIAL REFERENCE TO THE TSHWANE METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITY

By

Pfungwa Michelle Nyamukachi

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

Magister Administrationis (Public Management)

In the Faculty of Economic and Management Sciences

University of Pretoria

Supervisor: Professor Dr. N. L. Roux

October 2004
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This dissertation is a result of a four-year long process. Along the way there have been moments of loneliness, doubt and fatigue. But also a great many moments of sheer pleasure, of learning and discovery. Many thanks to the inspiration so generously given from people I met in person as well as in print. That inspiration made me soldier on and now I have a deeper love and vision for the field of public administration and management. I would like to especially thank God for making it all possible and being the invisible hand and shield that keeps me together, protected and on track. I would like to give special thanks to the following people;

- **Professor J. O. Kuye** head of the School of Public Management and Administration for his support, expertise and inspiration,
- **Professor N. L. Roux** my supervisor for his enduring support, expertise, wise guidance and patience throughout this study,
- **Professor J. Mafunisa and Professor C. Thornhill** for their expertise and support.

Special thanks to my family, Mr and Mrs Nyamukachi, Jestine Nyamukachi, Tekweni Nyamukachi, Melody Nyamukachi, Simbarashe Nyamukachi, Sandra Nyamukachi and Chaipe Fred Nyamukachi who are my pillars of strength and source of joy, for their love, prayers as well my friends for their support and encouragement.
SUMMARY

The primary goal of all research is to discover knowledge. The objectives of this research were; firstly, to investigate and describe the previous (that is pre-1994) and the current (post 1994) status of local government. Secondly, to identify and describe problems with service delivery at local sphere with particular reference to the Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality (the unit of analysis for the research). Thirdly, to investigate and explore the various delivery options that can be used as tools to improve the delivery process by exploring. Fourthly, the extent to which they are used presently at the Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality and in the future. Finally, to provide guidelines and recommendations for implementation as a hypothetical model for use by The Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality and other municipalities in their efforts to improve/enhance service delivery.

The year 1994 ushered in a new era for South Africa. It saw South Africa become a democratic country after decades of apartheid rule. Apartheid as a government system was discriminatory in nature on racial lines since 1948. The results of which are still felt and can be seen today. The apartheid system was such that government spending was directed towards the development of White people and White areas. The Black people were neglected with little or no spending on basic services such as health, housing, education, roads and infrastructure, water and electricity. In some respects the current government inherited a first world infrastructure, however it is still faced with third world issues and imperatives namely social development, service delivery, unemployment and poverty. The problem of service delivery backlogs is not one unique to South Africa but a problem faced by many African and developing nations. Creating the good life for its citizens will remain the challenge for the South African government on all its spheres, but even more so for the local sphere since municipalities (that make up this sphere) are the government closest to the people and interact more closely with communities through the delivery of the various services as required by the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996 (Act 108 of 1996). Municipalities, through
their administration, policies and actions play a critical role in reshaping communities.

Given the immense needs for service delivery particularly in previously neglected areas of the Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality area, the research question asked was;

*To what extent can alternative delivery options be used to solve service delivery backlogs and problems in the local sphere of government in South Africa with particular reference to the Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality?*

In the endeavour to answer the research question, a description of the current nature or status of local government in South Africa was given. An explanation was also given of the concept of alternative service delivery and the various alternative service delivery options that are available for application by municipalities such as the Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality to enhance service delivery. It is a decade since South Africa became a democratic state and despite promises and efforts to improve service delivery to the public there still exist backlogs in service delivery.

The research concluded that reform is obligatory to revitalise municipalities and enhance service delivery, thus ensuring access to services becomes a reality for all. It appears that based on this research, traditional institutional mechanisms and arrangements, and conventional management approaches have proved to be ineffective and inefficient to meet current realities of service delivery. Municipalities should remain true to the principle of a learning institution, continuously seeking to improve its performance by experimenting with new processes, approaches and ways of achieving its goals or by benchmarking. There is therefore, a need for innovative solutions, strategies *and* new ways of structuring institutions and delivering services. This implies a change in processes, a change in people and a change in culture. All municipalities including the Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality need to
constantly review and restructure their institutions in search for more effective ways of achieving goals and meeting service delivery needs of the communities they serve. However, a thorough institutional analysis of the status quo needs to be undertaken or else the restructuring endeavour is baseless and such an endeavour runs the risk of failure. Any restructuring endeavour is time consuming and complicated as all stakeholders have to be consulted and many circumstantial issues have to be considered. This study provides a recommended hypothetical model for reform that could be applied by municipalities wishing to reform for the purpose of enhancing service delivery. The model, though simplistic could serve as a basic guide that municipalities and municipal departments can use should they wish to undergo changes in order to improve service delivery.
# List of Contents

## Chapter 1: General introduction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1 General introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Frame of Reference</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Problem Statement</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 The research question</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 Objectives of the research</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6 Statement of hypothesis</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7 Significance of research</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8 Methodology</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9 Limitations of research</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10 Definition of terms</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10.1 Local government</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10.2 Municipal council</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10.3 Local government management</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10.4 Alternative service delivery</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10.5 Partnerships</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10.6 Privatisation</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10.7 Corporatisation</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10.8 Electronic service delivery</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10.9 Private sector vs. public sector</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10.10 Change and change management</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10.11 Reengineering</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10.12 Restructuring</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10.13 Internet and the World Wide Web</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10.14 E-commerce or e-business</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10.15 Electronic democracy</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.11 Structure of Research: Chapter Summaries</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 2: Local government in South Africa

2.1 Introduction
2.2 Description of local government in South Africa
2.2.1 Characteristics of municipalities
2.3 Historical context of local government in South Africa
   2.3.1 Local government transformation
   2.3.1.a Local government negotiating forum
   2.3.1.b Local Government Transition Act (Act 209 of 1993)
Local government in South Africa after 1994
2.4.1 Status of municipalities
2.4.2 Powers and functions of municipalities
2.4.3 Values and principles applicable to local government
2.4.4 Normative guidelines of public administration
2.4.4.a Batho pele principles
2.4.5 Categories of municipalities
   2.4.5.a Metropolitan municipalities
   2.4.5.b Roles and responsibilities of a metropolitan council
2.5 The general environmental framework for local government service delivery
   2.5.1 The macro-environment
   2.5.1.a The political environment
   2.5.1.b The economic environment
   2.5.1.c The social and cultural environment
   2.5.1.d The technological environment
   2.5.1.e The statutory legislative environment
2.6 The objectives of municipalities
2.6.1 Municipalities and service provision
2.8 Conclusion

Chapter 3: Alternative service delivery options

3.1 Introduction
3.2 What is alternative service delivery
3.3 Rationale for Alternative service delivery: Pressures of Change 47
3.4 The legislative framework for alternative service delivery for South African municipalities 49
3.4.1 The Municipal Infrastructure Investment Unit (MIIU) 51
3.5 Alternative Service Delivery Options and Innovations 51
3.5.1 Partnerships as alternative service options 52
  3.5.1.a The rationale for partnerships 54
3.5.2 Outsourcing or Contracting out 55
  3.5.2.a Service contracts 57
  3.5.2.b Management contracts 58
  3.5.2.c Criticism and obstacles to effective contracting 62
  3.5.2.d Leasing and franchising arrangements 63
  3.5.2.e Partnerships with non-governmental organisations 66
  3.5.2.f Public partnerships - shared delivery 67
3.5.3 Concerns regarding private public partnerships 68
3.6 Conclusion 69

Chapter 4: Alternative service delivery options: Corporatisation, privatisation and electronic service delivery

4.1 Introduction 70
4.2 Corporatisation as an alternative service delivery option 70
4.2.1 Rationale for creating separate entities 72
  4.2.1.a Agencies 72
  4.2.1.b Utilities 73
4.3 The Canadian Experience: Special Operating Agencies (SOAs) 74
  4.3.1 Description of Special Operating Agencies 74
  4.3.2 Underlying rationale for special operating agencies (SOAs) 75
  4.3.3 Departments best suited for the SOA model 75
  4.3.4 Framework document 76
4.3.5 Evaluation of the efficacy of creating separate entities 76
4.4 Privatisation as an alternative service delivery option 78
4.4.1 Divestiture or service shedding 79
4.4.2 Objectives of privatisation 81
4.4.3 Arguments in favour of privatisation and benefits of privatisation 83
  4.4.3.a Efficiency 83
  4.4.3.b Benefits of privatisation 83
4.4.4 Arguments against privatisation 84
  4.4.4.a Displacement of public employees: job losses 85
  4.4.4.b Fear of price increases 85
  4.4.4.c Exclusion 86
  4.4.4.d The efficiency of the private sector 86
4.4.5 Theoretical and practical underpinnings of privatisation as
development strategy in less developed countries 86
4.4.6 Determining the feasibility of privatisation 87
4.5 E-Government/ Electronic Service Delivery as an
alternative service delivery option 88
  4.5.1 Reasons for electronic service delivery 89
    4.5.1.a Developments in information and communication technology 90
    4.5.1.b Citizen expectations 90
    4.5.1.c Service enhancement 90
    4.5.1.d Cutting costs and improving efficiency 92
  4.5.2 Stages of electronic government 92
  4.5.3 Infrastructure requirements for electronic government 94
  4.5.4 Barriers to the implementation of electronic government 95
4.5 Conclusion 96

Chapter 5: Alternative service delivery options for the Tshwane Metropolitan Council and the need for organisational change

  5.1 Introduction 97
  5.2 The Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality: A brief description 97
  5.2.1 Strategic focus areas of the Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality 100
  5.2.2 Services provided by the Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality 101
  5.2.3 The Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality’s system of government 105
  5.3 The Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality and Service Delivery Problems 107
    5.3.1 Key Problems: Pressures for reform 107
5.3.1. a Service backlogs 108
5.3.1. b Finance 108
5.3.1. c Institutional arrangements and bureaucracy 109
5.3.1. d Other 111
5.3.2 Extent of application of alternative service delivery options 111
5.3.2. a Partnerships 111
5.3.2. b Corporatisation 112
5.3.3. c Privatisation 112
5.3.2. d Electronic service delivery 113
5.3.3 Views on alternative service delivery options by Tshwane Metropolitan Council’s senior personnel 113
5.3.3. a Restructuring grant 114
5.4 Need for municipal change and development 116
5.5 Conclusion 119

Chapter 6: A hypothetical model for municipal reengineering and reform for improved service delivery

6.1 Introduction 120
6.2 The innovation imperative and municipal reengineering 120
6.2.1 Reengineering, restructuring, change and change management 121
6.2.2 Resistance to change 122
6.2.3 Communication and reengineering 124
6.2.4 Strategic management, integrated development plans and reengineering 125
6.2.5 Integrated Development Plans: core components 127
6.2.6 Leadership and reengineering 129
6.3 Recommended tools for decision making 130
6.3.1 Tool 1: Alternative service delivery framework test questions 130
6.3.2 Tool 2: Ring fencing 131
6.3.3 Tool 3: The public sector comparator 136
6.3.3. a Purpose and benefits of the public sector comparator 136
6.3.3.b Components of a public sector comparator 138
6.4 Introducing municipal reforms for improved service delivery 142
6.5 Conclusion 150

Chapter 7 Conclusion and Recommendations 152

Bibliography 159
Tables and Figures

Table 2.1 Distribution of services in urban and rural areas in 1996 41
Table 2.2 Estimated cost of meeting service backlogs 1998-2007 42
Table 3.1 Key technical factors in outsourcing decisions 60
Table 3.2 Real applications of partnerships in South Africa 65
Table 4.1 Methods of selling off public assets 80
Table 4.2 Action plan or guideline for privatisation and commercialisation 82
Table 4.3 Benefits of electronic service delivery to the public and to government 91
Table 4.4 Stages of electronic government 92
Table 6.1 Recommended approaches and methods of dealing with resistance to change 123
Table 6.2 Alternative service delivery framework test questions 130
Table 6.3 Ring fencing focus areas 134
Figure 5.1 Organogram/Institutional Structure of the Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality 99
Figure 5.2 Approval/resolution process 110
Figure 6.1 The ring fencing process 133
Figure 6.2 The public sector comparator process 137
Figure 6.3 Steps in Valuing risk 139
Figure 6.4 Steps in Valuing transferable risk 140
Figure 6.5 Introducing municipal reforms for improved service delivery 142
Annexures

**Annexure A:** Sample of interview questions 169

**Annexure B:** Examples of possible risks and descriptions of each 182

**Annexure C:** Tables of direct consequences of risks and an illustration of risk matrix 183

**Annexure D:** Example of valuing transferable risk 185

**Annexure E:** Example of valuing retained risk 187