CHAPTER 7 – THE CASE OF CSA AND SOCIAL JUSTICE

In spite of recent advances in treatment and care available in most developed countries, the HIV/AIDS pandemic continues to spread throughout the developing world. Structural inequalities continue to fuel the epidemic in all societies, and HIV infections have increasingly been concentrated in the poorest, most marginalised sectors of society in all countries. The relationship between HIV/AIDS and social and economic development has therefore become a central point in policy discussion about the most effective response to the pandemic (Parker, 2002).

7.1 Introduction

The previous chapter dealt with how the IGWS addresses gender as a social justice imperative. This chapter focuses on the way in which CSA addresses HIV/AIDS as a social justice concern. This will be carried out by discussing the HIV/AIDS pandemic, followed by the South African response in dealing with it: that represented by CSA in particular. This section provides a brief background to global and local concerns on the HIV/AIDS epidemic and locates the role and goals of the Centre for the Study of AIDS – CSA – at the University of Pretoria within that debate. This is achieved by furnishing a broad overview of the pandemic and of how the global powers and the South African government have responded to it at a macro level. At the micro level, this chapter considers the strategic response of the Ministry of Education to the pandemic as well as that of the higher education sector. Finally it looks at the role and goals of the CSA and considers how they fulfil both the global and national mandates to alleviate the high prevalence of the HIV and HIV/AIDS pandemic in the country. The rationale is to critique the position of CSA and arrive at an appreciation of its position on HIV/AIDS as a social justice concern.

7.2 Overview of HIV/AIDS

The HIV and AIDS epidemic started in the mid ’80s with a few reported cases across the world and since then, hardly 20 years later, it has developed into a global crisis. It has been described as the most devastating pandemic in the history of modern civilisation. Its spread across the globe has been rapid and its impact profound. According to the Joint United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS — UNAIDS, close to 40 million people in the world were living with HIV/AIDS in 2005 and over 20 million
have died. The largest proportions of those infected reside in sub-Saharan Africa, and the highest prevalence in this region is found in South Africa (United Nations, 2006; Saint, 2004; Otaala, 2004).

Originally, the pandemic was regarded as a health issue only. However, it is increasingly recognised as having much wider and broader implications for all levels of society. In some 20 years, the view of the pandemic has shifted from being a simple medical matter to a complex socio-economic problem on a global scale. The economic consequences are dramatic since the portion of the population that is of a productive age is most severely affected by the epidemic. In effect, currently, the pandemic attacks each component of the Human Development Index. It reduces life expectancy, lowers educational attainment, and reduces income per capita. It undermines the very concept of human development (African Development Forum, 2000:2).

In order to appreciate its global impact, it can be described as a humanitarian crisis undermining the realisation of all the millennium development goals. Hence, the United Nations describes it as a global emergency. In the same light as the UN analysis, several analyses of the HIV/AIDS pandemic in its 25 years of existence around the globe regard it as a global threat. It undermines socio-economic freedom, particularly since the large majority of people infected and affected by it are found in the South – the poorest regions of the world, already fraught with serious socio-economic and political problems of underdevelopment (Parker, 2002:343, Barnett, nd.:30). It undermines democracy and human rights because groups that are already vulnerable to human rights violations – such as women, children, sex workers, and those living in poverty – are unable to realise their rights (CSA, 2004:1). It undermines gender equality: research indicates that the prevalence of HIV/AIDS is higher among women, “… because women’s vulnerability to HIV/AIDS is rooted in inequality in sexual, social and economic terms. It is at the intersection of power, gender, inequality, poverty and destructive social norms that HIV hits hardest. Furthermore, it has a negative impact on educational development because the highest prevalence of HIV is found among the youth that are still educationally active in tertiary education” (Otaala, 2005; Saint, 2004). The above analysis of HIV/AIDS reflects some of the elements of the strand of analysis which focuses on political economy. This view situates HIV/AIDS within
broad socioeconomic issues and links its spread, impact and governance to globalisation because it explains globalisation and its diverse meanings (Altman, 1999:560).

In keeping with the critical tradition that informs this study, HIV/AIDS can also be regarded as a global emergency that prevents people from experiencing social justice. It can be inferred that it exacerbates the five faces of oppression which people experience because of its magnitude and some forms of the exclusion and stigmatisation it perpetuates (Young, 2000:35). People living with HIV/AIDS and those affected by it experience marginalisation, which is defined as the exclusion of a whole category of people from useful participation in social life. HIV/AIDS renders societies powerless against it. This situation could describe the experiences of the majority of women in sub-Saharan Africa (Young, 2000:36). The status of powerlessness could also describe the position of the global community vis-à-vis the pandemic because to date a cure for the disease has not yet been discovered. Recognising its global impact and working to transform this impact is an important part of social justice. In this regard, it is useful to employ Young’s social connection model for responsibility and global justice, in which she contends that “… all agents who contribute by their actions to the structural processes that produce injustices have responsibilities to work to remedy these injustices” (Young 2004:42). HIV / AIDS has reached a stage where it is a global responsibility, and the global community therefore urgently needs to find ways to correct the injustices caused by it. It is no longer the responsibility of nation states alone but, rather, that of the global community.

The above analysis using Young’s five faces of oppression also displays certain similarities with the politico-economic approach to HIV/AIDS. This approach explains the shape of the pandemic in terms of broad historical processes in the economy and society that have contributed to a range of structural inequalities such as race, class, ethnicity and gender, which in turn have conditioned the vulnerability of different individuals and groups to HIV/ AIDS infections.

Most of these factors can be grouped into three analytically distinct, but interconnected categories; (i) economic (under) development and poverty; (ii) mobility, including migration, seasonal work, and social disruptions due to war and political instability; and (iii) gender inequality. This research reveals that despite the uniqueness of each local
HIV/AIDS epidemic, the same general structural processes are at work in Africa, Asia, Latin America and the Caribbean (Parker, et al., 2000:S23).

With the dawn of the new millennium, the impact of HIV had reached such catastrophic proportions that the international community responded by establishing UNAIDS in 2001 as an international body to provide appropriate world policy guidelines to halt and reverse the spread of HIV and AIDS as one of the Millennium Development Goals. The UNAIDS acknowledges HIV as a

... Global emergency and one of the most formidable challenges to human life and dignity and is committed to strengthening support to nationally owned and led responses. UNAIDS has five focus areas including: leadership and advocacy, strategic information and technical support, tracking monitoring and evaluation, civil society engagement and mobilization of resources (http://www.unaids.org).

As a global emergency, the HIV/AIDS pandemic has been associated with the broader impact of globalisation, both negative and positive. While the field of political economy informed the conceptualisation of the pandemic, it also highlights that a feminist conception of equality is also relevant. From the feminist perspective, HIV/AIDS is regarded in the following manner:

AIDS is a socially constructed disease and much of the response and attitudes towards HIV-infected individuals centre around the pre-existing concepts, paradigms and societal construction of those affected. Social construction theory is concerned with the way in which societies interpret, judge and ascribe meaning to groups, conditions, and events (Berger and Luckman 1996), interpretations that may or may not reflect reality (Gilbert and Wright, 2003:1).

In order to realise a more holistic view, the analysis of the political economy also needs to be combined with the feminist position with regards to HIV/AIDS as a socially constructed disease or pandemic. The merits of this perspective lie in privileging the voices of groups that are most affected, in the process making a valuable contribution to research that is often overlooked.
7.3 The South African State’s HIV/AIDS Agenda

National governments have also conceptualised the pandemic in similar terms to those of the global community and have also aligned their existing HIV and AIDS strategies with the world agenda, establishing appropriate policies and research bodies informed by the global mandate of alleviating it. In South Africa, HIV/AIDS strategies have been in place since 1994. In 1992, the National AIDS Coordinating Committee of South Africa (NACOSA) was formed; in 1994 it prepared the South Africa AIDS Strategy and Implementation Plan which was designed to prevent the spread of HIV and AIDS, to reduce its impact and to harness existing potential resources for this purpose (Coombe, 2000:19). The main goal was to address the HIV/AIDS issue by means of a multidisciplinary, multi-sectoral and holistic mainstreaming approach. Through it, the following broad structures were established:

- The Inter-Ministerial Committee on HIV/AIDS (IMC);
- The Inter-Departmental Committee on HIV/AIDS (IDC);
- The South African National AIDS Council (SANAC);
- The National AIDS Coordinating Committee of South Africa (NACOSA), now an independent NGO focusing on lobbying for advocacy at national level; and
- Education, health and welfare programmes in general
- (Coombe, 2000: 24-25).

Thus at formulation level, relevant policies were set up together with appropriate structures and processes to support their implementation and evaluation. However, despite the commitment of the government to address the HIV/AIDS pandemic, researchers show that the scale and magnitude of its efforts have not been sufficient to deflect it. South Africa is still the HIV/AIDS epicentre in the 2000s.
Table 7.1 – The Consequences of the Pandemic: Projections to 2010

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1999</th>
<th>2005</th>
<th>2010</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of SA workforce HIV positive</td>
<td>11.5%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>22.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of SA workforce with AIDS</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
<td>1.65%</td>
<td>2.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New AIDS cases per annum</td>
<td>145,256</td>
<td>466,365</td>
<td>625,180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of AIDS orphans</td>
<td>153,000</td>
<td>1,000,000</td>
<td>2,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Life expectancy of SA females (years)</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Life expectancy of SA males (years)</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Data regarding AIDS prevalence levels in sub-Saharan Africa represent a cause for alarm and purposeful action. The figures present a picture that is so powerful and unarguable that the only way to change the situation is to engage in purposeful action which will result in further changes. However, the statistics regarding the impact of HIV/AIDS mask more than they reveal because they do not indicate the intricacies of where the problem lies.

The 2000 AIDS review suggests that the implementation of the 1994 plan has been impeded principally by problems with regards to the mismatch between policy and implementation. These were identified as being insufficient political commitment and capacity on the part of the government at all levels, provincial and local, as well as misinformation and inability on the part of leadership to grapple with the complex dynamics of the HIV/AIDS pandemic (Coombe, 2000:25-27).

The above problems indicate that in the South African context, during the 1990s, the government was ill-informed concerning the urgency of the situation, leading to non-implementation. The ensuing difficulties indicate that there was a need for a renewed strategy in this regard, together with a global approach and a recognition of the national emergency, such as that by UNAIDS. As a result, from 2000 onwards there was a more concerted effort by the government to reinforce existing strategies and approaches, with
the main goal of promoting an HIV/AIDS-free society in line with the UN and the millennium development goal of eradicating it by 2015. The renewed political will in response to combating HIV/AIDS is evident in the increase in the National Health budget. According to Ndlovu, “the total HIV and AIDS subprogrammes budget of the strategic health programme (which includes the comprehensive HIV and AIDS grants for provinces and specific allocation for the national department) has increased nominally from R1.6 billion in 2005/6 to R2 billion in 2006/7” (Ndlovu, 2006:1).

Other government departments echoed this national goal in their quest to promote an HIV/AIDS free society. In South Africa, the department of education (DoE)’s current strategy, *Tirisano* (working together), is a commitment to the reconstruction and development of HIV/AIDS prevention and intervention measures in all phases of the system, and at every level working together with all the stakeholders across all sections of the society (Coombe, 2002:31).

Table 7.2 – The *Tirisano* (Working Together) Programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project</th>
<th>Strategic objective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Awareness, information and advocacy.</td>
<td>To raise awareness and the level of knowledge of HIV/AIDS among all educators, learners, to promote values, which inculcate respect for girls and women and recognise their right to free choice in sexual relations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIV/AIDS within the education curriculum.</td>
<td>To ensure that life skills and HIV/AIDS education are integrated into the curriculum at all levels.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIV/AIDS and the education system.</td>
<td>To develop planning models for analysing and understanding the impact of HIV/AIDS on the education and training system.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Coombe, 2000:31-33).

The above table indicates the government’s concerted effort to re-educate the public regarding HIV/AIDS. Since it concentrates on the education arena, it has the potential of reversing the negative impact of HIV/AIDS by reversing the high mortality rates of the youth in terms of the re-organisation of the curriculum and the planning of the education system with the view of addressing the demonisation of HIV/AIDS.
7.4 The South African Higher Education HIV/AIDS Agenda

The higher education sector also embraced the *Tirisano* strategy. It made its contribution explicit in its broad and multifaceted conceptualisation of the pandemic, couched in the language of multi-sectoral collaboration and cooperation against it. This is evidenced in the 2000 South African Universities Vice Chancellors Association (SAUVCA) report, which indicated that HIV/AIDS is of particular relevance to higher education because:

- it is a developmental issue, not just a health issue;
- it affects not only individuals, but also organisations and systems;
- it affects human resource development;
- preventing the spread of HIV/AIDS and managing its impact requires knowledge; and
- successful institutions and societal responses to HIV/AIDS require leadership (Chetty, 2000:112-13).

The follow-up to this document was a consultative national conference on HIV/AIDS and the related field of education. At this conference the higher education sector made the following declaration:

As the higher education community, we recognize the seriousness of the threat posed by HIV and AIDS to our community and to the education sector. We fully support the ministry’s initiative in calling this conference and commit ourselves to supporting the coalitions against HIV and AIDS through

- Education
- Research
- Community outreach
Management of HIV/AIDS

Advocacy and Stimulation of Critical Debate and

Inter and intra-sectoral collaboration (Tirisano, 2002:49-50).

Concurrently, as the conference was taking place, the higher education sector was involved in the initiative of implementing the first nationally coordinated Higher Education HIV/AIDS Programme (HEAIDS). It was launched in November 2001 by the dominant higher education stakeholders: SAUVCA, CTP and the Department of Education. The programme was sponsored by the British Department of International Development (DfID) and the Canadian Development Cooperation (CDC) (HEAIDS, 2004:215).

The goal of the HEAIDS Programme is to mobilise the higher education sector to respond sensitively, appropriately, and effectively to the HIV/AIDS epidemic through HE’s core functions of teaching, research, management, and community service, through the continuum of HIV/AIDS interventions – namely prevention, treatment, and care and support (HEAIDS, 2004:214).

This signifies that higher education institutions would be regarded as having responded adequately to the HIV/AIDS pandemic if, after being assessed, they displayed the majority of the results below:

Table 7.3 – Goals and Results of the Higher Education HIV/AIDS Programme.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Results and objectives</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Effective policy, leadership, advocacy and management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effective prevention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effective care and support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching appropriate to HIV/AIDS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate research and knowledge creation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community outreach</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The HEAIDS agenda to employ education to combat the HIV/AIDS pandemic is in harmony with the discourse of researchers from around the globe that recognises and endorses the important role which education plays in addressing the resulting problems. Coombe and Kelly (2001) make a case for education as a vaccine for HIV/AIDS. “In the absence of a physiological vaccine against HIV infection, society has at its disposal a ‘social vaccine’: the vaccine of education”. They argue that education:

- enhances the potential to make discerning use of information;
- enhances the potential to plan for the future; and
- accelerates favourable socio-cultural changes (Coombe & Kelly, 2001:9-12).

South African higher education scholars argue that “the triad mission of higher education can be used to effectively combat the HIV and AIDS through the incorporation and integration of AIDS issues in all teaching, research and community service activities” (Mapesela, 2003:109). Crew (1999) avers that the universities need to adopt an activist role in the face of the crisis. The CSA position is that universities should not work in isolation but with the Southern African Development Community (SADC) and with the world community, united collaboratively and coherently, in order to halt the said global emergency (Crew, 1999:8). In 2000, the institutional profile of the University of Pretoria with reference to its response to HIV/AIDS was as follows:

Table 7.4 – HIV/AIDS and Institutional Profile of the University of Pretoria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Programmes</td>
<td>The Centre for the Study of AIDS (CSA), first of its kind to be established in South Africa with areas of focus listed in table 11.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Services</td>
<td>Campus health and 24 hour counselling service.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum</td>
<td>Various partnerships with certain departments established aimed at curriculum development — mainstreaming HIV/AIDS.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partnership</td>
<td>Universities in the SADC region, local institutions, international universities such as the Universities of Toronto, South Wales and Yale.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outreach</td>
<td>Telematic education programme that carries HIV/AIDS programmes.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Since the current study is informed by the critical theory approach that perceives hope and the possible in the impossible, I concur with the position that aspires to imminent victory over the HIV/AIDS pandemic and CSA’s attitude of adopting an activist stance.

Table 7.5 – Framework for a comprehensive Pretoria University response to HIV/AIDS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Pretoria University status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University Mission</td>
<td>Be responsive to the real needs of society through vision and in the knowledge domain.</td>
<td>Innovation Generation document.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overarching Principle</td>
<td>Personally committed university leadership bringing about total management commitment, showing itself in policy development and commitment of resources.</td>
<td>Management team financially and structurally supports most of the HIV/AIDS mainstreaming activities of the CSA.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Strategies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inward-looking</td>
<td>Protects its own functions as an AIDS-affected institution. Links prevention to care. Tackle management-related factors.</td>
<td>Activities and services of the CSA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Adapted from Kelly, 2001:52-54.
The global community should experience the rage caused by the injustices of HIV/AIDS because people are socio-economically marginalised while women and children experience the worst effects of the pandemic.

In 2001, Kelly developed a synthesis report for the Association for the Development of Education in Africa (ADEA) which contains a conceptual framework for a comprehensive response to HIV/AIDS in a university in Africa. One South African study praises this framework as being relevant in assisting universities to address the issue of HIV/AIDS in a holistic and strategically comprehensive manner (Van der Merwe & Gouws, 2005:57). This framework will be used to evaluate how the University of Pretoria has performed in its response to the HIV/AIDS pandemic.

It can be inferred from the table above that the University of Pretoria is creating an appropriate response to the pandemic that reflects the national and global mandate of an HIV/AIDS free society by 2015. The mission and the areas of focus of the CSA are illustrative in this regard.

The CSA is an institutional project that focuses on implementing the University of Pretoria’s HIV/AIDS policy. From the outset, the CSA was established to inform the university community about the HIV/AIDS dynamics as they unfolded. The staff of the CSA consists of researchers, academics and activists who demonstrate much commitment to the HIV/AIDS research field in general and, in particular, the implementation of legal policy pronouncements and current HIV/AIDS research findings. The project staff accomplish this in a paradoxical context, a local (institutional) and national (countrywide) environment fraught with both rejection and acceptance of the HIV/AIDS phenomenon. This peculiar state of affairs is closely linked to the infringement of the social justice mandate entrusted to institutions of higher education in the country. There is a need to study the campus response to the national mandate of social justice with regard to HIV/AIDS in order to inform future policy developments; and furthermore, to gain a clearer and better understanding of how the university responds to the mandate though its treatment of the pandemic.

The CSA’s mission and strategic objectives are,
...to mainstream HIV/AIDS through all aspects of the university’s core business activity. The mission is to understand the complexities of the HIV/AIDS epidemic in South Africa and to develop effective ways of ensuring that all the students and staff of the university are prepared professionally and personally to deal with HIV/AIDS as it unfolds in the South African society (CSA, 2004:1).

The strategic objectives of the CSA, when translated into areas of focus, include activities that target the university community as a whole in ensuring that there is current information on the pandemic. These areas are not merely about disseminating information but are framed in terms of the human rights discourse and focus on nurturing social transformation and democracy. Most of them relate to the agenda of social justice, particularly the approach based on human rights.

The CSA focus areas involve monitoring the mainstreaming of HIV/AIDS in the university’s core business, community mobilisation, training, and support, and research, together with a human rights culture in the context of transformation and development (CSA, 2005:1-2). These focuses contribute to the realisation of the mandate of HEAIDS as indicated above. Furthermore, these areas are not only of local interest but are global in nature because, through collaboration in research, the CSA could possibly influence the global community.

The CSA has emerged as one of the more relevant and timely higher education HIV/AIDS programmes in the country which facilitates the realisation of the broad government mandate of providing effective responses to the HIV/AIDS pandemic. The University of Pretoria’s performance in the 2001 HEAIDS study indicates that the institution is responding to the HIV/AIDS pandemic positively. There is political will and buy-in by management as evidenced by the presence of an HIV policy and financial commitment to HIV/AIDS programmes at the management level.

With reference to effective prevention, established staff and student peer education programmes are organised and coordinated by the CSA, although much work is still necessary with regard to other items concerning effective prevention, such as the establishment of Voluntary Counselling and Testing (VCT). Acceptable care and support is available at the onsite campus clinic for treatment of opportunistic infections
in staff and students. However, there was no response in the area of palliative care, usage of ARVs and home based care for the university community. This indicates that the university still needs to develop in this area while working on mainstreaming and teaching with regards to HIV/AIDS since only 20% of the HODs indicated that there was a departmental policy to include HIV/AIDS in the curriculum, while the other 80% indicated that no such policy was in place (CSA, 2005:5-6).

The institution must also develop the area of research and knowledge creation since the study discovered no response to this aspect (HEAIDS, 2004: 166-167). However, evidence gathered from the institution indicates that there is relevant and constructive research in the form of CSA’s yearly reviews, discussed in this section. On the basis of the HEAIDS criteria or the HIV/AIDS framework, the University of Pretoria is meeting some of the requirements while in other areas there is room for improvement.

The CSA is playing a most crucial role in disseminating information regarding the status of the pandemic to the university community and stakeholders and even further afield to the international community. An analysis of the role that the CSA is playing in using ICT in support of HIV/AIDS related research indicates that the CSA site “provide[s] current epidemiological data, bibliographic data-bases, reports, documentation, discussion forums, and the possibility of links” (Kelly, 2002:10). Thus the CSA is relevant to both the local and global community with respect to activities that promote the alleviation of the HIV/AIDS pandemic.

7.5 HIV/AIDS Reviews by the CSA

The AIDS reviews are published annually by CSA in an attempt to address “… the complex question as to why, despite the comprehensive National HIV/AIDS Plan adopted in 1994, South Africa has what has been described as the fastest growing HIV epidemic in the world” (Crew, 2000:1).
Table 7.6 – HIV/AIDS Reviews Summarised

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author, title and year of publication</th>
<th>Synopsis and theory of change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Marais Buckling, (2005)</td>
<td>This review looks critically at how South Africa should be measuring the impact of HIV/AIDS. It highlights the sociological and politico-economic reality: “... what emerges is a nuanced but horrifying picture of a society that is being ruptured and buckled into an antithesis of the humane, just and dignifying society millions struggled for and continue to strive towards.” The review argues that it is imperative that the country develops creative and innovative ways of combating the pandemic so that the ideal of a socially and economic just society is realised.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pieterse &amp; van Wyk, What’s Cooking Review, 2005.</td>
<td>This review examines macro-economic policies and how they give rise to socio-economic conditions that exacerbate a person’s vulnerability to food insecurity, HIV infection, hastening the development of AIDS and its effects on the success of treatment. The authors argue that food insecurity is as much a product of historical injustices as it is of current policy decisions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kometsi, K., (un) Real Review, 2004.</td>
<td>This review addresses the manner in which the epidemic positions men and the crucial role that they can play in the social and political responses to HIV/AIDS. It further looks at the dominant images of men in society and focuses on masculinities in the South African context.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barolsky, V., (Over) Extended (2003)</td>
<td>This review examines the impact of the epidemic on families and the personal relationships between family members. It addresses the question: How the (over) extended family copes with the epidemic and how social and community structures can be developed in innovative and creative ways to cope with the epidemic.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kitson, C., Ceaser, M., and Jithoo, T., Whose Right AIDS Review, 2002.</td>
<td>What do human rights have to do with AIDS? This review looks at the connection between HIV/AIDS and human rights. It considers what constitutes the rights based approach to HIV/AIDS and the international guidelines on which such an approach is based.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jones, T., Who Cares AIDS Review, 2001.</td>
<td>This review investigates the role the international community plays in addressing the HIV/AIDS pandemic in Africa. It considers the extent of care from the African and the South African community and argues that all should care in the fight against the pandemic.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marais, H., To the Edge AIDS 2000 Review.</td>
<td>This review seeks to address the forces that shaped the response to the HIV/AIDS epidemic in 1994-1999. It examines the ideological factors, origins of the National AIDS Plan of 1994 and the dynamics and challenges that led to the country’s failure to fully implement the plan.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The table above depicts only a selection of publications by the CSA that attempt to furnish the public with information related to the HIV/AIDS pandemic as it is experienced by ordinary people in various settings and contexts in the country. The focus of the AIDS reviews ranges from addressing macro socio-economic issues to micro issues such as the role of men (masculinity) and the extended family in addressing the pandemic. The reviews provide a rich and well researched perspective on how HIV/AIDS affects lives and possible ways of dealing with the pandemic. Furthermore, the brief analysis of its yearly HIV/AIDS Reviews indicates that in the area of critical research and knowledge creation, the centre is relevant to the local university community, the higher education institutions, the South African nation and the global community at large. This points to the critical role the centre is playing in addressing the global emergency through providing timely and relevant research.

The reviews further illustrate how the pandemic and its impact is closely intertwined with imbalances of power and access to resources in the South African context, in a similar manner to Bancroft’s (2001) report in a global context. In the reviews, it is also evident that the HIV/AIDS pandemic is conceptualised by the CSA in its publications in politico-economic terms — a broader strand of analysis with broader categories such as the global nature of the HIV/AIDS pandemic (Altman, 1999:260). Although the HIV/AIDS reviews of the CSA cited in the current study raise pertinent issues related to the pandemic, the women’s movement and the feminist perspective on HIV/AIDS appear to be downplayed. The feminist perspective seems to be subsumed under the debate of globalisation and HIV/AIDS. It is nonetheless crucial that the feminist standpoint within the South African context begin to highlight the threat the pandemic poses to women (Msimang, 2003:101).

An equally important aspect of the reviews is that they are couched in the discourse of social constructivism that privileges the voice of participants – those infected and affected by the HIV/AIDS pandemic. In this manner, they shed light on the calamity that is often overlooked by other publications couched in the terms of scientific and medical discourse. Furthermore, the reviews speak to the human rights culture that informs most of the activity of the centre. By being informed by social constructivism and the human rights culture, each review fulfils the radical social justice mandate in
that it includes experiences of the marginalised in research as a crucial contribution to knowledge.

The Centre does not operate in a vacuum but in a context that is informed by conflicting discourses and paradigms in addressing the pandemic which exert an impact on the effectiveness of the centre in fulfilling its mandate. For instance there is a constant debate on the relationship between HIV/AIDS and poverty on the one hand and HIV/AIDS and ARV on the other (Coombe, 2000). The one camp is informed by the social justice discourse and contends that alleviating poverty will reduce the prevalence of HIV/AIDS while the other position is informed by the logic of the market and of profit, and argues that the provision of medication such as ARV will alleviate the pandemic. In this context, the CSA must find a balanced position that will present the best possible prevention and intervention strategy to the general public while taking cognisance of the conflicting positions. Since currently, as noted, the country is experiencing the highest prevalence of HIV/AIDS in the whole world, while the hardest hit portion of the population affected and infected by it are those living in poverty and marginalisation, the social justice position on the pandemic boasts impressive credentials for alleviating the situation. On that note, it is informative to analyse and reveal how the CSA makes sense of social justice and HIV/AIDS. Judging from the artefacts and publication of the CSA considered in this section, its position on HIV/AIDS as a social justice concern is informed by the ideological and political context in which it operates. This will be addressed in the analysis of the data garnered from the interviews with participants from the CSA.

7.6 Conceptualisation of Social Justice

The CSA Deputy Director avers that social justice is a complex concept, concerning the total transformation of institutions to correct the imbalances of the past. According to him social justice aims to promote access, gender and disability equity in the institution. With regard to the wider community, social justice is aimed at increasing community participation and involvement.

I mean I am looking not only from the point of view of access of previously disadvantaged communities to higher education, but also looking at things like staffing structure in terms of gender equity, issues
of disability, relationships with communities. I mean they draw their staff from communities – but a lot of projects and research happen through communities and I would imagine issues of social justice are very important there in terms of how the university works with these communities. Perhaps initially in terms of selecting research topics, looking at issues of historical imbalances, access to services and rights I would imagine that the university has an important role in this kind of research (Deputy Director of CSA).

The CSA deputy director’s perception of an institutional response to the social justice mandate reveals several characteristics. The most dominant one that is emphasised several times is the slow pace of transformation at the University of Pretoria while the second has to do with making the demographics of institutions representative of the South African population and promoting the employment of people from marginalised groups. His position on social justice reflects the liberal school which fosters equality within the existing structures (Rizvi, 1999), particularly the issue of making the demographics of the institution more representative of the historically marginalised communities. While demonstrating concern regarding the slow pace of the university in this respect, the director’s sentiments reveal an aspect of an institutional culture that is conservative and locked in the past, in that the slow pace is retarding the full realisation of the government’s social justice mandate. What appears to emerge from the data is that the director is operating in a context that is at odds with his ideological standpoint. He expresses a liberal position while he operates within a conservative context. There is a tension between the conservative and the liberal paradigms and thus the radical social justice advanced in this study appears to be overshadowed.

The deputy director further offered three examples of programmes that constitute a response to social justice: the UPFY Programme, the IGWS and the Centre for the study of Human Rights. Within the CSA, an exemplary project that promotes the social justice mandate is the Youth Skills Development project. This project upgrades marginalised youth by providing them with relevant skills so that they can be self-reliant and thus enhance their self-worth and dignity. Furthermore, the project utilises the “Train the Trainer” feature which ensures that the skills learned are ploughed back into the community by better trained and skilled youth. While the CSA programme is relevant and useful, it falls short of fully engaging the youth in other aspects of the HIV/AIDS
pandemic, particularly those framed by the political economy analysis and critical theory. What appears to be lacking in the youth programme is the inculcation of critical consciousness and action against systems of oppression and poverty together with their role in human emancipation as proposed by critical theory (Kincheloe & McLaren, 2002). Another important aspect of the youth programme is the emphasis on “skilling”; however, in terms of critical theory, skilling without an emphasis on liberatory consciousness and action is tantamount to perpetuating the status quo of oppression and marginalisation. In this regard, it would be of benefit if such programmes were infused with the language of critical pedagogy so that they serve as emancipatory systems against systems of oppression.

The experience of the deputy director, with respect to the University of Pretoria’s response to the HIV/AIDS mandate and transformation at large, illustrates the phenomenon of the mismatch between policy and practice as identified by policy analysts (McLaughlin, 1998). While the CSA’s director mentions some relevant aspects of social justice, in particular, transformation as an element of government policy, what appears to him as a disparity is the complex nature of social justice in practice, particularly the context which is controlled by a dominant discourse of conservatism and its anti-progressive form of social justice.

However, in experiencing social justice as a complex endeavour, the director is not alone; he is joined by the two project managers in this study. In recognition of its complexity, the participants shared their sentiments that social justice promoted by relevant research topics and practices is informed by the human rights culture. This framework informs most of the dispositions and activities of the CSA, including its research and training endeavours. The initial point of departure of this approach encourages activists to consider everyone, regardless of their HIV/AIDS status, as being entitled to the basic human rights enshrined in the universal declaration of human rights and the South African Constitution. This position ensures that everyone is accorded equal treatment in all areas of life and no exception should be made regarding people living with and affected by HIV/AIDS.

The issue of social justice, we are a social research organization and indeed we will always look at the sort of the social issues around the
epidemic. We have got some of the number crunchers and the bio-
medical staff on board. As the team within the centre we focus on the
themes on all the social issues, ranging from education to sociology,
psychology, psycho-social well-being and we try to marry that with our
vision or approach and linked to our approach to doing our work within
the human rights framework. It is all about access and meaningful
participation. Sort of ensuring access to the activities that we are doing,
and sort of to the greater good of human society, but also getting all
stakeholders within the constituencies to have meaningful participation
in all initiatives that we are doing. I mean all of that is sort of for us the
social justice element is sort of enshrined into your normal basic human
rights. So because we work within ... we are a social research
organisation working within the human rights approach; the social
justice angle is sort of the logical entry point for us into the HIV/AIDS
(CSA Project Manager 2).

In addition to the human rights framework, fulfilling social justice concerns involves
employing contextualised research with the aim of improving the lives of women since
they represent the portion of the population most severely affected by the HIV/AIDS
pandemic. It also involves a multi-sectoral approach, for instance, working with non
profit organisations such as People against Women Abuse (POWA), and international
aid agencies, such as Australian Aid. The main aim is to empower women and improve
their socio-economic status.

One project manager’s conceptualisation of social justice is informed by a human rights
culture with a strong emphasis on gender equality. The research projects under the
auspices of the project manager attempt to effect “gender justice”: for example, two
projects focus on the trauma and empowerment of women. The focus of this project is
to empower victims of gender based violence by providing the project organisers with
property (CSA Project Manager 2). Although on a small scale, such activities do
constitute a building block towards achieving gender justice in the context of the
pandemic that is undermining gender equality, what also emerged with reference to
gender is the attempt to go beyond the provision of services to women’s empowerment.
In a way this is similar to the project on self-reliance which attempts to promote
sustainable development that is longer lasting. The CSA’s focus on gender does not
merely end with the limited gender perspective that concentrates on women. There is
another progressive venture that focuses on gender from a masculine perspective. As a
result, a more balanced perspective regarding gender would be provided. In this
broadened perspective, there are also proponents which hold that women’s rights are no less than human rights. This is a similar stance to that advocated by socialist feminists in advancing gender justice (Young, 2004; Unterhalter, 2004). In so doing, the socialist feminist also strives to represent human diversity and thus to portray inclusiveness as an element of social justice. However, the CSA’s position on HIV/AIDS and gender could benefit from engaging with the Man as Partners (MAP) movement whose objective is to change men’s knowledge, attitudes, and behaviours, leading to a decrease in the spread of HIV/AIDS and gender based violence (Greig & Peacock, 2005:3).

The human rights framework that the CSA adopts in dealing with the pandemic portrays the global commitment to dealing with it. It also reflects Parker et al.’s position on the rights based approach:

Ultimately, together with a new emphasis on community mobilization aimed at unleashing resistance to stigmatization and discrimination, structural interventions aimed at developing a rights-based approach to reducing HIV/AIDS-related stigmatization and discrimination should be a high priority in order to create a transformed social climate in which stigmatization and discrimination will no longer be tolerated. Within such a framework, discrimination becomes a clear breach of a basic human rights obligation — a breach that, when concretized in civil rights legislation can effectively impede and prohibit the exercise of HIV/AIDS related stigmatization and discrimination (Parker, et al., 2003:17).

The difficulty with the human rights culture/approach is that the dominant discourse that informs it at the moment is one of neo-liberalism and hence it is limited in inculcating a form of social justice that promotes collective human rights.

While the staff of the CSA perceive social justice as a complex concept to define, yet even more complex when being implemented or practised, especially given the historical legacy of the country and the stigma associated with HIV/AIDS, adopting the human rights approach emerged as pertinent for them. Implicit in this approach is the attempt to deal with the injustices suffered by those infected or affected by HIV/AIDS, for example, stigmatisation. The human rights approach also resonates with the position of socialist feminists on justice as freedom from the five faces of oppression (Young, 2000). According to Young, for every member of a given society to experience justice,
there must be humane treatment and equal recognition of all. By linking these two approaches, a socially just community could be created. For example, members of society who are marginalised because of their HIV/AIDS status could be accorded full recognition and incorporated into the social world.

Although the said framework devised by Young was written within a Western context, the present study utilises it here because it illuminates certain aspects of the oppression experienced by people affected with HIV/AIDS. Furthermore, the framework is useful for providing solutions in addressing the injustices.

7.7 The CSA’s Conceptualisation of HIV/AIDS

The data analysis indicates that, in implementing the CSA’s mandate, the project manager’s conceptualisation of HIV/AIDS is further broadened and informed by current debates on the political economy of HIV/AIDS. The staff at the CSA perceive it as more than merely a medical issue, but more importantly, as a developmental issue since it cuts across all sectors of the economy and the social life of communities. This broad view is couched in the human rights culture which is the mainstay that informs most of the CSA activities. In addition to this, HIV/AIDS is adopted as a moral responsibility of the institution and the nation at large. This concept can be characterised as having more neutral undertones, even though it is informed by current politico-economic debates. It possesses liberal tones because its emphasis leans more towards the human rights approach that operates in the capitalist and globalised context responsible for the globalised nature and socio-economic inequalities of the HIV/AIDS pandemic. The liberal undertones of this conceptualisation have merits in being couched in terms of the human rights culture, but fall short of theorising the pandemic in radical social justice terms – as a thread of global social justice. Another important omission is the downplaying of the feminist position that perceives HIV/AIDS as being socially constructed and best understood from the perspectives of the society that is affected and infected by the pandemic (Gilbert & Wright, 2003).

7.8 Leadership in HIV/AIDS

Another important attribute that emerged from the data concerns the CSA’s objective to demonstrate leadership in terms of HIV/AIDS in the academic field by equipping...
students with skills such as initiative, creativity, and humane skills that contribute to the enhancement of the social role of higher education. The CSA also fulfils the university's business and economic mission to produce leaders in the corporate world with relevant knowledge of HIV/AIDS. This mission is fulfilled by mainstreaming HIV/AIDS in most of the university curricula and other extracurricular activities. Of note in this attempt is the success story with respect to mainstreaming HIV/AIDS in engineering, resulting in informed engineering graduates. Equally of note is the CSA’s approach to educating the UP community concerning HIV/AIDS. In this regard the CSA has embraced the flexible learning approach and thus attempts to accommodate all learners. However, while there are success stories of mainstreaming HIV/AIDS in the curriculum in isolated departments, there is much resistance to mainstreaming since, as noted, only 20% of the departments are embracing it. Hence, it can safely be inferred that the mainstreaming of HIV/AIDS is strongly contested in the university context, and for it to gain ground, much spadework needs to be done.

With their zeal to demonstrate leadership in the HIV/AIDS field, the interviewees’ responses indicate that the CSA does not operate in isolation, but embodies a strong community outreach focal point which is informed by the inclusive and broadened conceptualisation of the HIV/AIDS phenomenon. The community projects with which the CSA is involved include but are not limited to youth concerns, women/gender development, schools (through the national vaccine project) and linking academia with the community. Furthermore, the CSA places a strong focus on community development, enhancing pertinent areas such as improvement of food security and social infrastructure.

The approach of the CSA when implementing the HIV/AIDS policy is not limited to the local community but extends to the continental and global community. The project managers indicated how the magnitude of the pandemic has necessitated that the CSA does not adopt the AIDS/HIV project in terms of the isolationist and exceptionalism positions, but must, rather, cooperate and collaborate with internal and external compatible organisations. It maintains strong links with relevant local, national, regional and international activist organisation in the HIV/AIDS fields. At an institutional level, the centre enjoys strong links with other tertiary institutions in the country while at the
national level it is informed by the government HIV/AIDS Programme as it was established in response to the then vice president’s call in 1999. Regional programmes are manifested in the form of the SADCC Future Leaders Programme which targets the youth and empowers them with relevant skills in the HIV/AIDS field. International links have been established through the involvement in the activities of UNESCO by one project manager and the HIV/AIDS research project of the University of York.

The CSA has positioned itself as a socially relevant centre with a strong research function. This indicates that its role in implementing policy on HIV/AIDS is strongly informed by relevant and current research. The AIDS Review is evidence of this fact. The other exemplary research endeavours are those in collaboration with international institutions such as that just mentioned.

Demonstrating leadership in the HIV/AIDS fields translates into the implementation of both local and global organisational visions of mitigating and curbing HIV/AIDS. From the United Nations to the University of Pretoria, there is strong commitment to the alleviation of the pandemic. The UNAIDS’s commitment, actions and goals to halt and reverse the spread of HIV/AIDS by 2015 are reflected in the leadership, as regards HIV/AIDS activities, taken by the CSA (UNAIDS, 2007). Related to this commitment are regional issues of critical concern. For instance, the SADC identification of “the need to ensure that poverty alleviation is addressed in all SADC activities and programmes with the ultimate objective of eradicating it. HIV/AIDS is a major threat to the attainment of the objective of SADC and therefore is accorded priority in all SADC programmes and activities” (SADC, 2007). This is a pertinent concern because, according to UNAIDS figures, the SADC community records the highest prevalence of the HIV/AIDS pandemic; therefore, it is fitting that the SADC should take explicit action towards mainstreaming the latter. Demonstrating leadership in the HIV/AIDS area at local and global level, and taking into consideration HIV/AIDS as a social justice concern, reflects Young’s (2002) position on justice as a global concern. Social justice can no longer be an isolated national issue, but becomes a global one.
7.9 The Role of Project Managers

The project manager’s role in implementing the HIV/AIDS policy focuses on the following functions: strategic planning, fundraising, research management, staff development and “innovating and expanding CSA”, youth and gender development. Once more the CSA is socially relevant because it proposes a special portfolio for HIV/AIDS and the youth, headed and coordinated by a project management team.

My specific role I mean my primary portfolio in the centre is the Youth Projects – the Leaders at Work Project and other related links of which there is quite a few of. There is a media portfolio as well liaising with the media and so general marketing of the centre as well. Then other activities include sort of grant writing, I am one of the main grant writers of the Unit because we have to raise our own funding in the unit. Then also I am representing the centre on various bodies sort of regionally and nationally. And I am chief editor in the UNESCO Impact of HIV and AIDS clearing house in Paris (CSA Project Manager 2).

This is particularly important because global statistics indicate that the generation affected most by the pandemic comprises the youth of tertiary education age (16 – 25 years). The manner in which the CSA markets its services to the youth target market is exemplary and credit goes to the youth portfolio project manager who continually provides vibrant, popular and captivating messages regarding HIV/AIDS. The emphasis on gender is also of particular relevance to the mitigation of HIV/AIDS because women constitute a large percentage of the people affected and infected by the pandemic. In fact this focus reflects the current strategies of dealing with the phenomenon of the feminisation of poverty and HIV/AIDS. In addressing these issues, social researchers argue that increased empowerment of women globally is the key (Gahan, 2005: 5).

In sharing experiences regarding their role, the project managers revealed very little evidence of how HIV/AIDS impacts on them as social scientists and researchers. Their role is limited to issues of the development of the skills of the youth as regards HIV/AIDS gender and community development. What appears to be missing, for instance, is the interrogation of issues of socio-economic exclusion, deprivation and discrimination owing to the pandemic and the role of neo-liberalism therein. From the perspective of critical theory, the centre would be in a position to advance radical social justice if the role of the project manager were informed by critical social research and science, whose
aim is to liberate human beings — the youth and adults alike — from systems of oppression and homophobic practices of capitalism as characteristics of the global context of the pandemic (Hill, 2000:3). A related matter with respect to revitalising the role of the project in challenging neo-liberalism and its anti-democratic tendencies can be found in applying the principles of Tirisano and compassionate citizenship suggested by Waghid (2004). Waghid’s important suggestion is that instilling compassionate citizenship in the youth cultivates values of democracy, social justice and equality, non-racism, non-sexism, ubuntu – human dignity, openness, accountability and respect for the rule of law. Waghid further adds that in higher education the role of university teachers in a context of global injustice such as HIV/AIDS would involve that:

[We] will need to cultivate compassion as an appropriate response to the situation of others; this is a quality that deserves recognition in the education of students and the democratisation of society. Good universities not only teach students practical reasoning, but also a sense of generosity and appropriate concern towards others …. Teaching university students to show compassion means instilling in them the value of learning to oppose undeserved conditions of living which affront human dignity such as socio-economic deprivation, racism, inequality and poverty – conditions which are rife in South Africa and on the African continent (Waghid, 2004:539).

Although Waghid’s suggestions are expressed in general terms and refer to teaching, they could be applicable to the project managers at the CSA, as university employees involved in training the youth at the university as a place of enactment. Therefore, a consideration of teaching the CSA clientele some principles of compassionate citizenship as an aspect of democracy would go a long way towards facilitating the rights-based approach that frames most of the CSA’s activities.

### 7.10 Outcomes of the Programmes

The CSA has enjoyed some successes in implementing the HIV/AIDS policy. The evidence provided by the project managers points to successful outcomes in the area of intervention, youth development, addressing stigma, gender and masculinity. The intervention package has been created and must be replicated nationally. Since the objective of this package is to address HIV/AIDS trauma, primarily aimed at women, again a strong gender focus is evident. In this regard, the CSA should be wary of
making a contribution to dealing with the feminisation of HIV/AIDS as referred to by Gahan (2004).

The CSA, through its various projects, particularly those that target the youth, has successfully demystified the stigma attached to HIV/AIDS. In addressing the notion of stigma, the human rights approach once again informs the conception and delivery of training material. Not only is there progress in addressing stigma, but another area that also evidences positive outcomes is the broadening of gender to include the masculinity perspective. This process, according to the project manager, represents the goal of the CSA “to invent new ways of meaningful participation of men in HIV/AIDS programmes and promote men as active agents of change”. This implies that in the battle to combat the spread of HIV/AIDS it is not only women who should be in the forefront but also men, because all genders are equally affected by the pandemic. These outcomes reflect the activity of the organisation MAP whose objective it is to build societal capacity to involve men in HIV/AIDS related prevention, care and activities related to gender based violence and the promotion of gender equality (Greig & Peacock, 2005:2).

According to the CSA director, the CSA projects are locally and regionally focused. As noted, their main agenda in promoting social justice is framed by the human rights approach while addressing the stigma attached to HIV/AIDS. One example of a regional programme that addresses social justice and HIV/AIDS is the one offered to regional parliamentarians which promotes the dignity and human rights of those affected and infected by HIV/AIDS. The CSA’s involvement with these parliamentarians is another indication of the relevance of their project to the local outcomes.

7.11 Challenges of the CSA

For the two project managers, stigmatisation of HIV/AIDS remains the greatest national challenge for the CSA to address despite the fact that the centre has instituted measures to address this. Even at institutional level, HIV/AIDS continues to be demonised, which has led to the perpetuation of a taboo culture that the CSA must also address. One project manager’s position with regards to the challenges of stigma and misconceptions about the pandemic is as follows:
One of the challenges, first we are focusing on the university campus, is the diversity of the campus population. I mean there are myths and misconceptions going with that, if you are dealing with race and culture, the average white students on campus are not affected by the HIV/AIDS; they feel sometimes untouched by it. So if you are trying to have a campaign targeting them or if you are trying to get them involved into the programme, they sometimes look reluctant because they sometimes see it as a black issue and not a white issue. Some of the black students might think that well it is a drug-user issue or it is a homosexual issue (CSA Project Manager 2).

According to the project managers, the pandemic has re-invented and recreated gender and social inequalities, thus presenting a challenge of great magnitude that needs to be addressed consistently and immediately; not piecemeal.

Although there have been some positive outcomes, especially in the area of demystifying HIV/AIDS and the stigma attached to it, the project managers argue that the battle is not completely won as there continue to be further misconceptions of the HIV/AIDS pandemic influenced by race, culture and the socio-economic dynamics. These misconceptions are going to continue to exist on the global scale for as long as the statistics point to the fact that the hardest hit groups of the populations are those marginalised by poverty, gender, race and social class. The question that arises, with reference to dealing with stigma, concerns what CSA experience is also reflected in the international research field. According to Parker, HIV/AIDS related stigma and discrimination continue to plague the world even among the sectors of the world that are experiencing adverse poverty conditions and the feminisation of poverty (Parker, et al., 2003:17). They suggest that for the global community to deal more effectively with stigma and related discrimination and oppression, there is a need to:

Conceptualize stigma and stigmatization as intimately linked to the reproduction of social difference; this paper offers a new framework by which to understand HIV/AIDS-related stigma and its effects. In so doing, it highlights the manner in which stigma feeds upon, strengthens and reproduces existing inequalities of class, race, gender and sexuality. It highlights the limitations of individualistic modes of stigma alleviation and calls instead for new programmatic approaches in which the resistance of stigmatized individuals and communities is utilized as a resource for social change (Parker, et al., 2003:17).
Another challenge that the CSA has been required to deal with is the increasing demand for its services in the context of the growing numbers of those affected and infected by HIV/AIDS, particularly among the youth. As a result certain staff members have felt overwhelmed by the constant demand for their services by the university community and the nation at large.

Some of the above challenges are reiterated by the CSA director. According to him, the challenges that face the organisation stem from three sources – student related, staff related and management related. With regard to students, stigmatisation, racism and reluctance to support some of the CSA programmes are the main challenges. With regard to staff stigmatisation the challenges are coupled with limited cooperation from staff. With regard to management, there is reluctance to assist with the CSA projects in particular.

Financially, like the other two centres – the UPFY and IGWS – the CSA has had to contend with financial difficulties, perhaps due to the commodification and marketisation of higher education services as described earlier by Giroux (2002) and Apple (2001). Overall, stigmatisation emerges as being the greatest challenge in the whole university community.

7.12 Dealing with the Challenges

In dealing with the said challenges, project managers characterise the approach of the CSA as being dynamic, innovative and creative. The goal of continuously finding unique and new ways of improving the situation drives most of its activities, for example, the Future Leaders Programme that equips the youth with skills to deal with the pandemic in the corporate world. The human rights approach once again emerges as the mainstay that informs the solutions formulated by the CSA. This broad approach is coupled with encouraging people to apply a critical mind to the greatest challenges, such as stigmatisation. Even in the projects that address stigma, the CSA does not employ the “one-size-fits-all” approach but rather creates specialised interventions for specific marginalised people.
In addressing the challenges facing the UP, the CSA director refers to a concerted effort that involves most of the stakeholders, from top management to students. Educating and disseminating information regarding HIV/AIDS is the dominant strategy employed by the centre, for example, the HIV/AIDS Reviews. The nature and focus of the educational interventions are such that they appeal to different audiences that consist of most of the stakeholders of the University community.

Measures to mainstream HIV/AIDS in the curriculum promote collaborative research on HIV/AIDS and cooperation with the Centre for Human Rights Studies. All these processes are intended to address the HIV/AIDS challenge in a context where misconceptions regarding the pandemic are rife. With reference to research, the promotion of interdisciplinary research is an important strategy for the centre:

> Also being placed in the university, we feel that one of the strengths is to promote interdisciplinary research. I mean in getting people from various disciplines together to do research together, to work on interventions together and do research together. And linked to that is that we believe firmly in sort of marrying theory with practice, I mean for a long time HIV and AIDS were sort of reactive, people reacted to the challenge. Throughout the years we have got so much theory in HIV/AIDS and the theory does not always influence what is happening in the field you know. Theories sometimes are always kept in library shelves and books and it does not actually feed back into the community where that theory was actually developed (CSA Project Manager 2).

By promoting interdisciplinary research, the centre is dealing with the challenges and demonstrating that it is aware of the complexity of the pandemic while forging ways of addressing it from a variety of perspectives. This is a positive disposition. However, in terms of critical theory, the research undertaken by the centre would benefit from adopting a stance that is critical of current research theories and practices with the aim of liberating knowledge and human beings (Kincheloe & McLaren, 2002). This is an area that the centre needs to explore in order to advance the agenda of radical social justice.

In addressing the financial difficulties, the centre continually seeks funds from different donors such as UNESCO and the Australian Aid organisation. The deputy director describes this venture in the following manner: “We raise all our funds from donor
organisations and international governments. What they [the University of Pretoria] do, give us office space and access to the university’s IT network internet – we pay for usage.” (Deputy Director, CSA). From the data it is evident that fundraising, addressing stigmatisation and making use of relevant research in the centre’s activities are important strategies for dealing with the challenges.

7.13 Critical Policy Engagement

The recurring question that cropped up in the researcher’s mind during the visits to the centre and while she analysed the interview data, was the level and extent of any critique of the dynamics which the HIV/AIDS pandemic presents to the CSA, especially because the centre has been tasked with engaging with the highly politicised area of HIV/AIDS. Evidence of some level of critique is present in the broad politico-economic informed conceptualisation of the pandemic as opposed to the sanitised limited one. Another example of such critique is the adoption of the human rights framework in addressing the pandemic. This indicates that the centre views people living with HIV/AIDS first as human beings with rights – which is most important. Its conception of a human rights discourse does not merely end at individual rights as the liberal tradition has it, but encompasses collective human rights that deal with broader societal developmental issues. Thus HIV/AIDS is not only an individual matter, but more of a collective one. However, the issue of HIV/AIDS as a collective human rights matter is not powerfully developed but is merely mentioned in passing. This is the area that I think the CSA needs to explore in future, in order to be considered as a critically engaged centre. Consequently, for the CSA to display characteristics of critical policy engagement, it has to interrogate the current discourse of individual human rights and inform its practices with collective rights of this kind.

The question to ask in relation to this topic is: what kind of policy content / framework specifically seeks to promote or oversee social justice? Is the increasing concern with HIV/AIDS a social justice issue? Is there a strong demonstrable commitment to accountability to social justice at the CSA? If there is not, what undermines the commitment to social justice? Is the framing of HIV/AIDS in the human rights culture possible if there is no strong commitment to social justice?
An attempt has been made in the current study to depict the conceptualisation of social justice and HIV/AIDS. For all the participants, the elements of social justice include a total transformation of the institution, promoting general and disability equity, gender and human rights. HIV/AIDS is viewed as a social justice concern because it mostly affects the marginalised people, and doing justice to the pandemic is found in the human rights approach. Thus, the human rights approach / strategy that focuses on democracy, diversity, inclusion, and tolerance of differences, results in long term positive consequences in addressing the issue. Although social justice is considered to entail a focus on the utopian human condition, promotes non-sexism, non-racism, non-classism, non-ageism, non-discrimination, and is concerned with promoting an inclusive and democratic culture, nevertheless HIV/AIDS has emerged as an attack on the utopian human condition aspired to, and will require a relentless defence of strategies informed by social justice to address this pandemic.

Although the suggested utopian human condition is admirable since it accommodates the marginalised victims of HIV/AIDS, the socio-economic and political context is hostile to it. The utopian view’s advocacy for the proper, humane, treatment of HIV/AIDS concerns is unambiguous. In this context, that which characterises the CSA’s advocacy is not even close to the utopian perspective. It is more realistic and practical in that it is couched in the language of the human rights and democratic culture with which most South Africans can identify and have come to embrace as part of the democratic dispensation. It is troubling that the human rights and democratic culture contains one glaring exclusion: in principle, social justice is mentioned but engagement with the strategy is deficient. Hence, to shift the activities of the CSA closer to the utopian view, concerted effort must be applied to the engagement with social justice and HIV/AIDS as a matter of urgency.

One important observation concerns the dynamics of power relations and how they affect the policy process at the CSA. The power dynamics at the university are heavily influenced by the neo-liberal ideology. Studies have shown that this ideology has altered the university as well as its research policy and practice. Most universities have witnessed the introduction of market-like behaviour on a global scale and at South African universities in general, while the University of Pretoria in particular is not an
exception. South African research points to neo-liberalism and globalisation as the main culprit that seriously undermines transformative social justice (Waghid, 2001). According to progressive educators, “the major task for leftist academics is to be accountable for the ‘real world’ political implications of theory by working out ways to connect education with community struggles for social justice” (McLaren, 2003).

Another important issue with regard to that which should be in place, versus that which is actually in place, is the purpose and content of the research agenda. In the context where the latter is being made to fulfil the needs of the markets more than the needs of the community or society at large, the CSA needs to position itself strongly as a social research centre for community development – the civic good. Related to this, the CSA needs to be wary of the neo-liberal research agenda whose main purpose is to do away with cooperation and the civic good and open the door for the operations of vast corporations and the law of money. If this is left unchecked, HIV/AIDS research for community development will be held under siege by the law of the markets and thus social justice will be compromised. Community development or civic good is an important mission which the CSA aims to fulfil and, in doing so, it is aligning itself with the broader mission and vision of the University of Pretoria. Community development, and engagement, do not occur in an ideological vacuum. In societies that subscribe to neo-liberalism, community development is informed by stakeholder participation in the projects geared towards development. At the CSA, the data revealed that there are attempts to practise the principle of stakeholder participation in the various projects. While this is a noble move, particularly towards alleviating the scourge of HIV/AIDS, it will continue to be inadequate as long as the said participation is unequal and informed by the ideology of market logic. In addressing this, the CSA needs to continue in its efforts with regards to community development and go one step further to empowering them in terms of human, social and humane capital. This implies the promotion of loving communities which build bridges to connect different social sectors and classes for the common human good. In this context the relevant question to ask is: what is the imagined community on which the CSA wishes its focus to fall? This imagined community would not only consist of the ruling class who are supposedly in control of the means of production. The envisaged imagined community consists of all classes; in particular, the working classes who make it possible for academics and
community workers to speak, write, and teach effectively, even if their contribution may appear to be meagre. The imagined community would use popular power and dominant power to address the common threat to humankind – HIV/AIDS.

7.14 Conclusion

This chapter has focused on the manner in which the CSA has addressed the HIV/AIDS pandemic as a social justice concern. It has highlighted the conceptualisation of the pandemic as a global emergency from the perspective of political economy. Furthermore, it has been shown that dealing with the pandemic, in a context informed by a neo-liberal and conservative agenda, hampers strategies that address the magnitude of the issue. However, the CSA has demonstrated the use of positive strategies in dealing and engaging with HIV / AIDS, despite operating in a context that does not fully promote the pandemic as a social justice agenda. In this connection, the chapter has suggested that the CSA has the potential to contribute to the alleviation of the crisis through the deployment of the human rights framework.
CHAPTER 8 – SOCIAL JUSTICE MANDATE UNDER SIEGE

If you are seeking justice, you are struggling, consciously or unconsciously against the logic of capitalism. And that implicit in your ideal for social justice is a different economic system, one which exists nowhere in the world but which [we] hope … will someday take shape. (Lebowitz, 1998:29).

8.1 Introduction

The previous chapters dealt with changes in education policy and institutional responses to the social justice mandate. In this chapter I show that despite policies, social justice mandates are marginalised and compromised because they are consistently at odds with the pervasive neo-liberal ideology within higher education institutions. However, I argue here that despite a neo-liberal and marketised global and local context, the ideals of radical social justice must be pursued. Put another way, the pursuance of a radical social justice agenda cannot stand in the wings and await the cue of ideological change.

In this chapter I examine the factors behind the marginalisation of the centres that are presented as beacons of social justice at the University of Pretoria. The guiding question in this last chapter is: “What contributes to the marginalisation of the social justice mandate in higher education and how can this situation be changed?”

This study is premised on the assumption that social justice in its enormity and complexity is an important guiding principle for polices and practices in higher education. However, the study also shows that social justice continues to be under siege owing to the overwhelming nature of the widespread global socio-economic policies of neo-liberalism. This is especially so because the quest for social justice and alternative futures is pursued in a global and local context that is hostile to the realisation of genuine social justice, because the nature of late capitalism has necessitated the move from a Keynesian welfare state to neo-liberal arrangements, as explained in Chapter One. In any nation state, the quest for social justice is embedded in the universal human rights declaration that recognises the socio-economic and political rights of all individuals regardless of race, class, gender, religion or any other form of classification. In a democracy, the state is the custodian of social justice and through its institutions such as the education system the ideals of social justice are to be realised. It has been
shown that the higher education sector has played a significant role in advancing the ideals of social justice globally and locally – particularly those of opening up access, promoting equal participation in higher education and inculcating the culture of democracy and compassionate citizenship. However, certain elements of social justice need to be highlighted because they play a pertinent role in illustrating the role of higher education in fulfilling the social justice mandate. This study has concerned itself with three aspects of social justice at the University of Pretoria: as mentioned, access to higher education in the form of UPFY, promotion of gender equality in the form of IGWS and a human rights culture in the form of HIV/AIDS and CSA projects.

8.2 Conceptualisation of Transformation

The response to the research question probing the factors behind the marginalisation of social justice initiatives in higher education is multifaceted and multidimensional. The position of this thesis is encapsulated in the quote by Lebowitz (1998) at the beginning of this chapter. In essence, elements of a socioeconomic order that would provide fertile ground for the germination of radical social justice informed by radical humanism principle appear to be an impossible ideal owing to the logic of late capitalism. Nevertheless, the quest for radical transformation that encapsulates the agenda of radical social justice as explained in Chapter Two continues to be a motivating factor even though it goes against the norm of late capitalism and the accompanying discourse of neo-liberalism that continues to marginalise social justice endeavours.

The process of marginalisation occurs at various levels of society, ranging from the broader macro socio-economic policies to micro level institutional policies that are couched in the language of social justice but continue to perpetuate social injustices by not being explicit enough about transformation. For instance, it has been stated in Chapter Four that the Innovation Generation document of the University of Pretoria underscores transformation as one of its strategic drivers. In stating the concept of transformation, it appears self-evident that the institution is transforming and this is further supported by the changing demography of students which is more representative of the South African population. But this is more of a prima-facie change. In this context, suggesting that UP’s conceptualisation of transformation is couched in the liberal discourse of reform would not be far from accurate. As an illustration, the
mission of the institution proclaims the promotion of equity of access, redress and transformation, and this is further reflected in the assertions of management participants at the three centres that there is commitment to opening up access to all South Africans in their diversity. In this regard, the university appears to be a massive institution for everyone embodying an egalitarian discourse. Furthermore, in a context that is driven by reform, there are beacons of calls to transform as exemplified in the three cases discussed. However, there exists a dilemma in the tendency to the marginalisation of transformation because of the threat it poses to the status quo of reform, and to the general conservative–liberal institutional culture of the university. Another compounding illustration is the fact that the dominant institutional culture is informed by conservative libertarian ideals, which creates a possibility for the downplaying of ideals that are more communitarian as evidenced in those of radical social justice. In addition, the institutional culture may appear to be no longer that of the traditional “ivory tower” institution divorced from society but rather one of influencing and increasing the knowledge base of society within the human capital view. It is within this perspective that the crisis arises because it is couched in a liberal functionalist language that does not problematise inherent injustices and inequalities in higher education and society at large. From this position, there is societal consensus on inequality which is almost in line with the libertarian position of Nozick (1929-2002); competition serves to balance inequality. Whereas radical social justice would critique injustices and encourage the emancipation of the whole society, functionalist and liberal informed policies tend to promote the status quo of injustices, stifling genuine equal participation in higher education. In this context, for the University of Pretoria to begin to seriously position itself as a transformed institution in the language of radical social justice, there needs to be substantive engagement with issues of transformation.

At a macro level, research shows that the global neo-liberalism and market ideology are the main culprits in the marginalisation of radical social justice (Vally, 2001; Waghid, n.d.; Rikowski, 2002; Apple, 2001; McLaren, 2001; Lebowitz, 1988; Giroux, 2002; Jansen, 2002). In Chapter Two, it has been shown that from the perspectives of radical left educators, global neo-liberalism and capitalism continue to hinder the transformative and counter hegemonic agenda of radical social justice in the 21st century. Hence the conceptualisation of transformation from the neo-liberal perspective
is intended to maintain the status quo of global capitalism and undertake necessary reforms that make it appear as if change has occurred. The adoption of a culture of reforming the socio-economic situation without overthrowing capitalism has also become a trend in developing and emerging democracies such as South Africa. In the South African context, this was reflected in the introduction of GEAR: a macroeconomic policy that was heavily informed by liberal market logic and which continued to perpetuate socio-economic injustices amongst the poorest and most marginalised sectors of the population. In this context, it would be a utopian ideal to await the inevitable collapse of capitalism due to the current crisis and injustices as foretold by orthodox Marxism. But the historical reality is that the capitalist socio-economic system is going to be with us for some time. Because this study is informed by critical theory and the notion of hope against all odds, and as a progressive critical educator, I advance a similar position to Freire’s *Pedagogy of hope* (2004). He states that “one of the tasks of progressive educators, through a serious and correct analysis is to unveil opportunities for hope no matter what the obstacles may be…” (Freire, 2004:4). This implies that there are opportunities for social justice, liberty and freedom in neoliberalism. As radical scholars, there is an urgent need to pursue more strongly the notion of human emancipation and endeavour to reconstruct knowledge that would promote social justice.

In the educational arena, social justice is under siege because of the global movement towards massification of higher education as a response to the growing demand for it in society. However, in this context, the role of higher education with respect to advancing democracy and acting as the custodian of social justice is declining. Instead, tertiary education is increasingly being informed and framed by the language of neo-liberalism through the process of the commodification and marketisation of higher education. This implies that the roles of higher education are being fashioned in a similar manner to those of the business world, with the prime motive of generating capital and maximising profit. Consequently the triple role of teaching, research and service to the community for the public good is replaced by a focus on the private good and corporate interest. If this trend of regarding higher education as merely another corporation continues, then society will ultimately lose a great deal because of the fluidity of the business world and the great risk of losing societal confidence in higher education. So it is incumbent upon
higher education institutions to resist, and safeguard themselves against the onslaught of, the market ideology by sustaining and protecting the tradition of democracy for all humanity.

The said assault is evident in the marginalisation of teaching as a liberatory activity, and of the role of transformative intellectuals and critical research in creating alternatives to neo-liberalism. In this context, it stands to reason that counter-hegemonic and counter cultural strategies are marginalised so that the status quo is maintained. In pointing to the massive assault of market ideology on social justice, this study is not positioning itself in terms of mere pessimistic determinism or apocalyptic despair. Rather, I, performing the role of a transformative intellectual, firmly hope in restoring the social justice agenda, and thus claiming its rightful intellectual space in the centre of policy formulation, implementation and evaluation. The hope is based on the position of radical humanism and critical theory that human beings possess the capacity to emancipate themselves from situations that are oppressive (Boshier, 1999:1). This inherent freedom is also part and parcel of the Enlightenment project and modernity akin to the argument of Habermas (1974) and the notion of a democratic public sphere. What this implies is that for social justice to be the lived experience of everyone, intellectual and ordinary citizens alike, the practice of open debate and the culture of human rights need to be promoted.

In furthering transformation projects, intellectuals in the three centres would play a pertinent role particularly in facilitating the social justice mandate of higher education. As intellectuals, they are tasked with the making a contribution to the mission of teaching, research and service to the community. For them to make a dent in the neo-liberal environment there is a need to adopt dispositions and practices informed by critical theory. This needs to be explored in the current epoch despite the hostility of neo-liberalism to the tradition of critique and emancipation promised by critical theory.

8.3 Conceptualisation of Social Justice

It has been asserted that the conceptualisation of social justice which frames this study is a radical one. The elements of radical social justice are the elimination of the five faces of oppression identified by Young (2000), the liberation of space proposed by
Ramphele (2002), the adoption of human rights and inclusive culture, and the promotion of global justice, with education playing a pivotal role. With reference to the pursuit of the mandate of access, gender equality, and the alleviation of HIV/AIDS, the study argues that they contain in them common features of alleviating the five faces of oppression and liberating space.

However, radical social justice continues to be sidelined, though in fact it has been demonstrated that the achievement of social justice is one of the greatest challenges of the 21st century, given the dominance of the conservative and liberal traditions of social justice and the resultant persistent injustices of the North and South divide and of socio-economic issues. The marginalisation of radical social justice is witnessed in the dominance of the liberal tradition’s conception of social justice amongst the facilitators at UPFY, IGWS and CSA, while the radical tradition of social justice is referred to on limited occasions, for instance, an indication that one item of the research agenda of the IGWS is *Ubuntu* and the possibility of exploring indigenous knowledge systems mentioned by researchers at UPFY. Thus a paradoxical situation exists, where the missions of the centres that contain the potential to deal with human misery, oppression and discrimination and contribute to the development of humane, inclusive and human rights based culture appear to be couched in the language of limited reform and not explicitly of transformation, as provided for in radical social justice. Furthermore, even in the limited instances where the sentiments of the facilitators at the three centres express elements of radical social justice, for example, where mention is made of empowering the African child through the demystification of mathematics and science, there appears to be a silence about the emancipatory possibilities of these disciplines couched in the discourse of radical social justice. In the case of CSA, elements of radical social justice are portrayed in the adoption of the human rights framework in dealing with the HIV/AIDS pandemic; however, this also falls short of the possibilities of substantive emancipation as there appears to be no indication of explicitly forging ways to challenge the dominant tradition of social justice.

UPFY contributes to the social justice imperative and the alleviation of the five faces of oppression by opening up access into higher education. At UPFY, social justice involves correcting the educational injustices of the past policies and practices. At
classroom level, it involves the use of progressive teaching methodologies and of empowering students with knowledge, while re-educating students about cultural imperialism. It also embraces improving the social-economic status of the marginalised members of the community, and broadening knowledge to include indigenous knowledge systems, particularly in the context of a knowledge society. In this regard, social justice is no longer restricted to questions of redistribution but encompasses issues of recognition of identity, difference and new forms of knowledge.

There is a need to affirm and accord full recognition to the multiplicity of worlds and forms of knowledge. These are elements of radical social justice, since they advance parity between redistribution and recognition (Fraser, 1995). At the university, what has emerged is a different picture. In theory and practice, the parity between redistribution and recognition is non existent. For example, in terms of the fact that the student numbers at the University of Pretoria are now more representative of the diverse South African population, the university is deemed to have met the measure of redistribution as social justice, but at the same time, recognition and tolerance of diversity is still an issue of great concern in the university community. The experiences of black African students that the institutional culture at this higher education institution reflects “Whiteness” as described in Chapter Four furnish evidence of lack of parity between recognition and redistribution. This indicates that there is a constant tension between policy and experience with reference to issues of social justice and that there is limited synergy and integration of redistribution and recognition. Each component is advanced in isolation as if they are not related to each other. Hence, even though it may appear as if there are concerns with recognition of identity, difference and forms of knowledge, when these are treated in isolation from redistributive features of social justice the end results still reinforce the liberal conception of social justice.

The IGWS, through its focus on gender equality and gender mainstreaming, also contributes to the elimination of the five faces of oppression. For it, social justice involves the advancement of gender equality, transformation, socio-economic equality and the advancement of a human rights culture as laid down by the South African constitution. The conceptualisation is located in the distributive paradigm of social justice. Although there are some traces of the radical paradigm in the mention of
transformation, it exists more in principle than in practice. The IGWS appears to be locked in the epoch of the distributive paradigm of social justice because it advances an egalitarian socio-economic order and seems not to have moved beyond the rhetoric of reform: for example, the implication by one facilitator that gender justice would be addressed by equalising the gender composition of staff at the university. In the distributive paradigm, the principles of liberal gender equality and social justice mutually presuppose each other and therefore appear to offer adequate remedies for global injustice. This illusionary state of affairs, characteristic of the current distributive paradigm, constitutes a comfort zone and continues to be left unchallenged, while injustices and breaches of human rights continue to rise to new levels locally and globally. There is potential in the oppositional voice of feminism. The IGWS needs to embrace, support and enact within its sphere of influence a set of core values in the areas of human rights and gender mainstreaming informed by socialist feminism in order to advance radical social justice.

The CSA, through its adoption of the human rights framework in dealing with the global HIV/AIDS pandemic, contributes to the alleviation of the five faces of oppression. For CSA, social justice endeavours would have to be framed by this framework in order to address those affected and living with HIV/AIDS. The achievement of social justice is a global project, not just the endeavour of a nation state or an individual institution. This position displays elements of radical social justice because of its global stance, indicating that the quest for social justice need not be limited to such states but should be the responsibility of the global community.

There is a need to take the cue from critical intellectuals and elevate the project of human emancipation. This process emphasises the centrality of human agency in counteracting neo-liberalism. Neo-liberalism in its various forms is socially made by human beings and it will take human beings to find alternatives to it particularly in the context of global oppression and injustices. It would be detrimental to the emancipatory project to wait for the natural death of capitalism.

In the broader global context there may be an argument that the current recession is a sign of capitalism self destructing. However there is ample evidence in the form of
government bail outs and the shaky but definite reassertion of the power of capital that this is not the case. In other words capitalism is not going to destroy itself. In the South African context it may be argued that there is a strong socialist agenda evidenced in the presence of the Congress of South African trade Unions (COSATU) and the South African Communist Party (SACP) in the Tripartite Alliance. However the country is unlikely to ditch a broader capitalist economic policy despite the socialist pressures from the SACP and the COSATU.

8.4 The Dilemmas and Possibilities of Transformation

In South Africa’s higher education context, the post 1994 dispensation provided a new policy framework which was based on democracy and a human rights culture. Within this setting, for higher education to be regarded as transformed, it was required to promote the three transformation pillars of 1. Increased and broadened participation, 2. Responsiveness to societal needs and 3. Co-operation and partnership in governance. By being responsive to these factors, higher education contributed to socio-economic development and the empowerment of the vast majority of South Africans. The discussion in Chapter Three has indicated that South African higher education has performed well by formulating relevant and appropriate transformation policies couched in the language of liberalism. However, due to the overwhelming logic of the market, the policies continued to facilitate a limited transformation that met the needs of the global and local markets. It has been indicated in Chapter One that the market logic when translated to the higher education context is perceptible in the commodification of higher education: academic capitalism, the trend to seek funds and forge links with the corporate sector as a way for academics to acquire funds (Slaughter and Leslie, 2001, Bundy, 2005 and Levidow, 2002). In the case of the three centres, commodification is portrayed in the demand placed upon them to acquire external funding to finance part of their operations. The university appears to be shedding its responsibility to advance transformation and social justice by not fully financing the three centres. Instead it is adopting a non-committal approach informed by academic capitalism; consequently, it is apparent that although such transformation is couched in the language of social

3 A political alliance between the ruling party, the African National Congress, the SACP and COSATU.
justice it allows only limited possibilities for advancing radical social justice because it is implemented in a framework of neo-liberalism which in a sense inhibits the right to equal access and participation in higher education.

The possibility for transformation exists in de-commodification of higher education and reinserting of the common good of higher education. This would entail changing the emphasis on economic and the profit motives to that of higher education serving the community. This position is advanced by critical scholars across the world. In sponsoring the three initiates of social justice fully, the university would not exhaust its funds. On the contrary, it would be some form of service to the community and a way of enhancing the public role of higher education.

8.5 The University of Pretoria and Neo-Conservative and Neo-Liberal Ideology

At the University of Pretoria, its inability to shed in total its neo-conservative and liberal institutional culture has been demonstrated. Because culture defines how any institution functions, the manner in which matters operate at the university is greatly influenced by the conservative culture and ideology whose main task is to reproduce and maintain the status quo of white privilege and dominance at the expense of any other cultures, particularly the counter culture reflected in radical social justice. For example, the fact that there was virtually no female senior executive until 2007 when only one woman was appointed at senior executive level is an indication of the dominance of a conservative patriarchal culture. This served to marginalise some of the activities of the centres that aimed to promote social justice because at management level, gender representation was not enshrined. Even if gender parity at management level did exist, as is required by government policy, the overall neo-conservative and liberal institutional culture of the university would still act as a stumbling block to the realisation of radical social justice because the ideological dispositions of the change agents at management level would be informed by liberalism.

Instances educational entrepreneurialism tell part of the story about academic capitalism at the University of Pretoria. (Rhoades and Slaughter 2004) At the strategic level, there are elements of academic entrepreneurialism and cost efficiency inn the tone and content of the Innovation Generation Document. For instance, in 1994, at the dawn of
the democratic dispensation in South Africa, the University of Pretoria was assessed as the best in terms of cost efficiency. This suggested that the university was managing to “do more with less “in the context of governments move to cut funding in higher education and encourage institutions to seek funds for themselves from other sources.

The common challenge that emerged from interview data from the three centres highlighted was limited financial resources as the main element and the fact that the management of the centres have to find ventures of generating money for the running each centre. For instance, at UPFY the director indicated that there are links forged with industry to acquire finding for students at UPFY as the projects goal is to addressed the shortage of labour supply the country with scarce skills in Math’s, Science, Engineering and Technology. In the case of the IWGS, the facilitators indicated that apart from being marginalised from the main faculties, they also had to generate funds from external sponsors and offer gender developmental workshops pitched at market prices. The failure to comply with the demands would lead to their further marginalization and possible extinction. The CSA equally indicated the concern with financial constraints and the challenge of finding means to obtain funds. The common focus on revenue seeking ventures by the three centres indicate that the university is more driven by the profit motif than consideration of issues of gender, HIV/AIDS and access as social responsibility issues for the common good.

The said neo-conservative and liberal ideology has also influenced the roles that the university employees fulfil as academics, administrators and activists. In this regard, a notable characteristic that emerged from the data with reference to the roles of most of the participants from the three centres is the description of their responsibilities in liberal language, for example, references made to “teaching for understanding” and making use of the “constructivist approach to teaching and learning” as opposed to that of radical discourse that would explicitly refer to critical consciousness-raising in the fashion of radical scholars like Freire (2005). Most of them see themselves as technocrats, educating students for their roles in the reproduction of capitalist interests. What is not being developed is the role of university employees as transformative intellectuals, with the mandate of educating the youth to call for better alternatives to neo-liberalism and to transform capitalism. Given that at the University of Pretoria,
particularly at the three centres, there are intellectuals who are not explicit about their own transformatory and emancipatory role, radical social justice will continue to be marginalised. Some of the participants focus on the upliftment of the individual student and are therefore informed by the redistributive paradigm of social justice, while others are more concerned with broader change at macro-level. Showing concern about change is not adequate. In order for radical social justice to be realised, the intellectuals need to further advance their pronounced engagement with issues of transformation toward just alternatives.

The powerful neo-liberal ideology blinds some of the university employees who perceive no alternative to it and are thus paralysed as regards transformation. It was observed that the university had reached saturation regarding change. This observation was made by participants whose framing of social justice is liberal and redistributive in nature; for instance, some facilitators at the IGWS expressed frankly the fact that the university has several policies established and informed by social justice. In this regard, the University of Pretoria has embraced elements of racial equality, gender equality and the eradication of practices of all forms of discrimination and oppression as a reform measure in order to comply with national legislative requirements. Such measures, while important to a limited extent, perpetuate the culture of compliance because they do not interrogate broader socio-economic frames but continue to operate within them. This observation is related to the issue of transformation paralysis that was discussed in chapter one. The sections of the university community that are more likely to identify with the concept of change saturation are those whose ideological position maintains the status quo of the University of Pretoria as a conservative traditional university. For this group of people, their strategy is to resist policy prescriptions that they deem as educationally inappropriate, based on their ideological framework. For example, one facilitator from the IGWS indicated that the centre is performing quite well with reference to addressing gender equality by running gender mainstreaming workshops internally and externally, to the public. I hold the position that the University of Pretoria is far from reaching change saturation: the transformation agenda still needs to be pursued more than ever before because there is a great and urgent need for the institution to consider the discourse of radical humanism and re-position itself in
promoting the public good and thereby be more responsive and relevant to the needs of the multiple and diverse citizens of South Africa, not just the privileged few.

The issue of transformation paralysis is related to the concern that there is a declining voice of criticism within South African higher education, which was raised by one of the foremost scholars in this field, Jansen, in his comment on the dwindling culture of critique in the current state of higher education (Jansen, 2004:11). The voice of criticism is crucial to the very survival of higher education staff members as stalwarts of democracy and protectors of social justice and needs to be revived so that progressive intellectuals can continue to promote the quest for a socially just future. Jansen (2004) further observes that what has replaced the voice of criticism is the voice of complaint. This study concurs with Jansen in advocating that in order to sustain and maintain higher education as relevant to the society at large, there needs to be the revival of critical intellectual engagement at universities.

This study has highlighted the merits and challenges that the three centres face in implementing the three elements of social justice: access, gender equality and alleviation of HIV/AIDS. It has been shown that these centres operate in a context that is informed by globalisation and neo-liberal ideology and that this overarching ideology affects the meaningful promotion of radical social justice as advanced by this study. In conclusion, notwithstanding the magnitude of the challenge of promoting radical social justice in a context that is opposed to it, the three centres through their substantive engagement policy can make a meaningful contribution to the enhancement of the said elements of social justice. In this process, they would be contributing to a more inclusive, equitable, respectful and tolerant society, informed by the latter.

Furthermore, the possibilities for transformation are contained in the existence of human agency. In analyzing the possible incidence of human agency in the three centres under study the following observations are pertinent. Given that from the point of view of critical theory, human agency broadly implies collective action for the collective good, there was evidence of two dominant points of view. The first was that the centres had little if any potential for agency. This was linked to the perception that change and agency for change were intimately connected to resources, financial, administrative and
executive resources. Arguably this may be associated with the hierarchical structuring of the University and the neo liberal interpretation of agency which posits that change is possible through resources and executive mandate for change. Included in this position was that the centre had reached change saturation given policy compliance at the institutional level.

The second is the belief that the centre has potential for agency. This was evidenced in the suggestion that union involvement in the centre would be beneficial to the centre and that the power of the union could be used as leverage for change. Another example was the argument, in this instance in UPFY, was the call to de mystify the teaching of science. Underpinning this call was the belief that demystification would make learning more accessible to a wider group of students and this would change the perception that science was difficult and available only to a few.

8.6 Policy, Implications and Lessons

Social justice in the South African context is driven by the new democratic state but it is highly contested in principle and practice. There is a clear divide between rhetoric and practice. On the face of it, social justice is symbolic and appears to fulfil some aspects of the radical social justice agenda, but at the level of implementation is translated as an extension of neo-liberal reality.

At the University of Pretoria, the commitment to social justice is pronounced, reflected in policy documents and translated by the three centres studied. However, owing to the university’s conservative institutional culture and its alignment with market ideology, social justice in the radical sense is marginalised. This result is evident in the sense that while the three centres play an important role (people who are likely to access them are disadvantaged or marginalised) this stands a chance of perpetuating social injustices for as long as the territorial core is informed by the conservative neo-liberal agenda. Only concerted efforts at mainstreaming these important social justice initiatives will bring the three major issues of such justice to the fore. That is, the university needs to build it into the curriculum and make it integral to the process of learning and teaching. This strategy could first be piloted at the centres and then be integrated at institutional level.
The process of mainstreaming these initiatives might take some time; in the meantime, the three initiatives exist as pockets of social justice and need to be sustained. Even though they appear to be isolated, their merit lies in advancing elements of social justice in a context that is hostile to it. In these three centres, there exist voices of resistance which adopt a counter-hegemonic stance that needs to be nurtured so that it can reclaim its space, advance radical social justice and thus contribute to the liberation and emancipation of higher education for democratic purposes. This would be in line with critical theory, particularly the interrogation of traditional assumptions that underlie conceptions of social injustices. That is, the culture of critiquing late capitalism with the purpose of humanising it and advancing justice of this type. Although these counter-hegemonic voices are isolated, they are valuable and useful towards constructing justice of this nature. In other words, while the creation of radical social justice often occurs in a hostile context, part of the solution lies in concerted efforts at harnessing the non-hostile voices in this context, no matter how far they may be from actually implementing radical social justice. The study posits that radical social justice knows no national or cultural borders; it is a global concern that may lead to a more informed and reflective transformative agenda.

As argued above, the current context of advanced capitalism characterised by globalisation and informed by a neo-liberal agenda is hostile to radical social justice. Despite this state of affairs, in this study, I advance the view that radical social justice is still the way forward to effect change towards a more humane, inclusive and democratic socio-economic dispensation. Neo-liberalism and economic rationalism is a policy for the present, and not for the future. At an educational policy level, I suggest that the radical social justice discourse needs to be revitalised and signified at all levels of the policy cycle. In radical social justice are found both the theory and the practice of a critique of the status quo, which constitute an important strategy for counteracting complacency, one-dimensionality and global injustices which result from neo-liberal discourses. The culture of critique is an element of radical social justice and an important function of intellectuals in higher education. Therefore, the nurturing of a revitalised radical social justice agenda is a matter of urgency in the current context of higher education in South Africa.