



**How inclusive education is understood  
by principals of independent schools**

by

**Jennifer Gous**

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree

**Philosophiae Doctor**

at the

Department of Education Management and Policy Studies  
Faculty of Education  
University of Pretoria

**Supervisor:**

Professor Dr Irma Eloff

PRETORIA  
2009



UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA  
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA  
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

**For my mother and father  
Catherine and Monty Gous  
and my aunt  
Des Oldfield**



By focusing on the ruins of history  
and the fragmentation of agreed upon meaning,  
we move against a victory narrative couched in the  
very conquering optimism that has lost its credibility,  
and toward some sense of what it means  
to use the now-time of a crisis of otherness  
to struggle toward a more just society.

Patti Lather



A thesis might be one's own work with many hours spent at a desk but without the support and encouragement of those around one, the task would be that much more difficult. For this reason I wish to say a heartfelt and warm thank you to the following people for supporting me through this process. To the following:

- My friends, family and colleagues who have supported me throughout the writing of this thesis. Their continuous interest in my research has been an indication of their care and love for me.
- The School Council and staff at The Key School for Specialised Education (Autism) for being generous in granting me study leave when I needed it most.
- The friends who proofread sections of my thesis to make sure that it was coherent and comprehensible – Liz Spann, Heather Drage and Jane Bird.
- My supervisor Prof Irma Eloff, a truly sanctified 'mensch' whose depth of wisdom, welcoming spirit, refreshing sense of humour, deep academic insight, valued guidance, and gracious support sustained me through the years of writing this thesis. I could not have wished for a better mentor.
- Professor Juan Bornman and Dr Suzanne Bester for being the critical readers of my proposal.
- Professor Jonathan Jansen, Dr Chaya Herman and Dr Venitha Pillay who gave me the opportunity to study as a PhD student at the University of Pretoria.
- The librarians and especially Clarisse Venter at the University of Pretoria who gave me endlessly efficient and willing help with sourcing materials, articles, books and journals.
- The Oppenheimer Memorial Trust for their generous grant of R50 000 to make this study possible.
- My kitty Muffin who kept me company at my desk for many hours and who occasionally made her own contribution by walking across my keyboard.
- Liz who accommodated my days in my study and who developed and illustrated the quilt design for my major findings.
- Jane who gave me insight into quilts.
- Adrie van Dyk for being my expert technical reader and thesis 'designer'.
- The Rabbi with whom I had an enlightening conversation on community.



- The informal discussion I had with Dr Melody Hougaard regarding the inclusive process in South Africa.
- My examiners who gave me unexpected and caring support in their thoughtful analyses and comments.
- My participants whose knowledge and experiences were readily and generously shared with me. This study would not have been possible without their input and I am deeply grateful to them for being willing participants and co-authors.
- To the One who has been beside me throughout the process, who took me to depths where I found the unsearchable and where I learnt a little more about who I am, I thank you.

---oOo---



I declare that the thesis which I hereby submit for the degree Philosophiae Doctor in Education Policy and Management Studies at the University of Pretoria, is my own work and has not previously been submitted by me for a degree at this or any other tertiary institution

---

**Jennifer Gous**

Signed on the \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_ 2010  
Johannesburg  
South Africa

---oOo---

In recognition that every child matters, inclusive education has become a practice that has been adopted by many schools across the globe and most usually in first world countries. As a whole-school system it occurs less frequently in developing countries including South Africa which, unlike many developing countries, has a sound infrastructure and many excellent schools in both the state and the independent sectors. 'Education White Paper 6: Special education: Building an inclusive education and training system' was published in 2001 with the express intention of developing an inclusive education system in South Africa. Some independent schools have successfully implemented exemplary forms of inclusion in their schools and this is the phenomenon that has been studied by focusing on the understandings and experiences of the principals. As the researcher I interviewed eight principals who are practicing inclusive education as the norm in their schools. This study reveals various aspects of the inclusive process including the pivotal role that principals play in the transformation process of which inclusive education is the harbinger. It also analyses why principals choose to embrace a paradigm that on the surface is uncomfortable and not an easy option. I used biographical narrative research as methodology for this qualitative research and crystallisation as quality strategy in order to study the phenomenon that is the understandings of principals of independent schools of inclusive education. The basic tenet was that inclusion leads to belonging and excellence in education. The major findings and implications for action are of interest not only to principals, but to anyone who is seriously interested in innovative and more humane forms of anti-oppressive education.

---oOo---



biographical narrative research  
children with disabilities  
cognitive disability  
crystallisation  
disability  
exclusion  
inclusion  
inclusive education  
inclusivity  
integration  
mainstream  
segregation  
social justice  
special needs

### Words used singly or in combination in electronic searches

---

attitudes	marginalisation
disability	othering
exclusion	perceptions
feminism	principals
gender	queer theory
hidden	science
inclusion	silence
inclusive education	special needs
independent schools	special schools
leadership	voice





ASD	Autistic Spectrum Disorders
CAAC	Centre for Alternative and Augmentative Communication, University of Pretoria
DoE	Department of Education
ECD	Early Childhood Development
EFA	Education for All
EWP6	Education White Paper 6 on Special Needs Education: Building an Inclusive Education and Training System
FET	Further Education and Training
GETC	General Education Training Certificate
IE	Inclusive Education
IEP	Individual Education Plan/Programme
ISASA	Independent Schools Association of South Africa
MVA	Motor Vehicle Accident
SAALD	South African Association for Learning and Educational Difficulties
SENCO	Special Educational Needs Coordinator
TEFL	Teaching English as a Foreign Language
WP6	Education White Paper 6 on Special Needs Education: Building an Inclusive Education and Training System



---

	Page
Abstract .....	i
Key terms .....	ii
Words used singly or in combination in electronic searches .....	ii
Acronyms .....	iii
<b>Chapter 1</b>	
<b>Introduction and orientation</b>	
<b>1.1 INTRODUCTION TO THE STUDY .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1.2 INTRODUCTION TO THE RESEARCH PROBLEM AND PURPOSE .....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>1.3 GENERAL AREA UNDER STUDY .....</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>1.4 PROBLEM STATEMENT .....</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>1.5 MY SPECIFIC STUDY .....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>1.6 PURPOSE OF THE STUDY .....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>1.7 WHY INCLUSIVE EDUCATION? .....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>1.8 WHY THE FOCUS ON PRINCIPALS? .....</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>1.9 WHY THE FOCUS ON INDEPENDENT SCHOOLS? .....</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>1.10 INCLUSIVE EDUCATION IN INDEPENDENT SCHOOLS .....</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>1.11 HOW I CAME TO DO THIS STUDY? .....</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>1.12 PURPOSE STATEMENT .....</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>1.13 RESEARCH QUESTIONS .....</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>1.14 CONCLUSION .....</b>	<b>21</b>



## Chapter 2

### The literature review

<b>2.1</b>	<b>INTRODUCTION</b>	23
<b>2.2</b>	<b>THE CHALLENGE OF INCLUSIVE EDUCATION</b>	23
<b>2.3</b>	<b>TYPES OF INCLUSION</b>	27
<b>2.4</b>	<b>INTERROGATING THE KNOWLEDGE BASE ON INCLUSIVE EDUCATION</b>	33
2.4.1	DEFINITION OF INCLUSIVE EDUCATION	33
2.4.2	INCLUSION AS A BROADER SOCIAL ISSUE	38
2.4.3	LOCATION OF THE PROBLEM	39
2.4.4	IDENTITY AND LEARNING	43
2.4.5	PROBLEMATISING NORMALISATION AND DEVIATION	43
2.4.6	VOICES FALLING ON DEAF EARS	45
2.4.7	EXPLORING OTHERNESS	48
2.4.8	PRINCIPALS AS AGENTS OF CHANGE	50
2.4.9	THE BIAS OF THE EDUCATIONAL CHANGE LITERATURE	53
2.4.10	FEMINIST RESEARCH	54
<b>2.5</b>	<b>SUMMARISING THE LITERATURE ON INCLUSIVE EDUCATION</b>	57



## Chapter 3 Explaining the methodology

<b>3.1</b>	<b>INTRODUCTION</b>	58
<b>3.2</b>	<b>CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK</b>	58
<b>3.3</b>	<b>RESEARCH DESIGN</b>	62
3.3.1	RESEARCH AIM	62
3.3.2	RESEARCH PARADIGM	62
3.3.3	RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	64
3.3.4	DATA COLLECTION METHODS	68
3.3.5	INDIVIDUAL INTERVIEWS	69
3.3.6	DIRECT OBSERVATION	71
3.3.7	TAKING FIELD NOTES	71
3.3.8	DOCUMENT ANALYSIS	72
3.3.9	APPROACH TO COLLECTION OF DATA	72
3.3.10	BRINGING THE DATA SOURCES TOGETHER	73
3.3.11	RESEARCH DIARY	73
3.3.12	DATA ANALYSIS	74
3.3.13	VALIDATION STRATEGIES	75
	3.3.13.1 Crystallisation	75
	3.3.13.2 Participant validation	76
	3.3.13.3 Peer review	76
	3.3.13.4 Rich (thick) description	76
	3.3.13.5 Interpretive explanation	77
3.3.14	LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY	77
3.3.15	STRENGTHS OF THE STUDY	78
3.3.16	ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS	78



## Chapter 4 Presenting the data

<b>4.1</b>	<b>INTRODUCTION</b> .....	80
<b>4.2</b>	<b>THE PARTICIPANTS</b> .....	80
4.2.1	DEMOGRAPHIC DESCRIPTION OF PARTICIPANTS .....	81
4.2.2	THE SETTINGS .....	83
<b>4.3</b>	<b>EMBRACING AN ARTISTIC GENRE</b> .....	86
<b>4.4</b>	<b>HOW IT ALL BEGAN...</b> .....	88
<b>4.5</b>	<b>TYPES OF DISABILITIES ACCOMMODATED IN SCHOOLS</b> .....	90
<b>4.6</b>	<b>MAJOR FINDINGS AS DERIVED FROM THE THEMES</b> .....	92
4.6.1	INCLUSION IS PERSONAL .....	93
4.6.2	IT'S ABOUT TAKING ACTION .....	110
4.6.3	IT'S PRAGMATIC .....	122
4.6.4	IT'S ABOUT OUR HUMANITY .....	163
4.6.5	IT'S ABOUT EMOTION .....	181
<b>4.7</b>	<b>CAVEATS TO INCLUSION</b> .....	187
4.7.1	GOVERNMENT INVOLVEMENT .....	187
4.7.2	TIMING .....	188
4.7.3	HARD WORK AND EFFORT .....	190
4.7.4	FUNDING ISSUES .....	191



## Chapter 5 Overview, Findings and Recommendations

<b>5.1</b>	<b>INTRODUCTION</b>	197
<b>5.2</b>	<b>SUMMARY OF THE STUDY</b>	197
<b>5.3</b>	<b>OVERVIEW OF THE PROBLEM</b>	200
5.3.1	PURPOSE STATEMENT AND RESEARCH QUESTIONS	200
5.3.2	REVIEW OF THE METHODOLOGY	201
5.3.3	CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK	202
<b>5.4</b>	<b>FINDINGS RELATED TO THE LITERATURE</b>	211
5.4.1	POLICY	211
5.4.2	TYPES OF INCLUSION PRACTICED	212
5.4.3	INDEPENDENT SCHOOLS LEADING THE WAY	214
5.4.4	RESTRUCTURING A SCHOOL SYSTEM	216
5.4.5	CHECKING WEBSITES AGAINST THE DATA	225
<b>5.5</b>	<b>SURPRISES</b>	227
<b>5.6</b>	<b>CONCLUSIONS</b>	232
5.6.1	IMPLICATIONS FOR ACTION	232
5.6.2	RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH	233
<b>5.7</b>	<b>CONCLUDING REMARKS</b>	233
	Endnotes	236
	References	238
	Additional References	253



## List of Graphics

---

Graphic 1	Traditional teaching method.....	32
Graphic 2	Accelerated learning as a result of a sense of belonging.....	32

## List of Figures

---

Figure 1	Matrix One: Curricular and assessment specifications.....	59
Figure 2	Matrix Two: Curricular expectations.....	60
Figure 3	Matrix Three.....	61

## List of Tables, Map and Diagram

---

Table 1	Personal details of participants.....	82
Table 2	Length of interviews.....	85
Table 3	How the concept of inclusive education is defined by the principals.....	88
Table 4	Types of disabilities and amount of support needed in the schools.....	91
Table 5	Details regarding number of paid support staff.....	137
Table 6	Types of adaptations.....	142
Table 7	Degree of inclusion taking place in each school.....	143
Table 8	Types of inclusion (as harvested from the literature) being practiced.....	212
Map 1	The Provinces of South Africa.....	64
Diagram 1	Bird's eye view of major findings.....	92



APPENDIX A	
Excerpts from the Salamanca and Dakar Statements .....	260
APPENDIX B	
Maslow's 'hierarchy of needs' .....	261
APPENDIX C	
Excerpt from White Paper 6 .....	263
APPENDIX D	
How the interview questions were formulated .....	264
APPENDIX E	
Excerpt from research diary .....	266
APPENDIX F	
Ethical clearance certificate .....	268
APPENDIX G	
Round Square Schools .....	269
APPENDIX H	
The Klingenstein Centre .....	270
APPENDIX I	
Excerpts from websites .....	271