

Towards a conceptual framework for understanding the implementation of Internet-based self-service technology

by

Thavandren Ramsamy Naidoo

BCom(Natal), BComHons(Unisa), BComHons(Wits),
MCom(Wits), PDipMkt(IMM)

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

Philosophiae Doctor (Information Technology)

in the Faculty of Engineering, Built Environment and Information Technology

at the

University of Pretoria

Towards a conceptual framework for understanding the implementation of Internet-based self-service technology

ABSTRACT

CANDIDATE: Thavandren Ramsamy Naidoo

PROMOTER: Prof A C Leonard

DEPARTMENT: School of Information Technology

DEGREE: Philosophiae Doctor (Information Technology)

KEYWORDS: e-commerce, e-service, Internet, ICT, self-service technology, implementation, actor-network theory, structuration theory, consumer-driven healthcare

In the past decade, there has been rampant growth in healthcare service delivery options, based on the Internet and related information and communication technology. As a result, there is a great deal of expectation among national governments, regulators, healthcare organisations, and other stakeholders about the role of the Internet in healthcare service provision. Given the global crisis in healthcare services generally and the funding of healthcare services specifically, a number of policymakers view the advances in Internet-based self-service technology as a potential enabler of more efficient and effective healthcare service delivery. Proponents of consumer-driven healthcare in particular who seek to use the Internet to make consumers more informed about healthcare funding decisions and to reduce the cost of servicing consumers have been actively experimenting in this area. Despite the accelerating growth in the deployment of Internet-based self-service technologies, their protracted uptake by users is giving rise to concerns about the effectiveness of the implementation and acceptance of these contemporary forms of service delivery. Furthermore, little is known about how the social healthcare context shapes Internet-based self-service technology implementations.

This thesis presents an in-depth qualitative case study that documents a healthcare insurer's efforts to implement an online self-service technology for the period 1999 to 2005. A research

framework was adopted that draws on key theoretical concepts from structuration and actor-network theory (ANT) to link the social context to implementation processes. These two conceptual lenses, which are compatible with the thesis's interpretive stance, reveal several new insights, confirming that the challenges associated with the implementation of information system innovations such as Internet-based self-service technologies cannot be understood in isolation. From a structuration perspective analysing the various enactments of self-service provision of healthcare afforded a deeper understanding of how social practices influence the design and use of the technology. From an ANT perspective, the study showed how the major translations in the design and use of the self-service technology emerged from a process where technological and social elements co-evolved. This study also reveals that the implementation problems and opportunities facing this particular healthcare insurance organisation were historical and systemic. This approach demonstrates that the complex interdependencies and interactions among contrasting social, political, economic and technological issues shaped the contemporary channel as it exists today and therefore advances theory in yet another important way.

Using the insights obtained from these two theories, a conceptual framework was derived. The conceptual framework demonstrates that in order to develop a comprehensive understanding of Internet-based self-service technology implementation, such an analysis must incorporate the interconnectedness of four perspectives – meaning, process, context and the technology artefact – and their respective conceptual elements from both structuration and actor-network theory. Future studies attempting to deepen our understanding of information systems implementation can also provide constructive insights by focusing on the interdependent, interconnected and historical nature of the implementation phenomenon. Some important practical applications for future self-service technology implementations are also discussed.

I declare that

Towards a conceptual framework for understanding the implementation of Internet-based self-service technology

is my own work and that all sources that I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references

Thavandren Ramsamy Naidoo



DEDICATION

To my partner *Losh* and our children *Shiven* and *Veshni*

In memory of my father *Ramsamy (Siva) Naidoo*

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am deeply indebted to a number of people for their help and generous support over the past five years. I would like to thank especially the following people:

Firstly, I would like to thank my promoter, Professor A. C. Leonard for his insight and guidance. His vast experience, knowledge and ability to stimulate the development of ideas were invaluable. To Dr. Elaine Byrne who helped me package and position the essence of my argument. To the Department of Informatics staff, especially Professor Carina De Villiers, at the University of Pretoria who urged me 'to start writing', a huge thank you. To Professor Roode and Professor Introna, thank you for challenging my worldview and for introducing me to the world of Interpretivism.

My gratitude also extends to the members of the SST's management and implementation team and related business areas whose direct contribution to this study during trying times, made this research possible. To all the researchers that I have referenced and corresponded with, especially to those on Actor-Network theory, Structuration theory, IS implementation and Self-service technology who paved the way for me (I feel like I have stood on the shoulders on giants), many thanks.

My partner Losh, my son Shiven, daughter Veshni have been helpful at all times and accepted my absence when duty to the work at hand called. I value their love and support immensely.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of tables	viii
List of figures	ix
List of maps and photographs	xi
List of common abbreviations	xii
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
Chapter 2: Research Methodology and Case Selection	11
Chapter 3: Literature Review	39
Chapter 4: Structuration Theory and Actor-Network Theory as Conceptual Frameworks for Analysis	88
Chapter 5: Background to the Healthcare Insurance Context	133
Chapter 6: Empirical Investigation into the Implementation of an Internet-based Self-service Technology at a Healthcare Insurance Firm	177
Chapter 7: Interpretation of the Case Study: A Structuration Perspective ...	240
Chapter 8: Interpretation of the Case Study: An Actor-Network Theory Perspective	301
Chapter 9: A Four Perspective Framework for Understanding Internet-based Self-service Technology Implementation	355
Chapter 10: Conclusions and Evaluation of Contribution.....	375
References	393
Appendices	423

List of Tables

Table 2.1: Summary of interpretive field research principles	26
Table 2.2: Guidelines for undertaking case study research	27
Table 2.3: Sources of empirical evidence	31
Table 2.4: Summary of interviews conducted with design team	33
Table 2.5: Summary of the research design decisions	38
Table 4.1: The social context of SST implementation: An initial synthesised analytical framework using structuration theory	103
Table 4.2: The social context of SST implementation: An initial synthesised analytical framework using actor-network theory	121
Table 5.1: Summary of key global health statistics	137
Table 5.2: Racial inequalities	141
Table 5.3: Examples of Web-style commerce	165
Table 5.4: Internet access in South Africa, 2004	170
Table 5.5: South Africa's Internet connectivity ranking	170
Table 5.6: Comparison of computer literacy rating	172
Table 5.7: Distribution of home languages in South Africa	173
Table 6.1: Average service levels achieved in relation to client interaction	195
Table 6.2: Summary of key user characteristics	229
Table 7.1: Contrasting structures of signification	246
Table 7.2: Structures rules and resources that influenced or were influenced by the implementation	252
Table 7.3: Designers technology-in-practice	254
Table 7.4: Summary of key theoretical concepts and illustrations from the study	297
Table 9.1: Applying the four perspectives of the unitary IS implementation conceptual model	371
Table 10.1: Some key examples of compliance to the Atkins and Sampson (2002) guidelines for undertaking case study research	387
Table A1: Constraining influences in the implementation of the Internet-based self-service technology	424
Table C1: Detail record of interviews conducted	431
Table C2: Detail inventory of documentation	434

List of Figures

Figure 1.1: Structure of the thesis	10
Figure 2.1: A snapshot of a conceptual network with nodes of memos and quotes	35
Figure 3.1: Conceptualisation of an online self-service technology	42
Figure 3.2: Communication techniques that shape service levels	44
Figure 3.3: A framework for understanding organisational change	51
Figure 3.4: Aspects of the research problem	54
Figure 3.5: Internet-based SST infrastructure components	63
Figure 3.6: Market exchanges: traditional and reverse	69
Figure 3.7: Continuum of SST and relationship complementarity	71
Figure 3.8: The nature of the relations between firms contemplating B2B implementation	75
Figure 4.1: The stratification model of the agent	93
Figure 4.2: The dimensions of the duality of structure	97
Figure 4.3: Extended enactment of technologies-in-practice model	103
Figure 4.4: ANT process model for SST implementation	122
Figure 4.5: The four moments of translation	124
Figure 5.1: The multiple stakeholders in a health system	143
Figure 6.1: UAG's structure	179
Figure 6.2: Staff productivity as indicator of administration efficiency	187
Figure 6.3: Growth in reserve requirements	187
Figure 6.4: HIC's rapid health membership growth	192
Figure 6.5: WSC's rapid Wellness program membership growth	194
Figure 6.6: eHIC's organisational structure	205
Figure 6.7: eHIC awareness levels by media type	212
Figure 6.8: UAG's servicing architecture – An integrated channel perspective	219
Figure 6.9: eHIC's landing page (2003 website redesign)	222
Figure 6.10: eHIC access at home and work	224
Figure 6.11: eHIC's online user registration growth	228
Figure 6.12: Leaky bucket syndrome – losing users over time	230
Figure 6.13: Proposed systems organisation restructure	233
Figure 6.14: Series of key events in the evolution of eHIC	238

Figure 7.1: Self-service technology in practice – shifting enactments by designers	243
Figure 7.2: eHIC’s e-service model for members	248
Figure 7.3: Consumer driven healthcare – shifting rhetoric of customer relations and interactions	249
Figure 7.4: Linkages with customers in the context of traditional and novel channels	258
Figure 7.5: Sample membership card	259
Figure 7.6: Self-service technology in practice – enactments by users as social actors	277
Figure 7.7: Self-service technology in practice – size representation of user segments	282
Figure 7.8: Staff profile of racial groups	294
Figure 8.1: Self-service technology in practice – shifting translations by designers	303
Figure 9.1: The four perspectives of SST implementation	363
Figure 9.2: A unitary model of IS implementation	370
Figure C1: Exploring conceptual level structures using networks representations	439
Figure D1: User profiling using calls and claims frequency	440
Figure D2: Major call reason categories	441
Figure D3: Profile grid of user base by call and login patterns	441
Figure D4: Login trend by day of the week	442

List of Maps and Photographs

Map 5.1: Map of South Africa	138
Photo 6.1: HIC located in commercial high rise city centre	185
Photo 6.2: A sprawling township located less than 10 km from HIC's offices	185
Photo 6.3: The office space structure at HIC	211
Photo 7.1: Some reasons for tapering usage at a workshop	265
Photo 7.2: The many faces of the H-World user	275



List of Common Acronyms and Initialisms

ANT	Actor-network theory
API	Application programming interface
ATG	Applied Technology Group
ATB	Above-threshold benefit
B2B	Business to business
B2C	Business to consumer
BA	Business analyst
BBEE	Broad-based black economic empowerment
BEE	Black economic empowerment
BHC*	British Healthcare Company
BPR	Business process re-engineering
CASE	Computer-aided software engineering
CDH	Consumer-driven healthcare
CIO	Chief information officer
CMS	Council for the Medical Schemes
COO	Chief operating officer
CPI	Consumer Price Index
CRM	Customer relationship management
D2C	Direct to consumer
EDI	Electronic data interchange
eHIC *	The e-commerce subsidiary of United Assurance Group
ERP	Enterprise resource planning
FAQs	Frequently asked questions
FSG*	Financial Services Group
HAS	Health savings account



HIC*	Health Insurance Company
HISO	Health International Services Organisation
HMO	Health Maintenance Organisation
HR	Human resources
H-World*	Health World (which was the initial brand name of the website)
ICT	Information and communication technology
IJVP*	International joint venture partner
IS	Information systems
IT	Information technology
JSE	Johannesburg Stock Exchange
JV	Joint venture
LAC*	Life Assurance Company
LIMS	Low income medical scheme
MSA	Medical saving account
NHS	National Health Service (UK)
NCSS	Network-based customer service system
OCR	Optical character recognition
OO	Object oriented
OPP	Obligatory passage point
PDA	Personal digital assistant
PPO	Preferred provider option
R	South African rand (currency)
SBU	Strategic business unit
SDLC	Systems development lifecycle
SMS	Short message service
SOA	Service-oriented architecture



SPG	Self-payment gap
SST	Self-service technology
ST	Structuration theory
TAM	Technology acceptance model
TR	Technology readiness
TRA	Theory of reasoned action
UAG*	United Assurance Group
USHC*	United States Healthcare Company
VPN	Virtual private network
WAP	Wireless application protocol
WHO	World Health Organisation
WSC*	Wellness Science Company

* Refers to anonyms chosen to preserve the confidentiality of the identities of the organisations involved.