THE INFORMATION AUDIT: PRINCIPLES AND GUIDELINES

by

Hannerí Botha

In fulfilment of the requirements for the degree M.BIBL.

in the Faculty of Humanities

University of Pretoria, PRETORIA

October 2000
TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF FIGURES, TABLES AND ADDENDUMS V

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS VI

SUMMARY VII

SAMEVATTING IX

CHAPTER 1: BACKGROUND TO THE RESEARCH 1

1. Introduction 1

2. Problem and context 1
   2.1 What gives rise to the problem? 1
   2.2 Statement of problem/Purpose of the study 2
   2.3 Sub-problems 3
   2.4 Necessity for finding a solution to the problem 3
   2.5 Defining the boundaries of the study terrain 3
   2.6 Definitions of key terms 4
      2.6.1 Information audit 4
      2.6.2 Financial audit 4
      2.6.3 Information mapping 4
      2.6.4 Communication audit 4
   2.7 Assumptions made 5
   2.8 The contribution of this study to the solution of the problem 5

3. An overview of the current state of research on the topic 5
   3.1 Nature of theory and research 5
   3.2 Main findings from the literature 6
   3.3 Conclusions/proposals from the literature 7
   3.4 Motivation from the literature for the continuation of the research 7

4. Methodology 7

5. Structuring of chapters 7

CHAPTER 2: THE FINANCIAL AUDIT 8

Chapter 2: Overview 8

1. Introduction 8

2. Definitions of key terms 8

3. Auditing: A historical overview 8
   3.1 The history and origins of auditing 8

4. The nature and objectives of an audit 9
   4.1 The nature of auditing 9
      4.1.1 Independent/external/financial auditing 10
      4.1.2 Internal auditing 10
      4.1.3 Governmental auditing 11
      4.1.4 Operational auditing 11
      4.1.5 Management auditing 13
      4.1.6 Comprehensive auditing 13
      4.1.7 Other audits 13
4.2  The objectives of an audit
   4.2.1  Major objectives of an audit  
   4.2.2  Secondary objectives and advantages of an audit  
   4.2.3  Other advantages  
4.3  The scope of an audit  
4.4  Classes of audits

5.  The auditing process
   5.1  Procedures and activities that make up the auditing process
      5.1.1  Pre-engagement activities
      5.1.2  Planning
      5.1.3  Compliance and substantive procedures
      5.1.4  Evaluating, concluding and reporting
   5.2  Different approaches to the auditing process
   5.3  Common auditing activities

6.  The auditing profession and the professional auditor
   6.1  Qualifications
   6.2  The auditor's responsibilities
      6.2.1  Reports his opinion
      6.2.2  Conducts the audit with due professional care and competence
      6.2.3  Maintains an independent mental attitude
      6.2.4  Reports on material irregularities
      6.2.5  Detects and reports illegal acts, other irregularities and errors
      6.2.6  Registers with the PAAB (Public Accountants' and Auditors' Board)
      6.2.7  Adheres to code of conduct

7.  Auditing and accounting standards
   7.1  Auditing standards
   7.2  Accounting standards
   7.3  Quality control
      7.3.1  The South African situation
      7.3.2  The international scene

8.  Conclusion


Chapter 3: Overview

1.  Introduction
   1.1  Communication audit
   1.2  Information mapping
      1.2.1  Fields; Chance
      1.2.2  Burk & Horton
      1.2.3  Underwood
      1.2.4  Best
      1.2.5  Cousins
      1.2.6  Posch
   1.3  Information systems audit
   1.4  Knowledge audit
   1.5  Intelligence audit

2.  The different types of audits: Methodologies
   2.1  Communication audit
      2.1.1  Cortez & Bunge
      2.1.2  Downs
      2.1.3  Ferguson & Ferguson
   2.2  Information mapping
CHAPTER 4: THE INFORMATION AUDIT – AN OVERVIEW

Chapter 4: Overview

1. Introduction

2. Definition: Information audit
   2.1 “What an information audit is not”
   2.2 Working definition: Information audit

3. The aim of an information audit

4. Benefits of an information audit
   4.1 Benefits according to Downs
      4.1.1 Validity benefit
      4.1.2 Diagnostic benefit
      4.1.3 Feedback benefit
      4.1.4 Information benefit
      4.1.5 Training benefit
   4.2 Benefits according to Underwood
   4.3 Specific benefits: Case studies

5. The value of information
   5.1 Information as a resource
   5.2 Determining the value of information

6. The role of the information audit in the information management process
   6.1 Definition: Information management
   6.2 The need for information management: Typical information problems
   6.3 Information auditing and information management
      6.3.1 The functions of information management
      6.3.2 Different perspectives from the literature
      6.3.3 The role of the information audit in the information management process: A practical example

7. Conclusion

CHAPTER 5: INFORMATION AUDIT METHODOLOGIES

Chapter 5: Overview

1. Introduction

2. Different approaches to information auditing
   2.1 Cost-benefit methodologies
   2.2 Geographical methodologies
   2.3 Hybrid methodologies
   2.4 Management information methodologies
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>Operational advisory methodologies</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>Compliance, advisory and inventory-oriented audits</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Barker</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Hamilton</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Alderson</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>De Vaal &amp; Du Toit</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>Dubois</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>Eddison</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>Gibson</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>Jurek</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>LaRosa</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.10</td>
<td>Lubbe &amp; Boon</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.11</td>
<td>Quinn</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.12</td>
<td>Riley</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.13</td>
<td>Robertson</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.14</td>
<td>St Clair</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.15</td>
<td>Stanat</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.16</td>
<td>Swash</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.17</td>
<td>Webb</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.18</td>
<td>Worlock</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.19</td>
<td>Booth &amp; Haines</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.20</td>
<td>Orna</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.21</td>
<td>Haynes</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.22</td>
<td>Buchanan &amp; Gibb</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Other information audit applications
   4.1 O’Flaherty: Information user audit
   4.2 EARL: Information needs assessment
   4.3 Lewington: Information needs assessment
   4.4 Evan-Wong: Practical case study

5. Comparison of different information audit methodologies
   5.1 Operational advisory audits
   5.2 Geographical audits
   5.3 Cost-benefit approach
   5.4 Hybrid approach
      5.4.1 Operational advisory approach and geographical approach
      5.4.2 Operational advisory approach and cost-benefit approach

CHAPTER 6: CONCLUSION

Chapter 6: Overview

1. Introduction
   128

2. The information audit
   2.1 The need for an information audit
   2.2 The main aims of an information audit
   2.3 Lack of standardisation
   2.4 A standardised information audit methodology

3. Financial auditing versus information auditing
   130

4. Guidelines for information auditing
   136

5. The future of information auditing
   137

BIBLIOGRAPHY
   140
# LIST OF FIGURES, TABLES AND ADDENDUMS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure/Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TABLE 2-1</td>
<td>TYPICAL RESPONSIBILITIES OF AUDITORS</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE 2-2</td>
<td>OVERALL APPROACH TO AN OPERATIONAL AUDIT</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE 2-3</td>
<td>“METHODOLOGY” FOR A “TYPICAL” COMPLIANCE AUDIT</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIGURE 1</td>
<td>SCHEMATIC OF COMMUNICATION AUDIT</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIGURE 2</td>
<td>HORN’S METHOD OF INFORMATION MAPPING</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIGURE 3</td>
<td>CIRCLE CHART: THE FOUR BASIC STEPS IN INVENTING OPTIONS</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE 5-1</td>
<td>INTERNAL VS. EXTERNAL INFORMATION SOURCES</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE 6-1</td>
<td>FINANCIAL VERSUS INFORMATION AUDITING</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE 6-2</td>
<td>WHAT INFORMATION PROFESSIONALS CAN LEARN FROM FINANCIAL AUDITS</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE 6-3</td>
<td>AN OVERVIEW OF THE TYPICAL CONTENTS OF THE ACTIVE WORKING PAPERS OF AN AUDITOR</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADDENDUM A</td>
<td>THE SOUTH AFRICAN INSTITUTE OF CHARTERED ACCOUNTANTS STATEMENTS ON AUDITING STANDARDS</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADDENDUM B</td>
<td>ASSURING THE QUALITY OF AUDIT AND RELATED SERVICES</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADDENDUM C</td>
<td>EXAMPLE OF A USER MATRIX</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADDENDUM D</td>
<td>EXAMPLE OF AN INFOMAP</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADDENDUM E</td>
<td>QUESTIONNAIRE</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADDENDUM F</td>
<td>INTERVIEW QUESTIONS</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADDENDUM G</td>
<td>BASIC ELEMENTS OF A SAMPLE QUESTIONNAIRE</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to extend my gratitude towards the following persons and institutions:

• My study leader, prof. J.A. Boon, for his contribution towards this research.

• The NRF for the bursary that was awarded to me. The financial assistance enabled me to conduct this research.

• My family: my father, mother and two sisters for their invaluable emotional support.
SUMMARY

The information audit: principles and guidelines

by

Hannerí Botha

Study leader: Prof. J.A. Boon
Department of Information Science
M.Bibl.

Auditing is a recognised management technique. It provides managers with an overview of the present situation regarding specific resource(s) and services within an organisation.

Many different types of audits currently exist in the commercial world. Over the last number of years the focus of audits has shifted from a purely financial one to an interest in all activities performed in organisations, including information resources.

Currently, as far as the researcher could determine, there exists no single accepted methodology for performing an information audit. Methodologies differ from organisation to organisation, depending on the purpose of the specific audit. In view of this the researcher investigates whether it is possible (and desirable) to develop a standardised methodology for information auditing, by investigating the nature and characteristics of a typical information audit as well as a number of other audit types, e.g. the financial audit which is a very good example of a standardised audit methodology. Furthermore, the researcher discusses a number of terms and processes that have some connection to the process of information auditing, to a lesser or greater extent. These types of audits and processes are discussed with a view to indicating their applicability to designing an information audit methodology.

These include the communication audit because of its focus on organisational information flow patterns; Information mapping because of its focus on the identification and use of information resources; the information systems audit for its focus on the way in which technological tools are used to manage information resources (although implicitly); the knowledge audit follows logically on information management and information auditing (cf. explanation at the beginning of Chapter 3); and the intelligence audit for its relationship with both information and knowledge management. The researcher concludes that none of these are the same as the information audit, though similarities exist.

The information audit is discussed by focusing on its aims, the benefits derived from performing an information audit and the role of the information audit in the information management process. Various information audit methodologies are discussed, evaluated and classified.

The researcher comes to the conclusion that even though the principles of the financial audit cannot be used to develop a standardised methodology for information auditing, information professionals can look towards the accounting profession to support them in developing a standardised, universally accepted method for accurately determining the value of information entities.

In conclusion, guidelines for a standardised information audit methodology are listed.
KEY TERMS

- Audit
- Auditor
- Communication audit
- Information audit
- Information management
- Information mapping
- Information resource
- Information systems audit
- Intelligence audit
- Knowledge audit
SAMEVATTING

Die inligtingsoudit: beginsels en riglyne

deur

Hannerí Botha

Studieleier: Prof. J.A. Boon
Departement Inligtingkunde
M.Bibl.

Ouditering is 'n erkende bestuurstegniek. Dit voorsien bestuurders van 'n oorsig van die huidige situasie met betrekking tot spesifieke hulpbron(ne) en dienste binne 'n organisasie.

In die kommersiële omgewing word verskillende tippes oudits gebruik. Met die verloop van tyd en veral oor die afgelope paar jare, het die fokus van oudits verander van 'n suiwre finansiële fokus na 'n fokus wat 'n verskynheid organisatoriese aktiwiteite en/of hulpbronne insluit, waaronder inligtingshulpbronne.

Die navorser het bepaal dat daar huidiglik nie 'n enkele, algemeen-aanvaarde metodologie bestaan vir die uitvoer van 'n inligtingsoudit nie. Bestaande metodologieë verskil van organisasie tot organisasie, afhankende van die doel van die spesifieke oudit. In die lig hiervan ondersoek die navorser of dit moontlik (en wenslik) is om 'n gestandaardiseerde inligtingsoudit metodologie te ontwikkel. Die navorsing fokus onder andere op die aard en eienskappe van die tipiese inligtingsoudit, asook dié van 'n aantal ander tippes oudits, bv. die finansiële oudit – as 'n baie goeie voorbeeld van 'n gestandaardiseerde oudit metodologie. Die navorser bespreek ook 'n aantal terme en prosesse wat in 'n mindere of meerdere mate ooreenkoms(te) toon met die inligtingsoudit. Die doel van hierdie deel van die navorsing, is om aan te dui of/inkuit mate hierdie prosesse gebruik kan word tydens die ontwerp van 'n inligtingsoudit metodologie.

Die oudits wat bespreek word, sluit in die kommunikasie oudit, aangesien laasgenoemde fokus op organisatoriese patrone van inligtingsvloei; “information mapping” aangesien dit fokus op die identifisering en optimale benutting van inligtingshulpbronne; die inligtingstelseoudit wat fokus op die tegnologiese hulpmiddels wat gebruik word tydens die (implisiete) bestuur van inligtingshulpbronne; die kennis oudit ontwikkel logies vanuit die prosesse van inligtingbestuur en inligtingsouditering (vgl. die bespreking aan die begin van Hoofstuk 3); en die intelligensie oudit wat 'n verwantskap toon met beide inligting- en kennisbestuur. Die navorser kom tot die gevolgtrekking dat geen van hierdie tippes oudits dieselfde is as die inligtingsoudit nie, maar dat ooreenkoms wel bestaan.

Die inligtingsoudit word bespreek deur te konsentreer op die doelwitte daarvan, die voordele wat dit inhou, en die rol van die inligtingsoudit in die inligtingbestuursproses. Verskeie inligtingsoudit metodologieë word krities bespreek, geëvalueer en geklassifiseer.

Die navorser kom tot die gevolgtrekking dat die beginsels van die finansiële oudit nie gebruik kan word om 'n gestandaardiseerde inligtingsoudit metodologie te ontwikkel nie. Ten spyte hiervan kan inligtingspesialiste baie leer van die rekenkundige beroep, veral wanneer daar gekyk word na die ontwikkeling van 'n gestandaardiseerde, universeel-aanvaarde metode vir die akkurate berekening van die waarde van inligtingsentiteite.
As gevolgtrekking tot die navorsing, word riglyne uiteengesit vir 'n gestandaardiseerde inligtingsaudit metodologie.

SLEUTELTERME
- "Information mapping"
- Inligtingbestuur
- Inligtingshulpbron
- Inligtingsaudit
- Inligtigstelsel oudit
- Intelligensie oudit
- Kennis oudit
- Kommunikasie oudit
- Oudit
- Ouditeur