THE RELEVANCE OF THE BENEDICTINE,
FRANCISCAN, AND TAIZÉ MONASTIC
TRADITIONS FOR RETREAT WITHIN
THE DUTCH REFORMED TRADITION:
AN EPISTEMOLOGICAL REFLECTION

CHRISTOFFEL HERCULES SCHUTTE
PhD
PRACTICAL THEOLOGY
FACULTY OF THEOLOGY
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

Supervisor: Prof Dr Yolanda Dreyer
APRIL 2006
STATEMENT BY CANDIDATE

I declare that the thesis which I am submitting to the University of Pretoria for the degree PhD Practical Theology has not been submitted by me to any other university for degree purposes; and

I am aware that, should the thesis be accepted, I must submit the additional copies as required by the relevant regulations at least six weeks before the next graduation ceremony, and that the degree will not be conferred if this regulation is not fulfilled with.

SIGNATURE: _______________ DATE: _______________
THE THESIS IS DEDICATED TO:

- God, the Ultimate, Uncontrollable Mystery and Source of life.
- Marietjie, Christo and Ghizela, a fabulous family and best friends.
- All the co-pilgrims (co-researchers) journeying to the inner mountain.
- The monks of La Pierre Qui Vire, Sacro Convento Di San Francesko, and Taizé.
- The Dutch Reformed congregations, Florandia and Murray.
- The nuns of the Benedictine cloister, Order of the Holy Paraclete
- My supervisor, Yolanda Dreyer
SUMMARY

The narrative research journey and pilgrimage into and epistemological reflection on the relevance of the Benedictine, Franciscan and Taizé monastic-mystic traditions (associative spirituality) for retreat within the Dutch Reformed tradition (disassociate spirituality) began because of a passion for, an interest in retreat and because of lack of research done on the subject. The research developed in story form as a participative active process of *story development*, interpretation, and reflection in which the researcher and the research subject as valued co-researchers (co-pilgrims) constructed a shared reality and new story together. Consequently, the observations and experiences reflected on may tell just as much about the researcher as about the action of retreat and the research participants. The action of retreat was not approached in a neutral, objective stance but with self-awareness, particular presuppositions, and a postmodern philosophical mindset with ideological-critical, deconstructive and inclusive thought processes. The research problem was viewed as a narrative situation of action, explained by means of empirical research, and interpreted via epistemological reflection and theological theories. The focus has not been on new or adapted theory formulation, hypotheses, or “conclusions” as such but on the empiric *interaction* between the experiences of Mystery (*noumenon*), the Jesus narrative, stories of the co-pilgrims, monastic traditions, Dutch Reformed tradition, the researchers’ own story, and those who might read the thesis. A potential amplifying or expanding of the repertoire of existing options and meanings were viewed as a possibility in the creative development of a new reality or research story. The aim was to listen to, understand, and interpret qualitatively the subjective dimension and experience of the reality (story/ies) of retreat as a situation where pilgrims (from different traditions and spiritualities) were in relation with God, self and others.

The research journey took me into the *life world* of the monastic-mystic traditions and my own internal dialectics and story within a Dutch Reformed context. From here arose questions, engagement, and re-engagement with the
monastic traditions and a new story. The concern was the beliefs and practices of the retreatants (co pilgrims) under study as beings in real-life human experiential reality, taking seriously their concerns, expressions of belief, practice, perceptions, and stories. The data from the empirical encounter was subsequently investigated, mapped with the major themes and interests highlighted and reflected on in the process. The main themes and focal points that were identified and researched were:

- The lives and stories of St. Benedict, St. Francis, and Br. Roger, their respective communities’ monastic-mystic spirituality, the way these traditions approach retreat and the way they live or express their respective monastic rules or orders in comparison with the Dutch Reformed traditions’ retreat narrative.

- The main elements of Monastic retreat namely silence, solitude, *lectio divina* in facilitating an awareness of God and the mystery of God as part of the journey to the inner mountain, ever deeper into his presence.

- Different types of retreat and especially the experience of monastic retreat, the experience of holy places (desert spirituality) as places saturated by prayer, Eucharist and the community of pilgrims, and retreat as pilgrimage experience.

- Retreat as ritual following a rite of passage structure of separation, marginality and reincorporation focusing on structure and anti-structure (power of liminality) as helpful tool of analysis and framework for planning of retreat.

- The potential therapeutic or pastoral care qualities of a monastic way of retreat facilitating in pilgrims, life story interpretation and new understanding of stories.

The research story ended in the form of findings and the posing of possible questions for future research.
KEY CONCEPTS

- Monasticism
  (Monastic Spirituality)
- Retreat
- Benedictine
- Franciscan
- Taizé
- Silence
- Solitude
- Lectio Divina
- Rite de Passage
- Pilgrimage
CONTENTS

CHAPTER ONE
Epistemology: Theory, Model and Method

1.1 Research Motivation, Relevance and Objectives 10
1.2 Theory 17
1.2.1 Paradigm-Theory 17
1.2.1.1 Premodernity 19
1.2.1.2 Modernity 20
1.2.1.3 Postmodernity 23
1.2.2 Theory of Science 29
1.2.2.1 Deductive Argumentation 30
1.2.2.2 Inductive Generalisation 32
1.2.2.3 Abductive Reasoning 34
1.2.3 Meta, Basis, Praxis Theory and Postmodernism 38
1.3 Meta theory 40
1.3.1 Hans-Georg Gadamer: Understanding and Self-Understanding 41
1.3.2 Paul Ricoeur: Explanation of Existence 48
1.3.2.1 Text Interpretation 48
1.3.2.2 A Hermeneutical Arc 51
(a) Prefiguration 53
(b) Configuration 53
(c) Refiguration 54
1.3.2.3 Symbol, Metaphor and Narrative 56
(a) Symbol 56
1.6.5 An Empirical Approach 116
1.6.6 Action-Reflection Dialectics 120
1.6.7 Ritual and Rite of Passage 124
1.6.7.1 Ritual 124
(a) Definition 124
(b) Characteristics 126
(c) Types of Ritual 129
(i) Structural Ritual 129
(ii) Stability Ritual 131
(iii) Ritual of Mystery 131
(iii) Therapeutic Ritual 132
(iiiii) Faith Enriching Ritual 133
(iiiii) Functional Ritual 134
1.6.7.2 *Rite de Passage* Structure:
Arnold von Gennep and Victor Turner 134
1.7 Methodology 140
1.7.1 Introduction 140
1.7.2 Quantitative Research Methods 140
1.7.2.1 Surveys 141
1.7.2.2 Data Collection 141
1.7.2.3 Experiments 142
1.7.2.4 Data Mining 142
1.7.2.5 Structured Observation and Interviews 142
1.7.3 Qualitative Research Methods 143
1.7.3.1 Participant Observation 144
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1.7.3.2 Interviews</th>
<th>146</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(a) Unstructured Interviews</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Structured Interviews</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Semi Structured Interviews</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(d) The Focused Interview</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(e) The Semi Standardized Interview</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(f) The Problem Centred Interview</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(g) The Expert Interview</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(h) The Ethnographic Interview</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(i) Focus Group or Group Interviews</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(j) Life Histories</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(k) Oral History</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(l) Narratives as Data</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(m) Documentary Analysis</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(n) Grounded Theory Process</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(o) Theological Reflection</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(p) The Appropriative Method</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(q) Social-Constructionist and Narrative Method</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Action</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climax</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ending</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(r) Literature Review and Literature Study: Historical Descriptive</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER TWO
Retreat and Spirituality

2.1 The Empirical Research Development Process 164
2.2 Empirical Fieldwork 167
  2.2.1 Participant Observation 171
  2.2.2 Documents 173
  2.2.3 Interviews 174
  2.2.4 Narratives 175
  2.2.5 Surveys 175
2.3 Discussion of aspects of the Fieldwork Data 176
  2.3.1 Motivation or Purpose for Going on Retreat 176
  2.3.2 The Retreat Venue 177
  2.3.3 Preference regarding the Type of Retreat 177
  2.3.4 Definition or Idea of Retreat 178
  2.3.5 The Experience of Monastic Retreat 178
  2.3.6 Elements of Retreat 179
  2.3.7 Preferred Spirituality and Faith Stories 180
  2.3.8 After Retreat 182
2.4 Spirituality 182
  2.4.1 Trends in Spirituality 183
  2.4.2 Defining Spirituality 186
2.4.3 Christian Spirituality 188
2.4.4 Spirituality Types 193
2.4.4.1 Head Spirituality 194
2.4.4.2 Mystic Spirituality 194
2.4.4.3 Heart Spirituality 195
2.4.4.4 Kingdom Spirituality 195
2.4.5 Protestant Spirituality 197
2.4.6 Studying Spirituality 199

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Monastic Christian Spirituality</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>The Taizé, Benedictine and Franciscan Communities</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1</td>
<td>The History of the Community of Taizé</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2</td>
<td>The History of St. Benedict, Founder of Benedictine Spirituality</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3</td>
<td>The History of St. Francis, Founder of Franciscan Spirituality</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Monastic Way of Retreat</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1</td>
<td>A Benedictine Way of Retreat</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2</td>
<td>A Franciscan Way of Retreat</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3</td>
<td>A Taizé Way of Retreat</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>Aspects of Monastic Retreat</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1</td>
<td>Silence</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2</td>
<td>Solitude</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3</td>
<td>Lectio Divina</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.4.3.1  Lectio  271
3.4.3.2  Meditatio  272
3.4.3.3  Oratio  274
3.4.3.4  Contemplatio  277
3.5  The Way of the Mystics  282
3.6  Monastic Rule or Way of Life  287
3.6.1  A Benedictine Way of Life  288
3.6.2  A Franciscan Way of Life  298
3.6.3  A Taizé Way of Life  306
3.7  A Monastic Way of Life after Retreat  311

CHAPTER FOUR
Retreat, Holy Places and Pilgrimage

4.1  Retreat  321
4.1.1  An Overview  321
4.1.2  Types of Retreat  325
4.1.2.1  Conducted Retreat  325
4.1.2.2  Un-conducted Retreat  325
4.1.2.3  Individually Directed Retreat  326
4.1.2.4  Vocational Retreat  326
4.1.2.5  Dialogue Retreat  326
4.1.2.6  The Creative or Arts Retreat  327
4.1.2.7  Private Retreat  328
4.1.2.8  Quiet One Day Retreat  329
4.1.2.9  Classical Retreat  329
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1.2.10</td>
<td>Ecumenical Retreat</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.3</td>
<td>Pastoral Care and Retreat</td>
<td>332</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Pilgrimage</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1</td>
<td>An Overview</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2</td>
<td>Pilgrimage in Judeo-Christian Tradition</td>
<td>342</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3</td>
<td>A Classification of Pilgrimages</td>
<td>345</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4</td>
<td>Pilgrimage Today</td>
<td>346</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Holy Places, Pilgrimage and Retreat</td>
<td>348</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CHAPTER FIVE**
Planning and Preparation of Retreat

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Chicagos' Irving Park Free Methodist Church Retreat</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Structure and Anti-Structure (Inter-Structure)</td>
<td>353</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>Communitas or Relational Anti-Structure</td>
<td>357</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Anti-Structure: Mystery, Transcendence and Spiritual Experience</td>
<td>361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>Turners' Theory on Meaning in Ritual and a Way of Retreat</td>
<td>365</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CHAPTER SIX**
Summary and Findings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Problem Statement and Research Gap</td>
<td>374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Meta, Base, Praxis Theory within the Postmodernistic Paradigm</td>
<td>374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>Research within the Social Constructionist Model</td>
<td>382</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>Methodology</td>
<td>388</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>Ending</td>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6.5.1 Monastic Retreat and the Presence of God 402
6.5.2 Monastic Retreat and Pastoral Care 402
6.5.3 Retreat as Ritual and Rite of Passage 403
6.5.4 Retreat, Pilgrimage and Holy Places 407
6.5.5 Elements of Monastic Retreat 409
6.5.6 Monastic Traditions: Way of Life and Way of Retreat 418
6.5.7 A Monastic Way of Life and the Dutch Reformed Tradition 425
6.5.8 Retreat and Ecumenism 429
6.6 Relevant Questions for Further Research 430
6.6.1 A Source or Rule of Life 430
6.6.2 Ecumenism and Retreat 430
6.6.3 Different Types of Retreat 430
6.6.4 Liminitas-Communitas 430
6.6.5 Monastic Spirituality and Prayer 430
6.6.6 The Feminine Influence or Relevance of Women within Monasticism 431

APPENDIX ONE
Interviews 432

APPENDIX TWO
Survey Questionnaires 448

BIBLIOGRAPHY 458