



**EXPLORING NARRATIVES OF
WHITE MALE POLICE OFFICERS SERVING IN THE
SOUTH AFRICAN POLICE SERVICES
IN THE KWAZULU-NATAL MIDLANDS AREA
UNDER A NEW CONSTITUTION:
A PRACTICAL THEOLOGICAL JOURNEY**

by

BRIAN BURGER

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree of

PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR

to the

**DEPARTMENT OF PRACTICAL THEOLOGY
FACULTY OF THEOLOGY**

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA, SOUTH AFRICA

SUPERVISOR: PROF. J.C. MÜLLER

AUGUST 2008



DECLARATION

I, Brian Burger, declare that **EXPLORING NARRATIVES OF WHITE MALE POLICE OFFICERS SERVING IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN POLICE SERVICES IN THE KWAZULU-NATAL MIDLANDS AREA UNDER A NEW CONSTITUTION: A PRACTICAL THEOLOGICAL JOURNEY** is my own work and that all the sources I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references.

.....

SIGNATURE

August 2008



**EXPLORING NARRATIVES OF WHITE MALE POLICE OFFICERS
SERVING IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN POLICE SERVICES IN THE
KWAZULU-NATAL MIDLANDS AREA UNDER A NEW CONSTITUTION:
A PRACTICAL THEOLOGICAL JOURNEY**

by

BRIAN BURGER

Supervisor **PROF. J.C. MÜLLER**
Department **PRACTICAL THEOLOGY**
Faculty **THEOLOGY**
Degree **PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR**

ABSTRACT

A new constitution in South Africa necessitated a change in policing practices from an abusive, para-military style to a community-based structure. Such changes had its challenges, which were partially addressed through new policies that affected all police officials. White, male police officers in middle-management, who were once central in the police, were increasingly being sidelined. This research describes the experiences of three police officers in the Kwazulu-Natal midlands. It was conducted using a narrative approach, working within a social constructionist and a postfoundationalist paradigm. This meant that their stories were listened to within the wider context described through media reports. The discourses shaping their ideas were explored and compared to the experiences of police members of other races. Comments from other police officers were brought into the conversation alongside the insights of other disciplines and research done by others, including criminology, business, politics, social sciences and theology. The participants wrestled with how faith in God could assist them in dealing with the challenges they were faced with. This journey also contributes to a wider audience beyond our local context.

KEY WORDS

Practical Theology, Narrative, Social constructionism, Postfoundationalism, South African Police Services, Constitution, Crime.



ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I wish to express my gratitude to the following people:

My wife, Alta and my children Edmari, Danika and Joshua.

Professor Julian Müller and his team of assistants.

My fellow students during these years together.

Family members, other ministers and congregations who have encouraged me.

Members of the Community Police Forums I have been involved in.

My co-researchers Pieter, Leon and Jody and all those who helped us reflect on our experiences.

All your support has meant more to me than words can express.



TABLE OF CONTENTS

TITLE PAGE	i
DECLARATION	ii
ABSTRACT	iii
KEY WORDS	iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iv
TABLE OF CONTENTS	v
CHAPTER ONE BACKGROUND INTRODUCTION AND PARADIGM POSITION	
1.1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.2 A NEW ERA IN SOUTH AFRICAN POLICING	1
1.2.1 The changing South African context	1
1.2.2 Structural changes in the police	2
1.3 THE FIELD OF RESEARCH	4
1.3.1 The research question	4
1.3.2 Personal reasons for choosing this field	5
1.4 MY JOURNEY IN PRACTICAL THEOLOGY	6
1.4.1 Early historical developments	7
1.4.2 20th Century developments	7
1.4.3 Liberation and Feminist Theology	10
1.4.4 My positioning on the theory-practice relationship	10
1.5 PARADIGMATIC POSITIONING	11
1.5.1 The Modern (foundationalist) paradigm	12
1.5.2 The Postmodern (nonfoundationalist) paradigm	13
1.5.3 The Postfoundational paradigm	15
1.6 NARRATIVE RESEARCH CONCEPTS	17



1.6.1	Social constructionism	17
1.6.2	Narrative	19
1.6.2.1	What is a narrative approach?	19
1.6.2.2	The distinctiveness in narrative research	19
1.6.3	Discourses	21
1.6.4	Not-knowing position	21
1.6.5	Unique outcomes	22
1.6.6	Co-researchers	22
1.7	RESEARCH PROCEDURE	23
1.7.1	Movement One	24
1.7.2	Movement Two	25
1.7.3	Movement Three	27
1.7.4	Movement Four	27
1.7.5	Movement Five	28
1.7.6	Movement Six	29
1.7.7	Movement Seven	29
1.8	LIMITATIONS OF THE RESEARCH	30
1.8.1	The localised scope of this research	30
1.8.2	Levels of honesty	31
1.8.3	Racial issues	32
1.8.4	My own “blind spots”	32
1.9	ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS	33
1.10	SUMMARY	35

CHAPTER TWO THE HISTORICAL CONTEXT DESCRIBED

2.1	INTRODUCTION	36
2.2	PRIOR TO 1994	37
2.3	A BRIEF HISTORICAL OVERVIEW	38
2.3.1	Amalgamating eleven agencies into one	38
2.3.2	Green and White Papers	39
2.3.3	Name changes	39
2.3.4	Moving towards new leadership and complimentary institutions	40
2.3.5	Community Police Forums	43



2.3.6	National Crime Prevention Strategy	44
2.3.7	Independent Complaints Directorate	45
2.3.8	Section 49 of the Criminal Procedure Act amendment	46
2.4	PERCEPTIONS ON CRIME-FIGHTING ABILITY	47
2.5	SUMMARY	48

CHAPTER THREE DISCOVERIES THROUGH OUR CONVERSATIONS

3.1	INTRODUCTION	49
3.2	EMERGING THEMES	49
3.2.1	Low quality of work	50
3.2.1.1	A diminished work ethic	50
	a) Jody's story of the "Robot System"	50
	b) Leon's story of uncaring detectives	51
	c) Pieter's story of poor station management	52
	d) Stories in the media	53
3.2.1.2	Corruption	54
	a) Media reports	54
	b) Jody's story of a vehicle theft investigation	55
3.2.1.3	How my co-researchers deal with these influences	56
	a) Stories of incentives	56
	b) Leon's story of exceptions	57
3.2.2	Relations between Police members	58
3.2.2.1	A story I witnessed of tensions	58
3.2.2.2	Jody's story of a lack of respect for ranks	58
3.2.2.3	Leon's story of racism	59
3.2.2.4	Pieter's story of undermining management	60
3.2.2.5	Pieter's story of distrust	61
3.2.2.6	Dealing with these tensions	61
3.2.3	Further training and promotions	62
3.2.3.1	Jody's story and unexpected outcome	63
3.2.3.2	Leon's stories of contentment and of pointless courses	63
3.2.3.3	Pieter's use of Unions amidst Affirmative Action	64
3.2.3.4	Promotions amongst other races	64



3.2.3.5	Pieter’s story of further training and technology	65
3.2.4	Top structures and politics	66
3.2.4.1	Unions – two sides of a coin	67
3.2.4.2	Politicians	68
	a) Our stories	68
	b) The media’s version of political involvement	69
3.2.4.3	Top police management	70
	a) My co-researchers’ perspective	70
	b) The media on the national commissioner	71
3.2.5	Community involvement	72
3.2.5.1	The Community Police Forum	72
	a) Jody’s experience	72
	b) Leon’s experience	72
	c) Pieter’s experience	73
	d) What others have experienced	73
3.2.5.2	An Open Door policy	75
	a) Leon’s station commander	75
	b) Pieter and Jody’s stories	75
3.2.5.3	Statistics and crime trends	76
3.2.5.4	Law enforcers outside the SAPS	77
	a) Pieter’s story of good relationships	77
	b) Media stories of opposition	77
	c) Leon and vigilantes	78
	d) Increasing cases of vigilantism	79
	e) Bringing in the SANDF?	80
3.2.5.5	Informers	80
3.2.5.6	Partnership with the courts	81
3.2.5.7	Church involvement	82
3.2.6	Human rights and Abuses	84
3.2.6.1	Treatment of suspects	84
3.2.6.2	The use of firearms	85
3.2.7	Effects on family life	87
3.3	SUMMARY	88



CHAPTER FOUR REFLECTION ON EXPERIENCE

4.1	INTRODUCTION	89
4.2	DESCRIBING THE TRADITIONS BEHIND EXPERIENCES	89
4.2.1	An Afrikaans culture of respect	90
4.2.2	Pride in your work	91
4.2.3	Discipline	92
4.2.4	Values of honesty and compassion	94
4.3	THE PRESENCE OF GOD AND THEOLOGY	95
4.3.1	A God who calls us	95
4.3.2	A moral and just God	97
4.3.3	A God of compassion	98
4.3.4	A God who gives us a vision	99
4.3.5	A God of community	100
4.4	SUMMARY	101

CHAPTER FIVE CONVERSATIONS FURTHER AFIELD

5.1	INTRODUCTION	103
5.2	CATEGORIES OF DISCUSSION	103
5.2.1	Leadership	104
5.2.1.1	Church and business perspectives	104
5.2.1.2	Political perspective	106
5.2.1.3	Social sciences perspective	106
5.2.1.4	Criminology perspective	107
5.2.1.5	Summary on leadership	107
5.2.2	Human Rights policies guiding police behaviour	108
5.2.2.1	The gap between policy and practice	108
5.2.2.2	Amnesty International report	109
5.2.2.3	Theological perspective	110
5.2.2.4	Criminology perspective	111
5.2.2.5	Political perspective	111
5.2.2.6	Summary on human rights	112
5.2.3	Internal police relationships	113



5.2.3.1	Relationship between units	113
5.2.3.2	Racial tensions	114
5.2.3.3	Promotions	115
5.2.3.4	Corruption and low work ethic	117
5.2.3.5	Business perspective	118
5.2.3.6	Social sciences perspective	119
5.2.3.7	Summary on internal police relationships	120
5.2.4	Utilizing communities and technology	120
5.2.4.1	Informers / Sources	120
5.2.4.2	Community Police Forums	121
5.2.4.3	Vigilantism	122
5.2.4.4	Crime statistics	123
5.2.4.5	Fighting crime with technology	123
5.2.4.6	Business perspective	124
5.2.4.7	Social sciences perspective	124
5.2.4.8	Summary on utilizing communities and technology	124
5.3	SUMMARY	125

CHAPTER SIX CONCLUSIONS AND LOOKING AHEAD

6.1	INTRODUCTION	126
6.2	A SUMMARY OF THE CONTENT	126
6.2.1	Overview of the chapters	126
6.2.2	Unique outcomes	134
6.3	MY CO-RESEARCHERS' LIVES NOW	136
6.4	A CRITICAL EVALUATION OF THIS RESEARCH	137
6.4.1	Did we achieve our aims?	137
6.4.2	Questions that remain unanswered	140
6.4.3	Is a narrative approach to research satisfactory?	141
6.4.4	What this process did for me	142
6.5	WHERE DOES THIS RESEARCH POINT TO?	144
6.6	CONCLUSION	146
	Works consulted	147



Appendix 1: Information Sheet	157
Appendix 2: Consent form	161
Appendix 3: Transcript (Pieter)	163
Appendix 4: Transcript (Leon)	173
Appendix 5: Transcript (Jody)	182