EXPLORING NARRATIVES OF
WHITE MALE POLICE OFFICERS SERVING IN THE
SOUTH AFRICAN POLICE SERVICES
IN THE KWAZULU-NATAL MIDLANDS AREA
UNDER A NEW CONSTITUTION:
A PRACTICAL THEOLOGICAL JOURNEY

by

BRIAN BURGER

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree of

PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR

to the

DEPARTMENT OF PRACTICAL THEOLOGY
FACULTY OF THEOLOGY

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA, SOUTH AFRICA

SUPERVISOR: PROF. J.C. MÜLLER

AUGUST 2008

© University of Pretoria
DECLARATION

I, Brian Burger, declare that EXPLORING NARRATIVES OF WHITE MALE POLICE OFFICERS SERVING IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN POLICE SERVICES IN THE KWAZULU-NATAL MIDLANDS AREA UNDER A NEW CONSTITUTION: A PRACTICAL THEOLOGICAL JOURNEY is my own work and that all the sources I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references.

..............................................................

SIGNATURE

August 2008
EXPLORING NARRATIVES OF WHITE MALE POLICE OFFICERS SERVING IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN POLICE SERVICES IN THE KWAZULU-NATAL MIDLANDS AREA UNDER A NEW CONSTITUTION: A PRACTICAL THEOLOGICAL JOURNEY

by

BRIAN BURGER

Supervisor PROF. J.C. MÜLLER

Department PRACTICAL THEOLOGY

Faculty THEOLOGY

Degree PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR

ABSTRACT

A new constitution in South Africa necessitated a change in policing practices from an abusive, para-military style to a community-based structure. Such changes had its challenges, which were partially addressed through new policies that affected all police officials. White, male police officers in middle-management, who were once central in the police, were increasingly being sidelined. This research describes the experiences of three police officers in the Kwazulu-Natal midlands. It was conducted using a narrative approach, working within a social constructionist and a postfoundationalist paradigm. This meant that their stories were listened to within the wider context described through media reports. The discourses shaping their ideas were explored and compared to the experiences of police members of other races. Comments from other police officers were brought into the conversation alongside the insights of other disciplines and research done by others, including criminology, business, politics, social sciences and theology. The participants wrestled with how faith in God could assist them in dealing with the challenges they were faced with. This journey also contributes to a wider audience beyond our local context.

KEY WORDS

Practical Theology, Narrative, Social constructionism, Postfoundationalism, South African Police Services, Constitution, Crime.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I wish to express my gratitude to the following people:

My wife, Alta and my children Edmari, Danika and Joshua.

Professor Julian Müller and his team of assistants.

My fellow students during these years together.

Family members, other ministers and congregations who have encouraged me.

Members of the Community Police Forums I have been involved in.

My co-researchers Pieter, Leon and Jody and all those who helped us reflect on our experiences.

All your support has meant more to me than words can express.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

TITLE PAGE i
DECLARATION ii
ABSTRACT iii
KEY WORDS iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS iv

TABLE OF CONTENTS v

CHAPTER ONE BACKGROUND INTRODUCTION AND PARADIGM POSITION

1.1 INTRODUCTION 1
1.2 A NEW ERA IN SOUTH AFRICAN POLICING 1
1.2.1 The changing South African context 1
1.2.2 Structural changes in the police 2
1.3 THE FIELD OF RESEARCH 4
1.3.1 The research question 4
1.3.2 Personal reasons for choosing this field 5
1.4 MY JOURNEY IN PRACTICAL THEOLOGY 6
1.4.1 Early historical developments 7
1.4.2 20th Century developments 7
1.4.3 Liberation and Feminist Theology 10
1.4.4 My positioning on the theory-practice relationship 10
1.5 PARADIGMATIC POSITIONING 11
1.5.1 The Modern (foundationalist) paradigm 12
1.5.2 The Postmodern (nonfoundationalist) paradigm 13
1.5.3 The Postfoundational paradigm 15
1.6 NARRATIVE RESEARCH CONCEPTS 17
CHAPTER TWO     THE HISTORICAL CONTEXT DESCRIBED

2.1     INTRODUCTION
2.2     PRIOR TO 1994
2.3     A BRIEF HISTORICAL OVERVIEW
2.3.1    Amalgamating eleven agencies into one
2.3.2    Green and White Papers
2.3.3    Name changes
2.3.4    Moving towards new leadership and complimentary institutions
2.3.5    Community Police Forums
2.3.6 National Crime Prevention Strategy 44
2.3.7 Independent Complaints Directorate 45
2.3.8 Section 49 of the Criminal Procedure Act amendment 46
2.4 PERCEPTIONS ON CRIME-FIGHTING ABILITY 47
2.5 SUMMARY 48

CHAPTER THREE DISCOVERIES THROUGH OUR CONVERSATIONS

3.1 INTRODUCTION 49
3.2 EMERGING THEMES 49
3.2.1 Low quality of work 50
3.2.1.1 A diminished work ethic 50
   a) Jody’s story of the “Robot System” 50
   b) Leon’s story of uncaring detectives 51
   c) Pieter’s story of poor station management 52
   d) Stories in the media 53
3.2.1.2 Corruption 54
   a) Media reports 54
   b) Jody’s story of a vehicle theft investigation 55
3.2.1.3 How my co-researchers deal with these influences 56
   a) Stories of incentives 56
   b) Leon’s story of exceptions 57
3.2.2 Relations between Police members 58
3.2.2.1 A story I witnessed of tensions 58
3.2.2.2 Jody’s story of a lack of respect for ranks 58
3.2.2.3 Leon’s story of racism 59
3.2.2.4 Pieter’s story of undermining management 60
3.2.2.5 Pieter’s story of distrust 61
3.2.2.6 Dealing with these tensions 61
3.2.3 Further training and promotions 62
3.2.3.1 Jody’s story and unexpected outcome 63
3.2.3.2 Leon’s stories of contentment and of pointless courses 63
3.2.3.3 Pieter’s use of Unions amidst Affirmative Action 64
3.2.3.4 Promotions amongst other races 64
3.2.3.5 Pieter’s story of further training and technology 65

3.2.4 Top structures and politics 66
3.2.4.1 Unions – two sides of a coin 67
3.2.4.2 Politicians 68
   a) Our stories 68
   b) The media’s version of political involvement 69
3.2.4.3 Top police management 70
   a) My co-researchers’ perspective 70
   b) The media on the national commissioner 71

3.2.5 Community involvement 72
3.2.5.1 The Community Police Forum 72
   a) Jody’s experience 72
   b) Leon’s experience 72
   c) Pieter’s experience 73
   d) What others have experienced 73
3.2.5.2 An Open Door policy 75
   a) Leon’s station commander 75
   b) Pieter and Jody’s stories 75
3.2.5.3 Statistics and crime trends 76
3.2.5.4 Law enforcers outside the SAPS 77
   a) Pieter’s story of good relationships 77
   b) Media stories of opposition 77
   c) Leon and vigilantes 78
   d) Increasing cases of vigilantism 79
   e) Bringing in the SANDF? 80
3.2.5.5 Informers 80
3.2.5.6 Partnership with the courts 81
3.2.5.7 Church involvement 82

3.2.6 Human rights and Abuses 84
3.2.6.1 Treatment of suspects 84
3.2.6.2 The use of firearms 85

3.2.7 Effects on family life 87

3.3 SUMMARY 88
CHAPTER FOUR  REFLECTION ON EXPERIENCE

4.1 INTRODUCTION 89
4.2 DESCRIBING THE TRADITIONS BEHIND EXPERIENCES 89
4.2.1 An Afrikaans culture of respect 90
4.2.2 Pride in your work 91
4.2.3 Discipline 92
4.2.4 Values of honesty and compassion 94
4.3 THE PRESENCE OF GOD AND THEOLOGY 95
4.3.1 A God who calls us 95
4.3.2 A moral and just God 97
4.3.3 A God of compassion 98
4.3.4 A God who gives us a vision 99
4.3.5 A God of community 100
4.4 SUMMARY 101

CHAPTER FIVE  CONVERSATIONS FURTHER AFIELD

5.1 INTRODUCTION 103
5.2 CATEGORIES OF DISCUSSION 103
5.2.1 Leadership 104
5.2.1.1 Church and business perspectives 104
5.2.1.2 Political perspective 106
5.2.1.3 Social sciences perspective 106
5.2.1.4 Criminology perspective 107
5.2.1.5 Summary on leadership 107
5.2.2 Human Rights policies guiding police behaviour 108
5.2.2.1 The gap between policy and practice 108
5.2.2.2 Amnesty International report 109
5.2.2.3 Theological perspective 110
5.2.2.4 Criminology perspective 111
5.2.2.5 Political perspective 111
5.2.2.6 Summary on human rights 112
5.2.3 Internal police relationships 113
5.2.3.1 Relationship between units 113
5.2.3.2 Racial tensions 114
5.2.3.3 Promotions 115
5.2.3.4 Corruption and low work ethic 117
5.2.3.5 Business perspective 118
5.2.3.6 Social sciences perspective 119
5.2.3.7 Summary on internal police relationships 120

5.2.4 Utilizing communities and technology 120
5.2.4.1 Informers / Sources 120
5.2.4.2 Community Police Forums 121
5.2.4.3 Vigilantism 122
5.2.4.4 Crime statistics 123
5.2.4.5 Fighting crime with technology 123
5.2.4.6 Business perspective 124
5.2.4.7 Social sciences perspective 124
5.2.4.8 Summary on utilizing communities and technology 124

5.3 SUMMARY 125

CHAPTER SIX  CONCLUSIONS AND LOOKING AHEAD

6.1 INTRODUCTION 126
6.2 A SUMMARY OF THE CONTENT 126
6.2.1 Overview of the chapters 126
6.2.2 Unique outcomes 134
6.3 MY CO-RESEARCHERS’ LIVES NOW 136
6.4 A CRITICAL EVALUATION OF THIS RESEARCH 137
6.4.1 Did we achieve our aims? 137
6.4.2 Questions that remain unanswered 140
6.4.3 Is a narrative approach to research satisfactory? 141
6.4.4 What this process did for me 142
6.5 WHERE DOES THIS RESEARCH POINT TO? 144
6.6 CONCLUSION 146

Works consulted 147
Appendix 1: Information Sheet 157
Appendix 2: Consent form 161
Appendix 3: Transcript (Pieter) 163
Appendix 4: Transcript (Leon) 173
Appendix 5: Transcript (Jody) 182