Leadership and governance for a sustainable public service. The case for selected South African public service organizations

by

GOONASAGREENAIDOO

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

Philosophiae Doctor (Public Affairs)

In the Faculty of Economic and Management Sciences
University of Pretoria

Promoter: Professor Dr. J.O. Kuye
Co-Promoter: Professor Dr. C. Thornhill

October 2004
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

To my dearest Lord Krishna, who guides me, and willingly gives me all the support and knowledge that I need, I am totally devoted to you.

To my promoter and Mentor, Professor Jerry O Kuye for always asking for more and demanding the best of me. Thank you for sharing your wisdom and for giving so much to this project.

To my co-promoter, Professor C. Thornhill, thank you for your comments and suggestions.

To Dr. Morgan Pillay, I graciously thank you for your continual support and encouragement.

To my mother, I thank you for the wisdom you have shared, the lessons you have taught me, and the love you have given me.

To my brothers and their families, thank you for your support.

To all my friends, I treasure and support your friendship.

To all the people in the South African public service who have assisted me, I graciously thank you.

Goonasagree Naidoo

Pretoria; South Africa

2004
DECLARATION

I hereby declare that the research report submitted for the Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) to the University of Pretoria, apart from the works recognized, is my own work and has not been submitted to another university for any degree.

Goonasagree Naidoo

Pretoria

South Africa

2004
ABSTRACT

The research proposes that the adoption of a hybrid leadership and governance framework by the South African public service is crucial for improving service delivery in South Africa. The leadership and governance framework of the South African public service has had a negative impact on its effectiveness and efficiency. The study analysed service delivery performance in four South African public service departments against the backdrop of their leadership and governance frameworks, namely: Departments of Health, Housing, Justice and Constitutional Development and Safety and Security. The study found that the frameworks currently in use are not very effective in redressing service delivery imbalances and inequities in South Africa, especially in previously disadvantaged communities. The needs and demands of the South African public are not being adequately met. The study found that there are a number of interrelated variables, which were hampering the effectiveness of the public service. The most important of these variables were identified as human resource and financial constraints, the lack of technical skills, the lack of co-ordination, ineffective intergovernmental relations (IGR) between the three spheres of government, ineffective policy implementation, conflict between the classical public administration model and the new public management (NPM) paradigm, and the lack of effective monitoring and evaluation systems. In view of the challenges facing the South African public service, this thesis presents an alternative, hybrid leadership and governance model. This model has been designed in response to the unique circumstances faced by the public service in the post-apartheid era (post-1994) public service. It requires a conception of public service leadership and governance that draws on various relevant approaches while adapting these to the prevailing local narratives already existing in the country. It incorporates traditional African ethics and values, transformational leadership and team leadership, and encompasses effective governance approaches, such as civic governance. It also includes accountability, transparency and public participation. It is evident from the four cases presented herein, that such transformation is crucial for improving the effectiveness and efficiency of the South African public service. The leadership and governance framework developed in this study is flexible, as it can be applied to diverse settings and circumstances. This study thus advances a pragmatic transformational African model for the improvement of service delivery in South Africa.
Leadership and governance for a sustainable public service. The case for selected South African public service organizations

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ........................................................................................................................................ I
DECLARATION ................................................................................................................................................ II
ABSTRACT .................................................................................................................................................. III
LIST OF ACRONYMS ...................................................................................................................................... vii

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY
GENERAL OVERVIEW OF THE STUDY ........................................................................................................ 1
HISTORICAL OVERVIEW OF THE SOUTH AFRICAN CONTEXT .................................................................. 2
   General overview of South Africa and its history ...................................................................................... 3
   Apartheid era: The South African public service and service delivery (1949 to 1994) ......................... 6
   Post-apartheid era: The South African public service and service delivery (Post-1994 to 2003) ......... 8
DEFINITIONS AND OPERALIZATION OF KEY CONCEPTS ....................................................................... 15
   South African public service .................................................................................................................... 15
   Service delivery ....................................................................................................................................... 18
   Leadership ................................................................................................................................................ 20
   Governance ............................................................................................................................................. 26
   Transformational African leadership and governance framework ......................................................... 34
MOTIVATION FOR RESEARCH .................................................................................................................... 35
PROBLEM STATEMENT ............................................................................................................................... 35
RESEARCH QUESTION ................................................................................................................................. 36
OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY ....................................................................................................................... 36
CHAPTER OUTLINE ..................................................................................................................................... 37

CHAPTER 2: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY
INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................................................................... 40
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY ...................................................................................................................... 41
   Case study approach ............................................................................................................................... 45
TARGET POPULATION (SAMPLE) / SELECTION OF STUDY PARTICIPANTS .................................................. 50
DATA AND INFORMATION COLLECTION ................................................................................................. 51
CHAPTER 3:  CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK OF THE STUDY:
RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION,
LEADERSHIP, GOVERNANCE AND SERVICE DELIVERY

INTRODUCTION............................................................................................................................... 64
PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION, LEADERSHIP, GOVERNANCE AND SERVICE DELIVERY ................................ 65
Public administration ................................................................................................................. 68
Public management as an integral component of public administration.............................. 70
A new approach to public administration .............................................................................. 72
New public management .......................................................................................................... 72
Relationships between public administration, leadership, governance and service delivery: A relational model .............................................................................................................. 75
TRENDS IN PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION WITHIN THE SOUTH AFRICAN CONTEXT................................. 79
Towards a new public administration model for effective service delivery by the South African public service ........................................................................................................................ 80
Mechanisms to promote a sustainable public service for effective service delivery ............ 86
The Constitution ........................................................................................................................ 88
Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) ............................................................. 92
Batho Pele - 'People First’ White Paper on Transforming Public Service Delivery (1997)..... 98
SUMMARY............................................................................................................................... 103

CHAPTER 4:  AN OVERVIEW OF LEADERSHIP AND GOVERNANCE APPROACHES

INTRODUCTION.................................................................................................................................. 104
A PLETHORA OF LEADERSHIP AND GOVERNANCE APPROACHES ................................................ 104
TRADITIONAL AFRICAN LEADERSHIP AND GOVERNANCE APPROACHES........................................ 111
CLASSICAL WESTERN LEADERSHIP APPROACHES (1841 TO 1987) ............................................... 117
POST-1985 WESTERN LEADERSHIP APPROACHES........................................................................... 163
WESTERN GOVERNANCE APPROACHES .......................................................................................... 171
FUNDAMENTALS OF EFFECTIVE GOVERNANCE.......................................................................... 180
Accountability ............................................................................................................................. 182
CHAPTER 5: ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS OF SELECTED CASES IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN PUBLIC SERVICE

INTRODUCTION
Selective overview of service delivery by the South African public service
Case study one: Department of Health
Case study two: Department of Housing
Case study three: Department of Justice and Constitutional Development
Case study four: Department of Safety and Security

ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS OF CASES
Future trends

SUMMARY

CHAPTER 6: SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

SUMMARY
CONCLUSION
RECOMMENDATIONS

LISTS OF SOURCES

BOOKS
JOURNALS
PAPERS
GREEN AND WHITE PAPERS OF THE SOUTH AFRICAN GOVERNMENT
PUBLISHED OFFICIAL REPORTS AND DOCUMENTS
REVIEWS
CONFERENCE PAPERS
NEWSPAPERS
WEBSITES AND ELECTRONIC JOURNALS
ACTS AND LEGISLATION
TABLES

Table 1/1: Service delivery backlogs in urban and rural areas at 1994 .......................................................... 9
Table 1/2: Service delivery backlogs in urban and rural areas of the provinces in 1995 .................................................... 10
Table 2/1: A comparison of data analysis and verification methods ................................................................. 57
Table 3/1: Public administration in South Africa (pre-1994 and post-1994) .................................................. 80
Table 4/1: Evolutionary stages of leadership approaches (1841 to 1987) .................................................. 120
Table 4/2: Studies of leadership traits (1948 to 1991) .................................................................................. 124
Table 4/3: Personality characteristics and behaviors of leaders and its effects on followers .............. 131
Table 4/4: Stages of electronic-governance ................................................................................................. 202
Table 5/1: Selected service delivery programmes from 1995 to 2001 .................................................. 223
Table 5/2: Selected service delivery programmes from 1994 to 2003 .................................................. 224
Table 5/3: Selected service delivery housing programmes from 1994 to 2003 ........................................ 225
Table 5/4: Service delivery performance - Department of Health .......................................................... 227
Table 5/5: Challenges impacting on service delivery performance - Department of Health .............. 246
Table 5/6: Service delivery performance - Department of Housing .......................................................... 250
Table 5/7: Challenges impacting on service delivery performance - Department of Housing .............. 261
Table 5/8: Service delivery performance - Department of Justice and Constitutional Development ........................................................................................................................................ 265
Table 5/9: Challenges impacting on service delivery performance - Department of Justice and Constitutional Development ........................................................................................................................................ 278
Table 5/10: Service delivery performance - Department of Safety and Security ........................................ 281
Table 5/11: Challenges impacting on service delivery performance - Department of Safety and Security ........................................................................................................................................ 285

FIGURES

Figure 3/1: Relationships between public administration, leadership, governance and service delivery: A relational model ........................................................................................................... 66
Figure 4/1: Contingency model of leadership ............................................................................................... 138
Figure 4/2: Path-goal theory of leadership ...................................................................................................... 139
Figure 4/3: Leadership behaviors in path-goal theory .................................................................................. 141
Figure 4/4: Leadership styles ......................................................................................................................... 145
Figure 4/5: Leadership continuum .................................................................................................................. 153
Figure 4/6: Components of transformational leadership ........................................................................... 157
Figure 4/7: Leadership factors ........................................................................................................... 158
Figure 4/8: Model of team leadership ................................................................................................. 166
LIST OF ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

AFIS  Automated Fingerprint Identification System
AIDS  Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
ANC   African National Congress
CBO   Community based organization
CJSP  Criminal Justice Strengthening Programme
DLGH  Department of Local Government and Housing
DOTS  Directly observed treatment short-course
DPSA  Department of Public Service and Administration
EXCO  Executive Council of the Province
G&A   Governance and Administration
GDH   Gauteng Department of Housing
GDP   Gross domestic product
HIV   Human immune deficiency virus
HPCSA Health Professional Council of South Africa
HRD   Human Resources Development
HRM   Human Resources Management
IC    Individualised consideration
ICT   Information and Communication Technology
IDP   Infrastructure Development Plan
IGR   Intergovernmental Relations
II    Idealised influence
IJS   Integrated Justice System
IM    Inspirational motivation
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>IPSP</td>
<td>Integrated Provincial Support Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IS</td>
<td>Intellectual Stimulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IT</td>
<td>Information Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LMX</td>
<td>Leader-member exchange theory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEC</td>
<td>Member of Executive Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIIF</td>
<td>Municipal Infrastructure Investment Framework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MRC</td>
<td>Medical Research Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MTEF</td>
<td>Medium Term Expenditure Framework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NACF</td>
<td>National Anti-Corruption Forum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAAIRS</td>
<td>The National Automated Archival Information Retrieval System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NHLS</td>
<td>National Laboratory Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCPS</td>
<td>National Crime Prevention Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEPAD</td>
<td>New Partnership for Africa Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NMIR</td>
<td>National minimum information requirements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-governmental organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NPM</td>
<td>New Public Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PFMA</td>
<td>Public Finance Management Act, 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PMTCT</td>
<td>Prevention of Mother-to-Child Transmission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PHC</td>
<td>Primary Health Care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPPs</td>
<td>Public Private Partnerships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSC</td>
<td>Public Service Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RDP</td>
<td>Reconstruction and Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SADC</td>
<td>Southern African Development Community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAP</td>
<td>South African Police Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SANAC</td>
<td>South African National AIDS Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronym</td>
<td>Full Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SANDF</td>
<td>South African Defence Force</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SARS</td>
<td>South African Revenue Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCOPA</td>
<td>Standing Committee on Public Accounts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SITA</td>
<td>State Information Technology Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMS</td>
<td>Senior Management Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TB</td>
<td>Tuberculosis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRC</td>
<td>Truth and Reconciliation Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHO</td>
<td>World Health Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WPTPS</td>
<td>White Paper on Transforming the Public Service</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>