The relationship between the Grade 11 Life Sciences curriculum documents, HIV/AIDS knowledge and behavioural preferences

By

Lindelani Elphas Mnguni

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the academic requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the Faculty of Education, University of Pretoria

2012
Abstract

In this study the relationship between the South African Grade 11 Life Sciences curriculum documents, HIV and AIDS knowledge and behavioural preferences of students was investigated. The Life Sciences curriculum and textbooks used in Grade 11 Life Sciences were analysed to determine the curriculum ideology of the subject and concepts related to HIV and AIDS that are prescribed for teaching with the aim of educating students about HIV and AIDS and promoting safe behaviour. Life Sciences and non-Life Sciences students were compared to determine whether academic HIV and AIDS knowledge taught in Life Sciences was related to functional HIV and AIDS knowledge and behavioural preferences.

Findings indicate that Life Sciences does not promote safe behaviour related to HIV and AIDS. Furthermore Life Sciences is knowledge-oriented and integrates HIV and AIDS knowledge as extra content. In addition Life Sciences does not have a clear curriculum ideology for HIV and AIDS education even though it has characteristics of various curriculum ideologies with greater emphasis on the scholar academic ideology. The Life Sciences curriculum makes provisions for the construction and application of HIV and AIDS knowledge, but it does not provide guidance with regards to application of knowledge. Moreover textbooks are not consistent with regard to presentation of content and do not present sufficient content for meaningful application in everyday life. Results also showed that academic HIV and AIDS knowledge improves some students’ knowledge of functional HIV and AIDS knowledge. It was also found that HIV and AIDS knowledge does not significantly correlate with some students’ behaviour presumably because students have difficulty in relating Life Sciences knowledge to real life. Consequently some students do not fully know some HIV and AIDS concepts, and they rely on alternative means to respond to questions for which they do not have the necessary content knowledge. It was also found that some students do not take ownership of social problems related to HIV and AIDS.

The researcher believes that there is a need to review HIV and AIDS education in Life Sciences by basing it on a precise curriculum ideology that will ensure that suitable scientific content, which may lead to behaviour transformation, is integrated.
Keywords: Grade 11, Life Sciences, curriculum ideologies, academic HIV and AIDS knowledge, functional HIV and AIDS knowledge, behavioural preferences, document analysis, survey
Declaration

The research work described in this thesis was carried out in the Faculty of Education, University of Pretoria, from January 2008 to August 2011, under the supervision of:

Dr A. L. Abrie
Department of Science, Mathematics and Technology Education, University of Pretoria
Private bag X20, Hatfield, Pretoria, 0028, South Africa,

and co-supervision of:

Professor L. Ebersöhn
Department of Educational Psychology, University of Pretoria, Private bag X20, Hatfield, Pretoria, 0028, South Africa.

This thesis presents original work by the author and has not otherwise been submitted in any form for any degree or diploma to any university.

Signed:

----------------------------------------------------------
Lindelani Elphas Mnguni (candidate)

Signed:

----------------------------------------------------------
Dr A. L. Abrie (supervisor)

Signed:

----------------------------------------------------------
Professor L. Ebersöhn (co-supervisor)
Dedication

This one is for my family; my wife Simphiwe and my son Wandile, my mother, brothers and sisters. I won’t forget you Khwibi.
Acknowledgements

I owe this entire thesis to the LORD and Saviour of my life, Jesus Christ. If your Word, LORD, had not entered my heart, I would surely not be here this day. All glory be unto you always. Thank you for seeing me through.

I also wish to thank the following people for their intellectual and technical support:

Dr A. L. Abrie and Prof L. Ebersohn for supervising the study,
Dr R. Kasonga and Ms. J. Sommerville for providing statistical assistance,
Mr A. K. Welman for editing the language, and,
Dr T. Vandeyar for all the “doctoral” advice and support.

I also thank all the students and teachers who participated in the study.

My humblest gratitude to everyone who prayed for me, especially my students at the University of Pretoria.

I owe my wife, Simphiwe, a world of chocolate for believing in me and for being there when I was discouraged.
# Table of Contents

Abstract ...................................................................................................................................... ii
Declaration ................................................................................................................................ iv
Dedication ................................................................................................................................ v
Acknowledgements ................................................................................................................... vi
List of Tables ............................................................................................................................ vi
List of Figures ........................................................................................................................ viii

1. CHAPTER 1: PRELUDE TO THE STUDY ..................................................................... 1
   1.1 Challenges for HIV and AIDS education in South Africa: A problem statement ..... 1
   1.2 The research context: conceptualization ................................................................. 5
       1.2.1 The curriculum ..................................................................................................... 5
       1.2.2 Socialization and behaviour transformation ........................................................ 6
       1.2.3 Behavioural preferences ..................................................................................... 7
       1.2.4 Life Sciences knowledge and students ................................................................. 8
       1.2.5 Health education .................................................................................................. 9
   1.3 Rationale for the study ............................................................................................... 9
   1.4 Assumptions about knowledge and behaviour ......................................................... 12
   1.5 Locating the discourse of the study in the literature ............................................... 13
       1.5.1 Curriculum studies ............................................................................................. 13
       1.5.2 HIV and AIDS education ................................................................................... 14
   1.6 Aims of the study ........................................................................................................ 17
   1.7 Research question and subquestions ......................................................................... 17
   1.8 Theoretical approach of the study: a conceptual framework .................................... 18
       1.8.1 Determining behaviour: The theory of planned behaviour ................................. 18
       1.8.2 Factors affecting behavioural patterns: social cognitive theory ......................... 20
       1.8.3 Role of knowledge in behavioural patterns ......................................................... 23
1.8.4 Summary of Conceptual Framework ................................................................. 26
1.9 The researcher as a research instrument ............................................................ 27
1.10 Conclusion and implications of the study to the body of knowledge ............. 29

2. CHAPTER 2: EXPLORING THE CURRICULUM-BEHAVIOUR TRANSFORMATION RELATIONSHIP ................................................................. 31
  2.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................ 31
  2.2 Curriculum challenges can be resolved ............................................................... 32
  2.3 Curriculum challenges ....................................................................................... 34
    2.3.1 Challenge 1: The role of the hidden curriculum on socialization .............. 36
    2.3.2 Challenge 2: Students’ needs are not prioritized in formal education ....... 38
    2.3.3 Challenge 3: The intricacy of curriculum ................................................... 40
  2.4 Selection of content knowledge ........................................................................ 54
  2.5 Resolving the curriculum-behaviour transformation dilemma ....................... 58
    2.5.1 Experimentalism ......................................................................................... 58
    2.5.2 Transformative citizenship education ....................................................... 62
    2.5.3 Critical pedagogy ...................................................................................... 64
  2.6 Implications for the current study ..................................................................... 67

3. CHAPTER 3: A LUTA CONTINUA: THE BATTLE AGAINST HIV AND AIDS ........ 68
  3.1 Introduction ......................................................................................................... 68
  3.2 The educational cost of HIV and AIDS ............................................................ 69
  3.3 Educational weaponry against HIV and AIDS ................................................ 71
    3.3.1 Integration of HIV/AIDS knowledge into curricula: current trends ........ 72
    3.3.2 Non-curriculum strategies for HIV/AIDS education in South Africa ...... 80
    3.3.3 Effectiveness of HIV/AIDS education to reduce the spread of HIV ...... 83
  3.4 The enemy redefined: factors affecting the spread of HIV .............................. 87
    3.4.1 Risk behaviour ......................................................................................... 89
    3.4.2 Gender ..................................................................................................... 90
3.4.3 Stigma and discrimination ................................................................. 92
3.4.4 Sexuality education ........................................................................ 94
3.4.5 Human rights .................................................................................. 96
3.5 Why does health education fail? Lessons for HIV and AIDS education .......... 99
  3.5.1 Attitude towards health education .................................................. 99
  3.5.2 Designing health education programmes ....................................... 100
  3.5.3 Evaluating the effectiveness ............................................................ 103
3.6 Implications for the study .................................................................. 105

4. CHAPTER 4: METHODOLOGICAL APPROACH TO THE STUDY .............. 106
  4.1 Introduction ..................................................................................... 106
  4.2 Justification of methodological and metatheoretical paradigms .............. 107
  4.3 Methodology for research subquestion 1 ........................................... 110
    4.3.1 General approach ....................................................................... 110
    4.3.2 Investigating the curriculum ideology for Life Sciences ................. 112
    4.3.3 Determining Life Sciences concepts that may affect behavioural preferences ... 113
  4.4 Methodology for research subquestions 2 and 3 .................................. 118
    4.4.1 General approach ....................................................................... 118
    4.4.2 Sampling and sample description ................................................ 119
    4.4.3 Instrument design and validation ................................................... 121
      4.4.3.1 Drafting the questionnaire ....................................................... 121
      4.4.3.2 Validation through a panel of experts ...................................... 123
      4.4.3.3 Piloting the questionnaire ....................................................... 125
    4.4.4 Summary of the questionnaire generated in this phase ................... 128
    4.4.5 Data collection and analysis ......................................................... 129
  4.5 Conclusion ....................................................................................... 131

5. CHAPTER 5: HIV AND AIDS KNOWLEDGE FOR BEHAVIOUR
TRANSFORMATION IN THE BIOLOGY CURRICULUM .................................. 133
5.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................. 133

5.2 Results ..................................................................................................................... 134

5.2.1 Curriculum ideology for Life Sciences ............................................................... 134
  5.2.1.1 The aim of the subject of Life Sciences ....................................................... 134
  5.2.1.2 Knowledge prescribed in the Life Sciences curriculum............................... 136
  5.2.1.3 Instructional process..................................................................................... 137
  5.2.1.4 The nature and the role of students in the instructional process .............. 138
  5.2.1.5 The role of teachers during instruction ..................................................... 139
  5.2.1.6 The purpose of assessment....................................................................... 140
  5.2.1.7 Conclusion: the curriculum ideology for Life Sciences ......................... 141

5.2.2 Life Sciences concepts and skills that may affect HIV and AIDS behavioural preferences ................................................................................................................. 141
  5.2.2.1 Curriculum Analysis ................................................................................ 141
  5.2.2.2 Textbook analysis ....................................................................................... 146
  5.2.2.3 Conclusion: Life Sciences concepts and skills that could influence behaviour 153

5.3 Making sense of the results: reflecting on literature ............................................. 155
  5.3.1 Results that echo existing literature in curriculum studies and HIV and AIDS education.............................................................................................................................. 155
  5.3.2 New insights concerning HIV and AIDS education in Life Sciences ............ 158

5.4 Conclusion ............................................................................................................. 164

6. CHAPTER 6: HIV AND AIDS KNOWLEDGE AND BEHAVIOURAL PREFERENCES OF STUDENTS ................................................................................................. 166

6.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................. 166

6.2 Results ..................................................................................................................... 167

6.2.1 Students’ understanding of academic HIV and AIDS knowledge ............... 167

6.2.2 Students’ understanding of functional HIV and AIDS knowledge ............ 172

6.2.3 Students’ behavioural preferences ................................................................. 175
6.2.4 Does knowledge correlate with behaviour? ................................................................. 180

6.3 Making sense of the results: reflecting on literature ...................................................... 183
  6.3.1 Results that echo existing literature in HIV and AIDS education ...................... 183
  6.3.2 New insights for HIV and AIDS education ............................................................. 186

6.4 Conclusion....................................................................................................................... 191

7. CHAPTER 7: IMPLICATIONS OF THE STUDY FINDINGS: AN EPILOGUE........... 192
  7.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................. 192
  7.2 Revisiting the research subquestions with the major findings ................................. 194
    7.2.1 Addressing HIV and AIDS for behaviour transformation in the Life Sciences curriculum: research subquestion 1 ................................................................. 194
    7.2.2 HIV and AIDS knowledge and behavioural preferences of students: research subquestions 2 and 3 ............................................................................................................ 200
  7.3 Recommendations for further research ..................................................................... 204
    7.4 Recommendations for Life Sciences curriculum development and HIV and AIDS education ............................................................................................................................. 206
  7.5 Conclusion: there is a need for social reconstruction .................................................. 206

REFERENCES .......................................................................................................................... 209

APPENDICES ........................................................................................................................... 241

Appendix 1: Construction of Instruments for document analysis ....................................... 241
Appendix 2: Interview schedule with teachers for identifying textbooks ............................. 243
Appendix 3: Profile of students participating in the study .................................................... 244
Appendix 4: Consent letters .................................................................................................. 260
Appendix 5: Questionnaire given to panel of experts for validation .................................... 266
Appendix 6: Questionnaire used by experts to validate the questionnaire given to students 279
Appendix 7: Pilot Questionnaire .......................................................................................... 281
Appendix 8: Questionnaire given to students for data collection ........................................ 285
# List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table Number</th>
<th>Table Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 1.1</td>
<td>Overview of how research subquestions are responded to</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2.1</td>
<td>A comparison of curriculum ideologies (adapted from Schiro, 2008)</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3.1</td>
<td>A summary of HIV and AIDS intervention programs</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.1</td>
<td>An outline of the research methodology used</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.2</td>
<td>A framework for document analysis (adapted from Nicholls, 2003)</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.3</td>
<td>An instrument used for reviewing components of the Life Sciences curriculum (Adapted from Schiro, 2008)</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.4</td>
<td>Instrument for identifying concepts foregrounded in Life Sciences as important to influence behavioural preferences of students</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.5</td>
<td>Panel of experts participating in the validation of instruments in the study. Research IDs are used instead of real names for ethical reasons</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.6</td>
<td>Summary of students participating in the study</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.7</td>
<td>Students’ response patterns to the questionnaire, adapted from Taylor-Powell (2008)</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.8</td>
<td>Categories of questions in the final questionnaire</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.1</td>
<td>Content knowledge within the four knowledge strands extracted from the CAPS document (Department of Basic Education, 2010: 61 - 75)</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.2</td>
<td>Content knowledge related to Tissues, cells and molecular studies for Grades 10 to 12</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.3</td>
<td>Summary of learning outcomes for Life Sciences (Adapted from Department of Education, 2003a: p 11-12)</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.4</td>
<td>The variation in page volume given to concepts related to HIV and AIDS in Shuters Life Sciences Grade 11 Students Book (Ayerst et al., 2008) and Focus on Life Sciences (Clitheroe et al., 2008)</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.5</td>
<td>List of HIV and AIDS related concepts and their appearance frequency in Grade 11 textbooks</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6.1</td>
<td>The difference in percentage of students from the two groups, who correctly responded to individual questions</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6.2</td>
<td>Representing the average scores of the two groups on academic HIV and AIDS knowledge</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6.3</td>
<td>A Mann-Whitney test results comparing Life Sciences students and non-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Life Sciences students in academic HIV and AIDS knowledge.................................................. 170
Table 6.4 The difference in percentage of students from the two groups, who correctly responded to individual questions testing functional HIV and AIDS knowledge........................................................................................................................................... 172
Table 6.5 Presenting students’ understanding of functional HIV and AIDS knowledge.............................................................................................................................. 174
Table 6.6 Mann-Whitney test comparing the behaviour of students who take Life-Sciences and students who do not take Life-Sciences............................................................... 176
Table 6.7 Summary of behavioural preferences of students on selected variables....... 177
Table 6.8 Proportion of Life Sciences students who disagree with statement given in V21 to V30 of Appendix 8. .......................................................................................................................... 178
Table 6.9 Proportion of non-Life Sciences students who disagree with statement given in V21 to V30 of Appendix 8.............................................................................................. 179
Table 6.10 Spearman’s correlations between academic HIV and AIDS knowledge, functional HIV and AIDS knowledge and behavioural preferences for Life Sciences students (N = 300).......................................................................................................................... 180
Table 6.11 Spearman’s correlations between academic HIV and AIDS knowledge, functional HIV and AIDS knowledge and behavioural preferences for non-Life Sciences students (N = 243).......................................................................................................................... 181
Table 6.12 A summary of the correlations between Life Sciences, functional HIV and AIDS knowledge and behavioural preferences in schools................................................ 182
List of Figures

Figure 1.1 The Theory of Planned Behaviour (adapted from Ajzen, 2006).......................................................................................................................................................................................... 19
Figure 1.2 An illustration of the triadic reciprocal (adapted from Crittenden, 2005: 961)............................................................................................................................................... 21
Figure 1.3 The conceptual framework of the current study...................................................................................................................................................................... 27
Figure 3.1 An outline of non-curricula strategies of HIV and AIDS education.............................. 81
Figure 3.2 An illustration of HIV and AIDS education and factors that lead to the spread of HIV and AIDS..................................................................................................................................... 98
Figure 4.1 An overview of how the instrument for document analysis was developed........................................................................................................................................................................... 114
Figure 4.2 The process used to prepare and validate the questionnaire.............................................. 121
Figure 4.3 Content validity indices obtained from the panel of experts............................................. 124
Figure 4.4 Distribution of students’ scores in the pilot study............................................................... 127
Figure 6.1 Indicating mean differences (in percentages) in scores per school for Life Sciences and non-Life Sciences students............................................................................................................................................... 171
Figure 6.2 Mean differences between Life Sciences and non-Life Sciences students’ scores in functional HIV and AIDS knowledge items................................................................................................................................. 174
Figure 6.3 A distribution of students’ responses on behavioural preferences...................................... 175
Figure 7.1 A summary of knowledge available in literature and discussed in Chapters 2 and 3.................................................................................................................................................................................... 193