AN EXPLORATION OF FACTORS FACILITATING AND HINDERING CHANGE IN THE TEACHING OF BOTANY IN PRIMARY SCHOOLS

THESIS
Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the Degree of
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
of the University of Pretoria.

DIANNE EDITH GOODWIN

July 2008
An exploration of factors facilitating and hindering change in the teaching of botany in primary schools.

This is a report of an analysis of a project that aimed to pilot an environmental education curriculum development process and professional development model in a rural and historically educationally and economically disadvantaged area. The research looked at the topic “plants” as the biological content in the context of developing a school garden, which was an environmental system in this instance. The school garden was considered to be a local environmental issue that each and every teacher could relate to. The intention of this research was to determine which factors facilitated and hindered change in the teaching of botany in primary schools.

The format of the research involved a preliminary study (to determine the participant’s initial environmental and plant knowledge) and then the main study, which followed the pre-post test format with interventions in between. This research is an example of a case study and the methods used to conduct the “fieldwork” were guided workshops, compiling a booklet and developing a school garden.

The main study's starting point was that “active engagement promotes change”. Throughout this project active engagement was carried out to determine whether knowledge, skills and attitudes towards the environment could be changed by (i) the active participation of teachers in the production of a booklet on what and how to plant in a school garden and (ii) the actual development of a school garden.

The initial findings of the main study were compared to the final findings to determine whether the active interventions resulted in change, be it positive or negative. One of teacher education’s most challenging tasks is to prepare botany teachers to enable them to deliver active participation instruction. The results of the research showed that the participating teachers had not become more environmentally literate although they did improve their plant knowledge. They had given lessons in the garden and utilized some of the activities from the booklet in their teaching. They had shared these with their colleagues and when materials from the garden were used they did have a positive effect on the classroom interaction. Thus they all saw the value of planting up their school garden and the merits in using actual plant material from these gardens. The Heads of the participating schools expressed the opinion that the project had been a success and many of the participants’ colleagues said that they had also changed their teaching to outcomes-based teaching and that their learner’s attitude was now positive towards plants. Most of the student group said that they had told their
parents about the project and their parents said that they approved of them working in the garden thus learning life skills in a hands-on practical way.

The overall impression of the school gardens at the end of the programme was one of general improvement and even nine months after the project, the participants remembered the majority of planting skills that they had accomplished during the year and still found it important for students to learn these skills. Thus the research findings support the idea that active engagement promotes change.
DECLARATION

I declare that this dissertation is my own work. It is being submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy at the University of Pretoria. It has not been submitted for any degree or examination at any other university.

Dianne Edith Goodwin

July 2008
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract .............................................................................................................................................. 2

Declaration ......................................................................................................................................... 5

Table of Contents ............................................................................................................................... 6

List of Figures ...................................................................................................................................... 8

List of Tables ...................................................................................................................................... 9

List of Appendices ............................................................................................................................. 11

Acknowledgements .......................................................................................................................... 12

Chapter 1 .......................................................................................................................................... 13

Introduction ......................................................................................................................................... 13

1.A. The Purpose ................................................................................................................................. 13

1.B. The Origin of the Study .............................................................................................................. 13

1.C. The Need for the Study .............................................................................................................. 15

1.D. The Context of the Study ........................................................................................................... 16

1.E. The Unfolding of the Main Study ............................................................................................... 18

1.F. Research Questions .................................................................................................................... 18

1.G. Summary Of Future Chapters ................................................................................................... 19

Chapter 2 .......................................................................................................................................... 21

The Literature Related to the Preliminary and Main Studies .............................................................. 21

2.A. The Environment ....................................................................................................................... 21

2.B. Environmental Literacy ............................................................................................................ 23

2.C. Environmental Education ........................................................................................................ 24

2.C.1. The Objectives of Environmental Education ......................................................................... 24

2.C.2. The Interdisciplinary Nature of Environmental Education .................................................. 25

2.D. The Links Between Biological and Environmental Education ............................................... 25

2.D.1. The Content of Biology and Environmental Education ...................................................... 25

2.D.2. The Attitude Required in Biology and Environmental Education ....................................... 26

2.D.3. The Skills of Biology and Environmental Education ........................................................... 27

2.E. The Implementation of Environmental Education in a School Setting ..................................... 27

2.F. Barriers to the Implementation of Environmental Education .................................................. 28

2.F.1. Affective and Psychological Factors of Teachers ..................................................................... 29

2.F.2. Teacher Preparedness with regard to Skills .......................................................................... 29

2.F.3. Teacher Preparedness with regard to Knowledge ................................................................... 30

2.F.4. Cultural Factors with respect to Teachers ............................................................................ 30

2.F.5. Hegemonic Factors with respect to Teachers ........................................................................ 30

2.G. Teacher Development .............................................................................................................. 31

2.H. The Background to and Nature of Educational Reform in South Africa .................................. 32

2.H.1. Outcomes-Based Education (OBE) ...................................................................................... 33

2.H.2. Curriculum 2005 .................................................................................................................... 33

2.I. Bringing about Educational Change ........................................................................................... 35

2.J. The Development and use of Resource Material .................................................................... 35

2.K. Curriculum Innovation underpinning the Research ................................................................. 36

2.K.1. Learning Methodologies for Biology and Environmental Education ..................................... 36

2.K.2. Teaching Methodologies for Biology and Environmental Education ..................................... 36

2.L. Programme Development ......................................................................................................... 37


2.L.2. Education-For-Sustainability ............................................................................................... 38

2.L.3. Some Existing Environmental Programmes ........................................................................... 39

2.M. Research Paradigms in Environmental Education .................................................................... 42

2.N. Gardening as a Change Vehicle ............................................................................................... 43

2.O. Overview of Chapter Two ........................................................................................................ 47
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1. A Diagrammatic Representation of the Environment (Loubser, 1996a: p. 6)........21
Figure 2.2. A Holistic Representation of the Environment (Loubser, 1996a: p. 7) ..............22
Figure 2.3. Change Process Model (Fullan, 1991).............................................................28
Figure 2.4. The Transitional Model for Learning Primary Science (Mac Donald And Van Rooyen, 1987)..................................................................................................................41
Figure 5.1. “What Biology Pupils should be able to do” (From workshop presented by M. Saunders at University of Witwatersrand – 1999) .................................................................112
Figure 5.2. Process Skills ..................................................................................................127
Figure 5.3. Reflections on usage of Booklet “Gardening With Flora” ...............................130
LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1. Reliability of “Plant And Environmental Knowledge” Questionnaire…………..65
Table 4.1. Local Environmental Issues……………………………………………………………74
Table 4.2. Ways of Solving Local Environmental Issues……………………………………..75
Table 4.3. Players Involved in Solving Local Environmental Issues………………………..76
Table 4.4. Methods Used to Determine Stakeholders’ Perceptions of Local Environmental
        Issues……………………………………………………………………………………………..76
Table 4.5. Methods Used to Solve the Poor Delivery of Water .................................77
Table 4.6. The Different Schools in the Preliminary Study ..........................................77
Table 4.7. The Methods the Different Schools use to Encourage Environmental Education.78
Table 4.8. Areas that could be included in the School Garden .................................80
Table 4.9. Individual Items that could be included in the School Garden..................80
Table 4.10. Ways of Improving the School Garden ....................................................81
Table 4.11. Garden Resources used in the Learning Situation .................................83
Table 4.12. Plant Knowledge Relevant to the Different Learning Phases .......................86
Table 4.13. Plant Knowledge and the Relevant Plant Specimens ...............................87
Table 4.14. Plant Skills and the Relevant Plant Specimens .......................................89
Table 4.15. Attitude to Plants and the Relevant Plant Specimens .............................90
Table 5.1. Details of the Main Study Group .................................................................95
Table 5.2. Skill Order of Participants for Preparing a Bed for Planting, Sowing Seeds into
        Trays and Sowing Seeds In Situ ...............................................................................98
Table 5.3. State of School Garden Nine Months after Completion of Project ..............103
Table 5.4. Skills Awareness Questionnaire ...............................................................104
Table 5.5. Results of Skills Awareness Questionnaire after Intervention ..................105
Table 5.6. Results of Wilcoxon Rank Sum Test for Comparing Botany Knowledge and
        Environmental Questions ......................................................................................113
Table 5.7. Significant Results of Wilcoxon Rank Sum Test for Comparing Selected Botany
        Knowledge and Environmental Questions ..............................................................116
Table 5.8. Results on the Usage of the Booklet “Gardening with Flora” ..................131
Table 5.9. Results of “Science Observation Matrix” ....................................................133
Table 5.10. Discrepancies between Average Peer Observations and Separate Researcher
        Observations (Z) ........................................................................................................135
Table 5.11. Plant Attitude and the Relevant Plant Specimens .....................................140
Table 5.12. The Attitude Questionnaire used as the Instrument to Assess Attitudes to Plants
        Qualitatively .............................................................................................................141
Table 5.13. Combined Results from Heads of Participating Schools .............................144
Table 5.14. Results from Colleagues of Participating Schools ....................................145
Table 5.15. Combined Results from Colleagues of Participating Schools .....................147
Table 5.16. Results from Selected Individual Students of Participating Teachers ............150
Table 5.17. Combined Results from Selected Individual Students of Participating Teachers
Table 5.18. Individual Environmental Literacy Scores for Overall Pre-Test (14/4) and Post-Test (15/11)
Table 5.19. Individual Environmental Literacy Scores for Pre-Test and Post-Test according to Categories
Table C.1.1. Intercorrelations between Environmental Literacy and the Variables in Chacko’s (2001) “Environmental Literacy” Questionnaire
Table C.1.2. Reliability of Chacko’s (2001) “Environmental Literacy Questionnaire
Table C.1.3. The Concepts related to Environmental Literacy
Table C.1.4. Items in Section “B” of the Environmental Literacy Questionnaire
LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix A - Actual Preliminary Study Worksheets .......................................................... 199
Appendix B - Gauteng Biology Syllabus Sheets for Each Grade 1 – 7 .............................. 205
Appendix C - Environmental Literacy Questionnaire ....................................................... 210
Appendix C.1 – Validity and Reliability of Chacko’s Environmental Literacy Questionnaire. 219
Appendix D – Knowledge on “Plants and the Environment” Test ..................................... 224
Appendix E - Twelve Principles of Class Control (Plus One) by Al Janulaw ....................... 226
Appendix F – Photos ........................................................................................................... 232
Appendix G – Gardening Skills ........................................................................................ 286
Appendix H – Reflections on the State of a School Garden ............................................. 287
Appendix I – “Design A Plant” ......................................................................................... 288
Appendix J – The “Gardening with Flora” Booklet ............................................................ 289
Appendix K - Classroom Teaching Observation Matrix .................................................... 291
Appendix L – Questionnaire to Heads ............................................................................. 293
Appendix M – Questionnaire to Colleagues ....................................................................... 294
Appendix N – Questionnaire to Students ........................................................................ 295
Appendix O – Wedding Invitation ..................................................................................... 296
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My sincere thanks to:

Professor John Rogan and Professor Max Braun, my supervisors, for their constant encouragement, advice, unstinting assistance and interest in the preparation of this dissertation.

Mike van der Linde and Mr. Jackie Grimbeck for their willingness to give up their valuable time to help with the statistics.

The relevant teachers from Siyabuswa who sacrificed their teaching time in order to participate in this programme.

The relevant heads, peer teachers and students of the participating schools who found the time to complete the questionnaires.

Finally, my husband, Peter, and my children, Cary and Ryan, for their encouragement and the sacrifices they had to make during this period in my life!