Social housing: Lessons learnt from the international experience

Dissertation submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree
Master in Town and Regional Planning
in the Department of Town and Regional Planning, Faculty of Engineering, Built
Environment and Information Technology
at the University of Pretoria
by Sanet Pohl
July 2001

Supervisor: Professor Doctor M.S. Badenhorst
I would like to express my gratitude to the following people for their various contributions to this document:

my supervisor, Professor Badenhorst, for his assistance, encouragement and guidance

Carolien Samson for her assistance,

My family, and DT Bennet for their unwavering support.
Sosiale behuising: Lesse te leer uit die internasionale onderling

Ingehandig ter gedeeltelijke vervulling van die vereistes vir die graad Magister in Stads- en Streekbeplanning in the Department Stads- en Streekbeplanning, Universiteit van Pretoria, Junie 2001

Studieleer: Professor Doktor M. S. Badenhorst

Samevatting

Sosiale behuising is 'n relatiewe nuwe studieveld in die Suid-Afrikaanse behuisingssektor. Die Nasionale Departement van Behuising is tans besig met die formulering van 'n sosiale behuising beleidsraamwerk. Die Departement het in die Behuisingswitskrif (1994) erken dat die ontwikkeling van sodanige raamwerk sal kan baat vind by verwysings na internasionale ondervindings. In hierdie studie is die voorsiening van sosiale behuising in Europa, Suid-Amerika en Afrika bestudeer met die oog daarop om die verskillende wyses waarop sosiale behuising voorsien word, uit te lig en te identifiseer en om die lesse daaruit te leer vir die ontluikende Suid-Afrikaanse sosiale behuising beweging te identifiseer.

In die studie is daar tot die gevolgtekking gekom dat die primêre doel van sosiale behuising is om die noodsaaklike diens van behuising teen kosprys aan individue met beperkte finansiële vermoëns beskikbaar te stel. Sosiale behuisingsprojekte word uitgeoer deur sosiale behuisingsinstellings (SBIs) wat geklassifiseer kan word volgens byvoorbeeld hul reëlsstatus of rede/motivering vir hul bestaan. 'n Deurdagte klassifikasiestelsel kan aangewend word om te onderskei tussen sosiale behuisingsinstellings wat kwalifiseer vir staatshulp en die wat nie kwalifiseer nie.

Daar is verder tot die gevolgtekking gekom dat die ontwikkeling van 'n geïntegreerde en effektiewe sosiale behuisingbeweging afhanklik is van 'n reeks faktore wat almal in plek moet wees ten einde te verseker dat die verskillende vlakke wat deel uitmaak van 'n sosiale behuisingsbeweging op 'n wadersyds ondersteunende wyse kan saamwerk. Nasionale beleid en wetgewing skep die raamwerk van norme en standarde waarbinne al die SBIs hul funksies moet uitvoer. Institusionele ondersteuning in die formaat van nasionale ondersteuningsagentskappe, tegniese ondersteuningsagentskappe en internasionale ondersteuningsagentskappe is noodsaaklik om te verseker dat 'n diverse reeks van primêre sosiale behuisingsinstellings kan ontwikkel. Dit is ook belangrik om regulerings- en moniterings mekanismes in plek te stel ten einde te verseker dat die sosiale behuisingssektor alle finansiële hulp op 'n verantwoordelike en deursigte manier aanwend.

Hierdie studie het ook tot die gevolgtekking gekom dat sosiale behuisingsinstellings in komplekse finansiële milieu's funksioneer. Daar is veelvuldige
instrument/meganismes beskikbaar waarmee sosiale behuisingsinstellings gefinansier of ondersteun kan word. Al hierdie instrumente wat onder andere belastingkortings insluit, vorm saam 'n omvattende finansieringsraamwerk. Daar is bevind dat elke instrument/meganisme 'n unieke rol in sodanige finansierings raamwerk vervul.

Daar is laastens bevind dat die bestuur van sosial behuisingseenhede deurslaggewend is vir die sukses van sosiale behuisingsprojekte. As die bestuur van sosiale behuisingsprojekte nie op 'n sensitiewe en deursigtige manier gehanteer word nie, kan selfs hoë ideale om mense met hulle behuisingsbehoeftes behulpsaam te wees, sneuwel/misluk. Indien inwoners of huurders as gelyke vennote gehanteer word kan die bestuurstaak aansienlik vergemaklik word. Suksesvolle sosiale behuisingsprojekte kan slegs gedeeltelik deur ontwerp geskep word. Bestuurspraktyke wat daarop gemik is om tuistes eerder as blote akkommodasie te skep, is van veel groter belang.
Social housing: Lessons learnt from the international experience

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree Master in Town and Regional Planning in the Department of Town and Regional Planning at the University of Pretoria, June 2001

Supervisor: Professor Doctor MS Badenhorst

Summary

Social housing is a relatively new field of study in the South African housing sector. The National Department of Housing, as part of their multifaceted approach to address the housing crisis in South Africa, is currently in the process of developing a policy framework within which the emerging social housing sector is expected to operate. The White Paper on Housing (1994) acknowledged that the development of a social housing policy would require significant engagement with international expertise and experience. In this study the provision of social housing in Europe, South America and Africa was studied with a view to identify the particular ways and means in which social housing is provided under different situations and also, to identify the lessons that can be learnt from such experiences for the emerging social housing sector in South Africa.

The study concluded that the primary goal of social housing is to provide the essential service of housing at cost to people with limited financial means. Social housing projects are carried out by social housing institutions (SHIs) that can be classified according to inter alia legal status and motivation. Classification can, however, be used to distinguish between SHIs that qualify for public assistance and those that do not.

It was further concluded that the development of an integrated and effective social housing movement depends on a range of factors which all have to be in place if synergy is to be achieved between the various levels of the social housing movement. National legislation and policies create the framework, norms and standards within which all the actors in the sector have to fulfil their functions. Institutional support in the form of a national sponsoring agency, technical service organisations as well as international aid agencies are essential for the development of a diverse range of primary societies that are responsive to a wide range of accommodation needs. Regulation and monitoring mechanisms are essential to ensure that the sector uses the public resources allocated to it in a responsible and accountable manner.
In terms of the financing of social housing the study concluded that (SHIs) are operating/functioning within complex financial environments that are continuously changing. There are quite a few instruments/mechanisms that can be used to finance/support SHIs. All these instruments e.g. grants, tax incentives and public-private partnerships together form a comprehensive funding framework within which each instrument has a particular niche or function to fulfil.

Lastly, the study concluded that housing management is literally the end all with regards to social housing. All the good intentions to assist those in need of housing within a supportive environment can fail if housing management is not done sensibly and transparently. Great benefit can be achieved from treating residents or tenants as partners with a view to ease the task of management. Successful social housing estates are created partly through design, but even more importantly through good management practises aimed at creating homes and not merely accommodation.
LIST OF SEARCH TERMS

Social housing
Housing associations
Social housing institutions
Housing co-operatives
National sponsoring agencies
Technical service organisations
Social housing legislative framework
Financing social housing
Financial instruments/mechanisms
Housing management
Management structures
Unit allocation
Maintenance
Rent collection
Tenant participation
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Samevatting

Summary

List of search terms

CHAPTER 1: THE PROBLEM AND ITS SETTING

1.1 INTRODUCTION 1

1.2 PROBLEM STATEMENT AND STUDY OBJECTIVE 7

1.2.1 Problem statement 7

1.2.2 Study objective 7

1.2.3 Applicability of the study 7

1.3 STUDY METHOD 8

1.4 EXPOSITION OF STUDY 9

CHAPTER 2: THE HOUSING POLICY FRAMEWORK IN SOUTH AFRICA

2.1 INTRODUCTION 11

2.2 BACKGROUND HISTORY 11

2.3 PROGRESS ON THE NATIONAL HOUSING PROGRAMME 16

2.3.1 Normalising the housing environment 16

2.3.2 Subsidy assistance to low income households 21

2.3.3 Supporting the housing process 25

2.3.4 Mobilising savings and housing credit 30

2.3.5 Promoting access to land with secure tenure 33

2.3.6 Co-ordinating the public sector’s actions, strategies and investments 38

2.3.7 Rationalising institutional and legal framework 39

2.4 ONE MILLION TARGET 40

2.5 CONCLUSION 41
CHAPTER 3: DESCRIPTION OF SOCIAL HOUSING, THE EVOLUTION AND CLASSIFICATION OF SOCIAL HOUSING INSTITUTIONS

3.1 INTRODUCTION 43

3.2 DESCRIPTION OF THE TERM SOCIAL HOUSING 43

3.3 EVOLUTION OF SOCIAL HOUSING IN INDUSTRIALISED COUNTRIES 44

3.3.1 Models of social housing provision 44
3.3.2 Historical overview 47

3.4 SOCIAL HOUSING IN DEVELOPING COUNTRIES 57

3.5 CLASSIFICATION OF SHIs 59

3.5.1 Defining the term housing association 59
3.5.2 Classification 61

3.6 CONCLUSION 76

CHAPTER 4: INSTITUTIONAL AND OTHER SUPPORT STRUCTURES/INITIATIVES

4.1 INTRODUCTION 78

4.2 INTEGRATED VS DECENTRALISED SYSTEMS 79

4.3 ORGANISATIONAL LEVELS OF SOCIAL HOUSING MOVEMENTS 83

4.3.1 National sponsoring agencies 83
4.3.2 Secondary or mother societies - also known as technical service organisations 94
4.3.3 Primary/daughter societies 98
4.3.4 International social housing institutions 100

4.4 THE ROLE OF INTERNATIONAL AID AGENCIES 101

4.5 THE ROLE FUNCTION OF A SOCIAL HOUSING LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORK 103

4.6 THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN PRIMARY AND SECONDARY SOCIETIES (SHIs) 106

4.7 CONCLUSION 109
CHAPTER 5: FINANCING SOCIAL HOUSING

5.1 INTRODUCTION

5.2 REASONS FOR PUBLIC SECTOR FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE TO THE SOCIAL HOUSING SECTOR

5.3 APPROACHES TO THE FINANCING OF SOCIAL HOUSING

5.3.1 Co-ordinated funding efforts
5.3.2 Facilitate funding at the provincial level
5.3.3 Targeted funding to respond to SHI specific needs
5.3.4 Institutional subsidy

5.4 INSTITUTIONS PROVIDING FINANCIAL SUPPORT TO SHIs

5.4.1 Private/commercial financial sector that includes inter alia building societies, savings and loan associations and banks
5.4.2 Non-institutional sources
5.4.3 Public Finance

5.5 FINANCIAL INSTRUMENTS AND/OR MECHANISMS

5.5.1 Loans (subsidised or at market interest rates)
5.5.2 Capital grants
5.5.3 Public private partnerships
5.5.4 Incentives (excluding tax incentives)
5.5.5 Directives to secure funding for SHIs
5.5.6 Tax incentives
5.5.7 Guarantees
5.5.8 Bridging finance
5.5.9 Cross subsidisation
5.5.10 Sources of additional income

5.6 CONCLUSION

CHAPTER 6: HOUSING MANAGEMENT

6.1 INTRODUCTION

6.2 HISTORICAL OVERVIEW OF SOCIAL HOUSING MANAGEMENT APPROACHES

6.3 MANAGEMENT STRUCTURES
6.3.1 Management structures used by small housing associations/SHIs 177
6.3.2 Management structures often used by large SHIs 181

6.4 MANAGEMENT FUNCTIONS 183
6.4.1 Unit allocation 183
6.4.2 Maintenance 190
6.4.3 Rent collection 190
6.4.4 Tenant participation 197

6.5 CONCLUSION 202

CHAPTER 7: SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION 211

BIBLIOGRAPHY 249
LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1   Capital subsidy levels in 1995
Table 2.2   Reviewed capital subsidy levels in 1998
Table 3.1   Classification of housing associations/SHIs according to legal status
Table 3.2   Classification of housing associations/SHIs according to motivation
Table 3.3   Housing associations/SHIs classified according to size
Table 3.4   Housing associations/SHIs classified according to their geographical scope
Table 3.5   Housing associations/SHIs classified according to the time-period they remain active
Table 3.6   Housing associations/SHIs classified according to function
Table 3.7   Housing associations/SHIs classified according to general status
Table 4.1   Origins of established social housing institutions (1998)
Table 4.2   Provincial spread of social housing institutions
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 4.1 Division of planning and decision-making powers between the different levels of a social housing movement 79

Figure 4.2 The Swedish Tenant’s Savings Bank and Building Society 81

Figure 5.1 Geographical representation of the approach of selected countries with regards to the funding of social housing 118

Figure 6.1 Management structures used by small housing associations/SHIs 171

Figure 6.2 Management structure preferred by large housing associations/SHIs 175