The influence of conflicting medieval church and social discourses on individual consciousness: dissociation in the visions of Hadewijch of Brabant

Christa Krüger
Department of Psychiatry, University of Pretoria,
Weskoppies Hospital, Pretoria, South Africa[*]

Abstract

This article examines the influence of the conflicting discourses in the medieval church and its social context on the subconscious experiences of Hadewijch of Brabant, a 13th century Flemish visionary, mystical author, vernacular theologian and Beguine leader. Her 14 visions of becoming one with God are analysed for evidence of dissociative states. Her dissociative experiences are interpreted in the light of a contextual model of dissociation, according to which dissociation is an information-processing tool that fosters a sense of self-in-society in the face of conflicting discourses. Hadewijch's visions and dissociation, which she used to teach her fellow Beguines, reveal her growth towards an integrated God-consciousness and her inner psychological integration of consciousness and the unconscious. The contextual model of dissociation provides a useful conceptual framework and hermeneutical tool for evaluating the consciousness of a person in a remote historical-cultural epoch.

Introduction

Hadewijch of Brabant occupies a unique place in medieval church history. A Flemish visionary, mystical author, vernacular theologian and Beguine leader of the 13th century, she is one of the three most significant original Beguine mystics whose written works have survived until the present, the other two being Mechthild of Magdeburg (c.1217–1282) and Marguerite Porete (c.1250–1310) (McGinn 1998:199–265; Larrington 1995).

---

[*] Correspondence to: Christa Krüger, Department of Psychiatry, University of Pretoria, Weskoppies Hospital, Private Bag X113, Pretoria, 0001, South Africa. E-mail: christa.kruger@up.ac.za.

Hadewijch's exceptional contribution lies in the way in which she managed to live with and integrate different types of conflicting discourse: Latin intellectualised theology versus sensual mysticism; church life versus profane love poetry; traditional medieval gender roles versus new roles for religious women; male God-language versus female representations of the divine; and God's transcendence versus becoming one with God. Hadewijch developed a unique integration of these discourses while writing prolifically on the subject and teaching her fellow Beguines, and through it all managing to escape being burned at the stake.

This article examines the writings of Hadewijch, specifically her 14 visions of becoming one with God, and the evidence of dissociation in them (Vekeman 1980). The aim is to investigate the link between the conflicting theological, ecclesiastical and social discourses of her time and what will be shown to be her dissociated consciousness. When one thinks about civilisation as "out there" and the individual unconscious as "in here", and one is reminded of the interaction between the two, questions arise about when or why such interaction might take place and how it might work. More specifically, the question arises whether and, if so, to what extent and how Hadewijch's life, theological work and visions represented a solution to living with religio-socio-contextual conflict.

The present enquiry takes place in an interdisciplinary context where on the one hand theology, specifically church history, and on the other hand psychiatry and psychology, might meet. The focus is on the role of conflict as a potential motivating force and mediating influence in the interaction between a person's social and church context and her/his unconscious/subconscious experiences, with reference to one individual whose alternating conscious and subconscious mental processes provide a special window on the problem.

A number of interdisciplinary gaps underlie this case study. The relationship between a person's individual consciousness and her/his social context and the question of how one person is able to understand another person's consciousness have been topics of research in the fields of transpersonal anthropology, psycho-cultural anthropology and social psychology (Adolphs 2007; Bargh 2007; Throop & Laughlin 2007). Understanding or evaluating the consciousness of a person living in another cultural and historical epoch poses even more of a challenge.

At the level of individual consciousness, the concept of dissociation is currently used in the fields of psychiatry and psychology to refer to an unconscious intrapsychic process whereby some mental processes or contents are segregated from the rest, and ideas or emotions are separated from one another (American Psychiatric Association 1994; World Health Organization 1992). When a person no longer experiences integration between memory, a sense of identity, and conscious awareness, that person is said to suffer from

a dissociative disorder (American Psychiatric Association 1994; World Health Organization 1992). However, despite the apparent agreement among the disciplines on a definition, controversy exists with regard to the mechanism and role of dissociation (for example, whether dissociation is a psychological defence mechanism, a neurocognitive tool, or a symptom of mental illness), the role that the process of dissociation might play in creating a person's consciousness, and the multiplicity (or not) of normal consciousness (Beahrs 1982; Kihlstrom 2007; Simons et al 2007).

Considering the different perspectives held in the fields of psychiatry and psychology, and theology and religious studies on the nature and aetiology of mental illness and related aspects, it is not surprising that previous Hadewijch studies in the fields of theology, literature or poetry have neglected her mental state (De Paepe 1973, 1979, 1983; Hart 1980; Mommaers 1990, 2004; Van der Zeyde 1934, 1936; Van Mierlo 1948–1951, 1950; Vekeman 1980; and others). Furthermore, the human response to social conflict has been studied in the fields of psychology and political science, albeit at a social or behavioural level, rather than at an individual psychological level (Holmes & Murray 1996; Levine & Thompson 1996; Pruitt 1998; Rusbult & Van Lange 1996; Stainton Rogers 2003).

Methodologically, this is a document-based case study of a person in a remote historical epoch. The text of Hadewijch's visions constitutes the data, and the case study serves to gain knowledge about a social issue, that is, dissociation in Hadewijch's conflictual context (Fouché 2002; Strydom & Delport 2002). Hadewijch's context is examined for sources of conflict and ambivalence. Her visions (Vekeman 1980) are then analysed thematically for evidence of dissociative states and for signs of progressive resolution of the dissociation through her visions. Her potential dissociative experiences are then interpreted in the light of a contemporary contextual psychiatric model of dissociation, and some bridges are built among the concepts. Elements of the method of portraiture are also used (Hoffmann Davis 2003). In reading Hadewijch's works, the original ground texts in Middle Dutch (De Paepe 1979; Van Mierlo 1950; Vekeman 1980) are complemented by translations in modern Dutch (Vekeman 1980) and English (Hart 1980).

Hadewijch's life and work

Hadewijch of Brabant was a visionary, mystical author and vernacular theologian who lived as a Beguine leader in the early 13th century (see the section below entitled "Hadewijch's conflictual social context") in what is now the northern part of Belgium.

Her date of birth is unknown and little is known about her personal background, except that she was a highly educated woman who chose not to

enter into either of the two regular states available to women of her time, namely those of married lady of the castle and nun (Mommaers 2004).

Hadewijch's work consists of 31 letters, most of which were written to junior Beguines (Mommaers 1990; Ortmanns-Cornet 1986; Van der Zeyde 1936; Van Mierlo 1948–1951), 45 poems in stanzas (De Paepe 1973, 1983; Rombauts & De Paepe 1961; Van Baest 1998), 16 poems in couplets (Ortmanns-Cornet 1988), 14 visions (more correctly, 11 visions presented in 14 sections) (Vekeman 1980), and a number of songs (Snellen 1907). Her entire oeuvre was probably written between 1221 and 1240 (Hart 1980).

Although she knew Latin and French, she wrote in Middle Dutch on the subject of, among other things, her explicit personal contact with God, in order to teach her fellow Beguines. In her writings, she developed a unique female love mysticism that focused on becoming one with God – a unique integration of courtly love poetry and Latin theology.

Hadewijch's use of her visions to teach others about living in such a way as to become one with God distinguishes her from other visionaries, such as Hildegard of Bingen (1098–1179), a prophetic teacher and theologian, whose mostly waking visionary experiences of a living light, associated with protracted illness, seem to have inspired her writings; and Elizabeth of Schönau (1128–1165), a prophet, reformer and teacher, who wrote about being in rapture and experiencing ecstatic states during which she received heavenly messages to be proclaimed to the church rather than direct, transforming contact with God (McGinn 1994:333–337). Hadewijch's visions, by contrast, involve explicit personal contact with God, entailing a transformation from her previous not-yet-full-grown state to being full-grown in God.

Much has been written about Hadewijch, mainly in the fields of theology and literature (Mommaers 2004). In the literary context Hadewijch is hailed as the pioneer poet of the Dutch language because of her immaculate technique, into which an artist's experience of the world and of herself is woven, and her powerful imagination. She is also acclaimed for her musicality and the skilful rhythm of her writing – a captivating psychological kind of ebb-and-flow, a going-out-of and coming-back-into this world, a reassuring balance of transcendence and immanence, always returning to the here and now (Van Mierlo 1950:36–40).

The central theme in Hadewijch's work is love. She often appears to equate love (*minne*) with God, for instance, "God-is-love" (Van Baest 1998:10) and the love that God is (Newman 2003:169–181). In the words of Bowie (1990): "For Hadewijch, Love (minne) becomes her spouse, her Lady mistress, her God, her companion, a mistress who leads Hadewijch through bleak times, moments of isolation and despair, as well as giving her periods of rapture and delight."

Van Mierlo (1948–1951, vol. II) comments on Hadewijch's *minne* as referring to God-characteristics: divine love (*caritate*) (1948:63–64), the

service of love (:65), living Christ (:71), virtues (:72) and love for others (:74). Reynaert (1981) analyses all the names by which Hadewijch refers to *minne*: *minne* is, inter alia, "light"/"clarity" (:55–90), "coals" (:91–97), "fire" (:99–133), "dew" (:135–142), "water"/"flood" (:143–159) and "hell" (:161–174). He concludes that *minne* for Hadewijch is a psychic-metaphysical power that is personified at times by, and that applies mostly but not exclusively to, and is directed mostly but not exclusively at divine love (Reynaert 1981:439–441).

In a more applied way, De Paepe (1983:29, 30, 38ff, 46) interprets Hadewijch's *minne* as meeting God in the world, a striving towards a sophisticated life (*een drang naar levensverfijning*) (:33–34), and simultaneously as a place, a way and an aim (*gelyktydig situatie, weg en doel*) (:43–45). Along similar lines, in the context of Hadewijch's stanzaic poems, Newman (2003) refers to a stormy relationship with love ("tension between faith and experience, or memory and desire" (:177)) and the threefold quest of love: to do battle for love, as love, and against love (:180).

From the variety of love references above, it is evident that oscillation and paradox are prominent themes in Hadewijch's work. Paradox is probably epitomised in Hadewijch's dilemma of satisfaction-frustration: that is, of the oscillation between God as fruition (*ghebruken*) and human as lack of fruition (*ghebreken*) (De Paepe 1973:9; McGinn 1994:346).

Moreover, De Paepe (1979), commenting on all of Hadewijch's works, refers to her paradoxical intertwinement of intellect and love (:xxiv) and God's transcendence and love that never really meet (:xxxvii). In the context of Hadewijch's stanzaic poems, De Paepe (1973) interprets Hadewijch's *minne* as the experience of dichotomies such as joy and suffering, certainty and doubt, hope and despair (:8); as an unbridgeable ravine (:9); and as psychic tension/unravelling of self (*zelfontraadseling* (:10–11)). In the context of Hadewijch's letters, an introduction by Herwig Arts in Ortmanns-Cornet (1986) refers to the unavoidable tension between truth, freedom and love (:8), between pride, courage and freedom (:9), and between God's presence and absence (:10).

The oscillation and paradoxicality further manifest in a third theme that is relevant for this study, namely that of gender malleability and female representations of the divine (Newman 2003:172), as well as gender role reversal (Schillebeeck, in the introduction to Van Baest 1998:5). In this regard, Van Mierlo (1950:26) refers to Hadewijch's assuming the male voice of a knight, especially in her visions.

As will be shown below, these themes of love, oscillation and paradox, and gender malleability in Hadewijch's work appear to mirror the tensions and ambivalence in her 13th century social context, where new movements were arising with regard to conceptualising and relating to God and oneself, living a good life, and exploring new social structures and roles.

Hadewijch's conflictual social context

The conflict and ambivalence in Hadewijch's context spanned a number of different levels. In addition to political changes, urbanisation, commercialisation, educational progress and increased literacy, the society of her day witnessed a number of new religious developments.

Whereas theology in Western Europe throughout the millennium preceding Hadewijch's life tended towards an intellectualisation of faith, according to which reason and reason-based doctrine were the route to knowing God, a different mystical emphasis developed in the 12th and 13th centuries. The new mystical concern was a direct, primary, personal and sensual experience of God, as opposed to an intellectualised relationship with Him. Although visions had been a common aspect of the continuing revelation of God throughout the Middle Ages, the flood of visionary narratives that followed shortly after 1200 reflected this new form of mystical consciousness, or mystical knowing of the divine, among both men and women (McGinn 1994, 1998).

Another revolutionary religious movement in Hadewijch's time, the *vita apostolica*, represented a return from the prevalent monastic theology ("monastic" because it was located in monasteries and cloisters, the church structures of those times) to the (non-institutionalised) way of life of the apostles, where religious persons lived as preachers and evangelists. This revolution was accompanied by a shift from the use of Latin to at least preaching in vernacular languages (McGinn 1998; Mommaers 2004).

A third revolutionary religious movement related to gender roles, where religious women (*mulieres religiosae*) concerned themselves in their inner life with attaining a loving union with Jesus Christ as the Son of God (McGinn 1998). This union was often described in sensual terms, even in erotic terms of physical union. This was clearly in contrast with Latin theology, in terms of which the human body, and especially the female body, was viewed as a symbol of sinfulness that had to be transcended in order to further one's striving towards the likeness of God. No longer did women think of themselves as second-rate human beings or fallen "Eves" who could attain salvation only through a life of subjugation and service to their husbands: now women could approach God in their own right (McGinn 1998).

This gender revolution also manifested in the outward organisation of the lives of religious women, who ventured outside the cloisters (for example, outside the Cistercian, Premonstratensian, Vallombrosan, Carthusian, or Dominican orders) to explore alternative ways of religious life. Some lived as *reclusae/inclusae*/anchoresses, isolating themselves from society in order to devote all their time to solitary religious contemplation, deliberately dying to the world through voluntary enclosure in a small room or cell, in

some cases temporarily, and in others for the rest of their lives (McGinn 1998).

One of these new forms of religious life was the Beguine movement, which originated in Lotharingia in the present-day Belgium, and spread to northern France, Holland and Germany. Although both men and women became Beguines, the women's movement was stronger and came to represent a new female self-consciousness. Groups of lay women who renounced the role of married lady of the castle, and who did not feel at home in the male-dominated Christian church, but who felt driven to live religious lives, chose to live together in religiously focused communities. They preached, did charitable works and contributed to the general upliftment of their communities, while falling outside the structures of the churches and the authority of the priests (McGinn 1998; Mommaers 2004). These informal religious, charitable communities of women were opposed to the legalism and isolationism of the patriarchal male-dominated church and convent life, and were persecuted as heretics, with a number of Beguines being burned at the stake. The Beguines were also criticised for their disregard for the protection offered by marriage; this disregard was viewed as contributing to social disorder (Bowie 1990; Mommaers 2004).

Societal conflict during the 13th century also extended to the so-called profane revolution, where the French troubadours sang courtly love poetry to their ladies. Hadewijch was familiar with courtly love poetry and exposed to the societal ambivalence between the reverence for the ruling male God as the recipient of human love and the idealisation of the female figure as object of male desire. One of the features of Beguine mysticism was the fusion and integration of courtly love poetry with Christianity. Barbara Newman (2003) describes this two-way process as the simultaneous, progressive Christianisation of erotic love and the eroticisation of divine love. This integration was accompanied, inter alia, by a shift from the traditional monastic reaction to the Song of Songs in the Bible – with both men and women assuming a female persona in relation to the male Divine Lover – to adopting a male voice vis-à-vis a female object of desire (that is, Lady Love) (McGinn 1998:169; Newman 2003:139).

Thus, the medieval social context in which Hadewijch found herself can be considered something of a combustion point in the early medieval humanist renaissance in Europe, at the intersection of several conflicting societal discourses, where the troubadours represented the profane revolution, and the Beguines represented the new religious movement and a new female self-consciousness.

Let us turn now to the psychological phenomenon that is postulated to have been relevant in Hadewijch's life and work.

Contextual model of dissociation

The currently fashionable definition of dissociation referred to earlier, namely a state marked by a lack of integration between memory, a sense of identity, and conscious awareness (American Psychiatric Association 1994; World Health Organization 1992), is descriptive and cognitive in nature, and does not account for its aetiology or the possible mechanisms through which it might arise.

Although mystical trance states have often been linked to the psychological process of dissociation (Bhugra & Bhui 2007; West 1967), the utility of most of the existing Western psychological and psychiatric models of dissociation for evaluating such trance states has been limited either by their descriptive, non-explanatory nature, as in the Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders (DSM) model (American Psychiatric Association, 1994), or by their exclusive focus on intrapsychic, non-communal processes.

For the purpose of the interpretation of Hadewijch's dissociative states, and given the focus of this article on the role of contextual conflict in her mystical visions, a contextual model of dissociation is used, which accounts for the interrelatedness of individuals with their social contexts (Krüger et al. 2007). Following the description of the model in this section, the next section will describe the evidence of dissociation in Hadewijch's visions; this dissociation will then be reinterpreted as an expression of and solution to the conflict that was so pervasive in her context.

In the preamble to the above-mentioned contextual model of dissociation, a team of five South African women psychiatrists and psychiatric registrars/residents found that a direct application of existing Western models of dissociation in their professional psychiatric context was problematic for a number of reasons. The team then set out to develop a model of dissociation that would overcome the limitations of these Western models and that would fit the pluralistic South African context. This new model was based on the following three Western models: the idea of everyday dissociation as processing of information and integration of mental contents (American Psychiatric Association 1994; West 1967); dissociation as a skewed information-processing reaction after traumatic events (Bremner et al. 1996; Hartman & Burgess 1993; Van der Kolk 1994); and dissociation as a skewed information-processing reaction due to intrapsychic conflict (Allen 1993; Gabbard 1994).

First, the Western model of everyday dissociation as processing of information and integration of mental contents was considered (American Psychiatric Association 1994; West 1967). According to this model, two filters aid in information processing. The first comprises the brain's resources and the second the psychological resources for information processing. The

first filter consists of an intact brain, chemical homeostasis, cognitive abilities, and intelligence. Its input is externally generated sensory information, that is, information derived through the senses of sight, hearing, touch, taste, and smell, as well as internally generated information such as proprioception, emotions, thoughts, and actions. The brain's resources contribute to creating the person's consciousness and laying down memory. The second filter – the dissociative filter – is a normal psychological tool that filters sensory, emotional and thought-related information so that only a manageable selection of information occupies the person's conscious awareness, just sufficient for the construction of a coherent sense of self, personal integrity, and personal identity.

Next considered was dissociation as a skewed information-processing reaction when a person is overwhelmed by information relating to traumatic events, such as natural disasters, interpersonal abuse, or any other trauma (Bremner et al. 1996; Hartman & Burgess 1993; Van der Kolk 1994). The person may experience a state of emotional shock and altered information processing. The brain's resources for information processing may be overwhelmed by the additional input of traumatic sensory experiences along with the usual sensory experiences, yet nevertheless attempt to process all the information. However, the dissociative defence mechanism may filter out the traumatic experiences, resulting in amnesia of the trauma, while memory of usual events remains unaffected.

Also considered was dissociation as a skewed information-processing reaction due to intrapsychic conflict (Allen 1993; Gabbard 1994). In terms of this model, a person's consciousness receives information from conflicting states of mind. For example, information relating to a person's desire not to be at work may be in conflict with information relating to the same person's need to be appreciated as a committed employee. The two sets of information cannot comfortably be held in consciousness at the same time without the person experiencing significant anxiety. Hence, at a given time, one of the sets of information may be filtered out of conscious awareness.

However, these Western models did not fit a number of the team's clinical encounters with dissociation in the South African context. First, all refer to intrapsychic phenomena in a single individual which are taken to explain certain mental symptoms, whereas in South Africa, mental symptoms are often found to be due to social problems such as problems in the relationships between family members and neighbours, problems with the ancestors, and witchcraft. Second, some concepts relating to dissociation, such as individual identity alteration, just do not seem to fit the local context, where an individual's state of mind is considered to be, ideally, in fluctuating harmony with her/his community's state of wellbeing.

The team then engaged in an auto-ethnographic discourse to examine the concept of dissociation in terms of their own collective background, life

and world views, perspectives on mental illness and spirituality, and appreciation of healing in their professional context (Ellis & Bocher 2000). They used this discourse in building on the above Western models, expanding them until they fitted their own context.

It was proposed that the discourse on dissociation be shifted from an individual level to a social level, where the roles of intrapsychic, inter-personal, social, cultural, spiritual, and environmental contexts in the development of dissociation could be acknowledged explicitly. All of these contexts were included in an expanded model of dissociation, according to which various types and sets of information contributed by the various contexts in which a person moves about constitute an individual's conscious-ness. There is some interaction between the individual's consciousness and the various contexts, as a result of which information is added to conscious-ness from each context in which the person operates.

For example, an individual's external physical environment contri-butes to consciousness sets of sensory information relating to events that occur. The person's intrapsychic make-up adds awareness of internally generated emotions, thoughts and actions. Interpersonal relationships repre-sent another context that contributes to consciousness information relating to these relationships, some of which may be traumatic in nature. The next context is the person's socio-cultural milieu, which may contribute con-flicting sets of information pertaining to conflicting socio-cultural values. The spiritual dimension represents yet another context that may contribute information about joyous experiences or incompatible belief systems. The person's dissociative filter then selects from all the contributed information those sets of information that will be retained in consciousness at a given time; the person's sense of self is constructed from all the information that remains in conscious awareness.

With specific reference to conflicting socio-cultural values, an indivi-dual can ordinarily move about in more than one conflicting "world" at the same time. For example, a person may simultaneously move about in a world that values the endeavours of a professional (such as her work context), as well as in a world that disapproves of such endeavours (such as her church context). The person's brain resources then process the information from the experiences that relate to both "world A" and "world B". In such a situation of gender role conflict, a woman cannot be a good wife and/or mother and a good professional at the same time, since these categories are considered mutually exclusive by the patriarchal society in which she operates. Hence, the woman would develop different personae or masks for different situations – an "identity A"/"persona A" for living in and dealing with "world A", and an "identity B"/"persona B" for living in and dealing with "world B". In order to ease the conflict between the two personae, the dissociative filter would then segregate the two conflicting sets of information and process the

information differently, depending on the circumstances. While "persona A" is active, information relating to "persona B" is filtered out of conscious awareness, and vice versa. However, the price that is paid for this is a fragmented sense of self.

It should also be borne in mind that trauma or conflict may occur on a communal level. Hence, the idea of conflict was expanded from representing an intrapsychic phenomenon to conflict as a social contextual phenomenon. Since the dissociative process occurs in a similar way in a community of individuals, it can be said to occur on a collective level. In such a case, shared individual intrapsychic dissociation would become collective dissociation. The community's dissociative filters may then segregate these conflicting sets of information, creating a double consciousness and resulting in a fragmented collective identity, which would manifest differently depending on the circumstances.

This contextual model of dissociation thus includes a person's interpersonal, socio-cultural, and spiritual contexts, in addition to the intrapsychic context. Dissociation is considered pivotal in the process of the normal construction of an individual sense of self and communal identities in the face of conflicting sets of information from various contexts. According to this model, dissociation can help an individual or a community to survive in a world of conflicting messages, where the conflict is often interpersonal or cultural or societal in nature, rather than intrapsychic.

Dissociation is therefore considered a normal information-processing tool that operates to maintain normal consciousness and thus, in the social context, balanced, coherent selves-in-society, that is, individuals connected to one another.

If an individual experiences a good balance between the contributions from the various contexts to her/his conscious awareness, the sense of self that emerges is a balanced, coherent self-in-society, that is, an individual connected to other people. Similarly, if a community experiences a good balance between the contributions from the various contexts to the community's collective conscious awareness, there is harmony in the community. On the other hand, traumatic events or situations of conflicting values (within one person or between people) represent challenges to individual or collective information processing, and may precipitate dissociation.

To return to Hadewijch: if one considers the pervasive conflict and ambivalence in her medieval social context, one wonders whether Hadewijch might perhaps have been prone to experiencing dissociative states.

Evidence of dissociation in Hadewijch's visions

In the context of the above-mentioned societal sources of conflict and ambivalence, Hadewijch writes about her visions and waking states as suc-

cessive, contiguous, and mutually exclusive mental states. She repeatedly mentions what would be labelled today as dissociative states that accompanied religious rituals or overwhelming emotion, for example, grief, despair, fear, longing, or desirous love for God (Hart 1980).

For example, she speaks of being "taken up in the spirit" (Hart 1980, V.10, p 287, l.1) and "entrancement of spirit" (Hart 1980, V.14, p 304, l.39), which suggests possession trance, a subtype of dissociative disorder (American Psychiatric Association 1994). Hadewijch appears to have experienced such states both frequently and intermittently; in some instances these states lasted half an hour (Hart 1980, V.10, p 288, l.21) and in others days at a time (Hart 1980, V.14, p 304, ll. 38–40 to p 305, ll. 1–2).

One of the typical features of dissociative states is that the person feels as if she/he is observing her/his body from the outside (Bernstein & Putnam 1986; Krüger & Mace 2002; Ross et al. 1989; Steinberg et al. 1994; Vanderlinden et al. 1993). In this regard, Hadewijch writes, "I fell out of the spirit" (Hart 1980, V.6, p 279, l.27) and "I returned into myself" (Hart 1980, V.3, p 272, l.23), indicating the end of those specific states.

On the feast of Saint John the Evangelist in the Christmas Octave, Hadewijch was "taken up in the spirit" (Hart 1980, V.10, p 287, l.1). After describing her vision of the bride in the city (Vision 10), she ends her account by saying:

> The Voice embraced me with an unheard-of wonder, and I swooned in it, and my spirit failed me to see or hear more. And I lay in this fruition half an hour; but then the night was over, and I came back, piteously lamenting my exile, as I have done all this winter. For truly the whole winter long I have been occupied with this kind of thing. I lay there a long time and possessed Love, or revelations, or anything else in particular that Love gave me (Hart 1980, V.10, p 288, ll.19–25).

This account appears to describe an alternate state of mind – a dissociative state – in which Hadewijch's usual perception was altered. Whereas she experienced a sense of wonder during the dissociative state, and an inability to see or hear as usual, she was in a distressed, lamenting frame of mind on her return to her usual state.

Hadewijch's visions were accompanied by a sense of heightened awareness, as is often the case with trance states. In Vision 11, she describes this as follows:

> And although I asked to know this, I nevertheless perceived the essence of all the things I saw. For all that is seen in the spirit

when one is ravished by Love is understood, tasted, seen, and
heard through and through (Hart 1980, V.11, p 289, ll.33–36.).[1]

Not only the form of Hadewijch's visions, but also their content, ranging
from a mountain, "Queen Reason" and an abyss, to the "Bride", the "Six-
winged countenance", and others – all conforming to typical Christian
symbolism (Hart, 1980) – reveal her dissociated consciousness, in the case of
the early visions in particular.

Two visions have been chosen to illustrate Hadewijch's progression
from her earlier visions through to her later visions: from a dissociated stance
to a more integrated way of being; these will be described below.

Vision 4: "Two kingdoms, two heavens"

In this vision (Hart 1980, V.4, pp 273–275), as Hadewijch sits waiting for
Mass on the feast day of Saint James in May, at the time of the scriptural
reading, a spirit from within her suddenly draws her senses inwards, so that
she is taken completely into that spirit. She then has what she describes as a
wonderful, symbolic vision.

She sees two kingdoms of heaven, alike in all respects. Then a burning
angel arrives and beats his mighty wings seven times, to stop and silence
everything and everybody, to prepare them for his voice. He addresses them
in the following order: the moon; the sun; all the stars, which cease their
rotation; the dwellers in paradise, who awaken; the throne, which ceases its
rotation; all the saints, living and dead, who appear; and all the heavens of
each kingdom, which open in eternal glory.

In a voice of thunder or like a mighty trumpet, the angel requires all
who have been stopped or who have appeared to bear witness to what he will
show Hadewijch. Hadewijch is then immediately taken up in the wings of the
angel, and in the midst of the one kingdom, which is the angel himself.

The angel then shows a full-grown (ideal) Hadewijch two kingdoms
or heavens, one of which is said to belong to the angel and the other to the
Hadewijch who is not yet full grown (the real Hadewijch, the Hadewijch who
doubts that she could ever be one with God). The angel addresses the full-
grown Hadewijch as "you", and the not-yet-full-grown Hadewijch as "she"
or "her". (Since in the vision Hadewijch seems to be two people at the same
time, the title given by Hart might be rewritten as "Two dissociated parts to
Hadewijch".)

The angel asks the ideal Hadewijch to choose the heaven that is the
richest and the most powerful. The full-grown Hadewijch sees that the two
heavens are similar in all respects, and equally powerful and glorious. All the
witnesses say "Amen!" and resume their previous states.

The angel then explains that the two kingdoms represent his and Hadewijch's two humanities before they attained full growth:

> These heavens, which you behold, are wholly hers and mine; and these you saw as two kingdoms that were separated were our two humanities before they attained full growth. I was full-grown before; and nevertheless we remained equal. And I came into my kingdom yesterday, and you became full-grown afterwards; nevertheless we remained equal. And she shall become full-grown today and come tomorrow with you into her kingdom; and nevertheless shall remain equal with me (Hart 1980, V.4, p 274, ll.22–29).

The angel tells the full-grown Hadewijch what lies ahead for the not-yet-full-grown Hadewijch – an arduous and lengthy journey towards achieving full growth. The not-yet-full-grown Hadewijch (1) should exercise all the known virtues with violent zeal, (2) should be miserable and unstable while doing that, (3) should remain discouraged, doubtful, fearful, self-depreciating and uncertain, and (4) should tolerate the darkness of the realisation that she does not yet have the sweet nature that comes from having a twofold appreciation (congruent knowledge and a rewarding experience) of herself:

> the privation – which each of us feels from the other – of our sweet nature, and the knowledge and the perception of it that we have twofold in ourself while she, not full-grown, must do without him, whom she must love above all, and must consequently experience as all-darkness (Hart 1980, V.4, p 275, ll.11–15).[2]

At this stage of the vision, Hadewijch has not yet integrated her ideal with her shortcomings. This vision abounds with extremely negative emotional terms, including terms relating to anxiety, guilt and feeling inadequate: "miserable", "unstable", "discouragement", "doubt", "fear", "torment", "relapse in faults", "despair" and "all-darkness".

There appears to be tension between her current state and her ideal state, and an "earnest desire to be perfect" and not to fail in anything, associated with a "violent zeal". Her personal standards appear to be very high, so that when she fails in being perfect, she suffers fear and torment and feels inadequate and guilty.

Then there is also the feeling of being "far removed". She "sinks into the angel" who has a "voice of thunder" and experiences the "penetrating taste of sweet Love". She also experiences a "feeling of belonging" as opposed to "being unknown to her friends and enemies".

Her vision appears to serve the purpose of allowing her to escape her intolerable emotional state and, at the same time, it explains and justifies her suffering as being meaningful in the process of growth to being one with God. At this stage, the not-yet-full-grown Hadewijch appears to long for God, whereas the full-grown Hadewijch appears to have fruition of or be one with God. There is tension and oscillation between the two extremes, accompanied by intolerable negative emotion.

Her vision allows her a glimpse of what it might be like to be full grown, fully integrated in herself and one with God, without having to suffer the intolerable emotional states that she experienced when not full grown.

Vision 14: "New power to live Christ"

In her last vision, Hadewijch sees the throne of the Creator (Hart 1980, V.14, pp 302–305). She immediately explains it as "the loftiness of the life of union to which I was chosen" (Hart 1980, V.14, p 302, ll.23–24). In the midst of the new throne stood a seat, where the Creator sat. His countenance at that moment was invisible to all who had never lived human and divine love in one single being. However, Hadewijch actually sees God's countenance. She is able to do so because by this time she has grown sufficiently to be able to "taste man and God in one knowledge" (:305, l.11), in other words, she is able to live human and divine love in a single being. Along with this new-found integration comes a feeling of equanimity, a sense that she is able to endure anything (:304, l.5).

In this vision, Hadewijch spends less time describing the vision, and more time explaining it to her fellow Beguines. She remarks that she was closer to God than they were, and that this caused her pain:

> And because I loved you so greatly, and neither could nor can forget you in any hour; and because I felt this death and your nonfulfilment in Love so closely with you, in stormy desire of God – that I was closer to God than you, pained me the more. And it was yet more painful to me because you were a child and on the human level (Hart 1980, V.14, p 303, ll.15–20).

Hadewijch again describes to her fellow Beguines what these (dissociative) states are like:

> Once I lay for three days and the same number of nights in entrancement of spirit at the Countenance of our Beloved; and this has often lasted for that length of time; and also for the same length of time entirely out of the spirit, lost here to my-self and to all persons, in fruition of him: to know how in

> fruition he embraces himself (Hart 1980, V.14, p 304, ll.38–40
> to p 305, ll.1–2).

Hadewijch also reflects on how she has escaped persecution and execution, and expresses surprise that the hostility in her environment is not more severe:

> Alas! When I think of what God wills for me, ... it is a wonder how I remain alive, unless because of the great Love who can do all things. But it is certainly a great marvel to me when I think that … they let me live so long, and that they offer me protection or respect or favor, and that they do not afflict me with ever-new torments (Hart 1980, V.14, p 302, ll.26–34).

Indeed, Hadewijch has a point here, because she was one of a select handful of so-called heretics of those times who were not burned for their beliefs. Could it have been because she seemed to have a certain naivety about her? Did the church leaders perhaps see little threat in her continually being occupied in trances, and thus not perceive her as someone who posed a threat to their power?

One can almost picture her, minding her own business, engaged in her writing, spending days at a time in bed in a trance, spending time in conversation with her fellow Beguines in between, a true mystic – hardly an outspoken social activist who might feature on the agenda of church leaders' meetings.

One might go further and picture her as potentially psychotic, isolating herself, becoming unkempt during those times that she spent in bed "in fruition", sometimes having food brought to her, being completely out of touch with reality, hallucinating and seeing thrones and huge disks flying around an abyss, seeing herself exalted as a divine being, singled out and almost rewarded for all her suffering in her miserable circumstances on this earth.

But are her writings those of a psychotic person? In addition to the accounts of her visions, Hadewijch also wrote 31 letters, 61 poems and some songs, all of which are critically acclaimed by excellent scholars as being of high literary quality. Her work is coherent and technically well written.

More specifically, in her visions she demonstrates strategic development through the first to the fourteenth visions, suggesting that she wrote these accounts as didactic fragments (Hart 1980). Whereas the earlier visions concern a gradual introduction to the things a believer might expect to see and hear in heaven (trees with leaves of gold, thrones, angels, a queen richly attired, a voice of thunder, etc.), the later visions become more focused on the personal relationship between Hadewijch and God, and their oneness.

This development of her integrated "God-human" concept is probably what sets her apart from most of the other mystics of her time, who maintained themselves as separate from God. Hadewijch clearly describes her concept of God, and how she becomes as God:

> To be out of the spirit and to be in him – this surpasses all that one can have from him and all that he himself can accomplish; and then one is not less than he himself is … to which I was chosen in order that I might taste Man and God in one knowledge, what no man could do unless he were as God, and wholly such as he was who is our Love.
>
> He who sat on the new throne, which was I myself, had the imposing appearance of the fearful, wonderful Countenance, and there spoke to me a Voice of loud thunder, with a noise like stormdrifts, which would silence everything so that it alone could be heard. The Voice said to me: "O strongest of all warriors! You have conquered everything and opened the closed totality, which never was opened by creatures who did not know, with painfully won and distressed Love, how I am God and Man! O heroine, since you are so heroic, and since you never yield, you are called the greatest heroine! It is right, therefore, that you should know me perfectly (Hart 1980, V.14, p 305, ll.2–24).

Furthermore, for Hadewijch the blurring of the boundary between God and man seems to be complemented by a blurring of the distinction between consciousness and the unconscious. Unlike many contemporary patients who, when they recover from an alternate state of consciousness, are unable to remember what happened or what they saw and heard during the alternate state, Hadewijch appears to have had sufficient access to those states of mind to be able not only to describe them in detail, but also to interpret them meaningfully for the sake of her fellow Beguines. She seems to have been able to pass fluidly from her conscious state of mind to her dissociated states of mind.

Her use of a love mysticism, and even terminology relating to physical love as a way of expressing closeness to God, illustrates that she can be regarded as a proponent of the profane revolution that occurred in those times. Whereas previously the relationship between humans and God had received the bulk of academic and literary attention, in the profane revolution love between humans emerged as a valid concern; human love and its descriptors then found their way into and enriched mystical endeavours.

Moreover, Hadewijch's audacity in recording her own (female, bodily) experiences as useful in teaching others about becoming like God

appears to reflect the growing new female self-consciousness. Prior to that time, the human body, and specifically the female body, with its more evident biological rhythms, had become a symbol of sin and all that is corrupt. However, according to the new female self-consciousness, women had independent worth as human beings and, like men, were created in the likeness of God. Hadewijch may therefore be regarded as a medieval torchbearer for recent developments in feminist theology (Christ 1997; Grey 2001; Schüssler Fiorenza 1994; and others) and even for the specific line of body theology (Bynum 1995).

Although the above two examples of Hadewijch's visions do not do justice to the scope of Hadewijch's dissociation, they serve to illustrate the close link between her dissociative experiences and her visions, with respect to both their form and their content. It is as if her visions represented not only a way of leaving or escaping an intolerable reality, but also a new context in which to continue grappling with the conflictual issues of that intolerable reality.

Hadewijch's dissociation as a way of managing contextual conflict

If the contextual model discussed earlier is applied to Hadewijch's visions, the question of the extent to which Hadewijch's life, work and visions represent an expression of, and a solution to, living with contextual dichotomies and ideological conflict arises.

In terms of an expression of contextual conflict, could it be possible that her pattern of dissociation mirrored societal ambivalence regarding some of the new forms of religious life, such as the Beguine movement? The Beguines were considered by the church authorities to be heretics, yet most, if not all Beguines, including Hadewijch herself, actually upheld the basic theological doctrines, and valued nothing more highly than the Christian faith and life as ways of getting closer to God.

Assuming that living with such conflict might have been associated with personal discomfort, Hadewijch's dissociative states might have helped her to manage conflicting ideas selectively, by restricting her consciousness to certain topics at a time. For example, whereas during her waking states she tended to be preoccupied and tormented by the conflictual relationships in her socio-religious setting, when in one of her trance states she was not conscious of the social problems that caused her so much grief and lamenting (Hart 1980).

In addition to its personal utility, her dissociation might have had an interpersonal usefulness. One wonders whether this pattern of dissociation might not have saved Hadewijch from execution at the stake by allowing her, through "being taken up in the spirit", to withdraw from potential situations of direct conflict or confrontation with the church authorities, yet still to

expound her ideas by recording and commenting on her visions, and to express herself in teaching her fellow Beguines, allowing her to maintain a sense of self-in-society.

In her theological work, her pattern of dissociation appears to have represented an integrative solution to apparently incompatible ideas such as "God" and "human". Through the earlier oscillation between longing for versus attaining fruition or union with God, and her alternating dissociative states, Hadewijch actually developed an integrated God-consciousness. She was then able to tolerate the opposing ideas, the paradoxical theological elements and the conflicting feelings, and to integrate these in her God-experience (Mommaers 1990:240; Van der Zeyde 1934:193).

This integrated God-consciousness did not come into being suddenly; instead, it grew slowly, through a longing to be one with God (Rombauts & De Paepe 1961:17–19). Hadewijch's visions of explicit contact with God involved a gradual transformation from being not-yet-full-grown to being full-grown in God. Van Mierlo (1950:15) speaks of the growth of the soul in being equal to the God-man, as well as becoming one with God through the God-man (:28–29, 31).

Becoming one with God can also be considered a to-and-fro process. Marieke van Baest (1998:15) calls it the "equivalence and mutuality of the partnership of a human being with God". De Paepe (1979:xxiii) considers *minne* as a bridge across the ravine between God and humans. Rombauts & De Paepe (1961:17) refer to a dialectical relationship between God and soul.

Eventually, through growing in love, Hadewijch reached the stage of a love union with God (De Paepe 1979:xx), of *minne* as meeting God on earth (De Paepe 1983:29, 30, 38ff., 46). She realised that she had become one with God, as well as remaining fully human at the same time (Van Mierlo 1950). Becoming one with God did not mean that her human nature had to be disavowed. Instead, for Hadewijch, being fully human was essential to becoming one with God (Mommaers, 1990:235).

In considering the apparent theological difficulty in becoming one with God, and the variable terminology used by the Hadewijch scholars referred to in the preceding paragraphs, it is to be noted that Reynaert (1981:441), in his book on Hadewijch's imagery, comments that Hadewijch's God concept is not so much a person, but rather an energy, a space, a living process of simultaneous explosion and implosion – an integration.

The gradual nature of Hadewijch's growth towards integration with God and her use of it as normative to junior Beguines appear to suggest that her dissociation might have been an expression of ordinary human psychological development in a social context of dissociatedness. It may then be concluded that she eventually reached a stage of mature psychological development.

The fact that Hadewijch's dissociation was intimately entwined with her accounts of her visions and her God concept may merely reflect her regular occupation as theologian and mystical author. If she had been, for example, a visual artist, it is conceivable that one might have interpreted the expression of her dissociatedness in her paintings.

It is important to note that Hadewijch moved freely between alternate states of consciousness, and had sufficient conscious access to her dissociative states for her to be able to present her view from within those states. She knew what she was experiencing and was able to describe it, for instance in sharing her self-consciousness with her fellow Beguines (De Paepe 1979:xxx, xxxix). Hence she was able to integrate her consciousness and her unconscious in her written works.

The purpose of this study was not to evaluate Hadewijch for mental illness. In fact, the concept of mental illness did not exist in Hadewijch's time, when events and human concerns were interpreted predominantly in religious terms. If Hadewijch's visions and her dissociation were to be evaluated from a modern-day psychiatric perspective, however, she may well have been diagnosed as mentally ill.

However, when her visionary experiences are reinterpreted here using the contextual model discussed earlier, this concept of dissociation provides new meaning for her visions and her self-consciousness, and makes possible a new interpretation of her mental state. Then it is not a pathological picture that emerges. Hadewijch's general functioning was not impaired. On the contrary, she functioned well. She was an acclaimed Flemish poet and a strategic teacher who cared for and guided her fellow Beguines with compassion (De Paepe 1979; Mommaers 2004; Rombauts & De Paepe 1961). Hadewijch's visions and dissociative experiences reveal her growth towards, and her teaching on, an integrated God-experience, despite pernicious socio-cultural-spiritual dichotomies. Gradually, her visions demonstrate a development towards being one with God while being fully human at the same time, towards a capacity to work as a human being while resting in God. She was a pioneer theologian, who reflected self-consciously on her own consciousness, and who used her own dissociative experiences as a vehicle for developing a coherent theory of integrated God-consciousness, where divine and human aspects, as well as contrasting feelings, coincide.

Conclusions

It was shown above that contextual conflict might have contributed to Hadewijch's dissociation and informed her visions, so that her visions and the dissociation in them mirrored the ambivalence and conflict in her context. Hadewijch's medieval context thus appears to have played a role in shaping her consciousness through the process of dissociation. Although this study is

limited by the exclusive focus on dissociation, specifically conflictual dissociation, and by the problem of being unable to assess Hadewijch in person, her dissociative experiences appear to have specific personal, interpersonal, socio-cultural and spiritual meaning when interpreted in the light of the contextual model of dissociation.

Furthermore, Hadewijch appears to have dealt creatively with her dissociated consciousness and actually achieved integration. Her visions and dissociative experiences reveal her growth towards, and her teaching on, an integrated God-experience, despite pernicious socio-cultural-spiritual dichotomies. Her theological synthesis seems to reflect not only her inner psychological integration of the outer, contextual conflict, but also her inner psychological integration of consciousness and the unconscious. Instead of a portrait of a medieval, psychiatrically disordered patient, the picture is that of a successful poet, theologian, leader and teacher, who reflected self-consciously on her own consciousness and used her dissociative experiences to develop a theory of integrated God-consciousness.

So where does this leave us? If a medieval visionary's severe dissociation can be reinterpreted as adaptive and creative, using a contextual model of dissociation, what are the possible implications for us today?

This case study across the centuries has illustrated how historical studies, as well as interdisciplinary dialogue (in this case, between psychiatry and theology or church history), might be useful in the development or refinement of psychiatric concepts such as dissociation.

Moreover, in clinical psychiatry and the mental health context, we might do well to acknowledge meaning-giving contextual influences on an individual's consciousness, and to be sensitive to conflictual ideas in patients' social and religious contexts that could lead to dissociative symptoms. Perhaps these findings may suggest a slight shift, where the presence of dissociative symptoms is not, as such, necessarily taken as a sign of mental illness, and where their possible meaning could be explored.[3] An interprettation of a person's dissociative symptoms as an indication of wider social or religious contextual problems, not merely as an individual problem, may also suggest support for psychiatric and psychological therapeutic approaches that focus beyond the individual or intrapsychic realm, on a concern that is more social psychiatric in nature.

Moving away slightly from the traditional psychiatric context, narrative-healing approaches may perhaps be especially well suited to helping people who struggle to make sense of their experiences of themselves in the world around them. In particular people who have been in conflict with institutions or with the expectations of their societies may benefit from narrative support to help re-position themselves in relation to the conflicting discourses surrounding them.

In a less sympathetic context: a great deal of controversy surrounds dissociation in the field of forensic psychiatry and psychology. The above findings could be considered for their potential implications in the legal context for court proceedings in, for example, murder cases where claims of dissociative amnesia, "emotional storm" or non-pathological automatism are used in the defence of the accused. The relevant issues include questions about whether the defendant had been able to control her/his actions at the time of the alleged offence and whether she/he can be held accountable for actions perpetrated during a dissociated state, as the person's self-control, judgement, or moral agency might have been paralysed or absent at that time.

Hadewijch is an example of an individual who, despite prominent dissociative trance states, retained insight, moral judgement and self-control. Her dissociation did not result in legally problematic outcomes and she did not violate the rights of other people, despite being persecuted to a certain extent for her beliefs. It remains to be explored more generally whether the presence as such of dissociative trance states should be taken necessarily to indicate a lack of culpability in criminal situations or legal proceedings. Perhaps the content of what a person does during their trance states might be a better indicator of *mens rea* than whether or not she/he experienced a trance state.

In the fields of theology and religious studies, Hadewijch's contributions include her pioneer role in softening the traditional dichotomies, bridging the divide between the human and the divine, and offering instruction in a pathway for human psycho-spiritual development. Notwithstanding many recent related theological developments, for example, with regard to female imagery of God (Christ 1997; Grey 2001; Schüssler Fiorenza 1994) and body theology (Bynum 1995), Hadewijch stands out for her integrated God concept, where humans develop to become God. As was shown above, Hadewijch's individual consciousness and dissociative states, along with her conflictual social context, all played important roles in her visions and theology. If this is considered in the light of a general orientation to mysticism, an overview of how human consciousness has changed over various epochs in human history and an explanation of how the changes in collective human consciousness relate to the broader socio-cultural context (Krüger 2006:136–145), further research possibilities emerge. For example, a focus on the relationship between a person's individual consciousness and her/his socio-religious context in the development of her/his God concept might contribute to a study of religious consciousness.[4]

One might also consider the role of mysticism as an activity – whether mysticism might be an expression of grappling with social issues, as an avenue for protest against, for example, socio-religious power gradients. Although Hadewijch took issue with the social structures and the prevailing masculine theology of her time, she did not go to war, retaliate, or act out in a

confrontational way. Neither did she escape the situation by becoming a recluse. Her way of dealing with the problem was to process it in terms of her mystical endeavours, to grapple with the issues in the context of her own environment and relationships. The complexity of the problems is reflected in the complexity of her writings. Considered in this way, perhaps mysticism should not be considered reductionistically as an escape from this world. Hadewijch did not escape; she worked constructively to achieve solutions to her problems, while remaining anchored in her environment.

In conclusion, it is suggested that dissociative mental states might be expressions of a process of ordinary human psychological development in a conflictual social context. The process of dissociation might flexibly shape an individual's consciousness in situations of contextual conflict, saying at least as much, if not more, about the context than about the individual.

Furthermore, the contextual model of dissociation has provided a useful conceptual framework and hermeneutical tool for evaluating another person's consciousness in a remote historical and cultural epoch. Through its application across centuries, the model has gained validity.

Over and above the idea that human consciousness has changed considerably since the Middle Ages, this trans-epochal study contributes to building a bridge between contemporary consciousness and the medieval consciousness of Hadewijch's time. In an anthropological or cultural sense, Hadewijch's attempts at living with contextual conflict are again relevant in the cultural melting pot of multicultural South Africa and other similar settings, especially regarding gender relations, religious-secular conflict and inter-religious conflict. With regard to the human response to contextual conflict, at least, perhaps our consciousness nowadays might not be so very different from those days, in that we might use similar psychological processes to try and make sense of our world in order to live meaningful lives.

Works consulted

Adolphs, R 2007. Consciousness: Situated and social, in Zelazo, P D, Moscovitch, M & Thompson, E (eds.), *The Cambridge handbook of consciousness,* ch. 30, 863–878. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Allen, J G 1993. Dissociative processes: Theoretical underpinnings of a working model for clinician and patient. *Bulletin of the Menninger Clinic*, 57(3), 287–308.

American Psychiatric Association 1994. *Diagnostic and statistical manual of mental disorders*. 4th ed. (DSM-IV). Washington, DC: American Psychiatric Association.

Bargh, J A 2007. Social psychological approaches to consciousness, in Zelazo, P D, Moscovitch, M & Thompson, E (eds.), *The Cambridge handbook of consciousness,* ch. 20, 555–569. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Beahrs, J O 1982. *Unity and multiplicity: Multilevel consciousness of the self in hypnosis, psychiatric disorder, and mental health*. New York: Brunner/Mazel.

Bernstein, E M & Putnam, F W 1986. Development, reliability, and validity of a dissociation scale. *Journal of Nervous and Mental Disease*, 174(12)*,* 727–735.

Bhugra, D & Bhui, K (eds.) 2007. *Textbook of cultural psychiatry*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Bowie, F (ed.) 1990. *Beguine spirituality: Mystical writings of Mechthild of Magdeburg, Beatrice of Nazareth, and Hadewijch of Brabant*. (Translated by O. Davies.) New York: Crossroad.

Bremner, J D, Krystal, J H, Charney, D S & Southwick, S M 1996. Neural mechanisms in dissociative amnesia for childhood abuse: Relevance to the current controversy surrounding the "false memory syndrome". *American Journal of Psychiatry*, 153(7) (Festschrift Supplement), 71–82.

Bynum, C W 1995. *Resurrection of the body in western Christianity 200–1336*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Christ, C P 1997. *Rebirth of the goddess: Finding meaning in feminist spirituality*. Reading, Mass.: Addison-Wesley.

De Paepe, N 1973. *Poëtisch erfdeel der Nederlanden: Hadewijch: Miere herten licht doolt na U al*. Hasselt: Uitgeverij Heideland-Orbis N.V.

De Paepe, N 1979. *Hadewijch: Een bloemlezing uit haar werken*. Amsterdam: Elsevier.

De Paepe, N 1983. *Hadewijch: Strofische gedichten: Middelnederlandse tekst en omzetting in modern Nederlands*. Leiden: Uitgeverij Martinus Nijhoff.

Edinger, E F, Cordic, D D & Yates, C 1996. *The new God-image: A study of Jung's key letters concerning the evolution of the western God-image*. Wilmette, Ill.: Chiron.

Ellis, C & Bocher, A P 2000. Autoethnography. Personal narrative, reflexivity: Researcher as subject, in Denzin, N K & Lincoln, Y S (eds.), *Handbook of qualitative research,* 2nd ed., ch. 28. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Fouché, C B 2002. Research strategies, in De Vos, A S (ed.), Strydom, H, Fouché, C B & Delport, C S L, *Research at grass roots: For the social sciences and human service professions,* 2nd ed., ch. 18, 270–277. Pretoria: Van Schaik.

Gabbard, G O 1994. *Psychodynamic psychiatry in clinical practice: The DSM-IV edition*. Washington, DC: American Psychiatric Press.

Grey, M 2001. *Introducing feminist images of God*. Sheffield, UK: Sheffield Academic Press.

Hart, C 1980. *Hadewijch: The complete works*. London: SPCK.

Hartman, C R & Burgess, A W 1993. Information processing of trauma. *Child Abuse & Neglect*, 17, 47–58.

Hoffmann Davis, J 2003. Balancing the whole: Portraiture as methodology, in Camic, P M, Rhodes, J E & Yardley, L (eds.), *Qualitative research in psychology: expanding perspectives in methodology and design,* ch. 11, 199–217. Washington, DC: American Psychological Association.

Holmes, J G & Murray, S L 1996. Conflict in close relationships, in Higgins, E T & Kruglanski, A W (eds.), *Social psychology: Handbook of basic principles,* ch. 21, 622–654. New York: The Guilford Press.

Kihlstrom, J F 2007. Consciousness in hypnosis, in Zelazo, P D, Moscovitch, M & Thompson, E (eds.), *The Cambridge handbook of consciousness,* ch. 17, 445–479. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Kroll, J & Bachrach, B 2005. *The mystic mind: The psychology of medieval mystics and ascetics*. New York: Routledge.

Krüger, C & Mace, C J 2002. Psychometric validation of the State Scale of Dissociation (SSD). *Psychology and Psychotherapy: Theory, Research and Practice* (formerly *British Journal of Medical Psychology*), 75(1), 33–51.

Krüger, C, Sokudela, B F, Motlana, L M, Mataboge, C K & Dikobe, A M 2007. Dissociation: A preliminary contextual model. *South African Journal of Psychiatry*, 13(1), 13–21.

Krüger, J S 2006. *Sounding unsound: Orientation into mysticism*. Pretoria: Aurora Press.

Larrington, C 1995. *Women and writing in medieval Europe: A sourcebook*. London: Routledge.

Levine, J M & Thompson, L 1996. Conflict in groups, in Higgins, E T & Kruglanski, A W (eds.), *Social psychology: Handbook of basic principles,* ch. 24, 745–776. New York: The Guilford Press.

Madigan, S (ed.) 1998. *Mystics, visionaries, and prophets: A historical anthology of women's spiritual writings*. Minneapolis: Fortress Press.

McGinn, B 1994. *The growth of mysticism: From Gregory the Great to the twelfth century*. Vol. II of *The presence of God: A history of western Christian mysticism*. London: SCM Press.

McGinn, B 1998. *The flowering of mysticism: Men and women in the new mysticism (1200–1350)*. Vol. III of *The presence of God: A history of western Christian mysticism*. New York: Crossroad.

Mommaers, P 1990. *De brieven van Hadewijch*. Kampen: Uitgeverij Kok.

Mommaers, P with Dutton, E 2004. *Hadewijch: Writer – Beguine – love mystic*. Leuven: Peeters.

Newman, B 2003. *God and the goddesses: Vision, poetry, and belief in the middle ages*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Ortmanns-Cornet, M (hertaler) 1986. *Hadewijch: Brieven.* Brugge: Uitgeverij Tabor.

Ortmanns-Cornet, M (hertaler) 1988. *Hadewijch: Mengeldichten of rijmbrieven*. Brugge: Uitgeverij Tabor.

Pruitt, D G 1998. Social conflict, in Gilbert, D T, Fiske, S T & Lindzey, G (eds.), *The handbook of social psychology,* 4th ed., vol. II, ch. 27, 470–503. New York: McGraw-Hill.

Reynaert, J 1981. *De beeldspraak van Hadewijch*. Tielt-Bussum: Uitgeverij Lannoo.

Rombauts, E & De Paepe, N 1961. *Hadewijch: Strofische gedichten: Middelnederlandse tekst en moderne bewerking.* Zwolle: N.V. Uitgevers-maatschappij W E J Tjeenk Willink.

Ross, C A, Heber, S, Norton, G R, Anderson, D, Anderson, G & Barchet, P 1989. The dissociative disorders interview schedule: A structured interview. *Dissociation*, II(3), 169–189.

Rusbult, C E & Van Lange, P A M 1996. Interdependence processes, in Higgins, E T & Kruglanski, A W (eds.), *Social psychology: Handbook of basic principles,* ch. 19, 564–596. New York: The Guilford Press.

Schüssler Fiorenza, E (ed.) 1994. *Searching the scriptures:* Volume 2: *A feminist commentary*. New York: Crossroad.

Simons, D J, Hannula, D E, Warren, D E & Day, S W 2007. Behavioral, neuroimaging, and neuropsychological approaches to implicit perception, in Zelazo, P D, Moscovitch, M & Thompson, E (eds.), *The Cambridge handbook of consciousness,* ch. 9, 207–250. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Snellen, J 1907. *Liederen van Hadewijch, naar de drie bekende hss., kritisch uitgegeven met eene inleiding en woordenlijst*. Amsterdam: W. Versluys.

Stainton Rogers, W 2003. *Social psychology: experimental and critical approaches*. Maidenhead, Phil.: Open University Press.

Steinberg, M, Cicchetti, D, Buchanan, J, Rakfeldt, J & Rounsaville, B 1994. Distinguishing between multiple personality disorder (dissociative identity disorder) and schizophrenia using the structured clinical interview for DSM-IV dissociative disorders. *Journal of Nervous and Mental Disease*, 182(9), 495–502.

Strydom, H & Delport, C S L 2002. Information collection: Document study and secondary analysis, in De Vos, A S (ed.), Strydom, H, Fouché, C B, & Delport, C S L, *Research at grass roots: For the social sciences and human service professions,* 2nd ed., ch. 21, 321–332. Pretoria: Van Schaik.

Throop, C J & Laughlin, C D 2007. Anthropology of consciousness, in Zelazo, P D, Moscovitch, M & Thompson, E (eds.), *The Cambridge handbook of consciousness,* ch. 23, 631–669. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Van Baest, M J E H T 1998. *Poetry of Hadewijch. (Studies in spirituality, Supplement 3.)* Leuven: Peeters.

Van der Kolk, B A 1994. The body keeps the score: Memory and the evolving psychobiology of posttraumatic stress. *Harvard Review of Psychiatry,* 1(5), 253–265.

Vanderlinden, J, Van Dyck, R, Vandereycken, W, Vertommen, H & Verkes, R J 1993. The dissociation questionnaire (DIS-Q): Development and characteristics of a new self-report questionnaire. *Clinical Psychology & Psychotherapy*, 1(1), 21–27.

Van der Zeyde, M H 1934. *Hadewijch: Een studie over de mens en de schrijfster.* Groningen: J B Wolters' Uitgevers-maatschappij N.V.

Van der Zeyde, M H 1936. *Brieven van Hadewijch: In de oorspronkelijke tekst en in Nieuw-Nederlandse overzetting met aantekeningen.* Antwerpen: De Sikkel.

Van Mierlo, J 1948–1951. *Hadewijch brieven: I. Tekst en commentaar.* Antwerpen: N.V. Standaard-boekhandel.

Van Mierlo, J 1948-1951. *Hadewijch brieven: II. Inleiding.* Antwerpen: N.V. Standaard-boekhandel.

Van Mierlo, J 1950. *Hadewijch: Een bloemlezing uit hare werken.* Amsterdam: Uitgeversmaatschappij Elsevier.

Vekeman, H W J 1980. *Het visioenenboek van Hadewijch. (Uitgegeven naar handschrift 941 van de Bibliotheek der Rijksuniversiteit te Gent, met een hertaling en commentaar.)* Brugge: Dekker & Van de Vegt–Nijmegen Uitgeverij Orion.

Waller, N G, Putnam, F W & Carlson, E B 1996. Types of dissociation and dissociative types: A taxometric analysis of dissociative experiences. *Psychological Methods*, 1(3), 300–321.

West, L J 1967. Dissociative reaction, in Freedman, A M, Kaplan, H I & Sadock, B J (eds.), *Comprehensive textbook of psychiatry,* 885–899. Baltimore: The Williams & Wilkins Company.

World Health Organization 1992. *The ICD-10 classification of mental and behavioural disorders: Clinical descriptions and diagnostic guidelines.* Geneva: World Health Organization.

Endnotes

1 Vekeman's modern Dutch translation puts it: *"Toen verzocht ik met aandrang om uitleg, ofschoon ik van alles wat ik zag het wezen peilde. Want al wat men schouwt met de geest die weggerukt is in de Liefde, dat doorgrondt men, dat proeft men door en door, daarvan blijft niets verborgen, daarvan verstaat men het geluid helemaal."* (Vekeman, 1980, V. 11, p. 130, ll. 11–16.). Hadewijch's own words emphasised the thoroughness of such knowledge by using repetition: *"Jc sach nochtan die dinghen welc si waren van allen dat ic sach, want al dat men siet metten gheeste die met minnen es op ghenomen, dat dore kint men, dat dore smaect men, dat dore siet men, dat dore hoert men."* (Vekeman, 1980, p. 131, XI: 52–58.).

2 In the modern Dutch: *"... de ervaring van het gemis van onze tedere natuur, die wij wederzijds helemaal van elkaar ondervinden, evenals van de instemmende kennis en de behaaglijke ervaring die wij in onszelf tweevoudig van haar hebben, terwijl zij, onvolgroeide, ontberen moet wat zij bovenal liefheeft en daar niets dan duisternis aan overhoudt"* (Vekeman 1980, V.4, p.70, ll.20–25).

3 In this regard, consider also the possible distinction between ordinary dissociation and pathological dissociation (Waller et al., 1996).

4 See also Edinger, E F, Cordic, D D & Yates, C 1996. *The new God-image: A study of Jung's key letters concerning the evolution of the western God-image.* Wilmette, Ill.: Chiron.

Oral history interviewing and its value in practical theological hermeneutics: an example from a study about a Pentecostal congregation

Andrew J Thomas[*]
Department of Practical Theology,
University of South Africa, Pretoria, South Africa

Abstract

Prior experience has been recognised as an important element of hermeneutics in both secular and theological studies. A problem for practical theologians who are investigating Pentecostal situations is the quality of the historical record that is available for analysis. This is an issue that is also relevant to this research and it was therefore decided to use the social scientific approach of oral history interviewing to provide a more detailed documentary record. The resulting interaction between contextual perception and the historical record revealed three central themes for further analysis: (1) autonomy, (2) authority and (3) the role of the Spirit. The lack of community was identified as a key issue in these areas, especially concerning participation. The importance of participation through ministry in the Spirit was identified as a possible means whereby an attractive community with a strong identity in Christ can be developed in the future.

Introduction

Acknowledgement of the importance of prejudices and pre-understanding has been a significant feature of hermeneutical studies since the work of Gadamer in the 1960s (cf. Village 2007:77-79), but it is only in recent times that it has become a feature of practical theological investigations. These studies have progressed beyond what Van der Ven (1993:34-41) identifies as the first "orientation" where practical theology was seen as the application of the fruits of the other theological disciplines for the improvement of the

---

[*] Co-researcher, research programme on "Religion, health and well-being in Southern Africa: practical theological perspectives", Department of Practical Theology, University of South Africa, Pretoria, South Africa.

praxis of the pastor. Practical theology has become more aware of the impact that contextual factors can have on praxis. Browning (1991:55-74) identifies the need to develop an in-depth understanding of the concrete situation in which one is acting as foundational to his or her "strategic practical theology". Farley (2000:120) sees the interpretation of these situations as central to the nature of practical theology. A key aspect of his hermeneutical approach involves "probing the past" for "disguised repressions". These are seen as events that were important in the formation of tradition and structure, but have been forgotten over time. Farley (2000:121) continues:

> To grasp the present situation of men and women in the churches calls for more than simply describing present policy. For the present is comprised of and structured by these disguised repressions of the past. And only a certain way of studying the past will uncover these repressions and in so doing will thus uncover something at work in the present.

One is therefore left asking the question: What is the "certain way of studying the past" that Farley is referring to?

I believe that depends on the situation one is studying. Many Anglican parish churches in the United Kingdom have detailed records which stretch back to the medieval period that offer a great deal of information to the researcher who is interpreting the current situation.[1] But what if one wishes to study a modern South African Pentecostal congregation?[2] Academic Pentecostal studies have developed markedly in recent years and examples of research into the history of the movement have featured in this journal (Kalu 1998; Nel 2001). At grassroots level, the original anti-intellectual stance of Pentecostalism (cf. Theron 1999:50) is still evident – a point that is reinforced, albeit only in a single case, in this current research project which focuses on the Assemblies of God in KwaZulu-Natal. In this particular study, I decided to use the case study approach of Eisenhardt (2006) as the inductive phase in my use of the empirical approach of Van der Ven (1993). The case study focussed on a single congregation that is called Ablewell Christian Fellowship for the purposes of the study.[3] On initial enquiry, I was informed that the church kept a record of meeting minutes that stretched back to its planting in 1982. These records contained some useful information, especially regarding the ministry period of the current leader (from 1992). Information on the period from July 1982 to June 1992 was, however, extremely sparse. There were only 10 recorded entries and significant gaps existed between these entries. There was nothing for the periods 12 April 1983 to 12 August 1985 and 26 April 1986 to 30 June 1992. The minutes were rather brief and bluntly factual; they lacked a personal element that could have offer more to the interpretive process. It was apparent that these records alone

would not be sufficient to assist me in developing an understanding of the historical background that would enable me to identify the "disguised repressions" in the current situation. Another approach was therefore required to supplement the documentary analysis of the meeting minutes.

One such approach was suggested in the work of Ackermann (1996:32 & 33) who sees "historically and contextually rooted stories" as an integral part of her feminist approach to studying praxis. These individual stories can be obtained through "life history" or "oral history" interviewing (Bryman 2001:316). Life history interviews encourage interviewees to look back on their entire lives and are usually combined with the study of personal documents like diaries; oral history interviews are more specific because they use questions that focus on particular events or periods in the past. Bearing in mind the specific time span of the meeting records, it was decided that the oral history approach (with its focus on particular time periods and events) would be more suitable for this research. One should note that this study used a "conventional approach" to oral history interviewing where the aim is the improvement of academic knowledge (Ntsimane 2006:7 & 8). This is in contrast to the Sinomlando Centre's[4] creative use of oral history methodology to preserve family voices to aid the resilience of individuals who are involved in the Memory Box Programme (see Denis 2001 and Ntsimane 2006 for examples of this approach).

The rest of this article focuses on how this conventional oral history approach, allied to documentary analysis, helped the researcher to develop an understanding of the past that improved the interpretation of the current situation. This is done by briefly outlining a number of background features, such as the position of the researcher in relation to the interviewees, the present context of Ablewell Christian Fellowship and some information on the structures of the Assemblies of God. This is followed by an overview of the more important features of the documentary analysis of the meeting minutes. The oral history approach that was used is then described and the responses from the various informants are used to develop a historical understanding of Ablewell Christian Fellowship. The past is then contrasted with the present to uncover issues that might be underlying current problems. The article ends by offering a practical theological suggestion to the church as to how it can tackle current problems.

Background to the case study on Ablewell Christian Fellowship

Position of the researcher

A point that should be emphasised at the outset is the relationship of the researcher to the congregation at Ablewell. The research at Ablewell was undertaken as overt participation – an approach that, according to historical

studies, would see me as an "insider" (Carton & Vis 2008:53-56). This occurred between April 2007 and May 2009. The overt approach was suitable because my initial experiences at Ablewell demonstrated how guarded many people in this rural congregation were when they were engaged in conversation. This attitude changed over time and the congregation gradually became more open as I was accepted in the local community. I am aware that my interpretation of the situation at Ablewell could have been affected by this interaction, but I felt that this was a necessary requirement to obtain some useful insights into how this tightly bonded rural community (see the following section of this article for further details) functioned. The researcher can be religiously classified as a charismatic evangelical who did not feel out of place in Ablewell's Pentecostal context.

The context

Ablewell Christian Fellowship is situated in a small farming town in inland KwaZulu-Natal. The original town has been in existence for just over a century, but many of the farming families (both British and Afrikaans) have been in the area since the mid-nineteenth century. These families know each other well and there is a strong sense of community. The people are generally conservative and have modernist life views:[5] the man goes to work and is the prominent figure, while the woman looks after the children and maintains the home.

In many ways Ablewell Christian Fellowship mirrors its conservative context. The Sunday worship was only mildly charismatic, with infrequent use of speaking in tongues and prophecy. The service was very structured and preaching was restricted to leadership or speakers from elsewhere who were invited. The congregation averaged around 50 to 60 in number and was mixed, with Black Africans and Indians making up at least a quarter of the numbers at Sunday services.

An evident feature of the congregation was that they were not "mobilised": few were involved in the ministry of the church. Most of those who were mobilised were involved in the children's ministry on Sundays, but only certain individuals did other work besides this. The pastor did outreach in the township with his wife and two other members. This involved some preaching of the gospel and a soup kitchen.

Several topics came to the fore in the pastor's preaching during the period of observation. A series of sermons was delivered on "The Feasts of the Lord" and how important they are for the modern church. This was supplemented by an Easter or "First Fruits" sermon which highlighted the pagan Babylonian roots of Easter. Another series centred on the need to be "waiting and watching" for the return of Jesus. An important message was the Pentecost sermon which focussed on the revival promise (*El Shammah*)

that the pastor believed had been given to the church. The pastor believed that the Lord would, through the Spirit, make the local region a "fruitful field" (Isa. 29:17). He noted that a trusted prophetic source had told him that this would be fulfilled by Pentecost 2009 but that it had not materialised. He then went into a range of reasons why he believed the vision had not come to pass. These mainly related to the area being in bondage to a range of spirits that he identified as Witchcraft, Intimidation, Independence, Black Crow and Jezebel. He did not reveal how they had been identified. He believed that the revival promise would still be realised in the future.

A notable event during the research was the restructuring of the children's ministry. A number of the people who were involved with the work were unhappy with how this was done and it resulted in around 15 people leaving the church, several of whom had held leadership positions in the past. It was noted that some of their problems stemmed from how the church was working within the "Group" structure of the Assemblies of God. Though stable, the church was not growing and all was not well. It was obvious that there were a number of issues that needed careful consideration.

Structures of the Assemblies of God in Southern Africa

The structure of the Assemblies of God in Southern Africa requires some explanation at this stage of the study. The work of the Assemblies of God is overseen by a General Executive that consists of 23 individuals from the denomination who are elected to their positions by the General Conference biannually (Watt 1992:135-137). The Assemblies of God is split into various sections and two historically active sections are of interest to this study: (1) "the Group" and (2) the Fellowship of Independent Assemblies and Ministers (FIAM). "The Group" section of the Assemblies of God originally came about through the work of James Mullen (1992:141). A key feature of "the Group" is the lack of any election to office – leaders are appointed by a senior "apostolic" figure. This "apostolic" position is based on an inter-pretation of the gift ministries in Ephesians 4:11. The leaders have authority over local assemblies (Mullen 1992:142-144). For many years, the main apostolic figure was John Bond; currently, it is Donovan Coetzee. FIAM was a looser collection of independent assemblies that rejected the "apostolic" interpretation of "the Group". They were run locally under ministers and elders, but came under the authority of the General Executive (1992:146, 147). This body folded in the late 1980s in KwaZulu-Natal and no longer forms part of the Assemblies of God structure.

Meeting minutes

Both these structures feature in the meeting minutes. The first minuted meeting was held on 25 July 1982 and a constitution was drawn up and signed the following day. The overall theme of the constitution was linked to the Statement of Faith of the Assemblies of God under the heading "Things commonly believed among us".[6] It was interesting to note the inclusion of a statement regarding the "sovereignty" of the Assembly, where it stated that the General Executive may assist the Assembly but should not exercise control over it. This was further explicated with a concise definition of "sovereignty". The first pastor, Nick Simms, was present at these meetings. These early meetings were held at a place called Cottage Chapel.

The original pastor left after only a few months and was replaced by a new pastor, Rick Hally, at the end of 1982. His time at the church seems to have been turbulent, with attendance and finances dropping sharply by 1983. An original member noted the need for "an alive church that reflected the glory of God" – the lack of "life" being duly noted.

By the time of the next meeting in August 1985, a new pastor (Tim Lewis) had been appointed. His time in ministry was characterised by tension between his "mission" and his work at the church. The mission work stretched from Newcastle down to the South Coast and meant that he was away from the church a lot. The tension developed to such an extent that, by early 1986, one leader wrote the pastor a detailed letter to express his concerns.

There was a period of silence until 1992 when the current pastor, Edward Hicks, arrived. One of the first things that was minuted was his desire to take the church into "the Group" section of the Assemblies of God (they were initially in the FIAM).This issue was not resolved by September 1994 and one leader made it clear that they should not enter "the Group" unless they received direct confirmation from God. He believed that they should remain independent and cited Isa. 54:1b and Gal.4:21-31 to support his position.

The meeting on 2 December 1996 focussed on the problem of balance between Edward's ministry outside of the church and his pastoral care of the congregation. It appears that Edward responded to this by noting that Able-well was a conservative church which needed to grow in a Pentecostal under-standing of the Holy Spirit. This tension continued into May 1997 when he accused the church of being in bondage to an "independent spirit" – a comment that relates to their continued refusal to enter "the Group".

Confrontational exchanges are again evident at a meeting in May 1998. Here Edward responded to claims that he was leading the church "autocratically" as opposed to "democratically". He stated that the church was run "theocratically" and based this on Isa.33:22, 23.

It appears the church finally entered "the Group" in April 1999. A definition of "control" had now been added to the original constitution alongside that of "sovereignty". A revised vision was in place by February 2000, with Rev.21:1-7 and Rev.22:17 being presented as Jesus', and therefore Ablewell's, goals.

March 2002 saw a Passover celebration with a Pentecost celebration scheduled for May. A leader noted that relationships had deteriorated over time and that much love and caring had been lost in the church. In December 2004 a definition for "assist" was added to the constitution to go with the earlier ones on "sovereignty" and "control" that are noted above.

The construction of a new church facility was started in 2006 and was completed in July 2007. The old church building became the location for all the activities of the children's ministry.

The current constitution, which was amended in 2009, identifies five main objectives for the church: (1) effective pastoral care; (2) discipleship; (3) effective communication of the gospel; (4) care for the poor and needy; and (5) networking. The church clearly identifies itself under the authority and apostolic direction of "the Group's" national and regional leadership.

Oral history

Although the meeting minutes offered some detail, there were gaps in the record and more personal assessments were required to "flesh out" the bare structure. In an attempt to obtain a richer historical account, the researcher used oral history interviews. Each interviewee was asked four questions.[7] These were:

(1)   How did the church come into existence?
(2)   What was it like in the early years?
(3)   What events in those early years really stand out for you?
(4)   Do you think things have changed over the years? If so, how?

These questions were open-ended and other questions were used to follow up on interesting topics that arose in the course of the interviews (cf. Carton & Vis 2008:44). They were designed to produce material that covered two areas of concern in the meeting minutes: (1) the gaps in the early record up to 1992 and (2) general detail concerning "ordinary" life and experiences in the church over the years of its existence.

Eight people were interviewed in six interviews from January to July 2009. The interviews were arranged and conducted with sensitivity to social location (Ntsimane 2008:110, 111). For some interviewees like Chris and Isla this meant chatting to both of them over morning tea at their home, while others like Linda preferred to be interviewed individually in a public cafe.

Due to the limitations of an article of this nature, only the answers that are considered significant for this study are included below.

● The Foundation of Ablewell Christian Fellowship

Nick was the first person who was interviewed. He had been the first pastor of the church from July 1982 to September 1982. He then later returned to minister for about three years from June 1987 through to February 1990. He recalled that the church had been the result of Bible study that had been conducted by a local Assemblies of God minister. He remembered how he had come to Ablewell.

> Nick: ... I was just a young Assemblies of God minister at the time. John Bond called me to say that there was a new Assembly that needed a minister and he wanted to send me there. I thought it was a bit strange because it was not a "Group" ministry but belonged to the Independents [FIAM] but ... we were sent under orders you could say. Ministers were moved around a lot back then; you stayed in one place for about two years until they [John Bond] moved you on elsewhere. Anyway, I arrived and we constituted the church with around 20 to 25 [23] people present.

Mark and Sara were interviewed together. Mark is an elder in the church and was present at its inception. He recalled that the Bible studies which the Assemblies minister had given them were important but noted that the work of a charismatic evangelistic ministry team had also been significant in their conversion to Christianity at the time. Chris and Isla had not been part of the church at its inception but had joined it soon after; they had originally worshipped at the local Methodist church. Chris had been an elder at Able-well. They both remembered the ministry of a charismatic evangelistic team as playing an influential part in how the church came into existence and they pointed out other things of interest regarding the founding of the church.

> Chris: ... Larry [Assemblies of God minister] did come a lot to teach both the men and the women, but there were other things happening at the time. A couple of Baptist guys ... Den Stokes and Ed Payne were also doing good Bible studies in the area. We were also doing lots of things by ourselves. There were "Hotline Tuesday nights", which were lively charismatic prayer meetings where the gifts really operated [people spoke in tongues, healings

occurred, prophecy was spoken]. People came from all over for those ... and ...

Isla: This was all tied up with what had started in the charis-matic renewal of course.

AJT: When had all these activities started to take place?

Isla: The charismatic renewal was back in the mid-1970s. A group of us travelled all over South Africa for events and outreaches. The Tuesday night prayer meeting was just an extension of that. It started around 1980. No ministers; just people from many churches joined in the Spirit. Many of these people ended up at the church [Ablewell].

Linda is the widow of a former church elder and had helped in the development of the church until she and her husband had moved on in 1995. They had come into the church at an early stage from an Anglican back-ground. She had not been present when the church was formed but had been part of the charismatic activity which Chris and Isla mentioned. She had joined the church in late 1982. Ruth had not been part of the church at its inception back in 1982 but did add that the early services were held in a converted chicken coup on her aunt's farm. This became known as "Cottage Chapel". Ruth had become involved in the church when she had moved to the area in 1990. Edward is the current pastor and was not present at Ablewell's inception. He had, however, been close to Larry (an Assemblies minister who had been involved in the local area) and he remembered him having been extensively involved in Ablewell in its formative period. He considered Ablewell to be an Assemblies of God plant that was attached to Larry's church.

● The early years

Accounts of the early period were varied. Nick recalled that about 25 to 30 people had gathered together with a strong sense of community being evi-dent. Sara remembered the early meetings as times with real anointing when many people had sung and prayed in tongues. She remembered "Cottage Chapel" as being full with around 35 people who had worshipped there on Sundays. Special memories for Mark were the occasions in 1982 when they had met at the first pastor's (Nick's) home and had blessed times of praise and worship as fellowship. This seemed to have changed with the arrival of the second pastor, Rick Hally, in November 1982. Mark and Sara explained:

> Mark: Ja ... you don't want to be nasty, but he was sent up from Cape Town and we all felt he was a bit immature in the Lord. He had problems with his marriage ...
>
> Sara: His wife was a lovely lady who really carried the work but she was ill with breast cancer. This was affecting them both and it was not a good time for everyone concerned. A lot of our people left the church because of the problems at this time. We did [leave] for a time.
>
> AJT: Could you be more specific as to these problems?
>
> Mark: As I said, he was immature in the Lord and many of the people had less respect for him than they did for his wife.

Chris and Isla agreed that Rick Hally's time in the ministry had not been a success and they seemed evasive as to the reasons why. Linda was more open about why Rick Hally had not been respected. She suggested that the move into the rural, insular community and his wife's health problems had put him under pressure and he had sought comfort in an extra-marital affair. This had probably been why some people had thought he was "immature in the Lord".

● Key events at Ablewell Christian Fellowship

Linda was also open about other problems with later pastors which she felt had affected the church. Tim Lewis, who arrived in March 1985, had caused a problem because many people had felt that he was never really around and was using the limited funds of the church for his "mission". He was replaced by the fourth pastor to lead the church, a Roy Line who had ministered at Ablewell from July 1986 to February 1987. He was an ex-headmaster who was very authoritarian and had a wife with a dominant personality. They, unfortunately, had caused a great deal of hurt amongst the congregation with their overbearing approach. Linda gave some examples and described the outcome:

> Linda: They just did not understand how to handle things. One couple had been having a difficult time and they [Roy and his wife] went over to see them. I am not sure exactly what was said but we [Linda and her husband] spent weeks trying to pick up the pieces. That couple would not return to the church because of what had been said. This type of thing involving, how would you say ... overbearing comments happened a few times and many were hurt by it. We decided something had to be done and we sacked him.

AJT: How did the church do that?

Linda: We had a meeting and asked him to leave. I still feel it was rather naughty but ... but the situation was not good and something had to happen.

AJT: Did his departure improve things?

Linda: Yes, it did. Nick agreed to come back to help sort out the problems that had been caused. His time with us [1987—1990] was a time of great healing and the atmosphere was happy again.

Chris and Isla also remembered Nick's second phase of ministry with fondness. Chris emphasised the tremendous love and unity that was present at the time. Another important time that stood out for Chris was when the church had no pastor from 1990 to 1992 – a period he called a "golden era". Isla remembered a vision she had had for a new church building in 2003 that included an upper level for a pastor training facility. She added that a church leader at the time had seen exactly the same vision. She regretted that they had not been listened to when the new church building had been designed in 2006. For Edward, the main events had centred around the "*El Shammah*" revival promise and "*El Shammah* ministries". He explained:

Edward: "*El Shammah*" means the Lord is here – in our midst. Back in 1993, a prophet called Barry Hines spoke a word [prophetic utterance] over us [Peter and his wife] concerning the local area becoming a "fruitful field". This was tied to the "fruitful field" text of Isaiah 29:17. There have been many repeats of this word over my time here – Lorraine has a whole folder of texts and words that have been given to us. It [revival] will come.

Edward: The ministry [*El Shammah*] started around the end of 1999. Dirk Steyn ran the tent ministry for around three years [2003] and they visited about 25 locations in our area. The Lord worked through him [Dirk] and his team in supernatural ways; the Spirit moved in amazing ways [healings, deliverance from evil spirits].

AJT: Why did the ministry stop?

Edward: *El Shammah* ministries didn't stop really. We [Edward and Dirk's brother Piet] still take trips to Israel each September and the tent work continues, but on a smaller scale and it's not attached to our body [Ablewell]. Dirk stopped his ministry because of allegations made by some in the Ladies Bible Study. Dirk was a good-looking guy and some women were attracted to

> him. This became "over-spiritualised" as some ladies
> saw this attraction as a demonic problem for Dirk. They
> told him and he just left the church and gave everything
> up to go back to farming. The other side [Piet's Israel
> tours] is still active, but it is nothing like it was; it was
> something special.

- How things have changed

Negative change seems to be a common theme in the church's history. Mark thought that the church had become more conservative over the years, stating the reduction in the use of spiritual gifts (like speaking in tongues) as a key part in this process. Sara believed that there had been a real lack of teaching Christian basics and this had hindered discipleship and growth in the church. Chris seemed to think that the church had become more controlled over time, with what he saw as a "Clerical George" attitude dominating: an approach which favoured that all ministry should be delivered by a trained minister over one that encouraged lay ministry. Ruth perceived the church to have become more conservative and restrained over the years. Linda remembered doing deliverance work (exorcism of evil spirits) with her husband and Edward and was surprised that this particular ministry was no longer functioning. Nick noted that the church had definitely changed over the years but that it still struggled for a sense of purpose beyond ministering to the pastoral needs of its people. Evangelism had always been a struggle and spiritual warfare (engaging evil spiritual forces in prayer) had been a common emphasis. The visiting aspect was something that struck Edward:

> Edward: I found it a strange little group when I arrived. All I
> seemed to do was to go around and take tea with them.
> It was nice and friendly. but there was little time for
> ministry. Everything was ... well, it was not Pentecostal;
> it was restrained, conservative ... very different from
> other Assemblies.
> AJT: Does that visiting still continue?
> Edward: Not as much as people would like; there are other
> things to do and I can't do it all.

Letting the past speak to the present

After having viewed the historical sources (both documentary and oral), we can now look at how they inform us about the present situation at Ablewell. Because an article of this nature cannot cover all the aspects involved, I have selected what I perceive to be three important areas.

Autonomy

The first is the issue of autonomy. The pastor's reference to "being in bondage to a spirit of independence" in the sermon I observed was not new. According to the meeting minutes, he made the same remark in 1997 – probably in relation to Ablewell's continued refusal to become part of "the Group". One wonders whether this spiritualisation of the issue is in fact valid when other evidence is considered. Although the pastor considered the area to be in bondage to a "spirit of independence", one cannot discount the naturally independent nature of this rural community. As a group, they stick together and defend their identity. Many of the families have been connected for at least a century and much good has come from it. The community spirit that is evident does not appear to be evil in origin.

It should further be noted that the church did not emerge from pure Assemblies of God roots. Chris and Isla spoke of the importance of the charismatic renewal and the prayer meeting on Tuesday nights. This was interdenominational: Chris and Isla were originally Methodists, while Linda has Anglican roots. Chris mentioned the impact of Baptist Bible ministry in the area. Mark and Sara were converted through the ministry of a charismatic evangelical outreach in the area. One should remember that although the church was constituted as an Assemblies of God church, it was originally in the FIAM which – as the name suggests – was a freer collection of Assemblies than those in "the Group" under the authoritarian leadership of John Bond.

One can see this independent nature coming through in Ablewell's struggles over entry to "the Group". Edward's desire to bring the church under "the Group" umbrella is evident in the minutes, but the ongoing seven year saga about entry demonstrates the church's reluctance to accept his plans.

A more subtle, yet important, part of this issue can be picked up from the evolving constitution. The constitution always included items on "sovereignty", outside assistance and general committee control. What is interesting is that under Edward's leadership, definitions for "assist" and "control" were added which diluted the independent control that these originally gave to Ablewell – thereby giving outside directives more power without visibly infringing the constitutional rights of the church.

Authority

The second important area is that of authority. Problems arose due to what were perceived to be an authoritarian style of leadership. Linda recalled how the fourth pastor, Roy Line (1986, 1987) had been rapidly removed after a few months at Ablewell because of the problems his dominant style had

caused and Edward also had trouble with regard to this issue. His desire to lead the church "theocratically" was clearly in response to a general belief that he was being autocratic. There is evidence that suggests this was an accurate observation by the church. The move towards "the Group" was certainly not desired by Ablewell; the desire was Edward's. It would appear that the issues Isla mentioned regarding construction work at the church had arisen because the views of the congregation had not been given sufficient consideration. The restructuring of the children's ministry was done without consulting a number of key participants in that ministry – a decision that led to much hurt.

The role of the pastor had also been a cause of friction for Ablewell. Edward was not the only minister who had been challenged over "mission" and "pastoral duties"; Tim Lewis, the third pastor (1985 and 1986), was heavily criticised for the same problem. This does raise questions about the pastor's role. Edward commented on the strong emphasis that had been placed on pastoral visitation when he had arrived at Ablewell. The pastor has to travel a great deal and visiting takes up much time in a rural community, so it is understandable that Edward had struggled to fit this element into a busy schedule of teaching and evangelism. Pastoral work with the body does not appear to have ranked high on his list of ministerial priorities. It does appear, however, to have been an important issue for others (like Chris and Mark) at Ablewell.

An authoritarian stance is evident in how ministry is structured. The "body" ministry of the early years is no longer a prominent feature of worship; as Chris said, a "Clerical George" model now dominates proceedings. This is probably most evident in Edward's own comment that "I can't do it all". In a balanced ministry structure he would not have had to "do it all"; others in the leadership would have taken on responsibilities like pastoral visitations.

As is shown by Chris's comments above, this approach does not sit well with the "body". The best evidence of this in the history of Ablewell relates to two "eras". Firstly, the informal and relaxed approach of Nick in his two periods of ministry (1982 and 1987-1990) saw times of growth and of healing. Today, he is still well respected by all the people in the church who knew him. The other time was when the church had no pastor and was run by the elders: Chris' "golden era" (1990-1992). These were times when the body had a voice and communication consisted of dialogue between the community rather than authoritarian instruction to it. This is an important issue for many in post-apartheid South Africa who view authoritarian structures with suspicion (Pieterse 1998:186). Another point in the historical evidence is that these were also times that saw the greatest use of spiritual gifts like healing, prophecy and speaking in tongues at Ablewell.

The role of the Spirit

This brings us to a point of disagreement in the records. Edward said that the congregation that he had inherited in 1992 were conservative and not obviously Pentecostal (displaying signs of baptism in the Spirit like speaking in tongues – something which he earnestly desired in the church). The majority of the interviewees would disagree with this and would say that the earlier years of the church, especially the two "era's" that are identified above, were times of great freedom and spiritual life. The historical record gives a possible reason for the current charismatic apathy at Ablewell. Edward mentioned that the tent mission which had run from 1999 to 2002 had been damaged because some of the women in the ladies' Bible study group had made "over-spiritualised" comments to Dirk Steyn. One wonders whether these charismatic excesses and the damage they caused to a vibrant ministry have caused people to be more cautious about spiritual gifts (like prophecy) in the present day.

A practical theological suggestion

When one reads Paul's teaching on spiritual ministries in 1 Cor.12-14, he repeatedly emphasises that they should function to edify the community (cf. Menzies & Menzies 2000:181-183). The problem that is highlighted above points to a recurring theme in the dialogue between the historical record and the present situation: problems arise at Ablewell when little consideration is given to relationships in the community. I would like to expand upon this by drawing on the "Total Church" model of Tim Chester and Steve Timmis (2007).

Chester and Timmis (2007:16-19) see the foundations of a successful church as the gospel and the community. I will expand on the community element here. When one considers the local context of Ablewell, one sees a tight community with a strong identity. There are therefore strong bonds that link together the relationships in the community and individuals have a distinct identity and role. Chester and Timmis (2007:38-45) explain that when one becomes a Christian, one severs the relationship bonds of one's old life and dispenses with one's former identity. Their scriptural basis for this is found in Matt.10:34-37; Mark 3:31-35 and Luke 11:27, 28. The new Christian builds new relationships in his or her new community – the church. He or she therefore forms a new identity as part of the community.

In the local context of Ablewell, this is important. People have to let go of the strong identity that they protect so tenaciously to take on a new identity in the church community. The question is: Does the church offer an attractive alternative to what they already have in secular society? Does it

offer them the community ethos they hold so dear? I believe that the current answer would be "no".

My reason for saying this lies in a broad understanding of *koinonia*. This Greek word that is translated as "community" can also be linked with the words "common", "sharing" and "participation" (Chester & Timmis 2007:41). And it is the final word, "participation", that I wish to focus on here.

When one looks at both the present and historical situations at Able-well, lack of "participation" is evident. "Body" ministry does not function like it once did. The leadership have made major construction and children's ministry decisions without consulting the congregation. The "*El Shammah*" revival promise had been made to Edward and his wife is held out as the central hope for the whole church. Similar revelations to others in the body concerning the need to stay independent or construction plans have been ignored. One can see why accusations of autocratic leadership were levelled at Edward in the past by a congregation that does not feel that it can – and therefore does not – participate.

This style of leadership is the key issue here. Edward said that Able-well should be run "theocratically", with God guiding its ministry. Although I do not disagree with his emphasis on divine direction, I do feel a church led "pneumacratically" – by the Holy Spirit through the body – is more in line with a New Testament model of a church. If the body is encouraged to minister through the spiritual gifts[8] (like healing), the community will be edified and encouraged. I believe that as the sense of community increases, there will be more freedom for this Spirit ministry: a cyclical pattern of mutual nourishment between Spirit and community.

The empowered community will have a strong identity. The Spirit will give it life (John 6:63) and will point to Jesus (1 John 5:6). The attraction of Jesus will be a strong reason to break cherished secular bonds and forge new ones as part of Christ's community at Ablewell. I saw and experienced glimpses of this during my research and the historical record shows that it was a feature in the past. Whether it will be an option for the future remains to be seen.

Conclusion

Some people might say that it would have been possible to reach the above conclusions from just applying biblical knowledge to the present situation, but I believe that the historical analysis has facilitated the hermeneutical task. There is nothing in the meeting minutes about the ministry of Roy Line, Nick Simm's second spell at Ablewell or the time when Ablewell was under the authority of the church elders. The oral interviews filled in these gaps. It is significant for this study that the interviewees gave a more detailed and

personal account of what had happened than what is available in the meeting minutes. Linda's recollection of Roy Line's ministry is a good example of an interview that offered evidence of historical tension with authoritarian approaches at Ablewell.

While there are many positives, one should note the problems that can be associated with the oral history interview approach which I used. Some interviewees held back information on sensitive topics. Examples of this are when Mark and Sara were questioned about Rick Hally's "immature" faith and the fact that Linda was the only interviewee who mentioned Roy Line's turbulent ministry. Errors of recall were also evident in some interviewees' answers, for example Nick's error about the numbers who had been present at the founding of the church. As a practical theologian who is inexperienced in oral history methodology, I have to take some of the blame for these "mistakes of memory" (Field 2008:146). I am still active at Ablewell and continue to learn about the interviewees and their lifestyles. Backed by this improved understanding, I would like to conduct further interviews with more specific questions targeting set periods. Every interviewee except Linda avoided talking about the ministry of Roy Line and this still seems to influence people who experienced this difficult time. This study did not uncover the full extent of the issues at Ablewell and I believe that further work will produce improved results.

These problems noted, I do feel that oral history interviewing has been shown to be a useful tool for practical theologians who attempt to interpret congregational issues that are often complex. It has shown how patchy Pentecostal historical records can be developed to make them significantly more useful for hermeneutic tasks. What this study has made clear is that we ignore history at our peril. Ablewell's past offers many insights into present issues that, once rectified, should lead to a happier, freer and more effective church community for many years to come.

Works consulted

Ackermann, D M 1996. Engaging freedom: a contextual feminist theology of praxis. *Journal of Theology for Southern Africa* 94, 32-49.
Browning, D S 1991. *A fundamental practical theology*. Philadelphia: Fortress.
Bryman, A 2001. *Social research methods*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
Carton, B & Vis, L 2008. Doing oral history, in Denis, P & Ntsimane, R (eds.), *Oral history in a wounded country: interactive interviewing in South Africa*, 43-62. Scottsville: University of KwaZulu-Natal Press.
Chester, T & Timmis, S 2007. *Total church: a radical reshaping around gospel and community*. Nottingham: IVP.

Denis, P 2001. Sharing family stories in times of AIDS. *Missionalia* 29(2), 258-281.

Denis, P & Ntsimane, R (eds.) 2008. *Oral history in a wounded country: interactive interviewing in South Africa.* Scottsville: University of KwaZulu-Natal Press.

Farley, E 2000. Interpreting situations: an inquiry into the nature of Practical Theology, in Woodward, J & Pattison, S (eds.), *The Blackwell Reader in Pastoral and Practical Theology*, 118-127. Oxford: Blackwell.

Field, S 2008. "What can I do when the interviewee cries?" Oral history strategies for containment and regeneration, in Denis, P & Ntsimane, R (eds.), *Oral history in a wounded country: interactive interviewing in South Africa*, 144-168. Scottsville: University of KwaZulu-Natal Press.

Menzies, W W & Menzies, R P 2000. *Spirit and power: foundation of Pentecostal experience*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan.

Ntsimane, R 2006. To disclose or not to disclose: an appraisal of the Memory Box Project as a safe space for disclosure of HIV positive status. *Journal of Theology for Southern Africa* 125, 7-20.

Ntsimane, R 2008. "Why should I tell my story?" Culture and gender in oral history, in Denis, P & Ntsimane, R (eds.), *Oral history in a wounded country: interactive interviewing in South Africa*, 109-128. Scottsville: University of KwaZulu-Natal Press.

Pieterse, H J C 1998. A theological theory of communicative actions. *Religion & Theology* 5(2), 176-194.

Theron, J P J 1999. Towards a practical theological theory for the healing ministry in Pentecostal churches. *Journal of Pentecostal Theology* 14, 49-64.

Van der Ven, J A 1993. *Practical theology: an empirical approach*. Kampen: Kok Pharos.

Village, A 2007. *The Bible and lay people: an empirical approach to ordinary hermeneutics*. Aldershot: Ashgate.

Watt, C P 1992. *From Africa's soil: the story of the Assemblies of God in Southern Africa*. Cape Town: Struik.

Interviews

Nick. Interview 1 with author, 28 January 2009.

Ruth. Interview 2 with author, 20 April 2009.

Mark and Sara. Interview 3 with author, 29 June 2009.

Chris and Isla. Interview 4 with author, 30 June 2009.

Edward. Interview 5 with author, 1 July 2009.

Linda. Interview 6 with author, 10 July 2009.

End Notes

1   St Lawrence's in Eyam, Derbyshire, is an excellent example. It is fa-
       mous for its part in alleviating the plague of 1666, an event that domi-
       nates the fundraising capabilities of the church in the present day (see
       www.eyamchurch.org for details).
2   Here "Pentecostal" refers to the "classic" Pentecostal groups of the
       Apostolic Faith Mission, Full Gospel Church and Assemblies of God.
3   A pseudonym is used to maintain confidentiality. Pseudonyms are also
       used for individuals who participated in the study and for characters
       from Ablewell's past.
4   The Sinomlando Centre for Oral History and Memory Work, Univer-
       sity of KwaZulu-Natal. This is a leading centre for oral history work
       in South Africa. Under the guidance of scholars like Philippe Denis
       and Radikobo Ntsimane, it has recognised the importance of oral his-
       torical methodology in both the academic sphere and at local level. A
       good example of the standard and type of work produced by the Cen-
       tre is that of Denis and Ntsimane's *Oral History in a wounded coun-
       try: interactive interviewing in South Africa* (2008. Scotsville: UKZN
       Press). Further information is available on the website.
       www.sinomlando.ukzn.ac.za .
5   I prefer this terminology over the more absolute term "worldview".
       Modern life-view assumptions dominate but are interspersed with
       postmodern assumptions that are alien to the modern worldview.
6   Available in full in Watt (1992:205–208).
7   Five questions were used in the full study but the fifth question related
       to views that are not strictly relevant for this article.
8   I am aware of the work of Berding (2000) and Aker (2002) on "gifts"
       and "ministries". I choose to use "gifts" here for ease of communica-
       tion, although I do agree with Berding and Aker's call to use the con-
       cept of ministries in relation to the gifts that are listed in 1Cor.12-14,
       Rom.12 and Eph.4:11.

Missionary ecclesiology:
a perspective from history

Willem Saayman
Christian Spirituality, Church History and Missiology,
University of South Africa, Pretoria, South Africa

Today one of the strongest impulses towards the renewal of the theological concept of the church comes from the theology of mission (Moltmann in Bosch 1991:369)

Abstract

The concept of a missionary ecclesiology is analysed according to the statement of Vatican II that the church is missionary by its very nature. The analysis is approached from the perspective of history, since the historical context is deemed to have played an important role in determining the nature of the missionary church. After World War II the concept changed dramatically as a result of decolonisation and the growth of liberation theology. The author supports Boff's conclusion that the church is "a community organized for liberation". In the context of the article the concept of "freedom" rather than liberation is preferred, and the demands this makes on our understanding of a missionary church are indicated.

Introduction

The Second Vatican Council concluded in *Ad Gentes* that, according to New Testament teaching, "the pilgrim church is missionary by its very nature" (in Bosch 1979:184). Yet this seemingly self-evident truth has been hotly contested terrain for a long time. When the modern Western missionary movement began, following the voyages of discovery and the Reformation in roughly the sixteenth century, neither the Roman Catholic church nor the fledgling Protestant churches were intrinsically organised for mission. The Roman Catholic church had managed to keep mission under the aegis of the church through the Middle Ages by creating and using missionary orders, which had originated in the Eastern church, to occupy the new-found "mission fields". The fact that mission was kept under the *aegis* of the church did not make the church a pilgrim church missionary by her very nature,

however. In the young Protestant *churches* the missionary dimension was, in David Bosch's opinion, completely muted (Bosch 1979:171). The huge missionary enthusiasm in Protestant *communities* could not be denied, however, and so mission enthusiasts formed themselves into mission societies under the Pietist influence and embarked on an existence clearly estranged from the Protestant churches[1]. This state of affairs existed clear through succeeding centuries, including the great century of Christian world mission (the nineteenth century), and into the twentieth century.

New initiatives in the twentieth century

The situation started changing with the birth of the ecumenical movement in the twentieth century at Edinburgh in 1910. The first two gatherings of the International Missionary Council (IMC) (Edinburgh 1910 and Jerusalem 1928) did not really deal explicitly with the relationship between church and mission, but implicitly the church was now one of the essential protagonists of world mission. In his preparatory volume for the Tambaram Conference, *The Christian message in a non-Christian world,* Hendrik Kraemer ([1938]1947:30) stated that the crisis situation in which the church found itself forced it to recapture the vision of what God meant the Christian community to be: "a fellowship of believers, rooted in God and his divine redemptive order, and therefore committed to the service and salvation of the world." This understanding was eventually incontrovertibly expressed at the third meeting of the IMC at Tambaram in 1938, where "church" and "mission" came together. At Tambaram "church" was represented in every one of the five sub-divisions of the theme, "The upbuilding of the younger churches as a part of the historic universal Christian community" (Saayman 1984:11). The conference took this engagement with both older and younger churches so seriously that the report and findings of the conference were eventually published under the title: *The world mission of the church*. For this reason I could conclude (*ibid.*) that, "after Tambaram it would be impossible ever again to speak about *mission* without speaking simultaneously about the *Church* – and vice versa". Tambaram therefore placed the topic of missionary ecclesiology firmly on the theological agenda. This did not, however, automatically mean that a solution was found for the estrangement between mission and church (which had existed for nearly three centuries, after all, and seemed to be working well – witness the "great century of world mission"!). Nor did it imply that the churches would suddenly all become missionary churches. What might have been some of the theological obstacles that needed to be overcome?

Mission as an after-thought and appendix to the church

Protestant theologians often practise their theology in such a way that one may be justified in deducing that the *real* history of the church started after the Reformation. I do not wish to create the same perception: the history of the church since Pentecost is of the utmost importance in a consideration of a missionary ecclesiology. In trying to determine the exact cause of the aberration, though, I will begin with the history of the church since the Reformation, for in my opinion it is here that the root of the problem lies. It is fairly generally accepted today that the phenomenon of "Christendom" (*corpus Christianum*) that developed as a result of the birth of the Constantinian era was not a blessing, but a bane for Christian mission.[2] According to Bosch (1979:105), one of the main reasons for this state of affairs was that the church now lost its *pilgrim character* (italics mine), and became thoroughly domesticated in the Roman Empire. There was no longer any real, vital eschatological expectation: the church had reached its pinnacle and all important salvific events had taken place. All the church now had to do was care for its own survival as vehicle of salvation. An important misunderstanding which contributed to this sad state of affairs was the belief that the Great Commission had been fulfilled by the apostles and that no further missionary effort was necessary or warranted. Although the first Orthodox and Roman Catholic missionary orders grew during these years, they all worked within the boundaries of the empire (and therefore within Church boundaries) and amidst concepts such as mission as enculturation and mission by force, it is hard to describe their efforts at this time as participation in the *missio Dei* (Bosch 1979:110–112). So, even in the Orthodox churches and the Roman Catholic church before the Reformation – and, very important, the voyages of discovery – one could not find many traces of a church "missionary by its very nature".

The sixteenth century witnessed two very important events with a bearing on the topic under discussion: the voyages of discovery and the Protestant Reformation. The discovery of vast numbers of human beings who had most definitely not been Christianised was the final nail in the coffin of the myth that the twelve apostles had fulfilled the Great Commission. New discoveries of unChristianised areas and peoples have been impulses for missionary enthusiasm through the ages, and this proved to be equally the case in the sixteenth century. Within the Roman Catholic church the old mission orders, as well as new ones founded expressly for the evangelisation of colonised territories (such as the well-known White Fathers in Africa), took up the challenge with papal approval. Obviously, this was inseparable from the great colonial project. Indeed, colonialism was justified in many instances by claiming that it led to the evangelisation of pagan people (Bosch 1979:117–119). The church that was to be implanted where it had not existed

before was firmly held to be the one church, indivisible from Mother Rome. One is therefore justified in arguing that *new appendices were being added* to the age-old church – it was not yet a pilgrim church, missionary by its very nature, taking shape. In the Protestant churches, it was mostly lay people who took up the challenge, and pride of place was taken by the Pietists. They were by their very nature somewhat removed from the institutional churches[3], and operated on the principle of bands of like-minded enthusiasts – *ecclesiolae in ecclesiae*. Where some of the leading lay mission enthusiasts tried to get their institutionalised churches involved, the most obvious example being the Baptist William Carey, the church refused to become involved institutionally. These enthusiasts were therefore obliged to follow the Pietist route, and created denominational mission societies in terms of which mission enthusiasts organised themselves into bands to "take the glorious name of Jesus" into the newly-discovered heathen lands (also in the wake of the colonial project). Since they had been badly disappointed by the lack of enthusiasm in their home churches, most had a fairly anti-ecclesiastical (and definitely anti-denominational) point of departure for their mission work. Indeed, some were convinced that they were going purely to "save souls for the Lamb", and not to waste time in replicating an institution such as the Western church which had (in their opinion) proved unsuitable for mission[4]. Again, it is very clear that mission was regarded as at best an appendix to the institutional church, something that could be left to a small band of volunteers, and something they could do without any reference to the church. Thus, the incredible missionary awakening brought about by the voyages of discovery and the Reformation in effect had no influence on the dominant ecclesiologies in the existing European churches. They were neither "pilgrim churches", nor were they "missionary by their very nature". Most of the energy of both Catholics and Protestants respectively went into proving that *they*, and not the opposition, represented the true church. The very nature of the Catholic church therefore largely entailed confirming the necessity of succession to the See of Peter (something that the Protestants could no longer claim), and they defined the true church with reference to the Pope (or his representative, the bishop). The very nature of the (Reformed) Protestant churches could be discerned from the proclamation of the Word, the maintenance of discipline, and the ministry of the sacraments (which, they claimed, were lacking among the Catholics). The emphasis on both sides of the divide was basically inward looking, and aimed at securing their own position against the *Christian* opposition. Obviously this is a generalisation, as there were extroverts in both camps. The extroverts in the Catholic church generally found their home in the missionary orders, and those in the Protestant churches found their home in mission societies; neither group played a significant role in influencing the official ecclesiological thinking. The *nature* (Latin *esse*) of the church, Catholic as well as Protestant, was untouched by the enormous release of

missionary enthusiasm at the time. Mission remained an after-thought and appendix to the *true* business of the church, which had to do with the survival of the existing institution.

There were a few exceptions, of course, as there always are. One exception well known to South Africans is that of the Dutch Reformed Church (DRC). At the very first synod meeting of the church in 1824 it was decided that the church itself, and not a mission society, should take on a missionary responsibility (Saayman 2007:35). Although there were mission societies at the Cape, some of which were supported and even initiated by DRC members (Saayman 2007:30–31), as soon as the church became structurally (synodically) organised, it decided that the missionary responsibility belonged to the church, and not to the societies. A number of important qualifications must be added, however. Throughout the nineteenth and most of the twentieth centuries, the utilisation of DRC missionary enthusiasm remained the responsibility of groups of mission enthusiasts in the church – these were either groups of ministers (such as the Ministers' Mission Societies in the Cape and the Free State), or groups of women in local congregations (such as the Women's Missionary Auxiliary (Saayman 2007:52–57)). The development of mission structures within the DRC followed the typical Pietist pattern (Saayman 2007:40–41; Durand 1985), as a result of which mission remained mainly the task of a group of like-minded believers, operating on the periphery of the institutional church. The rest of the congregation supported them financially and through prayer, but the DRC certainly never became a church "missionary by its very nature" because it had decided from the very beginning to make mission the responsibility of (a group within) the church. The problem of the construction of a truly *missionary* ecclesiology therefore remained a future responsibility.

The Second World War – a change in context

Tambaram 1938 stated the urgent need very clearly. Kraemer ([1938] 1947) was indeed one of the first prophets to sound the warning that the old way of being church and doing mission was no longer adequate. It was not yet clear, though, how to bring a renewal about. Barely a year after Tambaram, World War II broke out and radically changed the well-known colonial landscape. India, the "jewel in the crown" of the greatest colonial empire, became independent in 1947, a brief two years after the end of the war, and many colonies in Asia and Africa were soon to follow. The unpredictable consequences of this event were not restricted to "secular politics" only. An Indian spectator who stood watching the departure of the British Viceroy is purported to have said: "There goes Vasco da Gama" – in other words, there goes Western colonial influence, considered such a boon in the West and such a bane in the East. And if Western political and cultural influence had to

go, then, of course, so did Western religious influence (mission and colonialism had, after all, been intimately intertwined (Saayman 1991:22–35)). The age of the Third Church had come (Bühlmann 1977): the church in the Third World, the previously colonised parts of Asia, Africa and Latin America, that wanted to stand on its own feet and make its own mistakes (as an Asian church leader is purported to have said at an ecumenical gathering).

A missiologist who saw very clearly that everything had changed after the Second World War was Hans Hoekendijk. He indicated that post-war human beings were radically different, and that therefore church and mission had to become radically different (Hoekendijk 1948; 1964). *Ekklesia*, Hoekendijk stated (in Bosch 1991:377), was "a theo-political category". For this reason, "the church's offices, orders, and institutions should be organized in such a manner that they do not separate the believer from the historical" (Hoekendijk in Bosch 1991: 378). The influence of the changed context on mission theology in the wake of the Second World War began to reveal itself very clearly at the Conference on Church and Society organised by the World Council of Churches (WCC) and held in 1966 in Geneva. This would be incontrovertibly confirmed at the General Assembly of the WCC in Uppsala in 1968 (reflecting clearly also the theological influence of Vatican II). It was inspired mainly by the ecumenical study project on "The missionary structure of the congregation", within the parameters of the wider study project on "The unity of the church and the unity of mankind" (*sic*). As Bosch (1991:383) concludes, "the Hoekendijk approach had become the 'received view' in WCC circles". Of the four traditional "marks" of the church according to the Apostles' Creed (unity, catholicity, holiness and aposto-licity), catholicity was the dominant one in these discussions (Saayman 1984:38–39). The meeting of the Commission for World Mission and Evangelism (CWME) of the WCC had stated clearly at Mexico City in 1963 that mission was to be regarded as "mission in six continents": there were no longer mission "sending" and mission "receiving" countries. Mission was from everywhere to everywhere. Uppsala stated that there was only one catholic and apostolic church throughout the world; there were no longer "sending" churches and "receiving" churches. If that was the case, then the whole Catholic church had to be apostolic, in other words, as Vatican II had stated, missionary by its very nature.

The irruption of the Third World

Several new dimensions to the debate on missionary ecclesiology revealed themselves in the second half of the 1960s. Mexico City's slogan of "Mission in six continents" provided the theoretical base: there were to be no more "sending" and "receiving" churches. Perhaps the first influential impulse from the former "receiving" churches in the Third World came from Latin

America in the form of the Base Christian Communities (BCCs). These communities had their origins in the Roman Catholic Church in Latin America, largely as a result of the wave of renewal which swept the Catholic church after Vatican II. One of the great proponents of the ecclesiology underlying the BCCs, Leonardo Boff, described them as "signify[ing] a new ecclesiological experience, a renaissance of very church, and hence an action of the Holy Spirit on the matters urgent for our time" (Boff 1986:1; cf.:23). The main difference from earlier ecclesiologies, argued Boff (1986:2), was that the BCCs presented a new ecclesiastical system, not rotating on "a sacramental and clerical axis" (on which both classical definitions, Roman Catholic and Reformed, rotated), but on an axis of "word and laity". Boff thus claimed (correctly, in my opinion), that the BCCs did not simply represent an attempt to adjust the earlier ecclesiologies inherited from the time of the voyages of discovery and the Reformation. Rather, they were indeed attempts to transform ecclesiology in such a way that it could deal with the apostolic (missionary) needs of the present time. Boff (1986:45–60) argued that Jesus did not will only one institutional form for the church. In particular, he emphasised that there is no justification for neglecting and side-lining the contribution of the laity, both men and women alike, in the institutional church (Boff 1986:61–95). He described the central characteristic of the Church of Christ for our time as "an oppressed people organizing for liberation" (Boff 1986:34–44). Whereas according to the age-old Roman Catholic definition the church had been characterised in terms of the Pope/clergy, and the Reformed definition had characterised the church in terms of correct doctrine, sacraments and discipline, Boff (1986:40–43) argued that the BCCs characterised the church in terms of the community and its liberation.

The rapid growth and development of BCCs in Latin America influenced Protestant churches in that continent (and other areas) as well. This ecclesiology also had a strong influence on the Protestant churches in some African countries, especially in Southern Africa, where liberation theology exercised a marked influence through its philosophical links with (South African) black theology. It influenced ecclesiological thinking in Africa especially in terms of the desire of the African church to take ownership and control of its mission to the world. However, when African churches attempted to take control themselves, they encountered a serious obstacle, as they discovered that much of the control over mission in their own countries was actually firmly vested in older churches in the Western countries (mostly on the basis of contracts and agreements entered into in colonial times, and controls exercised through the provision of funding). Very often, for example (South Africa is a case in point) they found that the ownership of church land was vested through legal title deeds in churches in Germany, America or other Western countries[5]. Thus a totally new element

entered the debate: unequal economic power relations as a result of the reigning political economy, which promoted the continuing hegemony of the West, and also of Western churches. This dovetailed with the analysis and arguments of liberation movements, and brought *liberation* to the centre of the ecclesiological debate. African churches could not simply break all relations with the older churches in the West; they still needed financial and staffing assistance. Therefore, in order to initiate the process, African churches called for a moratorium on mission from Western churches (Bosch 1979:5–6). The very emotional moratorium debate gave rise to numerous misunderstandings on both sides, which did little to promote the debate about a missionary ecclesiology for our time. Rather, the battle lines were drawn in a struggle for the autonomy of Third World churches – and a new era in the debate dawned.

Liberation, autonomy and freedom

The end of the Second World War signified the collapse of the post-Constantinian *corpus Christianum*. Some perceptive observers (such as Kraemer) had indeed been aware since the end of the First World War that things had changed forever. The independence of India in 1947 and the subsequent wave of decolonisation in Asia and Africa, however, made this reality crystal clear. The West's claim as guarantor of education, civilisation and morality was revealed as lacking merit, and consequently the Western church's claim to be the embodiment of "the only true religion established by the only true God" seemed hollow and empty (Comblin 1998:9). As the Third World embarked on a struggle for liberation instead of Western development, the Third Church embarked on a struggle for autonomy – and often the two struggles progressed in tandem. Suddenly the Western pattern was no longer the only choice; instead, the choice was determined by "what was suited to the interlocutors [of Western evangelisation, namely Third World people] and their interests, preferences or objections" (Comblin 1998:10); it had indeed become an acceptable alternative paradigm, and this embryonic new ecclesiastical paradigm was far more fluid, earthy and human in character. It was centred on the *human community* in a *certain, specific place*, and with *certain, specific needs*, not on some faraway benevolent but unfamiliar fount of authority – whether in the form of a Pope or a "paper cardinal" (a set of sixteenth-century creedal writings) – and its needs and preferences. New alliances were formed, new metaphors sought. The dominant Western Roman Catholic and Protestant ecclesiologies lost their historical authority as the search for indigenous foundations intensified. The search for *the liberation of theology*, envisaged and analysed by Segundo (1976), had spilled over to the search also for *the liberation of ecclesiology*.

A new metaphor for missionary[6] ecclesiology: oppressed people organising for liberation

I referred above to Boff's (1986:34–44) statement that the central characteristic of the Church of Christ for our time is its identity as "an oppressed people organizing for liberation". I would like to make use of this description as metaphor, but I would like to define the most important concepts and processes here more clearly in my own terms. In the first place I take *oppression* to encompass far more than the absence of political emancipation. I understand it to refer to any disenfranchisement, be it economic, ethnocentric/racist, sexist, or ideological. I understand *people* to refer simply to a shared humanity, not some kind of sectarian grouping ("*volk*" in Afrikaans apartheid ideology, the "masses" in ideological revolutionary rhetoric). Moreover, I understand *liberation* in the first place as the general Judaeo-Christian concept of comprehensive human well-being (expressed so poignantly in the Hebrew word *shalom*), with both an "already" and a "not-yet" (eschatological) dimension, so passionately described by Comblin (1998:48–61) as the freedom for which God has called his people. I see it as the missionary calling of the followers of Jesus of Nazareth to obey the call of the Creator to join him in his outreach to set human beings free in situations where the striving for his promised *shalom* is denied by conditions of oppression and disenfranchisement – and eventually to rejoice with Creator, Liberator and Sustainer where signposts of *shalom* can be erected. And where a group of human beings have formed a community on the basis of their shared humanity and shared needs for well-being to achieve this in a certain place, there we have *ecclesiogenesis*. If various such communities begin to gather together with other similar human communities striving for the same freedom in other places, we get *ecclesia*.

Such an understanding makes a homogeneous, universally valid definition of missionary ecclesiology very difficult to formulate. For this reason I wish to propose that we follow Bosch's lead in *Transforming mission* (Bosch 1991:1–9) in formulating a new definition of mission, where a homogeneous definition has also become unattainable. He argues that it has become very difficult, indeed, well-nigh impossible to come up with any generally accepted synopsis of the meaning of "mission", and therefore proposes that we study history very carefully, analysing every era for its times of danger and opportunity (Bosch 1991:2–3), and establish as much as we can about the process of paradigm shift, rather than attempting to return to a romanticised era of simplicity and unanimity. We have rather to deal with our *own* period of danger and opportunity, the era of a shifting paradigm, by imaging a new vision for mission. To do this, Bosch (1991:7–8) argues with Soares-Prabu, we have to recognise that we are dealing today with "a pluriverse of missiology in a universe of mission". *Mission* is still one, still *missio Dei*, still

the eternal outreach of Creator, Liberator and Sustainer to the created cosmos in which we can participate – therefore "a universe of mission". But *missiology* is so complex, incarnated in such diverse contexts, calling for such diverse approaches, that we can only work in and with "a pluriverse of missiology". Yet we have to communicate with one another as God's people about the *missio Dei* from within our diverse contexts, we have to nourish each other as members of *one* body despite our distinctions and disparities; therefore we must develop a mutually understandable language and lexicon. This we can do, he suggests, by taking as point of departure for the first part of our definition the "universe of mission", and therefore speaking to each other about "mission as …" Then we deal with the reality of the "pluriverse of missiology" in the second part by completing the phrase with the "action-word" required by our distinct and disparate contexts. This, then, is how he builds his elements of an emerging ecumenical (=belonging to the whole inhabited earth) paradigm: Mission as the church-with-others, mission as *missio Dei*, and so on.

I would argue that it would be a waste of time to try to formulate a single, universally valid synopsis of the characteristics of a missionary church – a new paradigm is calling for various new metaphors. In order to describe and verbalise this new reality, let us work with an understanding of "a pluriverse of ecclesiologies in a universal *ecclesia*". The church can never be anything else but the Body of Christ on earth – hence the universal *ecclesia* remains God's covenant people, the new eschatological community. If it can no longer be recognised as such, it has lost the right to call itself "church". It is not a situation of "anything goes," but this community of people nevertheless has to be incarnated in many different contexts so that it can serve as the *oikos* of Jews and non-Jews, Greeks, Romans, slaves, everybody (1 Cor 9:19–23). It is clear from Paul's discourse here that these incarnations will differ in various places and among various groups in order to truly reflect the missionary context, which is why we have a pluriverse of ecclesiologies. In order to properly verbalise this reality, let us speak of "church as ..." just as Bosch speaks of "mission as ..." If we follow Boff, for example, in Latin America, we can speak of "church as community of freedom"; in a situation of alienation, such as in some industrialised First World areas, we may perhaps speak of "church as human fellowship"; in other industrialised areas of both the First and Third Worlds, it may be necessary to speak of "church as earthkeeper" (cf. Daneel 1998); and in many areas in Southern Africa amid the ravages of HIV/Aids and non-existent health services, we may speak of "church as healing community" (cf. Landman 2008:187–201). This brings about a real correlation between mission and church, reflecting Bosch's reality of "mission as the mother of Theology" (1991:15–16), and therefore also as "mother of the church" (cf. also Haacker 2005:249–262). But does this not leave us open to the reproach

(I paraphrase Stephen Neill) that if everything is church, then nothing is church? I am very aware of the possible validity of this reproach, and therefore I wish to conclude with what I consider to be abiding characteristics of a truly missionary church that set it apart from other human communities.

Conclusion

What characteristics would be essential to enable one to recognise the universal *ecclesia* as the body of Christ in a pluriverse of ecclesiologies? In the first place, it must be the *one* universal church, body of Christ, being given life through its connection to its head, Jesus Christ himself. This body is identified in the Apostles' Creed as both one and catholic. The reality that it is *one* signifies the bonds that keep believers together, while the reality that it is *catholic* signifies that *one* does not simply mean homogeneous, but presupposes diversity. Since the time of the events described in the parable of the tower of Babel, which provide an explanation for the multiplicity of human cultures and languages, the human community has never been homogeneous; there is diversity and differentiation. This needs to be reflected in the **one, catholic** body of human beings, the Bride and the Body of Christ; hence the pluriverse of ecclesiologies, which does not negate or abrogate the unity of the universal church. But this is not simply any body of heterogeneous human beings either; it is a *specific* community of human beings, the *new eschatological community*, which comes into being in response to the missionary invitation of the gospel and ministry of Jesus of Nazareth. For this reason it is the **holy, apostolic** community of human beings renewed by their faith in him (Jesus of Nazareth, the new human being) who calls them to be *new human beings* (Ephes 4:11–14; Saayman 2007:138–139). These new human beings have been called first of all *for freedom* (Gal 5:13; Comblin 1998:21–47). This freedom cannot be equated simply to political liberation, economic autonomy, and so on (*ibid*.); it is more than all that, for it is the freedom offered and guaranteed in Jesus Christ. Captivity can take many guises in different contexts. In some contexts we may be captive to Mammon, or to alienation from each other, or to dis-ease and a lack of well-being, or to sexist oppression. The call for freedom may therefore differ in different contexts – but it will always be rooted in Jesus Christ. So, if the true Church of Christ is the community organised for liberation (called for freedom), the task for which the missionary church is called may differ in different contexts, which is why we are able to speak meaningfully only about a pluriverse of ecclesiologies in a universe of *ecclesia*.

Does this negate the old definitions of the church as "there where the Pope is", or "there where the Word is proclaimed correctly"? Were the mothers and fathers in the faith therefore mistaken in their definition of the church? I truly do not think so. They were human beings of their time and of

their place, responding to the call for freedom as they heard and understood it. There were many temptations along the way, many voices claiming to offer freedom when in fact what they offered was seduction. There were others who wanted to define the church after their own nature, in order to gain control over the faithful. And there were always powers and princes who wanted to rule over a compliant institution that could be used for selfish or nationalistic purposes. In that context, where charlatans attempted to mislead the faithful, to guarantee orthodoxy they emphasised that the church was where the Pope was. And where they sincerely believed that the Word was no longer proclaimed faithfully, they emphasised that the church could exist only where the Word was authentically and freely proclaimed. But this is not what is necessarily impinging on our freedom as the new eschatological human community today, called for freedom in the twenty-first century. For that reason we have to determine what it is that we have to emphasise today in order to remain true to the teaching of the apostles, to establish communities of people organised for freedom. There are still charlatans wishing to mislead the faithful. There are still false apostles proclaiming a false gospel in an attempt to enslave our consciences, so the need to be watchful and faithful is still valid. How do we remain both watchful and true to our missionary calling? Comblin (1998:22) has a possible answer, which I find satisfactory:

> In the New Testament the gospel is always a simple formula that has an impact, the proclamation of a good that can be identified immediately … Now Paul's gospel is the proclamation of freedom. He announces the move from a way of life characterized by slavery to a life in freedom … only that which builds freedom is Christian. "For you were called for freedom brothers" (Gal 5:13).

We can remain true therefore only *in relationship*, as members of the body relating to the Head (the-church-with-Christ), and as members of the body relating to each other (the-church-with-others), and to the environment around us. If any of these relationships can be seriously questioned, there the authenticity of the missionary church will be at stake. In the end, therefore, I believe that this is how we can give shape to David Bosch's primary element of the new emerging ecumenical paradigm as being "a church-with-others" (Bosch 1991:368–388).

Works consulted

Boff, L 1986. *Ecclesiogenesis: the base communities reinvent the church.* Maryknoll: Orbis.

Bosch, D J 1979. *Heil vir die wêreld: die Christelike sending in teologiese perspektief.* Pretoria: NG Kerkboekhandel.

Bosch, D J 1991. *Transforming mission: paradigm shifts in theology of mission.* Maryknoll: Orbis.

Bühlmann, W 1977. *The third church.* Maryknoll: Orbis.

Comblin, J 1998. *Called for freedom: the changing context of liberation theology.* Maryknoll: Orbis.

Daneel, M L 1998. *African earthkeepers,* vol 1: *Interfaith mission in earth care.* Pretoria: Unisa Press.

Durand, J 1985. Afrikaner piety and dissent, in Villa-Vicencio C & De Gruchy J (eds.) *Resistance and hope: South African essays in honour of Beyers Naudé*, 39–51. Cape Town: David Philip.

Haacker, K 2005. One gospel, different people, manifold preaching: Paul's missionary strategy. *Missionalia* 33(2), 249–262.

Hoekendijk, J C 1948. *Kerk en volk in de Duitse zendingswetenschap.* Amsterdam: Kampert & Helm.

Hoekendijk, J C 1964. *De kerk binneste buiten.* Utrecht: Bosch.

Kraemer, H [1938] 1947. *The Christian message in a non-Christian world.* Second edition. London: Edinburgh House Press.

Landman, C 2008. Farm ministries in the Hoedspruit area: past and present. *Studia Historiae Ecclesiaticae* XXXIV(2), 187–201.

Saayman, W 1984. *Unity and mission: a study of the concept of unity in ecumenical discussion since 1961 and its influence on the world mission of the church.* Pretoria: Unisa Press.

Saayman, W 1991. *Christian mission in South Africa: political and ecumenical.* Pretoria: Unisa Press.

Saayman, W 2007. *Being missionary, being human.* Pietermaritzburg, Cluster.

Schultze, A 2005. *"In Gottes Namen Hütten bauen": Kirchlicher Landbesitz in Südafrika; die Berliner Mission und die Evangelisch-Lutherische Kirche Südafrikas zwischen 1834 und 2005.* München: Franz Steiner Verlag.

Villa-Vicencio, C & De Gruchy, J (eds.) 1985. *Resistance and hope: South African essays in honour of Beyers Naudé.* Cape Town: David Philip.

Endnotes

1   Confirmation for this claim can be found, for example, in the well-known Reformed axiom that the true church can be identified in the purity of doctrine, the ministry of the sacraments, and the maintenance of discipline. In the Catholic church, the teaching stated that where the Pope/bishop was, there was the church. In both cases this did not imply any missionary dimension to the nature of a true church; in both cases the nature of the church was defined in such a way that it could protect the church's existing interests.

2   See Bosch 1979:104–116 for an extensive analysis.

3   The mainline churches were not in favour of the existence of numerous smaller groups not clearly under the control of the church; and as the answer to Carey implied (I paraphrase: "Sit down, young man, if God wants to convert the heathen he can do so without your help or mine"), there was some intolerance (possibly even enmity) towards the upstart activists.

4   "The LMS stated its 'fundamental principle' in the following terms: 'Our design is not to send Presbyterianism, Independency, Episcopacy, or any other form of Church Order and Government … but the Glorious Gospel of the blessed God to the Heathen'" (Bosch 1991:330).

5   Schultze (2005) has written an excellent doctoral thesis to describe and analyse this state of affairs in relation to the Berlin Mission Society and ELCSA in South Africa.

6   I am aware of the move to the term "missional" rather than "missionary". I prefer the older term; my reasoning for this choice is to be found in an unpublished paper: "Missionary or missional? Probably only time will tell".

Stoic roots of early Reformational resistance theory: a marginal note on the origins of the right to resistance in early Reformational political thought

Andries Raath
Department of Constitutional Law and Philosophy of Law,
University of the Free State, Bloemfontein, South Africa

Abstract

As expressed in his *Institutes* in 1536, John Calvin's views on the right of subjects to resist the political oppression of rulers were preceded by developments in Lutheranism that sought recognition of the right to resist of tyranny. The acknowledgement of such a right to resist was kindled by Luther's and Melanchton's reading and interpretation of Cicero's views in this regard. The application of Cicero's views by the early Reformers provided them with the theoretical requirements for acknowledging the right to resist tyranny. This article adds a few marginal notes to early Reformational resistance theory and questions efforts at crediting Calvin (and Calvinism) with too much originality in this sphere.

Introduction

In his work, *Visions of politics, Volume II: Resistance virtues*, Quentin Skinner (2002:245f.) legitimately questions the perception that resistance theory should be associated with the rise of Calvinism in the latter part of the sixteenth century. Skinner critically probes Julian Franklin's belief that only during the political crisis touched off by the spread of the Reformation, did ideas of resistance first appear in their more mature form, adding that ideas of resistance initially appeared in the works of leading Calvinist-Huguenots, such as Theodore Beza, Francois Hotman and the anonymous author of the *Vidiciae, Contra Tyrannos* of 1579 (Franklin 1969:11-15, 27-29 & 39-40). Skinner also investigates Michael Walzer's observations that a Calvinist theory of revolution was the first to change the focus of political thought from the figure of the prince to that of the revolutionary, and consequently formed the basis for the new politics of revolution (cf. Walzer 1965).

Skinner concludes that although most of the leading protagonists of political resistance in the mid-sixteenth century Europe were Calvinists, they were by far not the first exponents of Protantism to advocate these ideas.

Skinner rightfully states that it remains to be investigated whether the theories espoused by the Calvinists may have originated with the Lutherans. Furthermore, Skinner believes that whether Luther was the "political conservative" that Walzer made him out to be, needs to be investigated.

A critical investigation of Skinner's observations reveals that the early Lutheran authors strongly espoused the views of the Stoics and the classic Roman- law authors in matters pertaining to politics and law. Early Lutheran political views largely integrated the Stoic notions pertaining to providence, natural law and the rational knowledge of injustice in particular, as well as the notion of the human being's natural aversion to injustice and inclination towards justice, benevolence and virtue. The early Lutherans embraced the arguments that Cicero set out in *De Re Publica*, *De Officiis* and *De Legibus* in particular, and these played a significant role in shaping early Reforma-tional thought on tyranny, injustice and the human being's desire to pursue virtue – all matters relevant to the way in which civil rulers should conduct themselves.[1]

This article largely considers the influence of Stoic political views and how these views impacted on early Lutheran political theories to the point where resistance to injustice and tyranny emerged clearly on the Lutheran political agenda.

Providence, natural law and the rational knowledge of injustice

Divine providence, the eternal law and the centrality of justice

Cicero's legal philosophy focused on the centrality of divine providence in human existence. Not only did God equip human beings with reason, but the human mind also received its illumination from providence (*DL*, 1.7.22f. (321)). Providence, as understood by Cicero, engraves the nature of an eternal law on the human mind (*DL*, 1.5.19 (317)). The precepts of the eternal law are the highest reason fixed in the human mind (*DL*, 1.5.19 (317)). Therefore, the tenets of law and justice are contained in the nature of human beings (*DL*, 1.5.19 (317)).[2]

Because divine providence impresses justice on the human spirit, it is not fabricated by the human mind, nor can it be eradicated by the human will. Justice precedes all human laws. They are merely expressions of justice, and therefore laws without the divine wisdom of justice are not, properly speaking, laws but oppression (cf. Plato, *Minos*, and Cicero, *DL*, bk. 2). In addition, civil rulers exercise authority as servants of justice, because justice is the very essence of political authority. The demands of justice go infinitely deeper than considerations of utility. Therefore, in his work on duties, Cicero observes that if we have learned anything at all about philosophy, it is that even if we were able to hide what we do from all the gods and from all

humankind, we should nevertheless abstain from all avarice, injustice, lust and intemperance (*DO*, 3, 8).

Because the demands of justice are innate to human personhood, only the nature of human beings reflects the demands of justice, and these demands oblige human beings to act uprightly. The immediate implications flowing from Cicero's views on providence, human nature and the centrality of the demands of justice are far-reaching: the demands of justice are much more fundamental than the legal minutiae involved in a study of law because they concern the essence of the human being's jural existence as a human being. Justice expresses the acts of persons relative to other persons in accordance with a certain kind of equality determined by the moral uprightness of the actors' will to adhere to virtue. Human beings are constantly driven by the law of justice because it makes for a happy, peaceful and virtuous life, and because it encapsulates all the qualities of any good law as the genuine substance and vital principle of morality, and as impressed upon the human heart by providence. Justice is, so to speak, a beacon of light established by providence in the hearts and minds of humankind; a light shining to guide human beings and civil government towards their ultimate goal. Justice is the most basic and noble idea and all attempts at reasoning about positive laws begin here because the essence of the perfection of laws rests in justice alone, and supernatural justice begins solely with an apprehension of God.

Apart from casting Cicero's teachings on divine providence and moral laws within a Scriptural framework, Melanchthon did not materially differ from the classical Ciceronian teachings on divine justice and the human being's ability to know and practise justice and the moral virtues in the earthly realm.[3] To Melanchthon, the centrality of divine providence in human existenceis reflected in God's having implanted certain given components of knowledge (*notitiae nobiscum nascentes*), which he calls the divine "light from above", a "natural light in the human mind," and the rays of "divine wisdom" engraved on the minds of human beings (cf. *CR*, 13:150[4]; *CR*, 11:920; *CR,* 21:721; *CR,* 13:642ff; *CR,* 20:695ff.).

The human mind, therefore, receives its illumination from divine providence – divine wisdom illuminating human reason by pouring rays of divine wisdom into our minds.[5] Melanchthon believed that these *notitiae* of divine knowledge come as a divine light "from above"; they reflect rays of "divine wisdom" poured into the being of the human person and kindle the light of the "human faculty" needed for managing and governing the earthly realm.[6] These *notitiae* illuminating the human mind, contain valuable principles for governing civil society.[7] Among these *notitiae* are the truths that "men were born for civil society", that offences which harm human co-existence should be punished and that promises should be kept (*CR*, 21:117; *CR*, 21:398-400; *CR*, 11:918-919).[8]

The natural knowledge engraved by divine providence in the human mind is congruent with the eternal and unchanging norm of the divine mind "that God has planted in us", thereby providing the starting point for life and co-existence in the earthly realm (*CR,* 16:228).[9] The precepts of the eternal law of divine providence reflect the highest reason fixed in the human mind because they concern the essence of human co-existence in society: the natural components of knowledge concerning the morals that support life and law in the earthly domain (*MWA*, 3:208).

The natural knowledge that human beings possess is traceable to the divine source of illumination in the human mind. Melanchthon observes emphatically:

> The greatest and best things in the divine mind … are wisdom, distinguishing honourable from shameful things, and justice, truth, kindness, clemency, and chastity. God planted seeds of these best things in human minds, when He made us after His own image. And He wished the life and behaviour of men to correspond to the standard of His own mind. He also revealed this same wisdom and doctrine of the virtues with His own voice [in the Bible] (*CR,* 11:918-919).[10]

Happy and just is the civil order of a society in which the divine *notitiae* are applied and enforced:

> This knowledge, divinely taught both by the light that is borne in us and by the true divine voice, is the beginning of the laws and of the political order [of the earthly kingdom]. God wishes us to obey them not only for the sake of our needs, but more, so that we may acknowledge our creator and learn from this same order that this world did not arise by chance, but that there is a creator who is wise, just, kind, truthful, and chaste and who demands similar virtues in us. We may also learn that he is an avenger who punishes violations of this order (*CR*, 11:918-919).[11]

Melanchthon's views on the "inborn nodal points of knowledge" come very close to reflecting Cicero's statement to the effect that law and justice are contained in the nature of human beings. Except for the fact that human reason cannot prove the existence of these principles of natural law (*CR*, 21:399-400 & *CR,* 13:547-555; *CR*, 21:116-117), these *notitiae* are elements of human nature, representative of innate human knowledge that are in the mind of God, and infused by God at the creation of humankind (see Kusukawa, 1995:94; Witte, 2002:124).[12]

Because of humankind's fall into sin, the human mind is not able to know the *notitiae* of natural law embedded in human nature perfectly (*MWA*, 4:146ff.; *CR*, 21:399-402).[13] However, through reason, human beings are able to discern the "sparks", of divine truth, so to speak, in spite of the fact that although God infused the perfect natural knowledge of the nature of good and evil in the human mind, sin prevents human beings from apprehending or applying it without distortion (see Witte, 2002:125).

Because God demands virtuous activities from human beings, according to Melanchthon, God "wrote" the law of nature in the minds of men in order to perform those virtues which reason understands and which are necessary for civil life (*CR,* 16:23). Therefore, although human beings are fallible and human reason is darkened by sin, the divine law of nature enables human beings to distinguish between right and wrong and to act virtuously (cf. *CR*, 16:23). Because of the possibility that human beings may misunderstand the tenets of natural justice (*CR*, 16:24), and human fallibility in knowing the divine commands for a virtuous life, God gave His moral law in Scripture to guide our fallen nature (*CR*, 21:392). The principles of moral law contained in Scriptures reflect the divine law or law of God, acting as a "law of virtue" and reflecting the eternal immutable wisdom and rule of justice in God Himself (cf. *CR,* 21:1077; 22:201-202; 21:294-6; 387-392; *CR,* 1:53-57).

Because all human beings are in need of a happy, peaceful and virtuous life, the tenets of natural law, subject to God's "law of morality", are necessary to accomplish virtue and justice (*CR,* 22:201-202; 21:294-296; 21:387-392). Therefore, similarly to Cicero, Melanchthon maintains that the natural-law precepts contained in the Scriptures enable us to apprehend the divine will of God (*CR*, 22:256-7; *CR,* 16:70).[14]

Justice and the nature of humankind

To Cicero, the impression of law in the human mind unites humans and establishes a natural fellowship among them (*DL*, 1.5.16).[15] The nature of justice is situated in the nature of humankind, and law in the form of the highest reason is fixed in the human mind (*DL*, 1.5.19 (317)), demanding from every person to grant to everyone his own. Therefore, the root of justice is human nature, and the human being's love for justice and right flows from human nature (*DL*, 1.10.28-29 (329)). Accordingly, human beings have a sense of justice (*DL*, 1.11.32-1.12.33 (33)), the virtues of love are the foundation of justice, and law is the product of human reason (*DL,* 1.11.32-1.12.33; *DL,* 1.15.43; *DL,* 2.4.8-10)).

The testimony of justice makes itself felt wherever the safety of citizens, the preservation of civil society and the tranquillity and happiness of human life demand it.[16] By implication, the only law of the state to which all

human beings are subject, is justice declared by reason and enlightened by divine providence. In civil society laws informed by providence rule the judges, as the magistrates rule the people.[17] Because justice reflects divine reason implanted in the essence of all human beings, justice is necessarily present in every human being in whom the tiniest ray of reason shines, and the force of jural obligation reveals itself to human beings because it shines equally in all human beings.[18]

Melanchthon shares Cicero's view that the impression of law in the human mind establishes a natural fellowship among us, because it enables us to distinguish between right and wrong: "... human reason, without God's Word, soon errs and falls into doubt. If God Himself had not graciously proclaimed His wisdom, men would fall still further into doubt about what God is, who He is, about what is right and wrong, what is order and what is disorder" (*CR*, 22:256-7; *CR*, 16:70). Therefore the precepts of natural law remain important in the earthly realm – natural law serves important civil, theological and pedagogical uses (cf. *CR*, 1:706-709; *CR,* 11:66; *CR*, 21:405-6, 716-719; *LC*, (1555), 54-7, 122-8).

The law also teaches against violence and injury of others, while cultivating charity and love. The law should instruct people on virtuous conduct:

> Paul says in Galatians 3[:4] that the law is a teacher in Christ, and that a child should be subject to the law, as though he were subject to teachers, until he matures in Christ ... Nevertheless, God has also subjected to this teaching all who are not in Christ or who are weak ... [for] the multitude must be instructed, ruled, and coerced in this manner even now by laws and by certain offices ... This political pedagogy, which is justice, forms morals and includes both religious rites and human civil offices. Through teaching and exercise it accustoms children [of God] to the proper worship of God, and it restrains foolish people from vices (*CR*, 1:706-8).

In Melanchthon's theological-political views, the virtues of love undergird justice in civil society. Through the Decalogue, God binds men together in multiple relationships all flowing from the love demanded by divine law (*CR,* 22:610). The specific demands of love find their expression in the particular commandments contained in the Scriptures, which command obedience to the authorities, the punishment of unlawful killing and violence, and so on (cf. *CR,* 1:87ff.; *CR,* 21:294ff.; *CR,* 22:25ff.; *CR,* 16:70ff.).

Because justice constantly testifies against injustice such as threats to the safety of the citizens, efforts to upset the preservation of civil society and the undermining of the tranquillity and happiness of people in civil society, human life demands that each is given his due and that justice is maintained.

It is the primary duty of magistrates to perform the duties of the law informed by providence and to rule subjects within the commonwealth wisely. Because magistrates are commanded by God to rule justly, all subjects have the duty to obey, and not to resist political authority and the laws of civil rulers which would lead to total chaos that ensues from public uprisings and sedition (*CR,* 21:223-224).[19] The obedience required by divine law (the Ten Command-ments and the duties contained in Romans 13) prohibits defiance of civil authority, which is viewed as a defiance of God Himself that would incur His wrath (*CR,* 21:223-224).

The human being's natural aversion to injustice

Because justice is the first and primary element to enter into the construction of every human society, the theory of justice forms a part of society and human society is part of the theory of justice.[20] Because all law and justice can be traced back to human nature, all laws must be based on a rational principle (*DL,* 2.4.8 (379)). However, in the final analysis, law is not the product of human thought, nor is it any enactment of humans, but something eternal which rules the whole universe by its wisdom (*DL,* 2.4.8-10 (381)). Ultimately, submitting to the demands of justice means to obey divine providence because law is the primal and ultimate mind of God (*DL,* 2.4.8-10 (381)), the divine reason of providence commanding virtue (*DL,* 2.4.8ff. (381-2)). Cicero cites two examples to prove his point: it was divine providence that commanded the heroic Cocles to obey the law of bravery by burning the bridge behind him when facing the enemy (*DL,* 2.4.8-10 (383)). On the other hand, Lucius Tarquinius broke the eternal law by violating Lucretia, the daughter of Tricipitinus (*DL,* 2.4.10-11 (383)): he broke and disobeyed a law that came into existence with the divine mind, because "what is right and true does not begin or end with written statutes" (*DL,* 2.4.10-11 (383)).

Law is the distinction between things just and unjust, made in agree-ment with nature. According to nature, human laws should inflict punishment upon the wicked and defend the good (*DL,* 2.5.11-12 (385)). All deeds of injustice therefore, are in conflict with human nature and upset the divine order of providence infused in human being's minds. Therefore, there is a basic aversion to injustice because it is contrary to human nature.

Melanchthon's theory of justice is not merely a theological matter, but also forms part of his views on society. Melanchthon remarks as follows:

> This knowledge [of natural law and justice], divinely taught
> both by the light that is born in us and by the true divine voice,
> is the beginning of the laws and of the political order [of the
> earthly realm]. God wishes us to obey them not only for the

> sake of our needs, but more, so that we may acknowledge our creator and learn from this same order that this world did not arise by chance, but that there is a creator who is wise, just, kind, truthful, and chaste, and who demands similar virtues in us. We may also learn that he is an avenger who punishes violations of this order (*CR,* 11:918-919).[21]

Knowledge of justice is an emanation from the rational nature of human beings. Not only as divine law inscribed on the human mind, also positive law should, as "rational positive laws" govern the earthly kingdom (*CR*, 16:230; *CR,* 22:611-612). The notion of "being rational" derives a particular nuance from a Reformational perspective: it means acting according to the natural law and applying practical considerations of social utility and the common good – without these requirements of "being rational", positive law does not bind the subjects in civil society (Witte 2002:129-130).[22]

Injustice is directly opposed to that which is rational and to human nature, and therefore there is a basic aversion to injustice. In the case of a civil authority acting contrary to natural law and divine law (the divine moral law), it is not binding and could be lawfully disobeyed. Thus, defiance of natural law precepts implies the unlawful conduct of magistrates beyond the authority of their office (Witte 2002:138).

Tyranny, injustice and the inclination of human nature towards justice, benevolence and virtue

To Cicero, laws were invented to ensure the safety of the citizens, the preservation of states, and the tranquillity, happiness and honour of human life (*DL,* 2.4.10-2.5.11 (383)). Those rulers who formulate wicked and unjust statutes break their promises and agreements (this is an implicit reference to the oaths made at the institution of rulers and their vows to govern justly) and put into effect anything but law, because by definition law inheres in that which is just and true (*DL,* 2.5.11-13 (383)).[23] Furthermore, by definition such a state is no state at all because it lacks law (*DL,* 2.5.13 (385)). Cicero explains that the "deadly pestilential statutes" which nations put into force are no better than the rules that might be passed by a band of robbers (*DL,* 2.5.13 (385)).[24] Such wicked and unjust laws are "ruinous regulations" and amount to deadly poison instead of being the "healing drugs" for the well-being of society (*DL,* 2.5.13 (385)). One such instance where law deviates from nature is where it does not inflict punishment upon the wicked and defend and protect the good, but operates to the contrary (*DL,* 2.5.13 (385)).

Because vows are contracts by which human beings are bound to God by calling upon God's justice, divine providence demands the scrupulous performance of these vows (*DL,* 2.16.41 (423)).[25] Not only are magistrates

called upon to govern in accordance with their vows and agreements, they are also commanded by providence to give commands which are just, beneficial and in accordance with natural law (*DL,* 3.1.1. (459)). The importance of government is highlighted by Cicero's observation that nothing is so completely in accordance with the principles of justice and the demands of nature as government because without it existence is impossible (*DL,* 3.1.2 (461)) – without the prudence and watchfulness of magistrates no state can exist, therefore they must be informed of the limits of their administrative authority, and citizens must know of the extent of their obligation to obey them (*DL,* 3.2.5 (463)).[26]

Whereas Cicero stated the conditions on moral-political, religious-political, moral-jural and religious-jural grounds for considering the injustice committed by civil rulers, Melanchthon proceeds from the notion of fundamental obedience to civil government, except where the moral-political conditions do not justify it. The primary moral-political instance of justice identified by Melanchthon concerns the safety of the citizens and the preservation of civil society. In his *Prelegomena to Cicero's De Officiis* (1530), he relies upon creatures' natural inclination to protect themselves against unjust violence (*CR*, 16:533-614). Analogous to Cicero's arguments on acting in self-defence, Melanchthon takes up the argument for the natural instinct common to both animals and humankind to repel violence[27] because God has implanted in their nature an "appetite for conserving themselves," while in humans there is the same inclination to repulse unjust violence(*CR,* 16:573). This "natural inclination" is nothing but the testimony of God, which He has given to us to be able to discriminate between justice and injustice.[28] In essence, the reason for instituting civil institutions is to guarantee the rule of justice, whilst the office of rulers and magistrates automatically excludes any right to inflict violence on their subjects (*CR,* 16:574). Subjects have the natural right to resist unjust violence by ordained rulers by calling on magistrates to assist: or, if no assistance is forthcoming, by acting themselves in the manner of a person who kills thieves in self-defence (*CR,* 16:573). Of particular significance is the fact that the lawful power to act in self-defence in resisting unjust force or violence is both limited to the office of ordained civil rulers, and is also a power possessed in extreme instances by every individual in accordance with the right of nature to repel violence with force (*CR,* 16:573).[29] Secondly, in a document composed by Melanchthon and issued by Luther, Jonas, Melanchthon, Spalatin and other theologians towards the end of October 1530[30] in response to the arguments in favour of resistance voiced by the legal advisors of Elector John, a combination of the moral-political and the religious-political arguments surface. The statement reads as follows:

> We are in receipt of a memorandum from which we learn that
> the doctors of law have come to an agreement on the question:

> In what situations may one resist the government? Since this possibility has now been established by these doctors and experts in the law, and since we certainly are in the kind of situation in which, as they show, resistance to the government is permissible, and since, further, we have always taught that one should acknowledge civil laws, submit to them, and respect their authority, inasmuch as the gospel does not militate against civil laws, we cannot invalidate from Scripture the right of men to defend themselves even against the emperor in person, or anyone acting in his name. And now that the situation everywhere has become so dangerous that events may daily make it necessary for men to take immediate measures to protect themselves, not only on the basis of civil law but on the grounds of duty and distress of conscience, it is fitting for them to arm themselves and to be prepared to defend themselves against the use of force, and such may easily occur, to judge by the present pattern and course of events. For in previously teaching that resistance to governmental authorities is altogether forbidden, we were unaware that this right has been granted by the government's own laws, which we have diligently taught are to be obeyed at all times (*LW*, 47:8).

In Luther's *Warning to his poor German people* (1531), he informs the people that in the event of a war by the emperor to stamp out the Reformed religion, those wishing to take up arms and fight the emperor cannot be reproved because they will be acting in self-defence and preserving themselves against the abuses of law. Luther's major concern expressed in this treatise was the fact that their opponents' plans were "built exclusively on force" and their cause relied on "the power of the fist," against the manifest and known truth of God (cf. *LW*, 47:11 & *WA*, 30(3)276-320). Luther's response followed upon the issuance of the *Augsburg Confession* in 1530 and the unrest it engendered.[31] Alarmed by the prospect of Emperor Charles V and the princes loyal to Rome attempting to extirpate the Protestant movement by using military force, Luther issued this "warning" to his followers – no one who cared for the freedom of the gospel or the integrity of the church should in any way assist such efforts, even if the emperor himself should command it. Not only passive non-cooperation but armed resistance would be justified to repel such violence to the gospel, the church and individual believers. The doctrinal and historical importance of this polemical treatise represents a departure from Luther's earlier, more passive attitude toward the civil authorities of that time.

The moral-jural implications of the Ciceronian-Melanchthonian views on the right of resistance

No study of resistance theory in Reformational thought is legitimate without considering the religious, moral, jural and political contexts within which resistance theory manifested itself. The early German Reformation established a moral and religious platform for political and jural resistance views by developing and extending the classical Ciceronian framework of providence, moral duty and political authority subject to natural law and human reason.[32] The development of this Ciceronian-Lutheran basis for developing resistance-theory had a profound impact on later generations of Reformational thinkers.

Whereas Luther and Melanchthon advanced a limited and conservative notion of political resistance by resorting to moral-political arguments only, later generations of Reformers tended to broaden the spectrum of arguments in support of legitimately establishing a right of resistance to civil rulers. Whatever the basic arguments advanced may have been, most of these emanated from the view that justice is a cardinal virtue and that it fulfils a constitutive function for making and applying positive law.

Melanchthon's incorporation of the divine moral law into his theory of legitimate resistance that informs natural law, took the criteria for justice, moral duty and the right to a deeper level of concreteness, particularly concerning issues related to the "right" of civil authorities to demand obedience of their subjects and the "right" of subjects to disobey the laws of its civil rulers.

By introducing the precepts of the moral law and the demands of justice in considering the right of civil authorities to demand obedience, Melanchthon contributed substantially towards delineating the conditions under which civil rulers would have a right to demand obedience from their subjects. In order to have this right to demand obedience, two requirements have to be present: firstly, in terms of the moral law, subjects should have a duty to obey, and, secondly, civil rulers should perform morally upright (just) actions.[33] Only then will civil authorities have the right to demand obedience of their subjects. The implication is that civil authorities have a right to demand obedience only if subjects have the duty to obey *and* if they perform morally upright actions in promoting truth, justice and virtue. In the absence of one of these two conditions, civil rulers lack an enforceable right to demand obedience. Subjects then have a right to disobey civil rulers if they have contravened the moral law (for example by unlawfully taking their property, ravishing their wives, and blaspheming in the name and honour of God) and provided that the subjects themselves act in a morally upright manner., Between the time of Luther's and Melanchthon's rejection of the peasant uprisings in 1525 and the threat of an attack by the emperor on their

faith and the church in 1530, the finer nuances of the interplay between duties in terms of the moral law and the demands of justice had crystallised and been refined to such an extent in Lutheran thought that there could be a right of resistance. The tyrannical assault or infringement of the law and the cunning, unlawfulness and the use of violence inflicted on the material and spiritual well-being of subjects by those siding with the antichrist in Rome, therefore could indeed proceed to the point where a right to self-defence became manifest.[34]

Regarding the first requirement, Luther and Melanchthon (and the Reformers generally) interpreted the commandment obliging one to honour one's parents widely to include obedience to all institutions having legitimate authority. The upright moral action required of civil rulers related to the classical statement of giving each person his due. However, just because a ruler may perform morally upright and just actions, this does not necessarily award him the unfettered freedom to act in a manner that disregards the rights of subjects in civil society. The rights of subjects not to have their possessions stolen, their wives ravished and their bodily integrity attacked place limits to the freedom of civil rulers. Similarly, if civil rulers do not perform morally upright and just actions, this does not, as such, give subjects a "right" to refuse to obey civil rulers under all circumstances, because these rulers may have enforceable rights to obedience in other respects.

The development of the idea of natural right had undergone a profound transformation as a result of the Lutheran acceptance of a "natural" right to resist based on a duty-oriented approach in terms of the moral law. In a wider context the demands of moral duty and moral uprightness also assisted in developing a more nuanced perspective on the moral limits of governance and the practical implications of the duties of individuals and social entities in the jural sphere.

Conclusions

The formulation of a right to resist tyrannical rulers became a powerful tool for ensuring political freedom in the course of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries in Europe. The seventeenth century, in particular, witnessed the extended application of the right to resist oppressive political rulers in a plurality of diverse conditions under which Reformational political theorists found themselves. In this respect the core of the right of resistance formulated by the early German Reformers opened up vast possibilities for further development and application.

However, the emphasis on the existence of such a right by later Calvinists did not deviate from the original aims of the German Reformers and their Scriptural interpretation of the Stoic commitment to the political duties of rulers and the moral aims for securing justice in society. The in-

fluence exerted by the Ciceronian-German Reformationalal arguments on later generations of Reformers in the development of a "right" to resist the unjust acts of rulers is manifest in the example of Samuel Rutherford's seventeenth-century appeals to law in resisting tyranny. Rutherford firstly stresses the duty of the ruler towards his subjects. To him, all rightful authority lies in law, whether it is the authority of the king, estates, populace or church. In the king's remotest distance from law and reason, he is a tyrant, because a tyrannical power is not from God; it is Satanic, and is no more from God that a license to sin is from God (Rutherford 1982:34(1)). Therefore, the judge also has a duty to execute judgment for the oppressed because the king has no power from God to exercise acts of tyranny without any resistance (Job 29:12-17; Jeremiah 22:15-16). To Rutherford, the office of the ruler implies governance in accordance with the precepts of God as summarised in the Decalogue. Once the ruler seriously transgresses his obligations, this is contrary to his office and therefore the ruler as a person must be resisted (Rutherford 1982:151(2)-152(1)). The king who acts contrary to his office may be resisted, the community only having to be subject to his power as royal authority in so far he acts in accordance with his office, which entails acting for the good of the people (Rutherford 1982:145(1)). Rutherford also refers to that power which is obliged to command and rule justly and religiously for the good of the subjects and as an authority over the subjects on certain conditions. When this power is abused it may be resisted (Rutherford 1982:141(2), 110(2) & 220(2)). In effect, it means that the people are only bound to the king in so far as he is a terror to evil. The fact that the people are united under the king through contractual obligations, presupposes that no such contract can come into existence outside the law of God. Secondly, Rutherford demands that subjects act uprightly in their relationship with the king. Therefore, the people should not apply their power at the instance of any kind of inappropriate behaviour on the part of the king; the people must suffer much before they may resume their power (Rutherford 1982:36(2)). Rutherford bases his argument on the principle of self-preservation: In the law of nature, God has given to every man the keeping and self-preservation of himself and of his brother (cf. Rutherford 1982:97(1)). De Grunchy (1995:79) rightfully remarked that

> (i)f the struggle against tyranny was central to the development of democracy, then the French Huguenots, the Scottish Presbyterians, and the English Independents, all heirs of the Genevan Reformation, must be accounted key agents in its historical development.

However, this statement is subject to the truth that the roots of the duty-based conception of a right to resistance in the Reformed fold did not *originate* in

Calvinistic thought, but had a profound influence on later generations of Calvinists.

Works consulted

Bauer, C 1950. "Die Naturrechtsvorstellung des jüngeren Melanchthon", *Festschrift für Gerard Ritter zu seinem 60. Geburtstag.* Tübingen: 244-255.

Bauer, C 1951. "Melanchthons Naturrechtslehre", *Archiv für Reformationsgeschichte* 42, 64-100.

Cicero, M T 1928. [DO] *De Officiis.* London: William Heinemann.

Cicero, M T 1948. [DRP & DL] *De Re Publica & De Legibus.* London: William Heinemann.

De Grunchy, J W 1995. *Christianity and Democracy. A theology for a just world order.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Franklin, J 1969. *Constitutionalism and resistance in the Sixteenth Century.* New York: Pegasus.

Kusukawa, S 1995. *The transformation of natural philosophy.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Luther, M 1898. [BW] *Briefwechsel.* Vol. 8 (Ed. Enders, C.L.). Stuttgart: Evangel. Vereins.

Luther, M 1883-1987. [WA] *Werke. Kritische Gesamtausgabe* (78 vols). Weimar: Hermann Böhlaus Nachfolger.

Luther, M 1958-1976. [W] *Works.* Pelikan, J (vols 1-30) & Lehmann, H (vols 31-55) (eds.). Philadelphia, Pa: Concordia.

Melanchthon, P 1519. *Philippi Melanchthonis De rhethorica libri tres.* Wittenberg.

Melanchthon. P 1834-1860. [CR] *Corpus reformatorum Philippi Melanchthonis opera supersunt omnia* (ed. Bretschneider, CB & Bindseil, HE, vols. 1-28). Halle & Brunswick: C.A. Schwetschke.

Melanchthon, P 1951-1971. [MWA] *Melanchthons Werke in Auswahl* (eds. Engelland, H, Ebeling, G, Nürnberger, R & Volz, H, vols. I-VII). Gütersloh: Mohn & Co.

Melanchthon, P 1965. [LC (1555)] *Melanchthon on Christian Doctrine. Loci Communes 1555.* (Transl. & ed. Manschreck, CL). Grand Rapids: Baker Book House.

Raath, A & De Freitas, S 2005. "Rebellion, resistance and a Swiss Brutus?" *The Historical Journal* 48(1), 1-26.

Rutherford, S 1982. *Lex, Rex.* (or *The Law and the Prince*), *A dispute for the just prerogative of king and people.* Harrisonburg, Virginia: Sprinkle Publications.

Skinner, Q 2002. *Visions in politics. Vol. II, Resistance virtues.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Walzer, M 1965. *The revolution of the saints: a study in the origins of radical politics.* Cambridge Mass.: Harvard University Press.

Witte, J 2002. *Law and Protestantism. The legal teachings of the Lutheran Reformation.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Endnotes

1   Apart from Luther, Melanchthon in particular had much affinity for Cicero's rhetorical and philosophical abilities. In his early work *Rhetoric* of 1519, much of which was written before he came to Wittenberg, Melanchthon already focuses on law cases and disputes as topics for purposes of rhetoric (*Rhetoric*, 1519, fol. 1(b), 34-36). He lauds the art of rhetoric in Cicero's *De Officiis* (*Rhetoric*, 1519, fol. B4(a), 20-22) and Cicero's speech for Milo as juridical examples of clarity (*Rhetoric,* 1519, fol. G1(b0-g4(b), providing students with the ideal standard for defence (*Rhetoric*, 1519, fol. F4(b)), and praises Cicero's moral values, comparing his writings with the Bible – whereas Holy Scripture is the only basis for true religion, Melanchthon turns to Cicero on moral issues. Melanchthon also lauds the exemplary standards of Cicero's writings for private and public morals (*De praefatione in officio Ciceronis* (1525), *CR*, 11: 88, 6-8): "Verum ego religionem ex divinis literis censeo hauriendam esse. De civilibus moribus malim audire Ciceronem ..." Due to the natural law inherent in all human beings, Melanchthon extensively applies the principles of Ciceronian ethics. This corresponds with St Paul's teaching that the whole of humankind is endowed with knowledge of the law (Romans 2: 14-15), and humankind having been invested with a conscience that testifies concerning that which is honest and bad: "Imo Gentes etiam habuerunt legem, hoc est noticiam naturalem de moribus discernentem honesta et turpia ... Ac Paulus erudite ratiocinatur, quod Gentes habeant legem, ac simul declarat, quid sit lex naturae; habent conscientiam accusantem et excusantem, id est, discernentem honesta en turpia, ..." (*Commentarrii in epistolam Pauli ad Romanos* (1540), *CR*, 15, 577, 33-40). Melanchthon also emphasised Cicero's *De Oratore* as a guide to governing by rulers (*M.T. Ciceronis de oratore libri tres* (1541), *CR*, 16, 689, 17-23): "Nam cum oratio nascatur ex rerum cognitione, erit inops orator sine harum rerum scientia. Et cum orator maxima reipublicae consilia gubernet, opus est ei ad sapienter dicendum et iudicandum omnium illarum maximarum artium scientia. Nam existere aliquos tales rerumpublicarum gubernatores necesse est omni-

bus aetatibus." In his philosophical treatises, Melanchthon produced more than 22 commentaries on works by Cicero, including *Officiis, Laelius, De Oratore,* fifteen addresses, including *Pro Archia, Milone, Ligario, Deitaro, Lege Manilia,* etc. For Cicero's influence on Melanchton's natural law views, see Bauer, 1950 & 1951.

2   To Cicero, human beings have a natural aversion to injustice, because human nature has a longing for liberty – a mind "well-moulded by Nature is unwilling to be subject to anybody save one who gives rules of conduct or is a teacher of truth or who, for the general good, rules according to justice and law."

3   Note e.g. his definition of particular justice in *CR*, 13: 539: "Iusticia particularis est virtus, suum cuique tribuens. Hanc definitionem Plato scribit a Simonide traditam esse. Et quod in textu dicitur: Est constans et perpetua voluntas. Haec verba sunt descriptio habitus, quasi dicat: Iusticia … est firmum propositum voluntatis, ut suum cuique tribuat." Hans Engelland describes the Ciceronian concept of knowledge from which Melanchthon derived his theory of knowledge, as follows: "The synopsis of the sciences just given rests upon a common fundamental assumption, upon a certain the ory of knowledge, derived from a Ciceronian concept …" in Melanchthon, *Loci communes* (1555): xxviii.

4   "Copiose autem in dialecticis dicitur de normis certitudinis ... Hic tantum obiter iuniores commonefacio, ut magis considerant, qualis sit naturalis lux in intellectu, et quae sit iudicii regula, et unde sit adsensionis firmitas."

5   See e.g. *CR* 13: 150 where he equates the "notitiae" with principles established in the human mind: "Principia sunt noticiae nobiscum nascentes, quae sunt semina singularum artium divinitus insita nobis, ut inde artes extrauntur, quarum usus in vita necessarius est, ut noticia numerorum, ordinis, proportionem, et multarum propositionum. Quodlibet est, aut non est. Totum est maius qualibet sua parte. Deus est mens aeterna, sapiens, verax, iusta, casta, benefica, conditrix mundi, servans rerum ordinem, et puniens scelera." Melanchthon developed his idea of knowledge from the premise of the "natural light" divinely instilled in the human mind, as "naturalis lux in intellectu", or "lux humani inegnii", or "lumen divinitus insitum mentibus" (see *CR*, 13: 150, 647; 21: 712).

6   See e.g. *CR*, 11: 920: "Et in Salomone: Pondus et statera iudicia Domini sunt. Sit igitur infixa pectoribus haec sententia, et firma ac immota assensione retineatur, leges et totum politicum ordinem spaientiam Dei esse, nobis monstratum, et res bonas esse, ac beneficia,

7   in quibus Deus vult agnosci, se quoque iustum et veracem esse, et
      amare iustitiam, et horribiliter irasci iniustitiae."

7   The aspects of the *notitiae nobiscum nascentes* concerning the ulti-
      mate presuppositions of action, Melanchthon called the presupposi-
      tions of action (*principia practica* of ethics), which direct the moral
      life and above all require distinctions between good and evil (*CR*, 13:
      649; 21: 711). This "divine light in the soul" cannot be extinguished,
      and should be "strongly aroused and the sense of it fortified so that we
      recognize, assert and confirm that the practical principles are just as
      sure and certain as the principles of thought, or even the immutable
      judgments of God" (*CR*, 21: 641ff., 711f.).

8   See e.g. his remarks at 919: "Hae notitiae divinitus traditae cum luce
      quae nobiscum nascitur, tum vero etiam voce divina, sunt initia legum
      et ordinis politici, cui vult nos Deus, non solum necissitatis nostrae
      causa obedire, sed multo magis, ut agnoscamus conditorem, et in hoc
      ipso ordine discamus, non casu extitisse hanc naturam rerum, sed
      opificem esse sapientem, iustum, beneficum, veracem, castum, et
      similes virtutes in nobis flagitantem, et vindicem punientem huius
      ordinis violationem." At 918-919 Melanchthon observes: "Summae et
      optimae res in mente divina conditrice generis humani sunt, sapientia,
      discernens honesta et turpia, et iustitia, veritas, beneficentia,
      clementia, castitas. Harum optimarum rerum Deus semina in mentes
      humanas transfidit, cum nos ad imaginem suam conderet. Et ad
      normam suae mentis congruere vult hominum vitam et mores. Voces
      etiam sua hanc ipsam sapientiam et virtutum doctrinam patefecit."

9   Even after the Fall, these *principia practica* find expression in the
      idea of law (*CR*, 13: 649f.; 21: 687f., 712).

10   Also compare *CR*, 11: 921: "Et ut numerorum scientia lumen est
      divinibus insitum mentibus, nec impedit, nec delet Evangelium, ita
      politica sapientia ex firmissimi-s notitiis extruitur, quae divinitus insi-
      tae sunt humanis mentibus, nec impediunt, nec delent Evangelium."

11   The principles of natural law enable human beings to distinguish
      between just and unjust acts: "Summicae et optimae res in mente
      divina conditrice generis humani sunt, sapientia, discernens honesta et
      turpia, et iustitia, veritas, beneficentia, clementia, castitas. Harum opti-
      marum rerum Deus semina in mentes humanas trnsfudit, cum nos ad
      imaginem suam conderet. Et ad normam suae mentis congruere vult
      hominum vitam et mores. Voce etaim sua hanc ipsam sapientiam et
      virtutem doctrinam patefecit."

12   Melanchthon followed Luther in rejecting the role of the human
      rational abilities in the moral sphere. The divine law is the law that
      God has imprinted on the human mind as an "external and immutable

precept of the divine spirit, a judgement against sin" proclaimed in the Word of God (*CR*, 21: 712, 686, 687).

13   Melanchthon defines natural law as the "natural knowledge of God and our guide in morality or judgment about good and evil, which is implanted by God in humankind like the knowledge of numbers," a natural order, corresponding with the moral part of God's law, summarised in the Decalogue; therefore the law of nature is the "knowledge of divine law implanted in human nature" (*CR*, 13: 649 f.; 21: 687f., 712).

14   Also note *CR*, 11: 919: "Ut igitur vides hanc pulcherrimam mundi figuram, coeli et elementorum positum, solis et stellarum motus, temporum vices, deinde in ipso homine mentem, numeros et alias notitias mirabili arte divinitus ordinatos esse, et divina potentia con-servari: sic certum est a Deo societatem hominum et vincula socie-tatis, imperia, leges, doctrinam virtutem, iustitiae, beneficentiae, veri-tatis, castitatis, contractus, iudicia, poenas singulari opere ordinatas esse, et excitatos ab eo gubernatores, legum tutores ac interpretes, qui subinde hos nervos societatis et doctrinam virtutum restituerent."

15   This flows from the two fundamental principles of justice – not to harm anyone, and to conserve the common interest (*DO,* 1.10.31).

16   Cicero in *DO*, 1.4.12, regards self-preservation as a basic inclination of human nature – nature has endowed every species of living creature with the instinct of self-preservation; "of avoiding what seems likely to cause injury to life or limb, and of precuring and providing every-thing needful for life ..."

17   To Cicero "it is the duty of the magistrate to represent the state and uphold its honour and its dignity, to enforce the law, to dispense to all their constitutional rights, and to remember that all this has been committed to him as a sacred trust".

18   The fixed order in political society enables Melanchthon to use it as one of the proofs for the existence of God – only an eternal Spirit can give human beings an orderly understanding for the sake of main-taining political community.

19   This emphasis is reminiscent of Cicero's call to subjects in civil society to labour for the peace and honour of the state (*DO,* 1.34.124).

20   Thus the duties prescribed by justice ought to have precedence: "From all this we conclude that the duties prescribed by justice must be given precedence over the pursuit of knowledge and the duties impressed by it for the former concern the welfare of our fellow-men; and nothing ought to be more sacred in men's eyes than that" (Cicero *DO* 1.43.155). The duty of obedience to civil rulers is an outflow of the duty to do justice: "Every duty, therefore, that tends effectively to

maintain and safeguard human society should be given the preference over the duty which arises from speculation and science alone."

21   God's Spirit enlightens the human mind to understand and apply the principles of natural law, see e.g. *CR*, 11: 68: "... quid de civilibus legibus divinus Spiritus decreverit; quas cum coelesti voce probari audietis, par fuerit, et cognoscere diligentius, et observare sanctius. Sese enim contemni Deus iudicabit, si civiles leges tantopere nobis commendatas violaverimus."

22   This, however, does not diminish the need all human beings have for guidance through God's Spirit – the Spirit of God renews the knowledge of natural law that became obscured in nature because the spirit of the human being became blind through sin (*CR*, 21: 140).

23   In *DO,* 1.7.23 Cicero takes good faith to be the foundation of justice: "The foundation of justice, moreover, is good faith – that is, truth and fidelity to promises and agreements." For the sigificance of the oath, see Cicero, *DO*, 1.39.40; 3.102; 3.99-102. At 3.29.104 Cicero circumscribes an oath as follows: "But in taking an oath it is our duty to consider not what one may have to fear in case of violation but wherein its obligation lies: an oath is an assurance backed by religious sanctity; and a solemn promise given, as before God as one's witness, is to be sacredly kept. For the question no longer concerns the wrath of the gods ... but the obligations of justice and good faith."

24   For Cicero's vehement opposition to tyranny, see *DO,* 2.7.23. The essence of his argument against tyranny is that rulers are chosen for the sake of justice (*DO,* 2.12.41). Referring to the practices of the tyrant Phalaris, Cicero uses the organic metaphor of the amputation of a limb in order to save the human body, to implicitly justify violent measures in combating tyranny: "(W)e have no ties of fellowship with a tyrant, but rather the bitterest feud; and it is not opposed to nature to rob, if one can, a person whom it is morally right to kill; - nay, all that pestilent and abominable race should be exterminated from human society". Cicero then applies the metaphor of the amputation of a limb threatening the human being's well-being, for as certain members are amputated, if they show signs themselves of being bloodless and virtually lifeless and thus jeopardise the health of the other parts of the body, "so those fierce and savage monsters in human form should be cut of from what may be called the common body of humanity" (*DO,* 3.7.32).

25   The principle that private citizens may, under certain circumstances, be relieved of their duty to obey oath-breaking rulers, is contained in Cicero's statement to the effect that promises are not to be kept, if

keeping them is to prove harmful to those to whom the oath has been made (*DO,* 1.10.32).

26   It should be borne in mind that, to Cicero, justice is the highest virtue (*DO,* 1.17.56), and that nothing that lacks justice can be morally right (*DO,* 1.19.62).

27   *CR*, 16: 573: "Bestiae naturali inclinatione repellunt violentim, quia cuilibet naturae insita est a Deo appetitio conservandi sese: in homine autem [est inclinatio] ... ad depulsionem iniusta violentia."

28   *CR,* 16: 573: "testimonia de Deo, ostendentia discrimen inter iusta et iniusta".

29   "vim iniustam repellere licet vi ordinata, scilicet officio magistratus, cum eius auxilio uti potest, aut manu propria, si desit magistratus, ut si quis incidat in latrones". He adds: "Verum est igitur dictum, vim vi repellere natura concedit".

30   For the dating of this memorandum, see BW, 8, 289-299. Also note the comments in *LW*, 47: 8ff. This source is not taken up in the Weimar edition of Luther's *Works*, but the date of the text is wrongly reflected as being 1531 instead of 1530.

31   This treatise was probably composed in October 1530 and published in 1531. It went through five editions in the same year. However, in 1525, Heinrich Bullinger in his play *Lucretia and Brutus*, had voiced clear sentiments in favour of democratic rule based on the taking of the oath by rulers and subjects (see Raath & De Freitas, 2005: 24ff.).

32   At least five years earlier Cicero's account of the expulsion of Tarquinius Superbus who, when he had reached the summit of his insolence, was deprived of his rulership by the people, in his *De re Publica* (DRP, 2.26.47 and 27.49), had inspired Bullinger to justify the people's right to protect themselves and their goods against tyrannical assault on their goods and the unlawful use of force. At that stage, Luther and Melanchthon still voiced the traditional view that obedience on the part of subjects is an unconditional duty.

33   The duties of the civil rulers to maintain discipline in civil society, to keep the peace through making laws, as defined by Melanchthon, were reiterated by most of the other Reformers: "Magistratus est persona, Dei ordinatione electa, ut sit custos disciplinae et pacis, certis legibus, et puriat contumaces vi corporali" (*CR*, 13: 551).

34   For the implications of tyranny in Bullinger's thought and the right of resistance prior to the developments in Lutheranism from 1530, see Raath & De Freitas, 2005: 1-26, at 25.

War zeal, nationalism and unity in Christ: evangelical missions in Germany during World War I

Elmar Spohn[1] & Christof Sauer[2]
Department of Christian Spirituality, Church History and Missiology,
University of South Africa, Pretoria

Abstract

World War I brought unspeakable destitution to humankind. The question arises: Which ideals drove people to march so enthusiastically toward battle and death? Church history research has called attention to the role of theology and the church. World War I was not merely welcomed; rather, it was understood to be God's word and was vigorously glorified theologically. To date, however, the role played by the evangelical missions has not been addressed by church history research.

The historical evaluation of mission journals of important evangelical mission societies of that era demonstrated that the evangelical missions also welcomed the war and justified it, as did the other Protestants. They shared in the over-glorification of their own nation and the propounding of negative platitudes about the wartime enemy. They professed to uphold the unity of all evangelical Christians; nevertheless, irritations arose between German missionaries and their international partners.

Introduction

In light of the millions of dead and wounded and the unspeakable suffering during the wars of the 20th century, the question arises: What idealism motivated young men to march enthusiastically towards combat and death? As far as World War II and the situation in Germany were concerned, this question can be answered by pointing to the seductive power of National Socialism. With regard to World War I, however, this question is more difficult to answer. At that time there was neither a *Führer*, nor a party calling to war, yet many Germans blindly followed the overrated nationalism and religious war zeal. A sense of elation prevailed and this evoked a limitless willingness in the population to make sacrifices for the fatherland. All class distinctions and religious differences were abrogated at the outbreak of the war. An

overwhelming feeling of brotherhood was experienced (Besier 1984:17). The fear that enemies could surround Germany, as well as the sense of political and diplomatic stagnation, had disappeared. A decision had finally been taken and this was experienced as liberating. War was at hand and with it a hope for the solution of numerous social and political problems. Christian theology and the church played an inglorious role in this euphoric atmosphere. For example, war was transfigured to represent the mighty voice of God. By analogy with the theophanies of the Old Testament, God was now declared to show himself in gunfire and cannon thunder (Hammer 1971:94-113; Erdmann 1985:148-157). The heroic death for the fatherland was compared to Christ's death on the cross and the German nation was considered to be God's chosen people. Many theologians were not merely staunch nationalists, but also warmongers, who enthusiastically welcomed the war against "materialistic England, inflated by its own obscurity", "the irreverent and morally depraved France" and "land-hungry Russia". These stereotypes, which were repeated like prayer wheels by Catholics and Protestants alike, had a devastating effect on the credibility of Christian theology and churches.[3]

Church history research has called attention to this tragic time (Hammer 1971; Hoover 1989). The role that German Protestantism played during World War I was investigated especially intensively because German Protestant theologians and church leaders were exceptionally susceptible to nationalism and war zeal. However, according to Huber (1970:135, 215), a more differentiated analysis of the Protestantism of the time is called for, as there were also theologians and groups who developed approaches to overcome the war theology, which he considers worthwhile investigating today. This research thus heeds Huber's appeal in that it investigates evangelical missions as a particular group of Protestantism. Since church historical research has given little attention to evangelicalism[4] in general, the examination of this dark chapter is also just beginning.[5]

The evangelical missions (the interdenominational faith missions), which were rooted in the Holiness Movement of the 19th century, represented a new type in the mission movement at that time. They differed from the mainstream Protestant mission movement by, above all else, their striving to cooperate internationally as well as interdenominationally (Fiedler 1994:32-69). Although classical missions also had international contacts, especially with the International Missionary Council (IMC) later on, this powerful international opening of the evangelical missions was new (Fiedler 1994:129-135). The founding fathers of these new missions established their mission societies with the consciousness of belonging to a "community" larger than a particular confession or denomination, namely to the international movement of those with a kindred spirituality. In this manner, the strong criticism they encountered from the established churches and mis-

sionary societies could, from the onset, be borne with grace, because evangelicals believed that they belonged to a greater ecclesiological community. The unifying ecclesiological category was found in spiritual experiences, namely conversion, often followed by later sanctification or healing experiences. At international conferences, this spirituality was nurtured and propagated. Charismatic figures played an integrating role in holding the Holiness Movement together over national and denominational boundaries. One of these integrating figures was the Englishman Hudson Taylor, who was highly respected and esteemed, particularly in Germany. Taylor's appeal for the evangelisation of China is regarded as the origin of the evangelical mission movement in Germany. A number of these newly created evangelical mission societies willingly joined Taylor's China Inland Mission and subordinated themselves to his authority.[6] That was unique at the time. It is true that in the past, some missionaries had joined English missions and worked under English leadership. However, the affiliation of entire mission societies to an international mission was a new concept and could only be explained by the common spiritual experience and by setting aside denominational and national differences. A proper English–German network existed, in which the new spiritual impulses flowed primarily from England to Germany (Holthaus 2005:237-241). This was especially the case with the "faith principle", which was conceived in England, readily received by the German evangelical missions and spread throughout Germany (Franz 1993:1-64; Schnepper 2007). Without these stimuli from England, the German evangelical missions would never have come into being. They were especially thankful for the spiritual stimulation from the Anglo-Saxon regions and felt closely associated with British evangelicalism, at least until the outbreak of World War I. Owing to the war, irritations and tensions arose between German and British evangelicals, resulting from excessive patriotism and a martial war zeal, the influence of which could not be prevented from entering the circles of evangelical missions. The views of the representatives of these evangelical missions with regard to nationalism and war zeal, and whether any signs of a peace ethic could be observed in them, will be examined below.[7]

The rhetoric of war in evangelical missons

During the war years, it was not unusual – in either Germany or England – to insist on the inevitability of war. At the same time, popular opinion did not hesitate to discredit pacifism; only a few resisted this sentiment. The majority of evangelicals were also caught up in the war zeal. The question now arises whether the representatives of the evangelical missions also held these views. It should be remembered that World War I had a devastating effect on mission work. Communication with the mission fields was almost completely disrupted and, in addition, German missionary efforts came to a standstill in

British colonies. The war also had negative effects on other aspects of missionary work; the recruitment of missionary workers became increasingly difficult as young men signed up in droves for voluntary duty on the military front instead for missionary service. World War I was a catastrophe for missions, unsurpassed in the earlier history of missions (Pierard 1996:362). It could therefore be assumed that the leaders of evangelical missions would have reached negative conclusions about the war. But that was not the case. Although they complained about the obstacles that the war posed for the missions, the war itself was not questioned.

The editor of the evangelical *Pilgrim Mission St. Chrischona* considered the war to be inevitable on theological grounds (Glaubensbote 1914:102). According to his view, while this war was not analogous to the Old Testament wars in which Israel had fought against gentiles, war was now led against Christian nations, and a Christian in this unredeemed world nevertheless had the duty to participate in the war (Glaubensbote 1914:102-103). Just as court officials had to enforce the decision of the judge, so a soldier had to fulfil his duty to secular authorities and defend his fatherland militarily (Glaubensbote 1914:103). He should go to war without fear, since fear was caused by a lack of trust in God and an impure conscience. The German and Austrian soldier should be convinced of the "pureness of the sword", for their Kaiser certainly had "not entered this war for territorial gains or mean revenge, but rather due to an irrefutable necessity to defend the fatherland". The phrase "God with us" was engraved onto the belt buckle of the German soldier; the Christian soldier was to carry the same phrase in his heart (Glaubensbote 1914:104). The editor of the *Glaubensbote* did not answer the question on whose side God fought in the war, and whether only for the Christian German soldier or to the same degree for the Christian French or the English soldier; he sensed how grotesque such an assumption would have been. As though God would side with one or the other bellicose nation! He thus added a warning to his explanation, saying that in World War I God's judgement was intended for the purification and the awakening of the nation (Glaubensbote 1914:104).

The anonymous author of a lead article of the *Liebenzeller Mission* also interpreted the war as the rod of God for the moral improvement of his people (Chinas Millionen 1915:77). However, according to this author, the majority of Germans would not grasp this. God had nevertheless shown his grace in that he had, at the appropriate time, provided the German people with men who could wield their swords in a manner pleasing to God. For example, he made mention of some high-ranking German military officers, such as Field Marshal Paul von Hindenburg (1847-1934), who gave God the honour after battles were won, and compared him to a shining light and the saviour of Europe (Chinas Millionen 1915:77).

A further thought, which was meant to justify the war, was the assumption that the gospel could be spread in the Allied (Engler 1914d:130) and conquered countries (Engler 1915:27). An example mentioned repeatedly was Turkey (Chinas Millionen 1915:80), because the impression existed that the Turks, as allies of Germany, would open themselves up to the gospel. Exactly the opposite occurred. The Turks began to deport and murder the Christian populations, especially the Armenians (Baumann 2007:74-85). But since Germany needed the Turks as allies, not too much political pressure was exerted on them. Therefore the protest of the evangelical missions against the genocide of the Armenians was rather muted (Chinas Millionen 1915:80).

For the leader of the German China-Alliance-Mission, Karl Engler[8] (1914e:145), the war was primarily a defensive against the "treacherous, numerous and mighty" enemies of the German Reich. He therefore had no qualms about offering prayers for the victories of the German army. He also saw positive aspects of the war, one being that the war had offered a chance for spiritual repentance (Engler 1914e:145-147). Major General Georg von Viebahn, a person highly regarded in evangelical circles, also concurred with this interpretation in the journal of the Neukirchener Mission. According to Von Viebahn (1914:386), God spoke through the war to the German people; the war was a call to repentance and a turning away from sin, infidelity and immorality. This close relation between war and devout morals can also be observed in an essay by Carl Polnick (1915:8), the founder of the German China-Alliance-Mission, when he complained that, in spite of the "earnest language of God, by which thousands were killed daily in the thunder of howitzers, in the crashing of bombs", the theatres and concerts were still attended. This thought found common consensus in the Catholic and the Protestant theology, as well as in evangelical circles. This view was based on the theological conviction that the course of history is predetermined. There was no perception of human responsibility for the course of history – war or peace – therefore, it was not considered to be under man's control whether war broke out or not; it was under God's control. In 1919 Engler (1914e:45) still held the view that the causes of war were firmly grounded "in the depths of God's judgment, in the mysterious connection of his plans with the peoples of the world". Therefore peace was not viewed as a result of human planning and efforts, but rather as a consequence of the moral reform of humankind (Misalla 1968:127-129).

But there were other voices in the circles of the evangelical missions that could not reconcile the bearing of arms with their Christian belief. Nevertheless, the leaders of the evangelical missions argued against this pacifist conviction. Karl Engler (1918:171) and the editor of the *Glaubens-bote* (1914:103) insisted on Luther's doctrine of the two kingdoms, without mentioning this by name. According to this doctrine, Christians may neither

inflict suffering on any other person nor fight evil with evil. The use of weapons in a defensive war, however, should be judged entirely differently. In war, an individual (including a Christian) served the authorities in defence of the fatherland and not as a private person with personal interests. The authorities – according to Engler – did not merely have the right, but also the duty to defend their country and people against enemy attacks. Engler insisted, as did many evangelicals before and after him, that Rom 13:1-7 required a Christian to obey the authorities that have been appointed by God. Engler (1918:171) also cited other biblical examples, such as the Old Testament wars, commanded by Joshua, Gideon and David, which showed that the biblical teachings did not fundamentally prohibit the use of weapons. In addition, Engler mentioned that Jesus and his disciples also never said a word against the soldier status**.** Consequently – according to Engler (1918:171) – war was compatible with the will of God and Christians could not refuse to bear arms.

This argument was based on the conviction that this war was forced on Germany from outside. Engler and the other evangelical authors accordingly assumed that Germany was not engaged in an aggressive, but rather a defensive war (Bender 1915:12). Historically, this is only partly true. There is no doubt that Germany started the military aggression: In a swift action, the German army marched into neutral Belgium and attacked France from a strategically advantageous position (Erdmann 1985:86-90). Germany regarded this as a preventive measure, since war seemed unavoidable and only a question of time. Confronted by the militarily superior Entente, Germany and the Axis needed the advantage of entering the war with a surprise attack. Viewed in this light, therefore, Germany rationalised that no aggressive war was being waged.

Even at this early stage of the war, this action led to the discussion of war-guilt. The rationale for this action was the conviction that each nation had the God-given right to defend itself. In his famous speech at the beginning of the war, the German Kaiser Wilhelm II repeatedly stated that Germany was a peace-loving nation on whom war was forced against its will (Besier 1984:11). Furthermore, the representatives of the evangelical missions often spoke about peace. According to Eduard Zantop's[9] interpretation, peace was part of the relationship between God and man (1915a:118; 1915b:70). Especially during the horrors of war, "hearts mourning, grieving, and yearning for comfort" were searching for peace. He continued by saying that peace would occur if and when people were willing to surrender themselves to God's punishment (Zantop 1915a:118).

In summary, it can be said that the representatives of the evangelical missions did not uphold a specially refined war theology. However, they perceived war as a divine turning point and justified it theologically. At the same time, they referred to the traditional concepts of Luther's doctrine of the

two kingdoms, to Old Testament examples and, naturally, to the key passage in Romans 13, in which Paul – according to the representatives of the evangelical missions – demands unconditional obedience under every authority. In addition, a deterministic theology, which interpreted war as God's instrument for moral improvement or spiritual awakening of the population, was adhered to. Eventually the biblical calls to peace were interpreted as a mystical heartfelt peace, which had no influence on politics. These concepts made the evangelical mission leaders blind to the real effects of war. A moral and spiritual renewal did not occur. Rather, the opposite took place. The war caused brutalisation and a spiritual dulling. Nevertheless, silence was maintained about the unspeakable horrors of war. The wretched destitution, the physical and psychological wounds soldiers sustained and the suffering of the people should have moved the representatives of the evangelical missions to reflection about the war that they had sanctified. But that was not the case. Instead, they faithfully held onto some of these theories, even until after the war (Engler 1919:33ff). They did not want to acknowledge that, during the war, they had taken on board the heavy burden of guilt. It thus happened that they later agreed with the aggressive war policies of the National Socialists – they did not even have the moral strength to protest against the criminal Nazi regime.[10]

A survey of the publications of the evangelical missions actually revealed that, when put in perspective, positive statements regarding war and nationalism did not take up any significant space in those publications. While at the onset of the war, a few articles had paid attention to political and military events, this hardly occurred later. Actually, in the journal of the Neukirchener Mission, political commentaries were rigorously avoided.

The rift between the German and the English evangelicals

The German evangelical missions that joined the China Inland Mission were answerable to the international leadership in Shanghai, which was headed by the British.[11] Although each mission received a certain amount of autonomy and its own field of work, cooperation with international colleagues was unavoidable in practice. During the initial years, such cooperation was not a problem; in fact, it was welcomed. Later, during the years following the turn of the century, and as nationalism in Germany received new impetus, cooperation became ever more difficult and calls for more independence became more vocal. As a result, the evangelical missions achieved more autonomy, yet they remained with the China Inland Mission (Franz 1993:110-111).

When World War I broke out, the relationship with the China Inland Mission was severely tested. As the Holiness Movement had lost its integrative power, national sentiment suddenly reigned. The atmosphere in the mission journals became more biting, for example the editor of the *Liebenzeller*

Mission tended towards nationalistic ideas in a lead article. He declared that it was high time that German Christianity assume its share of responsibility for the nations of the world. In contrast to the more superficial and businesslike manner of English Christianity, he claimed that German Christianity had greater emotional depth and a more thorough understanding of divine truths. He alleged that English missionary work acted according to the motto "Go into the world and teach the nations English!" Therefore, he urged German Christians not to make the same mistake and attempt to bring German culture and influence to the nations (Chinas Millionen 1915:82). This view reflected the tradition of the faith missions, which regarded colonial and imperialistic movements critically. According to Chinas Millionen (1915:81), Christianity was global and had brought about unique contextual manifestations among the various peoples.

Significant animosity developed between English and German Christians following an open appeal, on 4 September 1914, in which renowned German theologians and heads of mission societies criticised English politics. As a result of this, British church leaders and heads of mission societies refuted this criticism and blamed Germany for the outbreak of the war (Ludwig 2004:12; Besier 1984:11-27, 40-45). The German China-Alliance-Mission was, to some extent, also drawn into these disputes. The British director of the China Inland Mission, Walter B. Sloan, wrote to the head of the German China-Alliance-Mission and contended that the China Inland Mission had to side with the English government. The leaders of the German China-Alliance-Mission did not understand this (Engler 1914c:180). Karl Engler (1914a:162) was of the opinion that the time had come to cleanse the Germans of the spiritual influences of English Christianity, since by copying English manners, the German Salvation Army, the fellowship movement and the German mission societies had suffered far-reaching damage. When, owing to the general anti-British sentiment, voices arose in circles close to the German China-Alliance-Mission, claiming that English Christians could no longer be considered "children of God" (Engler 1914b:179-180), the leaders of the German China-Alliance-Mission were forced to express their views on the matter. Engler (1914b:179-180) and Eduard Zantop (1915:73-75) agreed that they could not deny the English Christians their belief in God. However, Engler was somewhat confused by the fact that there were "dedicated children of God" who sided with the English government. Although he attempted to understand the English Christians (1914c:180-183), he fell victim to the nationalistic ideas of the time. Engler maintained that this regrettable statement by the English Christians could only be explained if one understood the peculiarity of the English, who made no effort to understand other people or to read foreign reports. Likewise, the English understood the "German militarism" – and especially the German fleet – to be aggressive provocation and not a legitimate means by which Germany was defending

itself. Furthermore, according to Engler, the English Christians were given biased information by their government, in terms of which Germany was blamed for the outbreak of the war, having failed to honour Belgium's neutrality. However, Engler stated this was incorrect, since Belgium had already relinquished its neutrality. On the basis of such misinformation by the British government, Engler "excused" English believers for trusting the official publications of their government.[12]

Although Zantop no longer actively lead the German China-Alliance-Mission, he saw it as his responsibility to come out against the fanaticism of the German Nationalists. During the heyday of the Holiness Movement, it was hardly necessary to justify the "brotherhood" of believers across national and confessional boundaries, but this changed at the beginning of World War I. The shared experiences of conversion, sanctification and healing, which had proved to be an integrative power, seemed to lose their effect when war broke out. In addition, the charismatic leading lights of the Holiness Movement had all died by then. As unifying figures, they had previously held the movement together over national and confessional boundaries (Franz 1993:111). Zantop therefore had to rely on other arguments; the former emotion-based notion of belonging that had characterised the Holiness Movement was replaced with a thorough biblical-theological rationale. Zantop referred to the biblical texts 1 Pet 3:9; Col 3:11; Eph 1:15 and Ps 133 to emphasise the unity of everyone who was "born from God". Accordingly, whoever was "born again" belonged to the "church of God"; the nationality of the individual thus played a secondary role. Furthermore, Zantop modified the verse in Gal 3:28 in order to clarify the unity in Christ against the background of historical, political and social tensions (Zantop 1915:75): "There is not Japanese, Chinese, English, French, Russian, Austrian, German, baron or servant, but rather all are in Christ. All recognise that they are one in Christ." Zantop maintained that it was true that the believer had a duty towards his fatherland; yet, even in times of war, he should show love towards his fellow Christians. After all, duties towards the fatherland were not long-lasting; these were merely earthly ties. Much more important were the heavenly bonds, the loyalty towards the heavenly kingdom (Zantop 1915:74). Finally, he raised the argument that Satan enjoys sowing discord amongst the "children of God" (Zantop 1915:74). In a Christmas meditation on Luke 2:14, Zantop had already made it clear that, since God had made peace with humankind, they in turn should learn to live in peace with one another. Through the belief in the peacemaker Jesus Christ, it should be possible for the worldwide church – as a sign of the fellowship of peace – to love and help one another in spite of the war (Zantop 1914:178-179). Zantop's style may have been ruled by a basic patriotic tenor, yet his was a voice imbued with biblical truths, which were diametrically opposed to the spirit of that time.

Looking at the situation from the British perspective, it is interesting to note that the leaders of the China Inland Mission showed a high degree of loyalty towards the German missions with whom they were linked. The mission leaders in China greatly supported the German missionaries on the mission fields. When in 1915, the authorities required the China Inland Mission to terminate the membership of its affiliated German missions, the General Director, Dixon Edward Hoste – despite the threat of imprisonment – gave his support for the retention of these missions within the alliance of the China Inland Mission (Chinas Millionen 1949:22). When the news of England's entry into World War I reached the missionaries in China, the missionaries assured each other that they wanted to remain "brothers in the Lord." As a show of consideration for the German missionaries, English missionaries took down their flag in the dining rooms – this indicated their wish not to take the war and nationalism to the mission field (Chinas Millionen 1949:22). The credibility of Christian missions had suffered enough damage, since the Christian nations Germany and England fought a bitter war. For that reason, evangelical Christians wanted to set an example and bear a better witness, which was apparently achieved.

Zeitgeist and hermeneutics in evangelical missions

The evangelical missions always attempted to design their publications attractively for their reading public and to include relevant articles; for this reason, social trends were taken into consideration and adopted in the style and content.[13] The most significant social trends in Germany at that time were nationalism and militarism. These trends were addressed as a way of relating to the readers' everyday life, but also as a way of defending such trends theologically. In fact, nationalism and militarism could only be pursued if a biblical rationale could be proved. This had an effect on the hermeneutics of evangelicals. The spirit of the times (*Zeitgeist*) became the hermeneutic key, rather than only a measure against which the actuality and social relevance of the Christian gospel and teaching were measured. At least the evangelicals did not get completely swept up – as did some notable voices of German Protestantism – into heretical teaching about war and nation. But they were, with a few exceptions, incapable of being critical about the war and nationalism, despite their international friends and contacts. Rather than challenging militarism and nationalism, the evangelicals justified the war theologically and overemphasised the duties of a Christian in respect of his or her fatherland. Instead of denouncing the sinful and inhuman character of the war, it was praised as a pedagogic instrument of God for the moral improvement of the people. In the hermeneutic coordinate system of the evangelical missions, a preferential option was made for family and sexual ethics, while there was a determined exclusion of the social and

peace-ethical realms. Nothing was said – perhaps because of official censure (Deist 1991:153-163) – about the bellicose invasion of neutral Belgium, about the suffering of the Armenian people, or about the deployment of chemical warfare. Since conservative convictions and loyalty to the Kaiser were at an all-time high in Germany – which unfortunately went hand in hand with nationalism, militarism and unconditional obedience to authorities – not even a rudimentary ethic of peace could develop. With an astounding one-sidedness, this conservatism was 'sold' to the faithful as biblical teachings.[14] Granted, the evangelical missions did some good in that they neither represented a nationalist chauvinism, which elevated the German Reich to the people of God, nor propagated martial war theology, which attempted to compare the sacrifices of war to the sacrifice of Jesus. They emphasised the unity of the worldwide church of Jesus Christ and took a firm line against German imperialism. Likewise, the theory was advanced that one should respond to a wartime enemy, not with hate, but rather with love. Whatever this was meant to mean in practice on the battlefield, where soldiers stood against each other in close combat, was not explained. In this instance, the evangelical missions could at least have made an appeal to treat the opponent with respect and the wounded and prisoners decently and humanely. In summary, it can be said that the conservative spirit of the times strongly influenced the hermeneutics of the evangelical missions. These circumstances made the representatives of these missions blind to the dangers of nationalism and war zeal, as well as to the politically immoral behaviour of Germany.

Works consulted

Baumann, A 2007. *Der Orient für Christus: Johannes Lepsius – Biographie und Missiologie.* Basel: Brunnen.

Bender, J 1915. Aus Briefen von unseren Arbeitsfeldern. *China-Bote* 23(2), 11-13.

Besier, G 1984. *Die protestantischen Kirchen Europas im Ersten Weltkrieg. Ein Quellen- und Arbeitsbuch.* Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht.

Chinas Millionen: 50 Jahre Liebenzeller Mission 1899-1949. 1949. Bad Liebenzell: Buchhandlung der Liebenzeller Mission.

Chinas Millionen 1915. Jahresbericht der Liebenzeller Mission für das Jahr 1915. *Chinas Millionen* 17, 75-83.

Deist, W 1991. Zensur und Propaganda in Deutschland während des Ersten Weltkriegs, in Deist, W (ed.), *Militär, Staat und Gesellschaft: Studien zur preußisch-deutschen Militärgeschichte*, 153-163. München: Oldenbourg.

Engler, K 1914a. Deutsche und englische Gotteskinder. *China-Bote* 22, 162-164.

Engler, K 1914b. Deutsche und englische Gotteskinder. *China-Bote* 22, 179-180.

Engler, K 1914c. Die englischen Brüder und wir. *China-Bote* 22, 180-183.

Engler, K 1914d. Des Glaubens Bewährung in Not. *China-Bote* 22, 131.

Engler, K 1914e. Was uns heute Not tut. *China-Bote* 22, 145-147.

Engler, K (ed.) 1915. *Das Evangelium in China: Illustrierter Jahresbericht der deutschen China-Allianz-Mission vom Jahre 1914*. Barmen: Verlag der Buchhandlung der deutschen China-Allianz-Mission.

Engler, K 1916. Zeichen der Zeit. *China-Bote* 23, 11-12.

Engler, K 1918. Darf der Gläubige die Waffe gebrauchen? *Evangelisches Allianzblatt* 28, 171-172.

Engler, K 1919. Die Ursachen unseres Zusammenbruchs. *Der Gärtner* 9/10; 11/12, 36f.; 44f.

Erdmann, K D 1985. *Der Erste Weltkrieg*. 5th edition. München: Deutscher Taschenbuchverlag. (Gebhardt Handbuch der deutschen Geschichte; vol. 18.)

Fiedler, K 1994. *The story of faith missions*. Oxford: Regnum.

Franz, A 1993. *Mission ohne Grenzen: Hudson Taylor und die deutschsprachigen Glaubensmissionen*. Giessen/Basel: Brunnen.

Glaubensbote 1914. Kriegsgesinnung. *Der Glaubensbote* 37, 102-104.

Hammer, K 1971. *Deutsche Kriegstheologie (1817-1918)*. München: Kösel.

Holthaus, S 2005. *Heil-Heilung-Heiligung: Die Geschichte der deutschen Heiligungs- und Evangelisationsbewegung (1874–1909)*. Giessen: Brunnen.

Hoover, A J 1989. *God, Germany and Britain in the Great War: a study in clerical nationalism*. New York: Praeger.

Huber, W 1970. Evangelische Theologie und Kirche beim Ausbruch des Ersten Weltkrieges, in Huber, W (ed): *Historische Beiträge zur Friedensforschung*, 134-215. Stuttgart: Ernst Klett. Ludwig, F 2004. Der Erste Weltkrieg als Einschnitt in die Kirchen- und Missionsgeschichte. *Berliner Beiträge zur Missionsgeschichte* 4, 1-32.

Misalla, H 1968. *"Gott mit uns!" Die deutsche katholische Kriegspredigt 1914-1918*. München: Kösel.

Mojon, H 1919. Weltdemokratie und Weltfrieden im Lichte der Wiederkunft Christi. *Der Glaubensbote* 42(2), 15-17.

Ohlemacher, J 2000. Gemeinschaftschristentum in Deutschland im 19. und 20. Jahrhundert, in Gäbler, U (ed.), *Der Pietismus im neunzehnten und zwanzigsten Jahrhundert*, vol. 3, 393-450. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht.

Pierard, R 1996. World War I, the Western Allies, and German Protestant Missions, in van der Heyden, U & Liebau, H (eds), *Missionsgeschichte, Kirchengeschichte, Weltgeschichte,* 361-372. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner.

Polnick, C 1915. Gabenverzeichnis vom Dezember 1914. *China-Bote* 23(1), 7-8.

Sauer, C 2005. *Reaching the unreached Sudan belt: Guinness, Kumm and the Sudan-Pionier-Mission*. Nürnberg: VTR.

Schnepper, E A 2007. *Mission und Geld: Glaubensprinzip und Spendengewinnung der deutschen Glaubensmissionen: Genese, Struktur und Legitimation*. Wuppertal: Brockhaus.

Spohn, E 2009. "Wir haben mehr oder weniger geschwiegen dazu." Verwicklungen – Ambivalenzen – Opportunismus: Die Allianz-China-Mission in der NS-Zeit. *Monatsheft für Evangelische Kirchengeschichte des Rheinlandes* 58, 205-217.

Von Viebahn, G 1914. O Land, Land, Land, höre des Herrn Wort! *Der Missions- und Heidenbote* 36(12), 386.

Zantop, E 1914. Dennoch "Friede auf Erden". *China-Bote* 22, 178-179.

Zantop, E 1915. "Liebe zu allen Heiligen", auch im Weltkrieg. *China-Bote* 23, 73-75.

Zantop, E 1915a. Gottes Friedensgedanken. *Der Glaubensbote* 38(10), 117-118.

Zantop, E 1915b. Ein göttlicher Gnaden- und Friedensgruß. *Der Glaubensbote* 38(16), 69-71.

Endnotes

1   Corresponding author. Partly based on his MTh dissertation, The German Alliance Mission and the Federation of Free Evangelical Churches in Germany: The history of their relationship and its theological rationale, Unisa 2007. Email: MuESpohn@gmx.de.

2   Dr Christof Sauer, as the supervisor, had the idea for this article and finalised its English form. Email: Christof@Sauer-fam.de.

3   In the first two years after the war, 200 000 and 300 000 people left the church respectively (Hammer 1971:172).

4   In this essay, Christians of the Holiness Movement, Fellowship Movement, the interdenominational faith mission movement as well as Christians from Evangelical Alliance circles and free-churches are designated as evangelicals. The term "evangelical" did not exist at that time, since it only became popular in Germany during the 1970s, but it includes the whole spectrum of neo-pietist movements and groups that arose in the second half of the 19th century.

5   An exception is Ohlemacher's (2000) description of the attitude of the fellowship movement towards war. While he deals with one particular evangelical group only, the general mood seems to apply to the evangelical movement of the time at large.

6   The German China-Alliance-Mission joined in 1889, the Liebenzeller Mission in 1895 and the China branch of the Pilgrim Mission St. Chrischona in 1906. Smaller missions followed later.

7   The publications of the largest and best-known evangelical missions, namely those of the Pilgrim Mission St. Chrischona, the Liebenzeller Mission, the Neukirchener Mission and the German China-Alliance-Mission were evaluated. See Sauer (2005:168-170) for an overview of the origins and history of these missionary societies.

8   Karl Engler (1874-1923), a teacher, led the German China-Alliance-Mission from 1910 until his death.

9   Eduard Zantop (1865-1924), a representative of the Holiness Movement and Bible teacher, was mission inspector of the German China-Alliance-Mission (1903-1910) but remained active on the board until his death.

10   Research on the evangelical missions in Nazi times is still in its initial stages (see Spohn 2009).

11   Hudson Taylor was succeeded as leader by Dixon Edward Hoste in 1900 and by Frank Houghton in 1935.

12   Additional platitudes about the wartime enemies of Germany are found in Engler (1915:8).

13   Thus reports from the front were reproduced or propaganda was made for religious pamphlets with titles such as: "Through Blood and Iron", "God Speaks in the Storm of War", "With God for Kaiser and Kingdom!" In the publication *Chinas Millionen,* "mission reports" were renamed "war reports", possibly alluding to the spiritual battle (Eph 6:10-19).

14   For example, Mojon (1919) polemicised against modern developments such as democracy, voting rights for women and world peace efforts. Engler (1916) criticised social democracy and liberalism.

Towards a postcolonial Pentecostal historiography: ramblings from the south

Irvin G Chetty
Coordinator: Department of New Testament and Practical Theology,
Centre for Theology and Religion,
University of Fort Hare, Alice, Eastern Cape.

Abstract

This article focuses on contestations around the birth of Pentecostalism. Azusa Street Pentecostalism is very well documented therefore the bias was tilted in its favour. While this expression of Pentecostalism opened up new frontiers it also displayed some regrettable retreats around the issue of race relations. In stark contrast, both in South Africa and in Brazil, *inter alia*, societal concerns, inclusive of racial issues have been taken up by a new breed of Pentecostals. The current state of Pentecostalism reveals that the majority of Pentecostals live outside of the USA and Canada and that the rapidly emerging churches in the southern world are Pentecostal and indigenous, and function autonomously from Western Pentecostalism. Starting from the eighties, large independent Pentecostal churches have emerged in Africa. African Pentecostalism in South Africa is a relevant, flexible and rapidly increasing Christian formation. Unlike the dualistic tendencies of Western Christian approaches, the African Pentecostal worldview does not separate the physical from the spiritual or the individual from the social. Los Angeles cannot be viewed as the "Jerusalem" from which the "full gospel" imperialistically emanated centrifugally to the world. Other equally significant and simultaneous Pentecostal outpourings have been overlooked. Pentecostalism historiography may have to engage in perhaps one of the most important postcolonial ecclesiastical reconstructions yet.

Introduction

The Azusa Street Revivals are often regarded as the sole marker of the birth of the Pentecostal movement, but this view has been challenged (Pomerville 1985:48-49; Sepulveda 1992:86-87; Peterson 1996:3). This erroneous per-

ception had been largely created because of its most publicised revival resulting from the writings of Bartleman, the journalist, in particular. Despite this contestation most scholars concede that, since the beginning of the last century, Azusa Street Pentecostalism in the USA has been documented most extensively.

Three prominent figures emerge in the Azusa Street Revivals, namely, Bartleman, Parham and Seymour. Bartleman's hunger for a deeper spiritual experience despite his many hardships and humiliations clearly pervade all the records. The notion of Parham, as the "theological father of this movement", is intriguing. If anything, Parham's penchant for the "practical part of training" should challenge theological training institutions to develop a greater focus on experiential learning or work-based learning. His later links with the notorious Ku Klux Klan pose enigmatic and insurmountable challenges to any researcher of Pentecostalism. Frank Chikane (2006) states this challenge eloquently: "Can a person be a Christian, be baptised in the Holy Spirit, speak in tongues and practise racism?" In Parham's case can one kill in the name of "white supremacy"?

In South Africa, sound exegesis was similarly usurped by the ideological "eisegesis" of politically motivated clergy and, according to Loubser (1991: 321-337), an "Apartheid Bible" emerged. Fortunately, Christianity regained some modicum of respectability when apartheid was declared a heresy. The critical role of religious leaders, with their "vested political interests", has complicated the role of religion in South Africa. When DRC dominees, who spend six years, on average, studying theology, preached that apartheid had a biblical basis, the general membership would be invariably influenced to accept such a viewpoint as being biblically sound. In the USA, and also in South Africa, Biblical sanction was erroneously adduced for the "suspected but baseless perception of the inferiority of other races".

Seymour is generally viewed as the founder of the Azusa Street Revival. Against the backdrop of American racism, Seymour boldly asserted that "Jesus Christ was the only true liberator [of all people]" (Pomerville 1985:49).

How Seymour coped with the discrimination at Houston Bible School is indeed what perhaps made Seymour intriguing. The outsider's view of Azusa Street is interesting with its "weird babble, a new sect of fanatics, wild scenes, gurgle of wordless talk, disgraceful intermingling of races" (Pomerville 1985:50). This "disgraceful intermingling of races" lasted but for a brief period! Segregationists came to Azusa Street and took "their blessings" to their "whites only" church. Most observers of these revivals noted that crying, howling noises, running, jumping, shaking all over, spinning, falling and kicking were common occurrences. The practice of church services with no fixed time of closure is also interesting. These participants viewed them-

selves as "hungry after God" and therefore the duration of these meetings was deemed inconsequential.

Regrettable retreats and blazing new frontiers

Any student of early American Pentecostalism will have no difficulty in uncovering instances where Pentecostals failed, and ethical convictions, which were once strongly held and spontaneously practised, gradually fade into an abyss. Some scholars contend that the initial "intermingling of races" did not even last for more than a short while. When the whites returned to their congregations with the "blessing from Azusa Street" they reverted to their former practices of "whites only". Parham, the "theological father" of Azusa Street, eventually ended up with the Ku Klux Klan, an extreme right wing "whites only" sectarian movement notorious for lynching "negroes" and "negroe-lovers". So, by 1920, the interracial fellowship in Los Angeles totally gave way to the former separate, predominantly black or white Pentecostal congregations (Land 1993:20). The "honeymoon" period of non-racialism did not therefore even last for 14 years. Sadly, a very short-lived period indeed! In South Africa early spontaneous Pentecostal interracial fellowship also gave way to an explicit acceptance of apartheid (see Chetty & de Kock 1996:68-87).

In stark contrast, a new breed of Pentecostals, albeit small but steadily growing in strength, has surfaced in South Africa. The emergence of the Relevant Pentecostal Witness (RPW) gave expression to this movement. In South Africa the ecumenical churches responded to the apartheid government with the Kairos document, the Evangelicals with the Evangelical Witness in South Africa (EWISA), and the Pentecostals with the RPW (see Chetty & de Kock 1996:68-87).

In Brazil, Pentecostal churches have also been confronting poverty. According to Cecilia Loreto-Mariz (1994:129-146), Pentecostal churches facilitate a new identity and self-esteem for the poor who face poverty, marginalisation and insecurity. They initiate networks for the family, and assist in drug, alcoholism and prostitution rehabilitation. Similarly, a new breed of Pentecostal ministers in South Africa is also becoming more active in these ethical areas of social concern. So, unlike Pentecostals in the northern world, their siblings in the southern world have been readily drawn into the sociopolitical sphere to respond to societal concerns as an authentic form of Christian witness.

Pentecostalism as a renewalist movement?

Pentecostalism as a renewalist religious movement focused on a direct personal experience of God through the baptism of the Holy Spirit. The term

"Pentecostal" is derived from a Greek term denoting the Jewish Feast of Weeks. For Christians this festival focuses on the descent of the Holy Spirit upon the followers of Jesus Christ, as described in the second chapter of the book of Acts. Pentecostals view their movement as experiencing a similar kind of spiritual power. They also seek to replicate the worship styles, general practices and ethos that prevailed in the early church. Some Pentecostals, who use the terms "Apostolic" or "Full Gospel Church" to describe their denomination, reflect an ardent desire to recapture this early church tradition.

Pentecostalism is an overarching generic term that embraces a plethora of doctrinal and organisational positions. The Pentecostal movement is not led by any centralised structure, as most Pentecostals view themselves as part of larger Christian formations. A significant constituency deem themselves to be Protestants and others also embrace the tag, Evangelical. Yet others prefer the rubric Restorationist. Pentecostalism is doctrinally very close to the Charismatic Movement. From a historical perspective Pentecostalism has influenced the birth of the Charismatic Movement; some Pentecostals even use the two terms (Pentecostals and Charismatics) interchangeably. Pentecostals also display doctrinal variations with some formations revealing Trinitarian and others non-Trinitarian persuasions. Yet it would be safe to deem, at least doctrinally, that most Pentecostal formations identify with Evangelicalism. Furthermore, they focus on the reliability of the Bible and the need for change in an individual's life through faith in Jesus.

One of the cardinal classical Pentecostal doctrines is that of speaking in tongues as "evidence" of the presence and work of the Holy Spirit. Furthermore, in Classical Pentecostalism there is a pervasive emphasis on personal holiness, the place of works in the life of the believer, a "cooperating" with the Holy Spirit to "work out your salvation".

This theme of decolonising the historiography of Pentecostalism would be best advanced with a sketch of the current state of Pentecostalism.

The current state of Pentecostalism

David Barrett and Todd Johnson (1998:26) estimate that, in 1970, there were 74 million "Pentecostals/Charismatics" – 6% of the global Christian population. Almost 20 years later, in 1998, this figure had grown to 461 million or 25% of world Christianity. This figure accounted for more than the global numbers of "Protestants" and "Anglicans" together. Barrett and Johnson estimate that, based on current growth figures, the projections would place the numbers to 740 million or 28% of the world Christianity by 2025 (Barrett & Johnson 1998:26). This places the Pentecostal/Charismatic Movement as undoubtedly the fastest-growing Christian sector. Tinyeko Maluleke (2009)

calls this unprecedented religious phenomenon "the Pentecostalisation of Christianity".

As early as 1988, David Barrett (1988:810-830), apart from identi-fying 11 000 Pentecostal denominations, 3 000 independent Charismatics, and 800 Pentecostal denominations exclusive to the Third World, startled many outsiders of Pentecostalism by his earlier mentioned predictions. On a worldwide scale, only 29% are white and 71% are not white, and they are more urban than rural, more female than male, more children (under 18 years) than adults, more Third World (66%) than Western world (32%), more living in poverty (87%) than affluence (13%), more family-related than individualist.

Grant McClung (2000: 257-264) says that the "vitality of Christianity has moved from the east to the north, then to the west and now to the southern hemisphere". The term "southern world", mooted by McClung is preferred to "Third World". The newest rubric for an area wider than the "southern world" is "majority world". This includes Latin America, Africa and Asia (including Oceania) and is home to 75% of the Pentecostal/Charis-matic family. Seventy-five percent of the Church of God and 88% of the Assemblies of God global membership live outside the United States of America and Canada. Furthermore, the profile of the southernisation of Pentecostalism matches that of early American Pentecostalism. Robert Mapes Anderson's (1969:98-113) research on early Pentecostals identifies them as "generally, young, rural, impoverished, and poorly educated". McClung comments that North American Pentecostalism is "neither really at home with our past nor our future [but] in a chronological parenthesis", and calls for interdependence, grafting of resources, sharing of richness and contends that northern Pentecostals have something to learn from theology and ministry in daily life from the southern world.

Pentecostalism is currently predominantly a "so-called Third World" occurrence. While it has done reasonably well in North America, nonetheless fewer than 25% of its global membership is "white". This sector is also on the decline (Land 1993:21). Walter Hollenweger (1986:5-6) contends that the phenomenal increase of Pentecostalism in the southern world is not due to its doctrine, but to its roots in the spirituality of nineteeth century African-American slave religion. The dominant aspects of this spirituality are an oral liturgy, a narrative theology and witnessing, total involvement of the entire community in worship and service, visions and dreams in public worship, and a unique perception of the mind-body relationship revealed by healing through prayer.

Anderson (2000:25) states that the "thousands of AlCs in South Africa and throughout the continent are ʹpentecostalʹ movements in this sense, where the features outlined by Hollenweger have persisted, although their

form of Christianity is often quite different from Western forms of Pentecostalism".

Extravagant, architecturally designed churches, some holding in excess of ten thousand worshippers indicate the emerging Pentecostal middle class in sections of the southern world. In contrast to these megachurches, Pentecostals in the southern world are largely grassroots phenomena which are attractive to the disadvantaged and underprivileged in particular. The majority of the rapidly emerging churches in the southern world are Pentecostal and indigenous, and function autonomously from Western Pentecostalism.

While there is ongoing dispute in certain Christian quarters about the theological location of the thousands of African Initiated Churches (AICs), Anderson contends that from a phenomenological perspective the AICs can be classified as a "pentecostal" movement (Anderson 2000:24). He sees the AICs as having given birth to an expression of Christianity markedly disparate from Western Pentecostalism. He further avers that the essence of Pentecostalism has to do with its dynamism and flexibility to adapt and accommodate itself culturally within its varied context because of "freedom in the Spirit".

African Pentecostals

Starting from the eighties, large independent Pentecostal churches emerged in Africa. Some of these churches established loose networks or associations. Within the African continent they remain the most vociferous growing Christian formations, seeming to attract the younger, better-educated urban population. Unfortunately some of these churches have been under the spotlight for marketing a "prosperity gospel". This emanated from the shores of North America and peddles North American capitalism with a Christian veneer. However, we should refrain from falling into the trap of generalisations; while some churches may be guilty of such "malpractice" others have been busy with "reconstruction and innovations … in adapting to a radically different context" (Gifford 1992:8).

Without doubt, African Pentecostalism reflects the fastest growth point of religious formations in South Africa and also within the continent of Africa. Anderson (2000:26) contends that "Pentecostalism has been successfully incarnated into a uniquely African expression of Christianity because of its emphasis on spiritual experience and its remarkable ability to adapt to any cultural background in the world". The phenomenon of African Pentecostalism in South Africa is a relevant, flexible and rapidly increasing Christian formation.

Definition of the term "African Pentecostals"

Anderson (2000:27) uses the term "African Pentecostal" as an umbrella term for three types of churches [Italics mine]:

> … first, it included those churches originating in Western pentecostal mission initiatives [*such as AFM, Full Gospel Church of God (FGC)*].[1] Second, "new pentecostal churches" were not very different from Western pentecostal churches [*examples are Grace Bible Church and Praise Tabernacle Church*], but were initiated and governed by Africans. Third, the type which still forms the great majority of African pentecostal churches was the 'prophet-healing' churches ... In this book they are usually referred to as Zionist and Apostolic churches ...

Anderson however continues to add, "My premise continues to be that the vast majority of AICs are 'pentecostal' movements, even though they should not be regarded as 'Pentecostal' in the Western sense of the word without further qualification".

In this article the term "African Pentecostals" will embrace the second category, that is, *new churches not very different from Western Pentecostal churches but initiated and governed by Africans*.

The womb of global Pentecostalism was in the African slave religion of the United States and its birth lay in the black-led Azusa Street Revival in a Los Angeles slum. These humble beginnings, coupled with Pentecostalism's penchant for "freedom in the Spirit", make it essentially adaptable to various cultural and social situations. These factors also rendered the accommodation of its main beliefs in Africa easier. Harvey Cox (1996:259) succinctly notes that "the great strength of the pentecostal impulse" lies in "its power to combine, its aptitude for the language, the music, the cultural artifacts, the religious tropes … of the setting in which it lives …". The early manifestations of Pentecostalism derive from the religious matrix of the slaves in North America, who preserved their African religious cultural roots. Iain MacRobert (1988:9) contends that black Pentecostalism "cannot be fully understood without some consideration of their African origins and the conditions of slavery under which a black understanding of Christianity was formed". Therefore we can conclude that in black Pentecostalism we have a

---

[1]   The doctrine that speaking in tongues as the "initial evidence" of spirit baptism is one of the cardinal doctrines of both the Assemblies of God and the Full Gospel Church as classical Pentecostal denominations.

flexible reworking of African religious practices in a distinctly *Christian* context.

In the early history of American Pentecostalism, black spirituality also encouraged maximum participation through a community of interpretation, which included male and female participation. The dynamic milieu in which the early Pentecostals were nurtured was one where the newly sanctified life meant much more than abiding to a set of do's and don'ts (see Hollenweger 1972:399-412). A holistic view of body and mind is reflected by prayer for healing with the laying on of hands, and the role of worship through music and dance. In other words, the black roots of Pentecostalism emphasised the relational (orthopraxis) and expressive (orthopathy) aspects of faith. Land's (1993:15) orthopathy includes contemplation, adoration, praise and thanks-giving. Pentecostalism would do well to relish this spontaneous expression of affections as an indispensable core to Pentecostal spirituality.

Orthopraxis and orthopathy are two aspects of Land's integrated tri-partite Pentecostal spirituality of orthodoxy, orthopathy and orthopraxis. Steven J Land (1993:15), in his *Pentecostal spirituality, a passion for the kingdom,* has provided an excellent integrated model for holistic Pentecostal spirituality. Orthodoxy relates to the right praise-confession, orthopathy in-cludes right affections (inclusive of worship) and orthopraxy embraces right praxis. Holistic spirituality has to embrace cognition, affection (worship) and the behaviour which engenders a unified epistemology, metaphysics and ethics. Beliefs, affections (worship) and practice have to be integrated holis-tically.

A discussion of the concept of praxis might prove to be helpful here. Cheryl Bridges Johns (1993:20) views praxis as action and reflection viewed dialectically. In the late eighties, during the harshest years of apartheid, Chetty (1988:254-315) wrote extensively on the concept of praxis in his attempt to develop a contextual approach for theology and ministry in South Africa. Johns rightly contends that praxis is an insufficient means of knowing God and achieving human transformation. She therefore insightfully inte-grates praxis with *Yada* to overcome its inherent limitations (Johns 1993:38-41). *Yada* stresses the interrelationship between the knower and the known.

This keyword, praxis, is also vital to Lands' trilogy. If proper integra-tion is not achieved in one's spirituality then a false dichotomy arises. This is best illustrated by a theology student of the Dutch Reformed Church asking a visiting professor of theology which would be more easily excusable: to have a correct understanding of doctrine or to be poor in ethical relations with other race groups? This question was broached during the dark days of apart-heid, a system that was largely buttressed by the Dutch Reformed Church. This student did not grasp the essence of our faith in loving God *and* one's neighbour as oneself. The second part of this commandment of our Lord is not negotiable. They both go together and are interrelated. Sound theology, a

praxis orientation and a holistic spirituality are the three pillars of an integrated Pentecostal spirituality. The third pillar of orthopathy should not be neglected in our pursuit of a praxis orientation. This could use a great variety of psychomotor celebration in our affections (worship), that is, our contemplation, adoration, praise and thanksgiving. If Pentecostals were to apply Land's finely balanced framework for authentic spirituality, in his trilogy of orthodoxy, orthopathy (worship) and orthopraxis, they would undoubtedly have an even greater impact on society. Furthermore, such a holistic and integrated approach has carved an unprecedented respectability for Pentecostal scholarship.

MacRobert (1988:31) also observes that "the influence of African religious ecstaticism and spirit possession is evident not only among black Pentecostals but also in an attenuated form among the white Pentecostals … Elsewhere I have noted that aspects of ecstaticism and spirit possession have occurred in different permutations among 'Indian' Pentecostals in South Africa" (see Chetty 1995). These manifestations of Pentecostalism did not always meet with the approval of Western missionaries who favoured a more cerebral and less emotive expression of Pentecostal spirituality.

African Pentecostal spirituality is basically supra-rational. Unlike the dualistic tendencies of Western approaches, the African worldview does not separate the physical from the spiritual or the individual from the social. For African Pentecostal Christians the Spirit pervades all of life. The new African Pentecostals, with their nondualistic and holistic people's theology have met the real needs of people where the rubber meets the road. But who are these new African Pentecostals?

The New African Pentecostal Churches

According to Anderson (2000:43) these are the rapidly emerging Pentecostal or Charismatic churches with exclusively African leadership. Very significantly these churches are free of white control. Furthermore, this occurrence is a relatively recent happening and has only surfaced since the eighties. These churches have chosen a loose network arrangement and are in "fellowship" with, *inter alia*, the International Fellowship of Christian Churches (IFCC), formed in 1985, and the Christian Ministries Network (CMN), which began in 1990. It should be noted that the leadership of both the IFCC and CMN was largely white and was initially treated with a degree of misgiving by these new African Pentecostals. Few of these new churches founded their own African umbrella bodies, such as the Evangelical Minister's Association of South Africa (EMASA), located chiefly in the northern provinces, and the Light From Africa organisation (Lifa), focusing on the southern provinces. This may well have started a trend that others may follow in establishing such cooperative networks to avoid formally fraternising with (or even being

dominated by) a rather conservative white formation of Pentecostals or Charismatics.

Like many Pentecostal constituencies these churches focus on the power and the supernatural gifts of the Holy Spirit. While many are small independent churches, some are experiencing phenomenal growth. In South Africa in particular this is steadily becoming a national trend. There are a number of these African Pentecostal churches in Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal (such as Oasis Christian Fellowship in Mlazi)[2] and the Eastern Cape (such as Bisho Community Churches, which is led by a University of Fort Hare theology graduate, Smangaliso Matshobane) with a significantly large membership. The Grace Bible Church in Soweto under Mosa Sono had in excess of five thousand members in 1997. This church has branches in Ga-Rankuwa and Mmabatho, which function autonomously of the Soweto church. The Victory Fellowship group of churches was formed in the seventies; it was pioneered by Mandla Mapalala in Kwa-Thema and is devoid of a central structure. In 1992, in Soshanguve, this church experienced a split. According to Anderson (2000:43) as a result of perceived irregularities in the leadership structures the Soshanguve church seceded from Mapalala and assumed the name "Praise Tabernacle Church". The Lifa churches in the Transkei are lead by David Mniki and Joseph Kgobo and have an association with large "so-called" coloured churches from the Western Cape and Bloem-fontein. The African Gospel Church is difficult to locate, but it appears to be like the Pentecostal mission churches. IN 1947, this church was led by Job Chiliza followed by his son William. This church was a split from the FGC and the Pentecostal Holiness Churches, and must be one of the oldest churches of its type.

This category of new African Pentecostals, while it is a fast-increasing one, reflects a powerful Western influence in its liturgy and leadership patterns. Popular North American evangelists and "prosperity preachers", for example Kenneth Hagin, Kenneth Copeland and Benny Hinn, are recommended through the marketing of their books, and audio and video cassettes (Anderson 1987:72-83). These churches have a similar ethos as far as their teaching and practices are concerned as the Pentecostal mission churches.

The church government of these African Pentecostal churches differs, however, by being completely African black and reflects considerable local independence unlike the Pentecostal mission churches. Is this an alternative to the "evils" of "denominationalism" and the legalism of the older Pente-

---

2   These insights of the Oasis Christian Fellowship in Mlazi, KwaZulu-Natal, Bisho Community Church in the Eastern Cape and the Bethesda group of churches are the results of observations and unstructured or interviews with the respective leadership.

costal churches? The congregations are led by charismatic, younger, educated men (not necessarily in theology) with exceptional preaching and leadership qualities. This cadre of leadership seems to attract a membership of younger, prosperous and educated families unlike those in the Pentecostal mission churches. These congregations also have a sizeable number of professionals. In common with their Pentecostal mission church counterparts, these members speak of "salvation", are baptised (usually by single immersion), "speak in tongues" and pray regularly for healing (Anderson 2000:44).

It should be noted that these African Pentecostal churches are also averse to traditional African religious practices, alcohol and tobacco, the use of symbolic objects in healing and the wearing of uniforms. Initially these new Pentecostal churches gathered in school classrooms, halls, cinemas and tents. These churches subsequently obtained sites and established proper buildings for their ministries. In KwaZulu-Natal, the Oasis Christian Fellowship has a huge church building in a strategic position in Mlazi. Bisho Community Church, although it has independent "branches" throughout the country, currently occupies a rented venue. It is, however, in the process of making a bid for the "disused" Amatole Casino Complex. Steadily, an increasing number of these new African Pentecostal churches are erecting larger functional buildings throughout our country.

This article has focused on the new African Pentecostals in a rather sketchy manner. More detailed research is warranted that should also embrace Pentecostals among the other communities and the racially integrated urban expressions of Pentecostalism which are rapidly dotting our cities and towns in South Africa. Let us return to the contestations around the beginnings of Pentecostalism.

Contested origins

Pomerville (1985:48-49), Peterson (1996:3) and Sepulveda (1992:86-87) regard as erroneous the idea that all Pentecostal movements can trace their lineage to Seymour's Azusa Street mission or to Parham's initiative. Asamoah-Gyadu (2002:1, 4-33) identifies with this view in asserting that the unique origins of other equally significant and simultaneous Pentecostal outpourings have been overlooked. Furthermore, Anderson, Hollenweger and others remind us of the oral African-American origins of the Azusa Street Pentecostalism (Anderson 1999:105). McClung contends that when Los Angeles is assumed to be the "Jerusalem" from which the new retrieved "full gospel" emanates centrifugally to all the ends of the earth, then the truth is manipulated and smacks of imperialism (McClung 1999:11, 49). Anderson says that there were many "Jerusalems": Pyongyang (Korea), Beijing (China), Poona (India), Wakkerstroom (South Africa), Lagos (Nigeria), Valparaiso (Chile), Belem (Brazil), Oslo (Norway) and Sunderland

(England), among other centres (1999:120). Everett Wilson has correctly highlighted the fact that Pentecostalism has had many beginnings and there are many "Pentecostalisms" (1999:107). The significance of Azusa Street was in reminding North American Pentecostals of their nonracial and ecumenical beginnings. Numerous black South African Pentecostals were influenced and Azusa Street missionaries also founded some Pentecostal churches. Tom Hezmalhalch and John G Lake were sent from Azusa Street and Zion City and kept Seymour informed. In 1908 they founded the first Pentecostal church in South Africa, the Apostolic Faith Mission (see Anderson 1999:105).

Towards a postcolonial historiography of Pentecostalism

Postcolonial studies embrace a variety of hermeneutical approaches typified by their political and ideological agendas. This textual politics includes both a hermeneutic of suspicion and a hermeneutic of retrieval. According to Punt (2004:139) "[p]ostcolonial studies interact with colonial history and its aftermath(s), where a history of repression and repudiation is foregrounded but, since they also deal with ʿexpose', restoration and transformation are part of the repertoire of a postcolonial overture. Postcolonial studies are … a particular strategy of reading, an attempt to point out what was missing in previous analyses, to rewrite and correct".

Pentecostalism historiography may have to engage in perhaps one of the most important postcolonial ecclesiastical reconstructions yet. Wilson's (1999:103-104, 106, 109) paper on Pentecostal historiography cautions against the futility of expecting "to find a homogeneous Pentecostal type at the beginning" or "to assume that the experience of the first set of Pentecostals provide a model for the future". He says that it is the ordinary people, those "who were not at all certain where they were going" who carried the movement through its various stages to make an impact. He further points out that the future of Pentecostalism lies not with the North Americans but with the autonomous churches in Africa (African Initiated Churches – AICs), Asia and Latin America, whose origins often predate those of the "classical Pentecostals" in the West. Most of Pentecostalism's amazing expansion in the twentieth century was not primarily by missionaries from North America and Western Europe to Africa, Asia and Latin America. It was rather the result of the spontaneous spread of the Pentecostal message by thousands of preachers and "lay-persons" who spanned the continents with a burning new message of the power of the Spirit, healing the sick, and casting out demons. The success of the Bethesda revivals in South Africa was in JF Rowlands mobilising them as a "lay-led" movement (see Chetty 1995:153; Pillay 1994).

An inclusive postcolonial composite of Pentecostalism remains to be adequately sketched. The work of David B Barrett, Stanley M Burgess and Gary B McGee should be extended, if not juxtaposed, with scholars from the majority world. Perhaps Pentecostals *of the South* should begin to write our history, even if it takes the form of *ramblings from the south*.

Works consulted

Anderson, A 1987.   The prosperity message in the eschatology of some new charismatic churches. *Missionalia* 15(2).

Anderson, A 1999. Dangerous memories for South African Pentecostals, Anderson, Allan & Hollenweger, Walter J (eds.), in *Pentecostals after a century: global perspectives on a movement in transition.* Sheffield: Sheffield Academic.

Anderson, A 2000. *Zion and Pentecost, the spirituality and experience of Pentecostal and Zionist/Apostolic Churches in South Africa.* Pretoria: University of South Africa Press.

Anderson, R M 1969. *Vision of the disinherited: the making of American Pentecostalism.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Asamoah-Gyadu, J K 2002. Pentecostalism in context. *African Journal of Pentecostal Studies*, December (1).

Barrett, D B & Johnson T M 1998. Annual statistical table on global mission: 1998. *International Bulletin of Missionary Research* 22(1).

Barrett, D B 1988.   Statistics, global. *Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements.* Stanley M. Burgess and Gary B. McGee (eds.). Grand Rapids: Zondervan.

Burgess, S M 2005. *Encyclopedia of Pentecostal and Charismatic Christianity.* USA: Routledge.

Chetty, I G 1988. Towards a praxis model for the ministry of the church: a South African perspective. Doctoral thesis, Fuller Theological Seminary.

Chetty, I G 1995. The making of an indigenous clergy within the Indian Community: the case of the Bethesda Churches, in Denis, Philippe (ed.), *The making of indigenous clergy in Southern Africa.* Pietermaritzburg: Cluster Publications.

Chetty, I G & De Kock, W 1996. South   African   Pentecostals   and Ecumenism. *Studia Historiae Ecclesiasticae*: *Journal of the Church History Society of Southern Africa.* (22).

Chetty, I G 2003. Holiness heritage and Pentecostal ethics, in Stone, H Lynn (ed.), *International Pentecostal Symposium.* Cleveland, Tennessee: Church of God Division of Education.

Chikane, Frank 2006. The Pentecostal and Charismatic heritage. A paper presented at the Azusa Street Centennial Celebrations Seminar. Naledi AFM Church, Soweto, South Africa. 1 April 2006.

Cox, H 1996. *Fire from heaven: the rise of Pentecostal spirituality and the reshaping of religion in the twenty-first century.* London: Cassell.

Dayton, D W 1981. *Theological roots of Pentecostalism.* Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan/Asbury.

De Wet, C R 1989. The Apostolic Faith Mission in Africa: 1908-1980. A case study in church growth in a segregated society. PhD thesis, University of Cape Town.

Gifford, P (ed.) 1992. *New dimensions in African Christianity.* Nairobi: All Africa Conference of Churches.

Hollenweger, W J 1972. *The Pentecostals.* Minneapolis: Augsburg.

Hollenweger, W J 1986. After twenty year's research on Pentecostalism. *International Review of Mission* LXXV.

Hollenweger, W J 1997. *Pentecostalism: origins and developments world-wide.* Peabody, Mass.: Hendrickson.

Johns, C B 1993. *Pentecostal formation: a pedagogy among the oppressed.* Sheffield: Sheffield Academic.

Johnson, T M 1998. Annual statistical table on global mission: 1998. *International Bulletin of Missionary Research* 22 (1).

Land, S J 1993. *Pentecostal spirituality: a passion for the kingdom.* Sheffield: Academic.

Loreto-Mariz, C 1994. *Coping with poverty: Pentecostals and Christian base communities in Brazil.* Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press.

Loubser, J A 1991. *A critical review of racial theology in South Africa: the Apartheid Bible.* USA: Edwin Mellen.

MacRobert, I 1988. *The black roots and white racism of early Pentecostalism in the USA.* Basingstoke: Macmillan.

Maluleke, T 2009. Black and African theologies in the 21st Century: stirring up the agenda. Joint Conference of Academic Societies in the Field of Religion & Theology. University of Stellenbosch. 26 June 2009.

McClung, L G (Jr.) 1999. "Try to get people saved": revisiting the paradigm of an urgent Pentecostal Missiology, in Dempster, Klaus & Petersen, *Globalization of Pentecostalism.* Sheffield: Sheffield Academic.

McClung, L G (Jr.) 2000. *Globalbeliever.com, connecting to God's work in your world Cleveland.* Tennessee: Pathway.

McClung, L G (Jr.) 2006. *Azusa Street and beyond: 100 years of commentary on the global Pentecostal/Charismatic Movement.* Gainesville, Florida: Bridge-Logos.

Peterson, D 1996. *Not by might nor by power: a Pentecostal theology of social concern in Latin America.* Oxford: Regnum.

Pillay, G J 1994. *Religion at the limits: Pentecostalism among Indian South Africans* Pretoria: University of South Africa.

Pomerville, P A 1985. *The third force in missions: a Pentecostal contribution to contemporary mission theology.* Peabody, Massachusetts: Hendrickson.

Punt, J 2004. Current debates on biblical hermeneutics in South Africa and the postcolonial matrix." *Religion and Theology*, 11(2).

Sepulveda, J 1992. Reflections on the Pentecostal contribution to the mission of the church in Latin America. *Journal of Pentecostal Theology,* October.

Wilson, E A 1999. They crossed the Red Sea, didn't they? Critical history and Pentecostal beginnings, in Dempster, Klaus & Petersen, *Globalization of Pentecostalism*. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic

Angenendt, Arnold 2009. *Geschichte der Religiosität im Mittelalter*, 4. xii + 986 pages. Darmstadt: Primus/Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft. ISBN 978-3-89678-655-5. Prince: Not known.

Reviewer: Professor Dr Christoph Stenschke, Forum Wiedenest, Bergneustadt, Germany and Department of New Testament, University of South Africa, Pretoria, South Africa.

The revised fourth edition of this standard study of religion and religiosity in the Middle Ages deserves brief mention (first edition in 1997). The author, one of the leading authorities on the Christianisation of Europe and the church in the Middle Ages, provides an exhaustive survey of medieval religion.

After a brief introduction, definitions and a survey of research (1-30), Angenendt describes the various epochs and movements of the Middle Ages (1-88). Part two provides an analysis of the divine powers and their role in medieval religious thought (God, Jesus Christ, the angels, the devil and Mary (89-166; is one page sufficient for Mary, who played a significant role in medieval theology and worship? And what about the Holy Spirit?). Under "Revelation and Doctrine" (167-202), Angenendt offers a relatively short treatment of the Bible (the history of interpretation and hermeneutical principles, including allegory and typology, monastic *lectio divina*, the *glossa ordinaria*, scholastic exegesis, popular bibles for the laity) and theology (including heresy, tolerance and inquisition). Part three covers the cosmos and humankind (space and time, the human being and the family, community and fellowship) in medieval religiosity (203-349), followed by a detailed examination of liturgy (351-515). Angenendt also discusses grace, sin and ethics (517-658), as well as dying, death and the afterlife (659-750). The volume closes with ninety pages of notes, a detailed list of sources, a bibliography, and indexes of persons and subjects (751-986).

The volume is exhaustive and comprehensive in its coverage of the church in the West. Its focus is, however, on theology – which is why, at times, it reads as an account of the history of dogma. Religious practice is a lesser concern. Some issues raised by more recent debates and concerns could have been treated in more detail (or at least in separate sections), such as Christianity and the church's relationship with, Judaism and Islam in the Middle Ages (for Jewish-Christian relations in the Middle Ages, see MH Jung, *Christen und Juden: Die Geschichte ihrer Beziehungen*; Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 2008, 69-130). To what extent were the crusades motivated by religious motives? How and why were they so intertwined with political motives? Angenendt does not discuss any of this. One also wants to know more of the religious motives and needs that led to Franciscan spirituality and lent support to movements such as the Waldenses, the Cathari and the Albigenses (the Albigenses are only briefly

referred to; the section on marginalised and persecuted Christians also seems to include the church's treatment of lepers and prostitutes, 610f). What of the various medieval plays based on biblical content and the lives of the saints and other religious traditions (briefly treated as "liturgisches Spiel")? Would the practice of pilgrimages (also related to the crusades) not have deserved a separate section of its own (rather than a few references in other contexts)? What impact did the tremendous spread of Christianity during the Middle Ages have on its theology and religiosity? However, Angenendt's approach is helpful in that he treats these issues in their larger theological contexts, even if that does mean, almost by definition, that he fails to treat them as issues in their own right.

A final remark: the detailed table of contents and indices make this book particularly easy to use as a reference tool.

❊ ❊ ❊

Burton, Philip 2007. *Language in the Confessions of Augustine*. ix + 198 pages. Oxford: Oxford University Press. ISBN 978-0-19-926622-7. Price: US$36.00.
Reviewer: Dr Anthony Egan S.J., The Jesuit Institute – South Africa, Johannesburg, South Africa.

Both as autobiography and work of spirituality, the *Confessions* of St Augustine is one of the great works of religious literature. It has been read from a variety of perspectives from both within and outside the Christian tradition. New Testament scholar and biblical linguist Philip Burton's new book visits this classic text from the point of view of language itself, showing how Augustine drew upon a considerable knowledge of classical grammar and classical literary forms to construct his grand apologia.

Language itself is, Burton argues, a theme in the *Confessions*. It is an account of divine self-communication and of the creature's attempt to use language to communicate with the self-communicating God. But language itself is not an end in itself (that would be human conceit), but is a means of communicating with God (prayer – and the *Confessions* is nothing if not an extended, book-length prayer) and a way of communicating God to others through language (the sermon). Within this framework, however, Augustine uses a range of religious and secular literary forms and allusions to communicate his doubly directed message.

Although Augustine the convert was deeply wary of theatre (because it was traditionally staged to honour the gods and often included scenes depicting immorality) he nonetheless drew heavily on elements of comedy in his book – often to smile sympathetically at human frailty (his own in particular). He also alludes to a variety of classical literature in his message to the

reader. This is part of a broader use of the language of the "liberal arts"; the liberal arts are alluded to in the *Confessions*, as one might expect, since Augustine himself was one of the foremost professors of Rhetoric of his time. As a bishop, Augustine also draws upon biblical imagery, and often plays on the Greek and Latin expressions used to depict these images. This is a short but very dense book that will be of particular appeal to scholars of Augustine and to those who specialise in biblical and classical languages. As a non-specialist in classical languages, I must confess to finding it a bit heavy going at time, but found the way in which the author set his linguistic examination within the context of Augustine's life and thought very helpful. One thing the book succeeded in doing was to encourage me to reread the *Confessions* with an even deeper appreciation of Augustine's mastery of language. By reading this difficult study, and perhaps understanding only parts of it, I developed a greater appreciation of Augustine the prose poet.

<p style="text-align:center">✳ ✳ ✳</p>

Clayton, Paul B Jr. 2007.*The Christology of Theodoret of Cyrus. Antiochene, Christology from the Council of Ephesus (431) to the Council of Chalcedon (451).* Oxford Early Christian Studies. Oxford: Oxford University Press. v + 355 pages. ISBN 978-0-19-814398-7. Price: US$142.99.
Reviewer: Dr Rodney L Moss, Department of Theology, St. Augustine College of South Africa, Johannesburg, South Africa.

This very worthy publication attempt to provide an answer to the nature of the Christology of Theodoret of Cyrus. Recent scholarship has shown that it is far from easy to pin down Theodoret's doctrine of Christ. Paul Clayton, in my opinion, succeeds admirably in demonstrating the relative consistency of Theodoret's position and offers a credible explanation of the alleged "soft-pedalling" of his dualistic approach after the Formula of Reunion.

Clayton demonstrates, convincingly, that Theodoret was fixated on avoiding implications arising from the Arian heresy (i.e. that suffering could be attributed to the eternal Word). Consequently, his Christology is a two-subject Christology, divine and human, from beginning to end. In contrast, his Cyrillian opponents based the entire point of their Christology on there being one subject of the incarnation, the Word. "[T]he basic point of Cyril and the Alexandrians [is that] the subject of the Incarnation, the subject of the human experience, of human fear, temptation, obedience to the will of God, of human passion, death, and resurrection, is not just a human being in proso-pic union with the Word's *physis,* but the Word himself, the second *hypo-stasis* of the Trinity" (p 286) Theodoret, in contradistinction, insisted on teaching a real and genuine humanity in the incarnation.

Although Clayton shows sympathy for Theodoret's position, he is aware of the soteriological soundness of the orthodox approach. He concludes that Theodoret's "picture of God is sterile" (p 288). Cyril's Word, while remaining God, takes into his own life a living humanity in order to heal the human condition. This is infinitely more appealing than a God who enters into loose prosopic union (a union in which the Word is said to be visible by virtue of this union with the visible human tent) with humanity, rather than a more intimate hypostatic union – a union in which Jesus Christ, a human being, became the created self-expression of the Word of God through a permanent union of a human nature with the divine Person of the logos in order to "preserve" his divinity. Clayton is at pains (excessive I would say) to show that, even in his *Eranistes,* which scholars agree is the best phase of his thought, Theodoret never ceased to teach a two-subject Christology and to maintain the impassibility of the Word. In the latter period of his life he was, however, more cautious, more accommodating, to the Alexandrian position.

Clayton's scholarship is immense, and is aided by the availability of most of Theodoret's voluminous works in their original Greek. Theodoret is the most important source for Antiochene Christology in the period from the Council of Ephesus in 431 to the Council of Chalcedon in 451.

However, I have to take a critical stance towards Clayton's abstruse and unnecessarily complex sentence construction. At times, this makes sustained reading difficult and far too demanding. That said, Clayton's scholarship is of immense value. His detailed study of Theodoret's writings throws considerable light on the theology of the Councils of Ephesus and Chalcedon and sheds further light on the content of Antiochene Christology. This work is certainly recommended for students and scholars of the early church.

<div align="center">✳ ✳ ✳</div>

Reviewer: Professor Christina Landman, Research Institute for Theology and Religion, University of South Africa, Pretoria. South Africa.

Reading a book by John de Gruchy, Emeritus Professor of Christian Studies at the University of Cape Town, is always a unique experience. His latest book on John Calvin is no exception. De Gruchy is one of only a few authors in South Africa who deals with religious history in both a pietistically correct and politically correct way. He confesses his ecclesiastical perspective as being that of a Congregationalist, he never takes issue with accepted church dogmas and yet, at the same time, convinces his readers that they are at least

halfway on new theological roads that have been opened up by the very history he is describing.

De Gruchy achieves this by connecting concepts and events to each other in a way nobody else has done before. To describe predestination as a pastoral position is one of these liberating insights.

Liberating and surprising, too, is De Gruchy's presentation of Calvin as a Christian humanist. His comments may not be welcome to local ears since, even now, popular discourse regards humanism as opening the door to both liberalism and communism (p 41). However, De Gruchy explores the dialogical spaces between the binaries of the secular rejection of Calvinism on the one hand, and the flight into fundamentalism on the other, which locally is a strange mixture of pietism, revivalism and ultra-orthodox Calvinism.

Eventually De Gruchy offers Christian humanism as a legitimate root of Calvinism by presenting Calvin in roles alternative to those history has given him. In this book you will not find the hierarchical Calvin, but Calvin as the man who undermined the relationship between ecclesiastical power and salvation. You will not find the Calvin who has decided on behalf of God who was going to be saved, but the Calvin who focussed on predestination as the divine restoration of humanity. Also, you will not find Calvin as the destructor of icons and religious symbols, but the Calvin who enhanced the embodiment of the beauty of God in the church. Finally, you will not find the patriarchal or the racist Calvin here, but the humanist Calvin who was committed to restoring the good news of Christianity to all human beings.

The book is written in beautiful English. The contents are accessible to the lay reader. And yet the standard of the research presented in the book is of such a quality that it can be prescribed to students, and inform academic readers.

<center>✳ ✳ ✳</center>

Ferrari, S & Durham, W C (eds.) 2003. *Law and religion in post-communist Europe* (Law and Religion Studies 1) Louvain: Peeters Publishers & Booksellers. ISBN: 90-429-1262-2. Price: €45.00.
Durham, W C & Ferrari, S (eds.) 2004. *Laws on religion and the state in post-communist Europe*. (Law and Religion Studies 2). 328 pages. Louvain: Peeters Publishers & Booksellers. ISBN: 90-429-1362-2. Price: €65.00.
Reviewer: Dr Christo Lombaard, Department of Christian Spirituality, Church History and Missiology, University of South Africa, Pretoria, South Africa.

The study of the relationship between faith and human rights is in vogue at present, with the major contribution, in 2004, of authors JA Van der Ven, JS

Dreyer, & HJC Pieterse, *Is there a God of human rights? The complex relationship between human rights and religion. A South African case* (International Studies in Religion and Society, volume 2; Leiden: Brill). After the fall of the Berlin Wall in 1989, much has changed in the way Christianity constitutes itself, as illustrated earlier this year with the publication of Klaus Koschorke's edited volume *Falling walls: The year 1989/90 as a turning point in the history of world Christianity/Einstürzende Mauers. Das Jahr 1989/90 als Epochenjahr in der Geshichte des Weltchristentums* (Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag). The two studies being reviewed here contribute greatly, and in some detail, to our understanding of this dynamic, with their particular focus on the practical situation post-1989 in countries that previously constituted the USSR. With Soviet Communism's anti-religious stance, at times very harshly so, but which played out differently in the different states under its control, the religious reforms, which interestingly have usually been couched in human rights terms, have proved to be quite diverse.

In the 2003 *Law and religion in post-communist Europe* volume, very fact-like overviews (with only some interpretation) are offered of 17 Central and East European states, with two chapters on Russia, giving us a succinct yet substantial overview of the scene of church-state relations in this geographical area after the Cold War. An introductory chapter summarises the issues of politics, history, national (religious) identity, earlier church non/involvement with or against Communism, legislation, and international agreements that have given rise to the divergent paths now taken in these Central and East European countries regarding the church-state relationship. The closing chapter is a very perceptive review of the trends in the 17 countries; the author compares them with trends in Western European and North America. What is particularly interesting here are the twin emergent trends in the Central and East European countries: an insistence on tolerance and mutual respect between religious adherents, and the deliberate discouragement of any form of religious conflict.

The 2004 volume, *Laws on religion and the state in post-communist Europe*, includes a reprint of laws that have been enacted in 18 countries. However, not all countries are covered, and the overlap with the 2003 volume is therefore not complete. In addition, these laws have very different backgrounds, nuances and associated intentions. These and other issues are reviewed in an opening chapter, with a particular focus on the registration of religious organisations; 20 laws are reprinted in subsequent chapters. Together, these chapters (particularly if read together with the relevant chapters in the 2003-volume) give us some sense of the directions taken in Central and East European regarding church-state relations. These two companion volumes are very important works in our understanding of how the dynamics of the relationship between church and state are playing out in a part of the world where such legislation is developing at great pace. Impulses

developing from this part of the world are sure to have repercussions in wider international circles. For scholars of law who are interested in religion and its place in secular societies, these two volumes are indispensable.

✳✳✳

Frankenberry, Nancy K (ed.) 2008. *The faith of scientists: in their own words*. 523 pages. Princeton: Princeton University Press. ISBN 978-0-691-13487-1. Price: US$29.95; £17.95.
Reviewer: Professor Cornel du Toit, Research Institute for Theology and Religion, University of South Africa, Pretoria, South Africa.

The book comprises two parts. Part one (chapters 1-8) deals with the founders of modern science and part two (chapters 9-21) with present-day scientists. The book covers Galileo, Kepler, Bacon, Newton, Darwin, Einstein and Whitehead. Contemporary scientists are Rachel Carson, Carl Sagan, Steven Jay Gould, Richard Dawkins, Jane Goodall, Steven Weinberg, John Polkinghorn, Freeman Dyson, Stephen Hawking, Paul Davies, Edward O. Wilson, Stuart Kaufmann and Ursula Goodenough.

Few of us have enough time or interest to read scientists' original works, especially if we are only concerned with their thinking on religion or their view of the relationship between science and religion. Frankenberry's book makes leading scientists' ideas about religion accessible to lay people. Each chapter starts with an introduction that outlines the place, significance and work of a given scientist, as well as excerpts from the scientists' work that are relevant to the subject of the book. This is followed by bibliographies of each scientist's main works.

It must have been a mammoth task to read through the work of the aforementioned scientists to find the sections that deal with religion or the relationship between science and religion. Frankenberry's introductions to each scientist are also excellent. Those who are versed in the rhetoric of the science-religion dialogue will recognise most of the popular quotations and a great deal besides in this book. It can be regarded as a standard work for anyone wanting a reliable, first-hand guide to what the best scientists our planet has produced have to say about religion.

Some may disagree with the selection of names representing contemporary scientists. But it should be remembered that the author had to choose scientists who are reasonably representative of certain viewpoints, and here she has succeeded admirably. The book is a good investment as a reference work and a guide for people who would like to know these scientists' position on religion.

✳✳✳

Jossa, Giorgio 2007. *Jews or Christians: the followers of Jesus in search of their own identity*. WUNT 202. viii + 175 pp. cloth. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck. ISBN 3-16-149192-0. Price: €69.00.
Reviewer: Professor Dr Christoph Stenschke, Forum Wiedenest, Bergneustadt, Germany and Department of New Testament, University of South Africa, Pretoria, South Africa.

The history of early Christianity continues to be in the centre of interest to New Testament scholars and historians of the ancient church. There has been a trend in the past two decades to argue that the separation of nascent Christianity from Judaism, the so-called "parting of the way(s)", was a rather long process. Some scholars suggest that this process might well have lasted into the second and even third centuries. The New Testament sources which suggest the opposite are often taken to be of late origin and to reflect conflict specific to their own time rather than that of Jesus and the earliest churches. Against this background Giorgio Jossa, Professor of Church History at the University *Frederico II* in Naples, Italy, asks when it was that Christianity, born as a particular current within early Judaism, constituted and understood itself as a religion different and separate from its Jewish origin. He challenges the trend mentioned above and argues that the birth of a particularly *Christian* identity must actually be dated back to the very first period of the community of Jesus and even to Jesus himself.

Jossa rightly observes that the phenomenon under discussion has often been considered predominantly from a Palestinian perspective. Yet the *Jews of the Diaspora* and the *Gentile Christians* must not be excluded from the picture:

> The separation of Christianity from Judaism has to do above all not only with the Jews, but also with the Gentiles, and not only as spectators, but as a social reality that was necessarily involved in that separation. The correct observation that Christianity was born out of Judaism, that in the beginning, in fact, it was nothing more than a further orientation of a non-normative Judaism, which was still in the making, cannot lead to the too rapid conclusion that Christianity was born only when the groups of followers of Jesus stopped being part of Judaism (12).

The diffusion of Christianity among the Gentiles (i.e. once Christianity was no longer mediated through Jewish tradition) in fact played a decisive role in that separation, given that this form of Christianity was a difficult obstacle for both Judaism and Jewish Christianity to negotiate. The attempt of some Jewish Christians to remain Jews and/or keep Jewish traditions did not stop

Judaism and Christianity from appearing, to outsiders, to be clearly distinct religions. Jossa concludes that the history of this separation already began with the birth of a Christian community after the death of Jesus, if not in the very preaching of Jesus himself (13). One may also add: it is also seen in Jesus's deeds and in his interpretation of the Hebrew Bible.

Jossa sets out in chapter one with a survey of "The Jews from 4 BCE to 100 CE" (15-44). He sketches the portrait of Judaism in the first century that is emerging in recent research and identifies problems and aporias in recent contributions (Jewish identity and influence of the Pharisees, the messianic hope and the emergence of rabbinic Judaism).

Chapter two gives a summary of the early Christians from 30 CE to 100 CE (45-121). Jossa covers the attitude of *Jesus* towards Judaism (the observance of the Law, his messianic claims), faith in the early community in Jesus as Lord and Messiah (a fine summary and defence of an early high Christology; on this see the various contributions of M Hengel), the Hellenists and the Hebrews and their stance vis-à-vis the Mosaic Law, the mission of Paul to the Gentiles and Christian proselytism, and the gospels of Matthew and John and the "problem" of Judaeo-Christianity. For a recent excellent survey of Jewish Christianity, see also O Skarsaune, R Hvalvik (eds.), *Jewish Believers in Jesus: The Early Centuries* (Peabody: Hendrickson, 2007).

Chapter three examines how Jews and Christians were seen by the Romans in different periods (123-45): from Tiberius to Claudius (generally no distinction between both groups), the persecution of Christians under Nero in 64 AD and the Jewish war (66-74 CE – during this period, a clear distinction began to emerge), the exaction of the Jewish tax (from which Christians were exempt, "after the persecution by Nero and the Jewish war, the Christians were now considered apostates not only by the Romans, but by the Jews themselves", 139; no source ever hints at the payment of this tribute on the part of the Christians) and the persecution under Domitian. Thus there is evidence that early on "humanity seems to be divided into Romans, Jews and Christians" (145). Bibliography (145-63) and various indices (165-75) round off this well-produced volume. The volume does not have a concluding chapter or conclusions to the three chapters or its subsections.

While some scholars might not agree with Jossa, his arguments, which are based on the New Testament, early Jewish and Roman sources and a wide range of early Christian literature, deserve careful scrutiny. By and large he presents a well-argued, persuasive case that makes sense of many sources that do not suggest a long process of separation. If the canonical gospels are dated earlier and were considered to be historically more reliable (there are good reasons for both cases!) than granted by many scholars, they would support Jossa's case. It is to Jossa's merit that he has gathered together this material into a single, coherent case. Throughout this work, the author en-

gages with recent international research, and makes a point of referring to a number of interesting Italian contributions.

Jossa's focus on Diaspora Judaism and Gentile Christians is a welcome reminder of important issues that also belong to the larger picture. However, I would question some statements that suggest that, early on, there was something like a Gentile Christianity, fully separated from Judaism if only for social reasons. While Gentile Christians may soon have been in the majority in churches outside of Palestine, the Jewish Christian minority, Jewish Christian missionaries and itinerant prophets, the Jewish Gospel, the Scriptures of Israel, and the early Christian writings (with their Jewish "flavour") will have had a continuing bearing on these communities. In view of this, it is questionable to speak of a Christianity of "exclusively Greek origin" (9). If it was Christian at all, it cannot have been of *exclusively Greek origin*.

The volume is the English translation of *Giudei o cristiani? I seguaci de Gesù in cerca di una propria itentità* (Brescia: Paideia Editrice, 2004; trad. Molly Rogers). The bibliography lists other Italian contributions by Jossa. Of related interest is the recent collection by E. Iricinschi & H. M. Zelletin (eds.), *Heresy and Identity in Late Antiquity*, TSAJ 119 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2008; cf. the review in *ThLZ* 134, 2009, 539-41).

∗ ∗ ∗

Krüger, J S 2006. *Sounding unsound: Orientation into mysticism*. 323 pages. Pretoria: Aurora Press. ISBN: 0-620-37731-3. Price: R200-00.
Reviewer: Dr Christo Lombaard, Department of Christian Spirituality, Church History and Missiology, University of South Africa, Pretoria, South Africa.

Poised between non-acceptance of the world as society presents itself to us, and non-acceptance of religion in its presentation of too definite answers, *Sounding unsound* seeks a road less travelled, treading on slim pathways for which words as directions often do not suffice. Such a *via negativa* is no popular way in theologies, given to security of convictions and the durability of propositions, nor is it in modern Western culture, given to goals, commitments and achievements. The "sounds of silence" may resonate as a popular song, but for most, not as a way of being. Yet that is precisely the space Krüger inhabits. Like grace, this state of being is not something that can be explored, followed, attained. Instead, it means a letting go. In becoming less, the purity of the nothingness itself is just there. This is not *creatio ex nihilo*, but approximates *existere in nihilo*. It implies an individual, always *en route*, seeking to encounter an/the Ultimate, transversing the dualisms of our existence, such as – chapters 3 to 12 – something and nothing, or good and

evil, or relative and absolute. Such juxtapositioning, a rhetorical strategy typical of mystical writings, namely as an attempt to escape from the given, evident truths towards the hidden, enticing also-truths, is to a large extent continued in the second section of *Sounding unsound*, under the title "Structural elements". Here, Krüger's thoughts on different aspects of "nature" are collected (e.g. on humanity within the cosmos; on meaning; on the spirit). This leads to a section called "Mountain", in which aspects of the mystical experience of the present are presented. The preceding is all built into a model, an "integral approach" to mysticism, in the concluding section of the volume.

Among the values of this outstanding book is that it presents highly complex yet deeply experiential aspects of common, yet rare, humanity in simple language, and with humility. Unlike much popular writing on mysticism, it is highly informed, thoroughly researched and, one soon senses, thoroughly lived. Unlike much academic writing on mysticism, this text is inviting, seductive, leading one into what is essentially a very sensual phenomenon, in that it touches all aspects of our being, namely the expression of spirituality we call mysticism.

As a guide for seeking individuals, this book is excellent. As a study text for students, if preceded with some introductory work in order to form an interpretative frame of reference, equally so.

<p style="text-align:center">❊ ❊ ❊</p>

Mafeje A 2008. *The disenfranchised: perspectives on the history of elections in South Africa.* xii + 170pp. Pretoria: Unisa Press. ISBN 978-1-86888-441-4. Price: R184-00.
Reviewer: Professor Graham Duncan, Department of Church History and Church Polity, University of Pretoria, Pretoria, South Africa.

This collection of essays offers an insight into election processes in South Africa from the time of the South African War (1899-1902), and focuses, in particular, on elections since the birth of democracy in 1994. The perspective adopted is that of the historically disenfranchised. This book was the "brainchild" of the Independent Electoral Commission, but it rightly turned into a volume consisting of the independent contributions of authors sponsored by the IEC. The common theme of the book focuses on the perspective of the historically disenfranchised, to which group all the authors belong. It is therefore not a neutral study, but it is written from a specific commitment. What emerges is an analytical narrative the purpose of which is to inform and enlighten the reader.

Mqotsi and Jordan write historical analyses offering black initiatives and responses to electoral exclusion. These essays are very informative, parti-

cularly since they deal with those who were apparently powerless yet were able to make their own representations. Molapo and Mangcu enter the controversial yet historically significant field of contemporary history. This is especially true of Molapo's interpretation of the events of CODESA. Dieschos's paper on the role of political parties is especially insightful, since he deals with sensitive issues, including the unlikely possibility of drifting towards a one-party state even in the light of a multi-party democracy as a result of the growing proportion of the votes secured by ANC and the consequent crisis of identity faced by many other parties. The role of these parties is to offer a coherent constructive opposition that will challenge the abuse of power. The issue of proportional representation is raised as a factor in distancing the people from their representatives, representatives who have a greater loyalty to party leadership. The problem of a politics of entitlement is raised in this context where views have been promoted on the superior role played in the struggle in exile by those who engaged in it as opposed to those who bore the brunt of ongoing oppression. The problems of forming a unity government are highlighted in a discussion of historical racial fragmentation and colonialism and apartheid, which is the legacy of the liberation struggle, with its pedagogy of oppression as a hindrance to the development of a free and fair society. What is needed is a strengthening of the institutions that will promote and safeguard democracy.

Bam, Vilikazi and Jaiyesimi-Njobe all write on electoral management and participation, the first two as insiders, while Jaiyesimi-Njobe writes as an activist. He offers a critical survey of different electoral systems and expresses a deep concern for the "marginalised".

The authors are clear that choosing a suitable electoral model for the long-term future is a process that will require extensive consultation, given the history of South Africa. A key feature of such a model must include direct representation of the historically marginalised as a means of redressing the wrongs of the past. It must provide for freedom of expression, access to information and meaningful participation. Justice, equity and redress must be the hallmarks of a fair system. Such a model will move the locus of the loyalty of elected members away from the political party to the electorate themselves.

This book provides material for ongoing debate concerning the future of democratic elections in South Africa. Its stress on the marginalised provides a timely reminder that these people still constitute the majority of the population of the country. As such, the book is worthy of intensive study and debate.

✳ ✳ ✳

Reviewer: Professor Danie Veldsman, Department of Dogmatics and Christian Ethics, Faculty of Theology, University of Pretoria, Pretoria, South Africa.

This is the third title in the Ashgate series of New Critical Thinking in Religion, Theology and Biblical Studies. The author Ann Marie Mealey is a lecturer in Moral Theology at Leeds and All Saints, United Kingdom.

From a Catholic perspective, she states that the uniqueness of Christian morality represents a vexed question and that the church – read Catholic moral theology – in the current situation has yet to embrace the recommendations of the Second Vatican Council (referring to the *Optatam Totius 16*) concerning the ways in which it is to be renewed. For her, this task is still unfinished largely because there is no genuine consensus between theologians as to what distinguishes Christian morality from secular morality. Against the background of the Christian *Proprium* Debate (chapter 1), she highlights the strengths and weaknesses of the so-called autonomy (page 25ff, 54ff, 92ff) and faith ethic (page 27ff, 54ff, 92) schools of thought. For her, there is little dividing them and that, in some instances, both schools are simply defending one aspect of a hermeneutical dialectic.

In an attempt to move "beyond the *impasse*" and away from the divisions between proponents of the faith-ethic and autonomy positions, Mealey enlists the help of the hermeneutical theory of Paul Ricoeur (chapters 2 & 3), focusing in particular on the interpretation of texts in the search for meaning and self-understanding. She argues that many of the disagreements arising from the Christian *Proprium* debate can be overcome if scholars look to the possibilities opened up by Ricoeur's hermeneutics of interpretation (with key concepts such as life, descriptions of life, stories about life, history, myths and symbols). In short: Mealey's book brings about disorientation in order to reorientate! Mealey also argues that the uniqueness of Christian morality is more adequately explained in terms of a specific identity (self) that is constantly subject to change and revision in the light of many, often conflicting, moral sources (chapter 4). She advocates a move away from attempts to explain the uniqueness of Christian morality in terms of one specific, unchanging context, motivation, norm, divine command or value. By embracing the possibilities opened up by Ricoeurian hermeneutics, Mealey explains how concepts such as revelation (p 94ff), tradition (p 113ff), orthodoxy and moral conscience (p 155) may be understood in a hermeneutical way without being deemed sectarian or unorthodox (chapters 5 and 6). In conclusion, however, Mealey states that much of what Ricoeur proposes as the tasks of Christian Ethics remains to be done. Although he has enabled us – read Catholic

theologians – to take the first giant step, he has demonstrated why we must move beyond the *impasse* created by the autonomy and faith ethic schools. For her it can all be summarised as follow: each member of the body of Christ is invited to risk becoming a self that is more worthy of the title *Imago Dei* than ever before.

Mealey's publication represents a very readable contribution to the current debate on moral (Catholic) theology. It will indeed stimulate ongoing reflection on contemporary issues. However, if evolutionary epistemological contributions are not part of the current (moral) debate when theologians reflect on the significance of life stories in the making, history, tradition etc, it will continue to be seriously reductionistic.

<p style="text-align:center">✻ ✻ ✻</p>

Motlhabi M 2008. *African theology/black theology in South Africa: looking back, moving on.* Pretoria: University of South Africa Press. xii + 150pp. ISBN 978-1-86888-433-9. Price: R150-00.
Reviewer: Professor Graham Duncan, Department of Church History and Church Polity, University of Pretoria, Pretoria, South Africa.

This book comes as a timely reminder that Black Theology and the intimations of its demise (which appeared in the wake of the coming of democracy and the short-lived rise of the theology of reconstruction) were much exaggerated. Such a fate did not befall African theology to the same extent, and here the author tries to offer a degree of rehabilitation by foreseeing a joint future for both branches of this theological enterprise.

Apart from chapter one, all of the chapters are previously published re-edited works. Chapter one offers us a lucid insider history of the development of Black Theology in South Africa from a personal point of view. The book ends with an appendix on "The Moral Laws in the Tradition of Boston Personalism".

This work provides a helpful primer on the subjects of Black and African Theology. However, it is largely historical in its outlook. When this book's title says "moving on" we are obliged to ask, "From where?" This question is necessitated by the fact that the author hardly quotes an African or Black theologian from the last twenty years (including himself). The author writes as if nothing significant has happened during this time and asks for a new generation of African theologians to pick up the challenge (:x). What of those who have been labouring in this particular vineyard during this time and whose work is not even acknowledged? This is a serious lacuna which mars what is otherwise a worthy volume.

<p style="text-align:center">✻ ✻ ✻</p>

Mukuka, G S 2008. *The other side of the story: the silent experience of black clergy in the Catholic Church in South Africa (1898-1976)*. Pietermaritzburg: Cluster. ISBN 978-198750-5368-1. Price: R100-00; US$20.00.
Reviewer: Professor Graham Duncan, Department of Church History and Church Polity, University of Pretoria, Pretoria, South Africa.

This is the first expose of the trauma which black Roman Catholic candidates for ordination to the priesthood experienced as the result of "being black". It serves as a corrective to the traditional view that attempts to claim that black clergy failed as a result of their not being ready for ordination (either to the priesthood or to the episcopacy). In terms of periodisation, the study focuses on three stages in the process of indigenisation: 1856-1900, 1900-1956 and 1950-2005. However, in the final chapter there is a change in the phases of periodisation: the final period is sub-divided into the struggle against racism and the emergence of Black Consciousness and Black Theology in the 1960s and 1970s, and the formation of groups struggling against alienation in the 1990s. Mukuka acknowledges the contribution made by the European missionaries despite their expressions of superiority and power. He adopts an interdisciplinary approach to this primarily historical study, drawing on insights from the fields of geography, social politics and anthropology. The theoretical framework he operates from is based on: (1) the Comaroffs' work on hegemony and ideology within their model of a historical anthropology of consciousness; (2) James Scott's theory of domination and resistance; and (3) James Blaut's theory of diffusionism.

The first chapter focuses on a theoretical introduction to the topic under the provocative sub-title "history as lies and mischief". It accounts for the scant literary sources and justifies the role and necessity of oral historical research methodology in a context where much relevant information has been ignored or suppressed in the available literature. Chapter two moves to an explanation of the birth of missionary impulses in the Roman Catholic Church and examines the contributions of popes Benedict XV and Pius XI through the lens of apostolic letters and encyclicals *Maximum Illud* (1919), *Rerum Ecclesiae* (1926), *Evangelii Praecones* (1951) and *Fidei donum* (1957). These were expressions of a changing mood: they challenged a colonialist approach to missionary thinking and promoted the concept of indigenisation, especially the indigenisation of the clergy. However, their great distance from the centre of the church in Rome made it easy for missionaries to frustrate the impulse for change.

Chapter three introduces the reader to the life and experiences of the first four black priests in South African Catholicism and the tactics that were used to undermine and frustrate them, even to the extent of the invasion of privacy, sabotage of their work and the totally unjustified incarceration of one of them in a mental institution for seventeen years. These black priests,

however, did not remain passive recipients of oppression. They engaged in subtle and not so subtle forms of resistance. Chapter four considers specific aspects of the indigenisation process in the light of the four papal encyclicals and the number of priests ordained. Alongside this it is important to note that the process was complicated by the existence of a variety of power bases in Rome, Germany and the countries in which missionaries were serving. The fifth chapter takes us a little further along the road of indigenisation, with an examination of the first South African bishop, Bonaventure Dlamini, and his contribution within the problematic diocese of Umzimkulu.

Chapter six places the study in the context of the Black Consciousness and Black Theology movements and their relationship to the formation of pressure groups within the Roman Catholic Church. The final chapter summarises the work and offers some suggestions for action to radically alter the balance of power in the Roman Catholic Church in South Africa.

Mukuka has certainly begun to rectify the lacuna in the history of the growth of an indigenous clergy in the South African Roman Catholic Church in that he challenges the validity of much of the existing documentation and historical accounts recorded by white missionary clergy. He reveals a common problem in mission historiography – the discrepancies that exist between intention and reality in the indigenisation policy – and notes that a very real sense of "homelessness" still inhabits the minds of black priests and bishops.

In short, this book is a valuable addition to the resources available on Roman Catholicism in South Africa.

✳ ✳ ✳

Park, Robert L 2008. *Superstition: belief in the age of science*. 215 pages. Princeton: Princeton University Press. ISBN 978-0-691-13355-3. Price: US$24.95; £14.95.
Reviewer: Professor Cornel du Toit, Research Institute for Theology and Religion, University of South Africa, Pretoria, South Africa.

The author, a professor of physics, wrote the book to put present-day superstitions under the scientific spotlight. But this book concerns more than just superstition. It is an important contribution to the science/religion debate, touching on many of the issues in that discussion. Recent times have seen a number of publications (in the superstition critique genre), which should be viewed against the background of interventions from the physical sciences in particular. Park, while sympathetic towards religion, does not flinch from criticising unfounded superstitions. The merit of the book is chiefly that it provides us with a host of scientific data that enable us to assess ourselves and contemporary culture more accurately. The examples cited are, naturally,

American, but most Western and even non-Western readers can identify with them. Twelve chapters, subdivided into separate sections and written in an eminently readable style, deal with key issues in – mainly – Western societies.

Right at the outset we find the provocative statement that the Templeton Foundation has "bought" the Science and Religion debate (p 8). This is a serious allegation, since it questions the bona fides of Science and Religion projects funded by Templeton. The Templeton prize – worth more than the Nobel prize – is widely known for its lavish funding of various projects. Park cites examples. With reference to Steven Weinberg, he critically examines statements by physicists, especially for or against the so-called anthropic principle, which Templeton supports (pp 9-10). The author feels more comfortable with Gould's NOMA principle (i.e. Science and Religion comprises two non-overlapping magisteria) (p 14).

Chapter 2 deals with evolution: aspects of the intelligent design theory; the pattern-recognising ability of our brains; the controversy on whether or not to teach evolution as a subject in American schools; facets of the God of the gaps problem; Craig Venter and the mapping of the human genome; and other aspects of Phillip Johnson's intelligent design ideology. A significant point is the "unreliability" of Gallup polls, such as the 1999 survey that indicated that 45% of the American population support a literal interpretation of the Bible while another survey, in the same year, showed that 81% of the American people agree that dinosaurs lived millions of years ago (pp 49-50).

Chapter 3 (pp 56-78) describes several attempts in the USA to prove "statistically" that prayer makes a difference to people's physical health. The author accepts that prayer may alleviate the stress associated with illness and injuries. He also notes the positive effects of meditation techniques. He mentions Galton's work, especially his 1872 publication, *Statistical inquiries into the efficacy of prayer*. Since the Anglican Church's Daily Order for Prayer enjoins the faithful to pray for the longevity of bishops and monarchs, one would expect them to exceed average life expectancy, but no evidence of this could be found (pp 55-66). Claims to possess so-called extrasensory perception (ESP) are also debunked.

Chapter 4 (pp 79-92) looks at arguments about the notion of the human soul. Why do some people regard a fertilised ovum as a human person? Does the soul reside in our DNA? This raises the issue of the permissibility of stem cell research. In America at least six million inseminated ova have been frozen to enable women to have successful pregnancies. At the time of writing his book, the author estimated that there were at least half a million frozen ova in the USA. The Bush government was known to have prohibited the use of these cells for stem cell research (president Obama recently scrapped this ruling). The irony was that the Bush government per-

mitted the destruction of cells that were no longer needed, but prohibited their use in research that could help to conquer life-threatening diseases. As far as reincarnation is concerned, the author describes the case of an American woman who, under hypnosis, recalled details of her alleged life as an Irish woman in Cork County in the 19th century. The mystery, which was widely publicised, was solved when the incarnated personality was identified as an Irish neighbour whom the hypnotised woman knew in her childhood and from whom she heard Irish songs and stories. The author also discusses superstitions such as the belief that the soul weighs 21 grams because the human body is said to weigh 21 grams less after death, out-of-body experience, astral projection, etc.

Chapter 5 (p 93ff) focuses on life after death. Although almost 90% of all Americans believe in heaven, they actually want life. The author cites Pope Benedict XVI, who asked: "Do we really want this – to live eternally?" Park concludes that what people desire is "not eternal life, for which faith in eternal life seems something of an impediment. To continue living for ever – endlessly – appears more like a curse than a gift. Death, admittedly, one would wish to postpone for as long as possible. But to live always, without end – this, all things considered, can only be monotonous and ultimately unbearable" (p 103).

Chapter 6 (p 104ff) deals with the problem of innocent suffering. Here the principal example in the tsunami of 26 December 2004, whereupon Park proceeds to Job as the classical biblical example. Here, his lack of theological insight (into the background and history of the origin of the book) is obvious. He interprets the God concept projected by the book as that of "a vain and boastful god, easily manipulated by the taunting of Satan. This is a god more in the image of the Greek gods, with exaggerated human failings" (p 111). He explains the tsunami, correctly, as shifting tectonic plates rather than punishment for sin or something similar. In the view of many religions "there are no natural disasters. All disasters are supernatural" (p 107).

Chapter 7 (p 116ff) criticises New Age superstitions. "Beginning in the 1980s, the New Age movement embraced spiritualism, reincarnation, channelling, mediums, holistic healing, astrology, crystals, pyramid power, and more. Lacking guidance from a sacred book or tradition, belief itself becomes the unifying principle behind the New Age" (p 124). Chapter 7 is valuable in that it clarifies the operation of the amygdala, thalamus and hypothalamus and the role of emotion and emotional memory (pp 119-121). This is important in the context of the topic of the book, since many of our responses are emotionally tinctured and co-determined by experiences embedded in the amygdala since childhood.

Chapter 8 (p 129ff) introduces a necessary correction of superstitions that have emerged in popular literature over the past decade concerning the principle of quantum mechanics. Park calls it "quantum mysticism" (p 129).

Chapter 9 (p 142ff) will probably make many readers' hackles rise, because it tackles belief in homeopathic medicine. The chosen example is the supposed effect of Barbary duck liver on human health. The author indicates (p 144ff) that the ingredient is so diluted that it cannot possibly have any effect. Homeopaths usually shrug off this allegation by answering, "The water remembers" (p 152) – that is to say, the water remembers what it used to contain before it was diluted to the point where traces of the "miracle" substance are no longer discernible. The author concludes: "Alternative medicine is not a separate field of medicine; it's a separate culture – a culture of credulity" (p 158).

Nonetheless many people swear by homeopathy, which is simply attributable to the placebo effect – the theme of chapter 10 (p 161ff). It deals with aspects of "political medicine" (p 172ff) in recent American history and the attempts by practitioners of alternative medicine such as homeopathy, herbal medicine, Reiki, native American cures, magnet therapy, acupuncture, and so on to have their practices approved by medical aid funds. The author rejects the conventional/alternative medicine distinction: the only distinction is between efficacious and inefficacious medicine, that is, between medicine that has been tested and untested medicine (p 176). The American experience is that tests showed alternative medicine to have no beneficial effects (p 178). Interestingly, it was found that the placebo effect may be associated with the secretion of endorphins (p 183). MRI scans show that placebos activate the same brain areas as endorphins and other opioids.

Chapter 12 (p 188ff) deals with moral law. The author cites the example of the display of the Decalogue carved in granite on the university campus in Austen, Texas. This obviously privileged certain religions and was counter to the so-called Establishment Clause in the American constitution; the author describes the legal battle that ensued to get the granite block removed from the campus.

The final chapter stresses the frailty of our planet and the fact that we have nowhere else to go. The horrific rate of human population increase is described, as is the concomitant extinction of every other vegetable and animal species on earth. The superstition at issue is that we will always find a solution to our problems or can emigrate to space stations or other planets. The book concludes with this sentence: "Science is the only way of knowing – everything else is just superstition." This reductive statement should not put off prospective readers. It is a highly readable book, characterised by valuable information.

Some readers may find it a sobering book, while others may have a sense of self-humiliation. Very few of us can describe ourselves as free from all superstition or some form of wishful thinking. But what harm is there in superstition? More than that, why is superstition so popular and pertinacious? Why does it make us feel good? Unfortunately, these are philosophical and

sociological questions that exact physical scientists never ask. To them, as to the author of this book, it is purely a matter of upholding "pure" science in the face of quasi science – in itself no doubt an honourable enterprise, but to my mind too narrow.

The question of the possible harm that superstition entails is important, however. Alternative medicine, for example, robs people who pay fortunes to obtain a placebo effect. Superstition is certainly exploited to make big money. It is a multi-billion dollar project. In the case of religion it nurtures the belief that the things that befall people are punishments for sin or lessons that they need to learn. This inevitably determines the "victim's" relationships with others, usually to his or her detriment. Superstition is not always innocent. It is part of social systems of exclusion and inclusion, acceptance and rejection. It influences the respect/disrespect accorded to others and, of course, has a definite influence on various human rights issues. Underlying superstition is also the issue of fundamentalism – a topic necessarily associated with the operation of superstition if one is to understand it. Understanding the function and role of superstition in our lives deepens our self-understanding. It is a pity that the author does not devote at least some attention to these important questions.

<div align="center">✳ ✳ ✳</div>

Peters, F E 2004. *The children of Abraham: Judaism, Christianity, Islam* (new edition). 237 pages. Princeton: Princeton University Press. ISBN: 0-691-12767-7. Price: US$16.95; £10.95.
Reviewer: Dr Christo Lombaard, Department of Christian Spirituality, Church History and Missiology, University of South Africa, Pretoria, South Africa.

This new edition, which differs from the first edition (1982) primarily on the role ascribed to Islam among the world religions, also summarises the author's subsequent research into this field (e.g. 1990: *Judaism, Christianity, and Islam: the classical texts and their interpretation*; and subsequently, 2007: *The voice, the Word, the books: the sacred scripture of the Jews, Christians, and Muslims*). *The children of Abraham* covers the period of the time of Abraham to Aquinas; however, it sets out not to cover history, but certain themes that cut cross the three concerned religions. Of course, the book cannot escape the historical dimensions, and it is here that historically inclined academics will find the greatest difficulty with the book. A pre-kingdom period Abraham is understood as the initiator of monotheism which, though in accord with the narrated history of the Old Testament/Hebrew Bible/First Testament and with what almost all believers thus accept, is no longer the view held by critical scholars. Critical studies of the Hebrew Bible

patriarchs and of the development of monotheism in ancient Israel now place the growth of the monotheistic expression of Yahwism, in contrast to mono-latry, as a development that occurred during the Babylonian exile period of 586-539 BCE and thereafter. Some of the sources referred to in *The children of Abraham* are certainly familiar with these developments over recent decades, and here and there the author leaves hints that he is aware of at least some of these critical insights. The reason for these insights not being included in this volume is unclear; it may well have to do with the author's more literary-comparative approach to the Holy Texts of the three Book Religions, or perhaps his understanding of the best way to facilitate inter-religious understanding in our time has led him on this particular path. However, it is precisely these historical insights, which may to a substantial extent undermine the fundamentalisms to which all three these religions are inclined, that, in my opinion, would be most helpful in facilitating such inter-religious understanding. The complex relationship between textual account and historical "reality", often disconcerting to uninformed pieties, offers a most healthy antidote to uncritical fundamentalism. Though admittedly a very difficult path to take, it remains in my view the most promising route through the challenges offered by interreligious dialogue in our time, espe-cially when combined with an encouragement to draw spiritual nourishment from such insights (rather than what is usually done, namely, simply pointing out the historical alternatives without theologising on the implications).

The Introduction to the book gives brief overviews of the different conceptions of their Holy Books by the three religions is question, namely of the TaNaCh, the Bible (in two Testaments), and the Qur'an. Chapter 1 recounts broadly the early history of the patriarchs as told in Genesis, and summarises the rest of the Israelite-Judean history up to Hellenistic times. Here, too, none of the critical Old Testament histories of recent decades and centuries have been integrated. Chapter 2 reviews briefly the beginnings of the New Testament, the Mishna and Talmud and other post-biblical Jewish writings, and the Qur'an and early Islam, with particular and more critical attention paid to the latter. Chapter 3 offers a broad overview of the suc-cessive development of the three religions, while chapters 4 to 8 make a thematic comparison between, respectively, law, scripture and tradition, wor-ship, asceticism, and God talk (the last chapter, in my opinion, being by far the most valuable in the book). The book concludes with a brief Epilogue, in which the author shows how some aspects of these three religions are related to each other.

❋ ❋ ❋

Steinberg, Jonny 2008. *Three-letter plague: A young man's journey through a great epidemic*. Jeppestown, Johannesburg: Jonathan Ball Publishers. ISBN: 978-1-86842-288-3. Price R170-00.
Reviewer: Dr J T Modise, Modise Research Trade Travelling and Tours, Johannesburg, South Africa.

Most of the books written about the HIV epidemic focus on the individual's painful journey of recovery from near death after he or she has reached the lowest CD4 count. A few are about the discovery of the person's sense of self as a result of his or experiences with HIV/AIDS. Jonny Steinberg's book belongs to the latter category and stands out as a humanistic as well as a spiritual journey towards self-understanding in an age of HIV/AIDS. It is a study of the relationship between people and health institutions and attitudes and is written as a travelogue of the subject of study in his encounter with the HIV epidemic. It is an attempt to develop a model that transcends shame and blame, and to affirm positive living on the basis of the author's encounter with other people. This point of view cannot be packaged as a parcel of cute phrases with a view to impressing the reader; it is a genuine attempt to know what it means to live out a particular viewpoint.

This is well written, clear and enlightening book, a book that gives the reader an in-depth account of what it means to live with HIV/AIDS. What happens when you have never been tested for HIV? Steinberg deliberately travels to the area of Lusikisiki, in the Eastern Cape, where he meets a healthy and young man by the name of Sizwe. Sizwe has never been tested for HIV and has deliberately avoided being tested. However, Sizwe's meeting with Jonny opens a new window of hope for him as he enters into a journey of discovering what HIV is and how it has left the majority of Lusikisiki people in destitution. This journey, therefore, is a difficult story of human life in search of a safe haven in the culture of shame and privacy, and in an age of pharmaceuticals competing for the HIV/AIDS market (a market based on knowing one's own HIV status). Jonny Steinberg has managed to obtain data on these pharmaceutical companies and the whole situation exacerbates the culture of shame in the Eastern Cape. Indeed, his exposure of the competition for this market forms the basic contention of this book.

The basic contention of my criticism lies in the fact that Jonny Steinberg's inquiry suggests eliminating ignorance leads to the truth and the elimination error leads to knowledge. However, the opposite is true, because inquiry resides between ignorance and knowledge, and that is less than knowledge and more than ignorance. Further, my greatest disappointment with this book is its patronising approach: the author uses the plight of a poverty stricken community to promote his own personal agenda.

However, taken as a whole, the book is a worthwhile addition to HIV literature.

Tiernan, B R (translator, editor) 2008. *Empandeni Interlude (1899-1903): Journal of a woman missionary Josephine Bullen SND de Namur at the turn of the century in Rhodesia*. Pietermaritzburg: Cluster Publications. ISBN 978-1-875053-72-8. Price: Not known.
Reviewer: Dr Francisca H Chimhanda, Department of Systematic Theology & Theological Ethics, University of South Africa, Pretoria, South Africa.

The book "Empandeni Interlude ..." utilises a diary of Sr. Josephine Bullen, of the order of the Sisters of Notre Dame (SND). The diarist and four others of her companions were among the early missionaries to Rhodesia (now Zimbabwe) and, in particular, were founding members of the Roman Catholic mission, Empandeni, in the diocese of Bulawayo. The period covered corresponds with that of the colonial founding of Rhodesia. The diarist mentions encounters with and/or events surrounding some of the pioneers (e.g. Cecil John Rhodes [p 97, p 105-106]) and founding fathers (mainly the Jesuit priests; Hartman [also chaplain of members of the pioneer column] and Prestige) and sisters (particularly Mother Patrick – member of pioneer column and founder of the Dominican Missionary Sisters (p 63, 90, 91) as an offshoot of the King Williams Dominicans of South Africa) for the colony, and religious establishments in Rhodesia. Also mentioned are Mzilikazi and Lobengula (p 17, 32, 76) – fathers of the Matabele ethnic group that settled South of Zimbabwe while pushing North from South Africa (in a series of invasions).

The author, Brigid Rose Tiernan, is also a member of the SND religious congregation and writes to commemorate the centenary of Empandeni and the ongoing work of the SND in Zimbabwe. The book thus provides a forum for the SNDs to review their apostolate in terms of the past, present and future. The question of relevance in responding to the signs of the times is punctuated by the fact that the author wrote this volume after the SNDs had moved out of both Empandeni and Embakwe to new missions and/or the apostolate.

The diarist has an amazing eye for detail and a vivid photographic memory. Special events and encounters (particularly with flora and fauna) are given in picturesque sketches. For example, she mentions frequent encounters with snakes (p 31, 32, 33, 48, 65, 75) – a feature characteristic of inhabited virgin land. Bullen gives a panoramic view of flora and fauna, landscape, climatic conditions, the Matabele people and their culture.

Some of the events told keep the imagination of reader's (particularly those who are familiar with the history of Zimbabwe) alive – they also elicit further questions. For example, she mentions swarms of locusts devastating crops (p 26, 54, 79, 146) and one wonders which of these locust plagues appears as a point of reference in identifying a person's year of birth among people in pre-literate Zimbabwe! Here there is the reference to "I was born in

the year of the locust pestilence" − *ndakaberekwa gore remhashu.* Another question is: are the founding fathers of Empandeni, Hartman and Prestige the celebrities underlying Jesuit establishments − the Hartman and Prestige houses as preparatory school and student hostel in Harare and the University of Zimbabwe, respectively? The answer is "yes" (p 113).

Sr. Bullen also has a sense of humour. In subtle and overt ways she touches on most of the problems, challenges and gains of early missionaries in Zimbabwe. These founding missionaries of Empandeni are shining examples of piety and creativity (particularly in adapting to new environments and cultures); they were also adept at mingling with the people of the area. From the outset, they prioritised the need to learn the local language, IsiNdebele, made frequent visits to the villages, and minister to the sick and dying.

The main problem centres on inculturation – the missionaries failed to recognise African religious orientation as a starting point in their Christian evangelisation. The diarist mentions the derogatory terms used to refer to the local people ("heathens" or "pagans") (p 14, 39, 51, 83, 114, 130, 141, 142). As a result, the missionaries failed to capture and inculturate, for example, essential cultural norms such as *humwe,* literally translated as "togetherness" and referred to in the diary as a "beer drink work" (p 85) or "hoeing beer drink" (p 124). Converts were discouraged from attending full moon dancing festivals (p 98, 130). Other areas of tension include Christian marriages advocated in a predominantly polygamist society, land ownership (p 177), payment of *lobola*, and "rites-de-passage", such as the homing of the spirits. *Lobola* is negated as "wife buying" (p 64, 113). The mission estate(s) impinged on people's rights and dignity by displacing local people or absorbing them into the mission system. The diarist also mentions gender issues (p 92, 94, 113, 122, 133) which, ironically, also reveal the founding fathers' patronising attitude to the nuns.

It is interesting how some of the problems mentioned above have persisted or become more convoluted (land ownership in particular) during the past century.

Notwithstanding these criticisms, the book is an invaluable resource on the history of the SNDs, the Dominicans and the Jesuits – and, of course, the people of Zimbabwe themselves.

❋ ❋ ❋

Resensent: Dr Erna Oliver, Departement van Christelike Spiritualiteit, Kerk-geskiedenis en Missiologie, Universiteit van Suid-Afrika, Pretoria, Suid-Afrika.

Skokkend. Die kortverhaal-gelykenisse in hierdie boek is beslis nie slaaptyd-stories nie. Dit het ten doel om die leser te ruk tot nadenke en hopelik tot 'n verandering in denkwyse en optrede, want elke leser behoort iewers in een of meer van hierdie eietydse gelykenisse sy eie genadeloosheid te herken. Die stukkende wêreld waarin ons leef verseker dat lesers ook met sekere van die slagoffers in die verhale kan identifiseer. Gewondes weet dat dit nie net skurke is wat weerlose mense aanrand nie. Christene en die Kerk is ook soms geweteloos genadeloos.

Tog bied die boek baie meer as sensasionele nuusstories wat daagliks die bladsye van koerante en tydskrifte vul. Die evangelie word vanuit 'n nuwe vertrekpunt, naamlik die stukkende, liefdelose wêreld waarin Suid-Afrikaners leef, aangebied. In 'n wêreld waar die Bybelse boodskap geneig is om as "ou nuus" of "vervelig" gesien te word, bied hierdie aanbieding 'n vars aanslag. Dit kan nuttig gebruik word om die boodskap aangaande die een ding wat ons Christelike geloof uniek maak, naamlik genade, weer die fokuspunt te maak.

Elke verhaal eindig met 'n kort verwysing na 'n soortgelyke Bybel-verhaal maar met 'n ander uitkoms omdat God 'n bepalende rol daarin speel. Aanhalings uit bekende teologiese werke en 'n gebed rond elke hoofstuk af deur die gedagtes van die leser op die Here, ons genadige God, te vestig.

Die boek spreek tot alle gelowiges en word aanbeveel veral vir predi-kante en ander leiers wat genade behoort te leef. Die gelykenisse slaag daarin om mense bewus te maak van dinge, woorde, houdings en aksies wat genade-loosheid uitbeeld en wat maklik ongesiens, as deel van die professionele manier van dinge (en mense) hanteer, toegepas word.

NG predikant Andries Cilliers is 'n bekende skrywer. Van sy bekend-ste werke sluit in: *Volg my! … tot anderkant kommer, Geloof in die God wat rêrig is,* en *Tye en plek ... God se wil en ek*. Hy is ook 'n bekende rubriek-skrywer vir verskillende kerklike tydskrifte.

✳ ✳ ✳

Coertzen, P (red.) 2009. *Teologie vier 150 jaar: die verhaal van teologiese opleiding op Stellenbosch − die mense en geboue*. Parow: Bybel-Media. 211 bladsye. ISBN 978-086-991-6360. Prys: R184-94.
Resensent: Dr Erna Oliver, Departement Christelike Spiritualiteit, Kerk-geskiedenis en Missiologie, Universiteit van Suid-Afrika, Pretoria, Suid-Afrika.

Vereistes wat aan hierdie soort publikasie gestel word, is gewoonlik dat dit so volledig moontlik moet wees, interessante foto's en illustrasies moet insluit en in 'n aantreklike formaat gedruk moet wees. Die koffietafelgedenkboek van Stellenbosch se Teologiese Fakulteit voldoen aan al hierdie vereistes. Die glansbladsye vertel die verhaal van teologiese opleiding op Stellenbosch deur gebruik te maak van 'n integrale beskrywing en evaluering van die gang van teologie sonder om die verhaal in die blote opteken van datums te laat verval (xii).

Die artikels is van Engelse abstrakte en in die meeste gevalle ook van volledige bronverwysings voorsien. Die insluiting van die feesprogram asook die lyste van dosente, personeel en alumni dra daartoe by om 'n afgeronde geheel te skep. Dit word verder gekomplementeer deur die hoofstuk wat fokus op die terrein en geboue wat die geskiedkundige inligting geografies bind.

Die eerste drie hoofstukke bied 'n geskiedkundige oorsig. Hoofstuk 1: 1652-1963, bespreek die aanloop tot eie teologiese opleiding, die ontstaan van die Teologiese Seminarium, die Leerstryd en sluit af met 'n teologies-historiese oorsig van 1935-1963. Hoofstuk 2: 1963-1999, handel oor die ingrypende veranderings wat plaasgevind het tydens die oorgang vanaf Seminarium na die Teologiese Fakulteit. Hoofstuk 3: 2000-2009 handel oor die gebeure van die laaste dekade toe die VGKSA en UPCSA by die Fakul-teit aangesluit het.

Hoofstuk 5 bied die NG Kerk se perspektief op die geskiedenis. Hoof-stuk 6 verbreed die skopus deur te fokus op die Verenigende Gereformeerde Kerk. Hoofstuk 7 is die enigste gedeelte wat in Engels geskryf is. Die titel daarvan is: Theological education and the Uniting Presbyterian Church of South Africa. Hoofstuk 8 vertel hoe die Kweekskool deur die oë van ander gesien word. Prof Elna Mouton, die eerste vroulike dekaan aan 'n Teologiese Fakulteit, se "Met God op pad tussen herinnering en hoop?" vorm die slot-hoofstuk.

Onder leiding van die eindredakteur het die groot getal medewerkers se insette van uiteenlopende aard saamgevloei in 'n interessante gedenkalbum wat hierdie grootse gebeurtenis in die Suid-Afrikaanse geskiedenis stylvol herdenk.

✳ ✳ ✳

Resensent: Dr Erna Oliver, Departement Christelike Spiritualiteit, Kerk-geskiedenis en Missiologie, Universiteit van Suid-Afrika, Pretoria, Suid-Afrika.

Hierdie is 'n vertaling van die Engelse weergawe van die sewentiende-eeuse Karmelitiese monnik wat bekend was as Broer Lourens van die Opstanding. Die boek vorm deel van die reeks *Tydlose geloofskatte* wat daarop fokus om spesiaal uitgesoekte klassieke publikasies wat 'n beslissende invloed op mense se geloofslewe gehad het, in Afrikaans bekend te stel. Eenvoudig, opreg en op die man af, verduidelik die skrywer hoe dit moontlik is vir gelo-wiges om God se teenwoordigheid prakties in jou alledaagse lewe, werk en omstandighede raak te sien en hoe om in ware toewyding aan God te leef. Wat ook al die taak voorhande (werk, ontspanning, sleurwerk, uitdagende opdragte of gebed), dit is moontlik om alles wat ons doen in liefde en aan-bidding as offer aan die Here te verrig. Die boek bied riglyne waarop die praktiese ervaring van God se teenwoordigheid ook in ons gejaagde lewens werklikheid kan word.

Naas die inleidende dele oor die lewe en werk van Broer Lourens, word die hoofstukke volgens die verskillende genres ingedeel waarin die monnik sy lering weergegee het. Daar is vier gesprekke met Ab Josef de Beaufort, sestien briewe aan verskillende mense, asook geestelike lewens-reëls. Die boek sluit af met 'n hoofstuk oor 'n heilige leefstyl.

Die hoofstuk oor geestelike lewensreëls hanteer sake soos die vol-gende:

- Eerste treë na volmaaktheid
- Noodsaaklik oefening vir die geestelike lewe
- Hoe om met God in ons hart een te word
- Om van God in die alledaagse bewus te word.

Alle gelowiges behoort hierdie boek insiggewend en leersaam te vind. Onge-lukkig, soos ook die geval by ander Lux Verbi-vertalings, is die vertaalwerk nie van hoogstaande gehalte nie.

✳ ✳ ✳

Louw, D 2007. *Wow, God: oor die verrassende binnepret van glo.* Wellington: Lux Verbi. 163 bladsye. ISBN 978 07963 0676 0. Prys: R99-95.
Resensent: Dr Erna Oliver, Departement van Christelike Spiritualiteit, Kerkgeskiedenis en Missiologie, Universiteit van Suid-Afrika, Pretoria, Suid-Afrika.

Indien die leser die stryd om deur die eerste 37 bladsye waarin die voorskrif en vraagskrif vervat is, gewen het, wag die beloning in 32 kort hoofstukke waarin kernbegrippe en geloofskwessies hanteer word. Daar word nie kits-klaar antwoorde gegee nie en ook nie ingewikkelde teologiese diskussies gevoer nie. Die inhoud is beslis dogmatiek vir gewone mense. Sake wat bespreek word, is onder meer liefde, vergifnis, hoop, geluk, lyding, ver-soening, gebed, roetine, seksualiteit, denominasies, ouderdom, vriendskap en die dood. Hierdie sake word met behulp van vrae, anekdotes, Bybeltekste en persoonlike ervarings toegelik en die leser word tot die besef gebring dat geloof nie vervelig is nie, ook nie 'n ontkenning van die pyn en smart van die stukkende wêreld waarin ons leef nie en ook nie 'n pynpil of ontsnappings-roete daaruit nie. Te midde van alles wat met ons en rondom ons gebeur, dra die Here se wonderlike genade ons en dit maak *wow*-deel van geloof.

Louw se vermoë om 'n ding raak te sê stel ingewikkelde teologiese waarhede so eenvoudig maar treffend dat dit beide verstaanbaar en onthou-baar is: Hy sien die Wet van God as die heining wat keer dat geloof verdwaal (p 42).

Ongelukkig is die formaat waarin die boek gedruk is nie heeltemal verbruikersvriendelik nie. Die lettertipe is op plekke te klein en op ander plekke moeilik leesbaar en daar is enkele spelfoute.

Die boek word aanbeveel vir alle gelowiges. Die kwessies wat hanteer word, is relevant vir hedendaagse gelowiges en dit word op 'n vars manier benader wat beslis tot oud en jonk behoort te spreek.

＊＊＊

Van Valen, L J 2008. *Geworteld in Zijn liefde: leven en werk van Andrew Murray*. Dordrecht: De Banier. 419 bladsye. Geen prys vermeld. Inligting beskikbaar: www.debanier.nl.
Resensent: Professor Gideon Thom, Emeritus professor in Historiese en Kontekstuele Teologie, Universiteit van Fort Hare, Alice, Suid-Afrika.

Dit is vreemd dat daar nog nie 'n gesaghebbende Afrikaanse biografie van Andrew Murray (1828–1917) bestaan nie. Die eerste biografie, deur pro-fessor J du Plessis, is in 1920 in beide Nederlands en Engels gepubliseer. Dit is baie volledig, maar gee nie 'n kritiese beoordeling van Murray se denke

nie. Daarom is hierdie nuwe, deeglike en goed gedokumenteerde werk deur 'n onbekende Nederlander 'n belangrike gebeurtenis. Die prestasie is te meer merkwaardig as ons in gedagte hou dat Van Valen nie 'n professionele teoloog of historikus is nie. Op grond van sy ervaring is hy egter uitnemend geskik vir die taak. Hy het reeds biografieë van verskeie Skotse en Walliese kerkleiers gepubliseer, sowel as een van die groot Engelse evangelis, George Whitefield.

Van Valen dek alle aspekte van Murray se lewe, van sy jeugjare op Graaff-Reinet, sy opleiding in Skotland en Nederland, sy bediening in Bloemfontein – met vele besoeke aan die "Overvaal" – sy werk in Worcester en Kaapstad, en dan die res van sy lewe in die "geseënde Wellington". Ten spyte van die sober verteltrant, kom Murray se besondere bekwaamhede, toewyding en veelsydigheid duidelik na vore. Terwyl hy by sommige mense slegs bekend is as 'n "piëtis", is dit duidelik dat sy verhouding met Christus juis die dryfveer was agter sy daadwerklike stappe op baie terreine van die lewe. Hy was inderdaad 'n "piëtis" in die Gereformeerde tradisie, wat enersyds geywer het vir die belewing van die ware geloof "alsmede [voor] de radicale en totale heiliging van alle terreinen van het leven". Daarom het Murray, onder andere, van tyd tot tyd, in belang van geregtigheid en vrede, sy stem laat hoor op die politieke terrein – met name in belang van die twee Noordelike Republieke.

Benewens sy omvangryke kerklike en pastorale werksaamhede, het hy hom, veral in die vroeë jare, beywer vir die oprigting van hoërskole (oa Grey Kollege in Bloemfontein) en onderwyskolleges (oa in Kaapstad en Wellington). Later het hy hom toenemend beywer vir die sending – ook buite die grense van SA. Daarom stig hy, in 1877, "in die geloof", die bekende "Sendinginstituut" op Wellington. Op veelvuldige konferensies – sommige spesifiek vir predikante – het hy oud en jonk geïnspireer met sy visie van heiligmaking, voorbidding, evangelisasie en sending. Meer as 200 boeke uit sy pen is gepubliseer, dikwels in beide Engels en Nederlands, waarvan sommige in verskeie ander Europese en ook 'n aantal Oosterse tale vertaal is – en vandag nog herdrukke beleef.

Die geheim van sy invloed, sê Van Valen, was sy vermoë om, deur volgehoue studie, in 'n atmosfeer van gebed en diepe nadenke, deur te dring tot die kern van 'n saak. Daarby het hy hom daarop toegelê om dit wat hy verstaan het, grondig te deurleef. "Dit maakte zijn bediening zo origineel en uniek." Terselfdertyd kon hy effektief onderskei tussen hoofsaak en bysake. Dit het hom 'n natuurlike leier gemaak, en verklaar miskien waarom Murray ses keer as moderator van die Kaapse Sinode gedien het. Te midde van dit alles was hy, veral in sy later jare, bekend as 'n baie nederige mens.

Van Valen het tereg hoë waardering vir sy diep insig in die gelowige se vereniging met Christus en sy/haar roeping tot 'n vrugbare gebedslewe, ook vir die feit dat hy die kerk opgeroep het om met algehele oorgawe te

soek na "de volle pinksterzegen". Vanweë die omstredenheid daarvan, bestee hy baie aandag aan sy heiligmakingsleer. Hy gee 'n insiggewende beskrywing van sy geestelike ontwikkeling binne die historiese konteks van sy eie worsteling, ook ten opsigte van "geloofsgenesing". Benewens sy eie kritiek op Murray, gee hy ook aandag aan wat ander kritici van hom gesê het. Hy erken die leemtes in sy heiligmakingsleer en die feit dat dit 'n sekere wettiesheid tot gevolg gehad het. Sy swakheid was "de meerwaarde die hij toekent aan de ervaring". Daarmee saam hang sy onderbeklemtoning van die regverdigmaking deur die verdienste van Christus alleen: "Waarom heeft Murray niet zo bevrijdend gesproken over de troost van de toegerekende gerechtigheid van Christus?" Dit is 'n geldige punt van kritiek. Sy mening dat Christene "vorentoe" moes beweeg van regverdigmaking na heiligmaking, het 'n skeiding teweeggebring waar daar geen skeiding mag wees nie.

Ten spyte hiervan oordeel Van Valen dat Murray 'n "Calvinistiese piëtis" genoem kan word. Hier is hy nie baie oortuigend nie. Murray val sekerlik binne die breë Gereformeerde tradisie, maar, as hy die verkiesingsleer verstaan het soos George Whitefield dit verstaan het – by name teenoor John Wesley – het hy dit nogal goed weggesteek. Van Valen sê self dat Murray die geestelike rykdom van die Gereformeerde belydenisskrifte nie genoeg waardeer het nie. Aan die ander kant kan sy beskikbare kategismuspreke vandag nog met groot vrug gelees word. Maar dan kom die vraag weer op waarom Murray hierdie preke – waarvan ongeveer 'n derde ongelukkig verlore geraak het – nie gepubliseer het nie.

Daar is slegs enkele kleiner foute in die werk. Die Gereformeerde Kerk was nie betrokke by die 1885-kerkvereniging in die Transvaal nie, slegs die NG Kerk en die Hervormde Kerk. Die suggestie dat DF Malan op 'n manier deur die Kuyperianisme beïnvloed is, is misleidend. Teologies was Malan ver verwyder van Kuyper. Ten spyte daarvan het die meeste Afrikaanse Kuyperiane egter wel Malan se apartheidsbeleid gesteun. Dit is ook jammer dat sekere argaïese rasseterme soms sonder aanhalingstekens gebruik is.

Met hierdie goed versorgde publikasie het Leen van Valen ons 'n groot diens bewys. Dit is belangrik dat Afrikaanse Christene opnuut van die buitengewoon vrugbare en geseënde bediening van Andrew Murray kennis neem – of hulle nou "fundamentalisties-", liberaal-, charismaties-, "mistiesspiritueel-", Katoliek- of Gereformeerdgesind is. 'n Goeie Afrikaanse vertaling van hierdie biografie sal 'n baie groot leemte vul.

Boeknotas

Prof Christina Landman, Navorsingsinstituut vir Teologie en Religie, Universiteit van Suid-Afrika, Pretoria.

Baker, John 2007. *Keuses wat jou lewe kan verander*. **Vereeniging: Christelike Uitgewersmaatskappy. ISBN 978-1-77000-645-4. 280 pp. Prys R129-95.**
In hierdie (vertaalde) boek word Christen-gelowiges gehelp om keuses te maak wat hulle lewens gelukkiger sal maak. Hulle word aangemoedig om te kies vir vrywees van pyn, vir hoop, vir eerlikheid, vir verandering, vir goeie verhoudings, vir groei en vir genesing. Alhoewel die boek nie werklik die ingewikkeldheid van menswees en verandering verstaan nie, lê die waarde van die boek daarin dat dit mense wel daarvan oortuig dat hulle keuse kan neem. Die lewe van die gelowige is nie maar net een van rondgeslinger word en alles aanvaar nie. 'n Mens kan en moet gesonde keuses in jou lewe neem, en die wysheid wat jy uit jou geloof put, kan daarmee help.

Bid saam, met en vir jou kinders: sakgids vir ouers. **Wellington: Lux Verbi. ISBN-10: 0 7963 0573 0. ISBN-13: 976 07963 0573 2. 112 pp. Prys: R79-95.**
Hierdie is 'n vertaalde, goedbedoelde boekie oor die slaggate en hoogtepunte van ouers se gebede vir hulle kinders. Dit gee riglyne vir ouers oor hoe om te bid wanneer dit laagwater is, en ook wanneer die vloedwaters kom. Daar is ook voorbeelde van gebede vir ouers wat nie die woorde kan vind wanneer hulle kinders se streke hulle woorde by hulle gesteel het nie. Persoonlik voel ek dat gebede nie soveel voorskrifte hoef te hê nie, maar net uit die hart moet kom van 'n ouer wat sink en groei saam met 'n kind.

Bonhoeffer, Dietrich 2008. *Wat dissipelskap kos: genade wat alles van jou vra.* **Wellington: Lux Verbi. ISBN-10: 0 7963 0566 8. ISBN-13: 978 07963 0566 4. 396 pp. Prys: R139-95.**
Hierdie is 'n vertaling van die "Nachfolge" van Dietrich Bonhoeffer, die bekende Duitse teoloog wat in 'n Nazi-konsentrasiekamp gesterf het. Aangesien min Afrikaans-sprekende mense meer Duits magtig is, is dit 'n belangrike publikasie. Dit is aan te bevele dat elke Suid-Afrikaner wat Afrikaans kan lees, hierdie boek van Bonhoeffer onder oë kry. 'n Goeie teoloog skryf met bewoëndheid en oortuiging oor hoe om Christus na die volg wanneer elkeen, staat en kerk inkluis, 'n ander pad aandui. Die boek is goed vertaal deur Annes Nel. En dit was 'n goeie plan om John de Gruchy te vra om 'n inleiding vir die boek te skryf omdat hy 'n kenner van Bonhoeffer is en self ook

situasies in Suid-Afrika deur Bonhoeffer se bril geïnterpreteer het. Die persoon wat De Gruchy se bydrae uit Engels vertaal het, het egter 'n gemors daarvan gemaak. Dit doen nie De Gruchy of die publikasie goed nie. Die boek word egter – dringend – aanbeveel vir leke en akademiese lesers.

Heys, Clifford 2009. *God se name: wat dit vir jou beteken.* **Wellington: Lux Verbi. ISBN 978 07963 0863 4. 160 pp. Prys: R89-95.**
Hierdie is 'n baie bruikbare boek vir dominees. Dit gee 'n oorsig oor die name wat in die Bybel vir God gebruik word. Omdat dit baie historiese notas bevat, is dit ook nuttig vir die kerkhistorikus. Die skrywer, Clifford Heys, is ingelig en oopkop. Hy skryf sowel geleerd as toeganklik. Boonop is hy 'n Suid-Afrikaner en is dit vir 'n verandering nie 'n vertaalde boek nie. Alhoe-wel die skrywer in 'n skamele 160 bladsye ensiklopediese kennis van die Godsname vertoon, is daar tog 'n paar wat ek mis. Wat van Hagar wat God "die Een wat sien" genoem het? En Jona vir wie God "die Een wat liefde be-toon" geword het daar in die benouenis van die vis se maag? Nietemin is hierdie 'n belangrike boek om op die rak te hê, al word die gender-probleem met God se name nie aangeraak nie.

Joubert, Stephan 2009. *Jesus – 'n radikale sprong. Koninkryk, kerk en wêreld: waar pas ek in?* **Vereeniging: Christelike Uitgewersmaatskappy. ISBN 978-1-77000-842-7. 232 pp. Prys: R99-95.**
Dis 'n interessante boek waarin die skrywer op vernuftige manier huidige situasies op Jesus betrek. Sou ons vandag vir Jesus, wat 'n godsdienstige genie, 'n geneser en God self was, herken het as hy hom hier sou kom aan-bied? Dis die vraag wat Joubert in hierdie boek aanspreek. Dis natuurlik 'n totale ontkenning van die historiese Jesus – 'n verrassende aanpak van 'n Nuwe-Testamentikus soos Joubert – maar dit bring tog die kontekstualisering van Jesus vandag op die voorgrond. Ook verbasend is dat die skrywer Jesus in vandag se wêreld wil kontekstualiseer maar verskeie moderne verhale aan-bied om te wys hoe uit plek uit Jesus is – en altyd was. Dit laat die leser wonder oor waarheen die skrywer mik: Moet ons Jesus in ons daaglikse lewe kontekstualiseer, of moet ons juis anders en uit plek word sodat ons soos Jesus kan wees? Hoekom doen die skrywer dan so baie moeite om die uit-dagings van die 3de millennium te beskryf as hy nie wil hê dat ons Jesus by ons huidige uitdagings moet betrek omdat Hy juis uit plek uit is/moet wees nie? Of wil hy juis hê ons moet? Slaan my dronk. Tog is die boek interessant om te lees, juis omdat dit dinge by mekaar uitbring wat niks met mekaar te doen het nie. Of dalk het hulle.

König, Adrio 2009. *'n Perspektief op Openbaring.* **Vereeniging: Christelike Uitgewersmaatskappy. ISBN 978-1-77000-671-3. 429 pp. Prys: R129-95.**

Hierdie is 'n goeie kommentaar op die boek Openbaring. König kyk na Openbaring as beloftes wat reeds vervul is, maar ook weer vervul kan word. Of 'n mens saamstem met hierdie siening of nie, König verskaf soveel verskillende ander perspektiewe op Openbaring dat die leser bemagtig voel om self 'n keuse te maak. Dié wat die Bybel graag "getrou" – oftewel, letterlik – lees, sal heeltemal gemaklik binne König se aanpak voel. König is immers meesterlik daarin om alles in die Bybel met mekaar in verband te bring. Omdat dit egter so 'n verskeidenheid van insigte bied, word hierdie kommentaar aanbeveel vir leke en akademici, vir gewoonte-lesers, denkendes en andersdenkendes.

Meyer, Elza 2008. *Oorwinning: staan op vir God en ervaar sy seën vir jou en jou land.* **Vereeniging: Christelike Uitgewersmaatskappy. ISBN 978-1-77000-657-7. 132 pp. Prys: R69-95.**

Hierdie boekie beveel aan dat die mense van Suid-Afrika hulle na God sal draai sodat die hele Suid-Afrikaanse samelewing kan verander. Hierdie aanbeveling word vanuit die Bybel gewettig, en die *know-how* word uit die Bybel aangehaal. 'n Mens bewonder die skryfster dat sy hierdie groot taak op haar neem in 'n sekulêre samelewing, en 'n mens hoop dat haar volgelinge haar sou ondersteun. 'n Mens wens egter ook dat die boek met groter wysheid en insig in die rol van godsdiens in die huidige Suid-Afrikaanse samelewing geskryf sou wees. Godsdiens kan myns insiens 'n geweldige genesende rol in die Suid-Afrikaanse samelewing speel. Of dit die primitief-teokratiese, naïef-piëtistiese rol is wat die skryfster voorstel, moet nog gesien word.

Nürnberger, Klaus 2009. *Die Bybel: verantwoordelik lees is krities lees.* **Wellington: Lux Verbi. ISBN 978 07963 1035 4. 317 pp. Prys: R129-95.**

Hierdie is 'n basiese inleiding op die lees van die Bybel wat waarskynlik oorspronklik vir voorgraadse studente bedoel is. Die skrywer antwoord ook dringende vrae vanuit sy manier van Bybellees, soos watter rol vroue in die kerk behoort te hê, die verhouding tussen wetenskap en godsdiens, en etiese verantwoordelikheid. Die teologiese insigte in die boek is seker 'n 30 of 40 jaar oud, maar leke-lesers behoort tog veel waarde daaruit te kry.

Ozrovech, Solly 2008. *Die Heilige Gees en Pinkstervolheid.* **Vereeniging: Christelike Uitgewersmaatskappy. ISBN 978-1-77000-526-6. 460 pp. Prys: R129-95.**

Hierdie boek belowe om mense geestelik voor te berei vir Pinksterdienste in die NGKerk sodat God se Gees tydens hierdie dienste met sy kerk kan praat.

Die boek bied interessante leesstof, maar dis nie 'n sistematiese uiteensetting van die Heilige Gees en God se betrokkenheid by mense deur Sy Gees nie. Die boek bestaan uit stukke wat 'n bietjie lukraak saamgeflans is en elkeen 'n vinnige draai by die Heilige Gees gaan maak. Dis nie duidelik waar hierdie stukke en hulle indeling vandaan kom nie. Die stukke getuig eintlik van goeie navorsing, al is dit kunsmatig aan die Heilige Gees gehak. Die skrywer is bekend en bemind, en het hier waarskynlik die goeie samewerking gehad van navorsers en 'n redakteur.

Parrott, Les & Leslie 2008. *Die ouer wat jy graag wil wees: wat jy is, beteken meer as wat jy doen.* Wellington: Lux Verbi. ISBN-13: 978 07963 0731 6. 202 pp. Prys: R109-95.
Die boek bevat nuttige wenke vir ouers oor hoe om op so 'n manier ouer te "wees", dat jou kind jou wil na-aap. Die boek werk met statiese begrippe soos "karaktertrekke" en "kenmerke". Min spasie word gelaat vir die uniekheid van 'n kind, en vir identiteitsvorming by 'n kind – wat dikwels nie is wat die ouer vir die kind in gedagte het of kan beheer nie. Die gevaar bestaan dat die boek "harde" ouers nog harder gaan maak. Die boek is 'n vertaling van die Amerikaanse weergawe, *The parent you want to be* (2008).

Smit, Johan 2007. *Gebed: 'n omvattende gids.* Vereeniging: Christelike Uitgewersmaatskappy. ISBN 978-1-77000-391-0. 599pp. Prys: R159-95.
Die boek is 'n samestelling van gebede uit die Bybel, antieke en moderne outeurs en die internet. Tussenin word 'n bietjie oor gebed gefilosofeer, maar die struktuur van die boek is onduidelik. Die boek het 'n lieflike voorblad en is pragtig uitgegee. Miskien moes daar tog 'n bietjie meer aandag aan die inhoud gegee gewees het.

Smit, Johan 2009. *Jesus aan die woord: Die Bergrede – die preek wat mense nuut maak.* Vereeniging: Christelike Uitgewersmaatskappy. ISBN 978-1-77000-780-2. 344 pp. Prys: R129.95.
Hierdie is 'n Bybelstudie oor die saligsprekinge. Dit bevat aantekeninge as agtergrond, en dan vrae waarmee die Bybelstudeerders die teksgedeelte op hom/haar/hulleself kan betrek. Die studies is 'n bietjie piëtisties en naïef, en ontken die verskriklike omstandighede van die vroeë Christene se wêreld waarin hierdie saligsprekinge ontstaan het. Tog kan dit vandag met vrug gebruik word in Bybelstudiegroepe waar mense die oplossings vir hulle probleme aan hierdie waardevolle teks kan meet. Die Bybelstudies is waarskynlik meer vir ouer mense as vir die jongklomp.

Van Zyl, Tanya 2009. *Coach jou kind vir die lewe.* **Wellington: Lux Verbi. ISBN 987 07963 1042 2. 176 pp. Prys: R139.95.**

Die skryfster wil die *life coaching* wat nou in die korporatiewe wêreld opgang maak, gebruik om klein kinders groot te maak. Die vrae "Waar is jy nou? Waar wil jy wees? En How kan jy dit bereik?" word met leke *God-talk* geïntegreer om *life coaching* in die godsdienstige milieu in te trek. Ouers word geleer om hulle kinders tussen die moontlike en die onmoontlike te laat onderskei, en dan geloof – dit is, die onmoontlike – daarby te voeg om reg te kry wat moontlik is. Die boek getuig tog van groter wysheid en insig as baie van die ander stortvloed boeke wat nou verskyn om kinders groot te kry. Dit help om jou kind op wen-wen-situasies te laat fokus. Dit herinner jou daaraan om grense te stel, maar ook om respekvol met jou kind te kommunikeer. Dis goed om ouers daaraan te herinner, alhoewel dit nie nuwe gedagtes is nie. Die boek is pragtig uitgegee, met 'n CD vir ouers wat te besig is om te lees. Of dit wel gaan help om jou kinders soos 'n besigheid te bestuur, sal ons nog moet sien.

Von Hörsten, Hein 2008. *Pad van die lewe: die kuns van blydskap op jou lewensreis.* **Wellington: Lux Verbi. ISBN-10: 0 7963 0748 2; ISBN-13: 978 07963 748 4. 159 pp. Prys: R99-95.**

Die kuns om gelukkig te wees, is 'n belangrike vaardigheid wat beslis in godsdienstige boeke beskryf moet word. Hierdie boek hanteer die onderwerp egter so swak, dat 'n mens nie weet waarom dit gepubliseer is nie. Dis staaltjies uit suburbia wat onsamehangend saamgestel is, sonder 'n spesifieke fokus. Dit bring goed met onverwagse woordjies by mekaar uit wat niks met mekaar te doen het nie. 'n Laagtepunt in die boek is op bladsy 66 waar die sin "Rooikappie loop nou met 'n selfoon en laserskyfgeweer deur die bos, omdat sy aan die Feministe Party behoort ..." 'n mens laat wonder watse insig die skrywer in die leefwêreld van mense het, en of lesers werklik aan hom blootgestel moet word.

SUBMISSION GUIDELINES
Studia Historiae Ecclesiasticae

RIGLYNE AAN OUTEURS
Studia Historiae Ecclesiasticae

General/Algemeen

- *Studia Historiae Ecclesiasticae* publishes articles in the discipline of Church History/History of Christianity. Articles with an African/South African historical perspective receive priority.
  Studia Historiae Ecclesiasticae publiseer artikels binne die dissipline van Kerkgeskiedenis/Geskiedenis van die Christendom. Artikels met 'n Afrika/Suid-Afrikaanse historiese fokus sal voorkeur geniet.

- A statement confirming that the article is original research, not submitted to or published in another journal, should accompany the article.
  'n Verklaring dat die artikel oorspronklike navorsing is, nie by 'n ander tydskrif ingedien is nie, of reeds in 'n ander tydskrif gepubliseer is nie, moet die artikel vergesel.

- SHE publishes two issues unnually, with a supplement. An author will only be considered to publish one article in one of the issues, and another in the supplement.
  SHE publiseer jaarliks twee uitgawes, met 'n supplement. 'n Outeur kan slegs een artikel in een van die uitgawes publiseer, en 'n verdere artikel in die supplement.

- Two versions of the article must be submitted by e-mail to the Editor in Rich Text format (RTF) or Microsoft Word (MSW). One version must contain the name, address and e-mail address of the author and the second one must be without any identification. All references that could identify the author, such as an indication where the paper was read, may only appear on the first version.
  Twee weergawes van die artikel moet per e-pos aan die Redakteur gestuur word in Rich Text formaat (RTF) of Microsoft Word (MSW). Een weergawe moet die naam, adres en e-posadres van die outeur bevat en die tweede weergawe moet sonder enige identifikasie wees. Alle verwysings wat die outeur kan identifiseer, soos aanduidings van waar die referaat gelewer is, mag slegs in die eerste weergawe verskyn.

- After the initial selection of an article by two reviewers, it will, if necessary, be returned to the author who will then have to implement all alterations. Thereafter, the article must once again be submitted (two versions). The editorial staff retain the right to again submit the improved copy to the referees, should they deem this necessary.

  Ná die aanvanklike keuring van 'n artikel deur twee keurders sal dit, indien nodig, met kommentaar aan die outeur teruggestuur word, wat dan alle verbeteringe moet aanbring en die artikel weer moet aanbied (twee weergawes). Die redaksie behou hulle die reg voor om die verbeterde kopie weer aan keurders voor te lê, indien dit nodig geag word.

- Indicate your **title, name, department, institution, address, e-mail address and contact numbers** separately.

  Verskaf u **titel, naam, departement, instansie, adres, e-posadres en kontaknommers** afsonderlik.

- Subvention fees for *SHE* are **R120-00** per page. An account will be mailed to authors after publication of their article. Most state subsidised institutions cover the subvention fees of authors and can be claimed from the research output fund. Authors not attached to a state subsidised institution, will not pay subvention fees.

  Bladgelde vir *SHE* beloop **R120-00** per bladsy. 'n Rekening vir bladgelde sal aan outeurs gestuur word na publikasie van die betrokke artikel. Die meeste staatsgesubsidieerde instansies betaal die bladgelde van outeurs en kan van die navorsingsuitsettefonds geëis word. Persone wat nie aan 'n staatsgesubsidieerde instansie verbonde is nie, betaal nie bladgelde nie.

Article contents/Artikelinhoud

- SHE publishes articles between 4 000 and 6 000 words, based on original research or a reinterpretation of existing research.

  SHE publiseer artikels wat tussen 4 000 en 6000 woorde lank is, en gebaseer is op oorspronklike navorsing of die herinterpretasie van bestaande navorsing.

- All articles must have an abstract of approximately **150** words. In the case of an Afrikaans article, the abstract must also have an English title and abstract.

  Alle artikels moet van 'n opsomming van ongeveer **150** woorde voorsien wees. Indien die artikel in Afrikaans is, moet die artikel ook 'n Engelse titel en opsomming hê.

- Articles should be submitted that exhibit a clear structure in subtitled paragraphs.
  Artikels wat voorgelê word, moet 'n duidelike struktuur bevat met paragrawe wat onder subtitels ingedeel is.

- **All articles have to be language edited professionally before submission.** Articles in English should use UK English. Inclusive language should be used.
  Alle artikels moet professioneel taalversorg wees voor inhandiging. Artikels in Engels moet UK-Engels gebruik. Inklusiewe taal moet gebruik word.

- Articles must have broad margins and be typed in **double spacing**.
  Artikels moet breë kantlyne hê en in **dubbelspasiëring** getik word.

- Main headings of sections of the article must be typed in **Bold** (upper and lower case), the second heading in *Italics* (upper and lower case), and the third heading ● Ordinary (upper and lower case with a large dot).
  Wanneer van opskrifte gebruik gemaak word, moet die belangrikste opskrif in **Vetdruk** (hoof- en kleinletters) getik word, die tweede opskrif in *Kursief* (hoof- en kleinletters) en die derde opskrif ● Gewoon (hoof- en kleinletters met 'n groot kol).

- *Studia Historiae Ecclesiasticae* follows the widely accepted 'name-date' (or **Harvard System**) method for citations. A publication is cited or referred to in the **text** by inserting the author's last name, year and page number(s) in parentheses, for example (Van Wyk 1988:54-82).
  References to archival/unpublished material are to be placed in **endnotes** in a consistent format. Explanatory notes are also to be incorporated in endnotes. **Please do not make use of footnotes**.
  Studia Historiae Ecclesiasticae maak gebruik van die wyd aanvaarde 'naam-datum' (of **Harvard System**) stelsel vir aanhalings. Indien daar in die **artikel** verwys of aangehaal word uit 'n publikasie, word die outeur se van, jaar en bladsynommer(s) gebruik, byvoorbeeld (Van Wyk 1988:54-82).
  Verwysings na argivale/ongepubliseerde materiaal moet op 'n konsekwente wyse in **eindnotas** geplaas word. Verdere verduidelikings moet ook in eindnotas vervat word. **Moet asseblief nie voetnotas gebruik nie.**

● Short quotations should be placed in the running text, whereas quotations of three or more sentences should be indented.
  Kort aanhalings word in die lopende teks geplaas, terwyl aanhalings van drie of meer sinne geïndenteer word.

● **Abbreviations** may be used in endnotes and in parentheses (without full stops), but preferably not in the text of the article.
  Afkortings mag in endnotas gebruik word (sonder punte), maar verkieslik nie in die artikel self nie.

● References should be listed at the end of the text in alphabetical order under the heading **Works consulted**. Please do not include a complete bibliography of all works consulted, only a list of references **actually** used in the text. The **Harvard System** must be applied, for example:

  Milner, B C 1970. *Calvin's doctrine of the church.* Leiden: Brill.
  Dick, J J 2001. Church history through the ages. *Missionalia* 30(2), 70-89.
  Harmsen, F 1997. The faces of Jesus in art, in Du Toit, C W (ed), *Images of Jesus*, 98-111. Pretoria: Research Institute for Theology and Religion, University of South Africa.

  Aan die einde van die artikel moet bibliografiese verwysings alfabeties gerangskik word onder die opskrif **Bronne geraadpleeg**. Moet asseblief nie 'n volledige bibliografie insluit nie, slegs die **bibliografiese verwysings** wat werklik in die artikel gebruik is. Daar moet van die **Harvard verwysingstelsel** gebruik gemaak word, byvoorbeeld:

  Coertzen, P 1991. *Gepas en ordelik*. Pretoria: RGN-Uitgewers.
  Spoelstra, B 1993. Besinning oor die teologiese ensiklopedie van Kuyper met kerkreg en Diakoniologie as parameters. *In die Skriflig*, 27(1), 24-30.
  Maluleke, T S 1997. What Faricans are doing to Jesus: Will he ever be the same again? in Du Toit, C W, *Images of Jesus*, 185-205. Pretoria: Research Institute for Theology and Religion, University of South Africa.

● Make sure that **citations** and **references** are correct. It is not the responsibility of the editor to check it.
  Maak seker dat **aanhalings** en **verwysing** korrek is. Dit is nie die verantwoordelikheid van die redakteur om dit na te gaan nie.

● Graphics (e g tables, illustrations, etc), will only be included in an article if they are essential to understanding the text. Please provide a hard copy of graphics/illustrations/tables with your article.

Grafiese voorstellings (bv tabelle, illustrasies, ens), sal slegs in 'n artikel ingesluit word indien dit noodsaaklik is ter verduideliking van die artikel. Voorsien 'n harde kopie van grafieke/illustrasies/tabelle, met u artikel.

SUBSCRIPTION FORM

Studia Historiae Ecclesasticae
accredited journal for

The Church History Society of Southern Africa

Please complete this form and mail it as soon as possible, together with the subscription fee, to:

Mrs Nonnie Fouché
Church History Society of Southern Africa
Research Institute for Theology and Religion
University of South Africa
P O Box 392
PRETORIA 0003
South Africa

Name: . . . .

Address: . . . .

. . . .

. . . . **Postal code:** . . . .

Tel no: (h) . . . . **(w)** . . . .

Cell: .. . .

E-mail: . . . .

Total amount included: . . . .

Cheques payable to:

**THE CHURCH HISTORY SOCIETY OF
SOUTHERN AFRICA**

Subscription fees (Three issues annually)
Membership fees SA (p.a.)   R100-00
Subscription: SA Libraries (p.a.)   R100-00
International Subscription/Membership fees (p.a.)   US$40-00;   £25-00;   €35-00
Elsewhere (Africa) (p.a.)   US$30
2005/2006 Issues available at R50-00 per book
Subvention fees (per page)   R120-00

(VAT, POSTAGE AND HANDLING COSTS INCLUDED)