

I'M NOT A FRUIT WHICH FELL FROM A TREE: MIGRANTS' DISCOURSES OF RESISTANCE IN THE CONTEXT OF DEHUMANIZATION AND ECONOMIC EXPLOITATION IN SOUTHERN AFRICA

Buhle MPOFU

University of Pretoria, Faculty of Theology and Religion
Personal e-mail: buhle.mpofo@up.ac.za

I'M NOT A FRUIT WHICH FELL FROM A TREE: MIGRANTS' DISCOURSES OF RESISTANCE IN THE CONTEXT OF DEHUMANIZATION AND ECONOMIC EXPLOITATION IN SOUTHERN AFRICA

Abstract: This discussion highlights how some African foreign migrants living in South Africa articulate resistance to exploitative and corrupt tendencies in what emerges as life affirming and death denying developmental discourses. This article triangulated data collected from a Module PRT112 – an Introduction to Missiology – with data which emerged from a study designed to interrogate the lived experiences of foreign migrants in Johannesburg South Africa. Framed within the postcolonial paradigm, the contribution is premised on the idea that the discourses of African migrants are a viable hermeneutical optic for a theological and developmental agenda which legitimises marginal voices of the poor. At the heart of this critical discussion is a statement; 'I am not a fruit which fell from a tree,' which emerged as a response to ward off and rebuke corrupt public officials who often demand bribes from foreign migrants as a way to keep them intimidated and confined to liminal working conditions in the informal South African economic sector. By interrogating the radical response 'I am not a fruit' alongside data which reflect hostility towards migrants, the study highlights religious resistance to economic exploitation and life denying practices. These articulations are located within the postcolonial resistance discourses which counter neoliberal and dehumanizing tendencies and the study concludes by drawing on Bosnian and Rwandan examples to caution against dehumanization of migrants as it sets parameters for catastrophic genocide and other forms of violence perpetrated in the past.

Keywords: Religion, development, exploitation, migration, dehumanization, postcolonial, South Africa

Citation suggestion: Mpofo, Buhle. "I'm Not a Fruit which Fell from a Tree: Migrants' Discourses of Resistance in the Context of Dehumanization and Economic Exploitation in Southern Africa." *Transilvania*, no. 10 (2021): 42-49.

<https://doi.org/10.51391/trva.2021.10.07>.



Introduction¹

A recent book which aimed at proving that "a Christian ethical reflection on political-economic conduct in South Africa as an alternative to current modernistic ideas" was published by Venter² to produce new Christian ethical insights into the value of new liberal perspectives on the enhancement of the South African political economy. In doing so, there were new Christian ethical insight generated by Venter which inspired this contribution. The book is titled *Christian ethics and political economy*,³ and the authors make this important observation;

"The value-free and relativistic human and scientific discourses have led to an era of ideology. From fascism at the dawn of the century, through liberalism and the associated phenomenon of unfettered statism, (sic) to the current disillusionment of postmodernism and relativism with endeavours towards new mercantilism. All have maintained poverty, inequality and created scepticism amongst both lay persons and academics. Above all else a renewed yearning for moral and ethical direction in political and economic conduct has been created."



Given the instrumentalist uses of religion by people on the move as they navigate hostile landscapes in perilous journeys and negotiating settlement in host communities, we can draw lessons from migrants and refugees⁴ for innovative ways to address poverty and inequality through their creativity and resilience. I am always fascinated by the way in which migrants creatively develop coping mechanisms and subtly express disapproval and protest inhuman treatment, in their quest for survival and recognition of their human dignity, as they seek to meaningfully contribute to economic development both in host and home countries. In one of the recent publications Mpofu⁵ alluded to the critical role played by ‘diasporic’ contributions as he advanced the arguments for recognition of religious cost signaling as a new form of philanthropy, particularly within the African context where there are various traditions which promote charity:

“For most African communities, traditions aim at preserving a sense of identity and belonging. This is achieved through different forms of institutionalization, ranging from loose groups and occasional events via associations and movements to formal organizations. These structures are visible in South African community-based structures such as stokvels, which operate in different social contexts, such as local, national, global, and diasporic ones, and sometimes bridge the difference between them.”

This article triangulated data from an interview which was conducted for a PhD study with recent data collected from a Module PRT112⁶, an Introduction to Missiology provided by the Department of Practical Theology and Mission studies at the University of Pretoria’s Faculty of Theology and Religion (UP FTR). Five assignments submitted in partial fulfilment for the module were randomly selected to highlight the contextual realities of what students identified as critical contextual challenges which need an urgent response from the Church in South Africa. These include but are not limited to crime, poverty, violence, presence of foreign migrants, drugs, and substance abuse, abandoned children and prostitution. In this assignment, students were required to demonstrate how the challenges they identified in their respective communities could be addressed through concepts of *keryma*, *diakonia*, *koinonia* and *leitourgia* as defined by Kritzinger et al.⁷ It emerged that most students were overwhelmed by the inadequate missional responses to these challenges and felt that the church should do more to be visible in local communities especially given the recent devastating impact caused by COVID-19 on communities that were already reeling under the effects of these social ills. Of concern, the majority of students equated the presence of migrants with crime and violence and I was not confident that they have a positive view on the presence of migrants in South Africa. Such competency will have to be provided through theological training which empower them to address such challenges without fueling xenophobic tension which are simmering alongside dehumanizing anti-immigrant rhetoric prevalent in

both the private and public discourses.

It is important to mention from onset that the findings discussed in this contribution are not a representative sample of the experiences of all communities and migrants in South Africa. First, we discuss discourses on religion and developmental challenges as identified by students within the Module PRT112, then we move on to unpack and analyze statements from data which was collected among African Migrants on Mayfair Johannesburg. This contribution is premised on the idea that African migrants and religious presuppositions are a viable hermeneutical optics for a developmental agenda which legitimises marginal voices of the poor who yearn for economic freedom and search for opportunities on the margins of society. In the sections that follow I briefly discuss the statements which inspired this article then highlight the examples of xenophobic exploitation to interrogate the interface between religion and development before analyzing statements from data which was collected among African Migrants on Mayfair Johannesburg to demonstrate how these articulations emerged as postcolonial counter resistance discourse which militates against neoliberal and exploitative tendencies of the powerful elites.⁸ In a study that I have alluded to,⁹ participants demonstrated this kind of resistance through protest articulations that denounced all forms of marginalization and exploitation on the basis of nationality. This can be observed in the statement which inspired this contribution as cited from a male participant below:

“I’m not a fruit that fell from a tree and they must come and eat. I have a father, I have a mother, I have friends, I have a family, I have a country, and I have a home also. So, people must not look us like I’m coming from nowhere, I didn’t fall from a tree.”¹⁰

As a protest, the statement “I’m not a fruit that fell from a tree and they must come and eat” demonstrates how Sam (not his real name) – like some migrants – draw from the analogy of ‘sowing and reaping’ to articulate some kind of resistance to economic exploitation. In 2013 the Global Migration Group¹¹ published a thematic paper on “Exploitation and abuse of international migrants, particularly those in an irregular situation: a human rights approach” in which they note that

“Migrants, particularly those in irregular situations, are highly vulnerable to being exploited during their migration journey or upon arriving in their destination. Yet ‘exploitation’ is a concept that is not clearly understood... paper focuses on rights-based approaches to addressing the exploitation of migrants, irrespective of the category attributed to them at a given stage of the migration process...”¹²

Locals who exploit foreigners often take advantage of their conditions which often depict a struggle for survival and quest for quality of life within a hostile context with rejection in a life on the margins of society. Those in ‘irregular situations’

become easy targets and their lives are situated within a contested struggle for recognition, human dignity and search for identity through intersecting processes which are reflected in migrant expressions and identity constructions in socio-economic transformation. These trajectories demonstrate how contested processes of socio-economic and religion intersect in migrant identity constructions¹⁵. For Sam, the message to corrupt officials who demand bribes from foreigners in Johannesburg is that migrants are ‘not a fruit that fell from a tree’ and harvested when ready; he would rather protest such practices and remind those who would dare to listen that migrants are also human beings, with a human dignity (created in the image of God) and like local South Africans, they have families (who need financial support) in host communities and back in their home countries. So, migrants and refugees cannot be expected to use their hard-earned money for bribing corrupt officials. This is a protest, albeit, subtle and well calculated to avoid provoking the powerful who stand ready to mete the force on those who resist the system.

A fruit is a natural product from the trees. It is harvested by farmers when it ripe or collected from the forests by those who go hunting. In Africa the concept of hunting for fruits is common particularly in the countryside, but in urban cities fruits are bought at the marketplaces where farmers have supplied them. When Sam declares that he is not a fruit his message is intended to protest against corrupt South Africans who want to exploit migrants without appreciating that they work hard to earn a living and contribute not just by sending remittances to their home countries, but also contribute to the development of south African communities. Like ordinary South Africans, they earn a living through hard work, pay taxes,¹⁴ and invest or contribute to the economy as they work and make a living as they pursue safe and fulfilling lives. To indicate that “...I have a mother, I have friends, I have a family, I have a country, and I have a home also. So, people must not look us like I’m coming from nowhere, I didn’t fall from a tree” is to affirm human dignity in the face of dehumanizing exploitation. Therefore, exploiting migrants and refugees amounts to a violation of human right and dignity. According to the International Labor Organization OICD/ILO¹⁵ the report titled, *How Immigrants contribute to South Africa’s Economy* shows that

“Immigration is intrinsically linked with South Africa’s history, and migrant labour contributes significantly to the economy... The report examines empirically how immigrants affect key segments of the economy. ...[and] analyses the political and historical context of immigration and suggests ways to maximise the impact of immigrants in different contexts through appropriate policy responses. The report [also] highlights the fact that the impact of immigration is not straightforward...[but] depends on the country context and economic conditions... [suggesting that the] country can maximise the positive impact of immigration by improving policies to better manage and integrate immigrants so that they can invest and contribute to the economy where they work and live while staying safe and leading fulfilling lives.” (p.3)

The migrants’ threat to fair treatment and right to human dignity is constantly reflected in the manner in which they are exploited during transit and in host communities. Migrants often face a myriad of challenges and are often vulnerable to exploitative tendencies due to a number of reasons depending on their location and circumstances. In a study conducted in 2015¹⁶ migrant participants indicated that even when they ran their own businesses, they are always treated unfairly by local South Africans because they are not South African. Such ill treatment is worsened by language and cultural barriers and this marginalization is in spite of the fact that some foreigners have their own businesses and created employment opportunities for local South Africans. As one of the participants, Rachel (not her real name) pointed out below;

“...They call us *makwerekwere*...I’m having that saloon I’m the only foreigner in that saloon...And sometimes they will be busy; I will sit alone like there is nobody to communicate with. You know when they talk the language and going on and sometimes if a customer comes looking for me, they will divert the customer with their language and there is nothing that I will do because I’m not South African.”¹⁷

Locals resort to labeling migrants as ‘*makwerekwere*’ as they feel threatened by their presence because of competition for limited resources and job opportunities. As Orobator¹⁸ observed during his field work in East Africa,

“Refugees [and migrants] are rejected by host communities for whom their presence portends disaster for their already strained economic and ecological resources. Quite clearly, for “many Third World Countries...refugees represent an unacceptable strain on their limited resources.”

According to the Global Migration Group¹⁹

“...Even before migrants leave home, they may be subject to a degree of ‘exploitation’ by recruitment agencies that overcharge ... ‘Exploitation’ has also been used to refer to ... corrupt border and other officials who coerce migrants to pay bribes in order to continue their journey, or for the return of their documents, or to be released from detention. Migrants may be robbed, extorted, assaulted, held to ransom, beaten or even raped by traffickers, smugglers, border officials or others during their journey. Women and girls, and also men and boys, may be compelled to exchange sex for smuggling services or basic needs like food or accommodation throughout the journey. Unscrupulous landlords may take advantage of migrants’ powerlessness to charge exorbitant fees for substandard accommodation... Smugglers may put lives of migrants in danger, charge exorbitant fees and threaten migrants or their families who fail to pay them, taking advantage of their vulnerability in doing so... all of these examples of ‘exploitation’ constitute distinct crimes that should be investigated as such.”



Religion and Development within the context of migration

Although not exhaustive, the following literature highlights how scholars have seriously undertaken to explore the interface of religion and development in the African context. In order to help us understand the exploitation of migrants in host communities, the role of religion needs to be appreciated in these intersections with development. For example, scholars like Bompani²⁰ have studied *Religion and Development: Tracing the Trajectories of an Evolving Sub-Discipline. Progress in Development Studies* and Trimikliniotis et al²¹ examined *Globalisation and Migrant Labour in a 'Rainbow Nation': A Fortress South Africa?* The concept of development has been severely criticized from the angles of postcolonial studies and the post-development debate.²² Moreover, scholars from Africa have highlighted that in the UN development discourse 'development' is still a Western-centered and secular-framed concept of social transformation that has to be re-centered regarding a development agenda initiated by local (religious) communities and formulated in coherence with African cultures, cosmologies and world views in the context of migration,²³ particularly in African contexts, where religion should be regarded not only in an instrumental sense but as a decisive factor in processes of social transformation, as religious conceptualizations are among the crucial elements informing the situated knowledge of the needs people formulate, and as religious structures enhance their capacities to act self-determinedly.

It has been observed that religion plays an important role in the development of African communities. For example, in one of the contributions, titled *Re-thinking philanthropy as religious cost signalling in the context of socio-economic transformation in South Africa*, Mpofu²⁴ highlighted how religious communities played a major role in addressing the impact of poverty during the COVID-19 lockdown in South Africa. Understood from a developmental perspective, religion has a variety of instrumental purposes which derive from religious values to mobilise communities to work together for a common good. As Mpofu²⁵ observed

"Religion has long been thought of as a social mechanism for enforcing cooperation within cultural groups. One of the ways in which it may successfully accomplish this is by using religious commitment as a costly signaling device. All religions have rituals, taboos, and other requirements that can be very costly in terms of time, money, or effort. Fasting, tithing, frequent, and lengthy prayer and/or religious services, and dietary requirements that are difficult to follow require a good deal of commitment. Thus, religious commitment can be a signal of commitment to the group's values that is hard to fake, and a signal that one is likely to be a reliable, cooperative group member."

There is also a wide range of scholarly work which has explored the transformative role of religion in developmental agenda, discourses and practices -particularly from the

perspective of addressing the exploitative tendencies of transnational multinational corporations. The example that quickly comes to mind is the Bench Marks Foundation²⁶ a faith-based organization which monitors the impact of mining activities on poor communities in Rustenburg South Africa. According to information on their website, this "is a unique organisation in the area of corporate social responsibility (CSR) and monitors corporate performance against an international measuring instrument, the Principles for Global Corporate Responsibility."²⁷ Another good practice example of community-based faith responses and contribution to development is that of the Southern African Faith Communities' Environmental Institute (SAFCEI) which is a 'multi-faith organization committed to supporting faith leaders and their communities...to increase awareness, understanding and action on eco-justice, sustainable living and climate change.'²⁸

Until recently, the role of religion in developmental agenda has been widely ignored by governments, policy makers and international agencies who have now appropriately acknowledged the role of religion in development. There have been recent developments showing improved interest in religion and development studies. This is evident in the works of, among others, Swart²⁹ through his work; *Churches as a Stock of Social Capital for Promoting Social Development in Western Cape Communities* explored the role of local churches in the development of local communities in the western cape province, South Africa and others such as Adogame and Shankar³⁰ who take the role of religion in the lives of people on the moves seriously. Religion, and spirituality in particular are instruments which most migrants utilize as coping mechanisms in perilous journeys and negotiating peaceful settlement in host communities, where they search for economic opportunities. During the study conducted in 2015,³¹ there were respondents who indicated that their spirituality was a resource for coping with the challenges which they encountered, together with prayer from which they drew their daily sustenance. This was evident in the following artic"... we still need to vigorously preach the word of God if we understand the love it doesn't matter where I sleep or where I live should understand that love and the word of God doesn't have boundaries. The Bible is all over the world."³²

Respondents also exhibited the image of a God who is universal and works in ways that bring people from different nations to live and worship together in diverse communities which span across barriers of language, ethnicity, gender, race, color, political and economic differences, as one respondent noted:

"Diversity helps us to understand that God is universal, because the same God they are bringing from Cameroon is the same God whom we are worshipping here, same God for a person who has come from Zimbabwe and the same God for a person who is originally from here so it teaches us that God is God everywhere."³³

These profound statements highlight innovative and instrumental uses of religion as a form of radical resistance and demonstrates the resilience of migrants in their quest for a flourishing life.

Xenophobic exploitation and dangers of labelling

What the students identified as challenges in PRT112 was consistent with what emerged in a study with African migrants worshipping in Protestant congregations in Johannesburg as they lamented the levels of crime, poverty, xenophobic violence, drugs, and substance abuse, abandoned children, prostitution, and intimidation which they often receive from corrupt public officials demanding bribes. Even more telling, was the reality that there were students who identified the 'presence of foreigners' as one of the challenges impeding on the mission of the church in South Africa. Although there was a commendable effort to isolate criminal migrant activities such as selling of drugs and crime, there were students who framed the general presence of migrants as a challenge. Students who exhibited such views considered the presence of migrants as an additional burden to the church.

Although the Church is not directly associated with the challenges that were identified, lack of community engagement results in a missional dichotomy between what the church preaches and the reality of crime, exploitation and corrupt activities in local communities. Therefore, it is important that we examine this phenomenon, and in particular, the implications of corrupt activities of those tasked with maintaining law and order as means to ensuring economic development and a flourishing life for all citizens. According to the HSRC Policy Brief No. 4 refugees and asylum seekers constitute some of the marginalized groups in south Africa and therefore interrogating development from the perspective of migrant's experiences and discourses is a necessary and an urgent task.³⁴ According to Sonyika,³⁵

"...South Africa hosted about 273 488 refugees and asylum seekers, of whom 84% come from sub-Saharan Africa, in 2018 [and] The policy and law applying to refugees and asylum seekers in South Africa is largely progressive...[as] contained in the Refugee Act of 1998. [and] Associated rights to well-being, equality before the law, human dignity and non-discrimination are also enshrined in South Africa's bill of rights. Refugees can settle anywhere in the country and enjoy freedom of movement. Special permits have also allowed economic migrants from Lesotho and Zimbabwe to work and live in the country. This approach is in contrast to the majority of African states, which put refugees in camps, withholding several rights to social support, work and free movement...But in practice, refugees in South Africa also face many challenges in accessing their rights to social protections such as legal documents, social grants and security of stay. The government's progressive ideas are seldom reflected by the officials entrusted with implementing them..."

Given the botched implementation of these progressive immigration policies, this study is premised on the idea that the experiences of African migrants are a viable hermeneutical optics for a developmental agenda, which, when properly articulated, legitimises marginal voices of the poor in line with the agenda set out by Venter³⁶ who succinctly observed that:

"the current disillusionment of postmodernism and relativism with endeavours towards new mercantilism... have maintained poverty, inequality and created scepticism.. [and there is a need] for a renewed yearning for moral and ethical direction in political and economic conduct..."

At the heart of this critical discussion is a statement; '*I am not a fruit which fell from a tree,*' which emerged in response towards corrupt activities of some public and security officials who often demand bribes from foreign migrants working in the informal economic sector in South African communities. By declaring that he is not a fruit, this contribution locates these articulations within postcolonial counter resistance and religious discourses which militate against neoliberal and exploitative tendencies of the current global economic architecture. Despite enormous resources within the continent, Africa is riddled with wars, poverty and high levels of unemployment which have been worsened by the impact of corona virus COVID-19 prompting scholars like Bart-Williams to assert:

"One thing that keeps me puzzled, despite having studied finance and economics at the world's best Universities, the following question remain unanswered; why is that 5000 units of our currency is worth one unit of your currency when we are the ones with gold reserves.... The Western world depends on Africa in every possible way... by systematically destabilizing the wealthiest African nations and their systems. And all that backed by a huge PR campaign...established on the postcolonial free meal system."³⁷

This startling observation that the Western world depends on Africa, [which they exploit] by systematically causing instability in the continent, was made by Mallece Bart-Williams from Sierra Leone during one of her presentations at the TEDx event hosted by TED Conferences.³⁸ Building on a similar symbiosis, Patrice Lumumba³⁹ was more damning as he creatively engaged his audience through a lecture titled '*Africa is on the dinner table eaten by superpowers*' in a public lecture presented at Rwanda National Security Symposium on May 14, 2018.⁴⁰ The two African scholars raise similar observations; that despite the defeat of colonialism in Africa, the Western nations continue to have economic dominance through sustained neo-liberal tactics involving internal conflicts and exploitation of resources. As a result, Africans are left scrambling for what Lumumba calls 'crumbs falling under the dinner table' calling for decolonisation of African Religion, Culture and Economy at the 6th Annual Memorial



Lecture. For him, emancipation of Africans from economic deprivation, wars and poverty which are so common in the continent, will require that Africans decolonise – not just our culture of violence, but also religions towards a postcolonial economic freedom.⁴¹ Even Achile Mbembe⁴² underscored the significance of decolonising our minds as he eloquently articulated the idea that we must treat religion with caution as it has been entangled with parts of the colonial project.

Despite hard work migrants in South Africa have been labelled and called ‘*makwerekwere*’ other derogatory names. Calling people names has the potential to expose them not just to exploitation and abuse but has the potential for setting parameters for genocide. Our recent history is a clear reminder on how such a catastrophe is possible. Two genocides happened between 1992 and 1995 when there was a war in Bosnia and Herzegovina with over 100 000 Bosniaks brutally killed in a devastating war that left cities razed to their foundations after they were dehumanised and stripped of their human dignity.⁴³ The Bosnian Serbs were so indiscriminate in their violence that they even shelled hospitals and places of worship rape was used as a weapon of war and communities were obliterated in the ethnic cleansing that was mainly carried out by the Serbs. In Africa, another genocide was taking place in 1994 when almost 20% of the Rwandese population was wiped out in a space of three months during the Rwanda Genocide. The Tutsi minority as well Hutu and Twa people who were deemed moderate or seen as sympathisers were slaughtered on the streets of Rwanda after being labelled ‘cockroaches and snakes to be killed.’⁴⁴ As Ndahiro⁴⁵ observed, in order “[f]or genocide to occur, it must be preceded by the dehumanisation of a group. To dehumanise means to deny the humanity of someone, reducing them to sub-humans” As Just like what was unfolding in Bosnia, rape was used as a weapon of war by Hutu militias called *Impuzamugambi* and the *Interahamwe*. Like in Bosnia, people were also slaughtered in places of worship and hospitals – some butchered with machetes and some burnt alive. While there was some intervention in Bosnia, the Tutsis of Rwanda were on their own as no single government or agency meaningfully intervened to stop the genocide. Instead, European countries sent in planes to evacuate their own citizens at the beginning of the genocide, while defenceless

Africans were left to die.

Revisiting this painful history highlights the many common denominators between these two genocides was that the victims were first stripped of their human dignity through dehumanising language which incited violence. We now know that in Rwanda, the TRLM officially broadcast hateful messages through their widely followed radio station, and thereby incited violence. By referring to Tutsi as “*inyenzi*” which means “cockroaches” the Tutsi were stripped of their human dignity and therefore cast as deserving of any inhuman treatment – we all know how it ended – and we must be grateful that Rwanda put this painful past behind themselves and they are now one of Africa’s fastest developing nations. To set the context for a Bosnian genocide, Muslims and Croats were called “animals” and then were treated as such. Not long ago the world witnessed foreign nationals burnt alive in South Africa at the height of 2008 and 2015 xenophobic attacks. Therefore, we should be alarmed when foreign migrants are labelled and dehumanised because history has clearly demonstrated that dehumanising people lays a foundation for genocide. Such a call is urgent, given the simmering tensions in the light of increased poverty, unemployment and economic meltdown which has been exacerbated by COVID-19 lockdowns.

Conclusion

Migrants are ‘*not fruits*’, they are not ‘*makwerekwere*’, ‘*cockroaches*’, or whatever derogatory terms xenophobic locals may use, we must remember they are human beings created in the image of God, and therefore deserving of a just and human life – just like all of us. Therefore, we need to continuously explore the evolving field of religion and development through transdisciplinary scholarship which brings together a wide range of social science disciplines as well as religious and theological studies to explore ways in which we can mitigate xenophobic tensions and address the exploitation of vulnerable migrants in South Africa. Such scholarly engagement should also critique exploitative tendencies of current framework of ‘development’ and expose dominant Western notions of so called ‘sustainable development’ which exclude and divide poor communities.

Notes:

1. This article uses the research available in Buhle Mpofo, *When the People Move, the Church Moves: A Critical Exploration of the Interface Between Migration and Theology Through a Missiological Study of Selected Congregations Within the Uniting Presbyterian Church of Southern Africa in Johannesburg*. PhD Thesis, University of KwaZulu-Natal S.A., 2015.
2. Jan Charl Marthinus Venter (ed.), *Christian ethics and political economy: Markers for a developing South Africa* (AOSIS Publishing, 2020). Accessed 07 July 2021: <https://books.aosis.co.za/index.php/ob/catalog/book/220>
3. *Ibid.*, p1.
4. In South Africa, the terms migrants, refugees, and asylum seekers are used interchangeably as there are no refugee camps which isolate them. For purposes of this study, these terms must be understood to imply similar categories of foreigners who live in the country. In this regard, the words do not carry any difference although they are often collectively “referred to as regular, documented, undocumented,

- smuggled, trafficked, forced, voluntary, migrant workers, and stranded.” See the paper by the Global Migration Group, *Exploitation and abuse of international migrants, particularly those in an irregular situation: A human rights approach* (2013), p. 3. https://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/2013/2013_GMG_Thematic_Paper.pdf. Accessed September 08, 2021.
5. See B. Mpofu, “Re-thinking philanthropy as religious cost signalling in the context of socio-economic transformation in South Africa.” *Transilvania*, no. 9 (2020): 9-15.
 6. B. Mpofu, *Introduction to Missiology* (Pretoria: University of Pretoria Faculty of Theology and Religion, 2021). (PRT112).
 7. J.J. Kritzinger, P. Meiring, and W.A. Saayman, *On Being Witnesses* (Johannesburg: Halfway House – Orion Publishers, 1994).
 8. This has been an underlying objective on most of my recent scholarly works. For example, see the following texts: B. Mpofu and F. Settler, “The Limits of Social Responsibility with Respect to Religion And Migration in South Africa.” *Journal for the Study of Religion* 30, no. 2 (2017): 12-31; Buhle Mpofu, “Migration, xenophobia and resistance to xenophobia and socio-economic exclusion in the aftermath of South African Rainbowism.” *Alternation* 26, no. 1 (2019): 153-173.
 9. Mpofu, *When the People Move*.
 10. *Ibid.*, 156.
 11. Global Migration Group. *Exploitation and abuse of international migrants, particularly those in an irregular situation: A human rights Approach*, 2013. https://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/2013/2013_GMG_Thematic_Paper.pdf Accessed 08 July 2021.
 12. *Ibid.*, 11.
 13. For more details on migrants and identity construction processes, see B. Mpofu, “I’m Somali and I’m Christian: A dilemma for religion and identity in the context of migration in Southern Africa,” *HTS Teologiese Studies/ Theological Studies* 77, no. 3, a6678 (2021). <https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v77i3.6678>.
 14. Given that most of migrants and refugees are in the informal sector, it can be argued that some of them do not pay taxes because they are not formally employed. Granted, but we must not forget that there are no shops designated for migrants, we all purchase products with readily included value added tax (Vat) in every item sold in the formal market. Therefore, we all contribute to economic development not just buy purchasing, but also through taxes.
 15. Available at: OECD/ILO (2018), *How Immigrants Contribute to South Africa’s Economy*, OECD Publishing, Paris. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/9789264085398-en>. Accessed 08 July 2021, 3.
 16. Mpofu, *When the People Move*, 156.
 17. *Ibid.*, 156.
 18. A. Orobator, *From Crisis to Kairos: The Mission of the Church in the Time of HIV/AIDS, Refugees and Poverty* (Nairobi: Pauline, 2005), 167.
 19. Global Migration Group, 22-23.
 20. See Barbara Bompani, “Religion and Development: Tracing the Trajectories of an Evolving Sub-Discipline. Progress in Development Studies,” 19, no. 3 (2019): 171–85.
 21. See Nicos Trimikliniotis, Steven Gordon, and Brian Zondo, “Globalisation and Migrant Labour in a ‘Rainbow Nation’: A Fortress South Africa?” *Third World Quarterly* 29, no. 7 (2008): 1323–39.
 22. Aram Ziai, *Development Discourse and Global History: From Colonialism to the Sustainable Development Goals* (London, New York: Routledge, 2016).
 23. Adogame and Shankar.
 24. Mpofu, “Re-thinking Philanthropy.”
 25. *Ibid.*, 10.
 26. More details are available at: <https://www.bench-marks.org.za/>.
 27. <https://www.bench-marks.org.za/>
 28. See <https://safcei.org/about-us/> for more details.
 29. Ignatius Swart, “Churches as a Stock of Social Capital for Promoting Social Development in Western Cape communities,” *Journal of Religion in Africa* 36, no. 3-4 (2006): 346–78.
 30. See Afe Adogame and Shobana Shankar (eds.), *Religion on the Move! New Dynamics of Religious Expansion in a Globalizing World* (Leiden: Brill, 2012).
 31. Mpofu, *When the People Move*.
 32. *Ibid.*, 165.
 33. *Ibid.*, 164.
 34. It is also important to mention that in South Africa refugees, asylum seekers and economic migrants are bundled together as if they were in the same category. This is partly because the South African government does not advocate for refugee camps as they want foreigners to be integrated in society. Although this is a good policy, it justifies government neglect and abdication of its responsibility to provide safety to those fleeing wars in their countries. See Sonyika Adejiwon, “How South Africa is denying refugees their rights: what needs to change.” *The Conversation*: Accessed 07 July 2021 from: <https://theconversation.com/how-south-africa-is-denying-refugees-their-rights-what-needs-to-change-135692>
 35. Adejiwon, “How South Africa.”
 36. M. Bart-Williams, “Africa and the World,” TED Conferences talk. Available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=AfnruW7yERA> Accessed



28 March 2021.n.p.

37. Technology, Entertainment, Design (TED) conferences are organised by an American media organization owned by Sapling Foundation that posts talks online for free distribution under the slogan “ideas worth spreading.” Available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=AfnruW7yERA> [Accessed 28 March 2021].
38. Technology, Entertainment, Design (TED) conferences are organised by an American media organization owned by Sapling Foundation that posts talks online for free distribution under the slogan “ideas worth spreading.” Available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=AfnruW7yERA> [Accessed 28 March 2021].
38. See <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pYckyXuHdYg> [Accessed 28 March 2018].
39. Ibid., n.p.
40. A. Mbembe, *On Postcolony*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001.
41. Ibid., n.p.
42. See Insight 2019. Dehumanization of Muslims made Karadzic an icon of far-right extremism. Available at: <https://justicehub.org/article/dehumanisation-muslims-made-karadzic-icon-far-right-extremism/> Accessed 08 July 2021.
43. See K. Ndahiro, “Dehumanization: How Tutsis were reduced to cockroaches, snakes to be killed,” March 13, 2014. Available at: <https://www.newtimes.co.rw/section/read/73836>. Accessed 08 July 2021.
44. Ibid., 1.

Bibliography:

- Adejiwon, Sonyika. “How South Africa is denying refugees their rights: what needs to change.” *The Conversation*. Accessed 07 July 2021 from: <https://theconversation.com/how-south-africa-is-denying-refugees-their-rights-what-needs-to-change-135692>
- Adogame, Afe, and Shobana Shankar, eds. *Religion on the Move! New Dynamics of Religious Expansion in a Globalizing World*. Leiden: Brill, 2012.
- Bart-Williams, M. “Africa and the World.” TED Conferences talk. Available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=AfnruW7yERA> Accessed 28 March 2021.
- Bompani, Barbara. “Religion and Development: Tracing the Trajectories of an Evolving Sub-Discipline. *Progress in Development Studies*,” 19, no. 3 (2019): 171–85.
- Global Migration Group, *Exploitation and abuse of international migrants, particularly those in an irregular situation: A human rights approach* (2013). https://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/2013/2013_GMG_Thematic_Paper.pdf.
- Kritzinger, J.J., P. Meiring, and W.A. Saayman. *On Being Witnesses*. Johannesburg: Halfway House – Orion Publishers, 1994.
- Mbembe, A. *On Postcolony*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001.
- Mpofu, Buhle, and F. Settler. “The Limits of Social Responsibility with Respect to Religion And Migration in South Africa.” *Journal for the Study of Religion* 30, no. 2 (2017): 12–31.
- Mpofu, Buhle. “I’m Somali and I’m Christian: A dilemma for religion and identity in the context of migration in Southern Africa.” *HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies* 77, no. 3, a6678 (2021). <https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v77i3.6678>.
- Mpofu, Buhle. “Migration, xenophobia and resistance to xenophobia and socio-economic exclusion in the aftermath of South African Rainbowism.” *Alternation* 26, no. 1 (2019): 153–173.
- Mpofu, Buhle. “Re-thinking philanthropy as religious cost signalling in the context of socio-economic transformation in South Africa.” *Transilvania*, no. 9 (2020): 9–15.
- Mpofu, Buhle. *Introduction to Missiology*. Pretoria: University of Pretoria Faculty of Theology and Religion, 2021.
- Mpofu, Buhle. *When the People Move, the Church Moves: A Critical Exploration of the Interface Between Migration and Theology Through a Missiological Study of Selected Congregations Within the Uniting Presbyterian Church of Southern Africa in Johannesburg*. PhD Thesis, University of KwaZulu-Natal S.A., 2015.
- Ndahiro, K. “Dehumanization: How Tutsis were reduced to cockroaches, snakes to be killed.” March 13, 2014. Available at: <https://www.newtimes.co.rw/section/read/73836>. Accessed 08 July 2021.
- OECD/ILO. *How Immigrants Contribute to South Africa’s Economy*. Paris: OECD Publishing, 2018. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/9789264085398-en>. Accessed 08 July 2021, 3.
- Orobator, A. *From Crisis to Kairos: The Mission of the Church in the Time of HIV/AIDS, Refugees and Poverty*. Nairobi: Pauline, 2005.
- Swart, Ignatius. “Churches as a Stock of Social Capital for Promoting Social Development in Western Cape communities.” *Journal of Religion in Africa* 36, no. 3–4 (2006): 346–78.
- Trimikliniotis, Nicos, Steven Gordon, and Brian Zondo. “Globalisation and Migrant Labour in a ‘Rainbow Nation’: A Fortress South Africa.” *Third World Quarterly* 29, no. 7 (2008): 1323–39.
- Venter, Jan Charl Marthinus, ed. *Christian ethics and political economy: Markers for a developing South Africa*. AOSIS Publishing, 2020
- Ziai, Aram. *Development Discourse and Global History: From Colonialism to the Sustainable Development Goals*. London, New York: Routledge, 2016.