

# Mapping Places and Identities through Contemporary Bulawayo Popular Song Texts

**Nkululeko Sibanda**

<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2950-7767>

University of Pretoria, South Africa

[nkululeko.sibanda@up.ac.za](mailto:nkululeko.sibanda@up.ac.za)

**Nozizwe Dhlamini**

<https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0240-4423>

Lupane State University, Zimbabwe

## Abstract

In this article, the authors examine the symbiotic relationship that exists between places and identities in Bulawayo, Zimbabwe, through contemporary song texts. They borrow Julia Kristeva's concept of intertextuality to trace the sources of spatial textual referents embedded in song texts and examine the ways in which they inform the emergence and consolidation of identities. Through analysing selected song texts from the late Beatar Mangethe, Khuxxman and Lovemore "Majaiwana" Tshuma, the authors underscore the spatial senses in which these selected song texts define and shape identities and class distinctions in Bulawayo's townships. Finally, they describe the identities of characters who are sketched into the places that Mangethe, Khuxxman and Majaiwana sing about and from, thereby highlighting a symbiotic dialogue between people and places in Bulawayo.

**Keywords:** places; identities; song texts; intertextuality; spatiality

## Introduction

Human interaction bestows certain values, attributes, functions, experiences and connotations to and on space. As a result, creative and cultural works are never created in isolation. The socio-political, economic, cultural and physical environments influence the content, character, nature, texture, tempo and rhythm of any cultural product. As a result, cultural products exude a symbiotic relationship between the cultural content, physical (and conceptual) places and identities of the creators, and vice versa. Critically examining the position of place or space in the United Kingdom public anti-austerity demonstrations, Nield (2012, 232) observes that “no space is timeless; all spaces are under production all the time – and so can be intervened in, disrupted, argued with and reproduced”. We borrow this idea, which is anchored on Soja’s (1983) and Lefebvre’s (1991) concepts of social reproduction of space, to anchor our framing and engagement of the nexus between places, identities and music. Soja (1983, 136) submits that people’s daily engagements and interactions contribute to the formation and reformation of geographical (social, political and physical) space. It is this space that informs the work of cultural creatives as they strive to represent their varied ways of seeing and experiencing textually and visually.

In the article, we also deploy Julia Kristeva’s concept of intertextuality to trace the sources of spatial textual referents embedded in song texts and examine the ways in which they inform the emergence and consolidation of identities of the singers/subjects of the songs. Through analysing lyrical content of selected song texts from the late Beatar Mangethe, Khuxxman and Lovemore “Majaiwana” Tshuma, we underscore the spatial senses in which these song texts define and shape identities and class distinctions in Bulawayo’s townships. Finally, we describe the identities of characters who are sketched into the places that Khuxxman, Majaiwana and Mangethe sing about and from, highlighting a symbiotic dialogue between people and places in Bulawayo. In essence, we consider this intertextual relation between music and space a critical component in the social production of Bulawayo as a city. In this instance, the place and cultural product, are seen to be “producing each other in a reciprocal exchange of nuanced and subtle shifting meanings” (Nield 2012, 233).

Inclusive of the introductory section, the article is divided into four sections. The introduction details the focus of the article and guides the reader’s expectations. The second section details and engages with intertextuality as a theoretical framework that we deploy to engage the symbiotic relationship between the three case study song texts, the source places, and the subjects sung about. In the third segment, we analyse and draw linkages between song texts, spatialities and identities as they are framed and represented in Mangethe’s song *Makokoba*. The fourth and final segment examines the specific identities concerning Bulawayo, sketched in Khuxxman’s song *Amaloja* (Tenants), Majaiwana’s songs *Ikula Lami* (My Indian Girlfriend) and *Mkhwenyana* (Son-in-Law), and the specific dialogic relationships created between places and people.

Methodologically, we adopt a case study approach, which locates the three case studies at two levels. Firstly, our choice of musicians sang from and about Bulawayo. For instance, the case study song texts characterise Bulawayo people's experiences in different townships in the first lyrical content of three decades of independence. Majaivana was prominent in the first and second post-independence decades, while Mangethe and Khuxxman captured aurally and visually the experiences of Bulawayo's citizens after the turn of the millennium. Thus, these musicians can be said to be representative of different eras in the musical history of Bulawayo. Majaivana captures and represents a golden era in which musicians captured the euphoria of independence and life under black majority rule. This era further stretches into the 1990s where ZANU-PF consolidated a one-party state characterised by corruption and scandals. Mangethe and Khuxxman represent the millennium era – capturing the emergence of a new township cultural life in Makokoba anchored around township (cultural) tourism. While young musicians have emerged post-2010 who have sung from Bulawayo, such as Mzo7, Mchezznana, Asaph and the late Cal-Vin, to our expert knowledge the three case studies we have chosen remain as the leading musicians who have symbiotically captured Bulawayo as a place/space in their songs.

Secondly, the case study song texts are about specific spaces in Bulawayo. Majaivana sings about his diverse experiences in the townships, suburbs and high-rise residential flats in the Central Business District (CBD), while Mangethe reconnoitres Bulawayo's oldest township, Makokoba, and Khuxxman explores the modern township life. From Mangethe, we use *Makokoba* – a song that profiles Bulawayo's oldest township and characterises it as a beautiful historical tourism site and a major contributor to the identity formation of Bulawayo's township dwellers. Khuxxman's *Amaloja* profiles the experiences of tenants in Bulawayo's townships and characterises them as lower-class citizens exposed to abuse by landlords. From Majaivana, we use *Ikula Lami* – a song that profiles his experiences with an Indian girlfriend – as well as *Mkhwenyana* – which compares financial and material demands from a son-in-law by in-laws located in different spaces within Bulawayo. These song texts that capture, in their lyrical content and video representation, a connection between spaces, identities and musical material, provide the study with the desired qualitative data. While we are aware that the musical sounds and arrangements of these song texts can be used as a referent for analysing the nexus of music and places, for the article our analysis will be limited to the examination of the lyrical content and, in the case of Mangethe's *Makokoba*, a video representation of the lyrical narrative.

Research that maps places and spatiality into identities of citizens and vice versa is negligible within the Zimbabwean landscape. Much of the extant research has dedicated vast energy to engaging: music and conflict (Muhwati, Charamba and Tembo 2018); music and hegemony (Dhlamini 2017; Ncube and Siziba 2017); music and protest (Chiweshe and Bhatasara 2013; Kufakurinani, Nyakudya and Chinouriri 2017); music and *Gukurahundi* (Maedza 2017; Ndlovu 2018); and popular songs in Zimbabwe's colonial, liberation and post-independence periods (Musiyiwa 2013; Vambe 2000).

Makwenda (2005) comes closest to what we envisage to undertake through the current study in how she documents township music and examines how it has contributed to post-independence Zimbabwean cultural identities. Beyond these studies, we can relate to regional studies that have emphasised the dialogic relationship between space, music and identity. In Kenya, Nyairo (2006) examines how Nairobi, as a place, is characterised in urban popular songs and how these characterisations identify citizens and affect how they relate to the space in which they live. She concludes that urban popular music in Nairobi creates “a dialogue between people and places even when it merely ascribes meaning and significance to bare landscapes and quotidian experiences” (Nyairo 2006, 74). It is this relationship between place and people renditioned and represented in Mangethe, Majaivana and Khuxxman’s song and video texts that we seek to explore in the context of Bulawayo.

### Intertextuality as a Framework

Intertextuality as a critical approach in the study of texts is linked to theorists such as Ferdinand de Saussure, Mikhail Bakhtin and Roland Barthes. It was only in 1966 that Kristeva coined this critical approach into what is now understood as “intertextuality” through revising and reworking Bakhtin’s ideas on dialogism. For Kristeva (1986, 36) intertextuality refers to the dialogic nature that exists in all types of language as words are used in various semic sets and poetic sequences. In other words, Kristeva is of the view that every word in a text is intertextual and should be read not only in terms of the meaning supposedly residing in the text but also in terms of relations that exist between the text and other cultural discourses existing outside the text (Kristeva 1984; 1986). The text in this instance does not simply refer to a collection of linguistic words, but a fabric of different signifying materials (Jordaan 2016, 24) such as music, theatre and visual paintings. Thus, texts include aspects of human culture and expression that are central in the process of meaning-making and generation of a sense of place. Thus, the text becomes “a permutation of texts, an intertextuality: in the space of a given text, several utterances, taken from other texts, intersect and neutralize one another” (Kristeva 1980, 36). Therefore, we can argue that creative content producers, such as musicians, do not create original texts; rather they compile and package their products from pre-existent texts and experiences in and from a particular space. This reads true in Kristeva’s (1984, 59–60) submission that

if one grants that every signifying practice is a field of transpositions of various signifying systems (an intertextuality), one then understands that its “place” of enunciation and its denoted ‘object’ are never single, complete and identical to themselves, but always plural, shattered, capable of being tabulated.

We submit therefore that although Mangethe, Majaivana and Khuxxman’s song and video texts are about the place and space called Bulawayo, their meanings are not singular due to shifting relations and experiences in this place/space. Thus, intertextuality enables us to emphasise these spatial senses in which the case study song

texts succeed in defining and shaping postcolonial Zimbabwean urban class distinctions and identities.

Intertextuality does not refer merely to the interconnectedness between written texts, but also the dialogue between every kind of artistic and cultural artefact or phenomena in a cultural context and a larger network (Kristeva 1984). Consequently, we examine the dialogic interactions between selected song texts, Bulawayo place(s), and its people. In characterising this/these relationship(s), we are able to draw nuanced understandings of the identity(ies) and the state of transformation or transmutations that Bulawayo as a place has undergone. We use intertextuality to interpret and analyse musical artistic products concerning various forms of spatial production happening in Bulawayo. We deploy intertextuality to analyse how the lyrics, the rhythms and the video representations of the song texts connect to the story of Bulawayo as a place, its people and surroundings. We submit that the songs under scrutiny derive their meanings not only from the composer's/singer's artistic creation but also from the singer's relation to other embodiments of creations in the vicinity of Bulawayo. These meanings are brought to life through examining these networks of links that include, but are not limited to, the place of enunciation, the space referred to, and the people of Bulawayo. In other words, we are concerned with examining the dialogue between the "writing subject, the addressee and exterior texts" (Kristeva 1986, 36) and how the meaning(s) of these song texts are constructed through these referents within the Bulawayo socio-cultural context and space. We undertake this exercise with the awareness that the places and spaces referred to in these song texts are physical, human, social, cultural, political and/or spiritual texts.

Jordaan (2016) observes that every (cultural) work exists within the tradition from which it takes shape and which, in turn, redefines it. As a consequence, any artistic work should highlight a historical consciousness that locates the creator within this cultural tradition, which would subsequently position cultural products on a binary tradition position: either normative or alternative. While many studies that have emerged from and about Zimbabwean music have tended to choose a definite traditional placement, here we traverse this continuum by examining the case study song texts as that which they denote. In examining the textual references and influences of the respective song texts, we are able to unearth the life of Bulawayo citizens that is lived both in "official practice" and "subaltern statuses" as well as the relationship between the texts and their struggles and experiences. In so doing, we are able to examine resistance and confirmation practices in song texts simultaneously. This simultaneity is expressed in the multiple "layers of meanings rather than a solid and stable meaning which is supposed to be constructed through the writer's authorial vision" (Zengin 2016, 301).

In the article, we also adopt multiple positions in our engagement with texts – at one level, we analyse the textual dialogic relations as an audience, at another level we act as critics and on yet another level as interpreters. These multiple positionings allow us to engage with the various textual influences on the song texts due to adaptation and

appropriation. This is possible because, according to Zengin (2016, 301–302), intertextuality

provides an area of study of influences, adaptation and appropriation of texts into not only the written or literary texts but also the other media or non-literary fields. It is also a method for the analysis of any text constructed in culture and a way of interpretation of any cultural phenomenon correlated with non-literary arts and the current cultural epoch.

Therefore, songs, movies, buildings, photography, paintings and sculptures can be viewed as texts having interdisciplinary connections with each other. Intertextuality becomes relevant in the study of these texts because it allows the examination and aggregation of these relations, connections and associations to be made between texts, social and cultural processes and contexts.

### Welcome to Makokoba: Place and Song Texts

Connell and Gibson (2002, 84) submit that popular music is much more than a soundtrack alone as it expresses and captures images of the lifestyles and cultural life of the places from which it is created. Music provides a means of “reflecting or challenging social trends, attitudes to place, patterns of mobility and shifts in identity enabling new identities to be forged through shared experiences” (Connell and Gibson 2002, 89) highlighting a sense of place. In the words of Allen (2000, 4) music is “one of the fundamental mechanisms through which people indicate what they enjoy, approve of, identify with, recognise as true or acknowledge as ethically appropriate.” Music renders audible and resonant what is happening in life and experience (Mbembe 2005). This is achievable through an intertextual reading of the relationality, interdependency and interconnectedness between musical texts and places. From an intertextual perspective, the expressions of spatial experiences and sense of place through and in music can be understood through reading the network of textual relations between the song texts and locations. This is done through semiotically tracing and reading these relations and how they reflect visions of society and human relations (Allen 2000, 5).

In this section, we use Mangethe’s song text *Makokoba* to examine how it expresses spatial experiences and attitudes through reference to place and other texts. Our departure point is Connell and Gibson’s (2002, 27) observation that many places have been known for and through music. In the song, Mangethe sings from and about Makokoba as a historical and transhistorical place. Here, we examine the connections between Mangethe’s song text *Makokoba* and Makokoba as a place, highlighting the nuanced interrelationships between cultural identities and places. In essence, we examine how the song text invokes a sense and an essence of a place.

According to Relph (1976, 63), a sense of place is the “ability to recognise different places and different identities of a place”, while the essence of the place speaks to the

centrality of space as the centre of action and interaction. The essence of space also speaks to the characteristics of a place that focus and determine how people experience events happening in it. The situational identities that emerge from this dialectical spatial process highlight the embodiments of and inscriptions on spatial and textual referents in song and video texts. The genius loci of a space speak to the need to locate the understanding of performance (and cultural) texts and interpretation of meanings within a relevant socio-political and cultural context (Sibanda 2018). This proposition captures Lefebvre's (1991) lived/social and Soja's (1976) "third" space which identifies an experiential transformation of place into space; place being "personalised space" or "place that is occupied" (Short 2001, 15, 16). In this context, the textual referents in the song and video texts by Mangethe, Khuxxman and Majaivana become "structures of feeling: a set of received ways of perceiving and responding to reality" (Williams in Eagleton 2002, 24). These received ways of appreciating and interpreting spatial relationships in Bulawayo's townships are negotiated and expressed as "representations, typifications, [and] active images" (Goodman and De Gay 2000, 57) of actual living relationships (stories). Thus, we can argue that the selected case study song texts are a "way of seeing and knowing, which every day we put to practice and while the conventions hold, while the relationships hold, most practice confirms" (Goodman and De Gay 2000, 57). It is this way of seeing and everyday practice that positions Mangethe's *Makokoba*, Khuxxman's *Amaloja* and Majaivana's *Ikula lami* and *Mkhwenyana* as (spatial and musical) structures of feeling. As "structures" of feeling and ways of representing reality, these song texts locate Bulawayo's township and middle class political, socio-cultural and economic realities in the spatiality they represent. We argue therefore that Mangethe, Khuxxman and Majaivana's songs are musical structures of feeling that spatially and visually represent the actual living experiences of the people living in the townships – specifically Makokoba.

In the song *Makokoba*, Mangethe adopts a township touristic advertisement approach to position Makokoba as a welcoming site for everyone, that is, a home as well as a place of business and recreation. Released initially as a video text, the song text owes its huge success to its relation and invocation of the rich history and diversity of Makokoba as a place. Makokoba is the oldest township in Bulawayo, which was transformed from nucleated indigenous curvilinear houses, yards, field barricades and kraals into the hegemonic square/rectangular shape put on a straight plane at colonisation (Ranger 2010). In place of the nucleated homesteads of the old locations, there emerged clusters of two-roomed four-corner cottages specifically built for the male working force in the industries. Major landscape characters included the Madlodlo Beer Garden, Makokoba Cultural Market, Efusini, Stanley Hall and Square, and Amakhosi Township Cultural Square Centre which is built on a Ndebele heritage site. Mangethe's video watermarks these spaces as the key referents and markers of familiarity and belonging in her song text.

The intentional release of *Makokoba* as a video first and an audio for radio airplay highlights the textual importance of the place and space in understanding and

appreciating the song, especially for people who are unfamiliar with the location. Allen (2000, 1) observes that from an intertextual perspective, “reading becomes a process of moving between texts”, in this instance between the visual representations of the Makokoba spatial text and the song text. Critically examining the emergence of music tourism in the West, Connell and Gibson (2002, 222) submit that

music sites have emerged in the last decade of the twentieth century, particularly in the West, drawing visitors to experience, or visualise, the contexts within which particular musical styles were developed, recordings were produced, where “stars” were born and died, or were mythologised in songs.

The foreground of the visuality of Makokoba in Mangethe’s song generates nostalgic moments for those familiar with the place and/or affordable access to those new to the space. Consequently, for the song to make sense and be relevant to the geographic context of Bulawayo, Mangethe creates a visual reference to key historical spaces located within Makokoba. To achieve this, Mangethe takes her audience on a guided tour of Makokoba, highlighting the key places that have for a long time defined the township. For instance, she opens up her neighbourhood by recording her video passing through Amakhosi Cultural Township Square, Makhumalo Beer Garden, Renkini long-distance bus terminus, and Makokoba Cultural Market. These key spaces influenced the social life of individuals growing up in Makokoba and, as such, she foregrounds them as key in understanding her song text. To understand and appreciate Mangethe’s song *Makokoba*, it needs to be read within the context of Makokoba as a place and location. In the words of Raj (2015, 77), a text such as *Makokoba* “cannot exist as a hermetic or self-sufficient whole, and so does not function as a closed system”.

In the song text, Mangethe welcomes the world and frames it as *emzini wezinsizwa* (a home for the bachelors), thereby invoking a nostalgia located in the history of the place. The concept of *emzini wezinsizwa* is derived from the fact that when Makokoba was transformed into a modern colonial township, it was remodelled specifically for men in the mould of South African hostels. As such, it can be argued that Mangethe’s song derives its relevance from the oral stories emerging from the streets of Makokoba. The textual reference to the nostalgic history of Makokoba as the backbone for the understanding and appreciation of Mangethe’s *Makokoba* song text raises issues of authorship. While the song text is attributed to Mangethe, the music video shows her commenting and amplifying existing spatial texts in line with Raj’s (2015, 78) submission that “authors are not original and do not create anything from their texts from original muds but compile from the already existing texts”. Thus, song texts, such as Mangethe’s *Makokoba*, are “culturally fashionable discourses, ways of systemic or institutional speaking and saying”. It could be the reason why Mangethe’s song was easily adopted by the Zimbabwe Tourism Authority as a soundtrack for its township tourism programme, specifically to promote Makokoba Township.

As part of musical tourism targeted at promoting historical places and spaces, Mangethe’s *Makokoba* video text evokes “memories of the youth and act as a reminder



of earlier freedoms, attitudes, events, its emotive power serves to intensify feelings of nostalgia, regret or reminiscence” (Connell and Gibson 2002, 223). Growing up in Makokoba, the streets that Mangethe uses as a narrative canvas for her video text evoke personal memories of her youthful days performing *Stitsha* and other Amakhosi Theatre Production musicals under street lights. As she acts as a tour guide for her viewers and opens up Makokoba to the world, Mangethe exposes the township people’s affective investments that cannot be exposed simply through lyrics. For instance, through the video text, viewers experience the welcoming spirit of Makokoba as Mangethe interacts with smiling and happy on-lookers on the streets. Viewers are also exposed to the hustle and bustle of street activities, which relate to her youth days when she also played, performed, welcomed and helped people with directions around Makokoba.

Mangethe draws a couturier of images from Makokoba’s historical visual bank to create emotions of belonging and an open, welcoming community. Mangethe’s video text captures vividly *lokshin* life – children playing street soccer, people greeting each other on the street, yards that open up into the street, and street-side vending stalls. In essence, the reading and appreciation of this song text would have lost its significance if it were not done in Makokoba Township, as a referent and canvas. This reads true in Martínez’s (1996, 268) assertion that from an intertextual perspective, we “understand texts not as self-contained systems but as differentiated and historical, as traces and tracings of otherness, since they are shaped by the repetition and transformation of other textual structures”. From an audience perspective, we read Mangethe’s song text from a spatial orientation where the lyrical content affirms and confirms the spatial text and vice versa. To understand Makokoba as a place and its subsequent township life, viewers have to watch and listen to *Makokoba*. This experience is summed up by Keeling (2011, 113) who argues that “popular songs ... reflect a particular geographic experience at a certain point in time, whereby both the producer and consumer of the songs engage with the landscape in ways that are reflected in the music and in our memory”.

### Living *eKasi*: Emergent Situational Identities from Bulawayo’s Townships and Suburbs

The fluidity and contextuality of musical genres and traditions inspire the emergence of what can be termed situational identities. Kotarba and Vannino (2009, 115) characterise situational identities as those “momentary identities that we take up and shed on a regular daily basis”. What this means is that through the examination of musical texts within specific periods and contexts, people are able to “explain how people construct a sense of identity, individual and collective, around music” (Kotarba and Vannino 2009, 3). Wade’s (2000, 2) observation that “the way people think about identity and music is tied to the way they think about places” positions popular music texts as an integral site on which cultural identities are formed, both at personal and collective level”. In this section, we engage with and lay bare the specific spatial, socio-economic and political contexts of Khuxxman’s *Amaloja* and Majaivana’s *Ikula* and *Mkhwenyana*,

and how they reflect the singers' situational identities and relationship(s) with the place(s) that inspired the lyrical content.

Khuxxman's song text *Amaloja* bemoans the treatment township house owners mete out on tenants, such as giving them curfews, monitoring their movements, choosing visitors for them, and managing their diaries. The song text, released initially as a video, just like Mangethe's *Makokoba*, details and examines the relationship between two social identities in an ordinary township, namely: landlords and tenants. The video opens with an establishing aerial shot showing a high-density township, captured and framed into small boxes placed on a Cartesian gridiron plane. This invokes the economic disparities between the townships and suburban areas. Chingwenya and Dube (2018, 17) observe that "the urban poor are in most cases found with limited access to municipal services, which exacerbates urbanisation of poverty". This urban poor is mostly found in the townships living in what has been termed "match box" houses (Magwaro-Ndiweni 2011). It is on these kinds of "match box" houses that Khuxxman models the social identities that he amplifies in his song text. The Cartesian ordering of houses interspaced with narrow driveways that connect to create squares or rectangles foretells the fate of the tenants within these houses: controlled movement and curtailed growth. The narrow roads are used to limit any development to the houses as they delimit the spaces set aside for human occupation.

Gomel (2014, 125) observes that "our 'operational spaces' are as much a product of stories we tell ourselves about the world we live in as they are our sensory capacities; or rather the two are closely intertwined". The importance of this observation from a musical perspective is that music production is influenced by the composer/singers' spatial experience which results in the lyrical text either commenting about a place, drawing inspiration from a place and/or being produced from a certain place. To this end, musical texts embody, enunciate and privilege topophilia, which foregrounds "affective meaning producing between a person and a locale, and emphasizing the importance of creating a strong 'sense of place'" (Prieto 2017, 60). Song texts, therefore, express a deep phenomenological conception of space that signify locative or referential dynamics in lyrical content or video representation.

Discussing the phenomenological framing of space in literary texts, Prieto (2017, 64) submits that "when we are talking about place in the phenomenological sense, we are talking just as much as about the perspective of the observing subject as about the place observed". He further adds that in narrating this spatial experience, "the voice of authority is fully represented in the narrator, who has the historical perspective and interpretive authority necessary to give meaning to the events experienced phenomenologically by his characters". In the context of *Amaloja*, Khuxxman derives his historical perspective from being a township born and bred musician and his interpretive authority from his experience as a tenant in the townships. In so doing, the *Amaloja* song text becomes and operates as a "metaphor for all the other discursive

processes that produce it and which are in turn reproduced” (Van den Heever 2017, 71) by the video text.

Consequently, musical texts cannot be detached from the social or cultural textuality which forms the backdrop in which they are created (Kristeva 1980). The social text and the literary text are inseparably knit together to fabricate a tapestry because the former provides the backdrop in which the latter is created (Raj 2015, 78). Songs as social texts relate therefore to spaces in which people interact and relate. These can be political spaces through which governments manage and control people’s movement; social interaction or economic spaces in which people make a living (Ambe 2007); or socio-cultural spaces that pollinate the creative process. As the backdrop of texts, the social context rubs its varied identities and characteristics onto, in this case, the lyrical content of song texts.

Narrating the experiences of tenants in the township, Khuxxman annotates in the first voice account:

*Sonke amaloja sambenini thina siyolala, sizathola omastanda sebekhiye amagedi*  
[Let us all the tenants go home and sleep before our landlords lock their gates]  
*Sonke amaloja sambenini thina siyoziphumulela, sizathola omastanda sebekhiye amagedi*  
[Let us all the tenants go home and rest before our landlords lock their gates]  
*Uma uliloja uyafakelwa isikhathi sokungena lapha ekhaya, njengomtwana omncane*  
[If you are a tenant you are given a curfew as if you are a child]  
*Omastanda bazenzela umathanda emalojeni, abawahloniphi*  
[The landlords do as they please on their tenants]  
*Thina amaloja, ilanga litshonile solalaphi*  
[The sun has set, where are we going to sleep as tenants]  
*Solala? Solala egangeni njengenyoni!*  
[Where are we going to sleep? We will sleep in the bush like birds!]

He then turns to the landlords/landladies and pleads for respect on behalf of the tenants:

*Lina bomastanda phathanini kuhle amaloja, ayakudinga ukuphathwa kahle nawo njengaye wonke umuntu*  
[I call on you our landlords to treat your tenants with love because they need to be treated so like everyone else]  
*Abangane bami kabafuneki kulomuzi kuthiwa yiwo amaselas*  
[My friends are not allowed in this house because they are considered thugs]

This lyrical narrative content, which is visualised through the video where enactments of the abuse are represented, consolidates the two social identities emerging from this interaction between the landlord and the tenant. Nyairo (2006, 74) poses a critical observation on the representation of spaces/places in song texts: “How a place is referred to in a song will not only tell us plenty about who lives there, it will also affect the ways in which those very people relate to and live in that place.” As Nyairo further

observes, this dialectical relationship between place and music attaches meaning and significance to the interaction between people and places. The relationship between the tenant and the rented room(s) is temporary and lacks harmony as the tenant describes it as a bush “*solala egangeni njengenyoni*”. As such, a sense of belonging and of place is never developed between the tenants, their rented houses, and the locations they are found in. Consequently, there is a disconnection between the musical (and the tenant) and the spatial text although the former makes reference to the latter. Khuxxman’s *Amaloja* becomes a “song about hunger and desire, about the inhibitions and restrictions surrounding daily existence in the city” (Nyairo 2006, 88) from the tenant’s perspective. Consequently, because of their lack of a sense of place, tenants are always held in contempt and suspicion.

In both Mangethe and Khuxxman’s song texts, the township is branded as a site characterised by the spectacle, a process that expresses the authenticity of the places themselves. In the same manner, as Majaivana characterises spaces and places in Bulawayo, therefore the spectacle emerges from a lived spatial experience. For instance, Majaivana speaks about spectacular familial relations in *Ikula Lami*, where he narrates how his girlfriend spoils and spends her own money during their intimate picnic outings and in hotels, while in *Mkhwenyana*, he compares the financial and material demands of his in-laws located in the different city spaces such as townships, the CBD and suburbs. He narrates his experiences in the following manner:

*Ngakhonjwe Sabhabha ngazengahawula*

[I got a girlfriend who stays in the suburbs and I am struggled to cope]

*Ekuseni Mkhwenyana ingaphi i\$10.00*

[In the morning, son-in-law, where is the \$10?]

*Ntambama Mkhwenyana Ingaphi i\$10.00*

[In the evening, son-in-law, where is the \$10?]

*Ngakhonjwe eflathini ngazengahawula*

[I got a girlfriend who stays in the town apartments and I struggled to cope]

*Ekuseni heyi wena ingaphi isausage*

[In the morning, hey you, where is the sausage?]

*Ntambama heyi wena ingaphi ichiken*

[In the evening, hey you, where is the chicken?]

*Ngakhonjwe Mpopoma ngazikholisela*

[I got a girlfriend at Mpopoma (township) and I am enjoyed myself]

*Ekuseni Mkhwenyana lingaphi tshukela*

[In the morning, son-in-law, where is the sugar?]

*Ntambama Mkhwenyana singaphi sitshebo*

[In the evening, son-in-law, where is the relish?]

*Ngakhonjwe nkomponi ngazikholisela*

[I got a girlfriend from the compounds and I enjoyed myself]

*Ekuseni heyi wena phathakahle*

[In the morning, hey you, you should behave yourself]

*Ntambama heyi wena phathakahle*

[In the evening, hey you, just behave yourself]

In this song, Majaivana highlights a certain inclination and expectation from the in-laws in the different spaces to which he refers. Majaivana observes that his relationship with women and their families, who stayed in the suburbs and the CBD, were frustrating largely because they were on a capitalist and consumerist pattern. He complains that every morning and every evening his in-laws demanded from him money and various kind of expensive goodies which were a preserve of the rich in the late 1990s. Yet, those from the township and compounds were able to supply him with all the basics that he needed which made him happy. Although this speaks to a residual colonial framing which is underscored by an African patriarchal understanding that the son-in-law has responsibility for paying for the upkeep and provisions of his in-laws, it also apportions social situational identities.

In a closer look at the four spaces which he sings about, Majaivana actualises a particular state of relations between various populations and social groups, as these coalesce around specific conditions and Majaivana sets that condition as food. He seems to tell the tales of people's lives, their experiences, encounters, attachments, belonging and sentiments. His song takes the listener out of the greater Bulawayo space to the inner spaces within Bulawayo which embody different and distinct identities. The places are described in the song in a dramatic pattern of relationships where an individual cannot express oneself autonomously. Stokes (1994) discusses how music transcends the limitation of our place in the world and "boundaries" to construct trajectories. This describes the vital role of music in relocating ourselves. Stokes (1994, 12–13) states that:

The musical events, from collective dances to the act of putting cassette or CD into a machine, evokes and organizes collective memories and present experiences of place with an intensity, power, and simplicity unmatched by any other social activity. The 'places' constructed through music involve notions of difference and social boundary.

Place and identity become a core in this narrative. These places can be thought of as complex entities, ensembles of material objects, people, and systems of social relationships embodying distinct cultures and multiple meanings, identities and practices. As such, places are contested and continually in the process of becoming, rather than essentialised and fixed, open and porous to a variety of flows in and out rather than closed and hermetically sealed. In the same way, Khuxxman highlights that tenants in the townships are treated like children who must adhere to a curfew or else they will be locked out. This is spectacularly captured in the video where Khuxxman and Madlela Skikhobokhobo play the tenants who find the gate locked. When they try to engage the landlady, she blatantly refuses to open the gate forcing them to turn back and look for somewhere else to spend the night: "*Solala egangeni njengeniyoni!*"

The song texts used in this paper use space as a resource of an image of social identity and a benchmark for generating meanings in relationships. Kotarba and Vannino (2009, 18) observe that through reference to space(s), a song text can help a person feel like s/he belongs. In the song text *Makokoba*, Mangethe opens up her neighbourhood as she joyfully and gracefully takes her audience on a walk-about. This guided walk-about exposes a very close affinity that Mangethe has with the spaces that define Makokoba. Because she comfortably belongs and relates with space, we argue that it becomes very easy for her audience members to relate and feel a semblance of belonging. With regard to Khuxxman's *Amaloja*, the relation can be read at two levels. Firstly, there is a group that identifies with the experience, of either or both the tenant or house owner, represented and narrated in the song text. Secondly, there is a group that identifies with the township space that foregrounds this experience, even though they have never had the first-hand ordeal of it. However, what is central to these two groups is that their experiences and identities are shaped by their being in the township space, which is a referent in both song texts. Majaivana's music is a ubiquitous aspect of people's daily lives and their day-to-day struggles as they traverse the different spaces within Bulawayo. The places referred to in the songs literally and metaphorically represent what Cohen (1991) characterises as a setting for the quotidian social relations, practices and interactions of everyday life; and as a concept or symbol that is represented or interpreted. In her words, "music . . . plays a unique and often hidden role in the production of place" (Cohen 1991, 288). The production of place through music is seen as a contested process, but at the same time, the dynamic interrelationship between music and place suggests that music plays a very particular and sensuous role in place-making and identity formation.

## Conclusion

Human creativity bestows spaces with certain attributes and functions through the process of socialisation that taps into lived experiences. As seen in the engagement with the case study song texts in the current study, the process and approach to experiencing the city are located in the cultural processes of representation. Thus, we have attempted to unearth the life that is lived in the public spaces of the city of Bulawayo as captured and represented in the various song texts. The songs we have analysed underscore Bulawayo as a place of conglomeration and historically located cultural life. To borrow from Nyairo (2006, 88), "the visual and aural images that these songs generate signal an urban essence that continually points to the social production of space in ways that are very different from the idealised city that was conceived in colonial", in this case, Zimbabwe.

In deploying the concept of intertextuality as a lens to engage and analyse the embeddedness of Bulawayo spaces and identities on and in popular song texts by musicians based in Bulawayo, we have foregrounded music as a dynamic site in which relational processes and practices are the focus of analysis instead of static structures and products (Martínez 1996, 268). In other words, we have highlighted in this

discussion that music shapes spaces and spaces shape music (Connell and Gibson 2002). In the process of engaging the dialectical relationship between place/ space and music, we observed the emergence of situational identities that responded to the context. This is underscored by Kotarba and Vannino's (2009, 3) submission that

one's identity cannot be understood without a comprehension of the role that music plays in his/her life, by paying attention to how music allows one to cement social ties with friends, to understand politics of the world, to express emotionality, and so forth.

In addition to validating Kotarba and Vannino's observation, we have also highlighted that music can be used to create a sense and essence of place, generate, and affirm various social situational identities and represent spatialised relationships within the urban township set-up.

Yet, more research remains to be done within this area. The arts and cultural industries have since time immemorial directly and indirectly contributed to the social and economic development of their source communities, regions and the country as a whole. While the Zimbabwe Statistics Agency has tried to calculate actual and/or approximate contributions the sector makes to the gross domestic product, it remains a negligibly under-researched area. For instance, the 1980s to late 1990s saw Makokoba become one of the sites for content production and showcasing, which was expected to have contributed to the social and economic growth of the township. Through the creation of content and public performances, performers were employed, spaces were hired, and audiences were paid to watch live performances, which created a financial market within the performing arts industries. Yet, to the best of our knowledge, there is no quantitative study that has looked at computing the actual or approximate financial contributions to the development of the city both at the infrastructural and human capital level. Therefore, this remains a site for future research studies. Further research can also be done in examining and assessing the emergence of strands of township cultural tourism in Bulawayo at the turn of the millennium.

## References

- Allen, G. 2000. *Intertextuality: The New Critical Idiom*. London: Routledge.
- Ambe, N. 2007. *Planning Power: Town Planning and Social Control in Colonial Africa*. London: Taylor and Francis.
- Chingwenya, A., and D. Dube. 2018. "Informality and the Right to the City Centre: Contestations for Space in the City of Harare." *Education, Science and Production* 1: 12–22.
- Chiweshe, M. K., and S. Bhatasara. 2013. "'Ndezve Varume Izvi': Hegemonic Masculinities and Misogyny in Popular Music in Zimbabwe." *Africa Media Review* 21 (1/2): 151–170.

- Cohen, S. 1991. *Rock Culture in Liverpool – Popular Music in the Making*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Connell, J., and C. Gibson. 2002. *Soundtracks: Popular Music and Place*. London: Routledge.
- Dhlamini, N. 2017. “Music as a Medium of Protest: An Analysis of Selected Kalanga Music.” Doctoral diss., University of South Africa.
- Eagleton, T. (1976) 2002. *Marxism and Literary Criticism*. London: Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203361771>
- Gomel, E. 2014. *Narrative Space and Time: Representing Impossible Topologies in Literature*. New York: Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315889528>
- Goodman, L., and J. de Gay. 2000. *The Routledge Reader in Politics and Performance*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Jordaan, D. 2016. “The Intertextual Relationship between Augustine’s Confessions and The Letter to the Romans.” Doctoral diss., University of Stellenbosch.
- Keeling, D. 2011. “Iconic Landscapes: The Lyrical Links of Songs and Cities.” *Focus on Geography* 54 (4): 113–125. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1949-8535.2011.00033.x>
- Kotarba, J., and P. Vannino. 2009. *Understanding Society through Popular Music*. New York: Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203894606>
- Kristeva, J. 1980. *Desire in Language: A Semiotic Approach to Literature and Art*. Edited by L. S. Roudiez. Translated by T. Gora and A. Jardine. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Kristeva, J. 1984. *Revolution in Poetic Language*. Translated by M. Waller. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Kristeva, J. 1986. *The Kristeva Reader*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Kufakurinani, U., M. Nyakudya, and B. Chinouriri. 2017. “‘Wakachipa kungebhero’: Gender and the Portrayal of Women in selected Zimdancehall Songs.” In *Victims, Victims and Villains: Women in Musical Arts in Zimbabwe – Past and Present*, edited by B. Chinouriri, U. Kufakurinani and M. Nyakudya, 80–97. Harare: University of Zimbabwe Publications.
- Lefebvre, H. 1991. *The Production of Space*. Oxford: Donald Nicholson-Smith.
- Maedza, P. 2017. “‘Mai VaDhikondo’: Echoes of the Requiems from the Killing Fields.” *Social Dynamics* 43 (2): 215–229. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02533952.2017.1364470>
- Magwaro-Ndiweni, L. 2011. “Contestation in the Use of Residential space: House Typologies and Residential Land in Bulawayo, Zimbabwe.” *African Review of Economics and Finance* 3 (1): 40–56.



- Makwenda, J. 2005. *Zimbabwe Township Music*. Harare: Story Time Promotions
- Martínez, M. J. A. 1996. "Intertextuality: Origins and Development of the Concept." *Atlantis* 18 (1/2): 268–285.
- Mbembe, A. 2005. "Variations on the Beautiful in the Congolese World of Sound." *Politique Africaine* 4 (100): 69–91. <https://doi.org/10.3917/polaf.100.0069>
- Muhwati, I., T. Charamba, and C. Tembo, eds. 2018. *Singing Nation and Politics – Music and the 'Decade of Crisis' in Zimbabwe 2000–2010*. Gweru: Midlands State University Press.
- Musiyiwa, M. 2013. "The Narrativization of Post-2000 Zimbabwe in the Shona Popular Song-Genre: An Appraisal Approach." Doctoral diss., University of Stellenbosch.
- Ncube, G., and G. Siziba. 2017. "Compelled to Perform in the 'Other's' Language? Ndebele Performing Artists and Zimbabwe's Shona Centric Habitus." *Journal of Southern African Studies* 43 (4): 825–836. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057070.2017.1313609>
- Ndlovu, S. 2018. "Singing the Forbidden: An Analysis of the Political Significance of Viomark's Song 'Gukurahundi'." In *Singing Nation and Politics – Music and the 'Decade of Crisis' in Zimbabwe 2000–2010*, edited by I. Muhwati, T. Charamba and C. Tembo, 171–187. Gweru: Midlands State University Press.
- Nield, S. 2012. "Sitting the People: Power, Protest and Public Space." In *Performing Site-Specific Theatre – Politics, Place, Practice*, edited by A. Birch and J. Tompkins, 219–232. London: Palgrave MacMillan. [https://doi.org/10.1057/9781137283498\\_14](https://doi.org/10.1057/9781137283498_14)
- Nyairo, J. 2006. "(Re)Configuring the City: The Mapping of Places and People in Contemporary Kenyan Popular Song Texts." In *Cities in Contemporary Africa*, edited by M. J. Murray and G. A. Myers, 71–95. Basingstoke: Palgrave MacMillan. [https://doi.org/10.1057/9780230603349\\_4](https://doi.org/10.1057/9780230603349_4)
- Prieto, E. 2017. "Phenomenology, Place and the Spatial Turn." In *The Routledge Handbook of Literature and Space*, edited by R. T. Tally Jr, 60–69. New York: Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315745978-6>
- Raj, P. P. E. 2015. "Text/Texts: Integrating Julia Kristeva's Concept of Intertextuality." *Research Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences* 3: 77–80.
- Ranger, T. 2010. *Bulawayo Burning: The Social-History of a Southern African City 1893–1960*. Harare: Weaver Press.
- Relph, E. 1976. *Place and Placelessness*. London: Pion.
- Short, J. R. 2001. *Global Dimensions: Space, Place and the Contemporary World*. London: Reaktion Books.

Sibanda, N. 2018. "The Politics of Performance Space: An Investigation into the Practice of Scenography in Post-Independence Zimbabwean Theatre." Doctoral diss., University of KwaZulu-Natal.

Soja, E. W. 1976. *Spatial Inequality in Africa*. Los Angeles: University of California.

Soja, E. W. 1983. *Spatial Inequality in Africa*. Los Angeles: University of California.

Stokes, M. 1994. "Introduction: Ethnicity, Identity and Music." In *Ethnicity, Identity and Music: The Musical Construction of Place*, edited by M. Stokes, 1–27. Oxford: Berg.

Vambe, M. T. 2000. "Popular Songs and Social Realities in Post-Independence Zimbabwe." *African Studies Review* 43 (2): 73–86. <https://doi.org/10.2307/524985>

Van den Heever, G. 2017. "Spatialising Practices at the Intersections: Representations and Productions of Spaces." In *The Routledge Handbook of Literature and Space*, edited by R. T. Tally Jr, 70–80. New York: Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315745978-7>

Wade, P. 2000. *Music, Race, and Nation: Música Tropical in Colombia*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Zengin, M. 2016. "An Introduction to Intertextuality as a Literary Theory: Definitions, Axioms and the Originators." *Pamukkale University Journal of Social Sciences Institute* 25 (1): 299–326. <https://doi.org/10.5505/pausbed.2016.96729>