

**THE EMERGENCE AND EXPERIENCE OF BLACK WOMEN ACADEMICS IN
SOUTH AFRICAN HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS**

By

Hlengiwe Patience Molelekeng

04482183

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

MPhil in Multidisciplinary Human Rights

in the Faculty of Law

University of Pretoria

April 2020

Prepared under the supervision of

Dr Joel M Modiri

Table of Contents

CHAPTER ONE:	5
INTRODUCTION AND OVERVIEW	5
1.1 STATEMENT OF RESEARCH PROBLEM	5
1.2 RESEARCH QUESTIONS	8
1.3 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	8
1.4 OUTLINE OF THE CHAPTERS	9
CHAPTER TWO:	11
CHALLENGES, BARRIERS AND FACTORS AFFECTING THE ADVANCEMENT AND EXPERIENCE OF BLACK WOMEN ACADEMICS	11
2.1 INTRODUCTION	11
2.2 GENDER INEQUALITY IN SOUTH AFRICA	13
2.2.1 The post-democratic regulatory framework of higher education	14
2.2.2 The constitutional perspective of a regulated higher education environment	17
2.2.3 The legislative framework of a regulated higher education environment	18
2.2.4 The Reconstruction Development Programme	19
2.3 GENDER INEQUALITY IN HIGHER EDUCATION	21
2.3.1 Black women in the South African higher education context	23
2.4 BARRIERS AND FACTORS AFFECTING THE ADVANCEMENT AND EXPERIENCE OF BLACK WOMEN ACADEMICS	25
2.4.1 Negative stereotypes at the workplace	28
2.4.2 Racism and bias in recruitment.....	29
2.4.3 Discrimination at the workplace	30
2.4.4 Sexual harassment	31
2.4.5 Lack of perceived role models for women.....	34
2.4.6 Work-life balance.....	35
2.4.7 Inflexibility at the workplace and workload.....	38
2.4.8 Inadequate policies and programmes to address gender issues	38
2.5 FEMINIST PERSPECTIVES ON GENDER EQUITY AT THE WORKPLACE	39
2.5.1 Black feminist theories	41
2.5.2 Intersectionality.....	43
2.6 CHALLENGES FACING GENDER EQUITY	46
2.7 CHAPTER SUMMARY	47
CHAPTER THREE:	49

LEGISLATIVE MEASURES FOR GENDER EQUALITY IN HIGHER EDUCATION.....	49
3.1 INTRODUCTION	49
3.2 THE CONSTITUTION OF THE REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA,1996	50
3.3 EMPLOYMENT EQUITY ACT 55 of 1998	51
3.5 THE NOTION OF EQUALITY AND THE SOUTH AFRICAN APPROACH.....	53
3.5.1 Substantive equality.....	54
3.5.2 Equality of opportunities.....	55
3.6 GENDER EQUALITY INSTRUMENTS	56
3.6.1 International instruments.....	57
3.6.2 Regional instruments	58
3.6.3 Protocol to the African Charter on the Rights of Women in Africa.....	59
3.6.4 National instruments.....	60
3.7 MEASURES TO EMPOWER WOMEN AND TO ELIMINATE DISCRIMINATION	60
3.8 INSTITUTIONAL MECHANISMS FOR THE ADVANCEMENT OF WOMEN	62
3.10 CHAPTER SUMMARY	65
CHAPTER FOUR:	67
TRANSFORMATION MEASURES ADOPTED BY THE GOVERNMENT AND UNIVERSITY TO ADVANCE AND SUPPORT BLACK WOMEN ACADEMICS.....	67
4.1 INTRODUCTION	67
4.2 THE TRANSFORMATION MEASURES TAKEN BY THE GOVERNMENT	68
4.2.1 Various social purposes that universities, intend to serve	69
4.2.1.1 The 1997 Education White Paper 3 (EWP3)	69
4.2.2 Achievements of the structures and measures taken by the Government	73
4.2.3 Experiences and career advancement of women academics in South African HEIs	75
4.3 THE TRANSFORMATION AND MEASURES TAKEN BY THE INSTITUTIONS	77
4.3.1 Aptitude management	77
4.3.2 Aptitude management models for HEIs and Universities	77
4.3.3 Management support	79
4.3.4 Aptitude attraction	80
4.3.5 Aptitude advancement.....	81
4.3.6 Compensation and acknowledgment	81
4.3.7 Institutional methods.....	82
4.4 CHAPTER SUMMARY	82
CHAPTER FIVE:	84
RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION	84
5.1 INTRODUCTION	84

5.1.1 What are the challenges faced by black women academics in higher education institutions? ..	84
5.1.2 What are the contributing factors to the underrepresentation of black women in senior academic positions in higher institutions?	86
5.1.3 What are the rewards structures to encourage faculty success and offer support systems to reduce isolation that could potentially address the underrepresentation of black women?	87
5.1.4 What are the policies and practices regarding appointment and promotion that ensure the requirements for Equal Employment Opportunities?	88
5.2 CONCLUSION	89
5.3 RECOMMENDATIONS	90
5.3.1 Recommendations for institutions	90
5.3.2 Recommendations for black women academics	91
5.3.3. Recommendations for policy makers	92
5.4 SUGGESTION FOR FUTURE RESEARCH	92
5.5 RESEARCH CONTRIBUTION TO EXISTING KNOWLEDGE	93
BIBLIOGRAPHY	94

CHAPTER ONE:

INTRODUCTION AND OVERVIEW

1.1 STATEMENT OF RESEARCH PROBLEM

This study analyses the emergence and experience of black women academics in higher education institutions in South Africa. Black women are assuming expert occupations; black women are contravening from outdated black women-based occupations to further untraditional and formerly manly-based occupations.¹ Studies also illustrate black women climbing qualified rankings or titles in large amounts normally outstripping males, particularly in Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) and Universities. Though, academes in numerous countries, black women are usually focused in administration and subordinate academic rankings.² Black women endure discrimination as the constructions of HEIs continue to be 'male-positioned'.³ Leading to the lack of representation of black women in superior rankings of academic and administrative leadership in universities. South Africa employs affirmative action as a key tool to redress biased judgement of persons in the workplace and all South African HEIs. Universities, Universities of Technology and Colleges remain following confirmatory action n and the Employment Equity Act 54 of 1998 to recompense biased judgement at the workplace.

A demonstration by Higher Education South Africa, investigated the attainments and trials met by institutes of higher education after 20 years of democracy, argument to several trials institutions still need to overcome about the emergence of black women academics.⁴ Currently it seems to be lack of research that aims at understanding the contextual reasons that lead to turnover of black women academic's senior

¹ S Acker 'A foot in the revolving door? Women academics in lower-middle management' (2014) 33 *Higher Education Research & Development* 78.

² A Gallant 'Symbolic interactions and the development of women leaders in higher education' (2014) 21 *Gender, Work and Organization* 212.

³ N Cloete *et al* 'Great expectations, mixed governance approaches and unintended outcomes: The post 1994 reform of South African higher education' (2005) Dordrecht, Netherlands: Springer, 207-225.

⁴ Higher Education South Africa (HESA) 'South African higher education in the 20th year of democracy: Context, achievements and key challenges' presentation to the Portfolio Committee on Higher Education and Training' (2014) Cape Town, 5 March <https://static.pmg.org.za/140305hesa.pdf> (accessed 12 January 2019).

management in South African higher education.⁵ Against the backdrop of low representation of women in senior positions in specifically South African higher education and calls for equity, the study looked at the reasons why higher education institutions at times fail to retain this most sought-after group (women) in these positions of power. A research paper published in 2014 by Acker, for example, shows that 20 years after the novel governmental privilege, black women academics are met with exclusionary arrogances from their white colleagues by repeatedly questioning their capability and disregard their education.⁶ As per Moodly, the trouble comes from a formal ethos that honours white ability and disregards black ability.⁷ Mahope claims that this formal prejudice lessens black women academics to possessions and substances that are used to please the order of diversity programmes to grow the existence of black women academics in HEIs.⁸ This exclusionary exercise invalidates the existence of black women academics and puts them on an inadequate position with white co-workers. Moodly and Toni observe that black women academics encounter racial and gender unfairness.⁹ Analysing the university system in South Africa there is undeniable proof of gender discrimination but the influence on black women was sifted via a fixed system of racial prejudice such that white women would have been negatively influenced, yet black women academics would have been exposed to both negative effect of both gender and race judgement.¹⁰ This study focuses on general trends and challenges which apply across higher education with some variation among HEIs, especially between Historically White Universities (HWUs) and Historically Black Universities (HBUs). Arguably, the mergers of some HEIs were not really fixated on realizing the historically black institutions (HBIs) into historically white institutions (HWIs) due to racial, financing, and other non-informative aims, giving credibility to a misconception of the meant purposes of the geo political

⁵ L D Patton and N R Njoku 'Theorizing Black women's experiences with institution-sanctioned violence: a #BlackLivesMatter imperative toward Black liberation on campus' (2019) 32(9) *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education* 1182.

⁶ Acker (n 1) 78.

⁷ A Moodly 'Gender equity in South African Higher education leadership: Where are we twenty years after democracy?' (2015) 42 (3) *Journal of Social Sciences* 233.

⁸ SS Mahope 'Becoming a new kind of professional: A black woman academic caught in a transition' (2014) 28 (6) *South African Journal of Higher Education* 1989.

⁹ A Moodly & N Toni 'Women's access towards higher education leadership: Where are the role models?' (2015) 45 (1) *Journal of Social Sciences* 45–52.

¹⁰ A Johnson 'Performing and defying gender: An exploration of the lived experiences of women higher education administrators in sub-Saharan Africa' (2014) 42 (6) *Educational Management Administration & Leadership*, 841.

cut of HEIs from 36 to 21, categorized by name changing of the institutions and or organisational types.¹¹

After-1994, an extensive range of change-orientated projects have taken place looking for effective institutional modification. Including the description of the purposes and goals of higher education; widespread policy research, policy formulation, adoption, and application in the fields of governance, funding, academic structure and programmes and quality assurance; the ratification of new laws and regulations; and major reform and reconfiguration of the HEIs landscape. These programs, which frequently test the facilities and resources of the government and HEIs, Universities, Universities of Technology and Colleges have influenced the speed, environment, and results of modification. The South African Constitution of 1996 and White Paper 3 directed the state and institutions to realise thoughtful and broad varying priorities and objectives in and across higher education.

Majority of researchers tend to concentrate either on ethnic or sex as separate issues and thus paying inadequate devotion to the inseparable connection amongst sex and ethnic in the experience of black women academics in South Africa.¹² Much as when the aim of study is moved to the skills of black women academics, usually they are testified over the 'masculine regard' which silences women's voices.¹³ Johnson argues that because the opinions of black women academics are mainly lacking from the debates on ethnic and sex, it is important that black women scholars add their opinions to the discussion.¹⁴ It seems to suggest that there is limited research focusing on the emergence of black women academics in institutions such as Universities and Universities of Technologies in South Africa. This low portrayal of black women academics in Universities and Universities of Technology represents a substantial disparity. The key difficulty that prompted this study was the acknowledgment of this disparity.

¹¹ Cloete *et al* (n 3) 207-225.

¹² Gallant (n 2) 212.

¹³ E Gamble & N Turner 'Career ascension of African American women in executive positions in postsecondary institutions' (2015) 19 (1) *Journal of Organizational Culture, Communications and Conflict* 96.

¹⁴ Johnson (n 10) 841.

The research undertaken in this mini-dissertation endeavours to establish that, even though there are some significant achievements, several main problems and trials remain confronting the government and Universities and Universities of Technology with regards to sex and ethnic in the experience of black women academics. The research will also focus on the current legal framework and focus on gender equality and how these plays out within Universities and Universities of Technology. The starting point of the study is that the South African academy is still predominantly white and male because of the socio-economic and cultural effects of colonialism and apartheid.

1.2 RESEARCH QUESTIONS

The main research questions that flow from the above research problem and which will guide the structure of this mini dissertation are as follows:

- What are the challenges faced by black women academics in universities?
- What are the contributing issues to the lack of depiction of black women in high-ranking academic positions in universities?
- What are the existing or common transformation measures adopted by the government and universities to advance and support black women academics?
- What are the policies and practices regarding appointment and promotion for equal employment opportunities?

The objectives of the dissertation are to provide recommendations to the problems associated with the emergence and experience of black women academics in South African HEIs, focusing especially on universities and universities of Technology.

1.3 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This study is determined to investigate the emergence and experiences of black women academics about higher education institutions and to find the exact problems affecting the careers black women academics. Desktop research was employed. The study was therefore be structured by way of a story case study. Desk research is the grouping of derivative data from inside sources, the internet, libraries, trade

associations, government agencies, and published reports.¹⁵ Therefore, material from various journal articles which discuss emergence and experience of black women academics was discussed in this dissertation. A black feminist approach was applied since it is a social research method that concentrates on the way black people understand their encounters as well as the world in which they live in.¹⁶ This dissertation will also employ a standpoint methodological approach that is entrenched in the consciousness that the marginalised crowds, containing black women in South Africa, retain concrete information built on their lived events as black women academics.¹⁷

1.4 OUTLINE OF THE CHAPTERS

This study is divided into five chapters as follows:

The purpose of this first chapter is to give basis for the research problem and the framework for the whole study. The chapter outlines the inspiration driving the study, the problem statement, the research questions, and the research methodology used.

Chapter two will outline the theoretical perspectives linked to the trails met by black women in higher education institutions. The issues contributing to the diminished depiction of black women in leading academic titles in higher institutions will also be discussed.

Chapter three will discuss the legislative measures and framework for gender equality. This chapter examines the problem of gender inequality in higher education that persists despite loopholes in the legislation and the problems that may arise in interpreting the legislation. The chapter also discusses what needs to be done to integrate these international and national instruments into higher education.

Chapter four first discusses the transformation measures taken by the government and universities to address the challenges of black woman academics identified in

¹⁵ SC Baker *et al* 'Using virtual worlds in education: Second Life as an educational tool' (2009) 36 *The teaching of Psychology* 64.

¹⁶ VE Evans-Winters & BL Love *'Black feminism in education: Black women speak back, up, and out'* (2015) New York, NY: Peter Lang 179.

¹⁷ NA Naples *'Standpoint Epistemology and Beyond. Handbook of Feminist Research': Theory and Praxis'* (2009) London: Sage Publications 452.

chapter two and then assesses their effectiveness. It employs a black feminist theoretical framework to examine the experiences of black women academics. The chapter specifically focuses on the compensation arrangements that inspire institutional achievement and bid assistance methods to decrease segregation.

The final chapter contains the conclusion to the dissertation. This chapter answers the question of the rise of black women academics in higher education institutions. The chapter concludes by summarising results of the full dissertation. Centred on study outcomes, suggestions, and answers to the challenges that universities are presently encountering regarding enabling of black women academics in higher education institutions are presented in chapter five.

CHAPTER TWO:

CHALLENGES, BARRIERS AND FACTORS AFFECTING THE ADVANCEMENT AND EXPERIENCE OF BLACK WOMEN ACADEMICS

2.1 INTRODUCTION

In South Africa, social discriminations exist and are profoundly rooted in and mirrored in all areas of social living. The higher education structure remains no exemption. Societal, constitutional, and financial discriminations of a classed, raced, gendered, functional and structural nature that were created throughout the colonial-apartheid time deeply moulded and remaining to form South African higher education.¹ Efforts to transform South African higher education are consequently essentially bordered in terms of the general social goal of exceeding the genetic colonial-apartheid social construct with its profound discriminations and of committing to a different community mandate based on equality. Though, such conversion attempts happen in a higher education environment that is distinguished by a particular historic shape and environment.

South Africa continues to be a highly unfair country worldwide, calculated according to employment, revenue, and means.² Inequality frequently overlays lack, socio-economic difficulty, and race. When inequality shows as discrimination, susceptible crowds like black women academics or individuals who do not follow customary gender roles, encounter several systems of discrimination adding to grief from social rules and assemblies that continue to handicap those who are 'different'. Previously, black women academics have been side-lined and considered as unfit unlike male colleagues regarding social and power interactions. Responding to gender inequality, the establishment necessities of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996, clearly offer for an elected government built on, among other things, the worth of 'non-bigotry'.³ However, fundamental sex separations of work, both paid and unpaid, remain at the core of numerous cultural and social traditions in South Africa. Black

¹ N Cloete 'The South African higher education system: Performance and policy' (2014) 39 (8) *Studies in Higher Education* 1359.

² L Lane & R Birds 'Contextual admissions and affirmative action: Developments in higher education policy in England, perspectives' (2013) 17 (4) *Policy and Practice in Higher Education* 139.

³ R Deacon *et al* 'Education policy studies in South Africa, 1995–2006' (2010) 25 (1) *Journal of Education Policy* 99.

women academics are habitually identified in relative to motherhood and are viewed as generally accountable for loving and labouring for others.

Consequently, black women academics regularly endure difficulty in the formal economy and labour market, whilst individuals who work unpaid black women academics work' take on a disparate and mainly unrecognized responsibility. Nowadays, state-sanctioned violence against black women academics in the broader society, there exists an unbridled culture of violence and oppression against black women in higher education⁴. Black women academics, especially those unafraid and vocal about controversial issues, are especially vulnerable to institution-sanctioned violence. Additionally, impoverishment continues to be a constant influencing element to gender inequality, especially for black women living in rural parts of South Africa. This being one of the motives why black women academics are frequently depicted weak as targets of mistreatment, cruelty, and ill health plus heightened exposure to HIV/AIDS. Consequently, this chapter briefly intends to tackle not only the present status of the equality rights of women in South Africa, but more as well a restricted amount that of the emergence and experience of black women academics. Ultimately, this chapter aims to provide a comprehensive overview of the relationship between gender inequality and South African higher education and then outline the challenges, barriers, and factors affecting the advancement and experience of black women academics in South African universities using black feminist theoretical framework. Therefore, material from various journal articles which discuss emergence and experience of black women academics was discussed in this dissertation. A black feminist approach was applied since it is a social research method that concentrates on the way black people understand their encounters as well as the world in which they live in. Standpoint methodological approach was also applied entrenched in the consciousness that the marginalised crowds, containing black women in South Africa, retain concrete information built on their lived events as black women academics. The selection of material was not random selected but systematic selected.

This chapter reviews existing literature that analyses the emergence and experience of black women academics in universities including supporting issues to the

⁴ NN Croom 'Promotion beyond tenure: Unpacking racism and sexism in the experiences of Black women professors' (2017) 40 *The Review of Higher Education*, 40 583.

underrepresentation of black women academics in high-ranking academic ranks. According to Bhana the whole objective of a literature review is to gather information on a subject concerning anything that is understood or what has been researched about the part and where information disparities occur.⁵ This chapter begins with discussing gender inequality in South African Universities.

2.2 GENDER INEQUALITY IN SOUTH AFRICA

The institutional analysis and development context summarize South Africa's idea regarding gender equality and what the country plans to do to achieve this idea. A strategy was formed for South Africans to take part in resolving the historic inheritance by describing fresh words of position for communications in the private and public areas, and by endorsing an official framework that enables equal contact to goods and services for females and males. Proposing a method that shifts from handling gender matters as 'something at the end of the day business.'⁶ The framework conditions that in conversing growth matters it is frequently assumed that gender matters can be discussed after the discussion about 'hard-core issues'.⁷ The policy framework tries to safeguard that the practice of reaching gender equality is the focal point of the change procedure. The main laws of the framework are established from the standard covered in the Constitution under the Bill of Rights, promoting the rights of all people regardless of ethnic, sex, group, or age.

In South Africa women remain underrepresented in the area of permanent academic staff as they comprise only 43% of the total compliment in public higher education institutions. This inequity becomes more glaring in senior academic positions with only 18.5% of women as professors and 29.8% as associate professors.⁸ Although the number has risen from 29% in 2015 to 40% in 2018 of National Research Foundation (NRF) rated researchers who are women, men still publish more journal articles with black women academics only authoring 14-37% of the published papers with this 23%

⁵ D Bhana 'Race matters and the emergence of class: Views from selected South African university students' (2014) 28 *South African Journal of Higher Education* 364.

⁶ R Deacon *et al* (n 3) 99.

⁷ H Du Plessis 'Governance, higher education policy development and implementation at educational and systemic levels (2009) 65.

⁸ S Riordan & J Louw-Potgieter 'Career success of women academics in South Africa' (2017) 41(2) *South African Journal of Psychology*, 172.

spread determined by the discipline in question.⁹ Yet there are opportunities and other funding resources such as the National Research Foundation Thuthuka program which provides research monies for black women and the previously disadvantaged, some female academics still feel restricted in voicing their concerns about the barriers they encounter in higher education. Some note race or gender-related discrimination and others site jealousies from other black women.

Mainly due to the magnitude to which inequalities are rooted in South African civilization. This is specified in a chapter of the policy framework titled situational analysis and problem statement, that intends to give a global view of key problems that influence South Africa's progress on gender equality.

2.2.1 The post-democratic regulatory framework of higher education

The post-democratic governing framework of higher education mentions the rebuilding and re-organisation of South African higher education institutions in agreement with a corresponding system of legal procedures and document decrees on the one hand, and formal collaboration on the other. De Clercq states that a policy could also be observed as a dispute solution instrument proposed to “restore the cohesiveness, order and functionality of society.”¹⁰ In line with the research topic, it is the government’s responsibility to build and apply such curative instrument/rules by modifiable functionality of HEIs. If established and applied callously, policies can have a harmful effect of highlighting power dynamics and conflicts in the population by furthering the gains of one major faction compared to the other overshadowed faction(s). Though various kinds of policies are in place e.g. substantial, bureaucratic, substantive, emblematic, governing, and redistributive, common qualities are discovered on more than one of this policy categorize.¹¹ For example, as a representative of public good, government has the practical capacity to decide what it must do to correct previous educational inequalities. To a level of senior position in education inequalities that it uses legal tools to declare its aims and progressions of

⁹ M Rabe & P Rugunanan ‘Exploring gender and race amongst female sociologists existing academia in South Africa’ (2019) 24(5) *Gender & Education*, 566.

¹⁰H De Clercq ‘The venture capital post-investment phase: Opening the black box of involvement’ (1997) 147.

¹¹ De Clercq (n 10) 147.

act, the government validates the supervisory and bureaucratic parts of policy introduction, creation, application and assessment.

Black women academics have always worked outside the home despite limited occupational options, and their labour paid and unpaid has been central to the health and stability of their families and their communities. Shaw reports that as far back as 1980 Black women's labour force participation was more than twice as high as their White counterparts.¹² White women academics had a labour force participation rate of 16.3 percent compared with 39.7 percent for non-White women, the vast majority of whom were black women.¹³ Even among married black women, White women's labour force participation rate was just 2.5 percent while for married non-white women it was 22.5 percent¹⁴. Black women's labour force participation rates remain the highest of black women academics from any of the largest racial and ethnic groups, and in 2017 was 60.3 percent compared with 56.4 percent for White and Hispanic women.¹⁵

By introducing policy initiatives like fairness, remedy, and entry, the government exemplified by the Department of Education (DoE), is satisfying equally the redistributive and substantial tasks of policy growth. Mutually redistributive and substantial policy facets relate when the provision of reserves is fairly sent to parties like the formerly ostracized or barred from such reserves. The field of representative policy is an intense argument, when there is more of bombast and vows than concrete achievement and execution of those vowed services. Cloete and Muller confirm that "symbolic policies are not designed to be implemented as proposed; they nearly always have to disguise the nature of the strategic trade-offs to win broad consensus."¹⁶ Relating to the South African HE policy creation situation, the post-1994 period has been mostly distinguished by conflicting pursuits, that reflects that

¹² E Shaw *et al* 'Assets for Equity: Building Wealth for Women in Central Ohio' (2019) 6 *Institute for Women's Policy Research*, 35.

¹³ S.A Department of Labor Statistics 'CPS Tables Annual Averages. (2018) *Table 5 Employment status of the civilian noninstitutional population by sex, age, and race*. 26.

¹⁴ R R Branker 'Labour Market Discrimination: The Lived Experiences of English-Speaking Caribbean Immigrants in Toronto' (2017) 18(1) *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 209.

¹⁵ R Tesfai 'Racialized Labour Market Incorporation? African Immigrants and the Role of Education-Occupation Mismatch in Earnings' (2017) 55(4) *International Migration*, 211.

¹⁶ N Cloete & J Muller 'South African higher education reform: What comes after post-colonialism? (1998) Pretoria: CHET 243.

“a struggle for alignment in Higher education policy has been made within larger societal processes. The government has been unable in the post-1994 period to move far in establishing a systematically reconfigured and transformed system. The period can be characterised as having manifested policy hesitance and inefficacy much of the influences that contributed to shaping the policy field have come from outside higher education.”¹⁷

The post-1994 constitutionally chosen government’s intrusive partiality about policy construction and application was knowledgeable by the desire to reform “from an oligarchic racial State to an inclusive political democracy” working to create a regulatory environment in unit with the recently ushered-in democratic values preserved in the new Constitution of 1996.¹⁸ This study makes a division among a controlled higher education nature and supremacy of HEIs. While the last would denote to inside-motivated small in nature higher education institutional managerial and working systems used to maintain organisational tasks, the past meticulously correlates with outwardly-motivated macrocosmic policy factors in provisions of which the Government plans to portray its directive within the education area overall. In this precise setting and to the level of senior positions that the previous educational system was completely divided to even represent a ‘system’ the post democratic Government’s policy style adopted a mixture type of controlled intercession, that was the modus operandi for reducing conflicts amongst responsibility and independence of Universities and Technikons.¹⁹ The factors of a controlled post-democratic framework of higher education are preceded inside the constitutional viewpoint; the legislative framework; the Reconstruction and Development (RD) outline; as well as the DoE standpoint.

¹⁷A Fataar ‘Higher education policy discourse in South Africa: A struggle for alignment with macro development policy’ (2003) 17 (2) *South African Journal of Higher Education* 31-39.

¹⁸ Fataar (n 17) 31-39.

¹⁹ Universities & Technikons Advisory Council AUT (1996) A qualifications structure for universities in South Africa 7 <https://www.saqa.org.za/sites/default/files/2019-11/act101.pdf> (accessed 30 July 2020).

2.2.2 The constitutional perspective of a regulated higher education environment

The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996 renounces any kind of aberration from the democratic values of the country, and controls the lawful limitations of state-HE-civil people commitment, as well as the revoking of laws that may be an insult to the abandoned exercise of democracy.²⁰ As avowed in its introduction, the purposes of the Constitution are, amongst others, to “heal the divisions of the past and to build a united and democratic South Africa.”²¹ Also, Fataar opposes that as much as the Constitution was mainly founded on generous democratic principles, it did not, nevertheless, assure socio-economic advantages like the right to free education.²² Moreover, Olivier affirms that the concept of “co-operative governance” reinforces the HE-state link in RSA.²³ By eliminating institutional sovereignty as an important liberty in the Constitution, the state would consequently use its depositary obligation and managerial control of the higher education sector by ordering firm levels of responsibility. Nearly 65 percent of Caribbean immigrants live in the New York and Miami metropolitan areas, and more than one quarter of Africans live in the New York, Washington, D.C., and Atlanta metropolitan areas²⁴. As Imoagene noted, black women academics immigrant segregation patterns in places with small black women academics’ immigrant populations can skew results, possibly because of small group representation in the models.²⁵ Furthermore, because of black women academics’ immigrants’ extreme concentration, segregation results obtained at the national level are unlikely to resemble the lived experiences of black women academics’ immigrants. Additionally, the Constitution offers for higher education to be

²⁰ South Africa (Republic) White paper on reconstruction and development: Government’s strategy for fundamental transformation Pretoria: Government Printers (1994) 38

<https://www.gov.za/sites/default/files/16085.pdf> (accessed 30 July 2020).

²¹ The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996.

²² Fataar (n 17) 31-39.

²³ N Olivier ‘The relationship between the state and higher education institutions with reference to higher education policy documentation and the legislative framework. Paper commissioned as support material for the book, *Transformation in higher education: Global pressures and local realities in South Africa*’ (2001) Pretoria: CHET 2 1-14.

²⁴ T G Hamilton *et al* ‘Black Immigration, Occupational Niches, and Earnings Disparities between U.S.-Born and Foreign-Born Blacks in the United States’ (2018) 4(1) *RSF: The Russell Sage Foundation Journal of the Social Sciences*, 77.

²⁵ O Imoagene ‘Stepping up Your Game: Workplace Experiences of Second-Generation Nigerians in the USA’ (2018) 19(2) *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 512.

in the useful field of the national scope of government and does not cover any position to the institutional body of HEIs. In sight of the detail of Higher Education institutions being public forms, recognised according to law and acting out public purposes, it classifies them as structures of government”.²⁶ Since they are publicly sponsored, HEIs are consequently constitutionally held by the values of public management including equity, transparency, and accountability in their policy purpose frameworks.

Chapter Two of the Constitution openly narrates to higher education. Section 9(1) to (5) elaborates on the on the right to equality.²⁷ The State cannot discriminate in any way on any person, “unless it is established that discrimination is fair.”²⁸ Publicly subsidised HEIs are then indebted to guarantee that equality triumphs in all forms of the university’s running. This duty also pertains to the Government, in its trustee position, to safeguard that no pupil is deprived of admission to higher education chance, as this would create unfair discrimination. Sections 15(1); 16 (1) (c) & (d); 29(1)(a),(b) and 29(2) respectively focus the matters of “academic freedom and freedom of scientific research”, the right to basic and further education, as well as the claim of equity in restoring the educational injustices of the past apartheid regime.²⁹ In so far as the establishment of the higher education legal framework is affected, the pertinent and appropriate sections and parts of the Constitution can be observed in this respect, as a juristically ‘negotiated settlement’ for achieving incrementalism/campaigner unlike extremist/innovative policy re-formulation for the role of higher education in the country’s budding democratic allowance.³⁰

2.2.3 The legislative framework of a regulated higher education environment

The Higher Education Act, Act 101 of 1997 started to offer an attitude or an academic framework upon which the upcoming of South African higher education would exist in.³¹ Instilled with the characteristic democratic standards of the RSA Constitution, the Higher Education Act, is debatably the most reflective forerunner to the founding of a solo and harmonized HE system.³² The above named Act

²⁶ Olivier (n 23) 1-14.

²⁷ Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996 Chapter 2 sec 9(1) and sec 5.

²⁸ South Africa (Republic) ‘Education white paper 3 39.

²⁹ The Higher Education Act 27 of 1997 secs 15 (1),16(c);(d), 29(1),29(2) & 29(9).

³⁰ Fataar (n 17) 31-40.

³¹ The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996; The Higher Education Act (Act 101 of 1997).

³² Olivier (n 23) 1-14.

offered the legal framework for higher education policy change. To the degree that the 1997 Higher Education Act is broad of “transitional arrangements” like the retract of historical discriminatory laws and accordingly turns into the legal embodiment of a gradual and activist method to HE policy change. The Act then shoulders the role of a change from figurative policy developmental manner and all its associated difficulties, to anticipate a ‘policy vacuum’.

The Act attends to a variety of subjects, counting the creating of Council on Higher Education (CHE) as an advisory body to the Minister of Higher Education; quality assurance in the HE sectors; also, the funding and governance of HEIs.³³ The Act proceeds to authorise the Minister to outcome HE-related deviations, the sort of which are corresponding with both the Constitution and the renovation of the higher education scene. Also, the Act authorises the Minister of Higher Education to assign circumstances to the allowing of capital and credit of programmes of learning.³⁴

Cloete and Maasen oppose that the 1997 Higher Education Act befitted the prime legal way to forestall a “policy vacuum”, a state of execution inactivity that has been noticeably proven by “many of the key implementation instruments such as inter-linked planning and funding system, redress funding, a capacity-building plan and a research plan which had not been implemented by 2001.”³⁵

2.2.4 The Reconstruction Development Programme

The Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) paper with all its figurative policy results is one of the most important prime papers to be referred in the formulation of a way of life of education for South Africa.³⁶ This philosophy must place the formative foundation for the construction of commonly-shared national standards and urgencies, as well as for HE policy design in the situation of vows and distribution alongside, and the roles and purposes of the new HE system on the latter.³⁷ Kallaway

³³ The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996; The Higher Education Act (Act 101 of 1997).

³⁴ Olivier (n 23) 1-14.

³⁵ N Cloete & J Muller ‘South African higher education reform: What comes after post-colonialism? (1998) Pretoria: CHET 243.

³⁶ GM Nkondo ‘Towards sustainable pedagogical transformation: A perspective on the National Commission on Higher Education Black perspective(s) on tertiary institutional transformation (1998) Florida Hills: Vivlia Publishers & University of Venda 31-41.

³⁷ T Subotzky ‘Mergers in higher education – success and failures? *Tertiary Education and Management*’ (1997), 5(1) 107-180.

advocates that the RDP document more so envisioned to settle local strains and global techno-scientific fears, in order that poor and rural communities also profit from the results of democracy.³⁸ The RDP is seen here as a connection between the diction of higher education thinking as far as the purposes of HE are concerned, even as a “redistributive development, premised on RDP goals and growth through redistribution or the global development path, premised on redistribution through growth of the market.”³⁹

The RDP’s inadequacies therefore sanction the frequency of strains in a “dual, but integrated structure of South African society shaped by apartheid and largely determined along racial lines: namely, the combination of a relatively advanced political, economic and social order linked to a relatively under-developed one, upon which the former has depended on the latter in many critical ways for its existence and reproduction.”⁴⁰

Nkondo’s opinion of a related higher education philosophy is one that tries to raid equilibrium amongst the developmental university and the market university.⁴¹ The developmental university is entrenched in tackling elementary and direly-needed socio-economic chances by ways of groundbreaking curriculum styles; while the market university tackles the neo-liberal outline by ways of which higher education has convert a part of the trans-national ‘commodification’ initiative. In a policy setting then, the RDP view was “high on rhetoric and low on implementation.”⁴² The resultant conversation emphasizes more on the structural and theoretical parts of the unions, than on the official typologies subsequent from the reconfigured HE ecosystem in South Africa.

³⁸P Kallaway *Whatever happened to rural education as a goal for (South) African development? Vision and reality* (1998) Cape Town: UCT Press 20-58.

³⁹ Subotzky (n 37) 107-180.

⁴⁰ Subotzky (n 37) 107-180.

⁴¹ Nkondo (n 36) 31-41.

⁴² R King ‘What is higher education for? Strategic dilemmas for the twenty-first century university. *Quality Assurance in Education*’ (1995), 3(4) MCB University Press 25.

2.3 GENDER INEQUALITY IN HIGHER EDUCATION

Bhorat *et al*, claims that the “constructs of leadership denied the private realm and the connections between public and private life.”⁴³ She contends that management is seen as capability and presentation, with male qualities being preferred. In management, the effective parting of public and private encounters with endorsement and dents the goals of alteration of public and private life. She claims that organisational culture, and organisational settings, still support a manly sight of management. Her study led in the Gauteng Provincial Department of Education settles that the mainly raced and gendered charm of the structural culture and addresses of management moulded the situation in which men and women worked. Koen mention that Leading concepts of management enclosed by a notion of the “colour of competence” had its correlate in the gender of capability.⁴⁴ Black women academics hence fought against masculinist and racist notions of what established management.⁴⁵

The absence of execution of gender equity in spite of legislation, is emphasised by Deacon *et al*, as quoted in a Higher Education Conference Report of 2008, signifying that an absence of consideration of the intricacy of gender discrimination in institutions, has resulted to an absence of execution and black women gender discrimination.⁴⁶ According to Mzangwa and Dede, if considerations of decent management are founded on concepts of manliness, this effects understanding of quality, and demands for more systematic research on issues touching holding like maleness in management, institutional and organisational blockades, and the impacts of society’s gendered cultures.”⁴⁷

Similarly, Schwanke, in the North American context, also argues that cultural and structural circumstances and performs make blockades to and chances for the

⁴³ H Bhorat *et al* ‘Employment Effects in the Temporary Employment Services (TES) Sector:’ (2015) Post Labour Relation Amendment Act (s198).

⁴⁴ C Koen ‘Moving toward uncertainty: Higher education restructuring in South Africa’ (2003) Cape Town: University of Western Cape 21-84.

⁴⁵ Lane & Birds (n 2) 139.

⁴⁶ Deacon et al (n 3) 99.

⁴⁷ Mzangwa, ST & Dede, Y ‘The effects of higher education policy on transformation in post-apartheid South Africa’ (2019) 6(1) *Cogent Education* 1-16.

progression of black women in higher education management.⁴⁸ Attitudinal and organizational prejudices against women in higher education manage to dismiss black women from upper-level management titles.⁴⁹ These prejudices are rooted in unseen blockades, shortage of mentors, the old boys' networks, gender inequalities, and dimmer career routes.⁵⁰ In an Australian study, Lane and Birds says that globally, universities have much work onward of them if they are to recompense the gender disparity in senior positions and payment rates.⁵¹ Their research shows that scorn policy improvements inequity stays an issue in the Australian higher education department with insinuations for the acknowledgement and tackling of inequity in the global higher education business. Lane and Birds quote Deacon *et al*, who claims that even though study admits a gender inequity, the inequality is not rectified as there is a hesitancy to picture numerous of the most generally acknowledged claims to severe inspection, thereby stopping an understanding of the notable tenacity of unequal results for men and women especially black women academics in relations of salary and rank.⁵² Deacon *et al*, also discovered that in spite of the creation of forms to endorse the hire and career growth of black women, cultural variables like concepts of gender roles and features; male-ruled forms and substance at universities were driving against those strategies.⁵³ Alternative habits to “consider and realise complete gender equality in higher education is yet to be found”.

Shangase and Proches in their research in engagement with Bhorat and Goga write on how gender is established in the academy occupies with a fear by Leonard about how women can be braced to accomplish their ambitions and curl in higher education, short of being hurt and obstructed by male-controlled performs and customs.⁵⁴ Bhorat *et al*, state that women were inattentive from places of control and impact because they needed awareness of the rules of the game.⁵⁵ Black women academics, she

⁴⁸ DS Schwanke 'Barriers for Women to Position of Power: How Societal and Corporate Structures, Perceptions of Leadership and Discrimination Restrict Women's Advancement to Authority' (2013) 3 (2) *Earth Common Journal* 571.

⁴⁹ Schwanke (n 48) 571.

⁵⁰ H Bhorat & S Goga, 'The Gender Wage Gap in Post-Apartheid South Africa: A Re-examination' (2013) 22 (5) *Journal of African Economies* 835.

⁵¹ Lane & Birds (n 2) 139.

⁵² Lane & Birds (n 2) 139.

⁵³ Deacon *et al* (n 3) 99.

⁵⁴ N Shangase & C Proches 'Leadership Challenges Facing Female Employees in the Telecommunications Industry' (2014) 12 (2) *Gender and Behaviour* 628.

⁵⁵ Bhorat & Goga (n 50) 835.

maintained, were frequently unwilling to be tangled in the competitive, self-advertising conduct usually linked with overriding maleness. Black women academics are stimulated to absorb with the concealed syllabus of academia, for example, the custom of links, contacts, tenacity, and political assistances. In their closing comments Borhat and Goga argue that power must be considered, and ways have to be initiated to reduce the control of the masculine order, instead of expecting black women academics to seam the positions.⁵⁶

They additionally state that concepts of gender personalities are split and should instead be preserved as something that is in recurrent creation. Issues like alterations in age, ethnicities, disabilities, sexualities, cultural and social class must also be reflected in relations of power circulation. More they suggest that studies must also include victory tales of black women academics retrieving power and enabling feminist revolution as well as, the unsureness or preferences that most black women academics go through in higher education. Zulu proposes that “we require a re-invigorated and re-textured vocabulary and an expanded lexicon to focus on the leadership values and challenges that lie ahead for higher education”.⁵⁷ Including, between others, making awareness for a fast altering world. Eventually, Shangase and Proches lectures that management roles seem to be so over-extended that they signify a sort of manhood test and that there is a necessity to discover how management performs can become more maintainable, with regards to health and well-being as well as competitive act in the global pitch.⁵⁸ In other words, we require fresh guidelines for a much-changed game.

2.3.1 Black women in the South African higher education context

Black women structure the bulk of the South African populace and are serious to the progress and expansion of the economy as well as overall security of society.⁵⁹ Black women in control are role models in proving to the latent and competences of black women in a society where there is still discrimination against the girl-child and black women in footings of demarcated roles and as echoed in figures of abuse and

⁵⁶ Borhat & Goga (n 43) 835.

⁵⁷ CB Zulu ‘A comparative study of women in management in higher education in South Africa and the United Kingdom’ (2009).

⁵⁸ Shangase & Proches (n 54) 628.

⁵⁹ Cloete (n 1) 1359.

violence. Cloete specifies that South African businesses are still failing in gender quotas.⁶⁰ Back in 2014 globally, the quantity of black women in senior business jobs has stayed fixed at 38 percent.⁶¹ But the percentage of black women academics in senior business ranks has increased by 10 percent in 2018.⁶² This encompassed populace demographics, urbanisation, and equality of chance. In “countries with patriarchal societies black women are at or near the bottom of the ratings”.⁶³

Person *et al*, conducted a survey published in 2017 on gender equity development in Higher Education in South Africa and founded its results on 17 Higher Education Institutions.⁶⁴ The report settled that senior management numbers including “Vice Chancellor, Deputy Vice Chancellors”, Executive Deans and Chief Directors under this group, mirrored an average of 48 percent for women and 52 percent for men. Middle management numbers including “elected and/or associate Deans, Directors in various Departments and functions”, replicated a minor surge in the average percentage: 49 percent black women academics and 51 percent men academics. The commentary showed that equity made complete business wisdom and is a decent and ethical necessity. With such a small depiction of black women in these strategic groups what is totally absent are the visions, viewpoints, and experiences of over half of the population. This could influence institutional culture in relations of management styles, the institution’s image main concern and decision observes, incentives, and resources, also the placement of the institution in the HE markets.

Okoji, in the preface of a 2006 USAID report, showed that the 2003 review of empowerment of women and gender policies echoed “glaring disparities in gender balance in institutions”.⁶⁵ Lane and Birds also showed that “despite the formulation of many gender policies, the implementation of these policies was still problematic for most institutions.”⁶⁶ An agenda to tackle the answers of the May 2003 USAID account,

⁶⁰ Cloete (n 1) 1359.

⁶¹ K J Thomas ‘Occupational Stratification, Job-Mismatches, and Child Poverty: Understanding the Disadvantage of Black Immigrants in the U.S.’ (2015) 50 *Social Science Research*, 216.

⁶² L D Patton & C Haynes ‘Hidden in plain sight: The Black women’s blueprint for institutional transformation in higher education’ *Teachers College Record*, 120.

⁶³ Cloete (n 1) 1359

⁶⁴ D Person *et al* ‘Building South African women’s leadership: A cohort model for the PhD in student affairs’ (2014) 2 (1) *Journal of Student Affairs in Africa* 239.

⁶⁵ O Okoji ‘Influence of Leadership Styles on Community Development Programmes’ Implementation in Rural Communities of Akwa Ibom State Nigeria’ (2014)8 (2) *African Research Review* 86.

⁶⁶ Lane & Birds (n 2) 139.

was presented in September 2005, and was named Women in Higher Education Executive Leadership (WHEEL).⁶⁷ The emphasis was on the enabling of women over teaching and tutoring to undertake executive leadership roles in higher education. A strategic business was also shaped with Higher Education South Africa (HESA), to safeguard the steadiness of the course. The underrepresentation stayed a concern and area for beset action.

We are now in 2020. 2019 was not just another year in South Africa. It's worth is marked by 25 years of democracy, and the acceptance of the Women Empowerment and Gender Equality Bill (WEGEB) by the National Assembly of the Republic of South Africa.⁶⁸ The WEGEB calls for the advanced recognition of about 50 percent depiction of black women academics in decision-making assemblies, and its intentions at refining black women's admission to education, training, and skills development.

Northouse mentions that in the Swedish higher education context, the entire sum of black women who are professors and senior lecturers in the humanities, in veterinarian medicine and in odontology are very scarce equated to the entire sum of black women lecturers in the identical fields.⁶⁹ Implying that women are down played in progressive rankings in higher education in Sweden. Other research led by Okoji in China divulges that the number of black women academics who are in higher rankings in Chinese higher education is minimal unlike other countries, despite the point that women have accomplished to crack through the glass roof and penetrate the positions of the best.⁷⁰ This means that the challenge of women's underrepresentation in the upper echelons of academia is a worldwide phenomenon and not only a South African problem.

2.4 BARRIERS AND FACTORS AFFECTING THE ADVANCEMENT AND EXPERIENCE OF BLACK WOMEN ACADEMICS

This section presents a review of work that has been done in South Africa and other shores of the world in terms of how black women academics have been progressing in their careers. It will also identify the factors that both hinder and promote women in their careers in general and higher education. Recent research has focused on the

⁶⁷ USAID 'Field Report Macedonia May' (2003).

⁶⁸ Women Empowerment and Gender Equality Bill (2013).

⁶⁹ GP Northouse '*Leadership: Theory and practice*' (2015) London: Sage publications. 64.

⁷⁰ Okoji (n 65) 86.

career development of black women in higher education in various ways.⁷¹ This study will therefore focus on the career development of black women academics in terms of higher positions in academia. This area of progress is chosen to be investigated because it is surprising that black women academics today enter the workplace with the same levels, credentials, expectations, and necessary experience for advancement as men, but do not rise to top positions at the same pace in the same way as their male counterparts. Schwanke asserts this view by stating that black women perform the same as men, and at times even surpass them when it comes to earning university degrees but lag in terms of career progression.⁷²

Although black women academics have greater representation than black men academics, as of 2011, 23.5% of Black men academics were tenured or tenure-track versus 16.2% of black women; additionally, 83.8% of black women academics were contingent (or “term” faculty) versus 76.5% of black men.⁷³ Such disparities underscore the ways in which gender operates to further marginalize black women. As in my own role, black women are often given excessive service responsibility, usually requiring them to serve in tokenized roles to meet structural diversity needs within the university⁷⁴. The question here is why do black women academics continue to experience barriers to complete success? According to Shangase and Proches, women possess great leadership potential but this potential is obstructed by social, economic, and political constraints formed through common culture, history, perception of status, access to assets, and economic agents.⁷⁵ In the same light, Ricketts and Ricketts state that although black women academics have achieved specialised and managerial decision taking titles at the lower and middle points of the organisational ranking, it is still stimulating for them to get managerial positions in universities as they are still far behind men in terms of their representation in top management positions.⁷⁶ They further noted that some of the reasons for this are perceptions that black women academics are not good in leadership, recruitment discrimination and inflexible time arrangement for black women academics with young

⁷¹ Zulu (n 57)

⁷² Schwanke (n 48) 571.

⁷³ G Khunou *et al* ‘Black Academic Voices: The South African Experience’ (2019) *Cape Town: HSRC Press*, 59.

⁷⁴ I Meko ‘Silent no more: Challenges facing black African academics at South African universities’ (2016), 61.

⁷⁵ Shangase & Proches (n 54) 628.

⁷⁶ C Ricketts & J Ricketts ‘*Leadership: Personal Development and Career Success*’ (2011) 2nd ed. London: Cengage Publisher 197.

children. Scholars have identified different reasons for this situation. Ricketts and Ricketts argue that the first key barrier to the progress of black women academics in higher education is the “glass ceiling”.⁷⁷

According to Schwanke, the concept of the glass ceiling refers to “the unseen, yet unreachable barrier that keeps minorities and black women academics from rising to the upper rungs of the corporate ladder, regardless of their qualifications or achievements.”⁷⁸ Bhorat *et al*, highlight that academic promotions largely depend on journal archives, conference presentations and study that sometime need scholars to travel for long periods.⁷⁹ Though, some traditions and cultures still confine the drive of black women academics and, as such, place black women academics in a deprived situation in this respect. This may be the reason why Lane and Birds notes that some black women academics do not progress because moving into management positions brings additional stress, since they consider management work to be inflexible and restrictive.⁸⁰

Furthermore, barriers to the career progress of black women academics can be explained by the social role and expectation theories.⁸¹ These theories suggest that a perception has been created that leadership tasks require features that are masculine which leads to misconceptions that men make better leaders than black women academics. For instance, Shangase and Proches argue that leadership positions are less attractive to women than men because black women academics in administrative offices are underfunded as compared to the amount of work they do.⁸² Secondly, black women academics in leadership positions are expected to be available at work at any time and success in such positions often depends on them having a spouse who can shoulder domestic responsibilities. The same may apply to academic leaders; some black women academics find it less attractive because they have personal obligations that they cannot delegate to others. In the same light, Person *et al*, in the Report of the Symposium on “Overcoming Barriers to black women in Leadership in Higher Education, holds that some women are not interested in senior management positions

⁷⁷ Ricketts & Ricketts (n 76) 197.

⁷⁸ Schwanke (n 48) 571.

⁷⁹ Bhorat & Goga (n 43) 835.

⁸⁰ Lane & Birds (n 2) 139.

⁸¹ Schwanke (n 48) 571

⁸² Shangase & Proches (n 54) 628.

in higher education because of the inherent challenges of such positions”.⁸³ The literature consistently posits that “black women academics are the most stressed, the least satisfied, almost the least represented, possibly the least supported, and the most overworked of all faculty in academe”.⁸⁴

Cloete argues that in South Africa one of the main problems hindering the career progression of women is poor self-image.⁸⁵ Okoji expose that many black women academics lose self-confidence due to gender discrimination and lack a of mentoring and leadership growth programmes.⁸⁶ They further explain that South African board rooms are 67% male dominated, meaning that as many black women academics do not progress as all gender men in academics. Person *et al*, explain that black women academics under-representation is a result of formations in institutions of higher education that have been very formal and soaked in traditions and rituals that favour men.⁸⁷ According to Schwanke, this underrepresentation of black women academics is a lost opportunity for black women academics to influence and subsidise to the imminent of higher education.⁸⁸ Zulu argue that working black women academics are deprived by an absence of policy answers on how to stabilize their home responsibilities and workplace activities, since black women academics generally occupy a larger share of family responsibility.⁸⁹ Though, it would be interesting to find out why the problem still persists and what is being done to address it, especially in the context of the higher education environment in South Africa, despite the policies that are in place to support gender equity. Scholars have identified different reasons that hinder the progress of black women academics negatively and these reasons are identified and elaborated below.

2.4.1 Negative stereotypes at the workplace

The impact of stereotypes on gender and leadership has been studied for decades. Black women academics have been unfitting for management positions. Person *et al*,

⁸³ Person *et al* (n 64) 239.

⁸⁴ T Maseti ‘The university is not your home: lived experiences of a Black woman in academia’ (2018) 48(3) *South African Journal of Psychology*, 350.

⁸⁵ Cloete (n 16) 1359

⁸⁶ Okoji (n 65) 86.

⁸⁷ Person *et al* (n 64) 239.

⁸⁸ Schwanke (n 48) 571.

⁸⁹ Zulu (n 57).

note that stereotype in the work environment occur because most jobs were formerly held uniquely by men and, as a substitute of generating new words for women in those occupations, the nouns continued to be manly.⁹⁰ Even black women academics who have climbed to exceptional career altitudes are directed by negative attitudes stereotypes.

Okoji explains that w black women academics who do take up leadership roles are often judged negatively by men academics and black women academics alike.⁹¹ They also reveal that black women academics who abide by the traditional female or feminine characteristics are perceived as too nice and therefore not capable enough to handle leadership positions. On the other hand, those that show more masculine characteristics are also considered to be difficult. This perception alone makes it difficult for black women academics who are in leadership positions because they must work more than men to attest themselves. Ricketts and Ricketts believe that this is a barrier to the progress of black women academics.⁹² Stereotyping has blocked the progress of black women academics by moulding qualms over their management aptitudes and by compelling them to individually imitate to those qualms.

2.4.2 Racism and bias in recruitment

Another factor that negatively impacts black women academics progress in higher education is racism and bias in hiring black women academics. Maseko reveals that institutional prejudice that starts at the hiring phase endures through women's careers.⁹³ It was also discovered that, in the context of legal academia for example, women of colour encounter blockades with employment and promotion due to the bias and discrimination present.⁹⁴ Statistics show that the hiring break amongst white and 'non-white' is not the same in the United States.⁹⁵ For instance, 73% of white law professors are approved occupancy by year eight, compared to only 47% of law professors of colour.⁹⁶ This bias in the hiring of black women and the promotion

⁹⁰ Person et al (n 64) 239.

⁹¹ Okoji (n 65) 86.

⁹² Ricketts & Ricketts (n 76)

⁹³ TI Maseko 'A comparative Study of Challenges Faced by Women in Leadership: A case of Foskor and the Department of Labour in Mhlathuze Municipality' (2013) University of Zululand 69-108.

⁹⁴ Maseko (n 93) 69-108.

⁹⁵ Person et al (n 64) 239.

⁹⁶ Person et al (n 64) 239.

process shows a part in the continuing low representation of black women academics in top head of the departments (HOD) in academics positions in higher education.

2.4.3 Discrimination at the workplace

Black women academics often do not advance in organisations due to direct and indirect discrimination that is practiced in organisations.⁹⁷ Person *et al*, believe that the underrepresentation of black women academics at top levels is a result of unequal treatment of men and black women academics at the workplace, as well as the outcome of gender choices such as parenting and career roles.⁹⁸ Discrimination against black women academics is also found in remuneration, also known as the “gender pay gap”. Bhorat and Goga reveal that black women academics all over the world still get paid less than men, even when they are doing the same jobs as their male counterparts.⁹⁹ There is also continued gender discrimination in certain fields where more men, are seen working in engineering, construction, mining, manufacturing, and math-intensive fields, while more black women academics work in human resources, marketing, and public relations.¹⁰⁰

According to Yam, the reasons for women's underrepresentation in math-exhaustive grounds of science is due to sex discrimination in funding document revising; questioning; and employment.¹⁰¹ They believe that society is presently affianced in resolving difficulties of the past, instead of tackling evocative confines discouraging black women academics involvement in science, technology, engineering, and mathematics careers today. Person *et al*, further note that if the underrepresentation of black women academics in math-severe grounds is not due to unfair paper or funding evaluations, maybe its fallouts from unfair questioning and employment choices.¹⁰²

In the case of South Africa, Zulu shows that women often find themselves subjected to several kinds of discriminatory behaviours, attitudes and policies, despite the

⁹⁷ Ricketts & Ricketts (n 76)

⁹⁸ Person *et al* (n 64) 239.

⁹⁹ Bhorat & Goga (n 43) 835.

¹⁰⁰ Northouse (n 69)

¹⁰¹ N Yam ‘Raising half the sky: work–life balance of Chinese female administrative workers’ (2008) Auckland University of Technology.

¹⁰² Person *et al* (n 53) 239.

numerous campaigns that have been carried out to ensure black women academics identical and just admission to the workplace.¹⁰³ According to Maseko, in South Africa, racial discrimination tends to outshine other types of discrimination.¹⁰⁴ The reason is that a gap was formed among white and non-white females during apartheid, thus stopping them from merger and admitting the reality of gender prejudice beside them. This implies that access to equal jobs is still discriminatory. The report also shows that besides having equal job opportunities, many developing countries are still facing an industrialisation process where new occupations are frequently characterised by poor employment situations, low pay, no sense of sanctuary and restricted chances to ascent the business ranking.

2.4.4 Sexual harassment

The Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (USEEOC) rules describe sexual harassment as the unwanted sexual advances, desires for sexual favours, and other spoken or bodily demeanour of a sexual nature that openly or indirectly disturbs an individual's employment, unreasonably interferes with their work performance, or creates an intimidating, hostile, or offensive work environment. Sexual harassment was first documented in cases in which black women lost their occupations due to rejecting sexual proposals from their bosses.¹⁰⁵ This type of sexual harassment started to be described as "quid pro quo" sexual harassment - Latin for "this for that", denoting that a career or educational break is trained on some kind of sexual recital. Soon it was familiar in employment law that prevalent chauvinist behaviour from co-workers can produce horrible situations of service that became identified as an aggressive work situation and also establish illegal or unlawful discrimination.¹⁰⁶ These two straightforward types of sexual harassment, "quid pro quo" and hostile environment harassment, were abridged in the rules delivered by the USEEOC in 1980.

Aggressive work or educational situations can be formed by behaviours like speaking to black women academics in unpolished or actualising terms, broadcasting

¹⁰³ Zulu (n 57)

¹⁰⁴ Maseko (n 93) 69-108.

¹⁰⁵ CE O'Connell & K Korabik 'Sexual harassment: The relationship of personal vulnerability, work context, perpetrator status, and type of harassment to outcomes' (2000) 56 *Journal of Vocational Behavior* 299–329.

¹⁰⁶ KC Woods & NT Buchanan 'Sexual harassment across the color line: Experiences and outcomes of cross- vs. intra-racial sexual harassment among Black women (2007) Manuscript submitted for publication 58-104.

pornographic pictures in the workplace, and by making belittling or offensive remarks about women, like telling sexist jokes. Aggressive environment harassment also includes unsolicited sexual proposals like revealing one's private parts, forcefully caressing and fondling somebody, and forcing a person for dates even if no quid pro quo is concerned.¹⁰⁷ An imperative difference among quid pro quo and hostile environment harassment is that the former typically entails a one-on-one relationship where the culprit has command of employment or educational linked incentives or penalties over the goal. In distinction, the concluding can include several culprits and numerous targets. In the hostile environment type of sexual harassment, colleagues frequently display a form of hostile sexist behaviour on many victims over a prolonged period of time.¹⁰⁸ For hostile sex-related or gender-related behaviour to be reflected as illegal sexual harassment, it must be persistent or obvious enough to be arbitrated as having had an undesirable effect upon the work or educational environment. So, remote, or single occurrences of such behaviour naturally succeed only when they are umpired to be adequately harsh. Legal scholars and judges remain to use the two subtypes meanings of quid pro quo and hostile environment to describe sexual harassment.

Sexual harassment falls under the canopy of a further broad classification, prejudiced behaviour. Illegal discrimination can happen on the foundation of any legally safe group: race, ethnicity, religious creed, age, sex, gender identity or expression, marital status, national origin, ancestry, sexual orientation, genetic information, physical or mental disabilities, veteran status, prior conviction of a crime, or affiliation in other safeguarded classes put out in government or national law. Sexual harassment involves gender harassment, a phrase intended to highlight that detrimental or illegal sexual harassment need not necessarily have to be about sexual activity. Sexual harassment represents discrimination as it is dangerous, and it is centred on gender and not certainly inspired by sexual need nor does it need to entail sexual activity.

Both legal principle and social science study acknowledge gender is about mutually one's biological sex and gender-based stereotypes and expectations, like

¹⁰⁷ O'Connell & Korabik (n 105) 299-329.

¹⁰⁸ S Lim & L M Cortina 'Interpersonal mistreatment in the workplace: The interface and impact of general incivility and sexual harassment' (2005) 90 *Journal of Applied Psychology* 483-496.

heterosexuality and appropriate show of gender roles. Sexual harassment in the type of gender harassment can be founded on the breach of cultural gender stereotypes. For example, a man can go through gender harassment by being referred to as a “sissy” or being simply uncomfortable by pornography, contravening stereotypes that men must be strong, heterosexual, and sexually daring, while a woman can be gender harassed for accepting a job customarily carried by a man or in a usually male field. Gender harassment in this position could involve actions to sabotage the black women academics tools, machinery, or equipment, or saying the black women academics is not adequately keen for scientific work. Following sections of this study confer gender harassment in more detail.

It should be noted that sexual harassment is habitually circling, implying that it is “not clearly targeted at any individual or group of individuals”¹⁰⁹ in the labour or learning environment or behaviour that drives beyond the immediate aim of the harassment.¹¹⁰ Ambient sexual harassment is defined by a typical “frequency of sexually harassing behaviour experienced by others” and can consist of all forms of sexually harassing behaviour. For example, it can consist of pornography being flashed in a shared area or sexually abusive tongue being applied openly in the job or learning environment.¹¹¹ Ambient unsolicited sexual interest and sexual oppression denote to noticed cases of unwelcome sexual hunt, aimed at a colleague. In other words, one may not be directly affected to feel the impacts of sexual harassment just like a second-hand smoker.

Despite polished meanings and phrases to explain sexual harassment and gender discrimination, detailing the extent of these behaviours in work and education environments stays challenging. This is in part since persons facing these behaviours seldom tag them as such. Several studies have shown that over a half of working women account going through sexually harassing behaviour at work, yet less than 20 percent of those black women academics refer to the event as “sexual harassment.”¹¹²

¹⁰⁹ Woods & Buchanan (n 106) 58-104.

¹¹⁰ Lim & Cortina (n 108) 483-496.

¹¹¹ IH Settles ‘Use of an intersectional framework to understand Black women’s racial and gender identities’ (2006) 54 *Sex Roles* 589–601.

¹¹² Woods & Buchanan (n 106) 58-104.

2.4.5 Lack of perceived role models for women

According to Northouse, the lack of perceived positive role models in academics is a key reason for the absence of growth of black women academics in their professions.¹¹³ Black women academics lack potential female role models who combine academic career with family responsibilities. Schwanke also believe that black women academics who have succeeded in making it to top position as men are mostly women who do not have children and thus devote all their time to their work.¹¹⁴ Only a few black women academics with families or children can successfully manage both work and family. This is because they get easily distracted by their children or families and are most often caught between their jobs and families. According to Bhorat *et al*, the under-representation of black women academics in leading level places can give the impression that being a woman is a problem.¹¹⁵ This impression discourages black women academics leaders from aspiring to ranks of management seeing what other black women academics face and how they are handled. lack black women academics confront hostility from male colleagues when they try to work out of their specified cultural and social roles. The shortage of women as managers makes them look incompetent as role models. Zulu further points out that, the fact that fewer role models exist for women makes it difficult for other black women academics to be inspired and rise to top positions at the workplace.¹¹⁶

Due to patriarchy and the idea that men are better managers instead of women, McNae and Vali stated that women hold 18.7% of full professorships and only 19.3% of administrations.¹¹⁷ Clearly men lead the governance and management positions of institutions of higher education. More touching is the possibility that black women academics concerns in the institutions may not be adequately cared for, and that black women academics have little or no role models and mentors, something that may have extensive consequences in terms of creating forthcoming black women academics leaders. In this illumination, it is certainly crucial to acknowledge the case of Erasmus

¹¹³ Northouse (n 69)

¹¹⁴ Schwanke (n 48) 571.

¹¹⁵ Zulu (n 57).

¹¹⁶ Zulu (n 57).

¹¹⁷ R McNae & K Vali 'Diverse experiences of women leading in higher education: Locating networks and agency for leadership within a university context in Papua New Guinea (2015) 27(3) *Gender and Education* 288–303.

et al, that black women academics professors in higher education do not just come out of nowhere.¹¹⁸ They must be cultivated and formed appropriately across society. In other words, for black women academics to excel and be on par with their male counterparts they must receive opportunities and training equivalent to that of men. Maseko discovered that even though women and men getting the same educational qualifications, black women academics continue to be under-promoted in contrast to men, but women are not physiologically or sensibly reluctant to devote time, money or effort into the development of their professions in this area.¹¹⁹

In addition to the above, Farinde-Wu and Fitchett observe that universities are traditionally seen as clusters of free thought and human development.¹²⁰ But the writing on management position of women in higher education indicates that black women academics are less likely than men to be component of upper levels of senior management. This is reiterated by Williams's finding that "management in higher education is still a man's world and universities are male-dominated institutions when it comes to leadership".¹²¹

2.4.6 Work-life balance

Previously, domestic duties like childcare, housework, and care for the old were mostly reserved for only black women academics. Contemporary research has exposed that some men have begun taking "father time" with their children.¹²² Though the time that dads consume with their children has improved, black women academics accomplish more than twice what men do. According to Ricketts and Ricketts wedded women with kids are more expected to work double shifts, one at their paid job and one at home.¹²³ Apportioning with the opposing pressures of work and home life is a battle for black women academics. Often leading to anxiety and disappointment for many black women who are incompetent to work for their promotions. Bhorat and Goga declares

¹¹⁸ BJ Erasmus *et al* 'Employee retention in a higher education institution: An organisational development perspective' (2015) 37(2) *Progression* 32–62.

¹¹⁹ Maseko (n 93) 69-108.

¹²⁰ A Farinde-Wu & PG Fitchett 'Searching for satisfaction black female teachers' workplace climate and job satisfaction' (2018) 53 *Urban Education* 86-112.

¹²¹ DA Williams 'Strategic diversity leadership: Activating change and transformation in higher education' (2013) Sterling, VA: Stylus.

¹²² N Yam 'Raising half the sky: work-life balance of Chinese female administrative workers' (2008) Auckland University of Technology.

¹²³ Ricketts & Ricketts (n 76)

that most black women academics grumble that they are stuck between those early morning meetings, sometimes as early as 7:00am, and the family time of planning kids for school and breakfast.¹²⁴ Some black women who are extremely influenced by this frequently quit from their jobs owing to the problem that they face.

As per Yam, the work-family link handicaps women as they are regularly less mobile, since family priorities make them refrain from accepting positions that need lengthier workdays, extra travel or transferring geologically to a new site of employment.¹²⁵ This is a grave challenge for women as they do not have the time to stay back and work after work as their male colleagues. Women have minimal time to mingle with associates to develop relations and network, along with showing their devotion to the societal side of the organization.¹²⁶

The various positions/errands that black women academics do are deemed a hurdle to their career progression. Tran discovered that the anticipation of long hours was a substantial hurdle to many black women academics pursuing campaigns in the universities.¹²⁷ Moody and Toni's study on the experiences of black women lecturers in Nigeria disclosed that these women have the task of satisfying social and cultural roles in add-on to their position as lecturers.¹²⁸ Many of these black women academics lecturers are wives and mothers that must find a balance between their work and family life, and regrettably, at times, black women academics end up having role dispute.¹²⁹ Hannum *et al*, says that, for numerous black women academics, in supplement to the roles they have in universities, they stay the primary caretakers for their families making it hard for them to hike higher in academia as it will require extra time and attention.¹³⁰

This way of argument has been supplementary advanced by Farinde-Wu and Fitchett when they indicated out that black women academics have the probable to bring about

¹²⁴ Borat & Goga (n 43) 835.

¹²⁵ Yam (n 101).

¹²⁶ Yam (n 101).

¹²⁷ NA Tran 'The role of mentoring in the success of women leaders of color in higher education, mentoring and tutoring' (2014) 22(4) *Partnership in Learning* 302–315.

¹²⁸ A Moody & N Toni 'Women's access towards higher education leadership: Where are the role models?' (2015) 45 (1) *Journal of Social Sciences* 45–52.

¹²⁹ Maseko (n 93) 69-108.

¹³⁰ KM Hannum *et al* 'Women leaders within higher education in the united states: Supports, barriers, and experiences of being a senior leader' (2015) 35 *Advancing Women in Leadership* 65-75.

change, given their many responsibilities as breadwinners, wives and mothers.¹³¹ That is the justification numerous resorts/opt to place family pressures before their personal ambitions and end up negotiating their skills and receiving less challenging and respected jobs that will permit them to move through their many tasks.¹³² Some academics, like Evans-Winters and Love have a separate view and suggest that women academics, that are married to academic men, are probable to improve their efficiency and that it is a reassuring environment that urges the progress of academic black women.¹³³

McNae and Vali are of the same opinion that, it is black women academics who go through the greatest stages of dispute between work and family as they are still projected to execute the majority of family and household responsibilities.¹³⁴ To maintain this point, Abid *et al.* report that in Lesotho, girls obtain additional education than boys, but still, they habitually fall into gender-specific roles of wife and mother when they complete school and are ragged between work and family.¹³⁵ These events are time consuming and reject black women academics staff prospects for research and publishing which is the key explanation why black women academics professors are still few. Though men are gradually voicing interest in a more stable role in their work and family, it is black women academics who still go through the uppermost levels of struggle amongst their dual roles, as black women academics are still required to do the majority of family and household duties.¹³⁶

Badat confesses that black women academics regularly have to split their interest and time among childbearing and a career.¹³⁷ Female leaders of academic departments later, dissimilar to common women lecturers, go through 'triple' role dispute. My own point of view is that this outline is shifting, although extremely slowly with more partners

¹³¹ A Farinde-Wu & PG Fitchett (n 120) 86-112.

¹³² T Carvalho & R Santiago 'New challenges for women seeking an academic career: The hiring process in Portuguese higher education institutions' (2010) 32(3) *Journal of higher Education policy and Management* 239-249.

¹³³ VE Evans-Winters & BL Love '*Black feminism in education: Black women speak back, up, and out*' (2015) New York, NY: Peter Lang 179.

¹³⁴ McNae & Vali (n 117) 288–303.

¹³⁵ G Abid *et al* 'Promoting thriving at work and waning turnover intention: A relational perspective' (2016) 2 (2) *Future Business Journal* 127–137.

¹³⁶ E Constandius & E Bitzer '*Engaging higher education curricula: A critical citizenship education perspective*' (2015) Stellenbosch: SUN Press.

¹³⁷ S Badat 'The challenges of transformation in higher education and training institutions in South Africa' (2010) *Development Bank of Southern Africa, Johannesburg*.

splitting domestic duties and managing professions with wonderful skill and often at more cost to own relationships.

2.4.7 Inflexibility at the workplace and workload

One major factor that hinders black women academics from progressing to higher positions is the fact that most organisational cultures have not changed. Shangase and Proches claim that leadership positions still work better for white males than black women academics because men habitually embrace more unified key places in the organisations, where they gain access to useful knowledge regarding job availabilities, awaiting projects, and managerial choices regularly communicated via the old boys group.¹³⁸ As a result of this, some black women academics do not progress because moving into leadership positions brings additional stress, since they consider management work to be inflexible and restrictive.¹³⁹ Furthermore, the progress of black women academics is slow because domestic and work structures interlock to constrain them. This interlock is not a gridlock because change is possible. However, change cannot occur if there is a lack of flexibility at the workplace.¹⁴⁰ Most workplaces still have a fixed pattern of doing things and change can only be achieved when work schedules and work cultures are flexible.

2.4.8 Inadequate policies and programmes to address gender issues

Globally, there are laws in place to support women at work. However, Okoji note that there are huge discrepancies throughout countries regarding the curiosity and support of organisational managers in creating policies and programmes to help women's career advancement.¹⁴¹ Organisations in Canada, Britain and the United States appear to be the most proactive while businesses in Argentina, South Africa and Turkey appear to be the slightest proactive, in the encouragement of black women academics leaders and experts. Maseko argue that policies and practices such as coaching, career growth, promotion and compensation are key elements of the glass roof that stops black women academics from reaching the top.¹⁴²

¹³⁸ Shangase & Proches (n 54) 628.

¹³⁹ Schwanke (n 48) 571.

¹⁴⁰ Zulu (n 57)

¹⁴¹ Okoji (n 65) 86.

¹⁴² Maseko (n 93) 69-108.

Ricketts and Ricketts also disclose that the main impediment to the growth of black women academics is selection and promotion in the academic domain.¹⁴³ Women criticise that more men than black women academics are on academic panels, and creating an absence of openness selection and promotion. black women academics also complain that despite satisfying the benchmarks for promotion, they are still not promoted. Furthermore, Person *et al*, note that preferment systems mainly depend on the publication record of academics.¹⁴⁴ Due to a shortage of publication, women are not promoted. The cause for this is that family duties restrict black women academics research pursuits. Ricketts and Ricketts augment that working black women academics are deprived by a shortage of policy solutions on how to stabilize their household duties and workplace actions, as women usually take a bigger split of family duties.¹⁴⁵

In conclusion, the literature shows that many of the opinions set out by the researchers are restricted to the encounters confronted by black women academics with children, and the lack of sufficient policies to address these issues. This may give the impression that the situation is different for women without children, which is not the case. Therefore, researching on black women in general will give a more comprehensive perspective on why they do not progress as their male counterparts do. Secondly, the fact that black women progress slowly and still occupy lower and middle positions at work despite all the phenomenal efforts and solutions proposed by research, government, non-governmental organisations and feminist movements implies that there are hidden obstacles that need to be investigated, or rather that a different approach is needed. These factors contribute to the present study which aims to find out the factors affecting the advancement and experience of black women academics.

2.5 FEMINIST PERSPECTIVES ON GENDER EQUITY AT THE WORKPLACE

The development of black women cannot be discussed exclusive of feminist perspectives because feminists were the first to concentrate on gendered inequalities that began in our society in the 19th century. Turner and Maschi argues that feminism

¹⁴³ Ricketts & Ricketts (n 76).

¹⁴⁴ Person (n 64) 239.

¹⁴⁵ Ricketts & Ricketts (n 76).

is concerned with liberation of women from observes that subjugate them; therefore, it rejects all the scientific information or views that are macho in kind.¹⁴⁶ It is vital to use the feminist theory in this study as it would offer a clearer perception of the study and the root of gender equity. It would also enlighten on things that have been ignored or not seen and which are very crucial to women's development at the workplace. Feminist analysis has moved beyond the longstanding critique of the focus on class in classical sociology, beyond the construction of a special set of studies of gender parallel to sub-fields of ethnicity, disability, age, sexual orientation and religion and towards the theoretical recognition of the importance of the intersection of multiple inequalities, although there remain significant differences as to how this should proceed.¹⁴⁷

Feminism contends that women and men have identical likeliness to build themselves in all spheres of life, but that women's capability is stalled by outside needed limits and effects of social institutions and values, for example, patriarchy and sexism. It also declares that since women go through coercion as a cluster, they have frequently been powerless to build their full potential or gain the incentives of their full involvement in society. Feminism therefore supports that black women academics should organise in order to attain variation, increase human choices, reduce gender stratification, end sexual violence and publicize labour and women's rights so as to assist avoid inequity at the work place and in humanity as a whole, because women have something useful to add to every part of our world.¹⁴⁸ The black feminism theoretical framework and Intersectionality are discussed below.

¹⁴⁶ SG Turner & TM Maschi 'Feminist and Empowerment Theory and Social Work Practice' (2015) 29 (2) *Journal of Social Work Practice* 160.

¹⁴⁷ PH Collins 'It's all in the family: intersections of gender, race, and nation' (1998) 13(3) .82.

¹⁴⁸ G Wind 'Feminism Types and Definitions: Liberal, Socialist, Culture and Radical' (2014) 82 (27) *Critical Review of Management* 189.

2.5.1 Black feminist theories

Initial feminist scholarship frequently theorised from the point of white, middle-class women, but generalised their experiences to be symbolic for all women.¹⁴⁹ Consequently, a fresh set of feminist philosophies arose from the trials found by women of colour. Black feminist theories have suggested the deconstruction of feminist theories pertaining to the postmodernist view.¹⁵⁰ Black feminist research inventors have created and authored the idea of equality for black women, recommending methods of sharing the harassment of black women.¹⁵¹ Evans-Winters and Love emphasized that the aim of black feminists is to recognise the battle of black women against numerous cruelties.¹⁵²

According to Kelly and McCann, the suppressing of some groups of women and men while favouring others in the research of organisational leadership has ensued from the theoretical views that frame an interpretation of gender, address and organization.¹⁵³ Black feminist theorising is the comprehension of race, class, and gender as concurrent forces.¹⁵⁴ Black feminist theories highlight that in several contexts, race and gender cannot be divided.¹⁵⁵ Blacks must not be exempted from the impacts of reduced prospects that escort racial discrimination and group intolerance. Previously, the coercion and judgement of black women in South Africa started as slaves and domestic servants.¹⁵⁶ The domesticated worker has been strongly associated to black women. The stress on involvement in the professional labour force and evade from the boundaries of the home appeared far-off to black women. Over their experiences of race and gender repression, black women were

¹⁴⁹ A Howard *et al* 'The Black Women's Gather Place: Reconceptualising a Curriculum of Place/Space' (2016) 28 (6) *Gender and Education* 756–768.

¹⁵⁰ CR Monroe 'Race and color: Revisiting perspectives in black education' (2016) 55 (1) *Theory into Practice* 46-53.

¹⁵¹ DFD Silva 'Toward a Black Feminist Poethics: The question of Blackness toward the End of the World' (2014) 44 (2) *The Black Scholar* 81-97.

¹⁵² VE Evans-Winters & BL Love '*Black feminism in education: Black women speak back, up, and out*' (2015) New York, NY: Peter Lang 179.

¹⁵³ B Kelly & K McCann 'Women faculty of color: Stories behind the statistics' (2014) 46 (4) *The Urban Review* 689.

¹⁵⁴ F Storberg-Walker & P Haber-Curran 'Theorizing women and leadership: New insights and contributions from multiple perspectives' (2017) Charlotte, NC: Information Age Publishing.

¹⁵⁵ ME David '*Feminism, gender and universities: Politics, passion & pedagogies*' (2014) London: Ashgate.

¹⁵⁶ AMS Mostafa *et al* 'High-performance human resource practices and employee outcomes: The mediating role of public service motivation' (2015) 75 (5) *Public Administration Review* 747–757.

firmly mindful of their group distinctiveness, and therefore, more sceptical of white females who characterized much of their feminism in personal and personal terms.¹⁵⁷

Gender, race, ethnicity, and social class consist of a multifaceted hierarchical layer scheme in South Africa, in which noble white men and women repress men and women of deprived races, ethnicities and religions.¹⁵⁸ Race, gender, and social class are entwined, and multicultural feminism has exposed that gender is entwined with race and ethnicity.¹⁵⁹ Black feminism or multiracial feminism efforts on the intersectionality of race, gender, ethnicity, and social class. Researchers who study the theory of intersectionality contend that one cannot look at these social statuettes separately, nor can one be added to another, but the cooperation among them forms a social scene.¹⁶⁰ So, the social scene of men and women vary. According to Dortch and Patel, black women are in an odd place in society.¹⁶¹ Black women not only are jointly at the end of the working ladder, but their general social status is lesser than that of any other group.¹⁶² Black women's lived experiences form their awareness in such a way that their worldview varies from those who have a level of opportunity.¹⁶³ Therefore, Price *et al*, asserted that in the "feminist struggle, black women need to recognise the special vantage point their marginality has and make use of this perspective to criticise the dominant racist, classist, sexist hegemony as well as to envision and create a counter-hegemony."¹⁶⁴

Monroe stated that the concept of position denotes to previously shared, group-based experiences.¹⁶⁵ The concept of position implies to groups having joint pasts established on their joint location in the relation of power. "Groups have a degree of

¹⁵⁷ AA Farinde *et al* 'Pathways to teaching: An examination of black females' pursuits of careers as k-12 teachers' (2015) 38 (3) *Educational Research Quarterly* 32-51.

¹⁵⁸ L Hirshfield & T Joseph 'We need a woman, we need a black woman': Gender, race, and identity taxation in the academy (2012) 24 (2) *Gender and Education* 213-227.

¹⁵⁹ Evans-Winters & Love (n 133) 179.

¹⁶⁰ Silva (n 151) 81-97.

¹⁶¹ D Dortch & C Patel 'Black undergraduate women and their sense of belonging in STEM at predominantly White institutions (2017) 10 (2) *NASPA Journal About Women in Higher Education* 202-215.

¹⁶² D Bhana 'Race matters and the emergence of class: Views from selected South African university students' (2014) 28 *South African Journal of Higher Education* 364.

¹⁶³ Kelly & McCann (n 153) 689.

¹⁶⁴ T Price, R Dunlap and J Eller 'An exploration of Black women's intersectionality in athletic administration' (2017) 10 *Journal of Issues in Intercollegiate Athletics* 62.

¹⁶⁵ Monroe (n 150) 46-53.

permanence over time such that group realities transcend individual experiences.”¹⁶⁶ For black women, position theory puts less weight on personal experiences within socially formed groups than on the social terms that assemble such groups. Standpoint theory excludes the individual experiences of sexism and racism but jointly suggests that the group will be faced with those concerns as well.¹⁶⁷ Black feminism occurs as a standpoint theory for black women’s persecution. Previous works of black feminists established that systems of persecution like race, class, and gender establish various standpoints between women.¹⁶⁸ Black feminist standpoint theory offers a tactic centred on black women’s experiences. The standpoint theory gives a debate for black women to build lives and an outlet for documentation of their lived experiences.

Black feminist theories are philosophies that both intend to divulge the coercion experienced by marginalised groups and present chances for those groups to share about their experiences.¹⁶⁹ A basic assumption of black feminist theories is that black women cannot be fully sanctioned unless crossing oppressions like racism, sexism, and classism are removed.¹⁷⁰ Hence, research on black women as advisors have been included with feminist literature and these studies have not sufficiently recognized the phenomenon of leadership growth from the encounters of black women. Finally, study on feminist and black feminist theories is helpful in conveying black women’s leadership experience and how the intersection of race and gender alter their leadership development.

2.5.2 Intersectionality

Intersectionality is a socio-cultural theoretical framework that concentrates on the intertwining system of race, gender, and social class.¹⁷¹ Maria Stewart, a black female modern, enunciated a criticism of variance and contested the working of race and

¹⁶⁶ Evans-Winters & Love (n 133) 179.

¹⁶⁷ Howard *et al* (n 149) 756–768.

¹⁶⁸ PH Collins *Black feminist thought: Knowledge, consciousness, and the politics of empowerment* (1991) New York: Routledge.

¹⁶⁹ Silva (n 151) 81-97.

¹⁷⁰ B Kellerman & DL Rhode ‘Women at the top: The pipeline as pipe dream’ (2017) 21 (6) *About Campus* 11–18.

¹⁷¹ K Coate & CK Howson, ‘Indicators of esteem: Gender and prestige in academic work’ (2016) 37 (4) *British Journal of Sociology of Education* 567-585.

gender which ultimately developed into the origin of intersectionality.¹⁷² David, added onto the term intersectionality and contended that race and gender cooperate to shape the numerous aspects of black women's employment experiences.¹⁷³ Da Silva stated that "slavery and residual effects left of that significant facet of American history on black is primarily why intersectionality was conceptually born out of the study of black women and Black Feminist Thought."¹⁷⁴

When race, gender, and social class meet, they shape a lively, intertwining system discussed to as intersectionality.¹⁷⁵ The interlinking systems of race, gender and social class offer a voice to black women on confronts with intersectionality in their leadership growth. Intersectionality concepts offer a framework for the discovery of multi-dimensional research variables and offer an attitude that grew out of feminist and black feminist standpoints.¹⁷⁶ Intersectionality implies the ways in which social and cultural for example, race and gender constructs intermingle and are useful in better understanding the intricacies of the double status that black women leaders face in the workplace.¹⁷⁷ Research on socio-cultural issues like intersectionality is required to give a deeper understanding of ways that racism, sexism, classism, ethnicity and other social realities can disturb an individual's lived experiences in the workplace.¹⁷⁸

In intersectionality, gender disparities tied with race permeate opinions and mindsets that add to the shortage of black women at the director level.¹⁷⁹ Bestowing to David, when race meets with gender, a double standard contrast exterior for black women, hence dropping access to leadership spots and creating inconsistency about their competence to lead.¹⁸⁰ Black women academics and factions can experience interconnected blocks that inhibit development at the individual, group and organisational levels. The theory of intersectionality conveys a framework for recognizing the complications of smaller black women academics identities and

¹⁷² David (n 155).

¹⁷³ David (n 155).

¹⁷⁴ Silva (n 151) 81-97.

¹⁷⁵ Monroe (n 150) 46-53.

¹⁷⁶ Collins (n 147)

¹⁷⁷ Kellerman & Rhode (n 170) 11-18.

¹⁷⁸ Monroe (n 150) 46-53.

¹⁷⁹ Evans-Winters & Love (n 133) 179.

¹⁸⁰ David (n 155)

experiences.¹⁸¹ Storberg-Walker and Haber-Curran labeled intersectionality as a way of clarifying and examining the experiences that black women academics confront while standing places of influence in mostly white organisations.¹⁸² When the realms of race, gender, and social class meet, they outline social truths and enlighten the various extents of the lived experiences of black women.¹⁸³ One's history, culture and values offer a setting of quotation for creating connotation of shared experiences. So, black women look at the world from detached views built on their social rankings, and in the boundaries of the greater social constructs of race and gender.¹⁸⁴

Although literature exists on intersectionality, only some scholars have addressed leadership growth for black women from the view of intersectionality in academia.¹⁸⁵ The absence of research in this debate is vital to the professional development of leaders placed at the juncture of race, gender, and social class. Analysing intersectionality in the management experiences of black women extends the opportunity for new viewpoints of workplace values and beliefs to be learned. Research from this concept pursues to investigate the scientific study of supremacy, repression, isolation, and battle in institutions, organisations, and social groups for the aim of liberation, revolution, and social change.¹⁸⁶

In conclusion, Feminist theory is one of the theories that has contributed substantially to establishing an appreciation of women's difficulties around the world. Preferably, a unanimous opinion of gender equality would have been the best choice to improve women's development. The fact that Liberal, Socialist/Marxist, Radical and black feminists look at gender disparity in various ways is a setback because there is dispute between them about fitting political action. For example, Liberal feminism is involved in equal chances and admittance to resources, but Social feminism promotes for economic and gender change. Finally, radical feminism contends that change can be accomplished by increasing black women awareness of their dominance rather than restoring legal, social, and other organisations. The researcher believes that

¹⁸¹ E Grosz 'The practice of feminist theory (2010) 21 (1) *Journal of Feminist Cultural Studies* 94-108.

¹⁸² Storberg-Walker & P Haber-Curran (n 156)

¹⁸³ Price *et al* (n 164) 62.

¹⁸⁴ Hirshfield & Joseph (n 158) 213–227.

¹⁸⁵ Collins (n 147)

¹⁸⁶ Kelly & McCann (n 153) 689.

embracing black feminist and intersectionality slant to gender equity would be the perfect way to better tackle gender discrimination in the workplace.

2.6 CHALLENGES FACING GENDER EQUITY

Gender equality at work can be observed in different ways and is one of the most difficult conditions to switch.¹⁸⁷ Gender inequality is a facet of social interactions in the majority of societies. It is related to deprivation, violence, the labour market, health, housing, and education. It constructs the interactions of production and propagation and is inseparably related to knowledge building and spreading. However there has been little continuous interest globally to find out the task confronting gender equity at the workplace in overall and higher education in instance. It has been left mostly to feminist academics to record and account for the constant inequalities and gender power dealings of academic life.¹⁸⁸ Jakobsh reports that's the struggle for gender equity has brought to life the creation of a collaboration with gender scholars in Nigeria, Sri Lanka, South Africa, Uganda and Tanzania to start to plan and assess interventions for gendered modification in areas like; curriculum change, staff expansion policy networks and relocation are strong through the Commonwealth.¹⁸⁹ Bestowing to Meyers, tries towards gender equity were caused by the 1998 UNESCO World Conference on Higher Education by challenging the exclusion of all gender stereotyping in higher education at all stages and in all fields in which women are under-represented as well as growing of black women's dynamic engagement in decision-making.¹⁹⁰ As good as this may sound, it is vital to say that fairness at the workplace is still a task.

Matching to Jakobsh one of the tasks confronting gender equity is that government reserve provision to the department of the department of higher education stays minimum.¹⁹¹ He contends that gender perception is not usually integrated in sectoral or national plans. Therefore, instruction and sensitisation at all levels is a pre-requirement. Additional research conducted in the US by Elmuti *et al*, found that the

¹⁸⁷ Maseko (n 93) 69-108.

¹⁸⁸ K Merchant 'How men and women differ' (2012) 1 (9) *Gender differences in communication styles, influence tactics, and leadership styles CMC Senior Theses*. 513.

¹⁸⁹ DR Jakobsh 'Barriers to Women's Leadership' (2012) 7 (12) *Encyclopedia of Leadership* 77.

¹⁹⁰ DT Meyers *Feminist social thought: A reader* (2014) 2nd ed. New York: Routledge.

¹⁹¹ Jakobsh (n 189) 77.

pro-longed encounters tackled by women stemmed from small differences in employment, promotion, and evaluation.¹⁹² Maseko recognises three key motives why gender equity is a challenge: Firstly, there is an absence of positive action policies on identical promotion events, as well as poor observing of power in day to day work: Secondly, trials on family/redistribution policies in parental leave policies, and kindergarten; and finally, employment separation patterns remain where black women academics lead the public sector while men control the private sector.¹⁹³ He arguments that 70% of the public sector is women, whilst less than 40% of women remained in the private sector. This means that there is a trouble when it falls to employing black women in the private sector.

In relating to South Africa, the scruffle for gender equity began way back in, with many events to eliminate the unfair past and to shift the country for the future. The revolution agenda was conveyed in documents like the Education White Paper 3: A Programme for the Revolution of Higher Education 1997.¹⁹⁴ The Green Paper for Post-School Education and Training 2012 was also presented, which fixated on the revolution and overwhelming the inequities of the past, as well as emerging a higher education system so that it would make a far superior influence to social, economic and political growth: Confirmatory Action which refers to a body of policies and practices designed to eradicate judgement against disregarded clusters consist of ethnic subgroups and women. Its key aim was to remedy the impacts of past discrimination.¹⁹⁵ Even Though these change plans and policies that have been established, gender equity has still not been proficient. Clearly there is space for more progress.

2.7 CHAPTER SUMMARY

Firstly, this chapter produced several concepts that notified this study. The chapter goes more to converse the difficulties met by black women academics in higher education institutions using the accessible literature. Topics in line with the research

¹⁹² D Elmuti *et al* 'Challenges Women Face in Leadership Positions and Organizational Effectiveness' (2009) 8 (2) *An Investigation Journal of Leadership Education* 28.

¹⁹³ Maseko (n 96) 69-108.

¹⁹⁴ The Education White Paper 3 'A Programme for Higher Education Transformation, 1996 no 18207 <https://www.justice.gov.za/commissions/feeshet/docs/1997-WhitePaper-HE-Tranformation.pdf> (accessed 24 April 2020).

¹⁹⁵ Deacon *et al* (n 3) 99.

question of the study were highly included and these consist of, gender image, trials faced by black women at the HEIs and manners of academics for gender equality. In this chapter, the researcher addresses the underrepresentation of black women academics in top positions in higher education as well as the factors that retard/promote the progress of black women academics. The chapter also looks at various strategies in place to support black women in HEIs. In the course of examining the aspects manipulating the career advancement of women in higher education, the researcher has looked at the functions of management and what management is in order to throw light on the duties that top managers perform and to know whether these positions are too demanding for women. Finally, the reason why gender equity has not been attained has been discussed and areas that still have concerns have been raised.

The literature explored has revealed that there are several challenges that influence the progress of black women academics both nationally and internationally. It has also been discovered that lots of suggestions have been adopted to help promote black women to rise in their careers. Some of the recommendations are quite relevant to adopt or rather adjust by policy makers, institutions, and black women academics themselves to improve their careers in terms of occupying top positions in the workplace. This study has also sought to recommend an additional input on how to help promote black women in their career studies. That will be addressed in chapter five.

Chapter three presents the legislative measures and framework for gender fairness in higher education. Arguments to support and justify why the problem of gender inequality in higher education persists and what needs to be done to integrate these international and national instruments into higher education will also be dominant to the conversation. Which will be debated in the following chapter.

CHAPTER THREE:

LEGISLATIVE MEASURES FOR GENDER EQUALITY IN HIGHER EDUCATION

3.1 INTRODUCTION

South Africa's liberal legal framework, that affords both the safeguard and advancement of the rights of women and tries to attend their previously deprived and subservient place, has been welcomed by both legislators and academics as one of the country's achievement.¹ Key to this is the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996, that offers women extraordinary rights, especially in its Bill of Rights; in particular section 9 of the Constitution read with other rights. In add-on, the Constitution creates requirement for a Commission on Gender Equality to encourage the completion of and regard for gender equality.² Various laws have also been decreed to guarantee that positive actions are carried to defend black women academics constitutional rights. Labour laws are expressly 'women-sensitive'.

For instance, section 203(2) of the Labour Relations Act 55 of 1995 empowers the National Economic Development and Labour Council (NEDLAC) to publish Codes of Good Practice. To this end, NEDLAC issued a Code on the Management of Sexual Harassment Cases in 1998. The Basic Conditions of Employment Act 25 of 1997 revised in 2002 to contain the domestic worker sector guarantees, amongst other things, maternity leave, job security through pregnancy, minimum wages, housing and health care for previously disqualified groups, like domestic workers, whilst the Employment Equity Act of 1998 involves women as a 'designated group' to which confirmatory action methods operate. Also, the Broad-Based Black Economic Empowerment Act of 2003(2) shows its dedication to black women as it seeks to improve their possession and supervision of current and new businesses and growing their "access to economic activities, infrastructure and skill straining".

¹ N Olivier 'The relationship between the state and higher education institutions with reference to higher education policy documentation and the legislative framework. Paper commissioned as support material for the book, *Transformation in higher education: Global pressures and local realities in South Africa*' (2001) Pretoria: CHET 2 1-14.

² M Nconco '*Substantive Equality and Affirmative Action in the Workplace*' unpublished dissertation Nelson Mandela University 2012 25.

The overview of gender tackle assemblies in 1997, instructed with observing legislation and policy for gender equivalence in accordance with article 201 of the Beijing Platform for Action, advocated by the National Women's Coalition (NWC) in the early 1990s, has also been renowned as a momentous breakthrough in the pursuit for women's rights in South Africa's early years of democracy. Acclaimed as one of the most progressive and unified forms in the world, it comprised of a set which the Office of the Status of Women established in 1997 and situated in the President's Office created the peak with Gender Focal Points (GFPs) in National and Provincial Departments at operating point. The Commission for Gender Equality and the Parliamentary Joint Monitoring Committee on the Improvement of the Quality of Life and Status of Women (JMC) created the additional elements of the 'gender machinery'.

This chapter is a discussion on legislative measures and framework for gender equality in higher education. It is therefore important to firstly give a clear understanding of the concept and the principles that underpin it. It introduces and defines affirmative action and discusses the different types of equality attached to affirmative action. This chapter also aim to discusses section 9 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996, in so far as the enablement of women and gender equality is involved; to create a legislative framework for the emancipation of women; to support all features of laws and enactment of laws concerning women empowerment, and the selection and portrayal of women in ruling positions and forms; and to offer for affairs tied therewith. As stated in the previous chapter, this chapter will look at how the legislative measures, framework and affirmative action can be managed whilst meeting the requirement of equal employment opportunities for all.

3.2 THE CONSTITUTION OF THE REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA,1996

The Republic of South Africa has a democratic constitution which was adopted in 1996. Like the supreme law of the land, the constitution is the greatest crucial driving document that advises and sets grounds for the abolition of all bigoted traditions in the country. Section 9(3) of the constitution ensures that all are the same before the law and have a birthright to the same protection and the value of the law. The government cannot wrongly categorize directly or indirectly against anybody on any reasons like

ethnic group, gender and ethos.³ Furthermore, everybody has the right to fundamental and further education that the government through sensible methods ought to make increasingly accessible.

3.3 EMPLOYMENT EQUITY ACT 55 of 1998

The core aim of the Employment Equity Act of South Africa 55 of 1998 is to “achieve equity at the workplace by promoting equal opportunities and fair treatment/practices in employment through the elimination of unfair discrimination/practices and by implementing affirmative action to redress the disadvantages in employment that have been experienced by designated groups.”⁴ As of Nel *et al*, the Employment Equity Act of South Africa has two central divisions. The initial one handles equity and discrimination.⁵ The Act affirms that no employee must be victimized on the foundation of race, gender, sex, pregnancy, marital status, personal responsibility, ethnic or social origin, colour, sexual orientation, age, disability, religion, conscience, belief, political opinion, culture, language, birth or HIV status. Secondly, the Act deals with affirmative deed and declares that it is not unreasonable to differentiate where favourable deeds are being used in an organisation. The Act pertains to workers in all organisations not including persons in the National Defence Force, the National Intelligence Agency, and the South African Secret Service.⁶ Implying that managers should make choices about personnel established on their abilities, knowledge, and experience.

The Employment Equity Act requires the employer to be fair to all employees regarding their medical and psychological testing.⁷ Unfair discrimination relating to these should be dispensed with in provisions of the Labour Relation Act. The Employment Equity Act also makes provision for affirmative action that requires all employers who employ more than 50 workers to apply favourable actions for assigned parties, which are women, disabled people and black people such as Africans, Indians and Coloureds who have been deprived by apartheid regulations. Moreover, there is the

³ K Coate & CK Howson, ‘Indicators of esteem: Gender and prestige in academic work’ (2016) 37 (4) *British Journal of Sociology of Education* 567-585.

⁴ D Cooper ‘Social justice and South African university student enrolment data by ‘Race’, 1998–2012: From ‘Skewed Revolution’ to ‘Stalled Revolution’ (2015) 69 (3) *Higher Education Quarterly* 244.

⁵ PS Nel *et al* ‘*South African employment relations theory and practice*’ (2016) 8th ed. Pretoria: Van Schaik.

⁶ South African Litigation Centre ‘Laws and Policies Affecting Transgender Persons in Southern Africa’ (2017) Cape Town: South African Litigation Centre.

⁷ GD Breetzke & DW Hedding ‘The changing racial profile of academic staff at South African Higher Education Institutions (HEIs), 2005–2013’ (2016) 13 (2) *Africa Education Review* 150.

organisational analysis passage that confirms that employment policies, practices, procedures, and the work environment recognises any obstacles that might be disadvantageous to specific demographics. The passage also requires an Employment Equity strategy. Executives must draw up a five-year strategy that illustrates their scheme to fix the inequalities in the organisation and consequences are levied on disorderly organizations. Regarding dispute resolution, appeals against decisions taking in relation to this Act are tackled in the Labour Court.

The Employment Equity Act is an extremely significant Act that cannot be overlooked as it correlates to the key objects of this study, considering that the Act's key goal is to focus on fairness at the office. The aim here is to examine if this Act has accomplished its main purposes as specified, and to examine if these rules are being applied and observed. Study results have shown that gender equality at the office has not been accomplished in South Africa.⁸ This requires urgent attention.

A universal definition of affirmative action does not exist.⁹ The term 'affirmative action' was firstly introduced in the United States in 1961 by the official order 1092541 of U.S President J.F Kennedy.¹⁰ The concept of affirmative action has developed over time and adapted to the change of times. The definition and implementation of affirmative action differs due to the differences in culture and political structure of countries using it.

According to Mbutho, confirmatory action means the intentional use of race or gender-aware benchmarks for the particular intention of profiting a group that was formerly underprivileged due to race or gender.¹¹ The aim ranges from offering a particular solution for unfair prejudice to the more general purpose of growing the involvement of parties which are clearly under-represented in vital public areas like education, politics, or employment. Lederer, states that 'positive action entails handling a subclass or a group of people contrarily to enhance their prospects of finding a certain

⁸ CH Mayer 'A 'derailed' agenda? Black women's voices on workplace transformation' (2017) 18 (4) *Journal of International Women's Studies* 148.

⁹ M Nconco (n 2)

¹⁰ TH Anderson 'The Pursuit of Fairness: A History of Affirmative Action' (2004) 280.

¹¹ S Mbutho 'The Judicial defense for Affirmative Action Measures: A critique of the rationality standard of judicial review' unpublished dissertation, University of Kwazulu Natal 2015 21.

good or to guarantee that they acquire a quantity of specific goods.’¹² Harkoo states that ‘positive action is privileged access to social means for people who are part of groups that have been formerly underprivileged by hostile prejudice.’¹³

This constitutional provision can be interpreted to mean that the people prejudiced by discrimination are to be uplifted by affirmative action. Affirmative action is designed to correct the differences in social standings among individuals from various parties so that they too can fully enjoy their rights and freedoms. The wording of the affirmative action provision in the Employment Equity Act seems to pass this Constitutional test, as the first obligation has been referred in the title “designated group” and also the second and the third requirements are addressed in the Act.

3.5 THE NOTION OF EQUALITY AND THE SOUTH AFRICAN APPROACH

Proper equality or equality as stability needs that all people who are in the same position be given the same action and that people must not be handled inversely because of subjective characteristics like religion, race, or gender. This interpretation echoes with the initial Aristotelian concept of equality, that similar instances must be handled similarly. It is the most pervasive and slightest touchy interpretation of equality and shapes the abstract core of the legal concept, direct discrimination. In this official concept of discrimination, if there is uniformity in action, there will be no discrimination. A strict tactic to equality thus only involves equal use of the law without more analysis of the specific conditions or perspective of the person or group and therefore, the subject matter and the possible discriminatory effect of the law and/or policy in review. Therefore, it is a balanced theory. This purpose of the notion of equality is related to the challenges faced by black women in higher education institutions.

Explanation of the concept of formal equality and substantive equality and equality of opportunities will be discussed below.

¹² N Lederer ‘*Affirmative Action: A Never-Ending Story?*’ unpublished PhD thesis, University of Adelaide 2013 17.

¹³ H Harkoo ‘*Has affirmative action become an illusionary right for certain designated groups?*’ (2014) 23.

3.5.1 Substantive equality

Substantive equality was established from the shortcomings of proper equality. Jones views substantive equality as having four features namely; anxiety with effect of a ration on society, reception of variance, goal-directed and value-based attitude to rights to attain equality.¹⁴ Substantive equality can be approached in four different ways, namely “equality of results, equal opportunities; substantive rights and a broad value driven approach.”¹⁵

Equality of outcomes was created out of the realisation that equal conduct does not ensue equal positions.¹⁶ In other words, anti-discrimination laws are not sufficient to reach the cathartic aim as envisioned in the Constitution and Employment Equity Act (EEA). On the other hand, equality of prospects is a recognition of the fact that people of separate social groups are set inversely and cannot contest alike. This circumstantial attitude to equality is the symbol of substantive equality as it considers the outcome of the past on individuals’ positions.¹⁷ Thus making it essential that practical actions be taken to counter the result of past features on the comprehension of complete human capability. This act is permitted to an extent that it modifies the inequality of those being associated.¹⁸

The purpose of substantive equality is to eliminate socio-economic inequalities and the assemblies that root them. Social inequality mentions situations where elimination from an advantage is founded on an individual’s social character whereas economic inequality describes “unequal access to, and distribution of basic needs opportunities and material resources.”¹⁹ Under-representation around the workplace is a manifestation of economic inequality in employment law. This underrepresentation signifies an uneven distribution of reserves like employment opportunities. It is consequently important to have legislation such as the EEA that will have measures used to reallocate these resources. Though, this does not mean that changes should

¹⁴ T Jones ‘South African contributions to LGBTI education issues’ (2019) 19 (4) *Sex Education* 458.

¹⁵ South African Litigation Centre ‘Laws and Policies Affecting Transgender Persons in Southern Africa’ (2017) Cape Town: South African Litigation Centre.

¹⁶ K Lockett & S Shay ‘Reframing the curriculum: a transformative approach’ (2020) 61 (1) *Critical Studies in Education* 54.

¹⁷ Jones (n 14) 458.

¹⁸ South African Litigation Centre ‘Laws and Policies Affecting Transgender Persons in Southern Africa’ (2017) Cape Town: South African Litigation Centre.

¹⁹ Lockett & Shay (n 16) 54.

be removed. Substantive equality needs the exclusion of variance which is bind to hardship.²⁰ So, if being belittled in the workforce involves unequal admission to economic gains of being employed, such a situation needs to be resolved. This, though, requires to be done in accord with the Constitution.²¹ Both individual worth and dignity are recognised by substantive equality. Primarily, substantive equality stresses that clarification of rights must consider together the situation in which breach of rights happens and the objective for which the right was formed. This delicate method guarantees that actions and decisions taken stay in line with the principles of the Constitution.²²

3.5.2 Equality of opportunities

Equality of opportunities is a mixture of the two approaches, formal and substantive equality, using arguments from both, to allow positive action with strict limits.²³ For this approach, the understanding of distributive aspects is decisive for the achievement of equality. For equality to be achieved in terms of this approach, partakers cannot begin the event at various starting positions and cannot depart from the principle of individualism. This method neglects historic issues affecting negatively on a person's life opportunities.

In terms of this approach, with an equal starting point, individuality will reaffirm itself on the view that neutrality and symmetry has been achieved. This notion recognizes that the person's opportunities remain influenced by underlying discrimination founded on group characteristics. As a result, this notion is in favour of special behaviour built on ethnic, gender and disability, up to the objective of matching the starting position is convened. A solid dependence is also positioned on excellence, which is harmful in our knowledge of disadvantage. The institutional discrimination issue can be said to have been resolved when individuals enjoy equality of opportunities and get to remain handled on the core of their traits, not ethnic group or other level-based benchmarks.²⁴ For individuals to compete on a fair footing, human rights permit for persons fitting to

²⁰ South African Litigation Centre 'Laws and Policies Affecting Transgender Persons in Southern Africa' (2017) Cape Town: South African Litigation Centre.

²¹ Jones (n 14) 458.

²² Lockett & Shay (n 16) 54.

²³ Cooper (n 4) 244.

²⁴ Lockett & Shay (n 16) 54.

a particular group, to obtain privileged conduct for employment and this would be in accordance with the fair play rule.²⁵ Removing obstacles in the recruitment process would be a practical application of this approach. However, the problem with this approach is that it does not promise that deprived groups would be in a place to make benefit of the offered chances.

For example, a man and woman with identical qualifications compete for a job offer, the woman ought to be favoured if they are underrepresented at the particular employment level. This procedure would be an interim quantify and once the target of woman representation has been reached, the individual merit principle would be the determining factor. This model may be evaluated based on that it is purely routine and the results are not certainly assured by rising the conditions for an entry level job would nonetheless eliminate inadequately qualified black employees, creating obstacles to the hire of these people.

“This model is applied in the European Union countries, where specific measures are in place to ensure positive action, preventing current and compensate for past discrimination, as well as promoting equality.”²⁶

3.6 GENDER EQUALITY INSTRUMENTS

There are numerous tools that tackle gender inequality at international, regional, and national levels. These tools will be discussed as follows, I will first start with the international – “the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW), the Beijing Platform for Action, the Southern African Development Community (SADC) regional instrument and for the national instruments - the constitution of the Republic of South Africa and the Employment Equity Act 55 of 1998” and the others will follow.

²⁵ South African Litigation Centre ‘Laws and Policies Affecting Transgender Persons in Southern Africa’ (2017) Cape Town: South African Litigation Centre.

²⁶ Cooper (n 4) 244.

3.6.1 International instruments

CEDAW of 1979 was the first international tool to carefully tackle women's rights in the field of politics and culture also in economic, social and family areas.²⁷ The International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women unites all government groups to work keenly for the elimination of gender discrimination. CEDAW was approved by the South African government in 1996 and it includes a broad set of legally enforceable obligations and enforces responsibilities on the government about both rights to education and to gender equality.²⁸ The Convention further pursues to end discrimination opposed to women and girls in education.

Article 10 of the CEDAW explicitly needs government groups to take all proper procedures to reduce discrimination against women in order to guarantee them equal rights with men in the area of education.²⁹ It plays a vital part in combating gender equality; it is a means for removing any stereotyped notion of the role of men and women at all points and in all types of education by promoting co-education and more forms of education that will assist to reach this goal and in specific, by the review of textbooks and school programmes and the change of teaching techniques. Additionally, it seeks to bring the same prospects for admission to programmes of progressing education, comprising those in adult and useful learning mostly those targeted at cutting, at the quickest likely time, any disparity in education standing in the middle of men and women. It advises countries that customarily block or inhibit girls from joining school to open the doors to their education and for black women academics to be given equivalent conduct with men.³⁰ This tool, then, eradicates walls that have factually reserved female students from partaking in several careers and professional courses.

Also, in Article 11, it enunciates the right to non-discrimination in the workplace by inspiring all nations to take suitable actions to remove discrimination against women

²⁷ CR Monroe 'Race and color: Revisiting perspectives in black education' (2016) 55 (1) *Theory into Practice* 46-53.

²⁸ M Makhanya 'Advancing Gender equality in higher education and the broader society (2013) University of South Africa, Pretoria.

²⁹ VE Evans-Winters & BL Love '*Black feminism in education: Black women speak back, up, and out*' (2015) New York, NY: Peter Lang 179.

³⁰ Makhanya (n 28).

in areas of occupation in a bid to certify, equality of men and women so that all sides have equal rights.³¹ Including the right to equal employment chances, the use of the same principles for selection in subjects of employment, the right to unrestricted selection of vocation and hire, the right to advancement, job reassurance, all advantages and terms of service as well as the right to get employment preparation and rehabilitation, internships, improved occupational teaching and recurring teaching.³² Monroe says CEDAW creates the main and most broad bill of human rights for women.³³

3.6.2 Regional instruments

August 2008, the Heads of State of the SADC assumed the SADC Protocol on Gender and Development, giving their authorities and nations, inter alia, to increasing entry to quality education for both women and men and eliminating gender stereotypes from the syllabus, career choices, and careers.³⁴ On occupation matters, the Procedure, in article 19 observes that Government groups mean to, by 2015, evaluate, modify and ratify laws and policies that guarantee women and men have equivalent admission to paid work in all divisions of the economy as well as the purge of work-related seclusion and all types of employment discrimination.³⁵ SADC members devoted themselves to 50/50 depiction in all major decision-making situations in the public and private divisions by 2015. For actual and resourceful change or result, inventive policies are needed, not only for them to be drafted but implemented. It has been a long while since the policies were embraced but their application is still lacking.

³¹ F Storberg-Walker & P Haber-Curran 'Theorizing women and leadership: New insights and contributions from multiple perspectives' (2017) Charlotte, NC: Information Age Publishing.

³² MB Hundera 'Factors affecting academic staff turnover intentions and the moderating effect of gender' (2014) 2 (9) *International Journal of Research in Business Management* 61.

³³ Monroe (n 27) 46-53.

³⁴ Makhanya (n 28).

³⁵ DA Williams 'Strategic diversity leadership: Activating change and transformation in higher education' (2013) Sterling, VA: Stylus.

3.6.3 Protocol to the African Charter on the Rights of Women in Africa

While the African Charter is the prime accord offering a framework for human rights in the area, its supplies on women's rights are mostly seen as unproductive and insufficient.³⁶

The charter recognises and attests black women rights in three conditions. Firstly, article 18(3) needs government parties to “ensure the elimination of every discrimination against women and also ensure the protection of the rights of the woman.”³⁷ Secondly, article 2 offers that the rights and liberties preserved in the charter shall be relished by all, regardless of ethnic group, colour, gender, language, national and social origin, economic status, birth, or other status.³⁸ Lastly, article 3 of the African Charter declares that every person will be the same before the law and will be permitted to equivalent defence of the law.³⁹ And still the practise writes that “despite the ratification of the African Charter black women in Africa still continue to be victims of discrimination and harmful practices.”⁴⁰

The practise, which stemmed from years of political action by black women rights advocates in the province, has tried to revive the African Charter's dedication to black women equality by totalling rights that were absent from the charter and clarifying governments' duties concerning black women rights. Only one out over sixty editorials in the African Charter makes direct position to black women. The following are crucial weaknesses of the pact as it relates to black women:

- its failure to openly describe discrimination against black women, and
- its accent on conventional ideals and traditions that have long inhibited the progression of black women rights in Africa.

In Africa, some of the extremely grave abuses of black women rights happen in the secret realm of the family and are armoured by customary standards and cultural values. Articles 17(2) and (3) of the African Charter declares that all persons “may

³⁶ African (Banjul) Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, June 27, 1981, O.A.U. Doc. CAB/ LEG/67/3 rev. 5, 21 I.L.M. 58, art. 18(3) (1982)

³⁷ The African Charter Article 18(3)

³⁸ The African Charter art. 2.

³⁹ The African Charter art. 3.

⁴⁰ Protocol on the Rights of Women in Africa, supra note 1, art. 14(1)(d), (2)(a).

freely take part in the cultural life of his community” and that “the promotion and protection of morals and traditional values recognised by the community shall be the duty of the State.”⁴¹ Article 27(1) of the African Charter continues adding that “every individual shall have duties towards his family and society.”⁴² Furthermore, the only set allusion to black women rights in the charter is included in a section regarding “the family and upholding tradition, thereby reproducing the essential tension that plagues the realisation of the rights of women” in Africa. Certainly, the African Charter has been understood to shield traditional and sacred laws that infringe women’s rights, like the rights to equality and non-discrimination; to living, freedom, and protection of the individual; and to safety from brutal and demeaning care. And seeing whether a woman might receive her father’s fortune, that court trusted traditional perceptions of the family and the male leader as emphasized in the African Charter as the resources of women’s position, somewhat than on the rights and criteria secured in international legal tools.

3.6.4 National instruments

The South African government in reaction to international and regional tools has placed a full legal framework to tackle gender inequality with put goals that are targeted at gender equality and women’s empowerment. Presently, the South African parliament is composed of 45% women and is second in Africa following Rwanda in tenures of women image in parliament.⁴³

3.7 MEASURES TO EMPOWER WOMEN AND TO ELIMINATE DISCRIMINATION

The regulation is an important instrument for progressing women’s rights and equality. A healthy and efficient legal system founded on the rule of law is vital to supporting women to grow into equivalent associates in decision-making and development. Throughout the past couple of years, the international population has spent significantly in courses targeted at firming the rule of law in emerging countries. Contempt this venture, the rule of law remains to insinuate very little for most women

⁴¹ The African Charter Article 17(2) and Article 17(3)

⁴² Protocol on the Rights of Women in Africa, *supra* note 1, Article 17(1).

⁴³ G Abid *et al* ‘Promoting thriving at work and waning turnover intention: A relational perspective’ (2016) 2 (2) *Future Business Journal* 130.

and girls. The following are the actions to encourage women and to erase discrimination:

- Regardless of any other law, aims for women in all rules and procedures on emancipation will be at minimum 50%.⁴⁴
- Selected public associations and chosen private associations should, within their range of duties, build and execute tactics and approaches to support their laws and policies with subset, in two years of impending of this Act.⁴⁵
- Chosen public figures and elected private figures must, in their realm of duties, progress and apply plans and strategies that will support women to achieve power and control over choices and reserves that regulate the value of their lives, in order to accomplish the liberal awareness of women empowerment and gender equality.⁴⁶
- Chosen public parties and chosen private forms must endorse women empowerment by enchanting actions like:
 - Altering the settings and situations that hamper the attainment of viable and practical gender equality.
 - Forming suitable and applicable events intended to accept and endorse the parts of women in numerous areas of life; and
 - Applying appropriate legislation, policies and strategies in their directive and associating victims to advance obedience with these legislations, policies, and strategies; and inspecting aspects that source and donate to non-compliance with these legislations, policies and strategies.
- Chosen public figures and chosen private figures must progress and apply policies or plans first, intended to defend and promote women who have been deprived by unjust discrimination; second, certifying and advocating equal chances for women; third, pursuing to reduce gender discrimination; abuse of women in the work place; and gender-based violence.⁴⁷ The policies or plans may involve economic and land reform plans that comfort women; and

⁴⁴ Nel *et al* (n 5).

⁴⁵ Employment Equity Act 55 (1998) Pretoria: Government Printer.

⁴⁶ Mayer (n 8)148.

⁴⁷ S Fernandez 'The transformation of the South African public service: Exploring the impact of racial and gender representation on organisational effectiveness' (2016) 54 (1) *Journal of Modern African Studies* 98.

creativities that intend to uphold the rights and comfort of women and get the necessary terms for women empowerment in the office.

- Chosen public frames and chosen private parties must present in a year of election, the proposals and approaches planned; plans and strategies envisioned in subsection.

Procedures considered in subsection; and policies or courses considered in subsection, to the Minister for attention, valuation and advice. The Minister could, at any time after the proposal of the ideas, approaches or actions planned in subsection, need a chosen public organization or a chosen private organization to present to the Minister a statement on its application of subsection, for deliberation, evaluation and advice. The Minister can create procedures to help delegated public groups and chosen private parties to conform with this division. The question to rise is why the problem of gender inequality in higher education persists despite the legislative measures and framework for gender equality. Institutional structures for the progression of women – the nationwide gender system is discussed next.

3.8 INSTITUTIONAL MECHANISMS FOR THE ADVANCEMENT OF WOMEN

Regrettably, the assemblies of the National Gender Machinery (NGM) did not live up to the great prospects that convoyed their formation. In examining if women's policy tackle is truly feminist in nature, Mayer offers two analytical viewpoints: declare volume the degree to which women's policy tackle effects feminist policy; and state-society dealings the degree that "women's policy machinery develops opportunities for society-based actors, feminist and women's advocacy organisations to have access to the policy process."⁴⁸ Though, Fernandez states, "women's policy machinery will only reach high levels of state feminism when the state is defined as a site of social justice and has the capacity to institutionalize new demands for equality" and "when society sustains widely supported feminist organisations that challenge sexual hierarchies."⁴⁹ Short of such circumstances politicians can create women's policy offices; though, "they will have a hard time in either influencing women's equality policy or empowering women's interests in society, or both".

⁴⁸ Mayer (n 8) 148.

⁴⁹ Fernandez (n 47) 100.

Numerous difficulties relating to the above two analytical requirements ensued in the abolishment of maximum of these unique assemblies by 2009. Meanwhile innovative assemblies arose into position that were barely a development, transitory remark of the main glitches will avail. Including overlying directives and deprived communication between the many assemblies; partial successes of gender mainstreaming mainly over gender pivotal ideas; rough engagement with civil society groups; the absence of gender knowledge; and the absence of recognition of NGM structures.

The Office of the Status of Women (OSW) in the President's Office, ran by the Minister in this Office, was challenged with many obstacles. A core drawback was the detail that the Minister Essop Pahad "was not a feminist" and had diminutive consideration of the original reasons of women's relegation.⁵⁰ The key duty of the OSW was the elevation of gender mainstreaming in government departments over simplifying, exercise, observing, applying, and communicating with civil society and international figures. Deprived of expert, technical skill, and financial means to perform its command, it was basically abridged to a clerical role. Its actions were mostly linked to writing and to partaking in and holding of meetings exterior to the ministries and departments. In spite of its decree to link with women's groups in civil society, the OSW has secluded itself from the women's program.⁵¹ It assumed very limited events linked to easing gender mainstreaming in departments. Though, it formed the 'National Policy Framework for Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality' in 2000 even if this was not once approved to an Act. By 2007 it was practically defective and turned dysfunctional in 2009 with the formation of a Ministry of Women, Children and People with Disabilities (MWCPD). The GFPs in all department at national and provincial level were needed to safeguard that departments obey with gender mainstreaming necessities in their policies and programmes. Yet, Yolanda Sadie argues that the GFPs similarly required expert, since scarce were recognised at management stage.⁵² They were consequently unable to impact policy. Additionally, most were not keen to gender only but satisfied many other purposes. They also needed a grasp of gender, their characters and how to employ their tasks. No teaching on gender mainstreaming

⁵⁰ N Dingindawo *et al* 'Redressing past injustices through affirmative action: Creating opportunities for women to assume leadership positions in the society' (2016) 15 (2) *Journal of Educational Studies* 189.

⁵¹ Fernandez (n 47) 100.

⁵² Y Sadie 'Gender policy and legislation during the first 20 years of democracy' (2014) 36 *Strategic Review for Southern Africa* 111.

that was mostly regarded as including women was accessible. Most of the GFPs turn out to be dysfunctional in 2009 yet they were not properly dispersed.

The Commission for Gender Equality is a sovereign legal structure recognised in terms of the Commission on Gender Equality Act No 39 of 1996. As a Chapter 9 organisation the CGE is answerable to parliament, which has controlling influence over its operative. It is authorised to observe and assess policies and practices of government structures at any stage, in addition to legal and public forms and private organisations, to endorse gender equality and make suggestions that it believes needed. Ebrahim claims, with its practical powers of summons and trial, the CGE inhabits a vital part in safeguarding government answerability and distribution on judicial promises that the political, civil and socio-economic rights and freedoms become a 'lived reality' for the many disregarded women.⁵³ In performing its roles, the CGE Act also needs the CGE to mediate and cooperate with bodies endorsing gender equality and other divisions of civil society. Thru the close of its first term mid-2000 the CGE was overwhelmed by sombre inside wars: including low staff drive (over 27 workers had resigned); argument over which feminist objectives must assume importance; dispute over private matters; and dispute over dealings amongst officials and the larger South African women's program. Additionally, the value of study was seen as frail and was branded by a basic grasp of gender and an absence of practical complexity. The CGE did not test laws, let alone straight and suggest policy and legislation. It was also hesitant to contest the government.⁵⁴ In spite of its inner dismay the CGE started an extensive variety of projects and courses linked to research, support, observing and intrusions in the time 2002-2004. It established a planned effort and a plot of activity concentrating on six precedence parts of governance; gender-based violence; gender and poverty; tradition, culture, religion and sexuality; and gender and HIV/AIDS and was fairly effective in all these parts. The CGE also acquired a serious posture on the Communal Land Rights Bill of 2004 and the Traditional Leadership and Governance Bill in 2003 with the parliamentary JMC.

⁵³ S Ebrahim 'Reviewing the suitability of affirmative action and the inherent requirements of the job as grounds of justification to equal pay claims in terms of the employment equity act 55 of 1998' (2018) 21 *PER / PELJ* 11.

⁵⁴ FH Golele & M Rachidi 'The challenges of achieving gender equity in a government department: A case study of the department of health, Limpopo Province, South Africa' (2017) 15 (3) *Gender & Behaviour* 589.

In parliament's review of Chapter 9 institutions in 2007 to create the level to which these institutions had changed society and engrained human rights, the CGE did not charge well. Disapprovals elevated in this review comprise:⁵⁵

- Its reluctance to acquire a public position on debatable matters like service delivery, the effect of poverty on women and the distribution of antiretroviral drugs for people living with HIV and AIDS.
- Deprived grasp of its legal and constitutional decree.
- Absence of competence and usefulness, bringing into question the CGE's significance.
- Unacceptable affiliation with civil society.
- Inacceptable supervision purpose.
- Inside dispute among commissioners since the beginning of the Commission and strains among commissioners and staff.

The CGE has to some extent been able to recover itself from then and is stirring to assuming actions to achieve its decree. It is involved in support intrusion and is using its factfinding control in tactical matters that fall under its decree. In the era 2011–2013, for example, more than 20 policy and legislative suggestions were made, affiliations with civil society bodies amplified and almost 600 grievances on many subjects for instance gender discrimination, maintenance and gender violence were acknowledged and handled by CGE offices throughout the country. It is then obvious that in its many variations the NGM has, opposing to great faiths, mostly failed to put a gender program and to normalize gender in policies and agendas.

3.10 CHAPTER SUMMARY

The profuse method to women's rights in South Africa through constitutional supplies, an intricate and advanced governmental framework, and the depiction of women in political managerial titles was a serious opening idea in changing women's subservience. Together with the creation of institutional instruments, mainly the National Gender Machinery for women's progression, these frameworks, and institutions represent the government's pledge to the ethics of gender equality. Though, in spite of these progressions (the NGM was at its start of the greatest praised

⁵⁵ Republic of South Africa, Parliament 2007, 150-161

assemblies, and it was expected that it would impact policymaking from a gender perspective) hopefulness has diminished. Many difficulties categorised the first 'set' of organisations, fluctuating from an absence of a central form to partial encounter with civil society groups and the nonexistence of devoted, expert gender activists. The substitution of the gender central opinions with gender counters never happened. It is then expected that the lately recognised Ministry of Women in the Presidency will resurrect the flawed gender central points or create gender counters in departments at both international and national to the provincial level. A combined NGM that contains the CGE and civil society organisations as imagined in the 1990s, can offer the motivation for the much-needed functional development of the common of women's lives in both the public and private domains.

Women's equality on paper over the past 20 years has not resulted in the freedom of black African women. Women's subservience, that is echoed in for example the gender opening in hire, the lack of women, and the let-down of laws to tackle the high frequency of viciousness against women, can mostly be accredited to the lasting male-controlled customs that cause the rough power dealings amid men and women. Exclusive of consideration and analysing these walls practical advances to women's lives will not be grasped.

This literature explored has revealed that there are several factors that influence the progress of women both nationally and internationally. It has also been discovered that many suggestions and policies have been adopted to help promote women to rise in their careers. Some of the recommendations are quite relevant to adopt or rather adjust by policy makers, institutions, and women themselves to improve their careers in terms of occupying top positions in the workplace. This study has also recommended an additional input on how to help promote black women in their research. That will be addressed in chapter five.

Chapter four deals with the transformation measures adopted by the government and university to advance and support black women academics.

CHAPTER FOUR:

TRANSFORMATION MEASURES ADOPTED BY THE GOVERNMENT AND UNIVERSITY TO ADVANCE AND SUPPORT BLACK WOMEN ACADEMICS

4.1 INTRODUCTION

The first chapter set out a study framework on the emergence and experience of black women academics in South African Universities. The second chapter examined the literature about gender inequality and in higher education in South African and then outlined the challenges, barriers, and factors affecting the advancement and experience of black women academics from a black feminist theoretical lens. Chapter three conducted a desk top review of legislative measures and framework for gender equality in higher education. This chapter aims to identify the transformation measures adopted by the government and university to advance and support black women academics within the study area and the surrounding region.

Racial and gender categorisation under the system of apartheid and earlier colonial period greatly moulded South African society and ensued in lush inequalities. Experimental research has exposed worrying connotations of racism, classism and sexism inside the school and the rife edifices that side-lined black women academics.¹ In the new elected exemption, the rooted social inequalities in apartheid incited a wide range of change-positioned creativities in order to tackle the condition. Higher education institutions were identified as badly in need of reform. An analysis on black women in academic control, Merchant recognised governmental policies and the commitment of universities in South Africa to accept and improve gender and equity advancement drivers.² Yet, she stated that governance and management in higher education needed to resist with many bases of control, rival tasks, devolved constructions and forced possessions. Focuses of power encompassed schools in institutes, faculties, colleges, executive supervision, and councils.

The chapter seeks to examine the transformation measures taken by the government and universities to address the challenges and evaluate the growth made since the

¹ IA Phiri 'Major challenges for African women theologians in theological education (1989-2008)' (2008) 34 (2) *Studia Historian Ecclesiastica* 63-81.

² K Merchant 'How men and women differ' (2012) 1(9) *Gender differences in communication styles, influence tactics, and leadership styles* 225-227.

arrival of democracy in South Africa. Based on black women academics in South African universities, it inspects not only the historiography of judgement of black women researchers in universities, but also makes references for change. This chapter analyses existing literature that highpoints the detail that make an allowing situation for women academics, mainly black women academics, in South African institutions of higher education it is still a massive trial. The chapter also proves the prevalent existence of unequal and discriminatory performs in higher education and the need for a truly broad and just working setting.³ Secondly, the experiences and career advancement of black women academics in South African universities by using Standpoint theory is also explained. The trials undergone in universities over current periods have directed to the rise of many leadership tactics in the sector and can be seen in numerous universities.

4.2 THE TRANSFORMATION MEASURES TAKEN BY THE GOVERNMENT

Post-1994, there has been an extensive range of change-positioned creativities looking to result in institutional reform. Including the meaning of the drives and aims of higher education; widespread policy research, policy design, acceptance, and application in the parts of power, subsidy, academic edifice and programmes and quality pledge; the portrayal of new laws and rules; and main reshuffle and reconfiguration of the HEIs scenery and of institutions like Universities, Universities of Technology and Colleges. These schemes have frequently tried the volumes and abilities of the government and HEIs. Universities, Universities of Technology and Colleges have influenced the stride, nature, and results of revolution. The South African Constitution of 1996, Higher Education Act of 1997 Act and White Paper focused the government and institutions to understand deep and extensive necessities and goals in and over higher education. It was presumed that their advance practical fulfilment would subsidize vastly to the revolution and growth of higher education and society.

The Constitution commits the government and institutions to the declaration of the ethics of human dignity, the attainment of equality, and the progress of non-sexism and non-racialism and the human rights and freedoms that the Bill of Rights declares;

³ G Wise *et al* 'Inclusive higher education governance: managing stakeholders, strategy, structure and function' (2020) 45 (2) *Studies in Higher Education* 343.

and to “respect, protect, promote and fulfil the rights” personified in the Bill of Rights.⁴ The Higher Education Act declared the appeal of making “a single coordinated higher education system”, rearrangement and changing “programmes and institutions to respond better to the human resource, economic and development needs” of South Africa, restoring “past discrimination”, certifying representativity and equal access and contributory to the progress of all methods of information and allowance, in line with international standards of academic excellence.⁵ Furthermore, the Act also announced that it was necessary for HEIs to relish liberty and sovereignty in their connection with the Government in the setting of public responsibility and the national prerequisite for progressive services and logical information.

4.2.1 Various social purposes that universities, intend to serve

4.2.1.1 The 1997 Education White Paper 3 (EWP3)

White Papers are an instrument of participating democracy and not a permanent policy vow. White Papers do the double part of giving secure government policies and also appealing for views about them. The Education White Paper 3 (EWP3) echoes “the culmination of a wide-ranging and extensive process of investigation and consultation that was initiated with the establishment of the National Commission on Higher Education (NCHE) in February 1995 and the subsequent release of the Green Paper on Higher Education in December 1996 and the Draft White Paper on Higher Education in April 1997.”⁶

The overhead article, stated to as A Programme for the Transformation of Higher Education, puts the formative design for the final and incrementalistic application levels of South African higher education change. The EWP3 “is the culmination of a wide-ranging and extensive process of investigation and consultation that was initiated by the establishment of NCHE.”⁷ The EWP3 is observed as assuming a Human

⁴ The Constitution of Republic of South Africa, 1996, Section 7(2), Section 9, 10.

⁵ Higher Education Act 101 of 1997.

⁶ Department of Education (1997) Education white paper 3: A programme for the transformation of higher education. Pretoria: Government Printers 2.

⁷ S M Bengu ‘Foreword In: Draft education white paper 3: A programme for higher education transformation’ (1997) Pretoria: Government Printers 2.

Resource Development (HRD) viewpoint as its essential policy limits.⁸ As a policy preparation plan, the EWP3 tries to poise the opposing services of social development and equity on the one hand for example official and discrete reparation, and those of economic growth on the other. For example macro-economic global views that highlight market dominion.⁹ Further, continues declaring that the non-arrangement of HE policy with the developmental/fairness or the development manner has been one of the most contentious matters in the HE policy territory.¹⁰ In the Preface to the EWP3, the first post-apartheid SA Minister of Education, Bengu, stated that the EWP3 is important to the degree to which it exemplifies the DoE's purpose to assume a review method in deciding topics that supplementary improve the public notice.¹¹ Secondly, this is a replication of the counselling method as on-going, therefore this 1997 document being, as an important policy course, the DoE chose for a sturdier domineering style, with little trade-offs on serious matters.

The EWP recognised many social tenacities that higher education was envisioned to aid:

- To rally human gift and probable over lifetime knowledge and offer the work place, in an information-motivated and information-reliant society, with the always-altering complex capabilities and skill required for the development and success of a contemporary economy,¹²
- To assume the making, gaining and claim of new information and subsidize to the making, division and assessment of information,
- To discourse the advance desires of society and the difficulties and trials of the larger African setting,¹³

⁸ K King 'Policy coherence in education, training and enterprise development in South Africa: The implementation challenge of new policies' *Changing education and training in South Africa* (1998) Cape Town: UCT Press 4-19.

⁹ A Fataar 'Higher education policy discourse in South Africa: A struggle for alignment with macro development policy' (2003) 17 (2) *South African Journal of Higher Education* 31-39.

¹⁰ Fataar (n 9) 39.

¹¹ Bengu (n 7)

¹² S Michael 'University Governance, Leadership and Management in a Decade of Diversification and Uncertainty' (2013) 67 (3) *Higher Education Quarterly* 220.

¹³ Wise (n 3) 343.

- To subsidize to the social edifying and intelligent life of a fast altering society, socialize rational, accountable and usefully serious citizens and aid build the basics of a serious civil society, with an ethos of public discussion and lenience.

In spirit, the social drives reverberate with the main parts of higher education of distributing information and creating serious graduates, making and relating information over research and growth doings and contributing to financial and social growth and democracy over learning and teaching, study and community meeting. Concomitantly, and as part of the “vision of a transformed, democratic, non-racial and non-sexist system of higher education”¹⁴ higher education was termed to spread exact aims. Including:

- Amplified and widened partaking, with better entree for black women, restricted and settled scholars and equity of entree and fair odds of triumph to all though eliminating all methods of unfair discrimination and forward reparation for historical inequalities,
- Reform of the higher education system and its institutes to see the desires of a gradually mechanical-leaning economy and to bring the obligatory study, the extremely skilled folks and the information to train a rising society with the size to tackle national desires and to partake in a quickly altering and viable global setting,
- To theorize and strategize higher education in South Africa as a sole, synchronized structure, confirm variety in its organizational system and in the institutional scenery, expand the structure in relations of the blend of institutional tasks and programmes that will be essential to encounter national and regional requests in social, cultural and economic development”, and “balance weights for homogenization,
- To back a democratic philosophy and a culture of human rights by educational programmes and performs favorable to serious dissertation and original intellect, cultural lenience, and a common pledge to a human, non-racist and non-sexist social order,
- To make an allowing institutional setting and culture that is subtle to and confirms range, endorses resolution and esteem for human life, guards the

¹⁴ Michael (n 12) 220.

poise of persons from racial and sexual aggravation, and discards all other types of violent conduct,

- To recover the excellence of education and knowledge through the system and, particularly to confirm that programs are open to the national and regional setting, and to endorse superiority and quality assurance over the endorsement of programmes, programme appraisals and institutional checks,
- To grow and apply subsidy instruments in sustenance of the goals of the national higher education strategy.

The goals were: equity and reparation, quality, growth, democratisation, academic liberty, institutional autonomy, effectiveness and efficiency, and public culpability.¹⁵ The main pedals for altering higher education were to be national and institution-level preparation, subsidy, and quality assurance.

In the setting of a promise to societal rebuilding and growth programme to which higher education was likely to make a noteworthy input, the higher education change plan was essentially wide in possibility and essential in nature. Such a change plan had substantial monetary and person power inferences, which would inevitably form the course, vitality, and leap of institutional alteration.

The EWP 3, then, had three extensive political aims that were regarded and improved in the 1997 Education White Paper 3: A Programme for the Transformation of SA Higher Education.¹⁶ First was that a higher education and training system needs to be established “to meet the demands of social justice in order to address the social and structural inequalities that characterised the apartheid higher education legacy, which was evidently fragmented and distorted in nature, with some institutions better resourced than others and in which race and ethnicity continued to define and act as stumbling blocks to access into many of the institutions”. Secondly was that that original higher education system that desired to be established had “to address the challenges associated with the phenomenon of globalization with a focus on the central role of knowledge and information processing in driving social and economic development”. As a triumph pointer, the system would need “to produce graduates

¹⁵ Wise (n 3) 343.

¹⁶ K Asmal ‘Transformation and restructuring: A new institutional landscape for higher education’ (2002) Pretoria: Ministry of Education 2-4.

with the requisite skills to and competencies to participate in the economy as citizens of a democratic society and as workers and professionals, and furthermore be able to contribute to the research and knowledge needs of South Africa.” Lastly, the post-apartheid system of higher education needed “to ensure that the limited resources for the delivery of education were effectively and efficiently utilized in view of competing and equal pressing priorities in other social sectors of society”. These three high-level policy situations of the Government shaped a basis for the reform course of 63 of South Africa’s higher education and exercise sector and offered growth to expressive stages and procedures piloting to the 2003 union statements by the Government and the ultimate operation in 2004.

4.2.2 Achievements of the structures and measures taken by the Government

There have been number of accomplishments through the previous years, though some of these, will be observed later, have to be qualified:

- A complete plan and policy framework for higher education, as explained in many policy papers, have been described, even if the kind of change plan and some basics need continuing serious debate. The advanced recognition of this outline is probable to make a higher education system that is consistent with the main principles of social equity and reparation, social justice, democracy, and expansion.¹⁷
- The basics have stood placed for an original higher education scene founded by a particular, matched and discerned system encircling universities, universities of technology, comprehensive institutions, interaction and reserve institutions and many types of colleges. The related institutional reformation has offered the chance to reconfigure the Higher education system in a honorable and creative way, more suitable to the desires of a democracy and all its citizens in difference to the racist and exclusionary necessities that cut big parts of the apartheid system.¹⁸
- There has been amplified and widened involvement in higher education to spread social equity and encounter economic and social growth requests, a

¹⁷ S Badat ‘Higher education transformation in South Africa post 1994: Towards a critical assessment’ (2007) 19.

¹⁸ S Badat (n 17)

central goal given the inheritance of difficulty of black and women South Africans, specially of working class and rural poor roots. Student registrations have increased from 473 000 in 1993 to about 799 388 in 2008. There is also a wide deracialisation of the student form, largely and at numerous institutions. While in 1993 African students created 40% (191 000), and black students 52% of the student form, in 2011 they made up 64.4% (514 370) and over 75% singly of complete registrations.¹⁹ There has also been praiseworthy growth regarding gender equity. While women students made up 43% (202 000 out of 473 000) of admissions in 1993, by 2011 they created 56.3% (450 584 out of 799 388) of the student form.²⁰

- Secluded from the remainder of Africa and the world mostly, democracy has carried a comfort internationalization of the student form and, though to a more restricted degree, of the academic staff. International student admissions improved from 14 124 in 1995 to 51 224 in 2011, creating about 7% of the entire student form. Students from the South African Development Community alliance grew from 7 497 in 1995 to 35 725 in 2005. Students from other African countries grew from 1 769 in 1995 to 7 586 in 2011. Students from the remainder of the world summed 7 913 in 2011.²¹
- With regard to teaching-learning, study and community assignation, in many areas of education and training, institutions bid academic programmes that create high quality alumni with knowledge, abilities and skills to work professions locally and worldwide. Numerous parts of study are described by brilliance and the cohort of high quality essential and practical information for scientific publishing in local and international journals, for economic and social growth and invention, and for public policy. In a diversity of parts, there are also vital and advanced community engagement wits that relate academics, students and communities.

¹⁹ Department of Higher Education and Training (2012) 'Green paper for post-school education and training' (2012) Pretoria: DHET 16.

²⁰ Department of Higher Education and Training (2012) 'Green paper for post-school education and training' Pretoria: DHET 12.

²¹ Department of Higher Education and Training (2012) 'Green paper for post-school education and training' Pretoria: DHET 8.

- A national quality assurance framework and substructure has been created and policies, instruments, and creativities with esteem to official inspection, programme authorization and quality elevation and ability growth have been applied since 2004. These growths have meaningfully elevated the profile of class matters athwart the sector and have related concepts of quality in teaching and learning, research and community engagement to the aims and drives of higher education change. There has also been a connected developing institutionalisation of quality running in establishments.
- Subsequent the constitutional providing for the reality of private HEIs on condition that they do not discriminate about race, listed with the government, and upheld values that were not mediocre to those at similar public institutions, a small private higher education sector has been derived. Measures that private institutions need to see to attain university status are placed.

In conclusion to the complete, portions of South African higher education show substantial fortes and much potential regarding information manufacture and diffusion, to tributary to social equity, to economic and social growth and democracy, and to the growth needs of the Southern African area and the African continent. The next section discusses the experiences and career advancement of women academics in South African universities.

4.2.3 Experiences and career advancement of women academics in South African HEIs

The element that women academics in advanced and rising countries inhabit an exclusive place in academe has placed their experiences and career development forecasts to limits.²² Bhopal contends that in South Africa women are under-represented in higher and middle administration titles in HEIs.²³ Basanquet *et al*, mentioned that the educational upbringing of character, says that offspring “who are not loved do not live.”²⁴ Accurately, this denotes for female researchers to flourish and grow in their careers, universities must shift far from the social and outdated values

²² CB Howsona *et al* ‘Mid-Career academic women and the prestige economy’ (2018) 33 (1) *Higher Education Research and Development* 539.

²³ K Bhopal ‘The experience of BME academics in higher education’ (2014) London: Leadership Foundation for Higher Education 128.

²⁴ A Bosanquet *et al* ‘Redefining ‘early career’ in academia: A collective narrative approach’ (2017)36 (5) *Higher Education Research and Development* 910.

and standards that still repute females as the “other”, appropriate only to remain home deprived of continuing in their careers. Career development is optimistic work success, the penalties of human capital, socio-psychological factors, and results which a person gathers gradually, in line with their work experiences, in a vocation.²⁵ Toma *et al*, avow that the under-representation of female teachers in universities starts at senior lecturer spots and is even more visible at the professorial level.²⁶ Some of the causes for the under and over-representation of female researchers in some university levels are owing to work and family duties, male supremacy, policies in institutions and lack of sustenance systems in place. Gipson and Mitchell initiate that disdain having a Constitution that ensconces equal rights, discriminatory practices, structural inequalities, cultural factors, prejudices, and traditional patriarchal society remain thriving and well at institutions of higher education in South Africa.²⁷ Though black women academics rule the teaching career in South Africa, a handful of them inhabit management titles like men.²⁸

According to Hannum *et al*, South African higher education institutions do not have adequate retention strategies in place; he suggests that if there were any staff retention plan, the academic supervisors were meant to be conscious of it and thus apply them.²⁹ This would then have an impact on the development and retention of black women academics as researchers at South African institutions. Globally, there is significance in the extent to which men and black women academics pursue education and participate in an educational institution, at various levels. Mostafa *et al*, reflect that, in the majority 54 of 90 countries for which data is available, black women academics -only count for 25 to 45% of researchers and they represent more than 45% of the researchers in only 21 nations.³⁰ Comparing South African statistics to

²⁵ P Angervall & D Beach ‘The Exploitation of Academic Work: Women in Teaching at Swedish Universities’ (2017) 31 *Higher Education Policy* 1-17.

²⁶ SM Toma *et al* ‘Women in academic administration at the university’ (2010) 38 (4) *Educational Management Administration and Leadership* 489.

²⁷ J Gipson & D Jr Mitchell ‘How high-impact practices influence academic achievement for African American college students’ (2017)3 (2) *Journal Committed to Social Change on Race and Ethnicity* 135.

²⁸ J McDowell & A Carter-Francique ‘An intersectional analysis of the workplace experiences of African American female athletic directors’ (2017) 77 (5) *Sex Roles* 6.

²⁹ KM Hannum *et al* ‘Women leaders within higher education in the united states: Supports, barriers, and experiences of being a senior leader (2015) 35 *Advancing Women in Leadership* 65-75.

³⁰ AMS Mostafa *et al* ‘High-performance human resource practices and employee outcomes: The mediating role of public service motivation’ (2015) 75 (5) *Public Administration Review* 747–757.

these statistics, it is much closer to parity than the global average. The following section discuss the rewards structures and measures taken by the institutions.

4.3 THE TRANSFORMATION AND MEASURES TAKEN BY THE INSTITUTIONS

There has been an obstinate stiffness among many values and goals of higher education. For example, the degree that government and universities have wanted to chase social equity and reparation and value in higher education concurrently, hard political and social problems, selections and choices have occurred like; teaching and learning, research and community engagement specially in the situation of short public funds and academic advance initiatives to sustenance under-prepared black women academics as pupils, who manage to be mainly black and/or of working class or rural poor social roots. The following are the rewards structures and measures taken by the institutions to address the challenges affecting the advancement and experience of black women academics:

4.3.1 Aptitude management

Aptitude management includes the execution of combined human resource management tactics to entice, grow, hold and effectively use staff 'with the compulsory skills and aptitudes to encounter present and upcoming business requirements'.³¹ It is an ethos that subsidises to and releases the desire, promise, and act of persons, that go contribute to the establishment realising its mission, vision, and business goals.³² HEIs should make a talent culture favourable for the attainment of many urgencies linking to the working setting, like employment and retaining, act running, succession arrangement and assignation, and must guarantee that these develop planned flair management necessities.³³

4.3.2 Aptitude management models for HEIs and Universities

Erasmus *et al*, established the inclusive talent life-cycle model that can be used to chaperon the whole procedure of talent supervision in higher education institutions

³¹ G Abid *et al* 'Promoting thriving at work and waning turnover intention: A relational perspective' (2016) 2 (2) *Future Business Journal* 130.

³² L Morley 'Lost leaders: Women in the global academy' (2014) 33 (1) *Higher Education Research and Development* 116.

³³ M Saurombe *et al* 'Management perceptions of a higher educational brand for the attraction and of talent academic staff' (2017) 15 *South African Journal of Human Resource Management* 5.

and universities.³⁴ This model suggests that talent supervision begins with a complex educational control attitude and assurance toward academic talent. Flowing from that, institutes of higher learning must make their marking to entice talented academics. Once attained, talented persons must be charted and tailored into the places that best see their skills, to more confirm their meeting with and pledge to the workplace. Actual talent growth chances and good recital management schemes ought to be set to safeguard career development and succeeding preservation of talent.

Hotho established a model that can be castoff to chaperon strategic talent supervision in HEIs and Universities.³⁵ Rendering to the Strategic Talent Management model, a combined talent supervision plan needs the human resource tactic and business tactic of HEIs and Universities to be allied. When this is in order, higher education institutions can concentrate on enticing and employing a wanted pool of talent. Higher education also needs to grow an image that will appeal the right workers.³⁶ Furthermore, HEIs and Universities must recognise and value talented persons as a main resource. The precise individuals need to be chosen and positioned in appropriate titles. Then, comprehensive talent supervision observes, precisely talent growth, rewards, and performance management, ought to be preserved by nonstop management obligation.³⁷ Applying talent management observes successfully lead to condensed income and better separate results regarding the psychological pact, explicitly work engagement, energy, job gratification and inspiration.³⁸ This leads to a positive effect on structural results, like improved service value and presentation, that ultimately results in complete organisational triumph.

Williams, in her research between higher educational management, established the Talent Value Proposition Model to help with the actual talent management of academic

³⁴ BJ Erasmus *et al* 'Employee retention in a higher education institution: An organisational development perspective' (2015) 37 (2) *Progression* 48.

³⁵ S Hotho 'Higher education change and its managers: Alternative constructions' (2013) 41 (3) *Educational Management Administration and Leadership* 358.

³⁶ Howsona (n 22) 539.

³⁷ P Angervall & D Beach 'The Exploitation of Academic Work: Women in Teaching at Swedish Universities' (2017) 31 *Higher Education* 1-17.

³⁸ Saurombe (n 33) 5.

work.³⁹ The model portrays the subsequent parts, all of which cooperate to the formation of a talent value proposition for academic work:

- Structural product containing the status and image, ethos and uniqueness, strategic idea, corporate social accountability, and work setting and environs
- Employment product entailing fringe benefits, incentives, and salary; management and executive support; work-life balance; administration and growth of performance; occupational health and safety, job security; and fulfillment and drive
- Talent life cycle.

Lastly, the model shows that after the structural image, hire image and talent life-cycle courses have extended in the institution, these ideas then cooperate near the formation of a talent value plan for academic staff members. For this talent value plan to be active, it must take the subsequent elements into deliberation: the importance of having a talent value plan, the joint anticipation tangled in a talent value plan, as well as the trials tangled in applying a talent value plan.

4.3.3 Management support

Management's attitude is significant for the operative management of talent in associations. Bestowing to McNae and Vali, management commitment concerning talent releases the desire, pledge, and recital of individuals, contributing to the organisation attaining its mission, vision, and goals.⁴⁰ Affording to Constandius and Bitzer, many senior managers manage to aid a programme that is affiliated with the business strategy.⁴¹ The universities strategy attends as a director for the organisation's selection of the kind of talent to charm, grow and recall in order to have properly skilled, dedicated and involved employees to bring excellent services or quality goods.⁴² Human resource and talent managers are taxed to affiliate human

³⁹ DA Williams 'Strategic diversity leadership: Activating change and transformation in higher education' (2013) Sterling, VA: Stylus.

⁴⁰ McNae, R & K Vali, 'Diverse experiences of women leading in higher education: Locating networks and agency for leadership within a university context in Papua New Guinea' (2015) 27 (3) *Gender and Education* 289.

⁴¹ E Constandius & E Bitzer '*Engaging higher education curricula: A critical citizenship education perspective*' (2015) Stellenbosch: SUN Press.

⁴² Erasmus (n 34) 48.

capital and business strategies to guarantee the effective application of any talent management model.⁴³

Research by Bosanquet *et al*, presented that academic staff practiced adequate support from their managers but felt that performance management and feedback desired development.⁴⁴ Contrary, Selesho and Naile found that HEI managers were more absorbed by gains, business nourishment and defence for spending, while employees were ambitious with reclusive interests, like growth, financial rewards, and personal realisation.⁴⁵ Hundera claims top management underrates the value and severity of talent holding, and thus, the motives for and answers to labour revenue are incorrectly recognised.⁴⁶

4.3.4 Aptitude attraction

According to Morley a compact employer-branding module is the basis of aptitude attraction.⁴⁷ Bhana presented that features like employee value intention, people plan, brand steadiness, communication of employer brand and measurement of employer brand efforts are vital for the lure of potential talent to organisations.⁴⁸ Williams discovered that the status of the academic career in society charms likely academics to HEIs.⁴⁹ Morley, assumed that a favourable learning and working ambiance, job elasticity, credit, rewards and recompense, and operative employee exercise and growth will appeal academics to HEIs and Universities.⁵⁰ Research by Hirshfield and Joseph displayed that professional backing, salary, and coaching weight contribute to the lure of academic workers.⁵¹

⁴³ Saurombe (n 33) 5.

⁴⁴ Bosanquet (n 24) 910.

⁴⁵ JM Selesho & I Naile 'Academic staff retention as a human resource factor: University perspective' (2014) 13 (2) *International business & Economic Research Journal* 299.

⁴⁶ MB Hundera 'Factors affecting academic staff turnover intentions and the moderating effect of gender' (2014) 2 (9) *International Journal of Research in Business Management* 61.

⁴⁷ Morley (n 32) 116.

⁴⁸ D Bhana 'Race matters and the emergence of class: Views from selected South African university students' (2014) 28 *South African Journal of Higher Education* 364.

⁴⁹ Williams (n 39)

⁵⁰ Morley (n 32) 116.

⁵¹ L Hirshfield & T Joseph 'We need a woman, we need a black woman': Gender, race, and identity taxation in the academy (2012) 24 (2) *Gender and Education* 213–227.

4.3.5 Aptitude advancement

Aptitude growth denotes to a course of offering persons with a chance to raise over stimulating experiences, coaching, and mentoring.⁵² According to Moodly, bodies must grow workers who will be able to progress in their jobs.⁵³ Farinde *et al*, upholds that, when bodies progress their folks' talent, the general talent pool rises and the war for talent declines.⁵⁴

The significance of talent expansion opportunities for academic staff is well known. Hannum *et al*, discovered that the accessibility of talent development ensued in an improved number of qualified journals by staff members, an improved number of staffs with doctorates, bigger awareness of subsidy chances and improved postgraduate supervision yield.⁵⁵ Reports by Saurombe *et al*, Kelly and McCann displayed that an absence of structure for talent development and a deficiency of talent development chances were key aspects in the revenue intents of primary career academics.⁵⁶

4.3.6 Compensation and acknowledgment

McNae and Vali stressed the necessity to grow and employ an applicable recompense and return plan for effective talent management.⁵⁷ Abid *et al*, claims that non-monetary aspects must not be ignored, as these may too have an effect on the holding and lure of workers.⁵⁸ Payment practices are vital aspects in the lure and holding of fresh academics, particularly from previously underprivileged racial groups in South Africa.⁵⁹ In South Africa, there is a serious need for black academics that can aid to their disciplines and professional links, and over journals tackle issues of national worry.⁶⁰

⁵² C Zulu 'Women academics' research productivity at one university campus: an analysis of dominant discourses' (2013) 27 (3) *South African Journal of Higher Education* 759.

⁵³ A Moodly 'Gender equity in South African Higher education leadership: Where are we twenty years after democracy?' (2015)42 (3) *Journal of Social Sciences* 233.

⁵⁴ AA Farinde *et al* 'Pathways to teaching: An examination of black females' pursuits of careers as k-12 teachers' (2015) 38 (3) *Educational Research Quarterly* 32-51.

⁵⁵ Hannum *et al* (n 29) 69.

⁵⁶ Saurombe *et al* (n 33) 5.

⁵⁷ McNae, R & K Vali 'Diverse experiences of women leading in higher education: Locating networks and agency for leadership within a university context in Papua New Guinea' (2015) 27 (3) *Gender and Education* 289.

⁵⁸ Abid *et al* (n 31)130.

⁵⁹ B Kellerman & DL Rhode 'Women at the top: The pipeline as pipe dream' (2017) 21 (6) *About Campus* 11–18.

⁶⁰ VE Evans-Winters & BL Love '*Black feminism in education: Black women speak back, up, and out*' (2015) New York, NY: Peter Lang 179.

4.3.7 Institutional methods

The holding of academic staff is touched by many institutional failings, like an absence of mentorship, a deficiency of suitable government and research subsidy, collegial research spurs and employment equity initiatives.⁶¹ Over the previous two decades, government and private-sector research subsidy of public universities have extensively deteriorated.⁶² As an outcome, public university academics have been forced to convert 'academic entrepreneurs' and to produce a third torrent of revenue that will profit the person and the organization.⁶³

According to Hotho, academic staff of publicly subsidised universities work in a progressively competitive setting, organising their academic investment, that may include teaching, research, consultancy skills or other bids of prescribed academic knowledge.⁶⁴ The work of academics has therefore become further emotionally challenging and disjointed, suggesting a cost of professional sovereignty, scholar distinctiveness and psychological possession.⁶⁵ Possibly resulting in academic careers turning less striking and public HEIs and Universities not being favoured employers.

4.4 CHAPTER SUMMARY

In conclusion, this chapter has studied literature that has denounced the questions and study commenced in this thesis. Largely, the examination of the literature has reflected the government and institutional situations, culture and constructions that compel or allow effective application of black women academic expansion programmes in higher education. Maybe, literature offers evidence of the daunting effect applied on black women academic expansion creativities by academic traditions and cultures corrective research. If it is the case that institutional assemblies and observes are more important in inhibiting the development of black women in academics, then there is a bit of optimism. There is confidence for revolution, providing

⁶¹ F Storberg-Walker & P Haber-Curran 'Theorizing women and leadership: New insights and contributions from multiple perspectives' (2017) Charlotte, NC: Information Age Publishing.

⁶² Bhana (n 48) 364.

⁶³ Williams (n 39)

⁶⁴ Hotho (n 35) 358.

⁶⁵ A Moodly & N Toni 'Women's voices of and on leadership in higher education' Paper presented at the Global Research and International Services (GRDS) 7th International Conference on Teaching, Education and Learning (ICTEL), 10–11 October 2015' (2015) Pointe aux Piments, Mauritius.

that there is a determination to challenge institutional cultures and structures more forcefully than has been the case since the beginning of democracy in South Africa. Miserably, still, institutional cultures have not reformed much post-1994 between many South African universities and the outcomes are clear in the fairly small number of black women professors in all the HEIs in South Africa. Wise *et al*, proclaims, it is domineering that colleges and universities take a lively role in creating conjunction programming that declines the problems that black women academics struggle with every day.⁶⁶

The summary, conclusion and recommendations of this study will be presented in the chapter five.

⁶⁶ Wise (n 3)348.

CHAPTER FIVE:

RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION

5.1 INTRODUCTION

The previous chapter has focused on legislative measures and framework for gender equality, explaining the problem of gender inequality in higher education and what must be done to integrate these international and national instruments into higher education. In this chapter, the attention will be on how the discoveries have responded the research questions, boundaries, and upcoming research. This will be trailed by the inferences of the results, recommendation, contributions to literature, future research, and conclusions.

The study wanted to respond to the next research questions:

- What are the challenges faced by black women academics in higher education institutions?
- What are the contributing factors to the underrepresentation of black women in senior academic positions in higher institutions?
- What are the incentives assemblies to reassure faculty victory and bid support systems to decrease separation that could potentially address the underrepresentation of black women?
- What are the policies and practices regarding appointment and promotion that ensure the requirements for Equal Employment Opportunities?

5.1.1 What are the challenges faced by black women academics in higher education institutions?

This question pursued to tackle the challenges confronted by black women in climbing advanced titles in academia. Results have exposed that black women met many blocks in climbing the academic ranking therefore they are under-represented at management and higher academic stages of service. Their career growth and evolution endure to be tense with trials that do not appear to be retreating.

Firstly, outcomes of the study have shown that black women go through trials of gender inequality. There is a theme running through the issues and challenges voiced in all the literature. The root of the trials experienced are old, socio-economic, and

political, and they affect academic individuality creation as well as the relations of partaking in the societies of practice where positioned learning is meant to happen.¹ Learning as ‘genuine marginal participation’ in a practical community of rehearsal for ‘new’ or ‘early’ career academics must be clearly broad, leading to ‘change and growth of individualities’.² Disregarding practices are not and must not be muddled with ‘marginal participation’ as the previous denies entree to practices that lead to valued capabilities and uniqueness. Disregarding leads to agony and scuffle while trying to thrive on a rough playing ground. The study reveals that the causes of weakness or feelings of omission and prevention are many, but the roles of ethnic and gender inequality appear great. While the gender mutable does not arise constantly in the study, one of the literatures carries in nationality as an extra distinctiveness sign that, when allied to ethnic, gives interesting and relevant acumens into the control of the race mutable.

Secondly, the study had visibly recognised that there is an absence of mentorship programmes and black woman role models in HEIs. Numerous studies have revealed that mentorship is utmost operative in tackling the issue of gender under-representation.³ Mentorship is an important tool that is operative in sanctioning women on what is required for them to ascent the academic ladder; in other words, it can assist to push them on meeting the preferment measures. Also, mentorship helps in informing women on what is trendy in the institution and other institutions, for example, conferences and workshops. Female role models are also missing though they play an imperative part in the professional development of all persons. This is worsened by lack of black women academics’ role models to afford this mentorship for black woman academics. The shortage of black women academics’ counsellors can lead to a sense of seclusion by incipient academics as is also shown in Dingindawo *et al*, study. The outcomes also showed that the mentoring programme was not presented in the institution though there were preparation programmes that the university presented but the partakers felt that they were not enough, and they were not like mentorship.

¹ CH Mayer ‘A ‘derailed’ agenda? Black women’s voices on workplace transformation’ (2017) 18 (4) *Journal of International Women’s Studies* 148.

² S Fernandez ‘The transformation of the South African public service: Exploring the impact of racial and gender representation on organisational effectiveness’ (2016) 54 (1) *Journal of Modern African Studies* 98.

³ J Hills ‘Addressing gender quotas in South Africa: Women empowerment and gender equality legislation’ (2015) 20 (1) *Deakin Law Review* 156.

Raising a need for a mentorship programmes to be presented, where academics can travel even to other institutions to gain mentorship.

Also, the outcomes also confirmed that the promotion measures used by institutions were very rigorous and black women met numerous trials trying to meet those measures. Usually, when it emanates to meeting the promotion measures black women academics still have a long way as many of them were still doing their PhDs and in that field, they were also encountering trials of high workloads that limited them from focusing on their study. The literature used in this study validates that too many duties and workload are a portion of the trials that hold black women academics back.

5.1.2 What are the contributing factors to the underrepresentation of black women in senior academic positions in higher institutions?

This question wanted to explore gender representation in all levels of management and the conducive issues to the underrepresentation of black women in higher-ranking academic positions in higher institutions. Results have revealed that black women academics are under-represented in virtually all management and academic stages. Obvious gender inequalities were exposed specially as levels rise. Authors have pointed out that black women academics are vaguely signified in internal management. This could be credited to male-controlled trust classification with gender stereotypical ideas of 'masculine leadership'.

We see similar gender disparities in academia. Leonard and Grobler found evident gaps at the professoriate stage, faintly more women depiction at senior lecturer and lecturer levels 35% and 38% respectively and at junior lecturer level, black women academics are nearly equal with men, at 46%.⁴ The study tells that unlike men, women face encounters as they steer work, family, their education and other roles. This is part of the motives why black women academics find it hard to ascent the academic ladder, mainly in academia. The results have shown that women are in inferior titles as they lack institutional sustenance, their gender desires and interests are overlooked when it comes to choices made on promotion. All these aid to the absence of partaking in

⁴ A Leonard & AF Grobler 'Exploring challenge to transformational leadership communication about employment equity: Managing organizational change in South Africa' (2016) 10 (4) *Journal of Communication Management* 396.

research and publications while these are vital necessities for promotion, as will be shown in the following subset.

To this consequence, as the literature recommends, a lot still needs to happen to close the gender openings in higher education institutions in South Africa.⁵ The results show that gender parity in almost all HEIs internationally stays hard to attain. Though, the results gave interesting explanations about the matter of gender equality, since women don't have much confidence in themselves. In order for revolution to happen, it is apparent that there should be alteration at the fundamental stage, cultural, structural and as well as specific stage that is the change of men's mind set, by removing the negative stereotypes and predetermined ideas that both themselves and the society have about their aptitude to lead.

5.1.3 What are the rewards structures to encourage faculty success and offer support systems to reduce isolation that could potentially address the underrepresentation of black women?

It is obvious from the accounts that the trials of intellectual engagement in sight of gate-keeping practices concerning what ought to be imparted; how it must be imparted; and by whom precedents to power, regulate, and omission. Whereas the characteristics of black women academics in the university are alike, they are not standardised. The accounts not only altogether bring up parts of the history of education in South Africa, but offer clearness on, and offer speech to, a variety of numerous national, historical, and political legacies. These bequests, in education and overall like most areas of human effort, are categorised by contention, disregarding and in some cases absolute arrogance of certain clusters to others. In this situation, the lure is to oversee what an individual has attained and to concentrate on the blocks to victory. While genetic systemic socio-economic disparities and the endurance of structural variations, as well as evident or concealed prohibiting, explicate the experience of academia as a scruffle, the accounts show the durable purpose of black women academics to thrive beside all chances a purpose entrenched in their history and socio-cultural upbringings that visibly echo with their academic experiences.

⁵ Hills (n 3)158.

The accounts' concentrate on scruffle proves the struggle of tracing an entity's history and dazzling on their degree of triumph when the main imprint and experience is that of continuing scruffle. The accounts induce a hard past, a thought-provoking current and yet also an unusual situation of forte and achievement that is not always recognized. Certainly, the storytellers seem to be in 'liminality', which Leonard and Grobler define as a "liquid" area, concurrently altering and being changed by the pupil as he or she shifts it'.⁶ It is a revolution area in which a person can look back to move onward irrespective of the walls and encounters, always on the verge of being in flattering. Lastly, these accounts can be appreciated as a likeness of occurrences and lacks that are either appreciated or seen as a risk or that lead to manners of lack. While, they bid visions into what the university management can do to face hereditary absurdities if variety and change are to go past adding numbers to offering support and mentorship so that more black women academics transfer into the higher levels of academia. This means that the strategy is not attaining its aims.

5.1.4 What are the policies and practices regarding appointment and promotion that ensure the requirements for Equal Employment Opportunities?

This question sought to determine policies and practices regarding appointment and promotion that ensure the requirements for Equal Employment Opportunities. The findings have revealed that black woman development/progress is still not at the same equal as men even if gender issues are reflected when expressing policies and members of institutions are well conversant about the numerous policies at work involving human resource. Also, it was established that employment equity policies are practical in HEIs. However, even if employment equity policies are used in institutions, most of the literature exposed that there are insufficient policies in place to inspire black women academics in their jobs. They also observed that this could be since gender policies are not regularly edited to tackle the challenges black women academics meet. Even the observing and assessment of policy application is not done frequently. Besides, the selection and promotion of staff in universities, majority of the literature exposed that promotions must be founded on qualifications and experience

⁶ Leonard & Grobler (n 4) 396.

in management, teaching and study. In summary, HEIs policies have not realised their purposes as black women academics are still under-represented.

5.2 CONCLUSION

Although there has been noteworthy institutional change in higher education since 1994, there has been no “total, rapid and sweeping displacement” of bodies, organisations, policies, and practices.⁷ It is also debatable if there could be offered the post-1994 policy selections of the ANC, the restrictions of the conveyed political defrayal in South Africa, and numerous other conjunctural conditions and pressures. However, through the historical 16 years there have remained “a multitude of changes that have transformed higher education in South Africa and while continuities remain, the higher education system does not represent the distortion, upheaval and fragmentation that marked the sector at the start of the 1990s.”⁸

Black women academics come to labour in HEIs with an anticipation of alike handling and valuation of their effort on worth, and a supposition that they would improve in the same way that men escalate to the topmost of their fields. This is not frequently the case, as this study has shown. Black women academics depiction in this institution continues to be very low, as the results proved that the depiction of black women in academia remained low and that the promotion measure stays rigorous and hard for black women academics to reach. In this research, it can be settled that despite substantial exertions to battle gender inequity in higher education, the challenge still remains. Higher education in this institution require black women academics image in executive management, senior management, middle management and as well as in academic titles. What is required is a more thoughtful, mutual, family, and community-friendly ethos in the HEIs to support black women academics. The male-controlled nature of South African society has slowly snuck into the higher education institutions. This ethos, deliberately or involuntarily, moulds women’s experiences in higher education. Hills completes by that we need to build associations that reveal and challenge how gendered power is conveyed through abuse, disregarding, weakness,

⁷ HA Lee ‘Affirmative action regime formation in Malaysia and South Africa’ (2016) 51 (5) *Journal of Asian and African Studies* 519.

⁸ R Deacon *et al* ‘Education policy studies in South Africa, 1995–2006’ (2010) 25 (1) *Journal of Education Policy* 99.

cultural colonialism, and fierceness in academic life and in broader civil society.⁹ Consequently, it is of importance that universities are showed by the three major values of gender mainstreaming procedures, that are:

- The gender matter is universal and needs to be preserved as a cross-cutting matter in both teaching and research procedures;
- That the conduct of gender matters or anxiety that is not founded on symbolic information is frequently treated nonchalantly or with feelings. So, it is imperative to fast track the stimulating procedure with a situation examination that gives foundation for a model dispute and indication. Allowing future observation for modification and assessment,
- That gender mainstreaming handles the origin of the issue as it is made to test the inflexible and entrenched cultural views that spread gender inequality, that currently seems to be a key test encountered by South African society and its institutions.

5.3 RECOMMENDATIONS

In understanding of the results offered in chapter four of this study, recommendations are drawn at three levels: institutions, black women academics, and policy makers.

5.3.1 Recommendations for institutions

The Higher education Institutions must include democratic values and principles into its system. The institutions must impose a helpful atmosphere and environment that is receptive to black women academics matters instead of creating an environment that obstructs black women academics personal, academic, and professional growth.

Institutions need to grow and introduce clear gender-equity/equality policies that would offer a framework on mainstreaming gender in all parts of operations in Universities. Including the refurbishment and redirection of all policies, programmes and projects to

⁹ S Ebrahim 'Reviewing the suitability of affirmative action and the inherent requirements of the job as grounds of justification to equal pay claims in terms of the employment equity act 55 of 1998' (2018) 21 *PER / PELJ* 11.

include gender starting from the preparation stage.¹⁰ Between others, policies like staff development, mentoring, research and publication and Human Resource policies like hiring and selection policies ought to be amid those in which gender must be combined, as also explained below. An obligation must be completed by the institutions, in discussion with the Gender Unit, for example, to organise a gender-sensitisation program and for a gender-role socialisation program to educate men who are customary in their ways as outdated theorists and are advocates of patriarchy. An alliance of both women and men, must be agreed upon, particularly men in combating this struggle.

The shortage of black women academics in leading positions who mentor and inspire further black women academics is a difficult matter facing black women. Hence, the institution must accelerate female role models who will encourage women, who can coach, sponsor, protect and grow coverage and visibility of junior female academics. Role models and mentor's ought to be presented to present black women academics to the writing and publishing domain or the working community.

The institution ought to contemplate distinguishing the promotion standards between men and women, black women academics deserve special conduct considering that they have more responsibilities opposed to men. Black woman academics must also attempt to get PhDs as this will grow their possibilities of being promoted.

5.3.2 Recommendations for black women academics

Black women academics in management must be understood to be doing things differently, promoting the culture of insertion and stimulating the power status quo, instead of being subordinates in the leading power structures. Those who have succeeded to get into high positions must signify the desires of other women. Black women in academic management can be inspiring and can rally communal action for common good. Also, black women in management positions must test recognised patriarchal and hierarchical methods of management, redefine power relations instead

¹⁰ CH Mayer 'A 'derailed' agenda? Black women's voices on workplace transformation' (2017) 18 (4) *Journal of International Women's Studies* 148.

of permitting themselves to be appointed and take risks of proceeding the change and reform plans.¹¹

5.3.3. Recommendations for policy makers

This recommendation is for the level of policy. It is obvious in this study that patriarchal frameworks alleviate against black women academics' career movement. HEIs must create a comprehensive gender policy framework, from which HEIs will draft institutional policies. Policy methods must grip both equivalent opportunities and preferential treatment of black women due to their family or care role. Assenting action policies are imperative to fix age-old discrimination against black women academics. Additionally, family-friendly policies must be assumed to help women to settle work and family. Staff development programmes must strengthen gender equality policies and affirmative action schemes. Mzangwa and Dede continue to recommend that any affirmative action intended to empower black women must be ran by women themselves and not by men as it portrays a male role-image and not a female one. Women-centred teaching styles must be used as well, to make an image of a female-model in the course.

5.4 SUGGESTION FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

This section gives suggestions for forthcoming research. As shown in chapter one, this was a limited study, a greater scale and proportional study would be important to create a full image on the topic. This would help in acquiring a full plan to face the issue of under-representation of women in HEIs. Also, this study includes the emergence and experience of black women academics of one University. It would be beneficial to hear men's interpretations of the subject. It will help policy creators in drafting communal response plan and instrument that discourses the difficulties that delay positive revolution and growth regarding black women academics at higher institutions.

¹¹ ST Mzangwa & Y Dede 'The effects of higher education policy on transformation in post-apartheid South Africa'(2019) 6(1) *Cogent Education* 1-16.

5.5 RESEARCH CONTRIBUTION TO EXISTING KNOWLEDGE

The current study has shown gender inequalities in majority parts of HEIs. Most of the investigation proved under-representation of black women in leadership and academic positions.¹² Some authors have discovered and exposed blocks met by black women as they steer career growth in HEIs. Additional studies looked at policies and made recommendations to better the condition black women academics face in these institutions. This study has investigated greater into experiences of black woman academics that are hired in HEIs, which to a greater degree, patriarchally-oriented. It subsidises to the body of information by revealing the cause of the matter, which is that HEIs are masculine-oriented and family-unfriendly. Moreover, this study divulges the absence of institutional support for black women considering that they are held back by cultural opinions and other weighty roles they cannot abandon. Contrasting other studies that have observed specific parts that lead to the shortage of black women in key positions at the work place, this study probed into manners and observations of black woman academics that they have on themselves on management positions in HEIs to get their voices into the mainstream address. It expands on the present gender equality debates, mainly on the identification and recommendations of suitable policy styles for the South African setting.

¹² Deacon *et al* (n 8) 99.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

BOOKS AND BOOK CHAPTERS

Anderson, TH 'The Pursuit of Fairness: A History of Affirmative Action' Oxford University Press, (2004).

Asmal, K 'Transformation and restructuring: A new institutional landscape for higher education' Pretoria: Ministry of Education (2002).

Cloete, N Maasen, P & Muller, J 'Great expectations, mixed governance approaches and unintended outcomes: The post 1994 reform of South African higher education' *Reform and Change in Higher Education* Dordrecht, Netherlands: Springer (2005).

Cloete, N & Muller, J 'South African higher education reform: What comes after post-colonialism? Pretoria: CHET (1998).

Collins, PH *Black feminist thought: Knowledge, consciousness and the politics of empowerment* London: Harper Collins (2000).

Constandius, E & Bitzer, E *Engaging higher education curricula: A critical citizenship education perspective*. Stellenbosch: SUN Press (2015).

Cooper, D & Subotzky, G 'The skewed revolution: Trends in South African higher education 1988-1998' Bellville: University of the Western Cape Education Policy Unit (2001).

Riordan, S., & Louw-Potgieter, J. 'Career success of women academics in South Africa'. *South African Journal of Psychology*, (2017).

Rabe, M. & Rugunanan, P. 'Exploring gender and race amongst female sociologists existing academia in South Africa. *Gender & Education*, (2019).

David, ME *Feminism, gender and universities: Politics, passion & pedagogies* London: Ashgate (2014).

De Clercq, H 'The venture capital post-investment phase: Opening the black box of involvement 147' Edward Elgar, Cheltenham, UK, (2007).

Desai, Z & Van Der Merwe, P 'Accommodating diversity in an increasingly global era: Reconciling the tension between English and African languages in education policy in South Africa. *Vision and reality: Changing education and training in South Africa* (245-254)' Cape Town: UCT Press (1998).

Evans-Winters, VE & Love, BL (eds) *Black feminism in education: Black women speak back, up, and out*. New York, NY: Peter Lang (2015).

Jansen, J 'Changes and Continuities in South Africa's Higher Education System, 1994 to 2004 in *Changing Class: Education and Social Change in Post-apartheid South Africa*' Pretoria: Human Science Research Council Press (2004).

Kallaway, P 'Whatever happened to rural education as a goal for (South) African development? *Vision and reality* (20-58) Cape Town: UCT Press (1998).

Meyers, DT *Feminist social thought: A reader*. 2nd ed. New York: Routledge (2014).

Nel, PS, Kirsten, M, Swanepoel, BJ, Erasmus, BJ & Poisat, P 2016. *South African employment relations theory and practice*. 8th ed. Pretoria: Van Schaik (2016).

Nkondo, GM 'Towards sustainable pedagogical transformation: A perspective on the National Commission on Higher Education' *Black perspective(s) on tertiary institutional transformation* (31-41) Florida Hills: Vivlia Publishers & University of Venda (1998).

Northouse, PG *Leadership: Theory and practice*. London: Sage publications (2015).

Ricketts, C & Ricketts, J *Leadership: Personal Development and Career Success*. 2nd ed. London: Cengage Publisher (2011).

Storberg-Walker, J & Haber-Curran, P *Theorizing women and leadership: New insights and contributions from multiple perspectives*. Charlotte, NC: Information Age Publishing (2017).

Williams, DA 'Strategic diversity leadership: Activating change and transformation in higher education' Sterling, VA: Stylus (2013).

Patton, L. D. and Njoku, N. R. Theorizing Black women's experiences with institution-sanctioned violence: a #BlackLivesMatter imperative toward Black liberation on campus. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education* (2019).

Croom, N. N. Promotion beyond tenure: Unpacking racism and sexism in the experiences of Black women professors. *The Review of Higher Education* (2017).

Shaw, E., Hess, C., Childers, C., Haye, J. and Tesfaselassie, A. Assets for Equity: Building Wealth for Women in Central Ohio. *Institute for Women's Policy Research*, (2019).

S.A Department of Labor Statistics. CPS Tables Annual Averages. *Table 5 Employment status of the civilian noninstitutional population by sex, age, and race* (2018).

Branker, R R. Labour Market Discrimination: The Lived Experiences of English-Speaking Caribbean Immigrants in Toronto. *Journal of International Migration and Integration* (2017).

Tesfai, R. Racialized Labour Market Incorporation? African Immigrants and the Role of Education-Occupation Mismatch in Earnings. *International Migration* (2017).

Hamilton, T. G., Janeria A. E. and Angela R. D. Black Immigration, Occupational Niches, and Earnings Disparities between U.S.-Born and Foreign-Born Blacks in the United States. *RSF: The Russell Sage Foundation Journal of the Social Sciences*, (2018).

Imoagene, O. Stepping up Your Game: Workplace Experiences of Second-Generation Nigerians in the USA. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, (2018).

Thomas, K. J. 2015. Occupational Stratification, Job-Mismatches, and Child Poverty: Understanding the Disadvantage of Black Immigrants in the U.S. *Social Science Research* 50, 203–216.

Patton, L. D. and Haynes, C. Hidden in plain sight: The Black women's blueprint for institutional transformation in higher education. *Teachers College Record* (2018).

Khunou, G., Phaswana, E.D., Khoza-Shangase, K. and Canham, H. *Black Academic Voices: The South African Experience*. Cape Town: HSRC Press (2019).

Maseti, T. The university is not your home: lived experiences of a Black woman in academia. *South African Journal of Psychology* (2018).

Mekoa, I. *Silent no more: Challenges facing black African academics at South African universities* (2016).

JOURNAL ARTICLES

Abid, G, Zahra, I & Ahmed, I 'Promoting thriving at work and waning turnover intention: A relational perspective' (2016) 2(2) *Future Business Journal* 127–137.

Acker, S 2014 'A foot in the revolving door? Women academics in lower-middle management' (2014) 33(1) *Higher Education Research & Development* 73–85.

Angervall, P & Beach, D 'The Exploitation of Academic Work: Women in Teaching at Swedish Universities' (2017) 28(4) *Higher Education Policy* 517–533.

Badat, S 'The challenges of transformation in higher education and training institutions in South Africa' (2010) Development Bank of Southern Africa, Johannesburg.

Baker, SC, Wentz, RK, & Woods, MM 'Using virtual worlds in education: Second Life as an educational tool' (2009) 36 *The teaching of Psychology* 59–64.

Basson, Y 'Selected developments in South African labour legislation related to persons with disabilities' (2017) 20 *PER / PELJ* 2–21.

Bhana, D 'Race matters and the emergence of class: Views from selected South African university students' (2014) 28(2) *South African Journal of Higher Education* 355–367.

Bhopal, K 'The experience of BME academics in higher education' (2014) 32(4) London: *Leadership Foundation for Higher Education* 1-32.

Bhorat, H & Goga, S 'The Gender Wage Gap in Post-Apartheid South Africa: A Re-examination' (2013) 22(5) *Journal of African Economies* 827-848.

Bhorat, H, Magadla, S & Steenkamp, F 'Employment Effects in the Temporary Employment Services (TES) Sector: Post Labour Relation Amendment Act s198. Published mimeograph, Development Policy Research Unit: (2015) University of Cape Town 1-13.

Bosanquet, A, Mailey, A, Matthews, KE & Lodge, JM 'Redefining 'early career' in academia: A collective narrative approach'(2017) 36(5) *Higher Education Research and Development* 890–902.

Breetzke, GD & Hedding, DW 'The changing racial profile of academic staff at South African Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) 2005–2013 (2016) 13 (2) *Africa Education Review* 147–164.

Bunting, I 'The higher education landscape under apartheid. Transformation in higher education' (2002) *Global pressures and local realities in South Africa* Cape Town: CHET 55-86.

Byrd, M 'Theorizing African American women's leadership experiences: Socio-cultural theoretical alternatives (2009) 29 *Advancing Women in Leadership Journal* 2-19.

Carvalho, T & Santiago, R 'New challenges for women seeking an academic career: The hiring process in Portuguese higher education institutions' (2010) 32 (3) *Journal of higher Education policy and Management* 239-249.

Cloete, N 'The South African higher education system: Performance and policy' (2014) 39(8) *Studies in Higher Education* 1355–1368.

Coate, K & Kandiko Howson, C 'Indicators of esteem: Gender and prestige in academic work' (2016) 37(4) *British Journal of Sociology of Education* 567-585.

Cooper, D 'Social justice and South African university student enrolment data by 'Race' 1998–2012: From 'Skewed Revolution' to 'Stalled Revolution' (2015) 69(3) *Higher Education Quarterly* 237–262.

Deacon, R, Osman, R & Buchler, M 2010 'Education policy studies in South Africa, 1995–2006' (2010) 25(1) *Journal of Education Policy* 95–110.

Dingindawo, N, Nwafor, A, Mutshaeni, N, Mudzielwana, N & Mulovhedzi, 'Redressing past injustices through affirmative action: Creating opportunities for women to assume leadership positions in the society' (2016) 15(2) *Journal of Educational Studies* 180–196.

Dortch, D & Patel, C 'Black undergraduate women and their sense of belonging in STEM at predominantly White institutions' (2017) 10(2) *NASPA Journal About Women in Higher Education* 202-215.

Eagan, MK, Jr. & Garvey, JC 'Stressing out: Connecting race, gender, and stress with faculty productivity' (2015) 86 *The Journal of Higher Education* 923–954.

Ebrahim, S 'Reviewing the suitability of affirmative action and the inherent requirements of the job as grounds of justification to equal pay claims in terms of the employment equity act 55 of 1998' (2018) 21 *PER / PELJ* 2–38.

Elmuti, D, Jia, H & Davis, H 'Challenges Women Face in Leadership Positions and Organizational Effectiveness' (2009) 8(2) *An Investigation Journal of Leadership Education* 21-31.

Erasmus, BJ, Grobler, A & van Niekerk, M 'Employee retention in a higher education institution: An organisational development perspective' (2015) 37(2) *Progression* 32–62.

Farinde, AA, LeBlanc, JK & Otten, AS 'Pathways to teaching: An examination of black females' pursuits of careers as k-12 teachers' (2015) 38(3) *Educational Research Quarterly* 32-51.

Farinde-Wu, A, & Fitchett, PG 'Searching for satisfaction black female teachers' workplace climate and job satisfaction' (2018) 53 *Urban Education* 86-112.

Fataar, A 'Higher education policy discourse in South Africa: A struggle for alignment with macro development policy' (2003) 17(2) *South African Journal of Higher Education* 31-39.

Fernandez, S 'The transformation of the South African public service: Exploring the impact of racial and gender representation on organisational effectiveness' (2016) 54(1) *Journal of Modern African Studies* 91–116.

Gallant, A 'Symbolic interactions and the development of women leaders in higher education' (2014) 21(3) *Gender, Work and Organization* 203–216.

Gamble, E & Turner, N 'Career ascension of African American women in executive positions in postsecondary institutions' (2015) 19(1) *Journal of Organizational Culture, Communications and Conflict* 82–101.

Gipson, J & Mitchell, D, Jr. 'How high-impact practices influence academic achievement for African American college students' (2017) 3(2) *Journal Committed to Social Change on Race and Ethnicity* 124–144.

Golele, FH & Rachidi, M 'The challenges of achieving gender equity in a government department: A case study of the department of health, Limpopo Province, South Africa' (2017) 15(3) *Gender & Behaviour* 9584–9606.

Hannum, KM, Muhly, SM, Shockley-Zalabak, P & White, JS 'Women leaders within higher education in the united states: Supports, barriers, and experiences of being a senior leader' (2015) 35 *Advancing Women in Leadership* 65-75.

Hills, J 'Addressing gender quotas in South Africa: Women empowerment and gender equality legislation' (2015) 20(1) *Deakin Law Review* 153–184.

Hirshfield, L, & Joseph, T 'We need a woman, we need a black woman': Gender, race, and identity taxation in the academy' (2012) 24(2) *Gender and Education* 213–227.

Hotho, S 'Higher education change and its managers: Alternative constructions' (2013) 41(3) *Educational Management Administration and Leadership* 352–371.

Howard, A, Patterson, A, Kinloch, V, Burkhard, T & Randall, R 'The Black Women's Gather Place: Reconceptualising a Curriculum of Place/Space' (2016) 28(6) *Gender and Education* 756–768.

Hundera, MB 'Factors affecting academic staff turnover intentions and the moderating effect of gender' (2014) 2(9) *International Journal of Research in Business Management* 57–70.

Jakobsh, DR 'Barriers to Women's Leadership' (2012) 7(12) *Encloypedia of Leadership* 77-78.

Johnson, A 'Performing and defying gender: An exploration of the lived experiences of women higher education administrators in sub-Saharan Africa' (2014) 42(6) *Educational Management Administration & Leadership* 835–850.

Jones, T 'South African contributions to LGBTI education issues' (2019) 19(4) *Sex Education* 455-471.

Kandiko Howsona, CB, Coate, K & Croix, T 'Mid-Career academic women and the prestige economy' (2018) 33(1) *Higher Education Research and Development* 533-548.

Kellerman, B & Rhode, DL 'Women at the top: The pipeline as pipe dream' (2017) 21 (6) *About Campus* 11–18.

Kelly, B & McCann, K 'Women faculty of color: Stories behind the statistics' (2014) 46(4) *The Urban Review* 681.

King, K '*Policy coherence in education, training and enterprise development in South Africa: The implementation challenge of new policies*' (1998) *Changing education and training in South Africa* Cape Town: UCT Press 4-19.

King, R 'What is higher education for? Strategic dilemmas for the twenty-first century university' (1995) *Quality Assurance in Education* 3(4) MCB University Press 14-20.

Koen, C 'Moving toward uncertainty: Higher education restructuring in South Africa' (2003) Cape Town: University of Western Cape 31-45.

Lane, L & Birds, R 'Contextual admissions and affirmative action: Developments in higher education policy in England, perspectives' (2013) 17(4) *Policy and Practice in Higher Education* 135–140.

Lee, HA 'Affirmative action regime formation in Malaysia and South Africa' (2016) 51(5) *Journal of Asian and African Studies* 511–527.

Leonard, A & Grobler, AF 'Exploring challenge to transformational leadership communication about employment equity: Managing organizational change in South Africa' (2016) 10(4) *Journal of Communication Management* 390–406.

Lim, S, & Cortina, LM 'Interpersonal mistreatment in the workplace: The interface and impact of general incivility and sexual harassment' (2005) 90 *Journal of Applied Psychology* 483–496.

Luckett, K & Shay, S 'Reframing the curriculum: a transformative approach' (2020) 61(1) *Critical Studies in Education* 50-65.

Mahope, SS 'Becoming a new kind of professional: A black woman academic caught in a transition' (2014) 28(6) *South African Journal of Higher Education* 1986–1998.

Mayer, CH 'A 'derailed' agenda? Black women's voices on workplace transformation (2017) 18(4) *Journal of International Women's Studies* 144–163.

McDowell, J & Carter-Francique, A 'An intersectional analysis of the workplace experiences of African American female athletic directors' (2017) 77(5) *Sex Roles* 1-16.

McNae, R & Vali, K 'Diverse experiences of women leading in higher education: Locating networks and agency for leadership within a university context in Papua New Guinea' (2015) 27(3) *Gender and Education* 288–303.

Merchant, K 'How men and women differ' (2012) 1(9) *Gender differences in communication styles, influence tactics, and leadership styles* 225-227.

Michael, S 'University Governance, Leadership and Management in a Decade of Diversification and Uncertainty' (2013) 67(3) *Higher Education Quarterly* 67(3): 217–33.

Monroe, CR 'Race and color: Revisiting perspectives in black education' (2016) 55(1) *Theory into Practice* 46-53.

Moodly, A 'Gender equity in South African Higher education leadership: Where are we twenty years after democracy?' (2015) 42(3) *Journal of Social Sciences* 229–238.

Moodly, A & Toni, N 'Women's access towards higher education leadership: Where are the role models?' (2015) 45(1) *Journal of Social Sciences* 45–52.

Moodly, A & N Toni 'Women's voices of and on leadership in higher education. Paper presented at the Global Research and International Services (GRDS) 7th International Conference on Teaching, Education and Learning (ICTEL), 10–11 October 2015' Pointe aux Piments, Mauritius (2015) 31 (3) *South African Journal of Higher Education* 2015 138-153.

Morley, L 'Lost leaders: Women in the global academy' (2014) 33(1) *Higher Education Research and Development* 114-128.

Mostafa, AMS, Gould-Williams, JS & Bottomley, P 'High-performance human resource practices and employee outcomes: The mediating role of public service motivation' (2015) 75(5) *Public Administration Review* 747–757.

Mzangwa, ST & Dede, Y 'The effects of higher education policy on transformation in post-apartheid South Africa' (2019) 6(1) *Cogent Education* 1-16.

O'Connell, CE, & Korabik, K 'Sexual harassment: The relationship of personal vulnerability, work context, perpetrator status, and type of harassment to outcomes' (2000) 56 *Journal of Vocational Behavior* 299–329.

Okoji, O 'Influence of Leadership Styles on Community Development Programmes' Implementation in Rural Communities of Akwa Ibom State Nigeria (2014) 8(2) *African Research Review* 83-95.

Olivier, N 'The relationship between the state and higher education institutions with reference to higher education policy documentation and the legislative framework' (2001) *Transformation in higher education: Global pressures and local realities in South Africa*. Pretoria: CHET 1-14.

Person, D, Saunders, K & Oganessian, K 'Building South African women's leadership: A cohort model for the PhD in student affairs' (2014) 2(1) *Journal of Student Affairs in Africa* 235-360.

Phiri, IA 'Major challenges for African women theologians in theological education (1989-2008)' (2008) 34(2) *Studia Historian Ecclesiastica* 63-81.

Price, T, Dunlap, R & Eller, J 2017 'An exploration of Black women's intersectionality in athletic administration' (2017) 10 *Journal of Issues in Intercollegiate Athletics* 57-77.

Saurombe, M, Barkhuizen, EN & Schutte, NE 'Management perceptions of a higher educational brand for the attraction and of talent academic staff' (2017) 15 *South African Journal of Human Resource Management* 1–10.

Schwanke, DA 'Barriers for Women to Positions of Power: How Societal and Corporate Structures, Perceptions of Leadership and Discrimination Restrict Women's Advancement to Authority' (2013) 3(2) *Earth Common Journal* 568-700.

Selesho, JM & Naile, I 'Academic staff retention as a human resource factor: University perspective (2014) 13(2) *International business & Economic Research Journal* 295–303.

Settles, IH 'Use of an intersectional framework to understand Black women's racial and gender identities' (2006) 54 *Sex Roles* 589–601.

Shangase, N & Proches, C 'Leadership Challenges Facing Female Employees in the Telecommunications Industry (2014) 12(2) *Gender and Behaviour* 6275-6285.

Subotzky, T 'Mergers in higher education success and failures? (1997) 5(1) *Tertiary Education and Management* 107-180.

Toma, SM, Lavie, JM & del Mar Duran, M 'Women in academic administration at the university' (2010) 38(4) *Educational Management Administration and Leadership* 487–498.

Tran, NA 'The role of mentoring in the success of women leaders of color in higher education, mentoring and tutoring' (2014) 22(4) *Partnership in Learning* 302–315.

Turner, SG & Maschi, TM 'Feminist and Empowerment Theory and Social Work Practice' (2015) 29(2) *Journal of Social Work Practice* 151-162.

Welsh, D & Savage, M 'The university in divided societies: The case of South Africa' (1997) *The future of the university in Southern Africa* Cape Town: David Welsh (130-147).

Wind, G 'Feminism Types and Definitions: Liberal, Socialist, Culture and Radical' (2014) 82(27) *Critical Review of Management* 180-200.

Wise, G & Montalvo, CI 'How to Build a Regional University: A Case Study that Addresses Policy Settings, Academic Excellence, Innovation System Impact and Regional Relevance' (2018) 40(4) *Journal of Higher Education Policy and Management* 342–58.

Wise, G, Dickinson, C, Katan, T & Gallegos, MC 'Inclusive higher education governance: managing stakeholders, strategy, structure, and function' (2020) 45(2) *Studies in Higher Education* 339-352.

Wolpe, H 'The debate on university transformation in South Africa: The case of the University of the Western Cape' (1995) 31(2) *Comparative Education Journal* 275-292.

Woods, KC, & Buchanan, NT 'Sexual harassment across the color line: Experiences and outcomes of cross- vs. intra-racial sexual harassment among Black women (2009) 15 (1) *Cultural Diversity and Ethnic Minority Psychology* 67-71.

Zulu, C 'Women academics' research productivity at one university campus: an analysis of dominant discourses' (2013) 27(3) *South African Journal of Higher Education* 750 – 767.

POLICY DOCUMENT

African (Banjul) Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, June 27, 1981, O.A.U. Doc. CAB/ LEG/67/3 rev. 5, 21 I.L.M. 58, art. 18(3) (1982) (entered into force Oct. 21, 1986)

African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, Chapter 1 Article 17(2), (3)

African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, article 18(3) supra note 4.

Bengu, SM 'Foreword In: Draft education white paper 3: A programme for higher education transformation' Pretoria: Government Printers 1997.

Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996, Section 39(1).

Department of Education 'Education White Paper 3: A programme for the transformation of higher education (Notice 1196 of 1997)' Pretoria: Department of Education, South Africa 1997
https://www.gov.za/sites/default/files/gcis_document/201409/18207gen11960.pdf
(accessed 12 April 2020).

Department of Education 'National plan for higher education' Pretoria: Government Gazette 2008
<https://www.education.gov.za/LinkClick.aspx?fileticket=sKsxhYorWOk=> (accessed on 13 April 2020).

Department of Higher Education and Training 'Green paper for post-school education and training' Pretoria: DHET. 2012
<https://www.saqa.org.za/docs/papers/2012/greenpaper.pdf> (accessed on 13 April 2020).

Department of Labour 'Summary of the Employment Equity Act, 55 of 1998, issued in terms of Section 25(1)' (1998) Pretoria: Department of Labour, South Africa. Available: http://www.labour.gov.za/docs/legislation/eea/forms/eea3_eng.html. (Accessed on 30 November 2019).

Employment Equity Act 55. (1998). Pretoria: Government Printer.

Protocol on the Rights of Women in Africa, supra note 1, article 17(1).

Protocol on the Rights of Women in Africa, supra note 1, article 14(1)(d), (2)(a).

Republic of South Africa 'White paper on reconstruction and development: Government's strategy for fundamental transformation' (1994) Pretoria: Government Printers.

Republic of South Africa 'Education white paper 3: A programme for higher education transformation' (1997) Pretoria: Government Printer.

South African Litigation Centre 'Laws and Policies Affecting Transgender Persons in Southern Africa' (2017) Cape Town: South African Litigation Centre.

South Africa's National Policy Framework for Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality, 2020. *Report on Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality*.

USAID. Field Report Macedonia May 2003. <https://reliefweb.int/report/former-yugoslav-republic-macedonia/usaids-field-report-macedonia-may-2003> (accessed 29 July 2020).

White Paper on Higher Education, 1997. Education white paper 3: A programme for the transformation of higher education. General Notice 1196 of 1997. Pretoria.

Women Empowerment and Gender Equality Bill 2013.

ONLINE SOURCES

Advance HE. 2018. *Equality in Higher Education: Staff statistical report 2018*. London: Advance HE. <https://www.advance-he.ac.uk/knowledge-hub/equality-higher-education-statistical-report-2018> (accessed 18 April 2020).

Badat, S 'Higher education transformation in South Africa post 1994: Towards a critical assessment' (2007) Paper delivered at Solomon Mahlangu Education Lecture, held at Constitution Hill, Johannesburg 18-21.

Badat, S 'The challenges of transformation in higher education and training institutions in South Africa (2010) Johannesburg: DBSA <https://www.dbsa.org/EN/About-Us/Publications/Documents/The%20challenges%20of%20transformation%20in%20higher%20education%20and%20training%20institutions%20in%20South%20Africa%20by%20Saleem%20Badat.pdf> (accessed on 17 July 2020).

Charles, S. 2013. A Critique of the Concept of Disadvantage in relation to the Identification of Affirmative Action Beneficiaries: Race as Proxy for Disadvantage (Unpublished LLM thesis, University of Cape Town, 2013) 21. https://researchspace.ukzn.ac.za/bitstream/handle/10413/15876/Nkosi_Sakhile_Austine_2018.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y (accessed 20 April 2020).

Department of Education, 2008, Report of the ministerial committee on transformation and social cohesion and the elimination of discrimination in public higher education institutions, Final Report, Department of Education, Pretoria. <https://www.ukzn.ac.za/wp-content/miscFiles/publications/ReportonHEandTransformation.pdf> (accessed 21 April 2020).

Du Plessis, H 'Governance, higher education policy development and implementation at educational and systemic levels' Unpublished Presentation to the Conference on the Impact of Mergers in the South African Higher Education System at Tshwane University of Technology, Pretoria, South Africa. 8-9 October 2009.xf6c

Harkoo, H '*Has affirmative action become an illusionary right for certain designated groups?* Unpublished LLM thesis, University of KwaZulu-Natal, 2014.

Higher Education South Africa (HESA), 2014, 'South African higher education in the 20th year of democracy: Context, achievements, and key challenges', presentation to the Portfolio Committee on Higher Education and Training, Cape Town, 5 March. <https://www.universityworldnews.com/post.php?story=20140425131554856> (accessed 28 July 2019).

Lederer, N '*Affirmative Action: A Never-Ending Story?* Unpublished PHD thesis, University of Adelaide, Australia, 2013.

Makhanya, M. 2013. Advancing Gender equality in higher education and the broader society. University of South Africa, Pretoria. <https://www.unisa.ac.za/sites/corporate/default/About/Governance-&-management/Executive-management/Unisa-Principal-and-Vice%E2%80%93Chancellor/Speeches-delivered-by-Professor-MS-Makhanya> (accessed 14 July 2019).

Mamdani, M '*When does a settler become a native? Inaugural lecture presented on May 13.* Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press 1998.

Maseko, TI '*A comparative Study of Challenges Faced by Women in Leadership: A case of Foskor and the Department of Labour in Mhlathuze Municipality*' Unpublished thesis University of Zululand 2013.

Mbutho, S '*The Judicial defense for Affirmative Action Measures: A critique of the rationality standard of judicial review* Unpublished LLM thesis, University of KwaZulu-Natal, 2015.

Mhungu, V '*Positive Discrimination in South African Employment Law: Has Affirmative Action Overstayed its Welcome?* Unpublished LLM thesis, University of KwaZulu-Natal, 2013.

Nconco, M '*Substantive Equality and Affirmative Action in the Workplace* Unpublished LLM thesis, Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University, 2012.

Universities & Technikons Advisory Council AUT. 1996. A qualifications structure for universities in South Africa. Available: <http://education.pwv.gov.za/DoE-Sites/Higher-Education/Report-116.htm> (Accessed 29 June 2020).

Yam, N 'Raising half the sky: work–life balance of Chinese female administrative workers' Unpublished thesis Auckland University of Technology 2008.

Zulu, CB 'A comparative study of women in management in higher education in South Africa and the United Kingdom' University of South Africa 2009.