

Reading authors of the Enlightenment at the Cape of Good Hope from the late 1780s to the mid-1830s

Archie L Dick

Department of Information Science

University of Pretoria, Pretoria, South Africa

archie.dick@up.ac.za

Abstract

With few exceptions, the study of intellectual traditions in South Africa generally ignores their material traces. The embodiment of ideas and languages in books, pamphlets, newspapers, and other media does however matter. An analysis of the inventories and catalogues of private book collections and subscription libraries, as well as of book sales, minutes of a reading society, and of newspaper articles and advertisements reveals that Enlightenment authors were not unknown at the Cape in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. This article explains how their works were collected, circulated, and read, surfacing the material traces of Enlightenment ideas, so that it becomes possible to source some of the Enlightenment print culture origins of Cape liberalism.

Introduction

With few exceptions, the study of ideas and intellectual traditions in South Africa still generally ignores their material aspects.¹ In a recent compilation,

¹ M.O. Eze, *Intellectual History in Contemporary South Africa* (London, Palgrave, 2010). For an exception, see C. Sandwith, *World of Letters: Reading Communities and Cultural Debates in Early Apartheid South Africa* (Pietermaritzburg, UKZN Press, 2014). Another exception is A. Du Toit and H. Giliomee, *Afrikaner Political Thought: Analysis and Documents, volume one, 1780-1850* (Cape Town, David Philip, 1983). They however emphasise the writings/documents as products of Afrikaner political thinking rather than what these writers themselves may have read and that may have influenced their writings. For the period examined here see for example the inventory that lists also the books of F. R. Bresler (who is mentioned in Du Toit and

Peter Vale comes close when he says that “this country was made by ideas, most (if not all) of which came here in languages that were intimately bound to the ideas they carried”.² But the embodiment of those ideas and languages in books, pamphlets, newspapers and other media that Vale overlooks do matter as well.³ Borrowing from Antonio Gramsci, he aptly points out that “the country’s intellectual history... has been formed by ‘an infinity of traces’... – both international and internal”, and that we are only starting to find out where they are “located or... continue to reside”.⁴ He does not however mention Edward Said’s correction of the misuse of that phrase, generally cited as “... history is deposited as an infinity of traces in you without leaving an inventory”. Said discovered that Gramsci had added that “therefore it is necessary to make an inventory”.⁵ Said goes on to say that therefore you have to start by making an inventory.

The inventories and catalogues of books, as well as an ‘inventory’ of the evidence recorded in this article of how these books, pamphlets, and newspapers were collected, circulated, and read reveal some of the material traces of Enlightenment ideas at the Cape in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. The compilation of the inventories and catalogues as a process of archive-making is an equally valuable material trace. At the Cape the probate inventories prepared by VOC officials of the Orphan Chamber, and the catalogues compiled by book merchants and librarians, are the products of a rich mix of personalities, motives, techniques, and styles located in the contemporary intellectual culture. The making of these inventories and catalogues was also the making of knowledge about which authors, which books, and which Enlightenment ideas may have animated movements,

Giliomee, pp. 49-50) at MOOC8/44.7, available at <http://databases.tanap.net/mooc/anap.net/mooc/> retrieved 2 June 2016. Book titles are numbered in some inventories, but not in others.

² P. Vale, ‘Introduction’, in P. Vale, L. Hamilton and E.H. Prinsloo (eds), *Intellectual Traditions in South Africa: Ideas, Individuals and Institutions* (Durban, UKZN Press, 2014), p. 5.

³ See, for example, J. Soll, ‘Intellectual History and History of the Book’, in R. Whatmore and B. Young (eds), *A Companion to Intellectual History* (Oxford, Wiley, 2016), pp. 72-82.

⁴ Vale, ‘Introduction’, p. 7.

⁵ E. Said, *Interviews with Edward W. Said*, A. Singh and B. Johnson (eds) (Mississippi, University Press of Mississippi, 2004), p. 153.

conversations, and debates at the Cape.⁶ It now becomes possible to source some of the Enlightenment print culture origins of Cape liberalism.

This article concentrates on the period from 1778, when several Enlightenment authors were cited in a pamphlet signed by Cape burghers, until about 1834, by which time several significant print culture events had occurred.⁷ Enlightenment authors are considered here as those whose writings are associated with the ideas of the Enlightenment, and not just any authors who wrote during the Enlightenment period (c.1650-1800). The emphasis is however not on those travel writers whose work contributed to the development of scientific rational thought and scientific institutions in South Africa. There is a large body of literature that evaluates the impact of scientifically-schooled travellers and writers,⁸ and the titles of books by Anders Sparrman, Françoise Le Vaillant, John Barrow, and Hinrich Lichtenstein are listed in some of the

⁶ On the value of inventories and archives, see C. Hamilton *et al*, *Refiguring the Archive* (Cape Town, David Philip, 2002); J. Weintraub, 'Some Sort of Mania: Otto Hartung Spohr and the Making of the Bleek Collection', *Kronos: Journal of Cape History*, 32 (2006), pp. 114-38.

⁷ Just as the introduction of the first press in 1784 had been the result of a struggle between the burghers and the VOC, freedom of the press in the mid-1820s was the result of a struggle between broadminded colonists and an autocratic Cape Government. By 1828 at least six printers were active in Cape Town and in some of the interior districts, F. Rossouw, *South African Printers and Publishers, 1795-1925; From a South African Bibliography to the Year 1925* (Cape Town, South African Library, 1987), pp. 47, 207.

⁸ For works on Kolb, Sparrman, Thunberg, Le Vaillant, Swellengrebel, Lichtenstein, Barrow, Burchell, Gordon, and others, see for example: M. Sienaert and L. Stiebel, 'Writing on the Earth: Early European Travellers to South Africa', *Literator*, 17, 1 (1996), pp. 91-101; W. Beinart, 'Men of Science, Travel and Nature in the Eighteenth and Nineteenth-Century Cape', *Journal of Southern African Studies*, 24, 4 (1998), pp. 775-99; S. Dubow, *A Commonwealth of Knowledge: Science, Sensibility, and White South Africa, 1820-2000* (Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2006), pp. 18-70; I. Glenn, 'Primate Time: Rousseau, Levaillant, Marais', *Current Writing: Text and Reception in Southern Africa*, 18, 1 (2006), pp. 61-77; S. Huigen, *Knowledge and Colonialism: Eighteenth-Century Travellers in South Africa* (Leiden, Brill, 2009); D. Johnson, *Imagining the Cape Colony: History, Literature, and the South African Nation* (Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 2012); G. Schutte, 'Vetula Hottentota en Andere Naturalia: Brieven van Hendrik le Sueur, J.A. van Plettenberg en Petrus Camper over de ontdekking van Afrika', *Tydskrif vir Geesteswetenskappe*, 56, 2-2 (2016), pp. 507-33.

inventories for the period examined here.⁹ Wider circulation and reading of their books and those of other scientific travel writers probably ensued after their accession to the collection of the South African Public Library in the mid to late 1830s.¹⁰ Some of these writers expressed humane and sympathetic views on “the social ills of the Colony” such as slavery, and prejudice against the Khoisan.¹¹ Siegfried Huigen argues more pointedly that there is a seldom-mentioned connection between Cape ethnography and the “philosophical vanguard of the Enlightenment in the persons of Diderot, Kant and Herder” who have recently been described as anti-imperialist. He explains for example that Peter Kolb’s works influenced the image of primitive societies that many Enlightenment authors in Europe had made for themselves.¹² But these matters were not the primary concern of the scientific travel writers. This article therefore focuses instead on Enlightenment authors whose works had stronger implications for the ideas of natural rights, progress, freedom, and the general diffusion of knowledge. It discusses how their works and ideas were collected, circulated, and read at the Cape.

Until now the extent of awareness of Enlightenment authors and their books and ideas at the Cape has remained unclear. Already in 1971 Gerrit Schutte called for a closer study as an urgent need.¹³ In 1979 he elaborated this shortcoming as follows: “It is still too early to assess the degree to which Cape leaders were influenced by the Enlightenment. For instance, we hardly know what literature reached the Cape – a good deal it seems – nor, more importantly, who read it”.¹⁴ Without evidence, Schutte’s scepticism about the reading culture at the Cape is justified. From an analysis of the inventories and catalogues of private book collections, auction rolls, newspaper advertisements of book sales,

⁹ See the inventories of Maria Jurgens (MOOC8/40.24, item 38) for Sparrman; Eward Hay (MOOC8/22.19) and Jan Berrange (MOOC8/41.41, item 634) for Le Vaillant; Frans Bresler (MOOC8/44.7, item 16) for Barrow; and Christiaan Fleck (MOOC8/34.44, item 550) and Frans Villnagel (MOOC8/44.49a, item 23) for Lichtenstein.

¹⁰ For a list of titles, see *A Catalogue of the Collection of Books in the South African Public Library, Cape of Good Hope* (Cape Town, Bridekirk, 1834), pp. 161-3.

¹¹ See for example Beinart, ‘Men of Science’, pp. 786-7.

¹² Huigen, *Knowledge and Colonialism*, p. 211. See also pp. 33-58; 212-40.

¹³ G.J. Schutte, ‘Johannes Henricus Redelinghuys. Een Revolutionair Kapenaar’, *South African Historical Journal*, 3 (1971), p. 50.

¹⁴ G.J. Schutte, ‘Company and Colonists at the Cape’, in R. Elphick and H. Giliomee (eds), *The Shaping of South African Society, 1652-1820* (Cape Town, Longmans, 1979), p. 201.

diaries, private journals, as well as the catalogues of circulation and subscription libraries, it becomes apparent that authors of the Enlightenment were not unknown at the Cape in this period.

Johannes Henricus Redelinghuys (1756-1802), whose pamphlet *De Eerloosheid Ontmaskerd* (Infamy exposed) was published in 1792 in Amsterdam, was said to have had a “reasonable acquaintance with the authors of the Enlightenment”.¹⁵ Evidence in this pamphlet, in which he attacks his accusers in the ‘Cape Patriot’ movement,¹⁶ includes citations to Henry St John, 1st Viscount Bolingbroke (1678-1751) and Guillaume Thomas Raynal (1713-1796), whose works are associated with ideas of the Enlightenment.¹⁷ In 1795, in another pamphlet, he urged the Cape burghers (citizens) to resist the British occupation. He prefaced it with the words “Liberty, Equality, Fraternity. To The Citizens Of The Cape Of Good Hope”, and made exception from English aims of “murder and devastation” only for the Enlightenment author, Lord Chesterfield (Philip Dormer Stanhope, 1694-1773).¹⁸

Redelinghuys was however not exceptional in his familiarity with authors of the Enlightenment. Already in May 1778 anonymous pamphlets sealed in envelopes and strewn in the streets, and in front of some houses in Cape Town, included references to Hugo Grotius (1583-1645), Johann Heineccius (1681-1741), Samuel von Pufendorf (1632-1694), and John Locke (1632-1704).¹⁹

¹⁵ Schutte, ‘Johannes Henricus Redelinghuys’, p. 52 (my translation).

Redelinghuys was a member of a delegation to Holland in 1785. He became an editor of the Dutch newspaper *Oprechtse Bataafsche Courant* and may have been one of the earliest if not the first South African newspaper editor.

¹⁶ The inappropriate use of this label has been questioned - see T. Baartman, ‘Fighting for the Spoils: Cape Burgherschap and Faction Disputes in Cape Town in the 1770s’ (PhD thesis, University of Cape Town. 2011).

¹⁷ J.H. Redelinghuys, *De Eerloosheid Ontmaskerd...* (Amsterdam, Crajenschot, 1792), p. 101, p. 124. The citations were to Bolingbroke’s *Reflections upon Exile* (1716), and Raynal’s *l’histoire Abrege des Voyages* (sic).

¹⁸ C. Beyers, *Die Kaapse Patriotte Gedurende die Laaste Kwart van die Agtiende Eeu en die Voortlewing van hul Denkbeelde* (Pretoria, van Schaik, 1967), pp. 353-5; H.F. Heese, ‘Enlightenment, Europeans and Slaves in 18th century South Africa’, *Kronos*, 14, (1988), pp. 66-71.

¹⁹ Teuns Baartman argues that the burgher protests in the 1770s should not be linked with the Enlightenment views of the Dutch Patriots, but that the protests in the 1780s were instead more ideologically ‘Enlightened’ and connected with the Dutch Patriot movement – Baartman, ‘*Fighting for the Spoils*’, p. 199.

Their writings are associated with natural law and natural rights.²⁰ Natural law, in which human rights are considered to be natural and inalienable, advocates natural rights to life, liberty, and property. These authors were key figures in the natural law that underpinned the early Cape's Roman-Dutch legal system, and which adjusted to English law after annexation in 1806.²¹ Borrowing from the writing practices and idiom of Dutch pamphleteers, the Cape burgher protesters had complained about the abuses of power and referred for example to the “natuurlijke en wettig competeerende Burgerlijke Voorregten en Vrijheeden”.²² In the call for a more liberal economic regime, their arguments about natural rights also drew on the Enlightenment principles of social contract theory that Thomas Hobbes (1588-1679) and other *philosophes* had developed.²³

Stanley Trapido explains that this writing style originated in the reading habits of a “small intelligentsia”, revealed in the practice of publicly auctioning books at the Cape. He mentions Joachim Von Dessin (1704-1761) who upon his death had bequeathed his collection of 3 856 books, manuscripts, paintings, as well as mathematical and astrological instruments, to the Dutch Reformed Church²⁴ as a library “*ten nut van 't algemeen*”.²⁵ The collection included works

²⁰ A.M. Levine, Enlightenment Critics of Natural Law, available at, <http://www.nlnrac.org/critics/enlightenment-critics>, retrieved 5 February 2017.

²¹ J. Dugard, *Human Rights and the South African Legal Order* (Princeton, Princeton University Press, 1978), p. 393; J. Dugard, ‘South African Lawyers and the Liberal Heritage of the Law’, *Law, Justice, and Society*, pp. 19-34, available at <http://www.sahistory.org.za/sites/default/files/DC/rep19720000.037.052.009/rep19720000.037.052.009.pdf> retrieved 28 April 2017.

²² C. Beyers, *Die Kaapse Patriotte, 1779-1791*, (Kaapstad, Juta, 1929). p. 156.

²³ G.J. Schutte, *‘De Nederlandse Patriotten en de Koloniën: Een Onderzoek naar hun Denkbeelden en Optreden, 1770-1800. The Dutch ‘Patriotten’ and the Colonies. An Inquiry into the Ideas and Practices of the Dutch Enlightenment with regard to the Colonies, 1770-1800. With a summary in English’* (D.Litt thesis Rijksuniversiteit, 1974), p. 219.

²⁴ For a study of the reading culture associated with the Dutch Reformed Church at the Cape from 1652 to about 1814, see W.J. Van Zijl, *Van Skeepskis tot Wakis tot Boekrak* (Goodwood, Nasionale Boekdrukkery, 1992).

²⁵ S. Trapido, ‘Van Riebeeck Day and the New Jerusalem: Identity, Community and Violence in the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Century Cape, pp. 10-11’, 1993, available at: http://sas-space.sas.ac.uk/4253/1/Stanley_Trapido_-_Identity,_community_and_violence_in_the_18th_and_19th_century_cape.pdf, retrieved 8 April 2017.

of theology, history, philology, jurisprudence, geography, natural history, philosophy, mathematics, and medicine. Von Dessin, whose collection became the first ‘public’ library in South Africa, which even contained René Descartes first editions, was described as an “Enlightened” man.²⁶ In his collection were also the works of natural law authors Grotius, Heineccius, and Pufendorf who had been cited in the anonymous pamphlets.²⁷ Redelinghuys and other Cape burghers may well have read the books of these authors in this ‘public’ library. It was open “to all respectable citizens between 13:00 and 16:00 every Wednesday afternoon”, and “the books (could) be borrowed and taken home for one month or for three months for those living outside the city”.²⁸

Apart from those sourced abroad, Von Dessin had acquired many of his books at local public auctions. As the secretary of the Orphan Chamber, which administered many of these auctions and prepared inventories of the assets of the deceased, he had a special advantage of book selection. Von Dessin’s collection thus reflects a wider and earlier public ownership at the Cape of the books of Enlightenment authors. Grotius’ “*Een inleidinge tot de Hollandsche regts gelerentheit*” (*sic*), for example, is listed in the 1707 inventory of Henricus Munckerus.²⁹ Another book collector, Nicholaas Godfried Heyns (1725-1792), who was close to those “involved in the discussion of natural rights”, was also a member of the 1779-1782 delegation to the Netherlands.³⁰

²⁶ V. Pieters, ‘*Boeken aan de Kaap: een Onderzoek naar de Dessiniaanse Biblioteek in Haar Social-Culturele Context*’ (PhD thesis, University of Amsterdam, 1997), pp. 138; 140-1; P.E. Westra, ‘Boeke en Boekversamelings Tydens die Kompanjiesbewind aan die Kaap’, *Quarterly Bulletin of the National Library of South Africa*, 65 (2001), pp. 42-50.

²⁷ J.H. Von Manger, *Catalogue of the Dessinian (Joachim Nicolaas von Dessin) Collection* in the Public Library of Cape Town (Cape of Good Hope, 1821). Their titles may be traced to the Von Dessin Collection in the catalogue of the National Library of South Africa, which is electronically accessible on the Internet.

²⁸ W. Tyrrell-Glynn, ‘*An Account of Some Early Libraries and Book Collections at the Cape of Good Hope, with Special Reference to the Establishment of the South African Public Library*’ (PhD thesis, University of Stellenbosch, 1972, p. 81; See also A. Delmas, ‘*Artem Quaevis Terra Alit*, Books in the Cape Colony During the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries’, in N.M. Álvarez (ed), *Books in the Catholic World During the Early Modern Period* (Leiden, Brill, 2014), pp. 191-214.

²⁹ MOOC8/2.8

³⁰ Trapido, ‘Van Riebeeck Day’, p. 11.

His collection included the Dutch-language works of Grotius and Joost Van den Vondel, as well as Jonathan Swift's *Gulliver's travels* in English.³¹

Johannes Redelinghuys was however also described as a “‘Colored’ revolutionary who saw only part of the light of European Enlightenment”.³² The reason for this qualification is that the contemporary understanding at the Cape of ‘Liberty, Equality, Fraternity’ did not include the slaves. This was a widely-held view in the Netherlands and elsewhere. Redelinghuys probably followed Raynal, who had expressed “a vehement anti-slavery attitude” yet would not propose “an immediate and complete abolition”.³³ Colonial slavery in the Dutch Republic had been rationalised away as a necessary evil.

Pamphlet references to the authors and ideas of the Enlightenment could clearly be selfish and selective. The Cape burghers’ protests in 1778 were primarily against the mercantilism of the Dutch East India Company (VOC), intensified by the way certain officials treated them. Appeals to the States General in the Netherlands from the Cape, as well as from the West Indian territories, did not include the native inhabitants and slaves. These appeals were met moreover with a moderate reaction that left VOC mercantilism intact, but called for stricter supervision of company officials. The importance of slavery for production and profit meant that it would not be abolished.

As Schutte explains: “colonies were territories, annexed for the benefit of the mother country”, and “Nobody really influential defended the substitution of slave labour by free labour, as advocated by Adam Smith” (1723-1790), the Scottish Enlightenment author.³⁴ Even someone who abhorred slavery when he arrived at the Cape in 1796 succumbed within a few years to purchasing a large number of his own slaves. Samuel Hudson, in Robert Shell’s review of Kirsten McKenzie’s book about him, is an example of an effort to reconcile

³¹ R.F.M. Immelman, ‘Kaapse Bibliofiele en Hulle Boeke in die 18de eeu’, *South African Libraries*, 19, 4 (1952), pp. 94-5. English-language books circulated at the Cape even before the first British occupation in 1795. The works of French, German, and English-language Enlightenment authors such as René Descartes (1596-1650), Christian Wolff (1697-1754), John Locke, David Hume, and Joseph Priestley (1733-1804) were translated into Dutch in the late eighteenth century, explaining their presence in private book collections at the Cape.

³² His great-great grandmother was the Khoikhoi woman Krotoa, or Eva, who worked for Jan van Riebeeck and translated for the Dutch authorities, Heese, ‘Enlightenment’, p. 71.

³³ The reference is to Raynal’s *Histoire Philosophique et Politique des Deux Indes*, in Schutte, ‘De Nederlandse Patriotten en de Koloniën’, pp. 219 -220.

³⁴ Schutte, ‘De Nederlandse Patriotten en de Koloniën’, pp. 220, 222.

unsuccessfully “colonialism and an enlightenment conscience”.³⁵ Hudson’s reading record included the works of the Enlightenment authors Oliver Goldsmith and Edward Gibbon (See Table 1 below).³⁶ McKenzie, who argues that Hudson exemplified the Enlightenment, also shows how adjustment to the Cape led to his unravelling. Hudson’s own essays on slavery, women, Islam, and even fruit, according to Shell, are “clouded and ...compromised by his ...extensive slave holding and gentry-like lifestyle”.³⁷

The analyses of Schutte, Heese, and Shell imply that the Cape burghers and colonists references to and reading of authors and ideas of the Enlightenment may have been opportunistic, and rhetorically in keeping with the spirit of the times. At the same time, the meaning and impact of the Enlightenment have been debated robustly over several years.³⁸ Critical responses to the recent body of influential and controversial writings on the Enlightenment by Jonathan Israel provide some useful insights.³⁹ Israel’s

³⁵ R. Shell, ‘Review of *The Making of an English Slave-owner: Samuel Eusebius Hudson at the Cape of Good Hope, 1796-1807*. By Kirsten McKenzie’, *Kronos*, 21, (1994), p. 126.

³⁶ R. C-H. Shell, *Out of Livery: The Papers of Samuel Eusebius Hudson, 1764-1828* (unpublished manuscript), pp. 54, 69. I am grateful to the late Robert Shell for sharing this manuscript with me. Goldsmith and Gibbon are not listed in Hudson’s catalogue of books, suggesting that readers probably read more widely than the books they owned.

³⁷ Shell, ‘Review of *The Making of an English Slave-owner*’, p. 127. After three decades of ameliorative legislation, slaves at the Cape would only be emancipated in 1834, followed by four years of apprenticeship. Striking a blow for free trade and the Enlightenment, an act was also passed in 1834 that rescinded the trade privileges of the English East India Company, whose policies following the British occupations of the Cape had not differed very much from those of the mercantilist VOC - see J.L. Meltzer, ‘The Growth of Cape Town Commerce and the Role of John Fairbairn’s *Advertiser*, 1835 – 1859’, *Archives Yearbook of South African History*, 1994, pp. 109-10, 114; M. Arkin, *Storm in a Teacup: the Later Years of John Company at the Cape, 1815-36* (Cape Town, Struik, 1973), pp. 3, 71-2.

³⁸ See for example: M. Horkheimer and T.W. Adorno, *Dialectic of Enlightenment* (New York, Continuum 1992); J. Habermas, *The Philosophical Discourse of Modernity: Twelve Lectures*. Translated by Frederick Lawrence (Cambridge, MA., MIT Press, 1987).

³⁹ J.I. Israel, *Radical Enlightenment: Philosophy and the Making of Modernity, 1650-1750* (Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2001); J.I. Israel, *Enlightenment*

distinction between moderate and radical Enlightenment proposes conflicting views of progress and improving the world. Moderate Enlightenment, he argues, postulates a balance between reason and tradition and broadly supports the status quo, whereas radical Enlightenment conflates body and mind into one, reduces God and nature to the same thing, and invokes “reason as the sole guide in human life, jettisoning tradition”.⁴⁰ He bases his approach on a fundamental dichotomy between Baruch (Benedict de) Spinoza’s monism in which only one substance – either God or nature – exists, and John Locke’s dualism in which mind and matter are two kinds of substance. As an advocate for radical Enlightenment, he consequently rejects the national differences of Enlightenment, and the idea of a ‘family of enlightenments’.

Historically, Israel argues, there was a “shifting balance of intellectual forces in the course of which, from the 1760s down to the early 1790s, especially in Holland and France, the moderate mainstream were increasingly thwarted and repulsed and the radical wing increasingly preponderant”.⁴¹ It is radical Enlightenment that Israel associates with modernisation, freedom of thought and expression, equality, and democracy as the best form of government.⁴² Critics argue that Israel’s reasoning is presentist, that he does not provide sufficient proof for the claim that radical Enlightenment was responsible for today’s core democratic values, and that its idea of democracy does not include women in the public sphere.⁴³ He is accused also of downsizing the Enlightenment by cherry-picking a set of radical thinkers, and that he is ultimately unsuccessful in showing that they were responsible for modern liberal democracy. In fact, as De Dijn argues, one of Israel’s selected radical Enlightenment figures, Nicolas-Antoine Boulanger, was actually an

Contested: Philosophy, Modernity, and the Emancipation of Man, 1650-1752 (Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2006; J.I. Israel, *A Revolution of the Mind: Radical Enlightenment and the Intellectual Origins of Modern Democracy* (Princeton, Princeton University Press, 2010); J.I. Israel, *Democratic Enlightenment: Philosophy, Revolution, and Human Rights, 1750-1790* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011; A. De Dijn, ‘The Politics of Enlightenment: From Peter Gay to Jonathan Israel’, *The Historical Journal*, 55, 3 (2012), pp. 785-805; A. La Vopa, ‘A New Intellectual History? Jonathan Israel’s Enlightenment’, *The Historical Journal*, 52, 3 (2009), pp. 717-738.

⁴⁰ Israel, ‘*A Revolution of the Mind*’, p. 19.

⁴¹ Israel, ‘*A Revolution of the Mind*’, p. 34.

⁴² Israel, ‘*A Revolution of the Mind*’, p. 21.

⁴³ De Dijn, ‘The Politics of Enlightenment’, p. 799; La Vopa, ‘A New Intellectual history?’, p. 727.

enlightened monarchist who believed that Louis XV's monarchy was both modern and free.⁴⁴

More relevant to this article, Israel explains that there were signs after 1740 of a Dutch Enlightenment at the Cape, but that it was a top-down, hierarchical Enlightenment similar to the enlightened despotism of Central and Eastern Europe. In his view, the 'radical Enlightenment' response from Cape burghers was a call for a liberal economic "model of toleration and hospitality for all".⁴⁵ Intriguingly, he connects the ideas of radical Enlightenment and burgher protests with Von Dessin's collection of books and Redelinghuys' activism.⁴⁶ Israel's point may be misplaced since Spinoza, his champion of radical Enlightenment, does not feature at all in the burgher protest pamphlets. It does however affirm that Enlightenment authors featured in the early Cape's reading culture, and that they may have been read and interpreted both conservatively and radically.

The Enlightenment was very much "a process at work in European culture", and broadly involved the "exit from the Christian Millennium into a Europe of state power and civil society".⁴⁷ John Pocock explains that the terms 'Enlightenment' and 'The Enlightenment' only came into use long after the intellectual activities that commenced in Europe in the later seventeenth century, and that intellectuals at the time did not use these terms to describe their work. Scholars have subsequently defined it with the aims of either inclusion or exclusion, for example on the basis of the presence or absence of secular intellectuals or *philosophes* like Voltaire (1694-1778), David Hume (1711-1776), and Jean Jacques Rousseau (1712-1778).

Pocock's argument about Edward Gibbon (1737-1794) and Enlightenment in England claims that it occurred in too many forms to be contained in a single definition. Gibbon had rejected the work of *philosophes* associated with Denis Diderot and Jean le Rond d'Alembert's *Encyclopédie* project, but he had not rejected Enlightenment ideas.⁴⁸ For Pocock it is "better to think of a family of Enlightenments" with resemblances and quarrels than of "The Enlightenment" as a unified phenomenon with a single history and

⁴⁴ De Dijn, 'The Politics of Enlightenment', pp. 802-4.

⁴⁵ Israel, 'Democratic Enlightenment', p. 553.

⁴⁶ Israel, 'Democratic Enlightenment', p. 553.

⁴⁷ J.G.A Pocock, *Barbarism and Religion, volume one: The Enlightenments of Edward Gibbon, 1737-1764* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1999), pp. 4- 5.

⁴⁸ R. Darnton, *The Business of Enlightenment: a Publishing History of the Encyclopédie, 1775-1800* (Cambridge, Belknap Press, 1979).

definition”.⁴⁹ His quarrel is more with the article than with the noun. Marion Truslow argues along similar lines about Grotius who “helped to popularize a context for key Enlightenment ideas” in the Netherlands.⁵⁰ Pluralising Enlightenments, and considering the dominant European language groups at the Cape at that time, we may then speak of Dutch, English, French, German, and Scottish Enlightenments – all of which would contribute to the emergence of liberalism at the Cape.

There may not have been a ‘Cape of Good Hope Enlightenment’, but there were some identifiable signs and effects. Heese refers to “developments at the Cape in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries that in many ways resembled Enlightened thinking in Europe” and that emphasised reason, nature, and progress.⁵¹ The period from the late eighteenth to the early nineteenth century was one of protests, rebellions and uprisings by burghers and slaves, transitional governments, middle class and labour changes, and shifts in commerce as well as cultural identity resulting from events in the Netherlands, England, France, and the Cape itself.⁵² Governors during the First British occupation (1795-1802) and the Batavian period (1803-1806) are said to have been influenced by Enlightenment ideas.⁵³ For example, Commisary J. A. De Mist’s reforms in education and religion, the establishment of societies, and the general promotion of culture are well-documented. Recent scholarship,

⁴⁹ Pocock, *‘Barbarism and Religion’*, p. 9. For Radical and Moderate Enlightenment, see J. Israel, *A Revolution of the Mind: Radical Enlightenment and the Intellectual Origins of Modern Democracy* (Princeton and Oxford, Princeton University Press, 2010). For Counter-Enlightenment, see I. Berlin, ‘The Counter-Enlightenment’, in H. Hardy and R. Hausheer (eds), *The Proper Study of Mankind: An Anthology of Essays* (New York, Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 1998), pp. 243-68.

⁵⁰ For the Dutch Enlightenment, see for example M.A. Truslow, *Hugo Grotius and the Origins of the Enlightenment in the Netherlands*, Netherlands Institute for Advanced Historical Studies, 2007, available at <http://www1.umassd.edu/euro/2007papers/truslow.pdf>, retrieved 10 January 2016.

⁵¹ Heese, ‘Enlightenment’, p. 61.

⁵² W.M. Freund, ‘The Cape Under the Transitional Governments, 1795-1814’, in R. Elphick and H. Giliomee (eds), *The Shaping of South African Society, 1652-1820* (Cape Town, Longman, 1979), pp. 211- 40; Schutte, ‘Company and Colonists at the Cape’, pp. 173-210; S. Trapido, ‘From Paternalism to Liberalism, 1800-1834’, *The International History Review*, 12, 1 (1990), pp. 76-104.

⁵³ Freund, ‘The Cape Under the Transitional Governments’, p. 228.

however, raises questions about his and Governor J. W. Janssens' contributions, bringing to light also some of the limits and contradictions of the Enlightenment, as well as its connections with slavery and racism.⁵⁴

Evidence of the reception of Enlightenment ideas at the Cape in this period can nonetheless be traced in relation to the books of Enlightenment authors, and their subsequent use in pamphlets, newspapers, and tracts. Trapido's reference to the reading habits of a small intelligentsia, and Schutte's concern about who read Enlightenment literature, can be examined and fleshed out in greater detail by looking at how the books of Enlightenment authors were acquired, circulated and read. Between 1787 and 1791 French and German garrisons stationed at the Cape had already started cultural activities. A reading circle of the Württemberg Regiment ordered books and periodicals from Germany.⁵⁵ Reverend J.F. Spönlín, the priest who accompanied this regiment, submitted a report on education to the VOC Political Council in 1788 following a trip into the Cape interior. The report reflected his reading of Rousseau's educational ideas as expressed in *Emile*.⁵⁶

Once newspapers began to appear in 1800, and especially after the second British occupation in 1806, private clubs and societies with reading facilities emerged. Apart from the libraries of Society Concordia and Society Harmony, there were also subscription and circulation libraries, as well as bookshops associated with mercantile houses in an effort to widen access to books. There were even village libraries in the countryside.⁵⁷ By 1830, for example, there were libraries and book societies in Grahamstown, Worcester, Swellendam, Stellenbosch, Clan William, Somerset, and Genadendal. Books supplied for these libraries were intended for the promotion of reading.⁵⁸ Besides the wider dissemination of the English language as the motive for supply in some cases,

⁵⁴ Freund, 'The Cape Under the Transitional Governments', p. 213; K.M. Jeffreys, *The Memorandum of Commissary J.A. De Mist Containing Recommendations for the Form and Administration of Government at the Cape of Good Hope, 1802* (Cape Town, The Van Riebeeck Society, 1920); D. Johnson, 'De Mist, Race and Nation', *Alternation*, 5, 1 (1998), pp. 85-97 (see especially Johnson's footnote 6 for connections between the Dutch Enlightenment, racism and slavery); J.P. Van der Merwe, *Die Kaap Onder die Bataafse Republiek, 1803-1806* (Amsterdam, Swets & Zeitlinger, 1926).

⁵⁵ Tyrrell-Glynn, 'An Account of Some Early Libraries', p. 28.

⁵⁶ T.N. Hanekom, *Die Liberale Rigting in Suid-Afrika: 'n Kerkhistoriese Studie; Eerste Deel* (Stellenbosch, C.S.V. –Boekhandel, 1951), p. 195, footnote 3.

⁵⁷ Tyrrell-Glynn, 'An Account of Some Early Libraries', pp. 29-33; 40-53.

⁵⁸ *The Cape of Good Hope Literary Gazette*, 1, 1 (1830), p. 12.

there were books available in Latin, German, French, Dutch, and Italian at other libraries.

The connections between Enlightenment ideas, reading and social progress are evident in this period in accounts of the struggle for a free press. By the mid-1820s Thomas Pringle and John Fairbairn - the 'Franklins of the Kaap'⁵⁹ - were key players in both a successful struggle for the freedom of the press, and a related but unsuccessful first attempt to launch a South African Literary Society with a library and museum of natural history "for the community at large" and for "the progress of general science".⁶⁰ Pringle and the Dutch minister Abraham Faure (1795-1875) had already requested permission in 1823 to publish a "South African magazine" that was a literary periodical in English (*South African Journal*) and Dutch (*Het Nederduitsch Zuid-Afrikaansche Tijdschrift*).⁶¹ Their aim was to "prosecute this purpose by the most enlightened inhabitants of the Colony, both English and Dutch", with a view "to enlighten South Africa".⁶²

The Enlightenment 'spirit' that was associated to a lesser or greater degree with the burgher protests, the 'Cape Patriot' movement, and the Batavian period, typified British settler efforts in the 1820s to achieve greater constitutional freedom, and to promote the benefits of liberalism.⁶³ By 1829 the population in Cape Town was 18 296 (8 805 Whites, 6 222 slaves, and 3 269 Free Blacks), and although Dutch-language speakers were still in the majority,

⁵⁹ Randolph Vigne argues, probably mistakenly, that this was a reference to the arctic explorer John Franklin (1786-1847), and not the American Enlightenment printer and writer Benjamin Franklin, as several scholars believe - see R. Vigne, *Thomas Pringle: South African Pioneer, Poet and Abolitionist* (Woodbridge, James Currey, 2012), p. 119.

⁶⁰ *Papers of the South African Literary Society, 1824* (Cape Town, Bridekirk, 1825), pp. 4-5; L.D. Bregman, 'Snug Little Coteries: a History of Scientific Societies in Early Nineteenth Century Cape Town, 1824-1835' (PhD thesis, University of London, 2004), p. 67.

⁶¹ Dubow, 'A Commonwealth of Knowledge', pp. 31-2.

⁶² Vigne, 'Thomas Pringle', p. 123; K. Mckenzie, 'Franklins of the Cape': The South African Commercial Advertiser and the Creation of a Colonial Public Sphere, 1824-1854', *Kronos*, 25 (1998/1999), pp. 108; J.M. Mackenzie, 'To Enlighten South Africa': the Creation of a Free Press at the Cape in the Early Nineteenth Century', in C. Kaul (ed), *Media and the British Empire* (London, Palgrave, 2006), pp. 20-36.

⁶³ Hanekom, 'Die Liberale Rigting', pp. 114-36.

Cape Town was “becoming British”.⁶⁴ Among other events, that date also marks the transition of the South African Public Library from a reference or “closed access” to a subscription library,⁶⁵ the proclamation of the ordinance that guaranteed the freedom of the press, the revival and official establishment of the South African Literary Society, as well as the founding of other key cultural, educational, and scientific institutions underscored the spirit of the Enlightenment. These included the South African College, the South African Institution, and a theatre company.

These developments marked the rise of a kind of literary public sphere associated with the Enlightenment, similar to earlier events in Europe.⁶⁶ But they were accompanied too by “measures of inclusion and exclusion” that complicated the ‘Cape Enlightenment’.⁶⁷ Whether only the elite and wealthy possessed and read the works of Enlightenment authors, or whether they were more widely read is still unclear. A valuable source of evidence of the type of ownership of Enlightenment authors for this period is the inventories of the Orphan Chamber.⁶⁸ The sample of twenty two Enlightenment authors listed in Table 1 represents those whose works appear more often than those of others.⁶⁹ Besides being the more ‘popular’ authors, however, they also reflect aspects of

⁶⁴ H. Phillips, ‘Cape Town in 1829’, in C. Saunders and H. Phillips (eds), *Studies in the History of Cape Town* (Cape Town, University of Cape Town History Department in Association with the Centre for African Studies, 1987), pp. 5, 11.

⁶⁵ Tyrrell-Glynn, ‘*An Account of Some Early Libraries*’, p. 213. A Popular library that encouraged wider access to the poor and working classes was established in 1834 – see A.L. Dick, *The Hidden History of South Africa’s Book and Reading Cultures* (Toronto, University of Toronto Press, 2012), pp. 42-4.

⁶⁶ J. Van Horn Melton, *The Rise of the Public in Enlightenment Europe* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2001).

⁶⁷ Tyrrell-Glynn, ‘*An Account of Some Early Libraries*’, p. ix; Dubow, ‘*A Commonwealth of Knowledge*’, pp. 39-40.

⁶⁸ The sources of data are the inventories of the Orphan Chamber (MOOC/TANAP). The names of authors and owners of collections can be searched at <http://databases.tanap.net/mooc/>; See Appendix 1 for a sample of authors, titles, and owners.

⁶⁹ For the names of Enlightenment authors whose works were considered influential at the Cape in the late eighteenth century, see Beyers, ‘*Die Kaapse Patriotte*’, pp. 200-34.

the Dutch, English, French, German, and Scottish Enlightenments co-mingling at the Cape in this period.⁷⁰

Table 1. Enlightenment authors listed in Orphan Chamber (MOOC) inventories, ca. 1793-1832

Authors	Languages	Number of entries in inventories	Names of owners	Number of titles	Number of volumes
Samuel Von Pufendorf, (1632-1694)	German, Latin, Dutch	3	T. Rönnekamp (1793); F. De Jager (1819); J. Berrangé (1827)	2	3
Hugo de Groot, - Grotius (1583-1645)	Dutch	7	T. Rönnekamp (1793); D. Westerhof (1795); F. De Jager (1819); A. Faure (1824); F. Bresler (1825); J. Berrangé (1827); P. Diemel (1828)	7	15
Guillaume Raynal, (1713-1796)	French, Dutch, English	7	B. Weiler (1812); W. Pippin (1816); B. De la Motte (1817); E. la Febre (1817); C. Fleck (1820); F. Bresler (1825); T. Lawson (1828)	8	44
Charles-Louis Montesquieu, (1689-1755)	French, Dutch	4	B. Weiler (1812); la E. Febre (1817); C. Fleck (1820); F. Bresler (1825)	5	19
John Locke, (1632-1704)	English, French	3	J. Brinkhoff (1804); F. Bresler (1825); B. Goodison (1832)	4	6
David Hume, (1711-1776)	English, Dutch	6	T. Rönnekamp (1793); W. Pippin (1816); E. la Febre (1817); J. Digby (1826); J. Berrangé (1827); T. Oldham (1827)	5	24
Denis Diderot, (1713-1784)	French	1	B. Weiler (1812)	1	12
Isaac Newton, (1643-1727)	French, Dutch	5	B. Weiler (1812); J. Döring (1818); F. De Jager (1819); C. Fleck (1820); A. Faure (1824)	4	15
Jean-Jacques Rousseau, (1712-1778)	French	7	J. Brinkhoff (1804); B. Weiler (1812); E. la Febre (1817); B. De la Motte (1817); J. Döring (1818); C. Thalman (1824); J.	6	55

⁷⁰ For some of the challenges and limitations of compiling such lists and tables for authors of the Scottish Enlightenment, see: M.R.M. Towsey, 'Reading the Scottish Enlightenment: Libraries, Readers and Intellectual Culture in Provincial Scotland, c. 1750 - c.1820' (PhD thesis, University of St. Andrews, 2007); M.R.M. Towsey, 'All Partners may be Enlightened and Improved by Reading Them: The Distribution of Enlightenment Books in Scottish Subscription Library Catalogues, 1750-c.1820', *Journal of Scottish Historical Studies*, 28, 1 (2008), pp. 20-43.

			Berrangé (1827)		
Joost van den Vondel, (1587-1679)	Dutch	4	T. Rönnekkamp (1793); C. Thalman (1824); F. Bresler (1825); J. Berrangé (1827)	12	16
Voltaire (1694-1778)	French, Dutch	7	T. Rönnekkamp (1793); J. Brinkhoff (1804); B. Weiler (1812); C. Winter (1815); W. Pippin (1816); J. Döring (1818); P. Diemel (1828)	11	192
Friedrich Schiller, (1759-1805)	German	2	J. Döring (1818); C. Thalman (1824)	6	14
Oliver Goldsmith, (1728-1774)	English	6	B. De la Motte (1817); J. Döring (1818); C. Morgan (1821); J. Digby (1826); P. Diemel (1828); E. Hay (1798)	5	10
Alexander Pope, (1688-1744)	English, French, German	6	T. Rönnekkamp (1793); B. Weiler (1812); J. Döring (1818); F. De Jager (1819); P. Diemel (1828); T. Lawson (1828)	8	30
Jan Floris Martinet, (1729-1795)	Dutch	5	T. Rönnekkamp (1793); E. la Febre (1817); C. Fleck (1820); F. Bresler (1825); J. Berrangé (1827)	9	57
Walter Scott, (1771-1832)	English	2	M. Bailey (1824); R. Plowden	6	9
William Robertson, (1721-1793)	Dutch, English	5	T. Rönnekkamp (1793); P. Meyering (1813); A. Faure (1824); T. Lawson (1828); E. Hay (1798)	5	16
Jonathan Swift, (1667-1745)	English	3	T. Rönnekkamp (1793); J. Digby (1826); P. Diemel (1828)	1	21
Edward Gibbon, (1737-1794)	English	2	M. Bailey (1824); T. Oldham (1827)	2	3
François Le Vaillant, (1753-1824)	English, Dutch (no French titles)	2	E. Hay (1798); J. Berrangé (1827)	1	8
John Barrow, (1764-1848)	English	1	F. Bresler (1825)	1	1
Hinrich Lichtenstein, (1780 - 1857)	English, Dutch, German	3	J. Berrangé (1827); C. Fleck (1820); F. Villnagel (1830)	1	6
TOTALS					
22	5	91	26	110	576

Collecting

The Orphan Chamber inventoried only those estates in cases where minor children were heirs.⁷¹ Table 1, which is therefore by no means a complete record for this period at the Cape, nevertheless shows that Enlightenment authors were represented in several collections. Equally striking is that a number of inventories include the same Enlightenment authors and titles, revealing popularly shared reading interests. This may not necessarily mean that they were actually read, but it certainly indicates a deliberate selection or purchase, as well as a personal interest. And their inclusion strengthens the view that a range of types of readers and collectors at the Cape were interested in Enlightenment authors and their ideas.

Among them were priests (J. Berrangé, C. Fleck, B. Goodison), senior VOC employees (T. Rönnekamp, C. Thalman), clerks (D. Westerhof, C. Morgan), magistrates and other legal officers (F. Bresler, J. Brinkhoff, P. Diemel, A. Faure, T. Lawson), a translator (C. Winter), as well as a number of lower-ranking and ordinary colonists (P. Meyering, B. de la Motte, E. La Febre, F. de Jager, M. Bailey, E. Hay, R. Plowden, T. Oldham, W. Pippin, J. Digby, B. Weiler, F. Villnagel, J. Döring). That ten of the twenty six collectors owned slaves, which like their books could also be bought and sold, cannot be overlooked.

They appear to belong to the expanding middle classes that by the 1820s brought together the Dutch and English commercial and cultural elite.⁷² Middle-class identity at that time was not just about economic status but, following David Hume and Adam Smith's ideas about the "middling ranks", also about shared systems of political and moral values, as well as institutions that cultivated science and the intellect.⁷³ The Dutch and English elite promoted the spirit of Enlightenment by establishing several of South Africa's first scientific societies and institutions.⁷⁴

As confirmed and aspiring members of this cultural elite at the tip of Africa, the book owners listed in Table 1 as well as others were able to add the works of Enlightenment authors to their personal libraries. The Cape was "strategically positioned at the southernmost end of a great commercial and

⁷¹ G. Groenewald, 'On Not Spreading the Word: Ministers of Religion and Written Culture at the Cape of Good Hope in the 18th Century', in A. Delmas and N. Penn (eds), *Written Culture in a Colonial Context: Africa and the Americas, 1500-1900* (Cape Town, UCT Press, 2011), p. 309, footnote 24.

⁷² Meltzer, 'The Growth of Cape Town Commerce', p. 113.

⁷³ Dubow, 'A Commonwealth of Knowledge', pp. 28-35.

⁷⁴ Bregman, 'Snug little Coteries', pp. 10-11.

information highway” to receive new ideas and news of important events.⁷⁵ The works of Enlightenment authors could arrive in the cargo holds of ships. Shipping traffic at the Cape in the last quarter of the eighteenth century was especially heavy. For the period 1778 to 1793 a total number of 2 336 European and American ships arrived at the Cape, and for 1795 to 1800 it was 742.⁷⁶ Adrien Delmas points out that while the VOC controlled the spread of manuscripts produced in its ranks, it had no book policy. In this way “entire libraries were circulating in the ship’s hold with no one complaining about it”.⁷⁷

However, the 576 volumes of 110 Enlightenment-authored titles in the private collections listed in Table 1, as well as other books were acquired through auctions, book sales, bequests, direct purchases while studying in Europe (in the case of several priests and advocates), sent by friends and family abroad, through purchase orders, or shipped and landed on request.⁷⁸ The same, and additional Enlightenment authors, could also be found in other private collections at the Cape. A collection developed through bequests to successive generations is that of the German priest, H. W. Ballot (1767-1814), who arrived at the Cape in 1797 and died in 1814 after working in rural towns such as Tulbagh, Graaff-Reinet, and Swellendam. He bequeathed the collection to his son J.S.S. Ballot (1801-1868), also a priest, who added more books so that it comprised 780 volumes when the University of Cape Town purchased it in 1945.⁷⁹ When J.S.S. Ballot married the daughter of the Dutch priest and owner of books, J.J. Kicherer (1775-1825), the Ballot-Kicherer collection grew even larger and was subsequently handed down to family members. Enlightenment authors listed in a catalogue of this collection include Martinet’s *Katechismus der Natuur*, inscribed as a gift from Kicherer to his daughter on her thirteenth birthday.⁸⁰ It contains also the works of Friedrich Schiller, John Locke, and

⁷⁵ K. Atkins, ‘The Black Atlantic Communication Network: African American Sailors and the Cape of Good Hope Connection’, *Issue: A Journal of Opinion*, 24, 2 (1996), pp. 23–5.

⁷⁶ The number for the period 1778 to 1793 is calculated from statistics in Beyers, ‘*Die Kaapse Patriotte*’, pp. 334-5. The source for the period 1795 to 1800 is G.M. Theal, *History of South Africa, 1691-1795* (London, Allen & Unwin, 1919), volume 1, p. 36.

⁷⁷ Delmas, ‘*Artem Quaevis Terra Alit*’, p. 213.

⁷⁸ See for example Cape Archives (KAB), CO 3999/114, 1838; CO 3931/223, 1826; CO 3996/71, 1837.

⁷⁹ Immelman, ‘Kaapse Bibliofiele en Hulle Boeke’, pp. 92-3.

⁸⁰ R.F.M. Immelman, *The Ballot-Kicherer Collection in UCT Libraries: the Cape’s Second-Oldest Book Collection* (Cape Town, University of Cape Town Libraries,

Joost Van den Vondel.⁸¹ The Dutch translation from Latin of a scientific publication *Redevoering over de beoefening der Natuurkunde* (1790) by a relative of the Ballot family, is included in the private collection of Jan Berrangé who is listed in Table 1.⁸²

Enlightenment works in different languages and often in translations, not listed in Table 1, can be traced in private collections of the period. François Renier Duminy (1747-1811), who visited the Cape since 1767 and then settled there in 1786, possessed works in French of Voltaire, Racine, Montesquieu, and Rousseau among others. In order to build their personal libraries some collectors consulted literary periodicals like *Vaderlandsche Letteroeffeningen*, *De Boekzaal van Europa* or *Boekzaal der Geleerde Wereld*, and *Europische Mercurius* to place orders for new books published in European countries. The *Boekzaal der Geleerde Wereld*, which Dutch booksellers published to educate and entertain readers, contained biographies, literary news, and review essays of books along with their prices. It was described as a cross between the *Reader's Digest* and the *Times Literary Supplement*, and listed works of religion, history, geography, art and science that included those of Enlightenment authors.⁸³ There are several issues of *De Boekzaal van Europa* in the collections of the early book collectors Adam Tas (1668-1722) and Joachim von Dessin, whose set of 162 volumes ends when he died in 1761.⁸⁴ This practice persisted into the nineteenth century, and Christiaan Fleck who possessed a copy of *De Boekzaal der Geleerde Wereld van 1815 tot 1819* died just one year later.⁸⁵

Publishers often listed Enlightenment authors, although not labelled as such, in the back of their books. Publisher J. A. Crajenschot of Amsterdam announced in Berrangé's copy of Redelinghuys' *De Eerloosheid Ontmaskerd* that "the following works can be obtained from same", and then listed the works of Voltaire, Hume, Gibbon, Robertson, Smith, Bolingbroke, as well as the *Encyclopédie*.⁸⁶ Collectors therefore found ways and means to add these authors

1982), p. 25. The private collection of Fredrik de Jager also includes an item for women, *Boekzaal de Juffens* (sic), MOOC 8/33.45, item 87.

⁸¹ *Original Catalogue of the Private Library of the Ballot Family* (Cape Town, University of Cape Town Libraries, 1961), Varia Series, no.2.

⁸² MOOC 8/41.41, item 644.

⁸³ D. Varley, *South African Reading in Earlier Days* (Johannesburg, SABC, 1958) p. 9; See also 'Voorrede aan den Leezer', *Maandelyke Uittreksels of Boekzaal der Geleerde Waerelt January 1761* (Te Amsterdam, Dirk onder de Linden). The May/June issue for 1739 has a section on Linnaeus.

⁸⁴ Immelman, 'Kaapse Bibliofiele en Hulle Boeke', p. 89.

⁸⁵ MOOC 8/34.44, item 476.

⁸⁶ MOOC 8/41.41, item 319; Redelinghuys, '*De Eerloosheid Ontmaskerd*'.

to their personal libraries. But they also lent their books to friends and family, widening access to authors of the Enlightenment.

Circulating

A notary explained in 1824 that most of the books of Anthony Faure (the uncle of Reverend Abraham Faure) could not be listed in his inventory because they were still circulating among his friends. And in 1826 two of Anthony Hayes' books were returned to his family, from which he had borrowed them.⁸⁷ It was not unusual to lend and borrow books, and in the early eighteenth century already Adam Tas recorded in his diary that he had received back some books loaned to friends.⁸⁸

In Balthazar Weiler's inventory of 1829 the names in brackets listed after certain titles and authors are almost certainly those of borrowers. For example, the name J. Beck is found in brackets after a folio-sized *New Word Atlas* as well as after a fourth edition *Poetical Miscellany*.⁸⁹ Weiler also lent four bilingual dictionaries to three different friends, and to a certain Mr Heyman he lent four volumes of the five-volume *Anfangsgründe aller mathematischen Wissenschaften* written by German Enlightenment philosopher, Christian Wolff (1679-1754).⁹⁰ It may well have been the journalist, playwright, and first editor of the bilingual newspaper *De Zuid-Afrikaan*, Charles Etienne Boniface (1787-1853), who borrowed a French translation of Lord Chesterfield's *Letters to his son* from Weiler's collection.⁹¹ In 1829, William Reed received back eleven volumes of Samuel Johnson's works that had been in the estate of the late John Digby, and that he had probably loaned to him.⁹²

Social lending and borrowing practices were not unusual either in the country districts. Andries Stockenström (1792-1864), who is described as espousing the liberal cause and "a leader holding enlightened views", lent almost all his books for the establishment of a public library in Graaff-Reinet in 1824.⁹³ It was housed in a spare room in the public offices, and contained *Rees's Cyclopaedia, or Universal Dictionary of Arts, Sciences, and Literature*,

⁸⁷ MOOC 8/41.7; MOOC 8/41.37.

⁸⁸ Immelman, 'Kaapse Bibliofiele en Hulle Boeke', p. 89.

⁸⁹ MOOC 8/28.71, items 11 and 95.

⁹⁰ MOOC 8/28.71, items 18, 29, 36, 37, and 124.

⁹¹ MOOC 8/28.71, item 145.

⁹² MOOC MOOC8/43.36a. Samuel Johnson is also viewed as an anti-Enlightenment figure.

⁹³ F.A. Mouton, 'Afrikaners, Liberalism and the British Empire, 1806-1910', in S.W. Le Roux and R.C. Fisher (eds), *Festschrift in Honour of O.J.O. Ferreira* (Gordon's Bay, Adamastor, 2010), p. 77.

which attempted to “mimic the French Enlightenment”.⁹⁴ There were also other “books of reference, and a number of standard works, as also lighter reading”, and it was accessible “to every decently dressed person”.⁹⁵ The church library that Reverend Abraham Faure had established there in 1818 probably also contained several of his own books.⁹⁶

Enlightenment works in private collections often entered circulation as result of auctions and sales. Tyrrell-Glynn’s discussion of private book sales advertised in the *Cape Town Gazette and African Advertiser* by 58 merchants and firms between 1800 and 1822 confirms the possession and circulation of Enlightenment authors in the early nineteenth century.⁹⁷ He lists the names and dates of 108 sales by Dutch, English, French, and German-speaking colonists for the period, of which the private collections of four (Döring, Fleck, Weiler, and Winter) are mentioned in Table 1. Some sales were of French and Italian philosophy and history books found on cargo prize ships that were “seized and detained for adjudication”, as well as the school books of the Dutch Enlightenment-oriented *Tot Nut van ‘t Algemeen* society. That society published *Het belang der waare volksverlichting*, which was listed in Christiaan Fleck’s private collection.⁹⁸ Tyrell-Glynn lists, among others, the works of Rousseau, Montesquieu, Grotius, Voltaire, Linnaeus, Martinet, La Fontaine, and Bolingbroke, as well as the *Dictionnaire de Trévoux* that was a much-published encyclopaedia during the Enlightenment, and that preceded Denis Diderot and Jean le Rond d’Alembert’s famous *Encyclopédie*.

Reading

The reading of Enlightenment works cannot be straightforwardly inferred from evidence of their possession and circulation, but the presence of libraries, reading clubs and societies increase this likelihood. Readers could find the works of Enlightenment authors through their membership of reading societies and clubs, as well as of subscription or circulating libraries, which grew in number from about 1800 onwards. Some libraries were supplied by foreign booksellers’ agents such as F. Brummer in Copenhagen and J.M. Richardson of

⁹⁴ T. Morton, and N. Smith, (eds), ‘Introduction’, in *Radicalism in British Literary Culture, 1650-1830: From Revolution to Revolution* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2002), p. 11.

⁹⁵ C.W. Hutton, (ed), *The Autobiography of the Late Sir Andries Stockenstrom, Bart* (Cape Town, Juta, 1887), vol. 1, p. 207.

⁹⁶ Vigne, *Thomas Pringle*, p. 113.

⁹⁷ Tyrrell-Glynn, *An Account of Some Early Libraries*, pp. 223-7.

⁹⁸ MOOC 8/34.44, item 449.

London.⁹⁹ These libraries' new book titles in English, French, Dutch and German were announced from time to time in the Cape newspapers, and in printed catalogue supplements.

Sub-librarians in the South African Public Library, which opened its doors to the public in 1822 as a study and reference library, provided pen, ink, and paper for readers "to take extracts from any book". Its three catalogues for the period 1821 to 1829 list the works of Enlightenment authors such as Bolingbroke, Goldsmith, Locke, Pope, Scott, Swift, Smith, Hume, Gibbon, Schiller, Montesquieu, Voltaire, Rousseau, as well as the *Encyclopédie*, and these could well have been among the sources from which readers made their extracts.¹⁰⁰ Charles Boniface for example had to scale a ladder to reach the shelves in order to retrieve his selections from the seventy volumes of the Beaumarchais' edition of Voltaire, sent to the library from its buyer in England.¹⁰¹

Private (later captain) E.J.F Kelso who was stationed at Cape Town from 1833 to 1834 visited this library regularly as a subscriber. While based briefly on Robben Island he received library books via the help of a friend who would entrust them to Kelso's valet on the return boat. Among other books, his reading included Walter Scott's *The history of Scotland* and Edward Gibbon's *The history of the decline and fall of the Roman Empire*, commenting in his journal on chapters he had completed.¹⁰² Historical works in private possession that were donated to the 'Popular' or Penny Library that was started in 1834 for the poor and working classes, expanded the readership of Enlightenment authors. A young emigrant who subscribed to this library was found reading William Robertson's *History of the reign of the Emperor Charles V.*¹⁰³

Unknown until now are the records of the reading club of the Freemason Lodge de Goede Hoop. The lodge was established in Cape Town in 1772 and,

⁹⁹ Tyrrell-Glynn, *An Account of Some Early Libraries*, pp. 30-2; R.F.M. Immelman, *Men of Good Hope: the Romantic Story of the Cape Town Chamber of Commerce, 1804-1954* (Cape Town, Cape Town Chamber of Commerce, 1955), p. 164.

¹⁰⁰ Tyrrell-Glynn, *An Account of Some Early Libraries*, pp. 29-70; 110; 202-12; R.F.M. Immelman, 'Book Provision in Cape Colony, 1800-1860', *Journal of Library History*, 5, 1 (1970), pp. 35-46.

¹⁰¹ D.H. Varley, *Adventures in Africana* (Cape Town, University of Cape Town and Trustees of the South African Library, 1949), pp. 35-36.

¹⁰² E.J.F. Kelso Journals, 1833-1834, Brenthurst Library, Johannesburg, MS. 051.

¹⁰³ 'Popular ignorance', *The Cape of Good Hope Literary Gazette*, 3, 5 (March 1835A, p. 33.

like Freemasonry itself, was associated with the Enlightenment. The reading club subscribed to *Hansard* as well as international newspapers such as the *Amsterdamsche Courant*, the *Leidsche Courant*, and *The Morning Chronicle*. Also listed are the *Zeitung für die elegante Welt*, and *Letterkundig Magazyn van Wetenskap, Kunst en Smaak*.¹⁰⁴ At the meeting of 3 July 1824 the secretary recorded that a work by Grotius was being considered for purchase.¹⁰⁵ Several volumes of the Dutch translation from high German, and themselves translations from the original French Enlightenment writer Bernard le Bovier de Fontenelle's *Dialogues of the dead*, were included in the library. All the volumes carry the library's ownership stamp and the name of I.D. Piton, the treasurer and a member of the reading club committee.¹⁰⁶

Evidence that these library books were read include paper and blue ribbon markers, a folded page, as well as several marks in the margins of a number of volumes. A club member D. F. Berrangé was the brother of J.C. Berrangé who is listed in Table 1. More significantly, another member F.R. Bresler, also a collector mentioned in Table 1, was the brother of J.A. Bresler who had accompanied Johannes Redelinghuys to Amsterdam in 1785. The Bresler family library, which included Raynal's works, may well have been Redelinghuys' source of these and other Enlightenment authors that he had cited in his pamphlets.

Some of the Lodge de Goede Hoop reading club members also patronised the nearby Commercial Exchange subscription library, started around 1821, where John Fairbairn and the missionary John Philip (1775-1851) were subscribers.¹⁰⁷ At that library, George Thompson's *Travels and adventures in Southern Africa* (1827), which was edited and 'ghosted' in part by Thomas Pringle, was "in great demand".¹⁰⁸ This was probably because it captured the Cape merchants' shared feelings of neglect by the "parent country", but could well have been because it also carried some of the Scottish Enlightenment-influenced Pringle's poems and sketches.¹⁰⁹ Members of the Dutch and British

¹⁰⁴ Minutes (March 1824 – April 1825) of the Reading Club of the Archives of the Secretary, Lodge De Goede Hoop, Cape Archives, A731/G1/1.

¹⁰⁵ 'Minutes (March 1824 – April 1825) of the Reading Club'.

¹⁰⁶ The Dutch title is *Maandelychse Berichten uit Andere Waerelt, of De Spreekende Doden*, National Library of South Africa, Freemason's Lodge de Goede Hoop, MSC 30, Boxes 51-63.

¹⁰⁷ Immelman, *Men of Good Hope*, pp. 166-7.

¹⁰⁸ Vigne, *Thomas Pringle*, pp. 112, 116, 140; Immelman, *Men of Good Hope*, p. 166.

¹⁰⁹ Meltzer, 'The Growth of Cape Town Commerce', pp. 117-8; According to Van Wyk Smith, Pringle was also influenced by "an emergent English

cultural elite or “intellectual aristocracy” therefore often belonged to the same literary and reading societies, and were subscribers to the same libraries and journals. They probably exchanged books privately as well, although some could be sourced in unexpected places.¹¹⁰

Sources of liberalism

This reading culture connected with Enlightenment ideas, as well as those of liberalism more generally. The emergence of Cape liberalism as well as criticism by radical revisionists is well documented and explained by Stanley Trapido, Christopher Saunders, and others.¹¹¹ They have successfully identified its early adherents, as well as its key tenets, including a more representative government in a legislative assembly, a free press, a free market, free rather than forced labour, and a non-racial franchise. Liberal ideas about freedom and natural rights in the works of Enlightenment authors animated important debates and discussions about some of these tenets, and circulated among both serious and ordinary readers.

John Philip’s view that political institutions were necessary to construct a good society, for example, arose during his first years at the Cape, in part from his reading of William Blackstone (1723-1780). Unable to find the unabridged version, Philip relied on the abridged edition of Blackstone’s *Commentaries on the Laws of England*. Pieter Kapp sources Philip’s liberal ideas in Blackstone who in turn had drawn on the works of several Enlightenment *philosophes* to discuss the ideas of natural freedom, and of the absolute and relative rights of persons.¹¹² Stanley Trapido argues that Blackstone’s direct influence on Philip can be seen in the preface of his *Researches in South Africa* that was published in 1828.¹¹³ Philip’s missionary work, writing, and quite probably his reading of

Romanticism” – see M. Van Wyk Smith, ‘On the Borders of Solitude: Thomas Pringle and the Wordsworthian Imagination in South Africa’, in C.C. Barfoot, (ed), *A Natural Delineation of Human Passions: the Historic Moment of Lyrical Ballads* (Amsterdam, Rodopi, 2004), p. 190-2.

¹¹⁰ Varley, *Adventures in Africana*, p. 39; note 81.

¹¹¹ Trapido, ‘The Emergence of Liberalism’; C. Saunders, *The Making of the South African Past* (Cape Town, David Philip, 1988), chapter 16, ‘The Challenge Begins’, available at <https://www.marxists.org/subject/africa/saunders/making-past/ch16.htm>, retrieved 14 March 2016.

¹¹² P.H. Kapp, ‘Dr John Philip. Die Grondlegger van Liberalisme in Suid Afrika’, *Argief Jaarboek vir Suid Afrikaanse Gesiedenis*, 48, 2 (1985), pp. 50-1.

¹¹³ S. Trapido, ‘The Emergence of Liberalism and the Making of Hottentot Nationalism, 1815-1834’, in *Collected Seminar Papers on the Societies of*

Blackstone too, may have contributed to his support for the proclamation of Ordinance 50 in 1828 that gave all Cape Colony Khoisan and other free persons of colour the same freedom and protection before the law as white colonists.

Philip does not mention who had lent him Blackstone's book. But at a meeting of Khoisan-related groups to protest a vagrancy law in 1834 James Read junior, the son of a white missionary and his Khoi wife, invoked the ideas of what he described as an "ancient writer", which Trapido speculates could well have been Blackstone.¹¹⁴ It is not unlikely then that James Read senior, who became a trusted colleague of Philip, may have lent Blackstone to him. There were circulating libraries and reading societies at some London Missionary Society settlements, and probably the remnants of Johannes Van der Kemp's private library that Read senior supposedly allowed to fall into neglect.¹¹⁵

Kapp has criticised Philip's use of Blackstone's ideas, as well as those of Burke, Rousseau, and Smith as "selective and superficial". He claims that Philip confused philosophy with propaganda, that he had read about these authors in evangelical magazines, and that his liberal approach was theoretical and not based on contact with and knowledge of non-white people.¹¹⁶ But Andrew Bank explains that until the 1980s historians like Kapp re-interpreted Philip to serve the aims of Afrikaner nationalist historiography. Kapp's "denunciation of Philip's personality, character, and motives"¹¹⁷ therefore included how he had read the Enlightenment authors. Tim Keegan's recent biography of Philip however reveals that he had a deeper understanding of the Enlightenment and its authors than Kapp argues.¹¹⁸ Blackstone's ideas and approach would later influence William Porter, the "Father of Cape Liberalism". Porter, who had also read Grotius in Dutch in preparation for his work as attorney general at the Cape in 1839, learned about Blackstone through the works of two American jurists

Southern Africa in the 19th and 20th Centuries (London, University of London, 1992), vol. 17, p. 41.

¹¹⁴ Trapido, 'The Emergence of Liberalism', p. 52.

¹¹⁵ Dick, *The Hidden History*, pp. 43, 47; T. Keegan, *Dr Philip's Empire: One Man's Struggle for Justice in Nineteenth-Century South Africa* (Cape Town, Zebra Press, 2016), p. 47. Thomas Lawson's inventory (Table 1, MOOC8/44.10a) also listed Blackstone's *Commentaries*.

¹¹⁶ Kapp, 'Dr John Philip', pp. 285-7.

¹¹⁷ A. Bank, 'The Politics of Mythology: the Genealogy of the Philip Myth', *Journal of Southern African Studies*, 25, 3 (1999), pp. 474, footnote 50.

¹¹⁸ Keegan, *Dr Philip's Empire*, pp. 2, 11, 32.

who were themselves “products of the Enlightenment and influenced by natural law”.¹¹⁹

Like some of the Khoisan, some slaves were not unaware either of the ideas of authors of the Enlightenment and of liberalism. It was well known at the time that slaves hired people to read the newspapers to them, and kept themselves informed of the latest developments.¹²⁰ In this way, by having it read to them, they “read” in the Dutch and English-language newspaper *De Zuid-Afrikaan* of 21 January 1831 a direct quotation from Section 138 of Chapter 11 in John Locke’s *The Second Treatise of Civil Government* (1690). The newspaper had drawn on Locke’s ideas about private property in a debate about compensation for slave owners in view of the forthcoming emancipation.¹²¹ Locke’s view of a contract between the king and the people, with references to the 1688 ‘Glorious Revolution’, would feature in later issues of Fairbairn’s *South African Commercial Advertiser*.¹²²

Perhaps unsurprisingly, after freedom of the press was granted in 1829, the *South African Commercial Advertiser* serialised in 1830 the American Enlightenment author Benjamin Franklin’s *The way to wealth, or Poor Richard improved*, which contains sayings and advice about work ethic and frugality.¹²³ It was read also in the Cape countryside and other towns, where this newspaper was among many “taken by the English and the natives” and by “several Fingoes and some of the Gonahs”. At the Kat River Settlement, *Poor Richard* was translated into Dutch and printed as a tract under the title “Ou oom Spogter”. Besides the press, there was also a “regular circulating library formed

¹¹⁹ J.M. McCracken, *New Light at the Cape of Good Hope: William Porter the Father of Cape Liberalism* (Belfast, Ulster Historical Foundation, 1993); P. Thomas, ‘The Development of the Cape Common Law During the Early Nineteenth Century: William Porter, James Kent and Joseph Story’, *Fundamina*, 20, 2 (2014), pp. 907-915.

¹²⁰ *Zuid-Afrikaan*, 21 January 1831.

¹²¹ *Zuid-Afrikaan*, 21 January 1831. This newspaper also carried a reader’s correspondence about an article that quoted Voltaire in French, *Zuid-Afrikaan*, 16 April 1830; 23 April 1830.

¹²² *South African Commercial Advertiser*, 16 and 23 May, 7 July 1849.

¹²³ *South African Commercial Advertiser*, 19 June, 23 June 1830. Adam Smith’s political economy also featured in this newspaper, and in 1824 it carried a lengthy summary of David Ricardo’s *Principles of Political Economy and Taxation*, S. Trapido, ‘From Paternalism to Liberalism: the Cape Colony, 1800-1834’, *The International History Review*, 12, 1 (1990), p. 96.

to diffuse knowledge among the rising population”.¹²⁴ Extracts from other Enlightenment authors may have been produced as tracts and read in similar fashion.¹²⁵

Genadendal’s well-used lending library, started in 1823 and run by the Moravian mission, carried some of their works in German, Dutch, and English. It was frequented by visitors passing through the town, and was praised generously as perhaps the best country library in the colony.¹²⁶ Its catalogue lists *inter alia* the works of some of the scientific travellers to the Cape, as well as Isaac Newton’s three-volume *Mathematical principles of natural philosophy* and the *Katechismus der natuurlyke historie* for schools, patterned after Martinet’s *Katechismus der natuur*.¹²⁷ And learners at some country schools were reported to be reading Oliver Goldsmith’s *History of Rome* “very tolerably”.¹²⁸

Cape liberalism, Trapido explains, began to emerge from about 1820 onwards and was “not so much the application of a fixed doctrine as a process arising out of conflict, and constantly in flux”.¹²⁹ We are now able to trace some of the Enlightenment print culture origins from which Cape liberalism arose. This however takes us further back than the 1820s and the philanthropic missionary movement. It takes us back instead to late eighteenth century Cape Town, and to its reading culture that collected, circulated, and read the works of authors of the Enlightenment in Dutch, English, German, and French, and were cited in pamphlets by Redelinghuys and others. It also takes us to the progressive reading clubs, subscription libraries, books, and newspapers in the early nineteenth century that debated political and economic liberalism. And it

¹²⁴ J. Read, *The Kat River Settlement in 1851, Described in a series of Letters Published in The South African Commercial Advertiser* (Cape Town, Robertson, 1852), p. 123.

¹²⁵ The Religious Tract Society introduced a programme of popular science publishing in the mid-nineteenth century, see A. Fyfe, *Science and Salvation: Evangelical Popular Science Publishing in Victorian Britain* (Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 2004).

¹²⁶ ‘Recollections of Rambles Among the Mountains, no. 2’, *The Cape of Good Hope Literary Gazette*, 2 April 1832, p. 273.

¹²⁷ The Genadendal library catalogue commenced in 1824. See Section B – List of English titles, entry 115; C – List of Dutch titles, entry 75. I am grateful to Isaac Balie for making this catalogue available to me.

¹²⁸ Archives and Records, Brunel University, London. Records of the British and Foreign School Society, Annual Report, 1833-1834, p. 110.

¹²⁹ Trapido, ‘From Paternalism to Liberalism’, p. 77.

takes us to the Cape countryside and to non-elite readers who could discern some of the contradictions of Cape liberalism.

The economic liberalism of free labour, for example, brought with it new oppressive practices such as paying lower wages. Choosing a print culture simile, perhaps mockingly, Andries Stoffels told a House of Commons Select Committee on Aborigines in London in 1836 about the worsening conditions for the Khoisan that “there is now another kind of oppression... but it is like a newspaper that you put in the press and press down. They [the English]... oppress them in every way.”¹³⁰ On the other hand, the material traces of the Cape’s intellectual traditions reveal liberating features beyond the so-called conservative ‘Nederduitse Gereformeerde Boek’ tradition,¹³¹ and the Religious Tract Society publishing programme. The early reading culture that nurtured these intellectual traditions was robust and diverse, and embraced Enlightenment and liberal ideas about natural rights, progress, freedom, and the general diffusion of knowledge. This story of material traces is however absent in extant studies of how liberalism developed at the Cape.

Perhaps unsurprisingly, soon after representative government was introduced in 1853, the reading culture was placed on firmer ground through a system of government aid to Cape country towns and villages where subscription libraries had been established “in a liberal spirit”. A condition of this grant in 1855 was that the library would be open to the general public free of charge on certain days of the week “for the diffusion of useful knowledge”.¹³² Less surprisingly, William Porter bequeathed £100 to each of these libraries.¹³³ Whether or not the use of the ideas of authors of the Enlightenment since Redelinghuys in 1792 was selfish, selective, and ambivalent, the material traces that their books were collected, circulated, and read at the Cape in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries are certain. Their ideas and their books would continue to matter in its future.

¹³⁰ Trapido, ‘The Emergence of Liberalism’, p. 53.

¹³¹ D.W. Krüger, ‘Die Gereformeerde Leesstof van ons Kaapse Voorouers’, *Standpunte*, 20, 6 (1967), pp. 26-9; Van Zijl, *Van Skeepskis tot Wakis tot Boekrak*.

¹³² Report of the Select Committee on Local libraries, 1855, in M.S. Van der Walt, ‘Staatsteun aan Subskripsiebiblioteke in die Kaapkolonie Vanaf 1818 tot 1910’ (MA dissertation, University of Stellenbosch, 1972), p. 97. There were about twelve established subscription libraries by this time.

¹³³ McCracken, *New Light at the Cape of Good Hope*, p. 132.

