



UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA  
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA  
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

*A Reformatory Approach to State Regulation of  
Insolvency Law in South Africa*

by

**JUANITTA CHRISTELLE CALITZ**

**THESIS**

*submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree*

**DOCTOR LEGUM**

in the

**FACULTY OF LAW**

at the

**UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA**

**PROMOTER:**

**PROF DR A BORAINÉ**

**PRETORIA**

**DECEMBER**

**2009**



# *A Reformatory Approach to State Regulation of Insolvency Law in South Africa*

## TABLE OF CONTENT

### **PART I: INTRODUCTION**

1	GENERAL INTRODUCTION.....	2
1.1	INTRODUCTION.....	2
1.2	RESEARCH STATEMENT.....	7
1.3	RESEARCH OBJECTIVES.....	7
1.4	OVERVIEW OF CHAPTERS.....	9
1.5	SCOPE OF RESEARCH.....	11
1.6	TERMINOLOGY.....	11
1.7	REFERENCE TECHNIQUES.....	12
1.8	LIMITATIONS ON THE STUDY.....	13

### **PART II: A HISTORICAL OVERVIEW**

1	HISTORICAL OVERVIEW OF STATE REGULATION OF SOUTH AFRICAN INSOLVENCY LAW.....	15
1.1	INTRODUCTION.....	15
1.2	HISTORICAL OVERVIEW OF INSOLVENCY LAW IN GENERAL.....	16
1.3	ROMAN LAW.....	18
1.4	ROMAN-DUTCH LAW.....	23
1.5	ENGLISH LAW.....	27
1.6	SOUTH AFRICAN LAW.....	37
2	CONCLUSION.....	46

### **PART III: STATE REGULATION OF INSOLVENCY LAW: AN INTERNATIONAL PERSPECTIVE**

1	INTRODUCTION.....	52
2	UNITED STATES OF AMERICA.....	57
2.1	INTRODUCTION.....	57
2.2	HISTORICAL OVERVIEW OF THE AMERICAN BANKRUPTCY LAW.....	62
2.3	REGULATORY FRAMEWORK: THE UNITED STATES TRUSTEE.....	74
2.4	REGULATORY FRAMEWORK: THE BANKRUPTCY ADMINISTRATOR.....	85
2.5	INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK: ROLE OF THE COURTS.....	87
3	UNITED KINGDOM.....	92
3.1	INTRODUCTION.....	92
3.2	HISTORICAL OVERVIEW OF ENGLISH INSOLVENCY LAW.....	94
3.3	REGULATORY FRAMEWORK: THE INSOLVENCY SERVICE.....	105
3.4	INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK: ROLE OF THE COURTS.....	127
3	THE NETHERLANDS.....	129



4.1	INTRODUCTION.....	129
4.2	HISTORICAL OVERVIEW OF THE DUTCH BANKRUPTCY LAW.....	131
4.3	REGULATORY FRAMEWORK.....	133
4.3	VOORONTWERP INSOLVENTIEWET.....	139
5	INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATIONS.....	141
5.1	INTRODUCTION.....	141
5.2	UNCITRAL <i>LEGISLATIVE GUIDE ON INSOLVENCY LAW</i> . ....	143
5.3	WORLD BANK “ <i>PRINCIPLES AND GUIDELINES FOR EFFECTIVE INSOLVENCY AND CREDITOR RIGHTS SYSTEM</i> ”.....	148
6	CONCLUSION.....	155

## **PART IV: CONSTITUTIONAL AND ADMINISTRATIVE LAW ASPECTS OF STATE REGULATION OF SOUTH AFRICAN INSOLVENCY LAW**

1	INTRODUCTION.....	163
2	THE CONSTITUTIONAL LAW ASPECTS OF STATE REGULATION OF SOUTH AFRICAN INSOLVENCY LAW.....	165
2.1	INTRODUCTION.....	165
3	ADMINISTRATIVE LAW ASPECTS OF STATE REGULATION OF SOUTH AFRICAN INSOLVENCY LAW.....	169
3.1	INTRODUCTION.....	169
3.2	THE PROMOTION OF ADMINISTRATIVE JUSTICE ACT .....	170
3.3	PROMOTION OF ACCESS TO INFORMATION ACT 2 OF 2000.....	190
4	CONCLUSION.....	195

## **PART V: STATE REGULATION OF SOUTH AFRICAN INSOLVENCY LAW AND EARLIER LAW REFORM PROPOSALS**

1	INTRODUCTION.....	199
2	LEGAL FRAMEWORK OF SOUTH AFRICAN INSOLVENCY LAW.....	201
3	REGULATORY FRAMEWORK OF SOUTH AFRICAN INSOLVENCY LAW.....	204
3.1	INTRODUCTION.....	204
3.2	POWERS AND DUTIES OF THE MASTER.....	206
3.2	REVIEW PROCEEDINGS.....	259
4	INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK OF SOUTH AFRICAN INSOLVENCY LAW.....	261
5	PROBLEMS AND PITFALLS IDENTIFIED .....	263
5.1	MASTER AS REGULATORY BODY.....	261
5.2	REGULATION OF INSOLVENCY PRACTITIONERS .....	266
6	LAW REFORM.....	269
6.1	THE DRAFT BILL AND EXPLANATORY MEMORANDUM.....	270
6.2	PROPOSALS RELATING TO THE REGULATORY REGIME IN SOUTH AFRICAN INSOLVENCY LAW.....	272
7	CONCLUSION.....	278



## **PART VI: POLICY DEVELOPMENT AND CONSIDERATIONS WITH REGARD TO THE REGULATION OF SOUTH AFRICAN INSOLVENCY LAW**

1	INTRODUCTION.....	281
2	EXISTING POLICIES AND POLICY CONSIDERATIONS IN SOUTH AFRICAN INSOLVENCY LAW .....	284
3	POLICY CONSIDERATIONS FOR A REVISED REGULATORY REGIME.....	288
3.1	INTRODUCTION .....	288
3.2	THE ROLE OF THE STATE IN THE REGULATION OF INSOLVENCY LAW.....	291
3.3	THE REGULATORY FRAMEWORK.....	298
3.4	INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK.....	308
3.5	LEGAL FRAMEWORK .....	311
4	CONCLUSION.....	313

## **PART VII: RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUDING SUMMARY**

1	INTRODUCTION.....	317
2	PROPOSALS FOR LAW REFORM.....	319
2.1	INTRODUCTION.....	319
2.2	PROPOSED REGULATORY FRAMEWORK FOR THE SOUTH AFRICAN INSOLVENCY REGIME.....	319
2.3	INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK.....	336
2.4	LEGAL FRAMEWORK.....	338
2.5	CONCLUSION.....	341
3	CONCLUDING SUMMARY.....	345

<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY.....</b>	<b>351</b>
--------------------------	------------

<b>TABLE OF STATUTES.....</b>	<b>364</b>
-------------------------------	------------