

# Vibration Covariate Regression Analysis of Failure Time Data with the Proportional Hazards Model

by

**Pieter-Jan Vlok**

Submitted as partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree

**Master in Engineering**  
(Mechanical Engineering)

Department of Mechanical and Aeronautical Engineering  
Faculty of Engineering  
University of Pretoria

Supervisor: Mr. J.L. Coetzee  
Co-supervisors: Prof. A.K.S. Jardine and Prof. J.L. van Niekerk

October, 1999



# Acknowledgements

---

I would like to express my sincere gratitude towards,

- Mr. Jasper Coetzee, my study leader, for his support, guidance and encouragement throughout this study;
- Prof. Andrew Jardine of the University of Toronto for partially sponsoring and coordinating this research project;
- Dr. Dragan Banjevic of the CBM lab at the University of Toronto for giving me technical support and evaluating my results;
- Prof. Wikus van Niekerk for his co-supervision;
- SASOL, Secunda for supplying me with suitable data and permitting me to publish the results;
- My father and sister, for their continued interest in my work;
- Our heavenly Father, for giving me the strength and perseverance to complete this task which He laid upon me.

The Author

October, 1999

# Summary



UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA  
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA  
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

## Vibration Covariate Regression Analysis of Failure Time Data with the Proportional Hazards Model

by

**Pieter-Jan Vlok**

Supervisor: Mr. J.L. Coetzee  
Co-supervisors: Prof. A.K.S. Jardine & Prof. J.L. van Niekerk

Master in Engineering  
Department of Mechanical and Aeronautical Engineering  
University of Pretoria

There is no doubt about the potential economical advantages of preventive renewals based on statistical failure analysis or vibration monitoring, if performed correctly. Despite their advantageous abilities to produce economical benefits, both techniques have shortcomings. Vibration monitoring strategies recommend renewal based on short term vibration information only (often by waterfall plots or other short term trending techniques) and no scientific technique exists with which long term vibration information can be included in recommendations. Conventional statistical failure analysis techniques, on the contrary, utilizes the statistical long term life cycle cost optimum to base renewal decisions on and do not take diagnostic information (like vibration information) into account. The mentioned techniques complement each other extremely well and in this dissertation a scientific method to integrate these techniques was searched for with the emphasis on practicality.

Regression models with the ability to handle covariates (explanatory variables) was found to be the most logical route to the dissertation objectives. After an extensive literature study, the Proportional Hazards Model (PHM) was selected as the most suitable model for this application because of its sound theoretical foundation, numerical tractability and previous successes. The PHM was thoroughly researched including the investigation of different model forms, numerical parameter estimation techniques, covariate behavior and goodness-of-fit tests. A decision model utilizing the PHM, with the ability to handle non-monotonic covariates (like vibration parameters) through Markovian chains, was also identified and studied.

Data obtained from a typical South African industrial concern was collected and modeled with the studied theory, with promising results.

**Keywords:** Proportional Hazards Model, Vibration Monitoring, Failure Analysis, Preventive Maintenance, Renewal



# Opsomming

## Vibrasie Verklarende Veranderlike Analise van Falingsstyd Data met die Proporsionele Gevaarkoers Model

deur

**Pieter-Jan Vlok**

Leier: Mn. J.L. Coetzee  
Mede-Leiers: Prof. A.K.S. Jardine & Prof. J.L. van Niekerk

Magister in Ingenieurswese  
Departement van Meganiese en Lugvaartkundige Ingenieurswese  
Universiteit van Pretoria

Daar is geen twyfel oor die potensiële ekonomiese voordele van voorkomende hernuwing gebaseer op statistiese falingsanalise of vibrasie monitering nie, mits dit korrek bedryf word. Ten spye van hul vermoëns wat groot finansiële voordele inhoud, het beide tegnieke tekortkominge. Vibrasie monitering strategieë beveel hernuwing aan alleenlik gebaseer op korttermyn vibrasie inligting (tipies deur waterval grafieke of ander korttermyn tendens identifiseringstegnieke) en geen wetenskaplike tegniek bestaan waarmee langtermyn vibrasie inligting in besluite geïnkorporeer kan word nie. In teenstelling hiermee, neem konvensionele statistiese falingsanalises geen diagnostiese inligting (soos vibrasie inligting) in ag in hernuwings aanbevelings nie, maar grond besluite op die minimum statistiese langtermyn lewenssikkuskoste. Die bogenoemde tegnieke komplimenteer mekaar uitstekend en in hierdie studie is daar gesoek na 'n wetenskaplike metode waarmee die twee tegnieke geïntegreer kan word met die klem op praktiese toepaslikheid.

Regressie modelle met die vermoë om verklarende veranderlikes te hanteer, het geblyk om die mees logiese roete na die studiedoelwitte te wees. Na 'n deeglike literatuurstudie is besluit dat die Proporsionele Gevaarkoersmodel (PGM) die mees gesikte model is vir die genoemde toepassing vanweë sy breë teoretiese fondasie, numeriese implementeerbaarheid, asook vorige suksesse wat behaal is in soortgelyke toepassings. Die PGM is in diepte bestudeer, onder andere verskillende modelvorms, numeriese parameter beramingstegnieke, verklarende veranderlike gedrag en pasgehalte toetse. 'n Besluitnemingsmodel wat op die PGM gebasseer is met die vermoë om nie-monotone verklarende veranderlikes (soos vibrasie parameters) te hanteer deur Markov kettings is ook geïdentifiseer en bestudeer.

Data is verkry uit 'n tipiese Suid-Afrikaanse industriële situasie en is gebruik om die bestudeerde teorie te toets, met belowende resultate.

**Sleutelwoorde:** Proporsionele Gevaarkoersmodel, Vibrasie Monitering, Falingsanalise, Voorkomende Instandhouding, Hernuwing



# Table of Contents

Notation	i
----------	---

## Chapter 1: Problem Statement 1

1	Introduction	1
2	Use Based Preventive Renewal	3
1.1	Failure Data	3
1.2	Incomplete Observations or Censored Data	6
1.3	Renewal Theory	7
1.4	Optimal Use Based Preventive Renewal Decision Models	15
1.5	Concluding Remarks	16
3	Preventive Renewal Based on Vibration Monitoring Predictions	16
3.1	Methodology	17
3.2	Vibration Parameters	17
3.3	Shortcomings of Preventive Renewal Based on Vibration Monitoring	17
4	Integrating Use Based Preventive Renewal and Vibration Monitoring	19
4.1	Literature Study	20
4.2	Identification of Most Suitable Model	20
4.3	Thorough Study on Chosen Model	20
4.4	Practical Evaluation of the Model	20

## Chapter 2: Regression Models in Renewal Theory 21

1	Introduction	21
2	Accelerated Failure Time Model	22
2.1	Mathematical Model	22
2.2	Comments	22
3	Proportional Hazards Model	23
3.1	Mathematical Model	24
3.2	Comments	25
4	Prentice Williams Peterson Model	26
4.1	Mathematical Model	26
4.2	Comments	27
5	Proportional Odds Model	28
5.1	Mathematical Model	28
5.2	Comments	29
6	Additive Hazards Model	29
6.1	Mathematical Model	29
6.2	Comments	30

7 Selection of Most Suitable Model	30
------------------------------------	----

## Chapter 3: Proportional Hazards Modelling 32

1 Introduction	32
2 The Proportional Hazards Model	33
2.1 Assumptions of the Model	34
2.2 The Semi-Parametric PHM	35
2.3 The Fully Parametric PHM	39
3 Covariates	42
3.1 Effects of Interaction and Omission of Covariates	42
3.2 Effects of Measurement Error and Misspecification of Covariates	43
3.3 Effects of Monotonicity and Multicollinearity of Covariates	44
3.4 Time-dependent Covariates	44
4 Numerical Model Fitting Procedures	45
4.1 Snyman's Dynamic Trajectory Optimization Method	46
4.2 Modified Newton-Raphson Optimization Method	48
5 Goodness-of-fit Tests	52
5.1 Graphical Methods	53
5.2 Analytical Goodness-of-Fit Tests	56
6 Optimal Decision Making with the Proportional Hazards Model	59
6.1 The Long Term Life Cycle Cost Concept	59
6.2 Prediction of Covariate Behavior	61

## Chapter 4: Vibration Covariate PHM Application 68

1 Introduction	68
2 Preliminaries for PHM Analysis	69
2.1 Requirements for a Vibration Covariate PHM Analysis	69
2.2 Shortcomings	70
2.3 Concluding Remark	71
3 SASOL Data	71
3.1 Background	72
3.2 Covariates	74
3.3 Data	76
4 Weibull PHM Fit	79
4.1 Phase 1: Simple Weibull Model	80
4.2 Phase 2: Weibull PHM with Subjective Covariates Excluded	82
4.3 Phase 3: Weibull PHM With All Covariates	85
4.4 Final Model	86
5 Decision Model	86



5.1	Transition Probability Matrices	87
5.2	Cost Function and Optimal Replacement Policy	89
5.3	Evaluation of Optimal Policy	90
6	Conclusion	93
	Appendix	94

## **Chapter 5: Closure 99**

1	Overview	99
2	Recommendations	100

## **References 102**

1	Introduction	1
2	Background	2
3	Objectives	3
4	Methodology	4
5	Results	5
6	Conclusion	6
7	Appendix	7
8	References	8
9	Biographies	9
10	Disclaimer	10
11	Copyright	11
12	Index	12
13	Table of Contents	13
14	Abbreviations	14
15	Glossary	15
16	Acronyms	16
17	Abbreviations	17
18	Acronyms	18
19	Abbreviations	19
20	Acronyms	20
21	Abbreviations	21
22	Acronyms	22
23	Abbreviations	23
24	Acronyms	24
25	Abbreviations	25
26	Acronyms	26
27	Abbreviations	27
28	Acronyms	28
29	Abbreviations	29
30	Acronyms	30
31	Abbreviations	31
32	Acronyms	32
33	Abbreviations	33
34	Acronyms	34
35	Abbreviations	35
36	Acronyms	36
37	Abbreviations	37
38	Acronyms	38
39	Abbreviations	39
40	Acronyms	40
41	Abbreviations	41
42	Acronyms	42
43	Abbreviations	43
44	Acronyms	44
45	Abbreviations	45
46	Acronyms	46
47	Abbreviations	47
48	Acronyms	48
49	Abbreviations	49
50	Acronyms	50
51	Abbreviations	51
52	Acronyms	52
53	Abbreviations	53
54	Acronyms	54
55	Abbreviations	55
56	Acronyms	56
57	Abbreviations	57
58	Acronyms	58
59	Abbreviations	59
60	Acronyms	60
61	Abbreviations	61
62	Acronyms	62
63	Abbreviations	63
64	Acronyms	64
65	Abbreviations	65
66	Acronyms	66
67	Abbreviations	67
68	Acronyms	68
69	Abbreviations	69
70	Acronyms	70
71	Abbreviations	71
72	Acronyms	72
73	Abbreviations	73
74	Acronyms	74
75	Abbreviations	75
76	Acronyms	76
77	Abbreviations	77
78	Acronyms	78
79	Abbreviations	79
80	Acronyms	80
81	Abbreviations	81
82	Acronyms	82
83	Abbreviations	83
84	Acronyms	84
85	Abbreviations	85
86	Acronyms	86
87	Abbreviations	87
88	Acronyms	88
89	Abbreviations	89
90	Acronyms	90
91	Abbreviations	91
92	Acronyms	92
93	Abbreviations	93
94	Acronyms	94
95	Abbreviations	95
96	Acronyms	96
97	Abbreviations	97
98	Acronyms	98
99	Abbreviations	99
100	Acronyms	100
101	Abbreviations	101
102	Acronyms	102
103	Abbreviations	103
104	Acronyms	104
105	Abbreviations	105
106	Acronyms	106
107	Abbreviations	107
108	Acronyms	108
109	Abbreviations	109
110	Acronyms	110
111	Abbreviations	111
112	Acronyms	112
113	Abbreviations	113
114	Acronyms	114
115	Abbreviations	115
116	Acronyms	116
117	Abbreviations	117
118	Acronyms	118
119	Abbreviations	119
120	Acronyms	120
121	Abbreviations	121
122	Acronyms	122
123	Abbreviations	123
124	Acronyms	124
125	Abbreviations	125
126	Acronyms	126
127	Abbreviations	127
128	Acronyms	128
129	Abbreviations	129
130	Acronyms	130
131	Abbreviations	131
132	Acronyms	132
133	Abbreviations	133
134	Acronyms	134
135	Abbreviations	135
136	Acronyms	136
137	Abbreviations	137
138	Acronyms	138
139	Abbreviations	139
140	Acronyms	140
141	Abbreviations	141
142	Acronyms	142
143	Abbreviations	143
144	Acronyms	144
145	Abbreviations	145
146	Acronyms	146
147	Abbreviations	147
148	Acronyms	148
149	Abbreviations	149
150	Acronyms	150
151	Abbreviations	151
152	Acronyms	152
153	Abbreviations	153
154	Acronyms	154
155	Abbreviations	155
156	Acronyms	156
157	Abbreviations	157
158	Acronyms	158
159	Abbreviations	159
160	Acronyms	160
161	Abbreviations	161
162	Acronyms	162
163	Abbreviations	163
164	Acronyms	164
165	Abbreviations	165
166	Acronyms	166
167	Abbreviations	167
168	Acronyms	168
169	Abbreviations	169
170	Acronyms	170
171	Abbreviations	171
172	Acronyms	172
173	Abbreviations	173
174	Acronyms	174
175	Abbreviations	175
176	Acronyms	176
177	Abbreviations	177
178	Acronyms	178
179	Abbreviations	179
180	Acronyms	180
181	Abbreviations	181
182	Acronyms	182
183	Abbreviations	183
184	Acronyms	184
185	Abbreviations	185
186	Acronyms	186
187	Abbreviations	187
188	Acronyms	188
189	Abbreviations	189
190	Acronyms	190
191	Abbreviations	191
192	Acronyms	192
193	Abbreviations	193
194	Acronyms	194
195	Abbreviations	195
196	Acronyms	196
197	Abbreviations	197
198	Acronyms	198
199	Abbreviations	199
200	Acronyms	200
201	Abbreviations	201
202	Acronyms	202
203	Abbreviations	203
204	Acronyms	204
205	Abbreviations	205
206	Acronyms	206
207	Abbreviations	207
208	Acronyms	208
209	Abbreviations	209
210	Acronyms	210
211	Abbreviations	211
212	Acronyms	212
213	Abbreviations	213
214	Acronyms	214
215	Abbreviations	215
216	Acronyms	216
217	Abbreviations	217
218	Acronyms	218
219	Abbreviations	219
220	Acronyms	220
221	Abbreviations	221
222	Acronyms	222
223	Abbreviations	223
224	Acronyms	224
225	Abbreviations	225
226	Acronyms	226
227	Abbreviations	227
228	Acronyms	228
229	Abbreviations	229
230	Acronyms	230
231	Abbreviations	231
232	Acronyms	232
233	Abbreviations	233
234	Acronyms	234
235	Abbreviations	235
236	Acronyms	236
237	Abbreviations	237
238	Acronyms	238
239	Abbreviations	239
240	Acronyms	240
241	Abbreviations	241
242	Acronyms	242
243	Abbreviations	243
244	Acronyms	244
245	Abbreviations	245
246	Acronyms	246
247	Abbreviations	247
248	Acronyms	248
249	Abbreviations	249
250	Acronyms	250
251	Abbreviations	251
252	Acronyms	252
253	Abbreviations	253
254	Acronyms	254
255	Abbreviations	255
256	Acronyms	256
257	Abbreviations	257
258	Acronyms	258
259	Abbreviations	259
260	Acronyms	260
261	Abbreviations	261
262	Acronyms	262
263	Abbreviations	263
264	Acronyms	264
265	Abbreviations	265
266	Acronyms	266
267	Abbreviations	267
268	Acronyms	268
269	Abbreviations	269
270	Acronyms	270
271	Abbreviations	271
272	Acronyms	272
273	Abbreviations	273
274	Acronyms	274
275	Abbreviations	275
276	Acronyms	276
277	Abbreviations	277
278	Acronyms	278
279	Abbreviations	279
280	Acronyms	280
281	Abbreviations	281
282	Acronyms	282
283	Abbreviations	283
284	Acronyms	284
285	Abbreviations	285
286	Acronyms	286
287	Abbreviations	287
288	Acronyms	288
289	Abbreviations	289
290	Acronyms	290
291	Abbreviations	291
292	Acronyms	292
293	Abbreviations	293
294	Acronyms	294
295	Abbreviations	295
296	Acronyms	296
297	Abbreviations	297
298	Acronyms	298
299	Abbreviations	299
300	Acronyms	300
301	Abbreviations	301
302	Acronyms	302
303	Abbreviations	303
304	Acronyms	304
305	Abbreviations	305
306	Acronyms	306
307	Abbreviations	307
308	Acronyms	308
309	Abbreviations	309
310	Acronyms	310
311	Abbreviations	311
312	Acronyms	312
313	Abbreviations	313
314	Acronyms	314
315	Abbreviations	315
316	Acronyms	316
317	Abbreviations	317
318	Acronyms	318
319	Abbreviations	319
320	Acronyms	320
321	Abbreviations	321
322	Acronyms	322
323	Abbreviations	323
324	Acronyms	324
325	Abbreviations	325
326	Acronyms	326
327	Abbreviations	327
328	Acronyms	328
329	Abbreviations	329
330	Acronyms	330
331	Abbreviations	331
332	Acronyms	332
333	Abbreviations	333
334	Acronyms	334
335	Abbreviations	335
336	Acronyms	336
337	Abbreviations	337
338	Acronyms	338
339	Abbreviations	339
340	Acronyms	340
341	Abbreviations	341
342	Acronyms	342
343	Abbreviations	343
344	Acronyms	344
345	Abbreviations	345
346	Acronyms	346
347	Abbreviations	347
348	Acronyms	348
349	Abbreviations	349
350	Acronyms	350
351	Abbreviations	351
352	Acronyms	352
353	Abbreviations	353
354	Acronyms	354
355	Abbreviations	355
356	Acronyms	356
357	Abbreviations	357
358	Acronyms	358
359	Abbreviations	359
360	Acronyms	360
361	Abbreviations	361
362	Acronyms	362
363	Abbreviations	363
364	Acronyms	364
365	Abbreviations	365
366	Acronyms	366
367	Abbreviations	367
368	Acronyms	368
369	Abbreviations	369
370	Acronyms	370
371	Abbreviations	371
372	Acronyms	372
373	Abbreviations	373
374	Acronyms	374
375	Abbreviations	375
376	Acronyms	376
377	Abbreviations	377
378	Acronyms	378
379	Abbreviations	379
380	Acronyms	380
381	Abbreviations	381
382	Acronyms	382
383	Abbreviations	383
384	Acronyms	384
385	Abbreviations	385
386	Acronyms	386
387	Abbreviations	387
388	Acronyms	388
389	Abbreviations	389
390	Acronyms	390
391	Abbreviations	391
392	Acronyms	392
393	Abbreviations	393
394	Acronyms	394
395	Abbreviations	395
396	Acronyms	396
397	Abbreviations	397
398	Acronyms	398
399	Abbreviations	399
400	Acronyms	400
401	Abbreviations	401
402	Acronyms	402
403	Abbreviations	403
404	Acronyms	404
405	Abbreviations	405
406	Acronyms	406
407	Abbreviations	407
408	Acronyms	408
409	Abbreviations	409
410	Acronyms	410
411	Abbreviations	411
412	Acronyms	412</td



# Notation

---

$\bar{z} / \overline{z(t)}$	Covariate vector dependent / independent of time
$\lambda(z(t))$	Functional term dependent on time and covariates
$z_i / z_i(t)$	$i^{\text{th}}$ covariate dependent / independent of time
$\gamma$	Vector of regression coefficients
$\hat{P}_{ij}$	Transition probability estimate
$\Delta$	Inspection interval
$\beta$	Weibull shape parameter
$\eta$	Weibull scale parameter
$\lambda_{ij}$	Transition rate from state $i$ to $j$
$[]^T$	Transposed vector
AFTM	Accelerated failure time model
CBM	Condition Based Maintenance
$C_f$	Cost of unexpected failure renewal
CM	Condition monitoring
$C_p$	Cost of planned preventive renewal
$d$	Threshold risk level
$f$	Unreliability function / Cumulative failure density function
$F$	Failure density function
$g(t)$	Warning level function
$h$	Hazard rate
$H$	Cumulative hazard rate
$h_0$	Baseline hazard rate
IID	Independent and identically distributed
KS	Kolmogorov-Smirnov
$L$	Likelihood
$l$	Log-likelihood
LCC	Long term life cycle cost
$L_e$	Expected life
MTTF	Mean time to failure
NHPP	Non Homogeneous Poisson Process
$P\{\cdot\}$	Probability
PDF	Probability density function
PHM	Proportional hazards model / modelling
$PL$	Partial likelihood
POM	Proportional odds model
PWP	Prentice Williams Peterson model
$Q(d)$	Probability of failure renewal

$R$	Reliability / Survivor function
$R_0$	Baseline survivor function
ROCOF	Rate of occurrence of failure
$t$	Continuous time
$T_i$	$i^{\text{th}}$ Observed renewal time
$T_i$	$i^{\text{th}}$ Random renewal time variable
TPM	Transition probability matrix
$W(d)$	Expected time to renewal

## 1 Introduction

The reliability of a system is the probability that the system will perform its intended function for a specified period of time under stated conditions. Reliability analysis is concerned with the prediction of the reliability of a system over time and the identification of potential failure modes and their causes.

The application of reliability analysis to maintenance problems is referred to as maintenance reliability analysis. It is concerned with the prediction of the reliability of a system over time and the identification of potential failure modes and their causes. Very often, maintenance reliability analysis is concerned with the prediction of the reliability of a system over time and the identification of potential failure modes and their causes.

Various systems can be divided into two main categories: repairable and non-repairable. A repairable system is one that can be restored to a working condition after a failure. A non-repairable system is one that cannot be restored to a working condition after a failure.

The maintenance process can be divided into two main phases: corrective maintenance and preventive maintenance. Corrective maintenance processes are those that are triggered by a failure or a symptom. Preventive maintenance processes are those that focus on prevention and strategy setting, one of the components in the