FACTORS OF WORKFORCE DIVERSITY THAT INFLUENCE INDIVIDUAL AND ORGANIZATIONAL PERFORMANCE

by

JOSEPH ALLAN FELDMAN

Submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree

DOCTOR OF BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION (ORGANIZATIONAL BEHAVIOUR)

in the

FACULTY OF ECONOMIC AND MANAGEMENT SCIENCES

at the

PRETORIA

MAY 2001

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my appreciation to the following people:

Loretta, Tracey and Lauren for their unconditional love and support.

My parents, Sydney and Sarah Feldman for the life values they instilled in me that served as a source of strength during the time I worked on this research project.

My promotor Prof. J. J. De Beer for his assistance with a complex and difficult research project.

Prof. Ronel Rensburg for her leadership role in this project.

Mrs Rina Owen for the assistance with the statistical analysis.

Prof. Ronel Erwee for the opportunity to do this unique research.

Prof. Petra Van den Berg and Prof. Patrick Palmer for their encouragement.

ALL HONOUR BE TO GOD

INDEX

| | | | Page |
|--------|-----------------------------|--|------|
| CHA | PTER 1 | PROBLEM STATEMENT AND OUTLINE OF THE STUDY | |
| 1.1 | BACKGRO | OUND | 1 |
| 1.2 | THE ROLE | OF DIVERSITY IN ORGANIZATIONS | 3 |
| 1.2.1 | Types of div | versity in South Africa | 4 |
| 1.2.2 | Status Quo | of diversity in South Africa | 6 |
| 1.2.2. | 1 The impact Effectivene | of diversity-related problems on organizational ss | 6 |
| 1.2.2. | 2 Diversity tr | ends in the workplace in South Africa | 9 |
| 1.2.3 | Conclusion | S) | 12 |
| 1.3 | THE PROB | BLEM STATEMENT | 13 |
| 1.4 | THE OBJE | CTIVES OF THIS RESEARCH | 14 |
| 1.5 | ASSUMPT | TIONS ON WHICH THE STUDY IS BASED | 15 |
| 1.6 | LIMITATI | ONS OF THE STUDY | 15 |
| 1.7 | SCOPE OF | THE STUDY | 16 |
| 1.8 | CHAPTER | OUTLINE | 16 |

CHAPTER 2 DIVERSITY IN THE WORKPLACE

| 2.1 | INTRODUCTION | 18 |
|---------|---|----|
| 2.1.1 | Definitions of workforce diversity | 18 |
| 2.1.2 | Relevance of the influence of diversity on tasks and relationships in organizations | 20 |
| 2.1.3 | Workforce-related trends in diversity | 25 |
| 2.2 | ORGANIZATIONAL BEHAVIOUR AND WORKFORCE DIVERSITY | 26 |
| 2.2.1 | Introduction | 26 |
| 2.2.2 | Workforce diversity and Applied Organizational Behaviour | 27 |
| 2.2.2.1 | The contribution of Behavioural Science to diversity- related organizational behaviour | 27 |
| 2.2.2.2 | The influence of effective diversity management | 31 |
| 2.2.3 | The nature of the impact of workforce diversity in Organizations | 33 |
| 2.2.4 | The impact of workforce diversity in South African Organizations | 36 |
| 2.2.4.1 | Limitations of the Interactional Model of Cultural Diversity (IMCD) | 37 |
| 2.2.4.2 | A Study-framework for developing an alternative to the Interactional Model of Cultural Diversity | 39 |
| 2.2.4.3 | A Frame for developing a new paradigm of workforce diversity | 47 |

| 2.3 | ON WORKFORCE DIVERSITY | 48 |
|--------|--|----|
| 2.3.1 | Introduction | 48 |
| 2.3.2 | Research perspectives on the antecedents leading to the diversity climate in the IMCD | 51 |
| 2.3.3 | Research perspectives on the antecedents leading to diversity-related outcomes | 56 |
| 2.3.4 | A Contemporary multi-dimensional perspective on the dynamics of workforce diversity | 57 |
| | (i). A Trait-model of workforce diversity | 58 |
| | (ii). An Expectations-model of workforce diversity | 59 |
| | (iii). A Differential Power-model of workforce diversity | 60 |
| 2.3.5 | Summary on contemporary research perspectives | 62 |
| 2.4 | WORKFORCE DIVERSITY AND CHANGE IN ORGANIZATIONS | 63 |
| 2.4.1 | Introduction | 63 |
| 2.4.1. | 1 The role of change in the dynamics of workforce diversity | 63 |
| 2.4.1. | 2 The concept of Organization Development | 64 |
| 2.5 | WORKFORCE DIVERSITY-RELATED PROCESSES | 66 |
| 2.5.1 | Introduction | 66 |
| 2.5.2 | The relationship between the Team-working Model and the revised IMCD paradigm | 68 |

| 2.6 | | SECOND-ORDER PROCESS OF | 70 |
|---------|--------|---|----|
| | WOF | RKFORCE DIVERSITY | 70 |
| | | trages are a research on the management | |
| 2.6.1 | Introd | luction | 70 |
| 2.6.1.1 | Ingro | up – outgroup processes | 71 |
| 2613 | The o | origin and role of dimensions of culture in | |
| 2.0.1.2 | | sity-related group processes | 72 |
| 2.6.2 | The S | ocial Identity of employees | 77 |
| 262 | The | State of the second order process of | |
| 2.6.3 | | ffects of the second-order process of force diversity | 78 |
| 261 | C1 | party and the explorer and the explorations | 81 |
| 2.6.4 | Concl | usion | 01 |
| 2.7 | THE | FIRST-ORDER PROCESS OF WORKFORCE | |
| | DIVE | RSITY | 81 |
| 2.7.1 | Introd | luction | 81 |
| 2.7.2 | The d | ynamics of the First-Order process | |
| | Of wo | orkforce diversity | 85 |
| 2.7.3 | The re | ole of organizational culture in the First-Order | |
| | proce | ss of workforce diversity | 88 |
| 2.7.3.1 | Dime | nsions of organizational culture | 89 |
| | (i) | The impact of specific cultural content | 92 |
| | (ii) | Cultural fit | 92 |
| | (iii) | Informal integration | 93 |
| | (iv) | Structural integration | 95 |
| | (v) | Institutional bias | 96 |

| 2.7.3.2 | | ructs of organizational culture that are nt to the First-Order process | 97 |
|---------|-------------|--|-----|
| 2.7.3.3 | The Sof div | tatus quo regarding the management ersity | 99 |
| 2.7.3.4 | | ole of adaptive structuration in ganization | 100 |
| | (i) | Cross-cutting and nested differentiation | 101 |
| | (ii) | Crossing of categories and functions | 104 |
| | (iii) | In-group formation | 104 |
| 2.7.4 | | sity-related problems as outcomes of adaptive uration | 106 |
| 2.7.4.1 | | onsequences in the organization of diversity- d problems | 107 |
| 2.7.4.2 | | gnificance of the processes of workforce diversity ath Africa | 108 |
| 2.7.4.3 | 3 The ic | dentification of contextual factors of workforce diversity | 118 |
| 2.8 | CON | CLUSIONS | 120 |

| CHA | PTER | 3 MANAGING WORKFORCE DIVERSITY | |
|--------|----------|---|-----|
| 3.1 | INTRO | DDUCTION | 121 |
| 3.2 | AFFIR | AGING THE PARADIGM SHIFT FROM MATIVE ACTION TO THE VALUING ORKFORCE DIVERSITY | 122 |
| 3.2.1 | | le of affirmative action in the processes of orce diversity | 122 |
| 3.2.2 | | fluence of the valuing of diversity in the processes kforce diversity | 126 |
| 3.2.3 | Variab | eles of a management process of workforce diversity | 127 |
| 3.2.3. | 1 The di | versity-related types of organization form | 128 |
| | (i). | Dimensions of workforce diversity | 128 |
| | (ii). | The relationship between dimensions of workforce diversity and organization form | 129 |
| 3.2.3. | | nsions of diversity in the processes of work- diversity | 131 |
| | (i). | Dimensions in the second order process | 131 |
| | (ii). | Dimensions in the first order process | 132 |
| 3.2.3 | 3 The m | nultidimensionality of workforce diversity | 134 |
| 3.2.4 | | tionalizing the new management of ity paradigm | 136 |
| 3.2.4. | 1 Resea | rch perspectives of workforce diversity in South Africa | 137 |
| | | usions on the South African research perspectives rkforce diversity | 138 |
| 3.2.4. | 2 Concl | usions on the extent to which the findings of the South | |

| | African research can be integrated with the revised IMCD- Paradigm | 146 |
|-------|---|-----|
| 3.2.5 | Conclusion: A change model of workforce diversity | 148 |
| | | |

CHAPTER 4 THE RESEARCH DESIGN

| 4.1 | INTRODUCTION | 155 |
|---------|---|-----|
| 4.2 | PURPOSE OF THE EMPIRICAL STUDY | 156 |
| 4.3 | THE RESEARCH STRATEGY | 157 |
| 4.3.1 | The Measurement Instrument | 158 |
| 4.3.2 | The target population | 163 |
| 4.3.2.1 | The sample | 163 |
| 4.3.2.2 | 2 The sample size | 164 |
| 4.3.3 | Data collection | 164 |
| 4.3.4 | Statistical methods for data analysis | 167 |
| 4.3.4.1 | Determination of the diversity-related organization form of organizations in South Africa | 167 |
| 4.3.4.2 | 2 Determination of the factors of workforce Diversity in South Africa | 170 |
| 4.3.5 | Appropriateness of the research strategy | 182 |
| 4.3.6 | Strengths and weaknesses of the research design | 183 |

CHAPTER 5 RESULTS

| 5.1 | INTRODUCTION | 184 |
|-------|---|-----|
| 5.2 | THE DIMENSIONS OF WORKFORCE DIVERSITY IN SOUTH AFRICA | 186 |
| 5.2.1 | The status quo regarding the management of diversity | 186 |
| 5.2.2 | Extent of openness to change | 187 |
| 5.2.3 | How much is diversity valued in your organization | 189 |
| 5.2.4 | How is diversity managed in your organization | 191 |
| 5.2.5 | Extent of diversity related problems | 192 |
| 5.3 | RESULTS OF THE DETERMINATION OF THE FACTORS OF WORKFORCE DIVERSITY IN SOUTH AFRICA | 193 |
| 5.3.1 | Results of the determination of associations between Sections of the diversity opinion questionaire | 193 |
| 5.3.2 | Results of the structural equations analysis | 196 |

CHAPTER 6 CONCLUSIONS

| 6.1 | INTRODUCTION | 204 |
|-------|---|-----|
| 6.2 | RESEARCH QUESTION 1 | 205 |
| 6.2.1 | The Status quo of the management of diversity In South Africa | 205 |
| 6.2.2 | The extent of openness to change in organizations in South Africa | 206 |
| 6.2.3 | The valuing of workforce diversity in South Africa | 208 |
| 6.2.4 | How diversity is managed in organizations in South Africa | 209 |
| 6.2.5 | The extent of diversity-related problems in organizations in South Africa | 210 |
| 6.3 | RESEARCH QUESTION 2 | 211 |
| 6.4 | RESEARCH QUESTION 3 | 216 |
| 6.5 | FINAL CONCLUSIONS | 219 |
| 6.6 | RECOMMENDATIONS | 221 |

| BIBLIOGRAPHY | | 230 |
|---------------|--|-----|
| APPENDIX 1: | The Diversity Opinion Questionaire | 240 |
| APPENDIX 2 | Results of the frequency analysis | 251 |
| APPENDIX 3(a) | Preliminary statistical procedures for the determination of the diversity- related organization form of organizations in South Africa | 303 |
| APPENDIX 3(b) | Preliminary statistical procedures For the determination of factors of Workforce diversity in South Africa | 307 |
| APPENDIX 4 | Sample statistics for answering research Question 1 | 310 |
| APPENDIX 5 | Sample statistics of items of Sections B, C, D, F, G | 321 |
| APPENDIX 6 | Sample statistics of Factors of Sections B, C, D, F, G | 328 |
| APPENDIX 7 | Sample statistics of measures of association Between sections B, C, D, F and G | 334 |
| APPENDIX 8 | Statistics of Structural Equations Analysis | 343 |

LIST OF FIGURES AND TABLES

| Figure 1.1 | The impact of consultation between management and workers of productivity. | 8 |
|---------------|--|----|
| Figure 1.2 | Union activity and trust in Management. | 10 |
| Figure 2.1 | A manager's guide to Applied Organizational Behaviour | 28 |
| Figure 2.2 | An Interactional Model of Cultural Diversity | 32 |
| Figure 2.3(a) | The Transformational Factors involved in Second-Order Change | 45 |
| Figure 2.3(b) | The Transactional Factors involved in First-Order Change | 46 |
| Figure 2.4 | A revised paradigm of the Interactional Model of Cultural Diversity | 47 |
| Figure 2.5 | A Trait model of workforce diversity | 58 |
| Figure 2.6 | An Expectations model of workforce diversity | 59 |
| Figure 2.7 | A Differential Power model of workforce diversity | 61 |
| Figure 2.8 | The team-working model of workforce diversity | 67 |
| Figure 2.9 | A Revised Integrated Model of Cultural diversity based on diverse team processes | 69 |
| Figure 2.10 | The Processes or workforce diversity | 70 |

| Figure 2.11 | Influences of diversity on team-processes and outcomes | 71 |
|--------------|---|-----|
| Figure 2.12 | The First-Order process of workforce diversity | 81 |
| Figure 2.13 | The dynamics of the First-Order process of workforce diversity | 85 |
| Figure 2.14 | Crosscutting of categories of diversity | 103 |
| Figure 2.15 | Hierarchical diversity | 103 |
| Figure 3.1 | The diversity-complexity relationship | 123 |
| Figure 3.2 | Dimensions in the processes of workforce diversity in South Africa | 147 |
| Figure 3.3 | A Change model of workforce diversity | 150 |
| Figure 4.1 | A Predicted Path diagramme of workforce diversity in South Africa | 172 |
| Figure 5.3.1 | The interdependence between sections B, C, D, F and G | 194 |
| Figure 5.3.2 | Structural Equations Model of workforce diversity in South Africa | 197 |
| Figure 6.1 | A cultural specific change model of workforce Diversity in South Africa | 218 |
| Table 4.1 | Goodness of fit indices of an initial Structural Equations model | 176 |
| Table 4.2 | Goodness of fit indices of the first modified initial Structural Equations model | 179 |
| Table 4.3 | Goodness of fit indices of the second modified initial Structural Equations model | 181 |
| Table 6.1 | Status quo regarding the management of diversity | 211 |

| Table 6.2 | Extent of openness to change | 212 |
|-----------|--|-----|
| Table 6.3 | How much is diversity valued in your organization | 213 |
| Table 6.4 | How is diversity managed in your organization | 214 |
| Table 6.5 | Extent of diversity related problems | 215 |
| Table 6.6 | Frequencies of transformational and transactional change factors in South Africa | 217 |

SUMMARY

FACTORS OF WORKFORCE DIVERSITY THAT INFLUENCE INDIVIDUAL AND ORGANIZATIONAL PERFORMANCE

by

JOSEPH ALLAN FELDMAN

PROMOTOR : Prof. J. J. De Beer

DEPARTMENT: Human Resources Management

DEGREE : DBA (Organizational Behaviour)

Affirmative action to redress past discriminatory practices is being implemented on a growing scale in the world, and is creating more diversity in the workforce of organizations. With the implementation of affirmative action in organizations, dramatic changes in the composition of the workforce takes place, especially at management level.

Many leaders and managers have a poor awareness of the impact of changes in workforce composition on individual and organizational performance and its management. The central issue in dealing with workforce diversity is power-sharing. A heightened awareness in managers with regard to workforce diversity means becoming open to differences between employees. It also presuppose the creation of an inclusive environment that new groups will need to be let into positions of decisionmaking and influence.

Beyond opening the system, organizations will need to create strategies to help staff at all levels to overcome their resistance to this demographic transformation, and deal with one

another in harmonious, co-operative ways. Racial fears and tensions have historically shaped the management style of dominant groups to the point where thoughtless prejudice and stereotypical reactions have become the norm. Reactions of workers to such a management style reflects distrust.

Diversity-related performance problems can be encountered in organizations, due to the role that diversity plays in individual and organizational behaviour. Dominant groups may project prejudice and stereotyping that result in relationship and task performance problems. Negative effects like absenteeism, lack of training and so forth, give rise to inefficiency and low productivity. Thus, diversity-related problems can increase with increases in diversity (due to affirmative action and employment equity programmes), resulting in an increase in its negative effects on organizational efficiency, if diversity is not managed. The South African economy cannot afford the disregard for the management of diversity. Such disregard poses three dilemmas.

The first dilemma is the reality of the consequences of Affirmative action. in the context of the management of diversity. Whilst any increase in the level of task non-competitiveness cannot be afforded and accommodated (which in itself is the result of increasing diversity that is not managed), affirmative action has to be implemented. Against this background, it is obvious that South African organizations do not have the option of not understanding the dynamics of affirmative action and its role in the dynamics of workforce diversity.

The second dilemma is that there exists a research-need to understand workforce diversity and its issues(diversity-related problems) in South Africa as a prerequisite for developing strategies that are more effective than legislation in dealing with employee-perceptions of equity in the workplace.

The third dilemma, is the issue of knowing how to manage diversity. Most research in the world to date on was done on "unmanaged diversity". The status quo of diversity in South Africa is such that diversity related problems are intrinsic to the types of diversity discussed in this study.

Diversity will increase in South Africa, which may facilitate the deterioration of the status quo. To reduce the possible negative impacts of this development, the need exists for research to address the three dilemmas discussed.

The research method included firstly a literature study on the most recent appropriate perspectives on the dynamics of workforce diversity, and secondly a research design that was used to determine the diversity-related organization form factors of workforce diversity in South Africa.

In chapter 2 workforce diversity was studied in the context of Behavioural science, specifically in its contribution to organizational behaviour, with emphasis on group behaviour. Shortcomings of the established Interactional Model of Cultural of Diversity (IMCD) in explaining diversity-related group behaviour is remedied to satisfy research requirements of this study. A new paradigm of workforce diversity is created by integrating research perspectives on diverse-team processes, change-models and the IMCD. The outcome of this study is tested within the context of the results of a pilot-study done in 1997 on the progress made in managing diversity in South Africa.

In chapter 3 the management of workforce diversity is studied. The transformation of homogeneity through affirmative action to increased diversity, is investigated. Dimensions of workforce diversity and its role and nature in diversity processes is studied. Most relevant empirical South African research perspectives on the dimensions of diversity in South Africa are integrated with conclusions of chapters 2 and 3 in the construction of a Cultural-specific change model of workforce diversity.

In chapter 4 the research design was outlined The diversity-related *organization form* (mono-cultural, non-discriminatory or multicultural), *dimensions* and *factors* of workforce diversity is empirically determined at two levels: Firstly, organization form, dimensions, and factors of workforce diversity are identified in a descriptive study. Secondly, the factors of workforce diversity is then determined in a causal study.

In chapter 5 the results were reported in terms of the dimensions and organization form that was determined, and the identified factors. The results of the determination of the factors, are presented in the context of a theoretical model of workforce diversity in South Africa, that was established in the causal study.

In chapter 6 conclusions and recommendations were reported strictly on the basis of the data of the empirical study and the results. The factors that were determined, are presented as transformational (long-term leadership), and transactional (short-term management) factors. Recommendations are made on appropriate strategies and interventions to manage workforce diversity.

This study has limitations that impose constraints on the scope of the study. The population sample is an unrestricted non-probability convenience sample, with size n = 614. Thus, it is very difficult to estimate precision, and interpretations of variance of the mean statistic has to be done very conservatively. The results of the analysis of covariance to be used in inferential methods is affected by the sample's status as a convenience sample, as variances affect.