



University of Pretoria

**EXPLORING STAGES/PHASES AND GATES AS A PROJECT  
MANAGEMENT APPROACH FOR SOUTH AFRICAN CLEAN  
DEVELOPMENT MECHANISM PROJECTS**

by

Marco Lotz

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the of the requirements for the degree of

Philosophiae Doctor

In the

GRADUATE SCHOOL OF TECHNOLOGY MANAGEMENT

FACULTY OF ENGINEERING, BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND INFORMATION  
TECHNOLOGY

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

PRETORIA

JANUARY 2011

<b>Title of thesis</b>	Exploring Stages/Phases and Gates as a Project Management Approach for South African Clean Development Mechanism Projects
<b>Student</b>	Marco Lotz
<b>Promoter</b>	Profs Alan Brent and Herman Steyn
<b>Department</b>	Graduate School of Technology Management
<b>University</b>	University of Pretoria
<b>Degree</b>	Philosophiae Doctor (Engineering Management)

### **Abstract**

Climate change is a global problem that is at least partially caused by human induced greenhouse gas emissions. Various initiatives were developed in the 1990's to incentivise greenhouse gas emission reductions below legal limits. One of these systems is the Kyoto Protocol's Clean Development Mechanism (CDM). In these incentive schemes parties can sell (the Seller) their greenhouse gas emission reductions to other parties (the Buyer) who need to offset their emissions. Emission reduction incentivised projects have technical aspects, financial aspects and regulatory requirements. The complexity of emission reduction schemes are further increased due to the levels of scrutiny and diverse sources of scrutiny that a project undergoes.

As a developing country South Africa (SA) has a lot to gain by the successful implementation of CDM projects. Unfortunately very few successful CDM projects exist in South Africa. It was then the aim of this research to explore why there are so few projects and what are the current CDM project management approaches followed for CDM projects in SA?

During the investigation aspects of the project management landscape of SA CDM projects were structured by means of a stage/phase and gate approach. This was done to aid in addressing the specific requirements of CDM projects and to combine this with the limited real world experience of successful CDM projects in SA. A stage/phase-gate model was developed because of the

model's ability to manage risk per stage/phase and overall risks, as well as the ability of these models to assist in portfolio management.

Various research methods were used to develop the final proposed stage/phase and gate project management model (Model  $\beta$ ). These methods included over and above literature reviews:

- Two rounds of questionnaires to develop the model;
- Interviews with individual experts through identified cases to validate the first version of the model; and
- Interaction with the South African Clean Development Industry Association to validate the second version of the model.

Model  $\beta$  should not be seen as a stationary model. The model should rather be adapted by each emission reduction project developer to suit the developer's company specific requirements. Furthermore the evolving regulatory environment of emission reduction systems will lead to the continued adapting and updating of Model  $\beta$ . The model could then be useful for:

- Project developers to plan and execute their projects; and
- Buyers or Investors in projects as to quickly ascertain current project status and progression.

It is envisaged that applying Model  $\beta$ , or a derivative, will:

- Manage risk due to increased project management through a stage/phase and gate approach;
- Decrease project development time and ensure all required outputs are achieved quicker; and
- Due to decreasing development time, costs could be managed better.

*Keywords:*

emission reduction incentive, project management, stage/phase-gate

## Declaration

I declare that this thesis, which I hereby submit for the degree Philosophiae Doctor (Engineering Management) at the University of Pretoria, is my own work and has not been previously submitted by me for a degree at another university.



.....  
Marco Lotz

2011-01-04

.....  
Date

## Acknowledgements and Dedications

**“I dedicate it to all the kids and adults out there that have ever been picked on or made to feel inadequate.”**

**Korn, MTV Unplugged  
(Introduction to Creep)**

**“For with much wisdom comes much sorrow,  
the more knowledge, the more grief.”  
Ecclesiastes 1:18**

### **To thank:**

As a student I was historically constantly reminded of the pecking order of an academic institution. The lower one finds oneself in this pecking order the longer it takes to obtain feedback from the academic staff. This was not the case with Alan (Professor Brent). As a student there is then no greater compliment than to say that I got quick feedback irrespective of Alan’s work load or where he found himself in the world. The feedback provided was also of value and aided in completion of this research. I can then recommend Alan as a promoter to other students and can only hope that we work together in the future.

Professor Herman Steyn also needs mention for his unselfish feedback and input to the research. Whenever Alan and I got stuck we had the proverbial “reasonable man” (“reasonable researcher” in our case) to ask for advice.

To the administrative staff at the University of Pretoria for doing an unappreciated job exceptionally well. Marlene Mulder is especially thanked for her efforts.

### **On a personal note:**

This PhD was done to repay a debt - a debt to my friends that did not have the opportunity of tertiary education. Some did not have the financial means or stable family life that enables one for further education. Some simply did not have the ability. I would like to name you to eternalize you in the same sense that this work is now eternalized, but you are not the type of people who ever sought public recognition. In your small town lives with small dreams you found serenity not attainable by academic or financial success. This I realize

now. I consider each time I struggled during this research as an insult to you. For insulting you I humbly apologize.

To God, the Holy Trinity, for not being as impatient with me as I am with Him.

To my parents (Christo and Nita) for enabling me to pursue this study. In the end there is no project as cumbersome and complex as the project management of children. And no book, no PhD, will ever encompass this field.

To Christo and Sanet for reading the articles that were produced by this research and looking interested. To Stefan and Colyn for letting us experience the world once more as untainted and new – with eyes that only children can offer adults.

Looking back over the years some of the best memories involved my grandparents. When I thought about it the memories were so great because my grandparents never confined my thinking to reality and my imagination could roam free. An unattainable dream then became a mere thought away. In the same sense a PhD is considered by most to be so exclusive and so unattainable. The reality was that it was then only a thought away. The dreaming then propagated quite naturally into adulthood. This I owe to my grandparents.

To Doctor Andrew Gill. (a.k.a. the Gillamonster). It is an honour calling you 'doctor', my friend. Andrew who was born into socio-economic hardship. Andrew that obtained a tertiary education against all odds. And then reaching the pinnacle of his field as a doctor. Andrew who did not blame his circumstances on his family, society, the government or God. You put all of us born into means to shame and inspire everyone that has far less. Nice going, Andy.

To the friends that passed away. I will never forget you, but I have to move on. I have to silence my demons because nothing buried alive will ever die.

## Table of Contents

<b>Chapter 1: Introduction and background .....</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1. Climate change and the Kyoto Protocol's Clean Development Mechanism (CDM) .	1
1.2. The CDM: A Project Based Approach .....	2
1.3. Rationale of the research.....	5
1.4. Related theory .....	8
1.5. Problem Statement and Research Objectives.....	17
1.6. Benefits of aligning CDM project management with standard project lifecycle phases.....	19
1.7. Importance of the research problem.....	19
1.8. Limitations and assumptions of the study.....	20
1.9. Proposed research approach and strategy .....	21
<b>Chapter 2: Investigating the risk management potential of a stage/phase-gate project management approach .....</b>	<b>22</b>
2.1 Introduction .....	22
2.2 Project lifecycle stages and phases .....	24
2.3 The risk management potential of stage/phase-gate models.....	32
2.4 An exploratory case study to illustrate the risk management potential of stage/phase-gate models.....	33
2.5 Chapter conclusions .....	42
<b>Chapter 3: Investigating the need for a Clean Development Mechanism (CDM) specific stage/phase-gate project management strategy .....</b>	<b>43</b>
3.1 Introduction .....	43
3.2 CDM opportunities for South Africa and Africa.....	43
3.3 Engaging the South African CDM industry .....	45
3.4 Proposed CDM project management model - Model $\alpha$ .....	48
3.5 Layout transformation .....	53
3.6 Model $\alpha$ layout transformation .....	55
3.7 Further discussion and clarification of Model $\alpha$ .....	57
3.8 Potential inefficiencies of the developed stage-gate Model $\alpha$ .....	59
<b>Chapter 4: Validation of Model <math>\alpha</math>.....</b>	<b>61</b>
4.1 Introduction .....	61
4.2 Background on case study research .....	62
4.3 Case study approach.....	66
4.4 Discussion of case study protocol steps.....	66
4.5 Discussion of the proposed project management model of Case Study 1.....	77
4.6 Discussion of the proposed project management model of Case Study 2.....	81
4.7 Discussion of the proposed project management model of Case Study 3.....	83
4.8 Discussion of the reconciled model – Model $\beta$ .....	85
4.9 Overall results, conclusions and next steps .....	87
<b>Chapter 5: External validity of Model <math>\beta</math> .....</b>	<b>88</b>
5.1 Discussion on the answered questionnaires and identified trends .....	89
5.2 Experts' input on what is considered to be the success and failure criteria for CDM projects.....	95
5.3 Expert comment on the proposed CDM model (Model $\beta$ ) regarding applicability, completeness, practicality, areas that are unclear or any other comment.....	97
<b>Chapter 6: Conclusions and future work .....</b>	<b>98</b>
<b>References .....</b>	<b>102</b>
<b>Appendixes .....</b>	<b>112</b>
Appendix A: Discussion of Cooper (2000) on the Stage-Gate process.....	112
Appendix B: Financial considerations of illustrative case study.....	115



Appendix C: Details of the case study stage investigations.....	117
Appendix D: 1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> Questionnaire.....	118
Appendix E: Summary of the 1 <sup>st</sup> Questionnaire .....	121
Appendix F: Complete representation of Model $\alpha$ .....	122
Appendix G: Input received from Designated National Authority (DNA).....	129
Appendix H: Summary of Case study 1 (Animal waste management) .....	132
Appendix I: Summary of Case study 2 (Energy efficiency) .....	134
Appendix J: Summary of Case study 3 (Mine methane capture).....	135



## List of Figures

- Figure 1.1: Flow diagram of CDM process and party involvement  
Figure 1.2: Barrier analysis of CDM process  
Figure 1.3: Generalized project management sequence  
Figure 1.4: Grouping historical investigations into the project management landscape of the CDM  
Figure 1.5: Research problem statement and objectives  
Figure 1.6: Strategy of the research study
- Figure 2.1: Comprehensive Stage Gate Project Management Model (SGPMM) as suggested by Cooper (2001)  
Figure 2.2: The gate structure as proposed by Cooper (2001)  
Figure 2.3: Adaptation of Cooper's (2001) view on risk  
Figure 2.4: Comparing development and operational cost of a newly developed control system with the costs of an existing control system  
Figure 2.5: Binary decision tree representation of the case study
- Figure 3.1: Stage-gate Model  $\alpha$  for CDM project management  
Figure 3.2: Conversion of normal stage/phase-gate representation to the representation used in the models  
Figure 3.3: Model  $\alpha$
- Figure 4.1: Summary of Yin's (2004) view on case study types  
Figure 4.2: Order of case study research steps  
Figure 4.3: Illustration of how unit of analysis and case studies fit in the research space  
Figure 4.4: Euclidean length approach to phase consolidation  
Figure 4.5: The view of the interviewed expert of Case Study 1 on the split between Stage/Phase-Gate execution and parallel concurrent ranking  
Figure 4.6: Case Study 1  
Figure 4.7: Case Study 2  
Figure 4.8: Case Study 3  
Figure 4.9: Model  $\beta$

## List of Tables

- Table 1.1: Additional project management steps required in the CDM process
- Table 2.1: Phases in the project lifecycle
- Table 2.2: The proposed "must meet" and "should meet" structure of Cooper et al. (2000)
- Table 2.3: Addressing concerns raised by critics of a staged/phased-gate process
- Table 3.1: Summary on comments regarding CDM project management models used and why the specific model is in use
- Table 3.2: Phase objectives, Go/Kill and Ranking criteria for Phase 2 of Model  $\alpha$ : Feasibility assessment
- Table 5.1: Percentage of expertise as provided by respondents of 1st and 2nd questionnaire
- Table 5.2: Breakdown of perceived bottlenecks in successful completion of a CDM project – comparing answers of the 1st questionnaire with the 2nd questionnaire
- Table 5.3: High level perceived bottlenecks in successful completion of a CDM project
- Table 5.4: Summary of how the Respondents' comments were taken into account

## List of Abbreviations

CDM	Clean Development Mechanism
CER	Certified Emission Reduction
COP	Conference Of the Parties
DME	Department of Minerals and Energy, replaced by Department of Energy
DNA	Designated National Authority
DOE	Designated Operational Entity
EB	Executive Board
GHG	Green House Gas
GWP	Global Warming Potential
IPCC	Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
PDD	Project Design Document
PIN	Project Identification Note
PMBOK	Project Management Body of Knowledge
PP	Project Proponent
SA CDM IA	South African Clean Development Mechanism Industry Association
SD	Sustainable Development
UN	United Nations
UNFCCC	United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
VER	Verified/Voluntary Emission Reduction