

**A reading of power relations
in the transformation of urban planning
in the municipalities of the
Greater Pretoria region
(now Tshwane): 1992 - 2002**

P J van V Coetzee

July 2005

**A READING OF POWER RELATIONS
IN THE TRANSFORMATION OF URBAN PLANNING
IN THE MUNICIPALITIES OF THE
GREATER PRETORIA REGION
(NOW TSHWANE): 1992 - 2002**

by

Petrus Johannes van Vuuren Coetzee

Supervisor: Prof M C Oranje

**Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for
the degree Doctor Philisophiae (Town and Regional Planning)
in the Faculty of Engineering, Built Environment and Information Technology**

University of Pretoria

Pretoria

South Africa

July 2005

for Karien

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank the following people who have contributed to this study:

- Prof Mark Oranje, for his guidance and support.
- The staff of the Town and Regional Planning Department of the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality for their continued interest and support.
- Those family members, friends and colleagues who believed in me and supported me throughout this endeavour.
- All those who gave up their time to participate in my interviews, surveys and sometimes-nasty interrogations.
- The staff of the Academic Information Service of the University of Pretoria for their assistance.
- Wilma Henrico for assisting me with the final formatting and technical finish of the report.

Lastly, I would like to thank my Lord for providing me with this wonderful opportunity and the guts to complete this study.

PREFACE

Approximately two million years ago the earliest known hominids (predecessors of modern human beings) lived in the Greater Pretoria/Tshwane¹ area at the Sterkfontein and Swartkrans Caves - an area today known as '*the cradle of humankind*' or the area where humankind began. Since the Early Stone Age times, some 200 000 years ago, *Homo sapiens* and their predecessors have inhabited the Pretoria/Tshwane area in the vicinity of Wonderboompoort in the Magaliesberg where there was an abundance of edible plants and game for hunting.

With the arrival of the Iron Age about 1 800 years ago, the population profile of the Tshwane area changed dramatically. These people were mainly cattle herders, cultivators and hunters. Their principle industries were iron smelting and the making of pottery. Pottery found in the Groenkloof Nature Reserve is associated with the so-called Moloko tradition of the early Setswana-speaking societies. The Iron Age inhabitants were later followed by the Setswana-speaking people who settled in the west of Pretoria and the Ndebele-speaking people who settled in the north-east of Pretoria. During the early decades of the 19th century these people were dislodged by the Ndebele of Mzilikazi who came from Natal to settle on the banks of the Apies River. In c.1833, Mzilikazi moved to the former Western Transvaal.

It was more or less during this time that the first white travellers entered this area. They were known as the *Voortrekkers* (pioneer settlers). Lucas Bronkhorst is generally accepted to have been the first white pioneer to settle in the vicinity of Pretoria during the 1840s². He settled on the farm Groenkloof. Pretoria was established on 16 November 1855. It was declared the capital of the Zuid-Afrikaansche Republic on 1 May 1860. In 1864 the first attempts were made to establish a *dorpsraad* (town council) and the first permanent council was elected in 1903³.

During the past 150 years Pretoria has developed from a small rural settlement into a significant metropolitan area with a population of 2.2 million inhabitants. This makes it one of the largest metropolitan areas in South Africa⁴.

¹ Pretoria was named after Marthinus Wessel Pretorius, its founder and son of Voortrekker Andries Pretorius. After the transformation of the local government on 6 December 2000, the local authority was renamed the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality (CTMM). Since then reference was also made to the *City of Tshwane* - although the name change was (in May 2005) not yet formally approved by the various authorities. Within the context of this study, reference is made interchangeably to *the City of Tshwane* in the present state, or *the former City of Pretoria* when referring to the old dispensation. The word Tshwane is derived from the word *Tshwana*, which means '*we are the same/we are one because we live together*' (Tindall 2000).

² See van Schalkwyk (1993).

³ See Tindall (2000).

⁴ Information obtained from the Department of Town and Regional Planning of the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality in 2003.

The City of Tshwane, is in many ways a city of contrasts. On the one hand, this city is well known for its abundance of state-of-the-art educational and research institutions; its strong economic base; its unique natural 'bushveld' environment; its diverse cultures; its excellent living conditions and the quality of its environment; as well as the illustrious Union Buildings, which designate Pretoria's capital city status.

On the other hand, this city, was previously (prior to the government transformation in 1994), seen and branded as the apartheid capital, with its overly conservative bureaucracy, the so-called Afrikaner *boere*-state. It was also here that Nelson Mandela was tried some 40 years ago. In 1994, Mandela was inaugurated in Pretoria as the first President of the 'new South Africa'. Since this transformation, the City of Pretoria/Tshwane's function as the administrative capital of South Africa and home of the President has been reinstated.

Today the new City of Tshwane is transforming itself and is developing into one of the smarter cities in the country. Reference is often made to terms such as the renaissance of Pretoria, or the rebirth of Tshwane.

CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1	
RATIONALE AND SCOPE OF THE STUDY	1
CHAPTER 2	
THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK FOR ANALYSIS	6
2.1 Introduction	6
2.2 Understanding “planning and power”	7
2.3 Contextualising the social fabric in the lifeworld	10
2.4 Machiavelli and Foucault on power	11
2.5 Power and rationality - and the power of (communicative) rationality	16
2.6 A framework for analysis	19
CHAPTER 3	
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	20
3.1 Emerging research methodologies within “the postmodern”	20
3.2 The practice movement, phronesis and power	22
3.3 Exploring the practice and powers in the City of Tshwane through naturalistic case study research	24
3.4 Analysing and theorising the case study data	29
3.5 Research integrity, validity and trustworthiness	31
3.6 The narrative: research tool and story	34

CHAPTER 4

**THE CONTEXTUAL REALITIES THAT INFORMED, SHAPED AND FRAMED THE
TRANSFORMATION OF URBAN PLANNING IN THE MUNICIPALITIES OF THE GREATER
PRETORIA/TSHWANE REGION DURING THE PERIOD 1992 TO 2002** **38**

4.1	Setting the scene	38
4.2	The patriarchal planning system in South Africa	39
4.3	Community participation	42
4.4	The unfolding social awareness in urban planning	45
4.5	The consolidation of (urban) strategic planning	46
4.6	The “sustainable” environmental agenda	49
4.7	Urban planning and management	51
4.8	Concluding remarks	53

CHAPTER 5

**A NARRATIVE ON THE TRANSFORMATION OF URBAN PLANNING
IN THE MUNICIPALITIES OF THE GREATER PRETORIA REGION
(NOW TSHWANE) DURING THE PERIOD 1992 TO 2002** **55**

5.1	The City of Tshwane: Opportunity from disaster	55
5.2	Utopia and science f(r)iction <i>The old planning system in the City of Pretoria (before the transformation in the 1990s)</i>	56
5.3	A new (dis)course on urban planning in the City of Pretoria <i>The beginnings of a new integrated approach to planning in the former City Council of Pretoria (1992)</i>	68

5.4	Some things/people will never change <i>The transformation of the former City Council of Pretoria's planning department (1993/1994)</i>	74
5.5	The dawn of 'the new South Africa' <i>The effect of the government transformation on urban planning in the Greater Pretoria region: 1994 onwards</i>	79
5.6	A new planning model embedded in holism <i>Environmental Management Programme for Pretoria (EMPRET): 1994 to 1995</i>	84
5.7	"Cherish the heart of the city" <i>The Pretoria Inner City Process: February 1996 to February 1997</i>	92
5.8	Three cities - one plan(ner) <i>The LDO process followed in the Greater Pretoria Metropolitan Area: February 1996 to February 1997</i>	112
5.9	The more things change; the more they stay the same <i>The introduction of Integrated Development Planning (IDP): 1997</i>	114
5.10	Planners rising from the ashes <i>Preparing for the IDP processes: February 1997 to June 1997</i>	119
5.11	The IDP process in practice: confusion, conflict and critique <i>The IDP process followed in the City of Pretoria: July 1997 to June 1998</i>	139
5.12	"The plan is coming together" <i>Finalising and approving the IDP: January to March 1998</i>	152
5.13	The IDP takes a nose dive <i>Implementing the IDP: July 1998 to July 1999</i>	158
5.14	"Quite frankly, Mike, we've had enough" <i>More legislation and government directions on city planning and local government: 1998 to 2001</i>	169

5.15	“Making the ship turn” <i>The ‘strategic thrust approach’ developed by the former City Council of Pretoria’s IDP task team (1999)</i>	173
------	--	-----

5.16	The rebirth of Tshwane <i>The establishment of the new City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality: 6 December 2000</i>	179
------	--	-----

5.17	The Exodus	193
------	------------	-----

CHAPTER 6

REFLECTING ON THE TRANS[FORMATION], THE TRANS[FORMED] AND TRANS[FORMING] URBAN PLANNING SYSTEM IN THE CITY OF TSHWANE	197
--	------------

CHAPTER 7

CONCLUSION	206
-------------------	------------

ANNEXURE A: PERCEPTION SURVEY

ANNEXURE B: DISCUSSION/INTERVIEW FRAMEWORK

ANNEXURE C: CHRONOLOGY

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

LIST OF FIGURES

LIST OF WORKS CONSULTED