

10



UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

**A STUDY OF AFFIRMATIVE ACTION AND EMPLOYMENT EQUITY
IN HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS IN KWAZULU-NATAL**

by

PREGLATHAN GOPAUL PADAYACHEE
B A B A(Hons) B Ed M Ed STD .

submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR

in the

Faculty of Education

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

PROMOTER : PROFESSOR D R BAGWANDEEN

JANUARY 2003



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My sincere appreciation and thanks are due to all those who assisted me to complete this thesis, more especially the following :

Professor D R Bagwandeem, my promoter, for his invaluable suggestions and for the untold hours spent reading the numerous drafts of the entire manuscript. His sense of dedication, thoroughness, expert supervision and his faith in my ability spurred me on to complete the project.

The academic as well as the senior executive management staff of the six Higher Education Institutions in KwaZulu-Natal, without whose co-operation this project would not have been possible.

My father-in-law, Mr V Poonan, a retired psychologist and teacher of English for proof-reading the document and also offering valuable insights and suggestions.

Mr Dev Naidoo, a retired school principal and Senior Certificate Matriculation Examiner of English, for also proof-reading the thesis.

Miss I Naidoo of Computer Services, University of Durban-Westville, who so willingly helped with the computer programming and data analysis.

Mrs Lorraine Rajagopal for her assistance in typing this thesis at short notice.

My wife, Professor Anshu Padayachee, for the encouragement she gave me throughout the project.

My children Levanya, Sumesh and Sandile who challenged me into completing the Ph D before they did.

My late mum, Mrs Pungee Padayachee, who from a very early age and under difficult circumstances, single handedly provided me with the necessary educational foundation.



DEDICATED TO :

MY LATE MUM

PUNGEE

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS USED

AA	:	Affirmative Action
AAA	:	Affirmative Action Agency
AACC	:	Affirmative Action Consultative Committee
AA/EE	:	Affirmative Action/Employment Equity
AA/EEO	:	Affirmative Action/Equal Employment Opportunity
AA/EEO Act	:	Affirmative Action (Equal Employment Opportunity for Women) Act of 1986
AA/EO	:	Affirmative Action/Equal Opportunities
AAUP	:	American Association of University Professors
ACE	:	American Council on Education
AFC	:	Americans for a Fair Chance
AGPS	:	Australian Government Printing Services
ANC	:	African National Congress
ASAHDI	:	Association of Vice-Chancellors of Historically Disadvantaged Institutions in South Africa
ATN	:	Australian Technology Network
AVCC	:	The Australian Vice-Chancellors Committee
BB	:	Broederbond
BC	:	Backward Classes
BLOEMT	:	Bloemfontein Technikon
BT	:	Border Technikon
B Tech	:	Bachelor of Technology
CASC	:	Council for the Advancement of Small Colleges

CATEs	:	Colleges for Advanced Technical Education
CCMA	:	Commission for Conciliation, Mediation and Arbitration
CCPSHE	:	Carnegie Council on Policy Studies in Higher Education
CHE	:	Council on Higher Education
CHET	:	Centre for Higher Education Transformation
CNE	:	Christian National Education
CNN	:	Cable News Network
COSATU	:	Congress of South African Trade Unions
CPD	:	Continuous Professional Development
CRSA	:	The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa
CT	:	Cape Technikon
CTC	:	Cape Technical College
DEETYA	:	Department of Employment, Education, Training and Youth Affairs
DEU	:	Distance Education University
DG	:	Designated Group
DOE	:	Department of Education
DOL	:	Department of Labour
D Tech	:	Doctor of Technology
ECT	:	Eastern Cape Technikon
EE	:	Employment Equity
EEA	:	Employment Equity Act
EEO	:	Equal Employment Opportunity

EEOC	:	Equal Employment Opportunity Commission
EO	:	Executive Order
EOPHEA	:	Equal Opportunity Practitioners in Higher Education in Australasia
EWP	:	Education White Paper
FCP	:	Federal Contractors Program
GETT	:	Gender Equity Task Team
GO	:	Government Order
HAIs	:	Historically Advantaged Institutions
HATs	:	Historically Advantaged Technikons
HAUs	:	Historically Advantaged Universities
HBIs	:	Historically Black Institutions
HBTs	:	Historically Black Technikons
HBUs	:	Historically Black Universities
HDI	:	Historically Disadvantaged Institutions
HDTs	:	Historically Disadvantaged Technikons
HDU	:	Historically Disadvantaged Universities
HE	:	Higher Education
HEA	:	Higher Education Act
HEIs	:	Higher Education Institutions
HEW	:	USA Department of Health, Education and Welfare
HIV	:	Human Immunodeficiency Virus
HR	:	Human Resources
HSRC	:	Human Sciences Research Council

HWAUs	:	Historically White Afrikaans-Medium Universities
HWEUs	:	Historically White English-Medium Universities
HWIs	:	Historically White Institutions
HWTs	:	Historically White Technikons
HWUs	:	Historically White Universities
ICS	:	Indian Central Secretariat
IDASA	:	Institute for Democracy in South Africa
IEU	:	Independent Educational Union of Australia
INSET	:	In-service Education and Training
KZN	:	KwaZulu-Natal
M Ed	:	Master of Education
MEDUNSA	:	Medical University of South Africa
MLST	:	M L Sultan Technikon
MT	:	Mangosuthu Technikon
M Tech	:	Master's Degree in Technology
NAACP	:	National Association for the Advancement of Colored People
NCHE	:	National Commission on Higher Education
NDG	:	Non-designated group
NGOs	:	Non-Governmental Organizations
NORTH	:	University of the North
NP	:	Nationalist Party
NWT	:	North West Technikon
OBC	:	Other Backward Classes

OCR	:	Office for Civil Rights
OFCCP	:	Office of Federal Contract Compliance Programs
OSW	:	The Commonwealth Office for the Status of Women
PAC	:	Pan African Congress
PD	:	Positive Discrimination
Pentech	:	Peninsula Technikon
Ph D	:	Doctor of Philosophy
Potch	:	Potchefstroom University
POW	:	Perception of Witwatersrand University
PT	:	Pretoria Technikon
RAU	:	Rand Afrikaans University
RCA	:	Report of the Constitutional Assembly
RDP	:	Reconstruction and Development Programme
RICP	:	Regional Institutional Cooperation Project
RMIT	:	Royal Melbourne Institute of Technology
RSA	:	Republic of South Africa
SA	:	South Africa
SAPSE	:	South African Post Secondary Education
SAQA	:	South African Qualifications Authority
SCs	:	Scheduled Castes
SCAPTL	:	Senate Committee on Appointment, Promotion, Tenure and Leave
SERTEC	:	The Certification Council for Technical Education

SPSS	:	Statistical Package for Social Sciences
STs	:	Scheduled Tribes
SWAPO	:	South West African Peoples Organization
TN	:	Technikon Natal
TNG	:	Technikon Northern Gauteng
TSA	:	Technikon South Africa
TT	:	Transvaal Technikon
UA	:	University of South Australia
UCGH	:	University of the Cape of Good Hope
UCLA	:	University of California, Los Angeles
UCT	:	University of Cape Town
UDUSA	:	Union of Democratic University Staff Associations
UDW	:	University of Durban-Westville
UGC	:	University Grants Commission
UN	:	University of Natal
UNIBO	:	University of Bophuthatswana
UNISA	:	University of South Africa
UNITRA	:	University of Transkei
UNIZUL	:	University of Zululand
UNO	:	United Nations Organization
UP	:	University of Pretoria
UPE	:	University of Port Elizabeth
US	:	United States
USA	:	United States of America

USCCR	:	The United States Commission on Civil Rights
USDE	:	United States Department of Education
UWC	:	University of Western Cape
UWS	:	University of Western Sydney
VENDA	:	University of Venda
VISTA	:	Vista University
VT	:	Vaal Triangle Technikon
WEAL	:	Women's Equity Action League
WexDev	:	Women's Executive Development Programme
WIN	:	Women's Issues Network
WITS	:	University of The Witwatersrand
WITST	:	Witwatersrand Technikon

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>PAGE</u>
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	i
DEDICATION	ii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS USED	iii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	x
LIST OF TABLES	xxiii
LIST OF FIGURES	xxv
LIST OF APPENDICES	xxix
SUMMARY	xxx
CHAPTER ONE : ORIENTATION	
1.1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.2 BACKGROUND AND MOTIVATION FOR THE STUDY	4
1.3 THE RESEARCH PROBLEM	12
1.4 AIMS OF THE PRESENT RESEARCH	13
1.5 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	14
1.5.1 Nature of the Study	14
1.5.2 Methods of Data Collection	15
1.5.2.1 The questionnaire	16
1.5.2.2 The interview schedule	17
1.5.2.3 Content analysis	17
1.5.2.4 Documentary study	17
1.6 WORKING DEFINITION OF TERMS	18
1.7 STRUCTURE OF THE THESIS	21

**CHAPTER TWO : THE NATURE AND SCOPE OF AFFIRMATIVE
ACTION : A THEORETICAL AND CONCEPTUAL
FRAMEWORK**

2.1	INTRODUCTION	23
2.2	THE MEANING OF AFFIRMATIVE ACTION	23
2.3	DISCRIMINATION AND NON-DISCRIMINATION	34
2.4	REVERSE DISCRIMINATION	36
2.5	PREFERENTIAL TREATMENT	38
2.6	GOALS AND QUOTAS	40
2.7	THE POSTULATE OF EQUALITY	44
2.8	AFFIRMATIVE ACTION AND JUSTICE	52
2.9	AFFIRMATIVE ACTION AND THE QUESTION OF MERIT AND QUALIFICATIONS	54
2.10	AFFIRMATIVE ACTION AND EMPLOYMENT EQUITY	58
2.11	AFFIRMATIVE ACTION AND TOKENISM	60
2.12	AFFIRMATIVE ACTION AND THE QUESTION OF ENTITLEMENT	64
2.13	AFFIRMATIVE ACTION: TOWARDS A DEFINITION FOR THE PRESENT STUDY	66
2.14	CONCLUSION	67

**CHAPTER THREE : PERCEPTIONS, ATTITUDES AND
CHALLENGES RELATED TO
AFFIRMATIVE ACTION AND
EMPLOYMENT EQUITY**

3.1	INTRODUCTION	71
3.2	THE AFFIRMATIVE ACTION DEBATE	72
3.2.1	Arguments Against Affirmative Action	75
3.2.2	Arguments for Affirmative Action	78

	<u>PAGE</u>
3.3 CHALLENGES AND CONSTRAINTS FACING AFFIRMATIVE ACTION/EMPLOYMENT EQUITY	88
3.4 THE POSITIVE IMPACT OF AFFIRMATIVE ACTION ON SOCIETY	96
3.5 CONCLUSION	98
CHAPTER 4 : A HISTORICO-COMPARATIVE STUDY OF AFFIRMATIVE ACTION POLICIES AND PROCEDURES IN SELECTED DEVELOPED AND DEVELOPING COUNTRIES	
4.1 INTRODUCTION	103
4.2 AFFIRMATIVE ACTION IN THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA (USA)	105
4.2.1 Strategies Employed to Achieve Equal Employment Opportunity in Higher Education in the USA	112
4.2.1.1 Executive Orders (EO)	112
4.2.1.2 Federal Agencies	114
4.2.1.3 The Higher Education Division of the Office For Civil Rights (OCR) in the US Department of Education	115
4.2.1.4 The US Commission on Civil Rights (USCCR)	119
4.2.2 Institutions and their Affirmative Action Plans	121
4.2.3 Group Action and Individual Action as Strategies to end Employment Discrimination in Higher Education	127
4.2.4 The Impact of Affirmative Action on the Progress of Women and Minorities (Previously Disadvantaged) in Higher Education	131
4.2.5 Reasons for the Differences in Higher Education Employment between the Previously Disadvantaged and Advantaged in the USA	137

	<u>PAGE</u>
4.2.6 Recommendations for more Effective Implementation of Affirmative Action Policies in the USA	141
4.2.7 Some Reactions and Resistance to Affirmative Action in Higher Education Employment in the USA	143
4.2.7.1 The Academic Community Response to Affirmative Action	148
4.2.8 The Need for Continuing Affirmative Action in the USA	154
4.2.9 Summation	157
4.2.10 Implications of Affirmative Action in the USA for South Africa	160
4.3 AFFIRMATIVE ACTION IN AUSTRALIA	164
4.3.1 Introduction	164
4.3.2 Anti-discrimination Legislation in Australia	164
4.3.2.1 Commonwealth and State Anti-discrimination Legislation	165
4.3.3 Background to the Affirmative Action (Equal Employment Opportunity for Women) Act of 1986	167
4.3.4 The Definition of Affirmative Action in the Australian Context	168
4.3.5 The Affirmative Action (Equal Employment Opportunity for Women) Act, 1986 (The AA/EEO Act)	169
4.3.6 The Affirmative Action Agency	172
4.3.7 The (Eight Step) Affirmative Action Programme	173
4.3.7.1 The Impact of the Affirmative Action Act (The Eight Step Programme) on Higher Education	174
4.3.7.1.1 Issuing of Policy Statement Regarding Commencement of Affirmative Action Programme	174
4.3.7.1.2 Consulting with Trade Unions and with Employees, especially Women	175

	<u>PAGE</u>
4.3.7.1.3	Setting Objectives and Making Forward Estimates 176
4.3.7.1.4	Conferring Responsibility for Programme on a Person with Sufficient Authority and Status 176
4.3.7.1.5	Monitoring and Analysis of Gender Patterning 177
4.3.7.1.6	The Collection of Data 177
4.3.7.1.7	Monitoring and Evaluation of Programme 178
4.3.8	Examples of National Affirmative Action Provisions for the Advancement of Women 178
4.3.8.1	Register of Senior University Women 178
4.3.8.2	The Colloquium of Senior Women Executives in Australian Higher Education 179
4.3.8.3	Network of Equal Opportunity Practitioners in Higher Education in Australasia (EOPHEA) 179
4.3.8.4	The Australian Technology Network (ATN) Women's Programme 180
4.3.9	Examples of Affirmative Action Provisions for the Advancement of Women within Institutions of Higher Education 181
4.3.9.1	University Women's Consultative Committee (University of South Australia) 181
4.3.9.2	Affirmative Action Consultative Committee (AACC) 182
4.3.9.3	Gender Representation Initiatives on University Governance/Decision-Making Committees 182
4.3.9.4	Affirmative Action and Mentoring Initiatives 184
4.3.9.5	Affirmative Action, Women and Research Initiatives 185
4.3.9.6	Women and the Merit Principle Initiatives 186
4.3.10	The Impact of AA/EEO Policies on the Progress of Women in Higher Education 188

	<u>PAGE</u>
4.3.11 Cultural Barriers to Progress among Women in Higher Education	191
4.3.11.1 The Masculine Culture at Institutions of Higher Education	192
4.3.11.2 Workloads	193
4.3.11.3 The Research Culture	194
4.3.11.4 Participation in Decision- Making	195
4.3.12 Reactions to Affirmative Action	196
4.3.13 Summation	199
4.3.14 Implications of Affirmative Action in Australia for South Africa	201
4.4 AFFIRMATIVE ACTION IN CANADA	204
4.4.1 Introduction	204
4.4.2 The Federal Contractors Program (FCP)	205
4.4.2.1 Management Commitment to Employment Equity (EE)	206
4.4.2.2 Responsibility for Employment Equity	209
4.4.2.3 Analysis of Employment Status Data and Salary	210
4.4.2.4 Employment Systems Review	211
4.4.2.5 Equity Goals	215
4.4.2.6 The Employment Equity Work Plan	217
4.4.2.7 Special Measures to ensure that goals are achieved	218
4.4.2.8 Monitoring Employment Equity Initiatives and Compliance	219
4.4.3 Summation	221
4.4.4 Implications of Affirmative Action in Canada for South Africa	222
4.5 AFFIRMATIVE ACTION IN ZIMBABWE	224
4.5.1 Summation	236

	<u>PAGE</u>
4.5.2 Implications of Affirmative Action in Zimbabwe for South Africa	238
4.6 AFFIRMATIVE ACTION IN NAMIBIA	243
4.6.1 Summation	250
4.6.2 Implications of Affirmative Action in Namibia for South Africa	251
4.7 AFFIRMATIVE ACTION IN INDIA	253
4.7.1 Summation	274
4.7.2 Implications of Affirmative Action in India for South Africa	276
4.8 CONCLUSION	284

**CHAPTER FIVE : A HISTORICO-COMPARATIVE STUDY OF
AFFIRMATIVE ACTION AND EMPLOYMENT
EQUITY IN SOUTH AFRICA**

5.1 INTRODUCTION	293
5.2 APARTHEID HIGHER EDUCATION LEGACY	293
5.3 THE ACADEMIC RESPONSE TO AFFIRMATIVE ACTION	306
5.4 STATE INITIATIVES TO ENSURE TRANSFORMATION OF HIGHER EDUCATION	316
5.4.1 The Constitution of The Republic of South Africa	316
5.4.2 The Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP)	318
5.4.3 The Green Paper on Higher Education	319
5.4.4 The Education White Paper (EWP) 3 of 1997	319
5.4.5 The Higher Education Act No. 101 of 1977 (HEA)	327
5.4.6 The Employment Equity Act (EEA) No. 55 of 1998 [Department of Labour (DOL), 1998]	328

5.4.6.1	The Legal Obligation Regarding Affirmative Action	331
5.4.6.1.1	Duties of a Designated Employer	331
5.4.6.1.2	Affirmative Action Measures	331
5.4.6.1.3	Consultation	332
5.4.6.1.4	Analysis	332
5.4.6.1.5	The Employment Equity Plan	333
5.4.6.1.6	Reports	333
5.5	CONCLUSION	333

CHAPTER SIX : ATTITUDES AND PERCEPTIONS OF PRACTICE AND PROCEDURES RELATED TO AFFIRMATIVE ACTION (AA) AND EMPLOYMENT EQUITY (EE) IN HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS IN KWAZULU-NATAL (KZN): FINDINGS OF THE PRESENT STUDY

6.1	INTRODUCTION	336
6.2	CHOICE OF LOCALE	337
6.3	INSTRUMENTS USED IN THE SURVEY	337
6.3.1	Development of the Questionnaire	339
6.3.2	Structure of the Questionnaire	341
6.3.3	The Personal Interview	342
6.3.4	Covering Letter	343
6.4	SAMPLING PROCEDURE	344
6.4.1	Selection of Institutions	344
6.4.2	Selection of Respondents	344
6.5	CONTROL OF QUESTIONNAIRES - DESPATCH AND RETURN	345
6.6	LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY	346

6.7	CONTROL PRECAUTION	347
6.8	ANALYSIS OF DATA AND INTERPRETATION OF RESULTS	347
6.8.1	BIOGRAPHICAL DETAILS OF RESPONDENTS	350
6.8.2	ACADEMIC STAFF PERCEPTIONS OF THE PRINCIPLES/CONCEPTS RELATED TO AFFIRMATIVE ACTION(AA)/EMPLOYMENT EQUITY(EE)	352
6.8.2.1	Composition of the 'Designated Group' in Affirmative Action/Employment Equity Programmes	353
6.8.2.2	Affirmative Action and Reverse Discrimination	362
6.8.2.3	Affirmative Action and Tokenism	365
6.8.2.4	Affirmative Action and Entitlement	367
6.8.2.5	Equality of Opportunity vs Equity in the Context of Affirmative Action/Employment Equity	369
6.8.2.6	Affirmative Action/Employment Equity and 'Degrees of Disadvantage'	373
6.8.2.7	Affirmative Action/Employment Equity Efforts based on Potential to Succeed and not Academic Merit alone	375
6.8.2.8	Affirmative Action/Employment Equity and Rigid Quotas	377
6.8.2.9	Affirmative Action/Employment Equity and the 'Goals and Timetable Strategy'	381
6.8.3	KNOWLEDGE, AWARENESS AND DISSEMINATION OF AFFIRMATIVE ACTION/EMPLOYMENT EQUITY POLICY	384
6.8.4	ACADEMIC STAFF SATISFACTION WITH THE IMPLEMENTATION, COMMUNICATION AND SUCCESS OF AFFIRMATIVE ACTION/EMPLOYMENT EQUITY EFFORTS	391
6.8.4.1	Satisfaction with the Success of Affirmative Action/Employment Equity Efforts	391
6.8.4.2	Satisfaction with the Communication of Affirmative Action/ Employment Equity Efforts	393

	<u>PAGE</u>
6.8.4.3	Satisfaction with the Manner in which Affirmative Action/ Employment Equity is Implemented..... 395
6.8.4.4	Affirmative Action/Employment Equity and the Promotion of a New System of Inequalities 397
6.8.5	INSTITUTIONAL STRUCTURES AND ORGANIZATIONAL ARRANGEMENTS RELATED TO AFFIRMATIVE ACTION/ EMPLOYMENT EQUITY 400
6.8.5.1	Staff Development/Mentoring Programmes 402
6.8.5.2	Written and Communicated Affirmative Action/Employment Equity Plan 404
6.8.5.3	Monitoring and Evaluation of Affirmative Action/Employment Equity Plan 405
6.8.5.4	Equity Surveys 408
6.8.5.5	Dissemination of Affirmative Action/Employment Equity Progress Reports 409
6.8.5.6	Grievance Procedures Related to Affirmative Action/Employment Equity Plan 411
6.8.6	MANAGEMENT, CONTROL AND MONITORING 413
6.8.7	INSTITUTIONAL ISSUES RELATED TO AFFIRMATIVE ACTION/EMPLOYMENT EQUITY 418
6.8.7.1	Commitment to Affirmative Action/Employment Equity 418
6.8.7.2	The Institution as a Fair and Equitable Place to Work 420
6.8.7.3	Sincerity of Affirmative Action/Employment Equity Efforts at Institutions 422
6.8.7.4	Diverse Workforce at Institutions of Higher Education 425
6.8.7.5	White Academic Staff Resentment towards Preference for Designated Groups 429

6.8.7.6	Top Management as Driver of Affirmative Action/Employment Equity Policy and Programmes	432
6.8.7.7	'Fast Tracking' Appointments from the Designated Group	434
6.8.7.8	Consultation in Development of Affirmative Action/Employment Equity Programmes	437
6.8.7.9	Indian/Coloured Staff Resentment to Preferential Treatment	439
6.8.7.10	Hiring of Unqualified Staff from the Designated Group	440
6.8.7.11	Performance of Indian/Coloured Male Academics	441
6.8.7.12	Performance of White Male Academics	442
6.8.7.13	Preferential Treatment of Black Women over White Women	444
6.8.7.14	Women as Beneficiaries of Affirmative Action/Employment Equity Programmes	445
6.8.7.15	Affirmative Action/Employment Equity Efforts and Appointment/Promotion Standards	448
6.8.8	INSTITUTIONAL BARRIERS TO AFFIRMATIVE ACTION/ EMPLOYMENT EQUITY	450
6.8.8.1	Institutional Culture and Climate	450
6.8.8.2	Identity, Reputation and Image of Institutions	452
6.8.8.3	Inability to Manage Staff Diversity	453
6.8.8.4	Failure to Build Capacities of Affirmative Action/ Employment Equity Beneficiaries	455
6.8.8.5	The 'Sink or Swim' Dilemma	456
6.8.8.6	Workload of Women	458
6.8.8.7	Lack of Advancement Possibilities for Women	459
6.8.8.8	The Traditional Masculine Culture	461
6.8.8.9	Negative Attitudes and Stereotyping	463
6.8.8.10	Insufficient Pool of Academics	465
6.8.8.11	Poaching	465
6.8.8.12	Lack of Vacancies	466
6.8.8.13	Equity vs Excellence	467
6.8.8.14	Funding and Rationalization	467

	PAGE
6.8.8.15 The Inefficiency of Human Resources Managers	467
6.8.8.16 'Job Hopping'	467
6.9 CONCLUSION	468

CHAPTER SEVEN : CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1 CONCLUSIONS	469
7.2 RECOMMENDATIONS	478
7.2.1 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE SUCCESSFUL IMPLEMENTATION OF AFFIRMATIVE ACTION/EMPLOYMENT EQUITY	479
7.2.1.1 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE PRE-IMPLEMENTATION PHASE	480
7.2.1.1.1 Identifying the Substantive Issues	480
7.2.1.1.2 Sensitising and Awareness-raising Workshops to Explode Myths, Misconceptions and Misunderstandings about Affirmative Action/Employment Equity	482
7.2.1.1.3 The Development of a Guideline Document/manual for the Implementation of Affirmative Action/Employment Equity Plans ..	484
7.2.1.1.3.1 Design and Development of Affirmative Action/Employment Equity Plan	485
7.2.1.1.3.2 Review of Recruitment Policies in Planning for Affirmative Action/Employment Equity Implementation	486
7.2.1.1.3.3 Defining Criteria for Merit and Potential to Succeed	487
7.2.1.1.3.4 Improving Equity Planning Processes and Developing Human Resources Practitioners	488
7.2.1.1.3.5 Expansion of Human Resources (HR) Capacity	489
7.2.1.1.3.6 Communication Strategies for Employment Equity	491
7.2.1.1.3.7 Developing an Institutional Business Case for Affirmative Action/ Employment Equity	492

	PAGE
7.2.1.2	RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION PHASE . . . 493
7.2.1.2.1	Structure of Human Resources Required for Affirmative Action/Employment Equity Programmes 493
7.2.1.2.2	Recruitment: Attracting, Recruiting and Retaining Staff from the Designated Group 495
7.2.1.2.3	Screening of Candidates 497
7.2.1.2.4	Appointments 497
7.2.1.2.5	Professional Advancement 499
7.2.1.2.6	Mentoring and Support for Staff from the Designated Group 500
7.2.1.2.7	Skills Development and Training 501
7.2.1.2.8	Responsibility for Implementation of Plan 501
7.2.1.3	RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE POST-IMPLEMENTATION PHASE 502
7.2.1.3.1	Monitoring the Plan 502
7.2.2	OTHER GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS 503
7.2.2.1	Managing Diversity 503
7.2.2.2	Resources and Organizational Culture 504
7.3	FURTHER RESEARCH ON AFFIRMATIVE ACTION/EMPLOYMENT EQUITY IN HIGHER EDUCATION 504
7.4	CONCLUSION 506
8.	BIBLIOGRAPHY 507
9.	APPENDICES 542

LIST OF TABLES

TABLE	DESCRIPTION	PAGE
1	Distribution of sample according to biographical details	349
2	Responses to the 'goals and timetable strategy' in Affirmative Action/Employment Equity efforts	382
3	Methods of dissemination of information on Affirmative Action/Employment Equity policy	389
4	Satisfaction of academic staff with whether their institution's implementation of the Affirmative Action/Employment Equity policy has been successful	391
5	Satisfaction of academic staff with communication of Affirmative Action/Employment Equity efforts	393
6	Academic staff satisfaction with the manner in which Affirmative Action/Employment Equity is implemented	395
7	Responses to provisions made for Affirmative Action/Employment Equity programmes	401
8	Responses to institutional provisions related to Affirmative Action/Employment Equity	414
9	Responses of the designated and non-designated groups at HBIs and HWIs to whether Affirmative Action/Employment Equity results in White staff resentment	430
10	Responses to top management driving Affirmative Action/Employment Equity policy and programmes	433
11	Responses of designated and non-designated groups to whether institutions are guilty of 'fast tracking' appointments from the designated group	435

12	Responses of men from different racial groups to performance of Coloured/Indian men	442
13	Responses of designated, non-designated groups and White men to White men not performing to their optimum	443
14	Responses of males and females from the designated and non-designated groups to whether Black women should be given preference over White women	444
15	Responses to institutional culture and climate as barriers to Affirmative Action/Employment Equity	450
16	Responses to the identity, reputation and image of institutions as barriers to Affirmative Action/Employment Equity	452
17	Responses to management of diversity at institutions	453
18	Responses to the failure to build capacities of Affirmative Action/Employment Equity beneficiaries	455
19	Responses to the 'sink or swim' dilemma of Affirmative Action/Employment Equity beneficiaries	456
20	Responses to women's workload being greater than men's	458
21	Responses to lack of advancement possibilities for women	459
22	Responses to the traditional masculine culture hindering women's progress	461
23	Responses to negative attitudes and stereotyping as barriers to Affirmative Action/Employment Equity	463
24	Checklist of substantive issues	480

LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURE	DESCRIPTION	PAGE
1	Summary of the nature and scope of Affirmative Action	68
2	Organogram illustrating the general theoretical framework of Affirmative Action	69
3	Organogram illustrating a theoretical and conceptual framework of Affirmative Action for the present study	70
4	Summary of negative perceptions and attitudes towards Affirmative Action	100
5	Summary of positive perceptions and attitudes towards Affirmative Action	101
6	Summary of challenges/constraints and problems facing Affirmative Action	102
7	Summary of the apartheid Higher Education legacy in South Africa	335
8	Location of Higher Education institutions in KwaZulu-Natal in the present study.	338
9	Illustrating the responses of the total sample to the composition of the 'designated group'	353
10	Illustrating responses of designated and non-designated groups to the composition of the 'designated group'	354
11	Illustrating the responses of the different racial groups to the composition of the 'designated group'.	355
12	Illustrating academic staff responses to whether Affirmative Action is perceived as reverse discrimination	363
13	Illustrating the responses of the various racial groups to whether Affirmative Action is perceived as reverse discrimination	364

14	Illustrating responses of the total sample to whether Affirmative Action is perceived as tokenism	366
15	Illustrating responses of designated and non-designated groups to whether Affirmative Action is perceived as tokenism	366
16	Illustrating responses to whether Affirmative Action is perceived as a form of entitlement	368
17	Illustrating responses to whether equality of opportunity and Equity are perceived as the same in the context of Affirmative Action/Employment Equity	369
18	Illustrating responses of management staff to whether equality of opportunity and Equity mean the same in the context of Affirmation Action/Employment Equity	370
19	Illustrating responses of designated and non-designated groups to whether 'degrees of disadvantage' should be considered in Affirmative Action/Employment Equity efforts	373
20	Illustrating responses of the different race groups and women to whether 'degrees of disadvantage' should be considered in Affirmative Action/Employment Equity efforts	374
21	Illustrating responses to basing Affirmative Action/ Employment Equity efforts on potential to succeed and not on academic merit alone	376
22	Illustrating responses of the total academic staff to Affirmative Action/Employment Equity appointments based on rigid quotas	378
23	Illustrating the responses of the designated and non-designated groups to the use of rigid quotas in Affirmative Action/ Employment Equity appointments	379
24	Illustrating the responses of the different racial groups to the use of quotas in Affirmative Action/Employment Equity efforts	380
25	Illustrating responses of the designated and non-designated groups to the 'goals and timetable strategy'	383

26	Illustrating the responses to how well informed academic staff are of the Employment Equity Act	384
27	Illustrating responses of the designated and non-designated groups to how well informed they are of the Employment Equity Act	386
28	Illustrating responses of the total sample to whether Affirmative Action/Employment Equity creates a new system of inequalities	398
29	Illustrating responses of the designated and non-designated groups and of those employed at HBIs and HWIs	399
30	Illustrating responses to commitment to Affirmative Action/ Employment Equity issues	419
31	Illustrating responses to whether the institution is a fair and equitable place to work	420
32	Showing responses to whether institutions' efforts are more than an attempt to appear politically correct	422
33	Showing responses of the designated and non-designated groups to whether their institutions' efforts are more than an attempt to appear politically correct	423
34	Illustrating responses to whether a diverse workforce will lead to better student /staff relations	426
35	Illustrating responses of the designated and non-designated groups to a diverse workforce	427
36	Illustrating responses of individual racial groups towards Indian/ Coloured resentment	439
37	Showing responses to whether Affirmative Action/Employment Equity initiatives result in hiring unqualified staff from the designated group	440
38	Illustrating responses of the total sample to women as beneficiaries of Affirmative Action/Employment Equity efforts	446

39	Illustrating responses of males and females to women as beneficiaries of Affirmative Action/Employment Equity efforts	446
40	Illustrating responses to whether Affirmative Action/Employment Equity efforts lower appointment/promotion standards	448

LIST OF APPENDICES

APPENDIX	DESCRIPTION	PAGE
1	Questionnaire on Affirmative Action/ Employment Equity including Covering Letter	542
2.	Interview Schedule	549
3	Newspaper headlines in South Africa related to Affirmative Action and Employment Equity since 1990	551
4	Summary of the History of Affirmative Action Issues and Policies in the USA	553
5	Covering Letter Fixed to Packets Containing Questionnaires	561



XXX

**THE STUDY OF AFFIRMATIVE ACTION AND EMPLOYMENT EQUITY IN HIGHER
EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS IN KWAZULU - NATAL**

BY: PREGLATHAN GOPAUL PADAYACHEE

DEGREE: PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR

DEPARTMENT: TEACHING AND TRAINING STUDIES

SUPERVISOR: PROFESSOR D R BAGWANDEEN

SUMMARY

The fact that the composition of staff in Higher Education institutions fails to reflect the demographic realities of South Africa and that Black people and women are still severely underrepresented, especially in senior academic and management positions, provided a compelling motivation for this study. This motivation is further reinforced by the fact that the enduring pervasive racist heritage of the past at institutions of Higher Education continues to disadvantage male academics of colour and women who have never had the opportunity to compete fairly in the distribution of benefits and opportunities in Higher Education. The researcher argues that the scenario continues to persist despite the promulgation of several pieces of legislation and policy since 1994 namely, the Labour Relations Act, the Employment Equity Act, the Higher Education Act, the White Paper on Affirmative Action and the National Plan for Higher Education.

Hence, the need to determine the perception of academics towards the constraints and challenges facing institutions of Higher Education and to identify ways and means of overcoming them in order to expedite transformation in Higher Education. Major research

with regard to Affirmative Action/Employment Equity in Higher Education, including perceptions and attitudes of academic staff is limited in South Africa.

The general aim of the present study was to gather objective and scientific data about Affirmative Action/ Employment Equity policies and their implementation procedures, as they pertain to academic staff within institutions of Higher Education in KwaZulu- Natal. The review of literature traced the efficacy of Affirmative Action and Employment Equity policies in three developed and three developing countries in the world. This review contributed significantly towards developing the data gathering tools, the evaluation of findings and the recommendations for effective implementation of Affirmative Action/Employment Equity in Higher Education institutions.

The research methodology utilized in the study were both qualitative and descriptive in nature and an interview schedule and questionnaires were employed to obtain data from a probability sample of permanently employed academic staff(faculty) from six Higher Education institutions in KwaZulu-Natal. The general conclusions derived from the empirical study include, *inter alia*, a profound misconception of the concept Affirmative Action/Employment Equity, the principles underlying it and the rejection of the concept 'designated group' as beneficiaries of Affirmative Action/Employment Equity policy. The findings also revealed that the implementation of Affirmative Action/Employment Equity policies were fragmented and the existing plans appeared to be merely a response to legislative requirements rather than a commitment to Affirmative Action/ Employment Equity.

Among the many recommendations put forward by the researcher was the development of a guideline document that sets out the process and substantive issues to assist in effective implementation of Affirmative Action/Employment Equity policies. The study also makes an urgent call for research in specific areas related to Affirmative Action/ Employment Equity.



KEY WORDS:

Affirmative Action

Preferential Treatment

Goals and Quotas

Equity

Equality of Opportunity

Higher Education

Employment Equity

Reverse discrimination

Affirmative Action/Employment Equity Plans

Tokenism