University of Pretoria etd, Hwang K D (2006)

The Mechanisms of Politico-Security Regionalism in Southeast Asia and Southern Africa: A Comparative Case Study of ASEAN and SADC

by

Kyu Deug Hwang

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree

Doctor Philosophiae (International Relations)

in the Faculty of Humanities

University of Pretoria

Pretoria
2005

University of Pretoria etd, Hwang K D (2006)

ABSTRACT

The central question addressed by this thesis is whether and to what extent ASEAN and SADC provide a regional response to security challenges from within and without the region respectively. In the examination of a regional response to security challenges in Southeast Asia and Southern Africa, this study investigates each regional organisation's efforts and methods of how to approach and deal with regional security problems. In examining the processes and patterns of ASEAN and SADC regionalism in terms of the security dimension, the focus is on political security in its regional context. In doing so, the mechanisms of both ASEAN and SADC politico-security regionalisms are explored.

This study also aims to compare SADC and ASEAN to find similarities and differences in terms of the way in which 'politico-security regionalism' as a regional project is used to respond to global challenges, as well as to internal needs. Moreover, this study seeks to explore what can be learnt from the experiences of both ASEAN and SADC with regard to regionalism and regionalisation in response to political security threats. This will, as a result, be conducive to understanding the character, nature and type of contemporary regionalism and regional security in the South, including Southeast Asia and Southern Africa.

Furthermore, in discussing the question of whether and how ASEAN and SADC attempt to shape and modify or change the process of globalisation and regionalisation in politico-security terms, this study emphasises a multi-dimensionality of contemporary regionalism – so called 'new regionalism' – which would normally be based on constructivism. Therefore, this study argues that the theoretical problem relates to the insufficiency of neo-realist and neo-liberal institutionalist accounts that call for a much needed attempt to bring ASEAN and SADC into contemporary discussions about the mechanisms of politico-security regionalisms within the context of a (social) constructivism of international relations (IR) theory.

Key Terms: Regionalism, New Regionalism, Politico-Security Regionalism, Regionalisation, Regional Security, Political Security, Regional Cooperation/Integration, Constructivism, ASEAN, SADC, Southeast Asia and Southern Africa

University of Pretoria etd, Hwang K D (2006)

OPSOMMING

Die kernvraag wat deur hierdie tesis aangespreek word, is of, en indien wel, in watter mate, ASEAN en SADC ‘n streeksrespons verskaf vir die sekuriteitsuitdagings van binne en buite hul onderskeie streke. In die ondersoek na ‘n streeksrespons op die sekuriteitsuitdagings in Suid-Oos Asië en Suider-Afrika, analiseer die studie die pogings en metodes van ASEAN and SADC met betrekking tot die aanspreek van die onderskeie streke se sekuriteitsprobleme. Die ondersoek na die prosesse en patrone van sekuriteitsregionalisme in ASEAN en SADC fokus op politieke sekuriteit in streekskonteks. Sodoende word die politiko-sekuriteitsmeganismes van beide streeksorganisasies bestudeer.

Hierdie studie vergelyk ook SADC en ASEAN om ooreenkomste en verskille uit te lig in terme van die wyse waarop ‘politiko-sekuriteitsmeganismes’ as ‘n streeksprojek gebruik word in reaksie op globale uitdagings, sowel as interne behoeftes. Verder poog die studie om te bepaal wat geleer kan word uit die ondervindinge van ASEAN en SADC in verband met regionalisme en regionalisasie as ‘n reaksie op sekuriteitsbedreigings. Die studie bevorder begrip van die karakter, aard en tipe kontemporêre regionalisme en streeksekuriteit in die Globale Suide met spesifieke verwysing na Suid-Oos Asië en Suider-Afrika.

Voorts, in die bespreking van die vraag of en hoe ASEAN en SADC hul beywer om die proses van globalisasie en regionalisasie in politiko-sekuriteitsterme te vorm en te verander, beklemtoon die studie ‘n multi-dimensionaliteit van kontemporêre regionalisme – die sogenaamde “nuwe regionalisme” – wat normaalweg gebaseer is op konstruktivisme. Daarom voer die studie aan dat die teoretiese probleem verband hou met die ontoereikendheid in die neo-realistiese en neo-liberale gëinstitusionaliseerde benaderings om die tipe meganismes van politiko-sekuriteitsregionalisme, doeltreffend te ondersoek en dat dit met welslae bestudeer en ontleed kan word deur gebruik te maak van (sosiale) konstruktivisme as ‘n teorie van Internasionale Verhoudinge

Kernbegrippe: Regionalisme, Nuwe Regionalisme, Politiko-Sekuriteitsregionalisme, Regionalisasie, Streeksekuriteit, Politieke Sekuriteit, Streeksamewerking/-integrasie, ASEAN, SADC, Suid-Oos Asië en Suidelike Afrika.

University of Pretoria etd, Hwang K D (2006)

CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION 1
1.1 Introduction 1
1.2 Research Problem and Aim 2
1.3 Theoretical Orientations 7
1.4 Demarcation of the Study 10
1.5 Research Methods 12
1.6 Limitations 14
1.7 Levels of Analysis 15
1.8 Structure of the Study and Outline 15

CHAPTER 2 CONCEPTUALISING POLITICO-SECURITY REGIONALISM 19
2.1 Introduction 19
2.2 Defining Security: Politico-Security 21
2.2.1 Weak States, States-Making and Politico-Security 26
2.2.2 Sovereignty and Politico-Security 27
2.2.3 The State: Primary Referent/Agent of Politico-Security 30
2.3 Defining Regionalism: Politico-Security Regionalism 34
2.3.1 The Domestic Level 42
2.3.2 The Regional Level 43
2.3.3 The Extra-Regional Level 45
2.4 Conclusion 47

CHAPTER 3 THEORISING POLITICO-SECURITY REGIONALISM 49
3.1 Introduction 49
3.2 Neo-realism 49
3.3 Neo-liberal institutionalism 52
3.4 Constructivism 55
3.4.1 Institutions 58
3.4.2 Norms 60
3.4.3 Collective Identity 62
3.5 Conclusion 64

CHAPTER 4 POLITICO-SECURITY REGIONALISM IN SOUTHEAST ASIA: THE EMERGENCE OF THE 'ASEAN WAY' IN THE COLD-WAR ERA 66

University of Pretoria etd, Hwang K D (2006)

4.1 Introduction 66
4.2 The Origin of ASEAN 68
4.3 The Evolution of ASEAN 72
4.4 ASEAN's Collective Identity: norms and principles 78
4.5 ASEAN's Security Diplomacy: the Cambodian conflict (1978-1989) 82
4.6 Conclusion 88

CHAPTER 5 POLITICO-SECURITY REGIONALISM IN SOUTHERN AFRICA: SADCC AS A RESPONSE TO APARTHEID SOUTH AFRICA IN THE COLD WAR ERA 91
5.1 Introduction 91
5.2 The Origin of SADCC 93
5.3 The Evolution of SADCC 100
5.4 Politico-Economic Security Strategy 104
5.5 Politico-Military Security Cooperation 109
5.6 Conclusion 113

CHAPTER 6 POLITICO-SECURITY REGIONALISM IN SOUTHEAST ASIA: CONTINUITY AND CHALLENGE TO THE 'ASEAN WAY' IN THE POST-COLD WAR ERA 117
6.1 Introduction 117
6.2 The Emergence of the ASEAN Regional Forum (ARF): The impact of the 'ASEAN Way' on the ARF 121
6.3 Conflict Management in the ASEAN Region 127
6.3.1 The South China Sea Conflict (1992-2004) 128
6.3.2 The East Timor Crisis (1999-2000) 139
6.4 Continuity and Challenge to the 'ASEAN Way' 146
6.4.1 The Asian Economic Crisis and Regional Security: Rethinking the principle of non-intervention 146
6.5 Conclusion 154

CHAPTER 7 THE REMAKING OF SADC POLITICO-SECURITY REGIONALISM IN THE POST-COLD WAR ERA 158
7.1 Introduction 158
7.2 The SADC Organ (OPDS): The emergence of a formal regional security structure 161

University of Pretoria etd, Hwang K D (2006)

7.3 Conflict Management in the DRC Crisis (1998-2004) 170
7.3.1 The Zimbabwe-led Intervention in the DRC: Collective Self-Defence? 170
7.3.2 The Unilateral Intervention in the DRC: Pursuing the legitimacy of operation 175
7.3.3 Peacemaking in the DRC Conflict: From unilateral intervention to multilateral diplomacy 180
7.4 Restructuring SADC's Security Architecture 192
7.4.1 From OPDS to OPDSC: Towards regional security integration 192
7.4.2 The Politics of the SADC Mutual Defence Pact 200
7.5 Conclusion 204

CHAPTER 8 A COMPARISON OF THE TWO CASE STUDIES 208
8.1 Introduction 208
8.2 Comparative Findings 210
8.2.1 Institutionalisation 210
8.2.2 Norm-based Conflict Management 214
8.2.3 Collective (Regional) Identity as Exceptionalism 219
8.2.4 Bringing In Multi-level Approaches to Politico-Security Regionalism 224
8.3 Theoretical Findings 233
8.3.1 Neo-realism 233
8.3.2 Neo-liberal institutionalism 235
8.3.3 Constructivism 239
8.4 Conclusion 243

CHAPTER 9 CONCLUSION 245

BIBLIOGRAPHY 249

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ACM African Common Market

University of Pretoria etd, Hwang K D (2006)

AEC	African Economic Community
ALC	African Liberation Committee
ANC	African National Congress
APEC	Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation
ARF	ASEAN Regional Forum
ARF-SOM	ARF Senior Official Meeting
ASA	Association of Southeast Asia
ASAS	Association of Southern African States
ASC	ASEAN Standing Committee
ASDT	Timorese Social Democratic Association
ASEAN	Association of Southeast Asian Nations
ASEM	Asia-Europe Meeting
ASPAC	Asia Pacific Council
AU	African Union
BLNS	Botswana, Lesotho, Namibia and Swaziland group of states
CAF	Central African Federation
CEAO	Communaute economique de l'Afrique de l'Ouest (West African Economic Community)
CONSAS	Constellation of Southern African States
CPCM	Maghreb Permanent Consultation Committee
CSBMs	Confidence and Security-Building Measures
CSCAP	Council for Security Cooperation in the Asia-Pacific
CSCE	Conference on Security and Cooperation in Europe
DRC	Democratic Republic of Congo
EAC	East African Community
EAEC	East Asian Economic Caucus
EC	European Community
ECA	United Nations Economic Commission for Africa
ECOWAS	Economic Community of West African States
EEC	European Economic Community
EEZ	Exclusive Economic Zone
EU	European Union
EWS	Early Warning System
FAC	*Forces armies congolaises*
FDD	Forces pour la Defence de la Democratie
FLS	Frontline States

University of Pretoria etd, Hwang K D (2006)

FNL	Forces Nationales de Liberation
FRELIMO	*Frente de Libertacao de Moçambique* (Front for the Liberation of Mozambique)
FRETLIN	Revolutionary Front for an Independent East Timor
HIV/AIDS	Human Immunodeficiency Virus / Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
ICG	International Crisis Group
IMF	International Monetary Fund
INTERFET	International Force for East Timor
IR	International Relations
IRIN	UN Integrated Regional Information Networks
ISDSC	Inter-State Defence and Security Committee
ISPDC	Inter-State Politics and Diplomacy Committee
LCBC	Lake Chad Basic Commission
LLA	Lesotho Liberation Army
MAPHILINDO	Malaya-Philipines-Indonesia
MLC	*Mouvement pour la liberation du Congo*
MONUC	UN Mission in the DRC
MRU	Mano River Union
NAM	Non-Aligned Movement (official title is Movement of Non-Aligned Countries)
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organisation
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Agreement
NEPAD	New Partnership for Africa's Development
NGOs	Non-Governmental Organisations
OAU	Organisation of African Unity
OPDS	Organ on Politics, Defence and Security
OPDSC	Organ on Politics, Defence and Security Cooperation
OSCE	Organisation on Security and Cooperation in Europe
PD	Preventive Diplomacy
PRC	People's Republic of China
PSC	Peace and Security Council
RCD	*Rassemblement congolais pour la democratie*
RENAMO	*Resistencia Nacionale Moçambicana* (National Resistance Movement of Mozambique)
SACU	Southern African Customs Union

University of Pretoria etd, Hwang K D (2006)

SADC	Southern African Development Community
SADCC	Southern African Development Coordination Conference
SANDF	South African National Defence Force
SAPA	South African News Agency
SEANWFZ	Southeast Asian Nuclear Weapons Free Zone
SEATO	Southeast Asian Treaty Organisation
SIPO	Strategic Indicative Plan for the Organ
SOM-PMC	Senior Officials Meeting-Post-Ministerial Conference
TAC	Treaty of Amity and Cooperation
UDEAC	Union douanière et économique de l'Afrique Centrale
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
UNAMET	United Nations Mission in East Timor
UNCLOS	United Nations Conference on the Law of the Sea
UNITA	*Uniao para a Independencia Total de Angola* (Union for the Total Independence of Angola)
UNSC	United Nations Security Council
UNTAET	UN Transitional Authority in East Timor
US	*see* USA
USA	United States of America
USSR	Union of Soviet Socialist Republics
ZANU	Zimbabwe African National Union
ZAPU	Zimbabwe African People's Union
ZOPFAN	Zone of Peace, Freedom and Neutrality