

**THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE STATUTORY FRAMEWORK FOR SKILLS
DEVELOPMENT: A CASE STUDY OF THE PRIVATE SECURITY SUB-SECTOR.**

By

VUYELWA TONI PENXA

**A Thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the Degree of Doctor
of Philosophy (PhD)**

in Public Affairs

**at the School of Public Management and Administration in the
Faculty of Economic and Management Sciences**

University of Pretoria

Pretoria

South Africa

**Supervisor: Professor Dr. P. A. Brynard
School of Public Management and Administration**

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

PRETORIA

SOUTH AFRICA

© 2009

Abstract

South African government has since 1995, developed a considerable body of legislation that defines a holistic Human Resource Development Framework for the Private Security Sub-sector. Through this legislation development process, the Private Security Sub-sector has made considerable progress in implementing this body of legislation. However, in spite of this achievement, policy implementation success indicators are not commensurate to the policy development success indicators and several challenges are still impeding skills development of workers. In particular, the Private Security Industry has moved steadily beyond the systems development phase. It has made strong progress in implementing stipulations of the skill development legislation in the sector with the support of the skills levy fund as well as donor support. Considerable attention has been paid to the implementation of the different types of skills development related legislation including funding the skills development initiatives and employment equity.

The cases examined in the study reflect varying and different degrees of success in achieving set targets as well as challenges that have emerged in the implementation process. There is an indication that the dire shortage of skills in the private security sub-sector persists and the efforts of the drivers of training and development in the sector, the Safety and Security Sector Education and Training (SASSETA), the Private Security Industry Regulatory Authority (PSIRA) and employers have made little impact on this need. This state of affairs cannot be allowed to continue indefinitely. The study revealed a range of critical National Skills Development Strategy targets that have not been met throughout the period under study. For instance employers have failed to meet obligatory targets of employing training employees to achieve at least ABET level 4. In addition, only 54% women have been trained and 4% people with disabilities. Furthermore, there are a number of other training obligations that compounds the challenge by infringing on the rights of the affected groups. This also retards the social and economic development of workers as well as that of the country. South Africa continues to lack effective, robust

crime fighting groups of skilled crime fighters in spite of the training levy funds that have been spent on skilling the Private Security Sub-sector.

The point of departure of this study is that the Skills Development initiative is a sector programme which must be led by the sector itself, especially the employers. The employers in the workplace constitute a valuable source of capacity to effectively implement the skills development legislation. SASSETA and PSIRA are the promoters and drivers of the participation of Private Security Service providers in skills development in pursuit of the 2014 vision. It is imperative that SASSETA and PSIRA, as proponents and catalysts of skills development, listen to the concerns raised by employers and continuously engage them as well as the intended beneficiaries, the workers.

The research revealed that benefits of the skills development legislation will only be realised when critical elements such as prioritising the identified challenges and shortcomings are the focus. The study highlighted the need for industries to capacitate their employees to understand the intended benefits of training regulations and requirements. Developing management and leadership capacity, creating conditions that are conducive for skills development at the workplace, and building the capacity of Small, Medium and Micro Enterprises (SMMEs) through innovation and support were also identified as critical for successful implementation of policy in this regard. The need to train and capacitate leaders in corporate governance and financial management was also among the findings identified by the study.

The findings will present an opportunity for scholars and researchers to debate and argue their merits and demerits which will in turn influence policy-making processes positively.



Statement of Originality

I hereby state that this is my original work both in form and content and that wherever I have referred to the work of other authors that has been duly acknowledged.

V. Toni Penxa

22268724

Acknowledgements

I dedicate this study to my late sister, Vuyiswa, who died in a car accident while pursuing her studies in medicine.

I acknowledge with appreciation my indebtedness to Professor P. A. Brynard for the support, patience and generous guidance provided during the conceptualisation and the implementation of this study.

Pieter Pieteron, Gusha and Loutjie, my colleagues and friends, without your emotional encouragement and unfailing friendship, there would have been no final thesis. Thank you for being so sincere..

To my dear mother, who passed away during the final stages of this study, thank you for believing in me. You were a light and a driving force behind my ability to complete this study. Ndlangisa, Thole, Mfingo, Gqagqane!

A special note of gratitude to my late Mother-in-law, MaGasela, Mvemve; I'm blessed to have had you as a mother. You allowed me to abandon the family and continue with my studies and pledged your support, in your own words, that I should study until my brain gets depleted (Uzufund'uduphel'ingqondo Molokazana wam!). I've done just that!!

To my husband, Khonaye, and children, Nosisa, ZwelamaNtande and Mxolisi, your support and inspiration are a priceless gift. Thank you for the encouragement, the sacrifices and the support you gave me to be able to complete this study. The baton is now with you! Qiqqa, I will always remember the moments we shared together in my study.

Above all, I thank my Creator and my God, Qamata, for having given me the strength and the wisdom to complete this daunting task at a time that was very challenging to me. I came out stronger. Every dark cloud has a silver lining.

Acronyms and Abbreviations

ANC:	African National Congress
ATR:	Annual Training Report
COSATU:	Congress of South African Trade Unions
DIDTETA:	Defence, Intelligence, Diplomacy, Trade and Industry Sector Education and Training Authority
DoE:	Department of Education
DST:	Department of Science and Technology
ESDA:	Electronic Security Distributors Association
ETQA:	Education and Training Quality Assurance Body
HET:	Higher Education and Training
HSRC:	Human Sciences Research Council
ISS:	Institute of Security Studies
WCSEA:	Western Cape Security Association
MEC:	Member of Executive Council
NACI:	National Advisory Council on Innovation
NBFET:	National Board for Further Education and Training
NEPI:	National Education Policy Initiative
NOPSA:	Northern Province Security Association
NQF:	National Qualifications Framework
NSA:	National skills Authority
NSB:	National Standards Body
NSDS:	National Skills Development Strategy
NTB:	National Training Board
NUMSA:	National Union of Metalworkers of South Africa
POSLEC:	Police, Security, Legal and Correctional Services
PSIRA:	Private Security Industry Regulatory Authority
RPL:	Recognition of Prior Learning
RSA:	Republic of South Africa
SABSEA:	South African Black Security Employers Association
SAIDSA:	The South African Intruder Detection Service Association



SAIS:	South African Institute of Security
SANSEA:	South African National Security Employers Association
SAQA:	South African Qualifications Authority
SARS:	South African Revenue Services
SASA:	Security Association of South Africa
SASCO:	South African Standard Classification of Occupations
SASSETA:	Safety and Security Sector Education and Training Authority
SDOA:	Service Dog Operators Association
SESA:	Small Employers' Security Association
SETA:	Sector Education and Training Authority
SGB:	Standards Generating Bodies
SIASA:	Security Industry Association of South Africa
SIC:	Standard Industrial Classification
SMME:	Small Medium and Micro Enterprise
SOB:	Security Officers' Board
SSEO:	Security Services Employers Organisation
SSP:	Sector Skills Plan
VIPPASA:	VIP Protection Association of SA
WSP:	Workplace Skills Plan

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT	ii
STATEMENT OF ORIGINALITY	iv
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	v
ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS	vi
TABLE OF CONTENTS	viii
LIST OF FIGURES	xiv
LIST OF TABLES	xv
LIST OF APPENDICES	xvi
CHAPTER 1	1
BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY	1
1.1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.2 VALUE OF THE RESEARCH	2
1.3 HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT OF PRIVATE SECURITY INDUSTRY	3
1.4 THE DEVELOPMENT AND PROFILE OF THE PRIVATE SECURITY INDUSTRY IN SOUTH AFRICA	4
1.4.1 The employers and employer organisations	6
1.4.2 The labour and labour organisations (trade unions)	9
1.4.3 Products and services	16
i. Private Investigators and Risk Management	17
ii. Armed Response	19
iii. Contract Guarding and Assets in Transit	20
iv. Event and Crowd Management	20
v. Electronic Security	21
vi. Close Protection Services (Bodyguards)	21



1.5	LABOUR MARKETS	21
1.6	SKILLS AND SKILLS SHORTAGES	23
1.7	SCOPE OF THE INDUSTRY	24
1.8	CONCLUSION	31
CHAPTER 2		32
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY		32
2.1	INTRODUCTION	32
2.2	DESCRIPTION OF RESEARCH PROCESS AND DELINEATION OF STUDY	34
2.3	CLARIFICATION OF KEY CONCEPTS AND TERMS	35
2.4	STATEMENT OF THE RESEARCH PROBLEM	43
2.5	RESEARCH QUESTIONS	45
2.6	RESEARCH AIMS AND OBJECTIVES	46
2.7	RESEARCH METHODS CHOSEN FOR THIS STUDY	47
	2.7.1 Case Study Research Method	47
2.8	RESEARCH DESIGN	48
2.9	DATA COLLECTION TECHNIQUES	52
2.10	SAMPLING METHOD AND SAMPLE SIZE	54
2.11	MOTIVATION FOR THE RESEARCH	55
2.12	SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY	56
2.13	LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY	56
2.14	CONCLUSION	57
CHAPTER 3		59
REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE ON POLICY IMPLEMENTATION		59
3.1	INTRODUCTION	59
3.2	POLICY IMPLEMENTATION AS CORE FUNCTION OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION	59



3.2.1	Public administration	60
3.2.2.	Policy	62
3.2.3	Policy-making and policy implementation	63
3.2.4	Critical variables essential for effective implementation of policy	68
3.2.5	Critical variables essential for Implementation of Skills Development Policy	69
3.2.6	Policy Implementation in relation to Skills Development	72
3.2.7	Policy Evaluation	74
3.3	STATUTORY FRAMEWORK REGULATING THE PRIVATE SECURITY -SECTOR IN SOUTH AFRICA	75
3.3.1	The need for regulating the South African Private Security Industry	76
3.3.2	The Regulation of the Private Security Industry in South Africa	76
3.4	THE REGULATION OF PRIVATE SECURITY SUB-SECTOR: INTERNATIONAL PERSPECTIVE	80
3.4.1	United Kingdom: England and Wales	81
3.4.2	Asia: India	83
3.4.3.	United States of America: Virginia	84
3.5	CONCLUSION	85
CHAPTER 4		87
AN OVERVIEW OF RELEVANT SKILLS DEVELOPMENT LEGISLATION IN SOUTH AFRICA		87
4.1	INTRODUCTION	87
4.2	THE CONCEPT OF TRAINING	90
4.3	HISTORY OF TRAINING IN SOUTH AFRICA: STRATEGIC CONTEXT	91
4.3.1	Evolution of skills development legislation in South Africa	91
4.3.2	Apprenticeships training through the manpower training act	93
4.3.3	Changing the education and training system	94
4.3.4	The Human Resources Development strategy for	



South Africa (HRD)	95
4.3.5 The National Skills Development strategy (NSDS)	97
4.3.6 Skills development legislation: post-1994	98
4.3.7 The National Qualifications Framework (NQF)	100
4.4 NEW FORMS OF PROFESSIONAL AND VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING	108
4.4.1 Workplace based training	108
4.4.2 Learnerships	109
4.5 THE PRIVATE SECURITY INDUSTRY REGULATORY AUTHORITY (PSIRA) AND THE SAFETY AND SECURITY SECTOR EDUCATION AND TRAINING AUTHORITY (SASSETA)	112
4.5.1 The establishment of the Private Security Industry Regulatory Authority (PSIRA)	112
4.5.2 The establishment of the Safety and Security Education and Training Authority (SASSETA)	114
4.6 CONCLUSION	117
CHAPTER 5	119
ANALYSIS OF SELECTED CASES IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN PRIVATE SECURITY SUB-SECTOR	119
5.1 INTRODUCTION	119
5.2 AN OVERVIEW OF THE SKILLS DEVELOPMENT LEGISLATION IMPLEMENTATION EFFORTS IN INCREASING PRIVATE ENTERPRISE TRAINING IN SOUTH AFRICA IN THE POST-1994 ERA	122
5.2.1 A Synopsis of Training in Enterprises across sectors in South Africa	122
5.2.2 A synopsis of national training by SETA'S in South Africa	124
5.3 SKILLS DEVELOPMENT STAKEHOLDER ANALYSIS	127
5.4 NATURE OF THE SELECTED SOUTH AFRICAN CASE STUDIES	130
5.4.1 Case Study One: Private Security Industry Regulatory Authority (PSIRA)	131

5.4.1.1	Regulation of Training in the Private Security Sub-sector by PSIRA	132
5.4.1.2	Training Regulatory Law Enforcement by PSIRA	135
5.4.2	Case Study Two: Safety and Security Sector Education and Training Authority (SASSETA)	148
5.4.2.1	Training rate of SETAS in comparison to International Trends	149
5.4.2.2	Selective overview of skills development by the Safety and Security Education and Training Authority (SASSETA)	151
5.4.2.3	Implementation of the National Skills Development Strategy (NSDS) by SASSETA	153
5.4.2.4	SASSETA'S performance against the NSDS objectives targets set by the strategic plans 2005/06 – 2007/08	157
5.4.2.5	Challenges impacting on the effective implementation of skills development legislative framework by SASSETA	163
5.4.3	Case Study Three: Large, Medium and Small Private Security Companies	168
5.4.3.1	Selected cases of employers in the Private Security Sub-sector	170
5.4.3.2	Employment and training of people with disabilities by large, medium and small private security companies	179
5.5	CONCLUSION	181
CHAPTER 6		184
RESEARCH FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION		
184		
6.1	INTRODUCTION	184
6.2	SUMMARY OF RESEARCH FINDINGS	188



6.2.1	PSIRA and SASSETA as custodians and drivers of Skills Development in the Private Security Sub-sector	189
6.2.2	Employers and the National Skills Development Strategy (NSDS) targets imposed by the Statutory Framework for Skills Development	193
6.2.3	The Statutory Framework for Skills Development and its impact on different types of Security Enterprises	194
6.3	RECOMMENDATIONS	196
6.4	POSSIBILITIES FOR FURTHER INVESTIGATION	202
6.5	CONCLUSION	205
	LIST OF REFERENCES	206

LIST OF FIGURES

- Figure 1/1: Geographical distribution of workers in the Private Security industry
- Figure 1/2: Geographical distribution of active Security Officers registered with PSIRA on March 2006
- Figure 1/3: Age distribution of PSIRA registered workers on 31 March 2002
- Figure 1/4: Gender and Race distribution of PSIRA registered workers on 31 March 2006
- Figure 1/5: Contribution of different categories of Services to the Value of the private security industry
- Figure 1/6: PSIRA Registration Statistics of Private Security businesses and security officers as at 31 March 2008.
- Figure 1/7: Security Service Provider Registration Statistics (2001-2008) – Historical Comparison.
- Figure 5/1: Employees Trained by Large Private Security companies by Race between 2005/06 – 2007/08
- Figure 5/2: Training Rate of Large Private Security companies by Gender between 2005/06 – 2007/08
- Figure 5/3: Employees Trained by Medium Private Security companies by Race between 2005/06 – 2007/08
- Figure 5/4: Training Rate of Medium Private Security companies by Gender between 2005/06 – 2007/08
- Figure 5/5: Employees Trained by Small Private Security companies by Race between 2005/06 – 2007/08
- Figure 5/6: Training Rate of Small Private Security companies by Gender between 2005/06 – 2007/08
- Figure 5/7: Expenditure on Training as a percentage of Total wage bill in Private Security Companies

LIST OF TABLES

- Table 1/1: Private Security Sub-sector Employer Associations
- Table 1/2: Description of responsibilities of Security Officer, Grade A
- Table 1/3: Description of responsibilities of Security Officer, Grade B
- Table 1/4: Description of responsibilities of Security Officer, Grade C
- Table 1/5: Description of responsibilities of Security Officer, Grade D
- Table 1/6: Description of responsibilities of Security Officer, Grade E
- Table 1/7: Companies Registered with PSIRA
- Table 1/8: Specific Markets utilizing electronic security services, and the proportion of total market value of each sector
- Table 1/9: Areas of education and training prioritised by the Private Security Sub-sector
- Table 1/10: Qualifications & Unit Standards falling under the Private Security Sub-sector Quality Assurance
- Table 2/1: Phases in which the study will be conducted
- Table 3/1: Schematic illustration of the Open System Approach model of policy-making and implementation.
- Table 3/2: The critical variables that are essential for implementation of skills development legislation
- Table 3/3: The three models for classification of Private security companies globally
- Table 4/1: Evolutionary stages of the Training legislation in South Africa
- Table 4/2: Structure of the National Qualifications Framework
- Table 4/3: Statutory Functions of the Safety and Security Sector education and Training Authority (SASSETA)
- Table 5/1: Private sector Training Survey results 2002/03 (%)
- Table 5/2: Skills Development Stakeholder Analysis
- Table 5/3: Comparison of PSIRA regulatory objectives, initiatives taken and outcomes thereof
- Table 5/4: Audits Conducted by PSIRA and dockets opened for Improper Conduct investigation within the period of 2005/06 - 2007/08
- Table 5/5: A breakdown of the type of inspection conducted from 1 April 2005 to 31 March 2008

- Table 5/6: Categories of Security Service Providers that are registered and inspected by PSIRA
- Table 5/7: Statistical information on the different categories of Security Providers inspected by PSIRA nationally during the financial period 2005/06 – 2007/08
- Table 5/8: Growth of the industry in size from 2005/06 – 2007/08
- Table 5/9: Statistics on inspections conducted on large, medium and small private security companies during the period 2005/06 – 2007/08
- Table 5/10: Improper conduct and breaching of code of conduct investigations conducted by PSIRA during 2005/06 – 2007/08
- Table 5/11: Alignment of Grades and other PSIRA programmes to the NQF-registered Unit Standards that are Accredited by SASSETA
- Table 5/12: Participation rate of Adult workers in training in selected OECD countries
- Table 5/13: Comparison of SASSETA skills development objectives, initiatives taken and outcomes thereof.
- Table 5/14: Skills Development Levy Income collected by SASSETA in 2005/06 – 2007/08
- Table 5/15: SASSETA's performance against the NSDS objectives' targets set in the strategic plan of 2005/06 – 2007/08
- Table 5/16: Challenges Impacting on the implementation of the NSDS objectives by SASSETA
- Table 5/17: Comparison of Private Security Companies' skills development objectives, initiatives and outcomes thereof
- Table 5/18: Challenges facing the training and employment of people with disabilities

LIST OF APPENDICES:

Appendix 1:

South African Qualifications Authority Act, 1995 (Act 58 of 1995) (Chapter 4)

Appendix 2:

Skills Development Act, 1998 (Act 97 of 1998) (Chapter 4)

Appendix 3:

Skills Development Levies Act, 1999 (Act 9 of 1999) (Chapter 4)

Appendix 4:

National Skills Development Strategy (NSDS) 2005 – 2010 (Chapter 4)