

CHAPTER FIVE

TEACHER UNDERSTANDINGS AND INFLUENCES OF VALUES EDUCATION

5 Introduction

In this chapter I present the findings of my research on teacher's understanding of values education. As an initial step, I provide background information on the type of schools within which focus group interviews were conducted. This information is important, as teachers felt uncomfortable with and were reluctant to disclose their identities. An explanation of the type of schools provides insights into the study population. Lastly, I present the findings under the canopy of emerging issues and cluster responses according to the school type. Before I move into a detailed presentation of the findings, I will begin by interrogating the concept of understanding.

Broadly, the concept of understanding operates in a twofold way: It is both relative and contextual. As a relative concept, understanding is not only dependent on intent, but carries different levels of meanings. At the first level, it is a simple awareness, that is, the knowledge of existence of something; while the second level involves a deep appreciation of the details of the concept under interrogation. The third level centres on sympathetic awareness and at the final level, understanding refers to practice, where conclusions of understanding are derived from actions (Hornby, 1995).

As a contextual concept, understanding draws its meaning from a diverse knowledge base that is context-dependent; i.e. different meanings can be attached to the term at any given time. Different societies give different weight to different concepts. It is for this reason that in this study, the source of knowledge of teacher understanding is critical. The source will provide insight into what exactly teachers mean when they say that they understand. Thus I will give the stated meaning and further an analysis of the practice will be used to verify whether understanding remains at the knowledge level or whether it goes deeper to the level of practice. I therefore have a stated understating and an understanding as demonstrated by practice. It is, however, important to caution here that it does not always follow that people act according to understanding.



In this chapter, I present teacher understandings and factors that influence understanding of values education as stated in their testimonies during the focus group interview sessions. The semi-structured interviews enabled teachers to express themselves and articulate what they understood values education to mean and the factors that have influenced their stance. The findings are therefore a presentation of the knowledge and perceived meanings that teachers have and give to values education. Whilst I appreciate that understanding as a concept can have an extended meaning to include practice, I have deliberately left this discussion to chapter 6, in which a comparison is drawn between the perceived meanings of values and the practice of three teachers. As an introduction to the chapter, I will briefly present an overview of the factors that seem to influence the values curriculum in Kenya.

My study assumed that teacher understandings of values were influenced by a number of factors besides the curriculum and government policy document on values education. Four key issues that are not overtly expressed in the school environment seem to influence the local debate on values education in Kenya. These are ethnicity/culture, religion, local politics and global influences, especially through the media. I will briefly explain these four issues.

Ethnicity/culture: Settlement in Kenya is predominantly oriented towards ethnicity, though urbanisation and internal economic migration have resulted in the movement and mixing of different ethnic communities. Despite these movements, one can still comfortably refer to regions based on dominant ethnic settlement, which inevitably determine the mode of behaviour and norms. Ethnic foundation has meant that even when people move to the bigger more cosmopolitan cities, they still uphold and align themselves with practices of their ethnic community. Village ties are very strong, as demonstrated by the importance given to the rural home. The village is referred to as the "home"- "permanent" and the urban settlement is referred to as the "house" - "temporal". All burial ceremonies occur in the village, which is the "permanent home".

The entertainment industry, realising the strong ethnic inclinations, has profited from this by celebrating/hosting special evenings in the city of Nairobi dedicated to the individual ethnic communities; e.g. "Kamba night" or "Luhya night". The events of the evening entail a celebration of a particular ethnic group in the form of playing music and serving food that is derived from a particular ethnic perspective. These evenings are very popular and attract many prominent personalities from the respective communities.



Ethnicity has bred and encouraged stereotyping that members carry along with them to their respective places of work. Teachers are no different. They are raised in the same communities and thus would generally be expected to exhibit the same characteristics as those of their fellow community members.

Religion: The second level of influence stems from the religious background. The majority of households in Kenya are aligned with a particular religious group. Aside from family, religion is a key determining factor as to how people conduct their lives in Kenya. When a traditional practice is discarded, it would mainly be because the family has embraced certain religious values. Religion determines how parents select schools for their children, how marriage takes place, and how burial ceremonies are conducted. Religion has been the greatest adversary to traditional practices in Kenya. Teachers belong to different religious groups and are therefore assimilated into the beliefs and practices of the chosen religion. Hence, teachers' thinking is inevitably influenced by the supernatural nature and reverence of religious beliefs.

Politics: The third level of influence stems from local politics. Local politics is the amalgamation of both the traditional and religious factors, including the dominating political standing of a particular ethnic community. I mentioned that Kenya is ethnically oriented, meaning that the politics of the day is dictated by the same pattern. The dominant philosophy of the area prevails, and teachers just like other inhabitants hardly have a choice but to follow the same to survive. For example, Western Kenya is dominated by the Ford Kenya party (FK), Nyanza province by the Liberal Democratic Party (LDP), central province by the Democratic Party (DP) and Rift Valley by the Kenya African National Union (KANU). Whether teachers support these respective parties or not, they have to conform in order to survive.

Globalisation: Lastly, a more recent influence is that of globalisation. The international conventions, e.g. human rights, children's rights, open airwaves, and the exposure to international cultures are changing the behaviour patterns of Kenyans. Twenty years ago, it was impossible to imagine that a debate on abortion or gay people would ever take place in Kenya. However, these debates are now common. Increasingly, as has been highlighted by scholar Aparicio (1998), there is a drift towards the fulfilment of the self above that of



society. This drift has a major influence on how people make choices i.e.; "Is it right for me?"

Thus, as curriculum changes on values education are taking place, other factors beyond the government policy document are having a great impact on the interpretation and implementation of the policy. The manner in which these factors play out in the life of the teacher are core to this study as they form context of analysis. As an opening statement to the findings from the interview sessions, I noted that although Kenya has unique experiences, the findings display a common trend of themes similar to those identified in previous scholarly works, namely diversity, inconsistency, mutability and the contextual nature of the concept of values.

My hypothesis states that the seemingly controversial and unclear way in which values education policy has been developed and implemented in Kenya has resulted in superficial treatment of teacher issues. Consequently, teachers use their own value judgments to interpret the values curriculum.

I begin with presentation of my findings of government schools, followed by private schools and finally religious schools. An important point to note is the fact that for many teachers this study was the first encounter with an explicit reference to values in the context of the curriculum and their day to day school activities. I have coded the responses of teachers as follows: "GH1" meaning Government high school teacher 1 and GP1 for Government primary school teacher 1. The same sequence is followed for the other schools, where I use PP1 to represent Private Primary teacher 1, and PH1 to represent Private high school teacher 1. For the Religious schools I use RP1 for Religious primary teacher 1, and RH1 for Religious high school teacher 1.

5.1 Government schools

Government schools are in the majority (60%) and vary from high performers to least performing schools. The tuition costs of such schools vary, but never reach the level of private schools. Teacher qualifications in these schools also vary, with the renowned secondary schools attracting university graduates. At the primary level, unlike the private schools, most teachers have a diploma in education.



The secondary schools are classified as district, provincial and national schools. This categorisation symbolises not only the status of the school but the geographical location from which it draws students. National schools can be considered as "A" schools, i.e. best. My study was limited to schools in Nairobi, thus the secondary schools I visited could fall within any of the categories, but the primary schools exist strictly at the district level. As mentioned earlier, the three categories represent the diversity of schools in Kenya. In this study I was interested in investigating a cross section of the society.

The management of government schools rests solely with the Ministry of Education, with support from the parents association. All teachers in government schools are recruited and employed by the Ministry, thus they have to adhere to the rules and regulations as stipulated by the Ministry. Wages are governed and administered using the government salary scales.

The challenges that government schools have encountered over the years have generally been linked to access to adequate resources to enable expansion or improvements in schools. For example, with the introduction of free basic primary education in 2002, these schools have absorbed large numbers of learners who were previously not attending school. At the time of conducting the interviews, I visited some primary schools that had an average of 80 learners in a class, using the facilities previously allocated for 40 learners. The secondary schools maintained an average of 46 learners per class. On the human resource side, teachers have complained of a heavy workload and low wages. On a number of occasions, countrywide teacher strikes have been organised to demand from the government improved working conditions. These schools grapple with low morale among teachers due to the poor working conditions. It is against this background that I conducted this study.

5.1.1 Findings

What follows is a presentation of my findings.

As an introduction to the interview sessions, I attempted to establish the level of awareness of teachers about the government policy on values education. This grounding information structured my questions in a manner that allowed for interrogation of areas that were familiar to teachers. Secondly the information enabled me to establish the information base of teachers, bearing in mind my hypothesis that states that teachers are using their own knowledge to interpret government policy on values education. I confirmed that teachers'



awareness of values education is governed by the school environment. What follows are the details:

5.1.1.1 School context as opposed to government policy context

I established that teacher awareness of values is dependent on the school context within which the teacher operates as opposed to the government policy document on values education. The question posed to teachers was- *Are you familiar with the specific goal of SMRV*? The knowledge of existence of the policy is the first step towards making any attempts to understand the concept. Thus if the knowledge of the policy is low, it may follow that understanding of the same can also be limited/

There is a marked difference in levels of awareness of the government policy on values education. On a percentage level, the awareness of the policy was relatively low among teachers in primary schools. The amount of time I spent explaining the goal to some head teachers and class teacher's bears witness to this. In one primary school where I obtained permission to interview some teachers, the head teacher enquired; "Do you want, or does the government want, to introduce another religion to schools?" This head teacher was ignorant of the goal of values education. He was, however, aware of the changes occurring in the curriculum. For him the changes were routine, especially when a new political party came into power. I mentioned earlier that curriculum changes have been associated with political changes, and so the teaching fraternity does not usually take these changes seriously.

In the high schools, the scene was different with a relatively high number of teachers noting that they could vaguely remember hearing of the goal of values in education in their teacher training. I was unable to determine whether the above response was because the teachers were more academically advanced and so could use their reasoning capacity to define values education. I therefore went on to probe why they could only vaguely remember values and elicited this response, "…though it is one of the goals of education, we teachers in general are not responsible, it is the counselling teacher, we do not interfere with her/his work…" (GH1).

The response from this teacher indicates that the interpretation and implementation of values education has maintained the old system, where a pocket of teachers responsible for teaching the subject of Social Ethics and Education (SEE) are still solely responsible for values education. This finding correlates with the literature on teaching as a profession, which



indicates that teachers take time to modify their teaching methods. But in the case of the Kenyan situation, it is a reflection of the teacher's understanding of the goal of SMRV. Despite the mainstreaming of values education, the teaching community has not changed due to limited knowledge among other factors. In the Kenyan context, this interpretation could also be influenced by the manner in which mainstreaming has taken place. As narrated by the teachers during the interviews, the refresher courses organised by the Ministry of Education have normally targeted Religious Education teachers, former teachers of SEE, and counselling teachers. Consequently, the thinking that values education remains the responsibility of a few is maintained.

I posed the same question in another school the response was relatively similar to the first one:

- "...Teacher Service Commission (the employer of teachers in the country) cannot fire me because I do not teach values, but I can be fired if I do not teach my main subject..." (GH2).
- "...the translation of values to pupils cannot be examined...it is not a priority to parents and the education" (GH3).

The above responses begin to question policy implementation and the degree of importance of the values education curriculum. The curriculum, though having mainstreamed values, seems not to have required that teachers, by necessity, should know what the policy entails. Secondly, the management of these schools did not require that teachers be conscious of the policy on values education. Knowledge of the goal was therefore not a central part of their classroom practice. Teachers are proceeding with their assignments despite the curriculum change. This finding goes further to confirm the hypothesis that teachers' practice on values education is informed from other sources besides that of government policy. They continue with their assignments without referring to government policy.

Having gathered information on awareness levels and having noted that government policy was not the source of knowledge for most teachers, I proceeded to the more detailed interrogation that would bring to the fore teacher understanding of values education. The following section presents the different understandings I was able to note.



5.1.1.2 Teacher understanding is based on practical needs as opposed to perceived results

I established that teacher understanding of values is explained by the envisaged practical outcome – i.e. what is the benefit of having values? The question posed to teachers was - *In your own words, what is SMRV?* Responses and experiences varied: in some instances, I came across teachers and head teachers who were completely ignorant of SMRV in education. They believed that they were in the profession to teach academic subjects, and nothing more this was mostly common with math teachers. For example the teacher who claimed that,

"...when I am teaching division, I concentrate on learners getting the concept right, I do not go into explaining that division is related to sharing as a value...that I do not do and do not see myself doing it..." (GH5).

"...they have changed the examples of multiplication from, e.g. having mangoes to demonstrate multiplication, they now have examples on number of people tested for HIV & AIDS...but I stick to the multiplication, I do not talk of HIV since I do not know much..."(GH3).

In other situations I felt moved by the effort taken by teachers to develop their students holistically.

I recorded similar concepts to explain values education, namely teaching obedience, humility, trustworthiness, and good behaviour. The difference in interpretation, I noted was in the philosophical grounding. In the government schools, obedience was important for it mediated teacher/learner relationships. In private schools obedience was important in as far as it ensured high academic achievement. Learners had to obey teachers so that they could live harmoniously and in the latter case, so that they could pass exams. It was common to hear expressions like, "... they have to learn to listen and obey us..." (GP1), "...students need to be respectful to teachers..." (GP2).

I also noted that teachers perceive SMRV from a narrow perspective. For these teachers, values education are principles or tools that help them manage their students as opposed to it being a strategy for ensuring that students internalise moral values that influence their daily



lives. I recorded expressions like – "it would be good if SMRV would stop the drug abuse..." (GH2).

Although stopping drug abuse may have a long term impact, the teacher who gave this statement was referring to the more immediate concern in the school. On the same question, another teacher said that,

"...what you are referring to er er...values or I would like to call it discipline, is important for I have to ensure that students are obedient..." (GP3).

The element of good behaviour seemed to dominate the discussion on the definition of values education. As alluded to earlier, teachers in government schools have always complained of a heavy workload due to the congested curriculum and high number of learners. This situation does not leave the teacher with any time for creativity. All they want to do is to complete the curriculum in the simplest and quickest way possible. A primary teacher in trying to emphasise the point of workload and the general working conditions, described her daily life:

"I earn US\$300 per month, which can only allow me to live in a one roomed cottage. I walk to work. Due to the free education introduced in 2002, I now have a class of 70 learners, I take all the 8 subjects taught at primary level, meaning that I have no free time to reflect during the day; I am expected to mark 70 x the 8 subjects I teach. How do you expect me to be creative and even think about inculcating values in a student, when I hardly have time to plan my academic lessons effectively?" (GP4).

She concluded by saying that, "I move with those who are ready to move" (GP4). Whilst the education policy has tried to mainstream values in the curriculum, there seems to be an assumption as to the capacity of teachers to absorb, internalise and practice the concept. I say this because the unique situations in which teachers find themselves do not feature in the policy. Kenya introduced free primary education in 2002; this move resulted in government schools taking on more students. This fact, among others, is reflected nowhere in the policy. In the example above, other social conditions including the large class that the teacher has to



teach, are wearing down on the teacher to a level where they are barely making it through the day. This has led to a situation where there is a gap between policy expectations and practice.

The diverse explanations of values that I found among teachers were a result of either the contextual nature of the concept or a clear representation of a concept vaguely understood.

Having established that teachers have mechanically interpreted values education to suit their practical teaching needs, I pursued the interrogation into areas that would explain the knowledge base of teachers. The response to this question would enlighten the study as to the key reference points for teachers. The following section explains my findings.

5.1.2 Teachers understanding of values is rooted in their history and experience

I noted as in other studies before mine, that teachers' understanding is rooted in their cultural, social and religious backgrounds. Teachers highlighted the fact that they used more than one factor simultaneously, in order to reach a decision. However, they were still able to identify some factors according to priority. The question posed to teachers was- when faced with situations where you have to make a value judgment, what informs your decision?

The interview sessions elucidated the different opinions and sources of knowledge used by teachers. Though leading to the same goal, it was evident that the various interpretations were based on different ideological, religious, social and professional backgrounds of teachers. I noted that teachers are influenced significantly by the community in which they were integrated. In other words, teachers do not act as isolated individuals, but as members of a community.

Religion inevitably was the most frequently mentioned premise that guided teacher decision making. For example, I had the following conversation with a teacher,

Maggie: If one of your students wanted to have an abortion, what would you say?

Teacher: I would discourage her.

Maggie: Why?

Teacher: She can die...it is just not right.



Maggie: Who said it is not right if the girl's schooling is at stake?

Teacher I use what my pastor has said or my knowledge as a mother... or I think about

what my mother would have said to me if I was pregnant...

Unfortunately, most teachers associate SMRV with religion. The hangovers of having SEE as a preserve of some teachers still prevails in the thoughts of teachers, with teachers of SEE labelled "the holy ones". Teachers rarely considered SMRV to be a key feature in national development. For teachers, values were a personal individual choice. The same way that teachers have freedom to choose their religion, they should have the same freedom to decide which values to adopt or not. The above sentiments by teachers demonstrate that most teachers have not embraced the education policy on values and further confirms the hypothesis that teachers are not using government policy as a source of information or practice, since they are not utilising it.

Culturally, it is evident that some traditional settings determine how teachers make value judgments. It was common to hear teachers say, "...In our culture, girls are not allowed to ..., I would use that knowledge in such a situation...", meaning that the cultural setting in which the teacher is brought up also affects their decision. If a teacher is brought up in a setting where the role of women is subordinate to men, they readily use this knowledge in their professional life.

In an effort to get more details related to culture, I asked what they would consider a well-rounded student to be. Those coming from traditions, where the high power distance factor was critical, were quick to say that,

"In my community, a good student is one who respects elders, is obedient, knows what is expected of him/her from the community, one who listens to advice, one who dresses decently, and one who is humble..." (GP5).

Note the strong sense of "community" as opposed to the "individual". This is a traditional way of valuing people. Teachers seem to consider a reverence attitude from students as a value. This is a cultural understanding, which goes beyond teacher student relationship, but also incorporates cultural gender considerations. Responses generated in interviews emphasised the fact that teachers carry their cultural beliefs into the classroom and even



portrayed heavy gender biases that they used in arriving at decisions. For example, subject choices for girls and boys - teachers are instrumental in persuading boys to take on sciences and girls the art subjects. These are biases that teachers carry into the classroom from their cultural and social backgrounds.

Other issues raised by teachers include:

"...Personal convictions, nature/age of stakeholder, finances, government policy, role models, social status of teacher, parents' attitude, research, background of student, influential characters, knowledge base, constitution, workload, and urban/rural setting ..." (Group response of GH &GP).

The above responses by teachers can be classified as socio-economic issues that the teacher encounters in his/her daily life. There is nothing factual or straight forward about them, and every teacher can come up with their own strategy based on their preferences. The issues raised reveal limited/professionally based decision-making, such as government policy, or professional training. A possible conclusion is that teachers make subjective decisions that are largely based on survival. I noted that teachers were preoccupied with pleasing the people they considered important, those who "... determine the cheque ...", nothing will be done to put at risk the "cheque".

Teachers have become very cautious. The mandate and security enjoyed in the past has been eroded. Thus, teachers are unwilling to spend time and effort on issues that may jeopardise their source of income.

The next level of questions attempted to clarify and identify other finer details that have an impact on decision making. For example, was age or sex of the teacher an important factor in values education.

5.1.3 Teachers' values are a microcosm of societal values

I noted that teachers' value judgments are enmeshed in prevailing society thinking, i.e. teachers' understandings were a reflection of their immediate environment and circumstances. The claim that teachers are the mirror of society was a constant theme in the literature on values education.



In some instances, scholars have asked why the teacher is expected to have such high standards, whilst they were part of a society that was not keeping the same standards. The question I put forward to teachers was, *What other issues influence your thinking on values?*

To emphasise the distance between the policy and teacher practice, I recorded that a relatively small number of teachers (30) identified their teacher training background as a source of information on values education. Teacher preparation is the main strategy used by the Ministry of Education to influence teacher practice. Thirty of the 180 teachers interviewed is a relatively low number especially if the above number is extrapolated to get a countrywide representation. It would mean that the government is far from achieving its goal, since it influences a paltry 16% of the teaching fraternity.

Teachers expressed doubts as to whether values education was ever meant for implementation or whether it will ever receive the much-needed attention. A secondary school teacher remarked, "...this system does not have a way of monitoring or rewarding anything other than academic achievement..."(GH5). One can conclude from this that what is taking place in schools is a microcosm of society, where values of materialism take precedence over moral values. In the school system, a teacher is judged by the pass rate of his or her students, not on how good their character is, or how they fit into society. Teachers complained openly about the limited support they received from parents. Parents, they claimed, showed very little interest in their children's education. One teacher expressed the following:

I have been in this school for four years, I have never met the parents of ... [learner]; I only saw them in second term of her fourth year after the mock exams, three months away from her final exams. They came because they felt that the mock results of their daughter were an indication that she may not do well in the final examinations....Can you imagine, where have these parents been all these years... how can you talk about values to such parents?... (GH6).



As a conclusion to the interview session, I requested teachers to share in one sentence, their meaning of values and the challenges they experience in trying to implement values education. From this question I noted the following.

5.1.4 Teachers' understanding of values is "fluid"

I noted that teachers' understanding kept shifting as the discussions progressed. I recorded different meanings provided for the same concepts and in some instances, government policy was condemned then later used as a perfect example, e.g. the education strategy of "family life education" as opposed to "sex education".

A host of reasons could be attributed to the conflicting and shifting understanding, namely: inadequate teacher preparation for implementing values in education; inadequate teaching materials; limited parental support; limited time to evaluate outcomes of a value based curriculum; discipline - abolition of corporal punishment; and the general hypocrisy of society. The above mentioned reasons left the teacher with no choice but to withdraw from key issues of values.

My conclusion is that though teachers may claim to understand the concept of SMRV, the environment in which they are working will determine how they interpret the concept and whether they will practice the values in their daily professional life. Secondly, teacher understanding is dominated by their life experiences both present and past. The response from one teacher seems to summarise the whole concept of teachers being a reflection of society. "...what the society appreciates as good..." (GP3).

5.2 Private schools

These schools are very costly, and created to serve the upper middle class and high class of society. The schools attract both local and international students. Private schools follow the curriculum set by the government and in addition offer options for the British Cambridge Curriculum. Teachers in these schools tend to be highly qualified with a university degree as the minimal entry requirement. It is important to mention, however, that there is a second category of private schools, which normally serve the low income and have earned themselves a poor name of being money-making ventures. Due to the shortage of schools,



the government has on many occasions overlooked the operations of low income private schools. My study purposefully concentrated on the first category: the elite private schools.

Comparatively, teachers in private schools earn a competitive market salary and their working conditions are much better than those found in government schools. Teachers in these schools have access to development loans and therefore tend to be more financially stable. The average number of learners in a class range from 25 to 35. The major challenge identified in private schools is job security - learners are from the elite of society and parents expect high output from teachers. The attitude and general demands of satisfying this clientele can be very stressful for some teachers.

Due to the environment, I found that teachers in these schools were constantly on the alert. Every statement or move they made was checked to ensure that they did not disrupt the harmonised relationship with students or their parents. It is in this light that they responded to the questions I raised on values education.

I began my interview sessions by trying to establish the level of awareness among teachers on values education. This correlates with my hypothesis that claimed that teachers use other sources of knowledge besides that of government policy. The following is a presentation of my findings.

5.2.1 The school context has more influence on teachers' values than the government policy

As stated under the government schools, I established that teacher awareness of values is dependent on the school context within which the teacher operates, as opposed to the government policy document on values education. In private schools, due to the demands, I found that the level of awareness of the government goal on values education was high. This was attributed to the ethos of the school as confirmed by a teacher:

"We are under the spotlight of the parents; we have to explain to them when curriculum changes, thus we have to be in touch with issues..." (PH1).

Accountability to stakeholders is the reason why teachers in private schools are aware of the goal on values education. The strong message that was conveyed from the conversation and observations of these was that they chose to join the private school, thus they had to meet the



demands. As a follow up question, I attempted to establish whether the high level of awareness was present at all private schools.

The general response was the following:

"Some of our colleagues are only now getting to know about the goal, since it now involves them in their subjects. Before they did not know about it... they only followed what was laid down by the school..." (PH2).

The above response suggests the existence of another system of values education besides that of the government. I went on to probe this issue and established that apart from a detailed briefing from the head teacher on expectations, teachers are provided with a document on ethos when they join the school. This document spells out what is expected of the teacher. A review of the document shows that it provides detailed guidelines as to how teachers should conduct themselves within the teaching fraternity and how they should interact with learners and their parents. In one school I visited, the teachers narrated the following incident.

"I was new to the school and so I was writing end of term report cards for the first time in this school. I completed my report cards quickly as this was an exercise I was accustomed too; I wondered why my colleagues were not as fast as I was to complete theirs. I felt very proud of my achievement and handed my reports to the principal for To my surprise, all the reports were final signing. returned. I was summoned to the principals' office. She tried to hide the disappointment on her face, but I could see through the simple smile that all was not well. The principal took a sample of four report cards to demonstrate her point to me. It was all a matter of language and the implications that some of my statements would generate. In my previous school, I used language I considered appropriate, this is not the case in a private school, for example if I said that "... could do better..." I had to explain what I meant, since more than one meaning could



be derived, i.e. that the student with more effort could do better, or that the student has purposely not been performing well thus the poor results. It was at this moment that I realised that I did not have the freedom to say whatever I thought. Secondly, little did I know that I had to sit with each parent and explain every word on the report card. These conditions, made me realise how I have to take personal interest in every child. I have to give an account to the parents, thus I have to take more responsibility" (PP1).

The above narrative confirms a different set of regulations besides that of the government. This set of regulations take precedence over government policy. I was interested in finding out why the government policy, though known to the school authorities, was not a reference point. The response was as follows:

"Though we know of the policy, we do not follow everything as stated. We know what works for us; we just ensure that we are within the policy..." (PH3).

Private schools have their own code of conduct that is determined by two key stakeholders. The first stakeholder is the parents. Parents with children in private schools form the elite of the country and thus have set standards and expectations they would like for their children. The standards represent a mixed bag of western influences, whilst at the same time maintaining some indigenous characteristics. These standards, as I will get to discuss later, keep changing with international developments.

The second stakeholder is the owner of the school. Private schools are business ventures. The entrepreneurs set standards that would ensure that they maintain their clientele. In some schools, parents demand that teachers who teach the British Cambridge option need to have gone through the British curriculum system themselves. This has resulted in expatriate teachers being recruited.

With the above background, I proceeded to seek details as to teacher understanding of the values education curriculum. The question posed to teachers was, *In your own words, what is SMRV?*



5.2.2 Teachers' understanding of values is governed by immediate professional needs as compared to long term life long issues

I established that just as in the government schools, where teacher understanding is governed by the immediate practical demands, the same applied in the private schools; i.e. what are the benefits? The main difference between the two schools was found in the emphasis. In the case of private schools, the driving force for values education was directly related to academic achievements. In other words, values were professional tools that supported teachers to produce the best academic results from their students. A summary of the concepts expressed by teachers are characterised by broad overlapping terms as follows.

"Obedience, responsibility, acceptability, cooperation, tolerance, trust, balanced personality, self-discipline, humble, independent, and integrated citizen".

These teachers understood values as a tool that enabled them to efficiently manage their schools. Their professional bias seemed to dominate their judgment. In reinforcing the professional bias, one teacher remarked, "I distance myself from the decision; this enables me to be "fair" and "objective" (PH1). Another teacher contributing to the discussion said, "We teachers are like judges...we have no time for feelings..." (PH2).

This stance gives the impression that the personality of the teacher is removed from the centre of decision making. This is contrary to other scholarly findings which alluded to the fact that the emotional side of the teacher is the driving force behind decision making. Though I noted teachers' statements, I would like to record that the interviews elicited great emotion, which seems to be in total contrast to the objective angle presented. The objective stance can be attributed to the issue identified at the beginning, in chapter 6, where I observed that teachers in these schools are on guard, checking all their statements and moves. I will confirm the level of importance of the professional side of the teacher when conducting a comparison of the conceptual understanding against classroom practice.

Another factor I noted is that a fairly good number of the private schools seem to emphasise the element of order. To some teachers a school's success was dependent on the level of orderliness and obedience. One head teacher said.



"I really do not care which church or whose child you are, you have to be cooperative...or build your own school..." (PH3).

The driving force for values seems to be a market led success with parents of learners in these schools having high academic expectations. Thus teachers' understanding of values tilted towards meeting the high academic expectations. What were therefore considered as values were traits that had a direct contribution to the learners' achievement of academic excellence.

Having established that the school environment is a key determinant of teacher's understanding, I attempted to confirm this find by rephrasing the question. I posed the following question to teachers, *When faced with situations where you have to make a value judgment, what determines/informs your decision?* The following are the findings.

5.2.3 Teachers' understanding of values shifts and is obscure

Teachers were hesitant to confirm confidently which values they promote. They identified the fact that they receive mixed signals from society. I noted competing claims of what values should be and how implementation should take place. The multicultural context of the school within which teachers operate seemed to heighten the disillusionment and dilemma of teachers.

In one focus group, teachers informed me that despite the strictly framed environment within which they worked, they were still not confident of which values to promote. I went on to probe further and one teacher responded by narrating the following incident.

"We normally have sports day and used to invite parents to participate in activities... children in this school come from rich backgrounds and there is a belief that the food that the school offers is not up to standard. On the day that parents are visiting, they are allowed to bring picnic lunches... This was fine, but what happened is that parents would arrive for the sports day, and instead of delaying the picnic to after the sports events, they would call their children to start eating. In the meantime the sports events are delayed as students are all over the



place...just imagine! What do you expect a teacher to say to the children, whilst it is the parents who are keeping them away from the sports field? This school has since disallowed parents from attending the inter-house sports day (PH4).

In this case, the school has adjusted to suit parents' demands. The questions that arise from this incident are; what would have happened if it was an individual teacher versus a student? Secondly, was the school right in adjusting to suit the parents and not confronting the issue? What message is the school sending? And whose interest is it serving? These are some of the confusing and inconsistent issues related to societal values that filter into the school environment.

Teachers are anxious not to be seen to impose or get into conflict/confrontation with parents. One teacher claimed that they seem to float in emptiness not very sure where to anchor. In some instances even though they were convinced that they were right, their views had to take second place. A teacher expressed his disgust with the choices he thought that elite parents have made, where academic achievements take centre stage. To him, it was misplaced priorities. He said

"Do you think parents care, when you call them for a meeting due to disciplinary problems? They do not turn up or only the mother comes. But if you tell them you want to discuss their child's marks, they both turn up for the appointment, so why bother about the learner's personality?" (PP3).

Having established that the school determined the manner in which teachers explained values, I went on to enquire from the teachers of any other sources of information. This is when I noted the fluidity of teachers understanding of values. The teachers presented a two faced value system. One value system was directed at meeting their professional expectations, while the other was for their private lives, which was mediated and informed by their religious beliefs or modernity.

"When I am in school, obedience means no explanations or compromise, at home, I negotiate with my children and give them the freedom to choose. Here I am at work and have to follow..." (PH4).



Scholarly works on values education argued that values have to be internalised, they have to be lived. In the example above, we see a situation where teachers have two sets of values, one for professional reasons and the other for their private lives. One teacher in trying to emphasise the above said, "You think I can bring my child to this school..." (PH5), showing that the values they espouse in the school, are for school purposes and they do not necessarily have to believe in them.

As a conclusion to the investigation of private schools, I would state that teachers in these schools are governed by strict regulations that they have to adhere to. These teachers, unlike their colleagues in the government schools, have limited leeway to make their own value judgments. Even in situations where they may feel they have better ideas, the school ethos and regulations do not allow them to work outside the stipulated framework. The findings on the private schools confirm partially the hypothesis which stated that teachers, due to their limited training on values were using their own standards to make value judgment. In the above case, teachers, though not using government policy, were not using their own standards, but those stipulated in their respective schools.

5.3 Religious schools

Religious schools (Muslim and Christian) were considered the most prestigious institutions, with every parent aspiring to have their children attend these schools. Student entry to these schools is highly competitive and the same applies for teachers. These are the famous "convent" or "Saint" Schools, and the more recent being those run by the Pentecostal churches and Salvation Army. These schools are considered as the ultimate, since they operate on both a private and religious basis. The combination means that learners are exposed not only to the best academic facilities, but also to strong spiritual grounding.

Teachers in these schools, though highly qualified are not as well remunerated as those in private schools. The working conditions are fairly good, with the number of learners per class ranging from 35 to 45. Opportunities for extra curriculum activities are high; teachers in these schools have unique chances of exposure, and these opportunities draw a number of teachers. Morale in these schools is relatively high and a strong sense of purpose seems to prevail.



Just as in the other schools, my starting point was to establish the level of awareness of teachers on the government policy document. This question was in direct response to my hypothesis, which claimed that teachers are using other sources of knowledge besides that of government policy to interpret the curriculum on values education. These findings, as will be seen below, confirm that the hypothesis was not far from the truth.

5.3.1 The school context as opposed to the government policy document determined teacher awareness

In the Christian and Muslim schools, the level of awareness of the government policy on values education was high. The variance found in the different schools is testimony to the fact that teacher awareness is dependent on the school context, which is determined by the management philosophy of the school.

As a follow up question I sought to find out why levels of awareness were extremely high, and discovered that besides the daily religious festivals and activities that take place within the schools, religious schools have been deeply involved since 2002 in the development of the values curriculum. Churches, as highlighted earlier, had been antagonised by the introduction of SEE as a subject. The subject was viewed as a threat to the more established religious education. They therefore volunteered their teachers to participate in the curriculum development process, not only as a professional exercise, but to ensure that their respective religious interests were incorporated and protected.

Despite recording a high level of awareness of government policy on values, I noted that the policy was not a serious reference point in the schools. This was a similar finding to that in private schools. The government policy served as a confirmation to these schools that their emphasis on values education was the right way to go. As expressed by one teacher,

"They [government] have realised that our students are much better citizens, thus they are trying to emulate how we do things in our schools..." (RH1).

In the same interview, in an effort to reinforce his colleagues' assertion of the government being an amateur in values education, another teacher responded by saying that,

"The government is a Johnnie come lately in mainstreaming values education" (PH2).



Teachers who participated in the interviews seemed to question the wisdom of complying with a policy and instructions from an institution (government) that is only trying to grapple with the concept of values. I noted a superior attitude displayed by teachers, with others saying that;

"After all, the government relied heavily on the expertise found in religious schools to develop its current values curriculum..." (RH3).

Another fundamental reason as to why government policy was not a key reference point was the fact that religious schools are founded on religious philosophies of the respective religions. As this teacher expressed,

"Government policy on values is fine, but our main reason for running the school is not based on government, but on our religious convictions. It was the parishioners who decided that we should have a school to serve our community..." (RP1).

Thus, the knowledge on values is grounded on the principles of the respective religions. The philosophies of the various religions differ, but generally require that education go beyond the academic to addressing the spiritual development of the learner. In one school, the head teacher made it very clear that the school did not employ any teacher who was not a "born again" Christian.

The above responses serve to confirm the hypothesis that claimed that the government policy was not the key reference point for teachers with regard to values education. Having recorded the level of awareness, I moved on to investigate teacher understanding of values. The question posed was, *In your own words what is SMRV*?

5.3.2 Teacher understanding is strongly influenced by religious and historical experiences

I found two kinds of teachers in these schools, those who were strong religious believers and the more liberal teachers. The strong religious teachers were especially found in the schools where the key criteria used to select teachers were on their religious convictions, or "born again". A good number of teachers in these schools seemed passionate about their careers. They believed that they were there to serve; it was a calling, therefore everything they did,



they referred to the principles of the Almighty. This could either be the Bible or the Koran. Therefore the concepts they raised as representative of their understanding of values were:

"Love, patience, serving others, consideration of others, honesty, pure heart, humility and things that help learners to live harmoniously with everyone in society" (Group discussions Primary and High).

As opposed to their counterparts in the government and private schools, the emphasis of values for teachers in religious schools was more of a long term nature. There were virtues that make a learner good now and forever. These teachers aligned everything to their religion and their understanding drew reference to the Bible / Koran. I found that teachers in these schools took conscientious and intentional actions, since they have established basic beliefs and core notions of what constitutes right or wrong. For example, "...students have to be good, as the Heavenly Father is good...". "You have to forgive, since your Heavenly Father also forgives you...".

These principles were imprinted in teachers such that their relationship with students was mediated in the same way and thus they ensured that students treated each other in the same way. I noted a certain level or sense of freedom among the teachers. Though they may not have been eloquent in their definition, they demonstrated a level of confidence in what they said.

I also met some secular teachers, who said that due to the constant contact with their fellow teachers and the general management of the school, they had begun to live according to the values as stipulated in the school ethos. This leads to the second finding that states that teacher understanding is enhanced by experience.

5.3.3 Teacher understanding is enhanced by constant encounter/application of values and accumulated experience as opposed to gender or age of the teacher

Teachers respond to the environment in which they work. I found that even secular teachers in religious schools used religious concepts to explain their understanding of values. As one teacher expressed:



"I have been here for three years...you will not survive this long if you do things your own way,... you have to tow the line...I now know what to do in different circumstances... the expectations of the teacher are clear..." (RP2).

There are basic principles that the teacher is expected to adhere to and these rules affect the teacher's decision making regarding values. The teachers' understanding is independent of government education policy on SMRV and is repeated and evaluated on a daily basis by the school management.

Further confirming the notion of environment, I found that teachers' values judgments were much more sharpened with experience or encounter with value laden issues. Teachers who had previously taught SEE were more at ease with the integrated curriculum as compared with their colleagues who had to adopt values in their daily lessons. One teacher said:

"I was alert on [the] issue of values when I was on duty and had to encounter disciplinary issues ...I would make sure I considered all the things as stipulated in the rules, now I literally have to be alert in my literature class, which is a big challenge..." (RH3).

The above teacher's expression of "stipulated rules" shows that some teachers in these schools, just as in the government and private schools, consider values from a much narrower perspective. They see values as a tool that would enable teachers to manage their learners, as opposed to a way of life. Their values were focused more on the behaviour of the learner.

Teachers in these schools, just as those in the private and government schools, highlighted the fact that their life experiences, especially their encounter with some key persons in their upbringing, had a great influence on how they make value judgments. These were parents, teachers or leaders. The teachers were, however, governed by the very regulations set by the schools, which leave them with very little room for exploration of ideas, especially if they were not in accordance with school beliefs.

5.4 Summary

The findings from the respective schools strongly suggest that teacher understanding is heavily influenced by the immediate environment within which the teacher operates.

Teachers mentioned other influences besides the school, but due to the framework within which they operate, their thinking is forced to shift. In the private and religious schools, the



emphasis and framework is more pronounced as compared to the environment found in government schools. For example, the media and Internet were continuously mentioned as sources of information. But these sources could only be a point of reference in as far as it enhanced the ethos of the school.

Government policy was not a key reference point for teachers. Exploring the reasons why this was so shows that the policy was far removed from the immediate circumstances in which teachers found themselves and, the fact that government was considered an authority in values education. One teacher from the government school said,

"...those people [government]...they make statements not knowing what the conditions are in the class..." (GH6).

The concept of the "human face of education" was highlighted in a number of discussions. In the Kenyan context, this is an important point to consider for it says something about the curriculum. The curriculum has on many occasions come under criticism for being too congested and too academic, depriving students of time to develop skills and attitudes in other areas of growth. This is a sentiment that is also expressed in the teacher preparation programme.

I recorded mixed reactions across the board on teacher responsibility on values education. Some teachers were not willing to take responsibility for the character of students, especially if it was negative. In schools that were acknowledged for having high levels of discipline, the teachers were more willing to take responsibility, though the issue of parents and support from government were highlighted as important factors in values education. To reinforce this point, during the interviews, teachers continually mentioned the terms "shared" or "accepted". These expressions highlight the current concerns in society, where every family seems to have its own definition of what they want from their children. Teachers are frustrated in their efforts and an environment of uncertainty and insecurity seems to prevail due to fragmented beliefs.

Religion continues to be an important influence in values education. Many teachers seemed to relate values to religion, and this could be a contributory factor as to why the government is not considered as an authority in the sector. Contestation between government strategies



and those of religious groupings are ongoing. The thought that the new values curriculum would address the problems is far from being realised. Unfortunately teachers' issues are neglected, with the impact being more significant in those teachers who have no strong school based reference point, in this case the government schools.

As I move to the observed sessions, I would like to emphasise that though teachers expressed values in broad overlapping terms, they displayed considerable consensus on the need for values education. The testimonies showed the varied situations teachers find themselves in, with some recording high levels of enthusiasm diversity in the concept interpretation; confusion as to which way to go and in many cases, frustration as teachers do not understand the government strategy on values education.

A number of teachers could not make a direct connection to the benefits of values education. To them it was seen as extra work. I would therefore be justified in concluding that teachers are not readily conscious of values in their practice as compared to their role of building the academic knowledge of their learners. A table developed through the interviews sessions with the teachers is presented in Appendix 1. The concepts demonstrate what they would consider values education in practice.



CHAPTER SIX

THE PRACTICE OF VALUES EDUCATION IN KENYAN SCHOOLS

6 Introduction

In this chapter, I describe my observation of practice in three different classroom environments and one discussion forum. I was interested in determining whether teachers' stated understanding corroborated with what they practiced. The discussion forum intended to broaden my understanding of some observed behaviour unique to male teachers. The observations spanned a period of three months, and I spent one month with each teacher.

Pseudonyms have been used for the respective teachers. Mrs Andia was a form two teacher who taught at a Christian secondary school. Miss Atieno was a grade seven teacher in a government primary school and Mr Okello was a teacher at a private school. I observed a grade seven class in primary school and form two classes in the two secondary schools. In the private school, Mr Okello taught at both primary and secondary level. It was interesting to note the different techniques employed in dealing with the various age groups. Messrs Bodo, Kedogo and Kamau participated in the discussion forum.

I begin by providing a brief background to the three teachers, and describe the key observed behaviours that emerged in the classroom situation. This is followed by an excerpt from the discussion forum. In conclusion I present a cross synthesis of key findings. My findings were deduced from key tenets of my observation, namely, language, relationship with students, and other colleagues, and content analysis of subjects taught.

The basis for observation was arrived at in a participatory manner with the teachers during the focus group discussions and key informant interviews. In the secondary school, I specifically requested to observe teachers in the social science classes. As I am a social scientist myself, I would not have been able to evaluate the content of a science subject satisfactorily. It was critical that I be able to understand the content of the subject so as to firstly appreciate the values embedded in the subject and have a wider vision of how values can be promoted in the subject, and secondly I needed to arrive at objective analysis.



This is only possible if one fully understands the subject. At the primary level, subject area was not an issue. The government and religious schools acceded to my request, but the private school gave me a teacher of pure science to observe.

I observed the traits as raised by the teachers during the interview sessions and enhanced this by observing how the teachers; in practice, promoted the universally acclaimed values of love, honesty and truthfulness, kindness, consideration and concern for others, compassion, obedience, responsibility, respect and diligence. Secondly, I listened to the language that was used in the classroom, particularly that which showed consideration, respect, understanding, helpfulness, knowledge ability, and humility. I also wished to determine how responsive the language was to learners' needs. Lastly, I noted the kind of relationship that the teacher had with his or her students. The literature on education has emphasised the importance of the teacher pupil relationship, terming it as critical to the learning of the pupil.

In order to manage the vast amount of information gathered, I decided to present it in four different ways. At the government school represented by Miss Atieno, the captured data has been synthesised into a single day in her teaching life. At the private school, as represented by Mr Okello, the information has been presented through the lens of three key characteristics of the students. At the religious school, as represented by Mrs Andia, the information has been presented using some unique incidents that took place whilst I was at the school. Lastly, the forum is presented in discussion format.

I am confident that this manner of presentation will bring out all the key observed findings. I therefore begin with the government school, followed by the private school, then the religious school and lastly the excerpt from the discussion.

6.1 Government primary school

Miss Atieno is a young teacher (23 years) who has been practising for two years. The school she teaches at is located in a lower middle-income suburb known as Langata. Following the introduction of free education in 2002, the number of students has increased tremendously, and Miss Atieno now has a class of 70 children. The school is in close proximity to a high-density slum area known as Kibera, and this has been the major reason for the increase in average class numbers. Slum areas always contain large numbers of out of school children, and so free education and a government policy that does not permit any child to be turned



away from school, has resulted in the dramatic increase in the learner population at schools in these localities.

Miss Atieno has a diploma in education, and has specialised in Home Economics and English. She is head of the Home Economics department. Teachers in government schools are required to move with their students from grade one to five, and then return to grade one. The upper grades have subject specialist teachers. Thus, Miss Atieno teaches grades 5, 6, 7, and 8 in Home Economics and also supports the English teacher.

As an introduction to my one-month stay with Miss Atieno, I asked her for a definition of values education. The following summary provides some insights into her understanding of the subject.

Values are the things we like...anything you find important and would like to protect, for example I value my freedom and I will do anything to protect it,...in the school environment values are those things that guide the head teacher and the teachers to run the school,...they bring us together...

I will now proceed to describe a typical day in Miss Atieno's professional life. She arrives at school at exactly 7.45am every day. On this specific day, she arrived at 7.30am because she was on duty, and had to deal with a cross section of students and issues beyond her normal Home Economics or English class. She apologised for being unable to give me the attention I needed as she was going to be very busy. After ensuring that the Assembly ran smoothly, Miss Atieno had to refocus her attention back to her normal classes that ran without a break. The government does not have enough funds to employ another home economics teacher and so Miss Atieno is responsible for all Home Economics lessons in the upper primary classes.

Her first lesson was a grade six class in which she taught English. Her enthusiasm seems to suggest that she preferred this class to any other English class. She made use of the current English curriculum, which has "mainstreamed" the concepts of values. On this particular day, she was dealing with sentence construction, where we find the following:



Topic

Virtues: Responsibility, generosity, obedience, honesty, hardworking, obedience, kind, kindness, kindly, trustworthy, trust, trustworthiness.

Aim: To enable the learner to develop further vocabulary and sentence structures relating to moral virtues and social responsibility and use them appropriately.

Specific objective

By the end of the unit, the learner should be able to:

- Talk about some moral virtues that they know
- Use the sentence structures and vocabulary correctly
- Read text and passages and answer comprehension questions
- · Read for pleasure

Some examples:

- She reminded the children to tell the truth at all times.
- The teacher encouraged the pupils to visit the sick old lady.

I listened to Miss Atieno's meticulous teaching. Sentences constructed were of a high quality and the students demonstrated that they had understood the lesson on sentence construction. I waited for the time when she would move the discussion from sentence construction to an explanation of the virtues, as the syllabus demands. This did not happen, and the period ended. Miss Atieno had five minutes to collect her books and move to the next class, and this time the lesson was Home Economics.

The grade seven Home Economics class was a practical lesson, in which students were learning different kinds of sewing stitches. Each student was expected to bring their own material, thread and needle. The school only provided a pair of scissors and material for the teacher to demonstrate. Half the class did not have the necessary materials to participate in this lesson. This situation would have been very frustrating for most teachers, but, to my



surprise, Miss Atieno proceeded with the lesson as though there was nothing amiss. The students who had no material either tried to copy from their friends, or openly engaged in other activities like reading novels. At one stage, one girl who had appeared to have been following the lesson and taking serious notes raised her hand and asked a question. She elicited the following:

Nyambura When do we use the backstitch?

Atieno (Walked to her table and realised that she had no material)

"Why are you wasting my time, are you trying to show off to our visitor...how do you expect to learn without material...some of you students should have remained in the slums..."

This was the last lesson before break and by the time the bell rang for lunch, I felt really tired, and wondered what teachers like Miss Atieno felt like after the lesson. During lunch break, despite the fact that she was on duty, I looked for the first opportunity to refer her back to the standard six English class. Initially she could not remember what lesson I was referring to, until I reminded her of an incident where she had rebuked a boy called Musa and challenged him to work hard or the girls would soon surpass him. The following conversation ensued:

Atieno "Ooh that lesson, the only way to get some of these boys to work is to tease or compare them to the girls...Boys feel superior to girls and will do anything to beat the girls in class... Is that what you wanted to know...?"

Maggie "No", I replied, "I wanted to find out how you ensured that the virtues you highlighted in the lesson moved from sentence level to actual practice?"

Atieno "...I was trained to teach English; I was not trained to teach values in English. When I am teaching sentence construction I am interested in the subject/verb group and not necessarily that the word used is e.g. sharing, therefore I need to go into the details of explaining the importance of sharing. ... for me to do so, it would mean that I have to go through a different kind of teacher preparation..., secondly, when do you think I will complete the syllabus?"

Maggie (Reflection): Must have seen the disappointed expression on my face and was thus quick to add, the following:



Atieno "Despite our tight schedule and limited resources, the school tries its level best to remind students of good values...look at all the posters on the wall, they cover different issues from HIV/AIDS to cleanliness and these are practical reminders to the learners."

I was careful not to be judgmental, but remembered the transfer theory, which states that when the situation of acquisition is too dissimilar to the situation of performance, transference cannot occur (Brown 1999). Children in Miss Atieno's school are expected to read the posters, understand and act on them.

From my initial encounter with Miss Atieno, I determined that she was a cheerful, polite and pleasant teacher. She knew her subject content and tried her best to impart the required skills to her students. Her greatest challenge, though, seemed to be in managing some of her classes. Some students took advantage of the fact that Miss Atieno would not punish them. On many occasions, I was surprised to witness her continuing with the lesson, even when a handful of students were definitely not paying attention or were involved in other activities. On this particular day, it was evident that in the grade seven Home Economics lesson, students were literally sleeping or conducting their own conversations. When I questioned Miss Atieno about this, she said,

Atieno "Do I look like I have the energy to tell students what they are in school for...these are big children? I did not force them to come to school...if they do not know why they are in school, it is not my responsibility... their parents should tell them...it is up to them...".

The school day at this government school terminated at 17.00 hrs. Learners departed at 16.30 and the duty teacher had half an hour in which to ensure that the school was left with all in order for the next day. Miss Atieno and I decided to use the half hour to reflect on the events of the day. Just as this reflective period of 30 minutes was about to commence, we heard a raucous din coming from the headmaster's office.

Narrative: Three grade three boys were caught fighting. The fight among the boys erupted because they were sharing one book, and two of the boys were faster than the third. The one who had not completed was trying to stop the others from turning over the page. The teacher



took the boys into the head teachers' office, for discipline. The head teacher started by calling the slower boy names.

Head teacher "Stupid, foolish boy, because you are slow you want to spread it to the rest of the team...take your stupidity home..."

Narrative In this same office was a poster hanging on the wall, which read, "A good word makes a child grow, any negative word pierces and wounds a child forever".

We were both tired, and Miss Atieno and I agreed to continue the following day. The incident with the deputy head teacher gave me something to reflect upon, and Miss Atieno needed all her time to mark books.

This was basically how she spent her teaching life, which was not any different from the majority of teachers at her school. In the one month that I spent with her, I witnessed changes in the language she used towards her students, and she begun to cultivate a level of responsibility towards her students. She also began to seek my opinion on strategies she could use for under- or non-performing students who, according to her, were in school merely to pass time.

Her behaviour demonstrated the fact that teachers lack the necessary knowledge and support to take on values education. Initially, she could not imagine that in her English lesson it would be possible to take sentence construction further, and to discuss the values attached to the vocabulary she was using for sentence construction. But in the end, she was asking me how to do it. Based on the evidence of this study, I believe that teachers' misconception that values education is extra work can be dispelled if teachers are provided with the necessary skills.

I will now move on to the private school experience.

6.2 Private school

Mr Okello is a 37-year-old science teacher. Initially, I was very surprised that the head teacher identified a science teacher for my observation sessions. But as time went by, I



realised why the principal made this decision. Mr Okello is a teacher with a great personality. His smart and calm outward outlook was a true reflection of how he conducted himself in his profession. At the time this observation took place, Mr Okello had been teaching at this school for three years. He found it very rewarding and interesting compared to his previous industrial environment. He taught various subjects, namely, computer studies, from primary to high school level, mathematics to Forms two and four, Physics to Form five as well as coaching the senior and junior school teams in hockey.

The school was multiethnic and multi religious, although most of the pupils came from the Asian community. From the manner in which the students behaved, one could not help but note that they influenced the running of the school through their parents. Thus, the Head of the School was made aware of what the student community felt about each one of their teachers. In addition, the wealthy background of the learners played a major role in shaping their outlook. Discipline levels were generally high and many students put a great deal of effort into their academic work. I was keen to see how Mr Okello dealt with the racial issue, of students who came from diverse backgrounds, as well as rich students who drove better cars to school than their teachers.

As an initial exercise, I requested Mr Okello to describe how he would define values education. Although the concept was evidently unclear to him, Mr Okello stated, "Values are things we regard as being important and thus help make or shape our lives". He said that he held values he acquired at home, which included a mixture of influences from the secular and mission schools he had attended. He remembered that in the secular school the emphasis was on orderliness, punctuality and neatness, whilst in the mission school he was struck by how the principal used psychological tactics to get them to achieve the same principles that were emphasised in the secular school. This exposure has left a lasting impression on Mr Okello, as he demonstrated by the way in which he conducted his professional life.

To facilitate rapid and focused observation, I requested Mr Okello to divide his class into three major groups representing the different types of student. I was then able to observe the teacher from the viewpoint of the three groups. This enabled me to easily make note of the changes and tactics that Mr Okello used in his classroom practice.



The first group was represented by Ajay. Ajay is a Computer Studies student who, I observed, was not bright. Although his parents were keen on assisting him to improve his grades, he did not seem to care much about doing well and was merely there to "finish school". I could see the challenge that Ajay posed for his teacher. Ajay not only talked too much in class, he also had a terrible temper and lived in the "fast lane" (discos, girlfriends, and so on.). It did not matter to him whether he passed or failed, as he knew he would inherit the family business. He was an only son. Mr Okello had to deal with a number of students who had these attributes. I witnessed the patience and tact that Mr Okello applied in dealing with these students. Instead of directly confronting them, he used students having similar characteristics to challenge each other. This method seemed to work extremely well. When I asked Mr Okello how he managed, he replied, "Set a thief to catch a thief".

I could see that these students often made Mr Okello really tired, and he could only respond to them with a shake of his head. When I asked him to explain what this meant, he said,

"At such times, just note that I am feeling pity for these learners. I look at the opportunities they have, and I compare it with what I had in school...but they really do not care, I feel for their parents...I would really like to make a difference in their lives, but the inner voice in me keeps telling me that I am wasting my time..."

Mr Okello also had to deal with boy-girl conflicts, mostly affecting the bright students. Due to his personality, the girls would individually ask for advice when they quarrelled with their boyfriends for not treating them with respect. In these instances, I saw Mr Okello switch from the role of maths teacher to that of counsellor. He would not only advise girls to focus on their studies, and not to develop serious relationships until they had left school, but he also comforted them, and made them feel valued despite the behaviour of the boys. At such times, I noted some confusion in him. In one of the after class review sessions I asked why he looked so confused when dealing with social issues. He would sigh, saying,

"I am not sure whether my attempts at putting the message across to the girls to focus on their studies will yield substantial results. You see this is a day school, the learners go out there and the school does not watch over what they do at home. I wish I knew what was happening in their homes".



Mr Okello's sentiments reflected the fragmented value systems that exist in schools today. There is confusion about whether one is doing the right thing, and if you have the support of the parents. Mr Okello had students with whom he had more than a student-teacher relationship, whom he considered his friends. These students did not consider the racial difference between themselves and Mr Okello, and he was much sought after outside the classroom. The students enjoyed talking with him, and they shared with him intimate issues affecting their lives. He was quick to advise where possible. I could see that these were cherished moments for both student and teacher and, as an observer, I tried my best not to intrude. I noted that Mr Okello tended to describe real life experiences based on his own upbringing in response to students' questions. During Parents Contact days, parents would seek out Mr Okello and acknowledge the fondness with which their children spoke of him. When I asked him about using his own life experience to advise students, he said:

Okello "This is what I know...I would rather stick to my experience than try to experiment with any textbook knowledge...".

Maggie What do you mean?

Okello "You see, I have a Christian background, and in this school the children come from different religions. You have to be careful not to say anything that will offend them...there are also some atheists, and the school rules clearly state the freedom of each individual...".

Maggie Do you normally refer to the school regulations?

Okello "Yes and no, the rules are simple to keep if you are a person who works hard ...they become a problem if you do not deliver, it will be noted immediately,...here people lose their jobs just like that!".

Mr Okello's response confirms that teachers make value judgments based on their life histories, rather than on what they read. It also confirms that teachers make the decision to conform to the norms of the school.

There were students whose motivation to do well was based purely on the need to "go to university just like their bigger brothers...or sisters". Such students were so dedicated to their studies that they would diligently follow lessons, do their homework and more. These



were the so-called "bookworms" and the least disturbing pupils for Mr Okello. I noted how he applied controlled pressure on these students to excel. He put in extra time and effort and they responded accordingly. He was at his professional best when he was with these students. He asked them to do research on emerging technology, and he arranged for them to meet leaders in the computer industry. I enquired why he spent so much time with these students. He remarked:

"The sky is the limit for these particular students...they know why they are in school...they do as you tell them...their parents also respond when you call them...they are a joy...what more can you want as a teacher...?".

My one month with Mr Okello made me realise that values are not only very personal, but that they can be deeply influenced by the particular teacher. From the attitude and behaviour of many students, I could see that they believed in what Mr Okello said. I noted that the students were keen to look smart like their teacher. Others went to the gym so as to attempt to obtain a physique like Mr Okello's. He was a role model for many of his students and helped shape their value systems by interacting with them.

I realised why the head teacher had chosen Mr Okello for the observation exercise. He did not only represent the ideal teacher, his personality was such that the Principal felt confident that he would portray an excellent picture of the school. This image issue as mentioned in chapter 5 is a critical question for private schools.

I will now proceed to present the findings of the religious school.

6.3 Religious school

Despite having been allocated Mrs Andia as the teacher for the observation sessions, I was compelled to observe more than one teacher, due to the manner in which the values education strategy is planned at this school. I observed that on a weekly basis, a theme is chosen, for example, "Love", "Forgiveness", "Prudence". Each teacher is allocated a week in the term to take the lead in promulgating the identified virtue, and prizes and points are awarded to students. These contribute towards the end of term house points. The teachers' attention is constantly being drawn to the said virtue, for they identify the activities of students that warrant acknowledgement. Time is set aside at the end of each week to reflect on progress.



Mrs Andia was a motherly teacher. Everyone, including her peers, referred to her as mother, and accorded her that respect. Mrs Andia was not only the school counsellor, but was also the English and social studies teacher for one of the form 2 classes. As an introduction to the observation sessions, I requested Mrs Andia to explain what she understood the goal of values education to mean. Below is a summary of what she said:

Values are the things we believe in. These things are stored in our subconscious and are developed over time, based on the teaching we received at home and at school. Thus it is important that the things stored in our subconscious are positive, since they are the ones that help our decision-making. It is very difficult to influence things in the subconscious, and also difficult to remove, thus teachers have to be careful how they handle learners, they have to know what they are trying to influence...As a Christian, I uphold Christian values and this guides my day to day decision making and activities.

Mrs Andia was a very practical person, and her students loved her for this. They claimed that she made them feel "wanted" or "important". During my month with her, I participated in a number of activities that she had organised for her class. I will give an example of one such activity. Mrs Andia taught the girls the virtue of being selfless, and quoted from the Bible, in the book of James 2:14-18 where the Apostle said, "You do not send your brother away to feel warm, when you actually know that he has no way of feeling warm". This made the students think, and take action. They saved their pocket money for one week and contributed the funds to an old people's home. At the old people's home, the girls cooked and cleaned up the compound for a day. They were enthusiastic, and the message seemed to have been driven home - they had had one week of sacrifice and preparation. The other classes always admired Mrs Andia's class.

What struck me about Mrs Andia was the manner in which she handled her classes. She did not seem to be in a hurry to complete the syllabus, which was a preoccupation of her



colleagues. I noted panic in some of her students who individually made the effort to keep pace with the other classes. When I questioned Andia on this, she laughed and said,

...no offence, but my new colleagues in teaching continue to surprise me year in, year out... they rush through the syllabus and are complete by the first term of fourth year... if you come to this school, in second and third term of fourth year, it is only revision taking place...the children are forced to revise and revise, they memorise and memorise in order to pass their final examination...This strategy, I do not believe in, I believe in training students for life, ...I really do not know why my colleagues rush, it is important to train the learner on the basic principles and provide them with time to explore and enjoy their learning...don't you see how the other girls wish they were in my class..., it is more important to internalise concepts than to memorise them...this is why our country is going down...we do not have educated people, only 'learned'...

Time spent with Mrs Andia demonstrated to me that there are different types of teachers; those who teach values because they believe in them, and those who have to practice values education for the sake of the syllabus they are teaching. I noted this distinction in conversations with different teachers. Whilst teachers like Mrs Andia punctuated their conversations with active expressions, including "We have" or "We do this..." other teachers spoke in terms of "if" or "could". There was a distance in their language.

Mrs Andia was a confident and stable teacher. Her personality, together with her Christian beliefs, was her driving force. She desired higher goals for her students, beyond mere academic excellence. My experience with both Mrs Andia and Mr Okello demonstrated that the personality of the teacher plays a crucial role in determining how the values education syllabus will be implemented.



6.4 Exploring the observed moral dilemmas of values education

The following is a discussion held with three teachers who frequently attended the discussions that followed their colleagues' observation sessions. Whilst I had been in the schools, I had observed what I considered unusual behaviour, especially among the male teachers: they tended to avoid, or kept a particular distance away from their female students.

Male teachers avoided bodily contact with their female students at all costs, even in situations where one would have expected the teacher to have contact that could not possibly be misconstrued. One such incident occurred in the sports field. A girl was injured in the hockey game and had to be helped from the field. The male coach approached the girl, but avoided touching her, giving instructions to her fellow students to carry her from the field. This was not the only incident that I observed, and so I sought first hand explanation from the male teachers. The discussion in Appendix 2.

The above dialogue brings out the dilemma that male teachers and the teaching profession in general seem to face in defining the limits of their actions, in order not to subvert the delicate teacher-learner relationship. The teacher is expected to be caring and trustworthy. These concepts are not clearly defined, and the confusion mounts when the situation is between male teachers and female learners. For example, the close association required for effective learning or counselling to take place, is a potential area of conflict of interest, as the teacher struggles with objectivity and impartiality. An example is the story of Mr Gitau, where a trusting relationship bred sexual attraction between the teacher and student, and this case, recreated a parent-child relationship, which is laden with emotions.

The dialogue with the male teachers also brings out the recurring theme of the teacher always being in the public eye, particularly a male teacher in a female or mixed environment. The male teacher is not only subjected to censorship from the head teacher, parents and community, but also from fellow female colleagues. The aspect of "being in the spotlight" has been discussed extensively by the likes of Burstein *et al.*, (1984), who in their contribution singled out what they considered a class of professions for which trust is a crucial element; namely, law, medicine and teaching. They explain why the teaching profession is included in this class of professions, by putting forward the claim that teaching is about mentoring and developing the mind. Carr confirms this position (1993:193).), when



he asserts that, "Values are inherent in teaching. Teachers are by the nature of their profession 'moral agents' who imply values by the way they address pupils and each other, the way they dress, the language they use and the effort they put into their work".

Another point raised in the discussion with the male teachers, is the question of whose values should take precedence in the school. Kedogo asks whose interests teachers are supposed to serve. Strike (1990) is quick to caution against attempts to moderate the moral life of a teacher, arguing that a person's private life should not come under scrutiny. Despite Carr's (1993) assertion that everything a teacher does is a reflection on their morals, he joins Strike (1993) in saying that a teacher's morality is their own affair so long as their behaviour and conduct does not impinge upon the basic standards and professional ethics of the teaching profession.

My conclusion of the discussion session is that despite the teachers' anxiety over their lack of confidence and training to confront the sticky but real issues of teaching values, the literature and interview sessions seem to reach a consensus in saying that teachers need to be conscious of their professional role of values transmitter, but at the same time have respect for the individuality of the teacher's private life.

Sumison (2000) says that teachers should balance their commitment to their professional practice against an ethos of caring. The challenge, however, is in drawing a line between the teacher's private and professional ethical life. Kedogo, in the discussion, pointed out the fact that even outside the school compound, his smoking habit, which he believed was his right, was still a cause of concern to some parents. The fact that Kedogo's profession required that he bore the burden of responsibility and accountability with him beyond the school compound created discomfort for him.

6.5 Cross case synthesis

I will now present my summarised key findings from the experience generated with the three teachers and the focused discussion. My findings, you will notice, serve to confirm some of the findings already presented in the interview discussions presented in chapter 5.



6.5.1 Teachers' practice is governed by their belief systems

This study complements those of Shuck (1997) Thompson (1992), which noted that teachers' beliefs play an important role in shaping patterns of instructional behaviour. In this study I noted that these beliefs have their origin in personal experiences; this would include the religious beliefs of the individual teacher. The second level of beliefs is entrenched in the teaching profession and is normally held unconsciously. For example, I noted that most teachers held the notion that it is "them against the world"; i.e. they regarded themselves as the victims who were always blamed for all the problems found in the schools.

The third level of beliefs is embedded in the school ethos, which is either pronounced or assumed.

The assertion that practice is governed by beliefs means that teachers give personal meaning to the content of their subject and they eventually put into practice what they believe about the subject. Mrs Andia's teaching reflected her belief in the moral purpose of education. Her passion for her work is as a result of her belief that education is more than academic. She therefore infuses her beliefs into the text and expands the text beyond the class room to include real life experiences. Her colleague in the same school, who believes in academic excellence, places more emphasis on the mental understanding of the concept of sharing; basically preparing the learner to verbally respond to any question in this area, but not necessarily to practice it. This example shows how teacher beliefs systems permeate the meaning they give to text and how these are translated to the practices method.

I found the second level of beliefs embedded in the teaching profession. There is a belief among most teachers that they are on one side and the rest of the world is on the other side. Teachers complained of not getting the necessary support from parents and society in general and claimed that all they got was blame and condemnation. This being the case, teachers have developed a repertoire of teaching methods that they believe will serve two purposes; i.e. to promote the ideas that they think are important whilst at the same time maintaining a sober relationship with the world. An example can be drawn from the discussion with the male teachers about the sports teacher who was keen on ensuring that he did not touch the female student in case the world came tumbling down around him with accusations.



There was also a standing belief among the teachers regarding the ownership of knowledge of the profession. During my observation sessions I constantly got the impression that teachers did not feel comfortable being questioned on what they did in the classroom. I then realised that the teachers who allowed me to observe them had taken a bold step, since this was viewed as intrusion. The classroom is the teacher's domain and they strongly believe that they know how best to handle the issues. Whenever I put forward questions in a manner likely to suggest another method, teachers were quick to tell me that they have tried and it and it did not work. Teachers have therefore developed an assortment of methods that they believe will deliver what they want the learner to grasp. This belief partly explains why changing the teacher practice remains a challenge for education.

Another growing belief I noted among teachers is the temporary nature of teaching as a profession. Most of the teachers believed that teaching was a temporary career and a stepping stone to a more lucrative career. I tried to establish why this was the case, and it emerged that a majority of teachers had actually joined the profession not by choice, but on their academic performance in upper six, which determined the career options at tertiary level. This temporal outlook to the profession has meant that teachers are not ready to engage in long term teacher development programmes since they were ready to take a leap to the next job whenever the opportunity arose. Instead, I found teachers enhancing their skills in other fields like research, counselling and computer studies. Non-governmental organisations have been the key attraction and are represent a market to absorb these teachers. The second finding in regards to teacher practice was that understanding was not uniformly applied as discussed below.

6.5.2 Understanding and implementation of values is not applied uniformly across the school or the community

Values implementation is generally fragmented. Even in schools which had strict rules and established value systems and guidelines, I noted that there was fragmentation in the understanding and implementation of values. As stated and further confirmed in the observation sessions, the religious schools and some private schools, made a conscious effort to ensure that a set of values were promoted within the school.



I noted in the observation of practice that, despite this, the individual teacher's belief system took precedence in the classroom. For example, while Mrs Andia, in the religious school, had the learners saving and contributing to an old people's home, her colleague in another class requested the learners to write an essay on selflessness. Both activities were an attempt to achieve the same goal as stipulated in the curriculum. It is the application, as determined by the respective teachers, that is different. In this case, the difference lay in the fact that Mrs Andia was a practicing Christian who was already involved in many charitable activities outside the school. She therefore used that knowledge in her classroom situation. This leads to the third findings which enumerates further on the individual's background.

6.5.3 Teacher practice is dependent on the individual's background

I found that, although teachers may have rules that guide their behaviour, the ultimate action taken by the teacher is rooted in their personal belief system. These beliefs could be religious or experiential. The story of Mr Okello from the private school, of Mrs Andia, and even that of Miss Atieno, all demonstrate how the teacher's personal life plays itself out in the classroom. Mr Okello stated clearly that he used what he learnt from the mission school to manage the different simultaneous activities taking place in his class.

Miss Atieno on the other hand, asked me how she could possibly complete the syllabus if she was to embark on a discussion about values in an English class. But as we discovered later, Miss Atieno was sending the message that she was not fully aware of what I was talking about, which was why she felt that she could not do it. Scholarly literature on values has alluded to this issue, claiming that teachers have little room to reflect on their actions, but instead act impulsively.

With the kind of pressure found in classrooms, they argue, if a teacher has never experienced or internalised a strategy, they will not use it; let alone use a text book explanation as a reference point. The next finding builds on what authors have generally claimed; that the school is a refection of the head teacher.

6.5.4 Teachers' practice is governed by the head teacher

This finding reinforces the interview sessions which highlighted the fact that the school environment is key in shaping teachers' understanding of values. Observation of teachers



revealed that practice is largely determined by the school head. Although a school has regulations, the head teacher determines how these regulations are followed. This confirms the literature findings, which stated that a school is a reflection of its head teacher.

Teachers in the schools under observation passed comments like, "...that one, she is lazy and you can get away with it, but so and so, will dismiss you on the spot...". I also witnessed the change in teachers' behaviour in the presence of the head teacher, or during their planning of activities. The teachers would say, "...this is what is acceptable...; if we do it this way it will sail through...". Teachers have studied the head teacher and carry out their activities accordingly. Mrs Andia also mentioned that "I have the guts to do what I do, since I know that I have the head teacher's support". The next finding goes on to cement the individuality of classroom practice.

6.5.5 Teacher practice on values is not always determined by knowledge or verbal claims of understanding, but more for personal survival

Despite the assertion by scholars that moral consciousness functions best with knowledge, I noted that, although teachers were knowledgeable about some moral issues, they chose to act in a manner that would best serve their own interests. I found no direct correlation between holding a value and acting upon it. For example, Mr Okello believed in discipline and an open relationship with his students, but had to find a crafty way of dealing with the misconduct of his students because he claimed that due to their rich background, "...it will not make a difference; you just create trouble for yourself".

In a similar situation, I found that teachers take the shortest route possible to achieve their objective. The fact that teachers did not act on issues does not necessarily mean that they do not hold a particular value, but that they are silent to protect themselves. I observed this attitude especially with Miss Atieno, who did not bother to ensure that all students were attentive or that they had the necessary material to participate in her class. According to Miss Atieno, corrective action would require time, explanation to the head teacher, or even beyond. Thus the best strategy was to pretend to be ignorant. As long as the classroom was manageable, and her key students were attentive, she carried on.

In spite of knowing the damage that abusive words can have on a child, the head teacher in Miss Atieno's school went ahead and used them. Statements made about education did not



correspond with the lax and casual attitude towards critical value based issues that affect learners. I witnessed how teachers in staffrooms openly discussed learners, showing scant regard for personal challenges faced by students, such as their parents' HIV status. As a silent observer, I concluded that values are regarded as unimportant by some teachers, who are preoccupied with completing the academic syllabus. The discussion held with the three male teachers is a clear demonstration of how teachers make decisions in order to survive.

6.5.6 Values are contagious; therefore modelling is a powerful strategy in teaching values

I confirmed that the teachers' personal lives played a major role in their teaching of values. The old saying that teachers need to practice what they teach is still relevant in Kenyan schools. The private school teacher, Mr Okello, had students who made personal decisions modelled on his behaviour. For example, he did not tell students to trim down and look smart, but some literally went to the gym in an effort to look like Mr Okello.

The religious school teacher, Mrs Andia, also had a powerful effect on the girls in her school. Despite the age difference, girls admired and respected her. Many girls said that they wished she was their mother! One girl said, "I would tell her anything... because I trust her...". On the other hand, the lack of interest that Miss Atieno showed towards some of her students was reflected in the behaviour of those students. They did not respect her, as could be observed in the way that they behaved in her class.

6.5.7 Teacher practice makes use of stereotyping

A leading example of this is that boys are expected to perform better than girls. Although teachers claimed otherwise during the verbal interviews, it was evident in practice that such stereotyping existed. Miss Atieno even used it as a wakeup call for the boys. In Mrs Andia's school, due to the principled manner in which she conducted herself, she was referred to as the "holy Joe" by her colleagues, notwithstanding the fact that it was a Christian school.

6.5.8 Teacher practice of values has a gender dimension

Despite the teachers' claim that their values are not affected by their gender, observation confirms that gender is a factor in teachers' decision making on values. These considerations are quite pronounced with respect to the relationship between male teachers and female



students. In the discussion with the male teachers, it emerged that female and male teachers are judged differently and the expectation of the school community of the values they are expected to espouse, differs slightly. People are often unaware of these expectations.

6.6 Summary

In conclusion, I would like to point out that the observation sessions confirmed, disputed, or built on some of the findings presented in the interview session. Among those that were confirmed is the fact that values are largely determined by the teachers' own histories and belief systems; that values are interpreted differently, thus leading to a fragmented implementation; that the environment plays a critical role in determining how values are understood; and that the head teacher is the one who ultimately determines how values education is implemented. This is confirmed by a growing volume of literature, which indicates that verbal knowledge claimed by teachers does not necessarily translate into action. Other factors, among them the school environment, gender and job security, will also determine a teacher's behaviour.

In the next chapter, I synthesise my findings and locate them among other previous works by identifying any similarities or unique features in the Kenyan environment. Most of the information presented in chapters 5 and 6 represented what the teachers said directly to me. In chapter 7, I include the key informant expert comments on the issues regarding values education, alongside that of the international scholar, as found in the literature review.