



UNIVERSITEIT VAN PRETORIA  
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA  
YUNIBESITHI YA PRETORIA

An evaluation of the integration of indigenous musical arts in the Creative and Performing Arts syllabus and the implementation thereof in the primary schools curriculum in Botswana

by

Mothusi Phuthego

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the degree requirements for

Doctor of Music

in the

Department of Music

School of Arts

Faculty of Humanities

University of Pretoria

Supervisor: Prof John Hinch

Pretoria

December 2007



## **Abstract**

The implementation of the Creative and Performing Arts (CPA) syllabus at lower primary school level in Botswana has been carried out without paying due regard to all that should be in place. As a result, the implementation exercise has been hampered by some administrative and logistical problems. The content for Creative and Performing Arts as a curriculum subject draws from Western culture, primarily due to the proliferation of literary sources for such content. It has therefore been a matter of urgent concern to establish the extent to which local culture, in the form of indigenous musical arts, have been integrated into the syllabus.

The methods employed in this study are qualitative. They include data collection by means of semi-structured interviews in focus group discussions, and content analysis of the syllabus document.

The results of this research suggest that the indigenous musical arts in the Creative and Performing Arts syllabus content are generally representative of the culture of the Batswana. But the indigenous musical arts content in the Creative and Performing Arts syllabus could be representative of the indigenous culture of the Batswana to a much greater extent, especially as it allows for the use of local resources and contains objectives that explicitly refer to the inclusion of the musical culture of a local community. Current limitations are mainly caused by the teachers' shortcomings in terms of appropriate teaching approaches and their vague understanding of the main concept that they should master, namely 'integration'. The results of the study further indicate

that teachers cover most of the indigenous musical arts in their lessons. The results also indicate that teachers are usually able to relate music with physical education, but are unable to integrate content as much as it is practicable due to lack of knowledge and skill on their part.

On syllabus implementation, the results reveal that school administrators feel that they have not been duly recognized as key players in the implementation exercise. They suggest that specialization in the teaching of the various components of the Creative and Performing Arts be encouraged. They also suggest a review of the syllabus that would allow primary school teachers more input.

As far as the teachers are concerned, the results reveal that, the implementation workshops they have attended have not been adequate in equipping them with the necessary skills to teach the subject. They, like the school heads, suggest specialization by teachers. They also suggest the following: a review of the syllabus and teaching and learning materials; provision of in-service training; close monitoring by the implementing authority, and the provision of resources.

The conclusion reached is that the syllabus allows the teacher the freedom to draw as much as possible from the community, thus making learning more relevant to the learner. With regard to syllabus implementation, the implementation exercise is hampered by the absence of appropriate resources and facilities as well as the necessary support in the form of needs-oriented in-service training. Owing to lack of resources and in-



service training that addresses specific needs, the teachers are not very effective in syllabus delivery.



## Acknowledgements

My sincere gratitude goes out to the following:

### **Prof John Hinch**

For his robust and scholarly supervision of my research.

### **Rene Ehlers and Jacqui Sommerveld**

Very helpful members of the Statistics Department, who patiently worked with me from the proposal stage of my research, through the pilot phase and ultimately through the research proper.

### **The Music Department Research Committee**

For the comments that helped sharpen the focus of my research in its proposal stage.

### **The Staff of the Department of Music Library**

For the friendly service. They would go to the extent of helping me find a book on the shelves.

### **The School Heads and Teachers**

Those that I interviewed. Their responses have constituted the core of my research data. Without their participation my research would not have materialized.

### **The University of Botswana**

For the generous sponsorship.

### **The Government of Botswana**

For the support I received through the Ministry of Education.

### **My Family**

For the encouragement and support.

## List of abbreviations

The following abbreviations are used in this thesis.

BEd	-	Bachelor of Education
BOTA	-	Botswana Training Authority
CCE	-	Centre for Continuing Education
CDE	-	Curriculum Development and Evaluation
CPA	-	Creative and Performing Arts
D&T	-	Design and Technology
DCD&E	-	Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation
FCE	-	Francistown College of Education
HE	-	Home Economics
LCE	-	Lobatse College of Education
NCE	-	National Commission on Education
PE	-	Physical Education
PSLE	-	Primary School Leaving Examinations
RNCE	-	Report of the National Commission on Education
RNPE	-	Revised National Policy on Education
SADC	-	Southern African Development Community
SAQA	-	South African Qualifications Authority
SCE	-	Serowe College of Education
TCE (Tlokweng)	-	Tlokweng College of Education
TTC	-	Teacher Training College
UB	-	University of Botswana



## Key terms

arts education  
Botswana  
content analysis  
creative and performing arts  
curriculum  
evaluation  
focus group  
indigenous musical arts  
lower primary  
music  
performance  
syllabus

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1 .....	1
BACKGROUND .....	1
1.1 Motivation to carry out the research .....	2
1.2 Music teacher training .....	4
1.3 Music in schools .....	6
1.4 Primary education in Botswana .....	8
1.5 The Creative and Performing Arts (CPA) syllabus ....	10
1.6 The Batswana as a nation.....	12
1.6.1 Ethnic composition .....	12
1.6.2 The indigenous culture of the Batswana .....	14
1.7 Problem statement .....	17
1.8 Main research question .....	18
1.9 Research objectives .....	19
1.10 Significance of the study.....	20
1.11 Limitation of the study .....	21
1.12 Delimitation of the study .....	21
1.13 Preview of Chapters .....	22
CHAPTER TWO .....	24
AN INTERROGATION OF CURRICULUM EVALUATION AND IMPLEMENTATION THROUGH LITERATURE REVIEW .....	24
2.1 Introduction.....	24
2.2 The arts in education .....	25
2.2.1 Definition of arts education.....	25
2.2.2 The benefits of arts education .....	27
2.3 The indigenous musical arts .....	32
2.3.1 Definition of ‘musical arts’ .....	32
2.3.3 Methods of teaching and learning indigenous musical arts .....	34
2.3.4 The value of indigenous musical arts education	37
2.4 The music curriculum.....	38
2.4.1 Definition of ‘curriculum’ .....	39
2.4.2 The structure of a music curriculum .....	41
2.4.2.1 The objectives-based model .....	42
2.4.2.2 The standards-based model .....	43
2.4.2.3 The eclectic model .....	47
2.4.3 Content in a music curriculum .....	50
2.5 Arts-based Curricula and integration of content ....	51
2.5.1 The Creative and Performing Arts syllabus .....	55
2.6 Curriculum evaluation .....	57
2.6.1 Formative and Summative evaluation.....	59
2.6.2 Syllabus evaluation .....	62
2.6.3 Evaluation design.....	64





2.6.4	Procedures and methods of curriculum evaluation	64
2.6.5	Models of evaluation and approaches to evaluation	67
2.7	Focus on the various evaluation approaches	68
2.7.1	The objectives-oriented approaches	68
2.7.1	Management-oriented approaches	69
2.7.2.1	The CIPP evaluation model	70
2.7.2.3	The UCLA evaluation model	71
2.7.3	Consumer-oriented approaches	71
2.7.4	Expertise-oriented approaches	72
2.7.5	Adversary-oriented approaches	73
2.7.6	Participant-oriented approaches	74
2.8	Evaluation of curriculum implementation	76
2.9	An overview of educational evaluation and programme implementation in Botswana	84
2.10	Conclusion	88
2.10.1	The case for the arts	88
2.10.2	The music curriculum	90
2.10.3	Methods of curriculum evaluation and models of evaluation	90
2.10.4	Evaluation of syllabus implementation	91
<b>CHAPTER THREE</b>		<b>92</b>
<b>RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY</b>		<b>92</b>
3.1	Research design	92
3.2	Methodology	93
3.3	Data collection instruments	94
3.3.1	Interview	95
3.3.1.1	Sample size and sampling procedures	96
3.3.2	Document analysis	99
3.3.2.1	Procedure for carrying out content analysis	101
3.3.3	Historical data	102
3.4	Data analysis	103
3.4.1	Qualitative data analysis	103
3.5	Pilot study	104
<b>CHAPTER FOUR</b>		<b>106</b>
<b>THE PILOT STUDY</b>		<b>106</b>
4.1	Purpose of the pilot study	106
4.2	The pilot sample	106
4.3	Access into the schools and ethical issues	107
4.4	The recording equipment	109
4.5	School grouping system and its implications on the methodology	110
4.6	Instrument validity and reliability	113
4.7	Data capture	114



4.8	Results of the pilot study.....	114
4.9	Conclusion.....	118
<b>CHAPTER FIVE.....</b>		<b>120</b>
<b>ANALYSIS OF DATA, RESULTS AND DISCUSSION.....</b>		<b>120</b>
5.1	Introduction.....	120
5.2	Access into the schools and ethical issues.....	120
5.3	Sources of data.....	122
5.4	Part 1.....	122
5.4.1	Organisation of lower primary (standard 1-4) Creative and Performing Arts syllabus (refer to Appendix I).....	122
5.4.2	Content analysis of lower primary (standard 1-4) Creative and Performing Arts syllabus (see Appendix I) .....	123
5.4.2.1	Categories of analysis.....	124
5.4.3	Discussion of results.....	127
5.4.3.1	Music.....	128
5.4.3.2	Singing.....	129
5.4.3.3	Dance.....	131
5.4.3.4	Movement in music.....	133
5.4.3.5	Drama.....	134
5.4.3.6	Clapping.....	135
5.4.3.7	Musical Instruments.....	137
5.4.3.8	Poetry.....	138
5.4.3.9	Costume art.....	138
5.4.4	Representation of indigenous musical arts in the Creative and Performing Arts syllabus.....	140
5.5	Part 2.....	142
5.5.1	Data on the implementation of the lower primary (standard 1-4) Creative and Performing Arts syllabus ..	142
5.5.2	Analysis of data.....	143
5.5.3	Presentation of results.....	143
5.5.4	Discussion of results.....	166
5.5.4.1	On participants' personal career.....	167
5.5.4.2	On indigenous musical arts and integration of content.....	168
5.5.4.3	On syllabus implementation.....	172
5.5.4.4	Impressions and views of teachers.....	177
5.5.4.5	Answers to the research questions.....	184
<b>CHAPTER SIX.....</b>		<b>189</b>
<b>CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....</b>		<b>189</b>
6.1	Conclusion.....	189
6.1.1	On syllabus implementation by school heads....	189
6.1.2	On syllabus implementation by teachers.....	190
6.1.3	On indigenous musical arts and integration of content.....	192



6.2	Recommendations .....	197
6.2.1	Syllabus review .....	198
6.2.2	Subject panels .....	198
6.2.3	Procurement of books and equipment .....	198
6.2.4	Programme monitoring .....	199
6.2.5	Minimum equipment list .....	200
6.2.6	In-service training .....	200
6.2.7	Utilization of local human resource and community participation .....	201
6.2.8	Further research .....	201
	REFERENCES .....	203

APPENDICES:

- A Questionnaire to teachers
- B Questionnaire to teachers - draft 2
- C Map of Botswana
- D Request for permission to conduct research
- E Letter granting permission
- F Photocopy of original letter granting permission
- G School action plan
- H Research statistics
- I Lower Primary School Syllabus