

CHAPTER 5

SYNTHESIS OF RESEARCH OUTCOMES AND RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE STUDY

5.1 Introduction

The study on factors impacting on the management and provisioning of student development and support in higher education in a developing country was conducted with a qualitative approach and a focus on acquiring an in depth knowledge and understanding of the phenomenon. To achieve this, a qualitative data collection and analysis approach was followed with only a slight mixing of methods through the utilisation of an interview questionnaire. The interviewing – as the main source of data collection – proceeded only after extensive literature review and analysis.

The following section provides a review of the research aim and secondary research questions with a critical assessment of the achievement or not of the aims of the study.

5.2 Review of the research aim and secondary research questions

The main research question for the study was: How can student development and support be provided for and managed to have strategic value for higher education in a developing country?

I made an attempt to answer this question through a qualitative study with the purpose to gain new insight into the factors impacting on the management and provisioning of student development and support.

As the study proceeded the main research question (problem) was posed to all participants and their views, knowledge and experiences were recorded for analysis. For the purpose of this study the literature



review did not only provide a theoretical framework for the research and new data collected but provided data towards determining the factors impacting on the management and provisioning of student development and support.

The literature review indicated a number of critical factors that are impacting heavily on student development and support. It already became clear from the literature review that there are factors on the international, national and institutional levels. The literature review extended to the fields of education, education management, education policy, national policy, socio-political and economic domain as well as aspects of management and finances.

I was able to postulate the following table of factors emanating from the extensive literature review:

Table 5.1: Factors postulated to have an impact on the provision and management of student development and support in higher education in a developing country

Macro-level impact: National policy and strategy

- National Plan for Higher Education
- Higher Education Act 101 of 1997
- Funding Framework for Higher Education
- Student Enrolment Strategy
- Programme and Qualification Mix Strategy
- Research imperatives and niche areas identified by research funding bodies (National Research Foundation)

Meso-level impact: Institutional policy and strategy

- Institutional Strategic Plan
- Three year rolling plans (required by Department of Education)
- Institutional Operating Plans
- Financial planning, strategy and allocations



- Resource and physical infrastructure policy
- Institutional responses to regional needs and priorities
- Inputs and needs from industry

Micro-level impact: Intra-institutional policy, strategy and approaches

- Student development and support strategy of the institution
- · Strategic thinking and management of units
- Unit structures and line functions
- Unit budget administration
- Service portfolio in SDSS

The above framework informed the lines of questioning during the interviews. It was a challenge to not be restricted to the factors pre-identified in the literature review and I had to remain aware of the risk throughout.

The main research aim was to focus on the identification of factors that may impact on the providing for and managing student development and support in higher education in a developing country. A number of secondary research questions were also posed.

The following table provides a summary of the secondary research questions and subsequent answers or findings.

Table 5.2: Secondary research questions and research objectives

Secondary question	Research objective achieved?
i.Tracing the existing range and	Through varied discussions and
the scope of student	accessing participants across
development and support	multiple institutions I was able to
services in higher education.	identify more closely, the range
	and scope of student development



	and support activity in higher
	education. The finding is a
	diversified and non-unified
	approach across the university
	sector with an increasing trend of
	a) Consolidating the multiple
	functions of counselling and
	academic support related
	services
	b) Positioning the functions within
	academic line management
	structures.
ii.Determining how national policy	Through discussion with the
and legislation have effect on	spectrum of policy-makers to
the provision and management	practitioners I was able to identify
of student development and	the specific national and
support services in higher	institutional strategies and policies
education.	that impact directly on SDSS:
iii.Investigating how institutional	a) National Plan for Higher
policies and strategic plans	Education
have effect on SDSS in higher	b) Enrolment planning strategies
education.	c) Institutional planning and
	priorities
	d) Funding framework for higher
	education
	e) Unit planning and
	management approaches
	f) Primary and secondary
	education systems.
	g) Increasing managerialism in
	higher education
iv.Exploring existing national and	Specific benchmarks – as current
international benchmarks and	trends – can be identified that



frameworks to indicate good	indicate good practice for SDSS:
practice for student	a) Consolidating the multiple
development and support in	functions of counselling and
higher education.	academic support related
	services.
	b) Positioning the functions within
	academic line management
	structures.
	c) Optimal responsiveness to
	national and institutional
	challenges to ensure a
	relevant service portfolio.
	d) Participative and pro-active
	management style within units.
v.ldentifying some of the critical	The study produced a list of
provision and management	critical management and provision
factors for an effective SDSS.	factors for effective SDSS. As
	reported in detail.

The following is a summary of factors identified towards addressing the main research question:

Table 5.3: Factors, in order of priority, as identified by the interviews and triangulated by the interview questionnaires and literature review

N	National education strategy
N	Managerialism
S	Student profile
F	Role of the lecturer
S	Strategic planning of the university
L	Jnit management approach
S	Student preparedness
C	Curriculum
li li	nstitutional structures
L	Jniversity access
L	Jniversity funding
L	Jnit responsiveness



Outcomes-based education
Education funding framework
Socio-political factors
Labour and skills development needs
Unit service portfolio
Primary and secondary education
Teaching strategies
Student attitude and behaviour
Technology in education
Globalisation
Economic factors
Unit planning
University resources

The above findings confirm 80% of the factors that were postulated after the literature review. However, a number of new or additional factors were highlighted by participants. The table indicates the original (as from literature) and newly identified factors (as from interviews and questionnaires).

Table 5.4: Original factors (as from literature) and newly identified factors (as from interviews and questionnaires)

(as it of the most of the control of		
Factor	Literature review	Interviews and questionnaires
National education strategy	•	•
Managerialism	•	•
Student profile	•	•
Role of the lecturer		•
Strategic planning of the university		•
Unit management approach		•
Student preparedness		•
Curriculum	•	•
Institutional structures		•
University access	•	•
University funding	•	•
Unit responsiveness		•
Outcomes-based education	•	•
Education funding framework	•	•
Socio-political factors	•	•
Labour and skills development	•	•



needs		
Unit service portfolio		•
Primary and secondary education	•	•
Teaching strategies	•	•
Student attitude and behaviour		•
Technology in education	•	•
Globalisation	•	•
Economic factors	•	•
Unit planning		•
University resources		•

The table indicates:

- a) Confirmation of factors identified in literature
- b) Additional factors highlighted by participants

In further analysis of the factors it is evident that participant views and experiences pertaining to higher education institutions on both the strategic and operational levels as well as experiences with students elicited the identification of additional factors impacting on student development and support, namely institutional strategy and priorities; management approach within a student development and support service unit; university priorities in allocating resources and student attitude and behaviour.

If the above findings from the interviews and questionnaires are compared with the initial framework of factors that was developed after the literature review, the final result is as follows:



Table 5.5: Categorisation of factors impacting on student development and support

CATEGORISATION OF IMPACTING FACTORS		
Macro-level factors	Meso-level factors	Micro-level factors
These factors relate primarily to international trends and challenges facing higher education.	These factors relate primarily to the national changes and challenges for higher education.	These factors relate primarily to institutional realities.
Factors identified after literature	Factors identified after literature	Factors identified after literature
 review: Globalisation and marketisation. Developing countries: specific dynamics in education. Managerialism. Quality assurance in higher education. Factors identified and confirmed after interviews and questionnaires: Managerialism. Globalisation and marketisation. 	 review: National economic status. National labour agenda (skills development needs). Transformation of the HE landscape and mergers. Implementation of a national qualifications framework. Implementation of outcomes-based education model. Implementation of a new funding framework. Government policy 	 Institutional histories: HBI versus HWI phenomenon. Institutional responses to transformation. Strategic management and priorities within institutions. Effective management. Accountability, quality orientation. Academic relevance and positioning. Student needs.



development and control, accountability measures.

Factors identified and confirmed after interviews and questionnaires:

- National education strategy.
- National funding framework for higher education.
- Labour skills needs and development strategies.
- Implementation of an outcomes based approach in all education sectors.
- Economic factors.
- Socio-political factors.

and confirmed after interviews and questionnaires:

- Curriculum factors.
- Changing role of lecturers.
- Student preparedness.
- Student profile and needs.
- University
 management,
 strategy and
 priorities.
- University funding priorities.
- Unit management and planning.
- Unit responsiveness.
- Unit service portfolio.
- Student attitude and behaviour.
- University resource allocation.
- Teaching strategies.

The above indicates that the factors identified through the literature survey were confirmed and extended by the factors as identified through the interviews with the interviews identifying further factors. Both these sets of factors were again ratified by the outcomes of the interview



questionnaire and may be considered the final list of factors to be impacting on the management and provisioning of student development and support in higher education within the context of a developing country.

The subsequent conclusions and directed recommendations based on the outcomes of the study, follows.

5.3 Conclusions and recommendations

The data analysis process highlighted a broad range of factors impacting on student development and support. The diversity in interpretations and experiences of policy-makers, institutional managers, student development and support managers and student development and support practitioners were evident as the study progressed. At the same time however it became equally evident that there are indeed common factors highlighted by the participants. These were generally expressed through statements of concerns and challenges that the participants conversed.

The main finding is presented in the following sections as a final conclusion to the study.

5.3.1 The context of a developing country

Through the literature review aspects of the context of a specific developing country were highlighted and compared to some noted experiences in developing countries. It became clear that within the context of a developing country the volatile economic, social and political environment has serious impact on the education sector in general and higher education in particular. In the case of South Africa, as an example of a developing country, very similar but also specific dynamics were identified. During the interviews the participants strongly



emphasised issues relating to the context of a developing country, namely:

- socio-political factors (impact of social change and political agendas on transformation and change);
- economic changes and growth (including the tensions between remaining poverty; limited resources and growing expectations that higher education should make a positive difference in the economic status of the country by producing skilled workers);
- changing education strategies (for example implementation of outcomes-based education);
- shifts in the approach and relationship between government and higher education (debate on high state-control versus state-facilitation approaches);
- labour agenda and high expectation of labour and skills development.

It is my view as the researcher that ultimately, the context of a developing country has both negative and positive impact. While participants demonstrated extreme unease with the consequences of transformation and reform of the higher education landscape, economic pressures and labour and skills demands of the economy, it was also evident that at the same time these dramatic impacts also seemed to energise the sector. Dealing with institutional mergers, general transformational issues, financial pressures and constraints, shifting government goals and guidelines stimulates renewed thinking and generates new perspectives on the strategic role and purpose of student development and support. There is also evidence of a renewed discourse on the purpose of a university (within the context of a



developing country) and the impact of globalisation and managerialism on the traditional view of the purpose of a university.

5.3.2 The context of higher education

Higher education in South Africa is experiencing a phase of radical change and reconfiguration affecting its very nature, purpose and approach. It was evident from the discussions with participants that government policy and strategy has a profound impact on higher education. Some factors in this regard can be mentioned:

- The National Plan for Higher Education (Department of Education South Africa, 2001a) and subsequent transformation of the higher education landscape.
- The promulgation of a new national qualification framework (Department of Education South Africa, 2003a).
- The implementation of an outcomes-based approach in all sectors of education (primary, secondary and higher education).
- The impact of the Labour agenda and economy-based skills development initiatives and priorities (also considering how this agenda impacts on national decision making on educational matters, e.g. determining priority areas and a weighted funding).
- Implementation of a new funding framework (Department of Education South Africa, 2004).

All of the above and other factors impacted heavily on the higher education institutions and brought about dramatic change within the sector. While many of these national level strategies brought about positive change and renewed thinking about the strategic purpose and alignment of the university, its role within society and the economy of university business there was also weariness for all the changes and all



participants indicated a need for stability and consolidation. The most critical factor for the student development and support manager to take cognisance of is possibly the changing role of the lecturer with the dramatic implications for the role of the student development and support function in the university. The lecturer increasingly has to be subject specialist, educationalist, counsellor and mentor and learning manager. This is a scope of skill and expertise that very few academics have and in some cases academics are just not comfortable with dealing with all of these aspects. The opportunity is further emphasised by the experiences of student under-preparedness and the difficulties lecturers experience in this regard. The scenario creates a critical window of opportunity for the student development and support function to re-invent and re-align itself within the university to become a strategic role player.

5.3.3 The student development and support function

The findings on factors impacting on the management and provision of student development and support were the primary focus of this study. The outcomes of the literature review, interviews and interview schedule indicate that many of the issues are however related to broader issues that higher education is dealing with.

All of the factors that were identified are not isolated and particular to the student development and support environment only but are interrelated with issues that the university is dealing with or in context of the current issues in higher education (also discussed in chapter 4).

It is evident based on the findings of this study that although all the factors identified are critical and important for the student development and support management to take cognisance of, there are a few factors that may be critical for student development and support to attend to:

 a) Lobbying for structured and more determined funding mechanisms in countering the lack of purposeful provisioning through the funding framework.



- b) Promoting the expert role of the student development and support practitioner in partnering with the lecturer when addressing teaching and learning challenges.
- c) Redefining and re-aligning the function to the core-business of the university. This implies an academic line-function and consolidated services.

Table 5.6 provides a summary and final conclusion of the main factors found to be critical considering all the sources and triangulated data.

Table 5.6: Summary of the factors found to be critical for the provision and management of the student development and support function in higher education in a developing country

Factor impacting on the management and provisioning of student development and support	Description and specific relevance for SDSS
Curriculum	Referring to the renewed emphasis in curriculum design and the inclusion of learning outcomes additional to subject knowledge and skills to also facilitate skills development requirements. The implementation of an outcomes-based approach also requires for the critical cross field outcomes to be accommodated in all curricula. The implementation of the Higher Education Qualification Framework (Department of Education, 2007) and subsequent re-curriculation of all academic programmes creates an opportunity for SDSS to establish many interventions as part of the curriculum and credit-bearing.
Student-preparedness, student needs and student profile	Referring to the profile and academic preparedness of students entering the university. The perceived and proven under-preparedness of first time entering



	students determine the role of the SDSS environment within the university. It also creates an opportunity for partnerships and curriculum-based interventions. The Units need to be extremely alert and responsive with a relevant service portfolio.
University strategic management and priorities and organisational structure	Referring to the approach of university management and the strategic role afforded to the SDSS environment within the university strategy, goals and objectives. The consensus view is that if a proper alignment can be established on this level the Unit(s) is/are well empowered to play out a potential differentiating role within the university. The consolidation of related services within an academic line function was indicated as a critical factor for success.
Increased managerialism	Referring to the impact of the international trend of increased managerialism. This trend was also found evident in all of the institutions of participants to the study – including a traditional universities and universities of technology. The general experience seems to be that managerialism – as expressed through financial and budgeting systems, quality assurance and productivity measurements – has a positive effect but also poses a threat to the educational business of the university if management does not find the subtle balance.
University access and accessibility	Referring to the national strategy to make university education accessible and the impact thereof. This strategy allows for more students to access higher education



	and is seen to inflate the student under- preparedness problem. For student development and support management it implies that the trends must be researched and monitored and strategic responses must be put in place in partnership with the academic environment. On another level accessibility priorities also allows the unit(s) to promote foundational type provisions and play a leading role in this area.
Funding framework and resourcing	Referring firstly to the national funding framework and the non-provision of a funding factor for this element of university business despite its growing importance within the university. Participants had consensus that additional grant funding provides relief but still leaves the unit(s) financially vulnerable as it not an assured income. General approach and resourcing priority within the university was also identified a critical factor.
Role of the lecturer	Referring to the changing role of the lecturer within the university. Lecturers are no longer just bearers of knowledge but have to facilitate learning in the broadest sense. For this they require a strong partnership with the SDSS practitioners in the university. This creates a large window of opportunity for practitioners to access students and work increasingly pro-active in terms of skills development and empowerment.
Unit management	Referring to the specific style and approach of managers within the SDSS Unit(s). This was also identified as a critical factor as the credibility of managers, representation on university forums, communication skills and related aspects will impact directly on the



standing of the unit(s) and subsequently on the potential impact and role and effectiveness within the university.

The following section is a critical review of the research and will address the process, possible short-comings with recommendation where relevant.

5.4 Limitations of the study and subsequent recommendations

The qualitative approach to the study seems to have been very relevant as it is a fairly new area of research and I set out to:

- a) gain insight and understanding of the phenomenon
- b) establish a basis for further investigation.

However the risk of subjectivity and the role of my own experiences had to be managed throughout.

5.4.1 Critical review of the research design

The planning for a multi-method approach in this study was relevant and proved successful. The use of both an interview and a complementary interview schedule per participant provided a means to verify outcomes. In addition the social networking approach in sampling participants were found to be the only manner in which to access as many as possible of the identified categories of participants. The cyclical research process with reflection was critical to the qualitative process and I found the post-interview notes and reflection most helpful as it assisted in the process. Saturation of data became evident when the interviews started to yield the same information from participants and a pattern evolved where the same factors were consistently highlighted by the participants.



5.4.2 Critical review of the literature review process and outcome

Whereas I initially viewed the literature review as a background exercise it became clear as the process unfolded that the literature will provide a valuable component to the research outcome.

The literature review was extensive and as the process unfolded the review extended to more fields and beyond educational literature. It eventually became a challenge for me to determine boundaries for this research as the reading branched deeper and deeper into management, education governance and the labour and political domains.

The nature of the study however required a comprehensive review and the documented reading and analysis covers a relevant range of topics related to the study. This confirms that a multidisciplinary approach to researching a complex phenomenon such as student development and support is essential.

It was difficult to find a balance between the broad scope of factors and fields relevant to the topic; a cryptic review of relevant issues and properly documenting the relevant issues. It is my position that the review – though comprehensive and covering many areas – were fruitful and produced a solid framework of factors to proceed with the gathering of data. The comprehensive reading and literature-review provided a good foundation for me during the interviews.

5.4.3 Critical review of the qualitative data collection and analysis approach

The data collection via interviews and interview schedule followed according to plan. It was however a major obstacle to secure and schedule interviews with the high profile and high level individuals that would be relevant for the purpose of the study.

I experienced the following challenges:

a) Time-consuming scheduling and liaison processes.



- All participants cooperated and participated enthusiastically and I
 was able to elicit valuable data from every interview.
- c) A few participants were not well informed on the specific focus of the study and I had to refrain from influencing the responses by guiding inputs and questions.
- d) The electronic recording and transcribing of interviews were an essential task. I would have lost valuable insight if the transcription was assigned to an assistant. It was as if the process of transcribing added another layer to the data collection and analysis process and additional understanding and insight to participant responses were gained.
- e) I learned from intently listening to the initial interviews (when transcribing) and was able to also improve interviewing technique and style.
- f) The qualitative approach was relevant to the topic of this study.

The value of the clear and well defined ethical considerations became very clear during the initial liaison and final interaction with participants. The ethical guidelines that were established provided clear borders for questioning and guided me in many ways to ensure an objective and true outcome to the interviews.

5.5 Conclusion and future research recommendations

As a final conclusion the following may be topics or areas for further research relating to the factors impacting on the management and provision of student development and support in higher education in a developing country:

- Aspects of student-preparedness versus university-preparedness.
- Strategic steps towards making the university prepared to deal with the under-prepared student in dealing with increased participation and university access.



- Organisational strategy and alignment of student development and support functions in organisational structure.
- Determining a comprehensive but relevant student development and support service portfolio for higher education.
- The role and impact of managerialism.
- The role and impact of national strategy and policy.



CHAPTER 6

CRITICAL REFLECTION ON THE PhD-STUDY EXPERIENCE

6.1 Prologue

It was an eager and easy decision to start this study. Student development and support is a passion and life time work orientation for me. In looking back I guess this is what I was born and raised to do.

Born into a middle class family and brought up in a loving supportive Christian home made me a "middle of the road person" in my time. As an only child in an otherwise small family I was often left to my own devices to entertain myself and play. In so doing I devised many a simple game for one. Though I had many friends and a welcoming home I was equally happy to teach the flowers. Looking back at my childhood I realise that protective caring parents and a nurturing adoring grandmother made me grow in self-esteem and I cemented two critical core beliefs namely that "I can" and "I am a good and decent person" that since then directs most of my life story.

In high school I established a firm platform for my spiritual life and dedicated my life to the Lord. This brought a sense of purpose and a determination to find my calling. It was only many years later that I actually realised that it was in those days already that my natural inclination to be reflective was nurtured. I became increasingly emotionally independent - mostly because I questioned myself, constantly evaluated my own performance, set goals and determined progress and always had this sense of meta-awareness about what I was doing and to what end. I became most aware of how I impacted on others and how they impacted on me. I suppose this made me naturally gravitate towards a career in education and psychology. Eventually during the second year of undergraduate studies I was exposed to aspects of educational psychology and my fate was sealed.



Later in my career as an educational psychologist and student counsellor I felt that I was getting to know the university through the hearts of people. The counselling and educational work exposed me to all forms of hardship and difficulty experienced by students in the emotional, spiritual and physical domain. Becoming a wife and mother gave new life perspectives but ultimately also intensified my awareness and sensitised me even more to what happens to students throughout the higher education experience.

Over two decades I experienced the shift in need and dilemmas and specifically also how higher education constantly grapples with the dilemma. The persistent question in me was always: "What are we doing?" with all the logical secondary questions of "is it working", "is it organised well" and "does it have impact"?

It was indeed an eager and easy decision to start this study even despite the restrictions imposed by life and work. Student development and support is a passion and part of who I am. Delving into this issue in scientific structured manner, asking the questions and attempting to find substantiated reasonable answers was inevitable.

6.2 Epilogue

6.2.1 What is happening? - reflection during the study

In thinking critically about the processes during the study there were many thoughts, emotions and insights that can be named.

The white-water swim

The initial stage (proposal writing) was an intense and draining period of sifting through confusion and steadfastly seeking clarity. Some of the PhD programme sessions energised and motivated while others overwhelmed. For me, getting to a final proposal was like swimming the white-waters determinedly and believing the embankment is most definitely coming up. It was most honestly a phase where I eventually experienced a severe crisis in confidence



and my belief in my own ability was seriously challenged. Though looking back I realised I did indeed have difficulty in dealing with criticism and negative feedback and that was probably the most difficult to overcome.

The toy room

The reading and literature review was like going into a room full of new exciting toys. The topic of the study justified reading in various disciplines including psychology, education, higher education, economy, sociology, I quickly created order and system as the volume of literature was so much and implemented a star-grading system for all articles and books. Once this was in place and reading became more focussed and structured and gradually a pattern of relevant literature and background emerged. I became intrigued with the – for me – new areas of insight on managerialism; the impact of labour and unionism on higher education and also the new paradigms in psychology. This multidisciplinary theoretical framework confirmed my years of professional experience of the SDSS context as being multidimensional. It was at this stage that I also found peripheral value in the study as my knowledge and understanding of current issues in the broader higher education sector grew.

It was at this stage that I again became confident about my ability to do this and proceeded with vigour. Work made it impossible to commit to reading and writing for extended periods and though I progressed well and eventually yearned to get out of the toy room.

Walking the parted sea: courage and determination

Preparations for the field work initially made me anxious as I had to adjust some plans and some of the initial thinking about how to go about it. When setting up appointments for interviews went smoothly I was encouraged.

My first university visit, with two individual interviews and one focus group interview was critical. It was easy enough to engage with participants conduct



the interview and ask the targeted questions but in reflecting and pausing afterwards I realised that my challenge is to:

- Not participate in (as opposed to facilitate) the discussions and remain in a neutral researcher role (my passion for the topic had to be controlled)
- To be extremely careful not to ask leading questions and even refrain from leading the answers.

The above reflection that took place made me become acutely aware of my role as the researcher. It became personal and more than just an academic principle.

Interviewing was less stressful from there on and I found myself relaxing more and listening better. I was constantly amazed about how eagerly participants shared information and more specifically their personal perspectives, experiences and views.

As the field work progressed I found my own understanding of the issues was growing. It already became clear that there were recurring topics and sensitivities.

As the opportunity arose I wrote an article on the preliminary findings of the study and going through this almost untimely exercise again gave me a critical academic look at what I was doing and whether it was leading to the planned outcome. Writing the article was an enriching experience towards critical review of my own work.

6.2.2 What happened? – reflection after the study

I started out with the intention (perhaps typical?) to uncover and expose, to make a contribution to the body of knowledge. Yet now, looking back and considering what happened I guess the chief outcome was that I actually changed, I grew as a professional, as a researcher and I now have a much



greater understanding and grasp of the topic. The contribution may be there but I know that that judgement is not mine. I am surely different and I know this because I am more confident to ask the critical questions.

The qualitative approach suited me well and I learned a tremendous amount about how to actually go about a qualitative study.

..... I think I've actually become a researcher.... I at least, for the first time ever started to seriously think of myself as one!!