

**The political aspects of institutional developments in the
water sector: South Africa and its international river
basins**

by

Anthony Richard Turton

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree

Doctor Philosophiae (International Politics)

in the Faculty of Humanities

University of Pretoria

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work is dedicated to the memory of my late father Clarence Stanley Turton, known affectionately to his family and friends as “Clarry”, or by his Zulu name *Ibhubezi* (meaning the Lion). He left an indelible imprint on my life. His love of the wide-open spaces of this continent, and his intense pride at being an African in every sense of the word (he spent his childhood at Hlabisa in Zululand and had a traditional Zulu upbringing) has always been inspirational to me, decades after his untimely death. I remain deeply indebted to him for the privileged exposure that he gave to me as a young child, often on the rolling plains of the Kalahari in the presence of the thundering hooves of thousands of migrating wildebeest, zebra and springbok, or in the shadow of the Mopani tree. I still yearn for his wisdom, much of which was so-called “traditional” in its origin. Whenever I return to those places I still feel his spirit stirring in my heart. It was during this early phase of my life that I became intensely interested in river basins and the complex web of life that they support as they meander across the African landscape.

At the intellectual level, this work is the reflection of the input into my life by many giants in the world of science, engineering and water resource management. I remain deeply indebted to Prof. Aaron Wolf, Prof. Jan Lundqvist and Prof. Peter Ashton, all co-founders of the Universities Partnership for Transboundary Waters (along with myself); Prof. Tony Allan, my mentor and “guru”; Prof. Malin Falkenmark; Prof. Maxi Schoeman; Dr. Jerome Delli Priscoli; Dr. Steve Mitchell; Dr. Barbara Heinzen; Dr. Clinton Swemmer; Dr. Leif Ohlsson; Dr. David Brooks; Dr. Geoff Dabelko and Ms. Ruth Beukman, all of who have been constant sources of encouragement to me.

On the technical side I remain indebted to Dr. Thinus Basson; Dr. Okalong Tombale; Mr. Peter van Niekerk; Mr. Piet Heyns; Mr. Beyers Havenga; Mr. Peter Pyke and Mr. Niels van Wyk, all of who gave of their time in order to provide me with the necessary information that was needed to complete this study. Special acknowledgement is given to Prof. Barry Buzan, who found the time to critique my early work. In similar vein, Prof. Marie Muller and Prof. Anton Du Plessis are acknowledged for their guidance, encouragement and technical support. Dr. Frik Potgieter is thanked for selecting me as a subject in his Ph.D. research programme in experimental ophthalmological surgery, which enabled the functional use of my one eye to be restored to reasonable levels again.

Finally, I gratefully acknowledge my wife Anna for her unflagging support; my daughter Melissa for her reliable proofreading of my manuscript; my son Rex for his professional management of my computing requirements; my sister Patricia who was there whenever I needed her; my brother Andrew (known in Zulu as *Majamela* - the one who stands and watches) who was always wise beyond his years; and my mother Heather (known in Zulu as *Nomsa* - the caring one) for having always believed in me when others didn't.

All of these people have been a valuable second-order resource to me, so this work is nothing other than a reflection of their combined impact on my life. While I acknowledge them all fully, I alone accept responsibility for the findings, which may not necessarily represent the viewpoints of any of the specific people mentioned.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 1: THE PROBLEM AND ITS SETTING

1.1	Background to the Problem	1
1.2	The Research Question	3
1.2.1	The Sub-problems	4
1.2.2	The Hypotheses	4
1.3	The Delimitation of the Study	7
1.4	The Definition of Concepts	7
1.5	The Importance of the Study	21
1.6	Research Design and Methodology	24
1.7	Structure of the Study	29

Chapter 2: THE SECURITIZATION OF WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT: A LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1	Introduction	31
2.2	The Consequences of Basin Closure: The Jordan River as a Classic Case	33
2.2.1	Basin Closure as a Concept	33
2.2.2	Jordan River Basin: Classic Case of Water Scarcity and Political Insecurity	34
2.2.3	The Israeli Hydraulic Mission	40
2.2.4	Water as a Potential <i>Casus Belli</i> in the Jordan River Basin	46
2.2.5	The Strategic Significance of Israeli Resource Capture	50
2.2.6	The Lebanon Invasion and Resource Capture	53
2.2.7	Expanding Horizons: Inter-basin Transfers as a Solution to Basin Closure	54

2.2.8	The Significance of Emblematic Events in the Jordan River Basin	56
2.2.9	Emergence of a Tentative Water Regime	60
2.2.10	Changing the Sanctioned Discourse: The Monetization of Water	62
2.2.11	Discussion: Basin Closure and Increasing Levels of Insecurity	64
2.2.12	Conclusion Regarding the Consequences of Basin Closure	69
2.3	Securitization as a Consequence of Increasing Levels of Insecurity	74
2.3.1	Introduction to Security Complex Theory	74
2.3.2	An Overview of Security Complex Theory	75
2.3.3	Hydropolitical Security Complexes as a Distinct Form of Security Complex	85
2.3.4	The Securitization of Water Resource Management in Closed River Basins	90
2.3.5	Conclusion Regarding the Consequences of Increasing Levels of Insecurity	92
2.4	Conclusion	94
Chapter 3: THE DESECURITIZATION OF WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT: A LITERATURE REVIEW		96
3.1	Introduction	96
3.2	Alternatives to the Securitization of Water Resource Management	96
3.2.1	Introduction to Regime Theory	97
3.2.2	An Overview of Regime Theory	98
3.2.3	The Relevance of Regime Theory to Closed River Basins	109
3.2.4	Linkage Between Security Complex Theory and Regime Theory	113
3.2.5	Conclusion Regarding the Alternatives to the Securitization of Water Resource Management	117
3.3	Critical Elements of Regime Creation	120
3.3.1	International Water Law	121
3.3.2	The <i>Rio Declaration</i> and the <i>Dublin Statement</i>	125
3.3.3	The <i>World Water Vision</i>	129
3.3.4	The World Commission on Dams	131

3.3.5	Generic Elements of a Water Regime	133
3.3.6	Conclusion Regarding the Critical Elements of Regime Creation	136
3.4	The Necessary Conditions for Regime Creation	139
3.4.1	Introduction	140
3.4.2	The Implications of Basin Closure on Water Management Institutions	140
3.4.3	Adaptation as a Result of Second-Order Resources	146
3.4.4	The “Turning of a Screw” Model	155
3.4.5	Ingenuity as a Second-Order Resource	160
3.4.6	Ingenuity and Institutional Learning	168
3.4.7	Indices of Second-Order Resource Availability	170
3.4.8	Conclusion Regarding the Necessary Conditions for Regime Creation	175
3.5	Conclusion	177
Chapter 4: DESCRIPTIVE OVERVIEW AND ANALYSIS OF THE SOUTH AFRICAN CASE STUDY		180
4.1	Introduction	180
4.2	South African Climatological Features	180
4.3	The Impact of Climatic Conditions on Water Resource Management	185
4.4	Brief Hydropolitical History of South Africa	190
4.4.1	Genesis of the Hydropolitical Dimension	191
4.4.2	From <i>Détente</i> to <i>Total Onslaught</i>	195
4.4.3	Post-Cold War Era	201
4.4.4	Overlay and South African Hydropolitics	203
4.5	The Orange River Basin	204
4.5.1	Physical Description of the Orange River Basin	205
4.5.2	Historical Progression of Regime Creation in the Orange River Basin	207
4.5.2.1	The Upper Basin: South Africa and Lesotho	208

4.5.2.2	The Middle Basin: South Africa and Botswana	210
4.5.2.3	The Lower Basin: South Africa and Namibia	210
4.5.3	The Orange River Basin within a Broader Regional Setting	211
4.5.4	Critical Hydropolitical Issues within the Orange River Basin	211
4.5.5	The Adaptive Security Spectrum in the Orange River Basin	213
4.5.6	Conclusion Regarding the Orange River Basin	214
4.6	The Limpopo River Basin	215
4.6.1	Physical Description of the Limpopo River Basin	215
4.6.2	Historical Progression of Regime Creation in the Limpopo River Basin	217
4.6.2.1	The Upper Basin: South Africa and Botswana	218
4.6.2.2	The Middle Basin: South Africa and Zimbabwe	220
4.6.2.3	The Lower Basin: South Africa and Mozambique	221
4.6.3	The Limpopo River Basin within a Broader Regional Setting	222
4.6.4	Critical Hydropolitical Issues within the Limpopo River Basin	223
4.6.5	The Adaptive Security Spectrum in the Limpopo River Basin	225
4.6.6	Conclusion Regarding the Limpopo River Basin	226
4.7	The Incomati and Maputo River Basin	228
4.7.1	Physical Description of the Incomati and Maputo River Basin	228
4.7.2	Historical Progression of Regime Creation in the Incomati and Maputo River Basin	231
4.7.2.1	The Upper Basin: South Africa and Swaziland	234
4.7.2.2	The Lower Basin: South Africa and Mozambique	235
4.7.3	The Incomati and Maputo River Basin within a Broader Regional Setting	236
4.7.4	Critical Hydropolitical Issues Within the Incomati and Maputo River Basin	237
4.7.5	The Adaptive Security Spectrum in the Incomati and Maputo River Basin	239
4.7.6	Conclusion Regarding the Incomati and Maputo River Basin	240
4.8	Conclusion	242

Chapter 5: THE ANALYSIS OF KEY HYDROPOLITICAL PROCESSES IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN CASE STUDY

5.1	Introduction	247
5.2	An Analysis of the Key Hydropolitical Processes in the Orange River Basin	247
5.2.1	Securitization Processes	248
5.2.2	Regime Creation Processes	257
5.2.3	Institutional Development Processes	259
5.2.4	Conclusion Regarding the Orange River Basin	263
5.3	An Analysis of the Key Hydropolitical Processes in the Limpopo River Basin	264
5.3.1	Securitization Processes	264
5.3.2	Regime Creation Processes	270
5.3.3	Institutional Development Processes	272
5.3.4	Conclusion Regarding the Limpopo River Basin	276
5.4	An Analysis of the Key Hydropolitical Processes in the Incomati and Maputo River Basin	276
5.4.1	Securitization Processes	277
5.4.2	Regime Creation Processes	283
5.4.3	Institutional Development Processes	285
5.4.4	Conclusion Regarding the Incomati and Maputo River Basin	292
5.5	Water as an Element of a Regional Security Complex in Southern Africa	293
5.6	Summary of the Analysis of the South African Case Study	299
5.7	Assessment of Regimes in the Context of the South African Case Study	302
5.8	Conclusion	305

Chapter 6: ASSESSMENT AND PRESCRIPTION	306
6.1 Introduction	306
6.2 Statement of the Problem	306
6.2.1 The First Sub-problem and Hypothesis	307
6.2.2 The Second Sub-problem and Hypothesis	309
6.2.3 The Third Sub-problem and Hypothesis	311
6.2.4 The Fourth Sub-problem and Hypothesis	312
6.2.5 The Fifth Sub-problem and Hypothesis	314
6.3 Conclusion	315
BIBLIOGRAPHY	317
SUMMARY	350
SAMEVATTING	352

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.	Volume of the Jordan River that was Apportioned in the Johnston United Water Plan.	44
Table 2.	Percentage of Water Consumption in the West Bank during 1990.	51
Table 3.	Agricultural Consumption of Water in Israel 1987/88.	57
Table 4.	Water Consumption in Terms of Article 40 of the Taba Agreement.	62
Table 5.	Expected Water Shortage in 2010 Based on the 1991/2 Israeli Drought Data.	67
Table 6.	Water Supply and Demand, Present and Future ($10^6\text{m}^3\text{yr}^{-1}$).	67
Table 7.	Types of Units Involved in Security Complex Analysis.	79
Table 8.	Instruments of Measurement.	83
Table 9.	Sectors within a Security Complex.	84

Table 10.	Contents of a Regime.	101
Table 11.	Visible and Less Visible Components of a Regime.	101
Table 12.	The Gradual Factors and Actors within Regimes.	103
Table 13.	The Immediate Factors and Actors within Regimes.	104
Table 14.	Matrix Showing Water Policy Goals and Available Tools.	155
Table 15.	Comparative Statistics for South Africa’s International River Basins.	184
Table 16.	Inter-basin Transfers of Water Involving International River Basins in South Africa.	187

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.	The Sub-problems and Hypotheses.	6
Figure 2.	Israeli Water Consumption from 1947-1993.	40
Figure 3.	Securitization Model.	73
Figure 4.	The Security Complex Spectrum.	76
Figure 5.	Levels of Analysis.	82
Figure 6.	Desecuritization Model.	120
Figure 7.	The Molden Model.	142
Figure 8.	The Turton/Ohlsson Model.	144
Figure 9.	Ohlsson’s Parallel Discourse of Scarcity.	150
Figure 10.	The Reflexive Model.	151
Figure 11.	The Linkages between First-order and Second-order Resources.	153
Figure 12.	The “Turning of the Screw” Model.	158
Figure 13.	Resource Matrix for Selected African Countries.	173
Figure 14.	Adaptive Security Spectrum for South Africa’s Co-riparian States.	174

Figure 15.	Integrated Model Showing the Linkage Between the Securitization and Desecuritization Dynamics in a Closing International River Basin.	179
Figure 16.	Ratio of Mean Annual Runoff to Mean Annual Precipitation for Selected Countries.	182
Figure 17.	Proportion of Gross Geographic Product of Each Province Supported by Inter-basin Transfer of Water in South Africa.	189
Figure 18.	Historic Overview of Regime Creation in the Orange River Basin.	207
Figure 19.	The Adaptive Security Spectrum in the Orange River Basin.	213
Figure 20.	Historic Overview of Regime Creation in the Limpopo River Basin.	217
Figure 21.	The Adaptive Security Spectrum in the Limpopo River Basin.	225
Figure 22.	Historic Overview of Regime Creation in the Incomati and Maputo River Basin.	233
Figure 23.	The Adaptive Security Spectrum in the Incomati and Maputo River Basin.	239
Figure 24.	The Southern African Hydropolitical Complex.	294
Figure 25.	Potential Patterns of Political Interaction Between Different Components of a Hydropolitical Complex.	295
Figure 26.	The Southern African Regional Security Complex Showing the Hydropolitical Complex as a Distinct Component.	297

LIST OF MAPS

Map 1.	The Jordan River Basin.	35
Map 2.	Various Water Diversions in Israel.	38
Map 3.	Potential Inter-basin Transfer from the Nile to the Jordan River Basin.	54
Map 4.	The Peace Canal between Turkey and Israel.	55

Map 5.	Security Complexes in the Third World.	77
Map 6.	Security Complexes of the Middle East North Africa Region.	87
Map 7.	South Africa's International River Basins.	183
Map 8.	Scenario for the Utilization of River Water in 2030.	186
Map 9.	South African Water Management Areas Showing Inter-basin Transfers.	188
Map 10.	The Orange River Project.	193
Map 11.	The Orange River Basin.	206
Map 12.	The Limpopo River Basin.	216
Map 13.	The Incomati, Maputo and Umbeluzi River Basin.	229
Map 14.	The Lesotho Highlands Water Project.	249
Map 15.	The Botswana National Water Plan.	267

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ANC: African National Congress
AU: African Union
BSE: Bovine Spongiform Encephalopathy
CCB: Civil Cooperation Bureau
CIA: Central Intelligence Agency
CMA: Catchment Management Agency
CODESA: Convention for a Democratic South Africa
CONSAS: Constellation of Southern African States
CSCT: Classic Security Complex Theory
CSD: Commission for Sustainable Development
DIWCC: Demographically-Induced Water Consumption Curve
DMI: Department of Military Intelligence
DNA: Mozambican National Department of Water Affairs
DOP: Declaration of Principles
DRC: Democratic Republic of Congo
DWAF: Department of Water Affairs and Forestry
ESCOM: Electricity Supply Commission
FAO: Food and Agriculture Organization
GCC: Global Climate Coalition
GCI: Green Cross International
GDP: Gross Domestic Product
GGP: Gross Geographic Product
GNP: Gross National Product
GWP: Global Water Partnership
HMEWP: Harvard Middle East Water Project
IBT: Inter-basin Transfer
ICJ: International Court of Justice
ICWE: International Conference on Water and Environment
IDRC: International Development Research Centre
IFP: Inkatha Freedom Party
IFR: Instream Flow Requirement
ILA: International Law Association
ILC: International Law Commission
IWMI: International Water Management Institute

IWRM: Integrated Water Resource Management
JIA: Joint Irrigation Authority
JIBS: Joint Incomati Basin Study
JPCC: Joint Permanent Commission for Cooperation
JPTC: Joint Permanent Technical Committee (South Africa and Botswana)
JPTC: Joint Permanent Technical Commission (South Africa and Botswana)
JPTC: Joint Permanent Technical Commission (South Africa and Lesotho)
JPTWC: Joint Permanent Technical Water Commission
JTC: Joint Technical Committee
JULBS: Joint Upper Limpopo Basin Study
JWC: Joint Water Commission
KOBWA: Komati Basin Water Authority
LBPTC: Limpopo Basin Permanent Technical Committee
LHDA: Lesotho Highlands Development Authority
LHWC: Lesotho Highlands Water Commission
LHWP: Lesotho Highlands Water Project
MAD: Mutually Assured Destruction
MAP: Mean Annual Precipitation
MAR: Mean Annual Runoff
MENA: Middle East North Africa
MPLA: Popular Movement for the Liberation of Angola
NATO: North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NEPAD: New Partnership for Africa's Development
NGO: Non-governmental Organization
NIS: National Intelligence Service
NP: National Party
NSC: North-South Carrier
OAU: Organization of African Unity
OECD: Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
OKACOM: Permanent Okavango River Basin Water Commission
OPEC: Organization of Petroleum Exporting Countries
ORASECOM: Orange-Senqu River Commission
ORP: Orange River Project
ORRS: Orange River Replanning Study
PAC: Pan Africanist Congress
PLO: Palestine Liberation Organization

PPP: Purchasing Power Parity
PWA: Palestinian Water Authority
PWC: Permanent Water Commission
RBA: River Basin Authority
RBC: River Basin Commission
RBO: River Basin Organization
RENAMO: *Resistência Nacional Moçambicana* (Mozambican National Resistance Movement)
RWB: Rand Water Board
SADCC: Southern African Development Coordination Conference
SADC: Southern African Development Community
SADC-HYCOS: Southern African Development Community Hydrological Cycle Observing System
SADC-WSCU: Southern African Development Community Water Sector Coordination Unit
SADF: South African Defence Force
SARCCUS: Southern African Regional Commission for the Conservation and Utilization of the Soil
SASOL: *Suid Afrikaanse Steenkool en Olie Maatskappy* (South African Coal and Oil Company)
SCT: Security Complex Theory
SEI: Stockholm Environment Institute
SIDA: Swedish International Development Agency
SIRWA: Structurally-Induced Relative Water Abundance
SIRWS: Structurally-Induced Relative Water Scarcity
SOAS: School of Oriental and African Studies
SSC: State Security Council
SWAPO: South West Africa Peoples Organization
SWE: Sectoral Water Efficiency
TCTA: Trans Caledon Tunnel Authority
TPTC: Tripartite Permanent Technical Committee
TVA: Tennessee Valley Authority
UDI: Unilateral Declaration of Independence
UN: United Nations
UNCED: United Nations Conference on Environment and Development
UNDP: United Nations Development Programme

UNEP: United Nations Environment Programme
UNESCO: United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNFCCC: United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
UPTW: Universities Partnership for Transboundary Waters
USA: United States of America
US: United States (of America)
USSR: Union of Soviet Socialist Republics
VNJIS: Vioolsdrift and Noordoewer Joint Irrigation Scheme
WBS: Water Barrier Scale
WCD: World Commission on Dams
WDM: Water Demand Management
WHO: World Health Organization
WMA: Water Management Area
WMO: World Meteorological Organization
WP: Water Poverty
WSI: Water Scarcity Index
WSSD: World Summit on Sustainable Development
WWC: World Water Council
WWF: World Water Forum
WWV: World Water Vision