

**A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF REGISTRATION PRACTICES IN  
SELECTED ORGAN WORKS OF JOHANN SEBASTIAN BACH  
(1685–1750) BASED ON RECORDINGS MADE BY MARIE-CLAIRE  
ALAIN AND JACQUES VAN OORTMERSSEN**

by

**THEODORE JUSTIN VAN WYK**

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the  
requirements for the degree of

**M MUS (PERFORMING ART)**

in the

**FACULTY OF HUMANITIES**

**UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA**

**PRETORIA**

2000

Promoter: Prof W.D. Viljoen

VAN WYK  
THEODORE JUSTIN  
BACH

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA  
LIBRARY  
2001  
MUS 3804

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This thesis is dedicated to Zelda.

My sincere thanks to:

1. Prof. Wim Viljoen for his guidance, motivation, encouragement and his ever living example of life.
2. Gillian Beyer and Elizabeth for their kind assistance and support.
3. Family and friends for their support and encouragement.
4. Myself for the time and effort.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My sincere thanks to:

1. Prof. Wim Viljoen for his guidance, motivation, inspiration and for being a living example at all times;
2. Gillian Barnes and Christobelle van Wyk for assisting in typing the thesis;
3. Lastly, but most importantly, to the Almighty God who made it possible for me to complete the task I had set out to do.

## SUMMARY

Title: A comparative study of registration procedures in selected jurisdictions  
Author: [Name obscured]  
Year: [Year obscured]

Name: [Name obscured]

Number: [Number obscured]

[Text obscured]

[Text obscured]

In his secular compositions he disclaimed everything common, but in his compositions for organ he kept himself infinitely more distant from it, so that here, it seems to me, he does not appear like a man, but as a true disembodied spirit, who soars above everything mortal.

- Johann Nicolaus Forkel on Bach (1802)  
(Stauffer & May 1986: 55).

This study is of a comparative nature and is...

## SUMMARY

Title: A comparative study of registration practices in selected organ works of Johann Sebastian Bach (1685-1750) based on recordings made by Marie-Claire Alain and Jacques van Oortmerssen.

Name: Theodore Justin van Wyk

Promoter: Prof. W.D. Viljoen

Department: Music

Degree: M. Mus. (Performing Art)

A firm knowledge of registration is an indispensable prerequisite of historical performance practice and is an absolute necessity for the proper interpretation and understanding of the music that is performed. The recent emphasis on the study concerning registration has assisted performers such as Marie-Claire Alain and Jacques van Oortmerssen immeasurably in the appreciation of the literature in this field.

Although eighteenth-century registration practices do not always provide specific or conclusive evidence in many areas, the information that is proffered, is far from insignificant. On the contrary, these provide a generous amount of relevant and usable knowledge, as reflected in the writings of composers, theoreticians and organ builders of this era. Many of these writings are valuable in the sense that most of the authors were contemporaries of Bach. Consequently, they give us an idea of the tonal ideal, general trends and principles that were popular in terms of registration during the eighteenth-century.

This study is of a comparative nature and is based on an empirical analysis of historical

practices of registration and the implementation thereof in the organ works of Johann Sebastian Bach. Alain and Van Oortmerssen's registrations are generally based on historical guidelines and principles as prescribed or suggested by the relevant authors on the subject on a particular area of registration, and consequently they apply these registrations practically to the genre of organ music in question.

Both Alain and Van Oortmerssen's approaches to registration, although based on the principles of historical registration practices, are examples of singular creativity, exceptional personal practices and disciplined preferences. These aspects enhance the fact that no organ work will ever be performed in exactly the same manner by any number of artists in the sense of registration. The registration preferences of Alain and Van Oortmerssen testify of uninhibited approach, while still remaining subjective to the basic trends of a particular work being performed.

**Keywords:**

- Alain – Van Oortmerssen – recordings – Bach – registration – historical organs – Mattheson – Adlung – Agricola – *plenum*

## CONTENTS

1. Introduction	1
1.1 Motivation for the study	1
1.2 Aim of the study	1
1.3 Research method	2
1.4 Problem statement	2
1.5 Presentation of the script	3
2. Biography of performers	4
2.1 Marie-Claire Alain	4
2.2 Jacques van Oortmerssen	5
3. Organs used in recordings	7
3.1 Organs played by Marie-Claire Alain	7
3.1.1 Organ of the Grote St Laurenskerk, Alkmaar (Netherlands)	7
3.1.2 Organ of the Aa-kerk, Groningen (Netherlands)	9
3.1.3 Organ of Freiberg Cathedral (Domkirche)	10

3.1.4	Organ of the Georgenkirche, Rötha	11
3.1.5	Organ of the Jacobijnekerk, Leeuwarden (Netherlands)	12
3.1.6	Organ of St Bavokerk, Haarlem (Netherlands)	13
3.1.7	Organ of Grauhof Abbey, Goslar (Lower Saxony)	14
3.1.8	Organ of the Martinikerk, Groningen	15
3.1.9	Orgue de l'Église Saint-Martin, Masevaux	16
3.2	Organs played by Jacques van Oortmerssen	18
3.2.1	Organ of the Grote St Laurenskerk, Alkmaar (Netherlands)	18
3.2.2	The historic organ of Roskilde Cathedral, Denmark	18
3.2.3	Organ of the Waalse Kerk, Amsterdam (Netherlands)	20
3.2.4	Organ of the Nidaros Cathedral, Trondheim	21
3.2.5	Organ of the Bovenkerk, Kampen (Netherlands)	22



4. Registration	25
4.1 Introduction	25
4.2 The “Bach organ”	27
4.3 The art of registration in Bach	34
4.4 Contemporary registration practices	35
4.4.1 <i>Plenum</i> registrations	36
4.4.2 Non- <i>plenum</i> registrations	41
4.4.3 The <i>Äqualstimmenverbot</i>	44
5. Analysis and comparison of registrations used in recordings	47
Free Organ Works	
5.1 Toccata in D minor BWV 565	47
5.2 Prelude and Fugue in B minor BWV 544	54
5.3 Toccata and Fugue in D minor BWV 538	59
5.4 Fantasia in C minor BWV 562	68
5.5 Trio Sonata in D minor BWV 527	73

	<p style="text-align: center;">Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme BWV 645</p>	
5.6	Concerto in G major BWV 592	81
5.7	<p style="text-align: center;">Wo soll ich fliehen hin BWV 646</p> <p>Chorale-based works</p> <p>Partita diversa sopra: Sei gegrüßet, Jesu gütig / O Jesu du edle Gabe BWV 768</p> <p>Choral</p> <p>Variation I</p> <p>Variation II</p> <p>Variation III</p> <p>Variation IV</p> <p>Variation V</p> <p>Variation VI</p> <p>Variation VII</p> <p>Variation VIII</p> <p>Variation IX</p> <p>Variation X</p> <p>Variation XI</p>	<p>87</p> <p>88</p> <p>90</p> <p>92</p> <p>93</p> <p>95</p> <p>96</p> <p>98</p> <p>100</p> <p>101</p> <p>102</p> <p>104</p> <p>105</p>

5.8	Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme BWV 645	108
5.9	Wo soll ich fliehen hin BWV 646	109
5.10	Wer nur den lieben Gott läßt walten BWV 647	111
5.11	Meine Seele erhebt den Herren BWV 648	112
5.12	Ach bleib bei uns, Herr Jesu Christ BWV 649	113
5.13	Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter BWV 650	114
5.14	Wir glauben all' an einen Gott, Vater BWV 740	115
5.15	Wo soll ich fliehen hin BWV 694	118
6.	Conclusion	120
Appendix A:	Selected discography of Marie-Claire Alain	123
Appendix B:	Discography of Jacques van Oortmerssen	127
Sources		129
Discography		132

## CHAPTER 1

### INTRODUCTION

#### 1.1 Motivation for the study

The writer has been fortunate to have had attended masterclasses under both Marie-Claire Alain and Jacques van Oortmerssen. Their exceptional professionalism, performance techniques and knowledge made a permanent impression on the writer and thus motivated him to pursue a study of such a nature.

The writer also had the privilege to have played on several historical organs and copies of such instruments in the Netherlands, viz. the organs of Grote Sint Laurenskerk, Alkmaar, Eglise Wallonne, Amsterdam, the Grote Kerk, Edam, the Nieuwe Kerk, Haarlem, and in Sweden, viz. the Arvidsson/Van Eeken/Yokota North German Baroque organ (a copy of a Schnitger organ) in the Orgryte Nya Kyrka, Göteborg. The authenticity of these instruments therefore also contributed to the undertaking of this study.

#### 1.2 Aim of the research

It is the writer's intention to make a contribution in this interesting field of comparative studies and to explore this hitherto little known area of organ performance. A critical comparative study of these performances will provide a comprehensive foundation for the organ scholar's research into Bach interpretation as a whole. The writer also needs a stimulus by means of comparison for his own performance of Bach works and that would also provide the student with an additional option of stimulating an interest in Bach's organ music.

### 1.3 Research method

There are numerous recordings of Bach's organ works that were made by competent and distinguished organists, but for the purpose of this thesis the writer has selected the latest recordings of Marie-Claire Alain and Jacques van Oortmerssen. The study is primarily one of an empirical nature, with the recordings of Alain and Van Oortmerssen as the research basis. A wide spectrum of literature is also used as secondary sources to highlight certain aspects pertaining to this study such as registration and historical organs. During this process, the writings of composers, organ builders, theoreticians and musicologists will be compared to the interpretation and "authenticity" of the recording artists. In the process of selecting the organ works for this thesis, the writer aimed to include works that would represent the main genres of Bach's organ music under two main categories, i.e. free works and chorale-based works. The writer also specifically chose works that have a distinct difference in terms of registration between the two performers, thereby omitting works with more or less the same registration structure in the two different approaches and interpretation thereof.

It is also the intention of the writer to include all the latest available volumes of organ recordings of Bach by both Marie-Claire Alain and Jacques van Oortmerssen. Therefore a selection of corresponding works found on the fourteen volumes of Alain and the current five volumes of Van Oortmerssen are made.

The names of registers in the specifications are spelt as supplied in the cover booklet notes of the CD's.

### 1.4 Problem statement

There are many studies of a musicological nature, yet there is a dearth in comparative studies on performance practice in style and approach between various performing organists. It is an irrefutable fact that subtle yet perceivable differences exist amongst

interpretational approaches of various performers, especially in terms of registration. The writer therefore felt that this aspect deserves closer scientific study, especially in the case of highly skilled performers of the calibre of Alain and Van Oortmerssen.

## BIOGRAPHY OF PERFORMERS

### 1.5 Presentation of the script

This script is divided into the following chapters:

- Chapter 1: Introduction
- Chapter 2: A biography of each performer
- Chapter 3: The historical organs that are used in recordings with specific detail such as year built and/or restoration, names of builders and specification of the organs.
- Chapter 4: A background to contemporary registration practices in Bach's time that are used in recordings.
- Chapter 5: An analysis and comparison between the two organists' different registrations that are used in the recordings.
- Chapter 6: Conclusion
- Appedix A contains a list of the most important recordings by Marie-Claire Alain.
- Appendix B contains a list of all the recordings by Jacques van Oortmerssen.

## CHAPTER 2

### BIOGRAPHY OF PERFORMERS

#### 2.1 Marie-Claire Alain

Marie-Claire Alain was born in 1926 into a family of musicians at Saint-Germain-en-Laye, near Paris in France. She studied at the Conservatoire National Supérieur of Paris where she won four *Premier Prix*. After this she won several awards in international competitions. Marie-Claire Alain's tours have taken her throughout the world giving over 2000 concerts, either as a recitalist or as a soloist with orchestra.

She is also greatly in demand as a pedagogue. Famous for her lectures illustrated with musical examples, Alain bases her teaching on extensive, unrelenting musicological studies into the organ repertoire and the performance of Early, Romantic and Symphonic music. Alain's recording catalogue contains over 250 records and over 60 CD's. These recordings have won her fifteen major French and international record awards.

The town of Lübeck awarded Alain the *Buxtehude Prize*, crowning her action favouring Early German music. Budapest awarded her the *Franz Liszt Prize*. On this occasion she was also decorated with the Danish *Danneborg Order*. Alain is also a member of the Swedish Royal Academy of Music.

Alain is a Doctor honoris causa of the Colorado State University and of the Southern Methodist University in Dallas, Texas. In France she is a Commander of the *Légion d'Honneur* and a Commander of the *Ordre National du Mérite*.

In 1984 Alain was named 'International Performer of the Year' by the New York City Chapter of the American Guild of Organists. Over the past two decades, Marie-Claire Alain has been recording exclusively for Erato Disques.

## 2.2 Jacques van Oortmerssen

Jacques van Oortmerssen was born in 1950 in the Netherlands where he began his music studies at an early age. He then furthered his studies at the Rotterdam Conservatory, studying the organ with André Verwoerd and piano with Elly Salomé. Here he also earned the distinction *cum laude* for his final examination and was given a special prize for improvisation. In 1974 he continued his studies with Marie-Claire Alain in Paris, France, where he was awarded the *Prix d'Excellence* in 1976. After this, he also studied piano receiving his degree as soloist. In 1977 he was awarded first prize at the Dutch National Improvisation Competition in Bolsward and the second prize in the Tournemire Competition at St. Albans.

Since 1979 Van Oortmerssen has been Professor of Organ at the Sweelinck Conservatory in Amsterdam where his organ class attracts students from all over the world. He is in great demand as a guest teacher and recitalist at many conservatories and universities in many different countries. In 1982 Van Oortmerssen succeeded Gustav Leonhardt as *Organiste Titulaire* of the Waalse Kerk in Amsterdam with its magnificent Christian Müller organ (1734).

Van Oortmerssen is an active composer, an organ consultant and a member of the baroque ensemble *Tirata Amsterdam*. He is also in demand as a concert recitalist worldwide and is becoming increasingly active as a conductor. In addition Van Oortmerssen is associated with the University of Göteborg, Sweden, as a visiting organ teacher and affiliated with the organ research project at the Göteborg Organ Art Center.



For the academic year 1993/1994 Van Oortmerssen became Betts Fellow in Organ Studies at Oxford University and as a recitalist appeared in many international festivals such as the BBC Proms. It is also during these festivals that his interpretations of Bach and early music have brought him widespread fame. In 1995 Jacques van Oortmerssen began recording the complete organ works of Bach on the most important historical organs in Europe.

He has been a jury member at the following international competitions:

- Grand Prix de Chartres
- International Schnitger Organ Competition
- Dublin International Competition
- Odense International Organ Competition
- South African National Organ Competition

1926 - Organ built by Heinrich Schnitger (1755)  
 Friedrich Schnitger was part of a famous family of organ builders in Germany during the late 17<sup>th</sup> century and early 18<sup>th</sup> century. He was the son of Heinrich Schnitger (1645) who built more than 150 organs by hand, and was a highly skilled and very obviously wealthy instrument maker. His organs are characterized by good church work, with a lot of tonal variety. (Wikipedia, 2009) It is a pleasure to play on this instrument, which is a play of sound, the organ is a masterpiece of the 18<sup>th</sup> century.

1926 - Restoration by Henning Engelbouts.

Principal 12'	Principal 8'	Principal 6'	Principal 4'
Principal 12'	Principal 8'	Principal 6'	Principal 4'
Principal 10'	Quintadena 8'	Principal 4'	Principal 2'

## CHAPTER 3

### ORGANS USED IN RECORDINGS

#### 3.1 Organs played by Marie-Claire Alain

##### 3.1.1 Organ of the Grote St Laurenskerk, Alkmaar (Netherlands) *Featured on CDs Vol 8, 9 and 10*

1646 Van Hagerbeer  
 Van Hagerbeer was a famous Dutch organ-building firm in the 17<sup>th</sup> century.

1725 Frans Caspar Schnitger (d. 1729)  
 Frans Schnitger was part of a famous family of organ builders in Germany during the late 17<sup>th</sup> century and early 18<sup>th</sup> century. He was the son of Arp Schnitger (1648-1719) who built more than 150 organs in Germany and the Netherlands, and Frans was obviously greatly influenced by his father. Their organs are characterised by good chorus work, well-voiced reeds and mutations. (Williams & Owen 1988: 384.) Newman (1995: 237) interestingly mentions that the typical Schnitger organ has a “howling” effect when it is played causing the pitch to rise slightly as the wind is “caught”.

1986 Restoration by Flentrop Orgelbouw.

#### Specification

<u>PEDAAL</u>	<u>RUGPOSITIEF</u>	<u>HOOFDWERK</u>	<u>BOVENWERK</u>
Principaal 22'	Prestant 8'	Prestant 16'	Prestant 8'
Prestant 16'	Quintadena 8'	Prestant 8'	Roerfluit 8'

Rohrquint 12'	Octaav 4'	Prestantquint 6'	Baarpijp 8'
Octaav 8'	Nasaat 3'	Octaav 4'	Quintadena 8'
Quinta 6'	Fluit 4'	Quint 3'	Octaav 4'
Octaav 4'	Superoctaav 2'	Octaav 2'	Fluit Dous 4'
Nachthoorn 2'	Quintfluit 3'	Flachfluit 2'	Spitsfluit 3'
Ruyschpijp III	Waldfluit 2'	Ruyschpijp II	Superoctaav 2'
Mixtuur VIII	Quintanus 1½'	Tertiaan II	Speelfluit 2'
Bazuin 16'	Mixtuur V-VI	Mixtuur VI	Sexquialtra II
Trompet 8'	Sexquialtra II	Trompet 16'	Scherp IV
Trompet 4'	Cimbel III	Trompet 4'	Cimbel III
Cornet 2'	Trompet 8'	Viool de Gamba 8'	Trompet 8'
	Fagot 8'		Hautbois 8'
	Vox Humana 8'		Vox Humana 8'

Couplers

RP/HW

RP/BW

HW/BW

Pedal/HW

Pedal/RP

Tremulants

Bovenwerk

Rugpositief

Pitch:  $a^1 = 415 \text{ Hz}$

Temperament: Equal since 1725

### 3.1.2 Organ of the Aa-kerk, Groningen *Featured on CD Vol 13*

1678 Andreas de Mare

The De Mares were Flemish builders based in Germany during the 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> centuries. Their organ cases are said to be the best examples of the Renaissance period (Williams & Owen 1988: 374).

1702 Arp Schnitger

#### Specification

<u>PEDAL</u>	<u>RÜCKPOSITIF</u>	<u>HAUPTWERK</u>	<u>OBERWERK</u>
Subbass 16'	Quintadena 8'	Praestant 16'	Holfluit 8'
Bourdon 16'	Praestant 8'	Octaaf 8'	Praestant 8'
Quinta 10 <sup>2</sup> / <sub>3</sub> '	Gedekt 8'	Holpijp 8'	Viola di Gamba 8'
Praestant 8'	Octaaf 4'	Salicional 8'	Fluit 4'
Violon 8'	Roerfluit 4'	Nachthoorn 4'	Octaaf 4'
Octaaf 4'	Gemshoorn 2'	Octaaf 4'	Fluit 2'
Bazuin 16'	Sifflet 1 <sup>1</sup> / <sub>3</sub> '	Nazard 2 <sup>2</sup> / <sub>3</sub> '	Flageolet 1'
Trompet 8'	Scherp IV-V	Ruyschpijp II	Clarinet 8'
Trompet 4'	Waldfluit 2'	Octaaf 2'	
Cornet 2'	Dulciaan 8'	Mixtur III-V	
		Cornet V	
		Trompet 16'	
		Trompet 8'	

#### Couplers

RP/HW (Bass)

RP/HW (Descant)

Pitch:  $\frac{1}{4}$  tone higher than  $a^1 = 440$  Hz

### 3.1.3 Organ of Freiberg Cathedral (Domkirche) Germany *Featured on CDs Vol 2 and 3*

1710-14 Gottfried Silbermann (1683-1753)

Gottfried Silbermann was the son of the famous builder, Andreas Silbermann (1678-1734). The Silbermanns are noted for the exceptional collaboration of French and South German elements in their organs (Williams & Owen 1988: 386-387).

#### Specification

<u>PEDAL</u>	<u>HAUPTWERK</u>	<u>BOVENWERK</u>	<u>OBERWERK</u>
Untersatz 32'	Bordun 16'	Gedackt 8'	Quintadena 16'
Octavbaß 16'	Principal 8'	Principal 4'	Principal 8'
Principalbaß 16'	Rohrflöte 8'	Rohrflöte 4'	Gedackt 8'
Octavbaß 8'	Viol di Gamba 8'	Nasat 3'	Quintadena 8'
Octavbaß 4'	Octava 4'	Octava 2'	Octava 4'
Pedalmixtur VI	Quinta 3'	Tertia $1\frac{3}{5}'$	Spitzflöte 4'
Posaunbaß 16'	Superoctav 2'	Quinta $1\frac{1}{2}'$	Superoctav 2'
Trompetenbaß 8'	Tertia $1\frac{3}{5}'$	Sifflöt 1'	Flachflöte 1'
Clarinbaß 4'	Mixtur IV	Mixtur III	Mixtur III
	Zimbeln III		Zimbeln II
	Cornet V		Echo (Cornet) V
	Trompet 8'		Krumhorn 8'
	Clarin 4'		Vox Humana 8'

Couplers

BW/HW

OW/HW

Tremulant

Schwebung

3.1.4 Organ of the Georgenkirche, Rötha

*Featured on CDs Vol 4 and 5*

1721 Gottfried Silbermann

Specification

PEDAL

Principal 16'

Posaune 16'

Trommete 8'

MANUAL I

Bordun 16'

Principal 8'

Rohrflöte 8'

Octava 4'

Spitzflöte 4'

Quinta 3'

Octava 2'

Mixtur III

Cymbel II

Cornet III

MANUAL II

Quintadena 8'

Gedackt 8'

Principal 4'

Rohrflöte 4'

Nasat 3'

Octava 2'

Tertia 1<sup>3</sup>/<sub>5</sub>'

Quinta 1<sup>1</sup>/<sub>2</sub>'

Sifflet I

Mixtur III

Couplers

I/PED

II/I

Tremulant



Pitch: ½ tone higher than a<sup>1</sup> = 440 Hz

### 3.1.6 Organ of St Bavokerk, Haarlem (Netherlands)

*Featured on CD Vol 12*

1735-38 Christian Müller

1961 Restored by the Danish firm, Marcussen & Son

#### Specification

<u>PEDAAL</u>	<u>RUGPOSITIEF</u>	<u>HOOFDMANUAL</u>	<u>BOVENWERK</u>
Principaal 32'	Praestant 8'	Praestant 16'	Quintadeen 16'
Praestant 16'	Holpijp 8'	Bourdon 16'	Praestant 8'
Subbass 16'	Quintadeen 8'	Octaaf 8'	Quintadeen 8'
Roerquint 12'	Octaaf 4'	Roerfluit 8'	Baarpijp 8'
Octaaf 8'	Fluit Dous 4'	Roerquint 6'	Octaaf 4'
Hohlfluit 8'	Super Octaaf 2'	Octaaf 4'	Flagfluit 4'
Quint Praestant 6'	Speelfluit 3'	Quint Praestant 3'	Nasat 3'
Octaaf 4'	Sexquialter II-IV	Woudfluit 2'	Nacht Horn 2'
Woudfluit 2'	Cornet IV	Mixtuur IV-X	Flageolet 1'
Mixtuur VI-X	Mixtuur VI-VIII	Scherp VI-VII	Sexquialtera II
Ruyschpijp III	Cymbel III	Tertiaan II	Mixtuur IV-VI
Bazuin 32'	Fagot 16'	Trompet 16'	Cymbel III
Trompet 16'	Trompet 8'	Trompet 8'	Schalmei 8'
Trompet 8'	Tregter Regal 8'	Obo(e) 8'	Dolceaan 8'
Trompet 4'		Trompet 4'	Vox Humana 8'
Cink (Zink) 2'			



Couplers

HW/Pedal

RP/Pedal

RP/HW

BW/HW

Tremulant

Rugpositief

Bovenwerk

 3.1.7 Organ of Grauhof Abbey, Goslar (Lower Saxony)  
*Featured on CD Vol 14*

1737 Christoph Treutmann the Elder

1989-92 Restored by Hillebrand

Specification

<u>PEDAL</u>	<u>HINTERWERK</u>	<u>HAUPTWERK</u>	<u>OBERWERK</u>
Principal 16'	Gedackt 8'	Principal 16'	Principal 8'
Soubbas 16'	Quintadena 8'	Viola di gamba 16'	Rohrflöte 8'
Rohrflöte 12'	Principal 4'	Lieblich principal 8'	Octava 4'
Octava 8'	Flöte travers 4'	Spitzflöte 8'	Spitzflöte 4'
Flachflöte 8'	Octava 2'	Viola di gamba 8'	Quinta 3'
Superoctava 4'	Waldflöte 2'	Quinta 6'	Superoctava 2'
Mixtur IV	Quinta 1½'	Octava 4'	Sesquialtera II
Gross Posaunen	Scharff III	Nassat 3'	Mixtur V
bass 32'	Hautbois 8'	Rauschpfeife III	Fagott 16'
Posaune 16'		Mixtur IV-V	Vox Humana 8'
Trommet 8'		Trommet 16'	

Schalmey 4'

Trommet 8'

Couplers

OW/HW

HI/HW

Tremulant

Pitch:  $\frac{3}{4}$  tone higher than  $a^1 = 440$  Hz
 3.1.8 Organ of the Martinikerk, Groningen  
*Featured on CDs Vol 1, 6 and 7*

1740 Gottfried Silbermann

1984 Restored by Jürgen Ahrend

Specification

<u>PEDAL</u>	<u>HAUPTWERK</u>	<u>RÜCKPOSITIV</u>	<u>OBERWERK</u>
Praestant 32'	Praestant 16'	Quintadena 16'	Praestant 8'
Praestant 16'	Octaaf 8'	Praestant 8'	Holfluit 8'
Subbas 16'	Salicet 8'	Roerfluit 8'	Octaaf 4'
Octaaf 8'	Quintadena 8'	Bourdon 8'	Nasard 3'
Gedekt 8'	Gedekt 8'	Octaaf 4'	Sesquialtera II
Roerquint 6'	Octaaf 4'	Speelfluit 4'	Mixtuur IV-VI
Octaaf 4'	Gedekfluit 4'	Gedektquint 3'	Trompet 16'
Octaaf 2'	Octaaf 2'	Nasard 3'	Vox Humana 8'
Nachthoorn 2'	Vlakfluit 2'	Octaaf 2'	
Mixtuur IV	Tertian II	Fluit 2	
Bazuin 16'	Mixtuur IV-VI	Sesquialtera II	

Dulciaan 16'	Scherp IV	Mixtuur IV-VI
Trompet 8'	Trompet 8'	Cimbel III
Cornet 4'	Viola da Gamba 8'	Basson 16'
Cornet 2'		Schalmei 8'
		Hobo 8'

### Couplers

HW/RP

OW/HW

### Tremulant

Rückpositiv

Oberwerk

Pitch: ½ tone higher than a<sup>1</sup> = 440 Hz

### 3.1.9 Orgue de l'Église Saint-Martin, Masevaux *Featured on CD Vol 11*

1975      Alfred Kern

The organ at Masevaux is the only non-historical organ that has been used in the recordings of Alain. In the light of this aspect, Kern's organ is based on the principles of traditional organ building techniques used in time of Bach. The compass of all the other organs used in the recordings restricts the performance of a certain number of Bach's works. The Masevaux organ has a manual compass of C-f''' and the Pedal C-f'. This makes it possible to perform works, such as Bach's Concerto transcriptions and other works that require an unusually high compass, on this organ.

Specification

PED

(30 notes)  
 Flûte 16'  
 Flûte conique 8'  
 Prestant 4'  
 Cor de nuit 2'  
 Fourniture V  
 Posaune 16'  
 Trompette 8'  
 Cornet 2'

GRAND-ORGUE

(54 notes)  
 Bourdon 16'  
 Montre 8'  
 Flûte à cheminée 8'  
 Prestant 4'  
 Gemshorn 2'  
 Fourniture IV  
 Cymbale IV  
 Cornet V  
 Trompette 8'  
 Clairon 4'

POSITIF DE DOS

(54 notes)  
 Viole 8'  
 Bourdon 8'  
 Prestant 4'  
 Flûte à cheminée 4'  
 Nazard 2 <sup>2</sup>/<sub>3</sub>'  
 Quarte 2'  
 Tierce 1 <sup>3</sup>/<sub>5</sub>'  
 Sifflet 1'  
 Fourniture IV-V  
 Voix humaine 8'  
 Cromorne 8'

OBERWERK

(54 notes)  
 Bourdon 8'  
 Flûte à fuseau 4'  
 Doublette 2'  
 Larigot 1 <sup>1</sup>/<sub>3</sub>'  
 Cymballe III  
 Chalumeau 8'

ECHO

(42 notes)  
 Bourdon 8'  
 Flûte traverse 8'  
 Flûte 4'  
 Cornet III  
 Voix humaine 8'  
 Tremblant

COUPLERS:

POS/GO

OW/GO

OW/PED

POS/PED

GO/PED

Tremblant

GO/OW

POS/ PED

## 3.2 Organs played by Jacques van Oortmerssen

### 3.2.1 Organ of the Grote St Laurenskerk, Alkmaar (Netherlands) *Featured on CD Vol 5*

1646 Van Hagerbeer

1725 Frans Caspar Schnitger

1982-86 Restored by Flentrop Orgelbauw

The Van Hagerbeer/Schnitger organ is the only common instrument used by both Alain and Van Oortmerssen on their recordings.

#### Specification

See “Organs played by Marie-Claire Alain”.

### 3.2.2 The historic organ at Roskilde Cathedral, Denmark *Featured on CD Vol 2*

1554 Hermann Raphaëlis

1611 Nicolaus Maas (?) (d. 1615)

Maas was a German builder active since 1584 in Central and Northern Germany and later moved to Copenhagen. Here he was organ builder to the

royal court and mainly constructed instruments of a Renaissance character  
 (Williams & Owen 1988: 373).

1654 Gregor Mülisch

1991 Restoration by Marcussen & Son

### Specification

#### MANUALVAERK

Principal 8'

Spitzflöjt 8'

Bordun 16'

Octava 4'

Rohrflöjt 4'

Nassath 3'

Super Octava 2'

Mixtur IV-V

Trompet 8'

#### RYGPOSITIV

Principal 4'

Gedact 8'

Gedact 4'

Octava 2'

Sesquialt II

Salicional 2'

Sedecima 1'

Mixtur III

Hoboy 8'

#### BRYSTPOSITIV

Gedact 8'

Waltflöjt 2'

Gedactflöjt 4'

Octava 2'

Sedecima 1'

Regal 8'

Geigen Regal 4'

#### PEDAL

Principal 16'

Octava 8'

Gedact 8'

Octava 4'

Mixtur IV

Posaun 16'

Trompet 8'

Schalmei 4'

### Couplers

BP/MV

MV/RP

MV/PEDAL

RP/PEDAL

Cimbelstern

Birds

Tremulant

Manualvaerk

Rygpositiv

Pedal

Pitch:  $a^1 = 432$  Hz

Temperament: Unequal temperament

3.2.3 Organ of the Waalse Kerk, Amsterdam (Netherlands)  
*Featured on CD Vol 1*

1680 Nicolaas Langlez

1734 Christian Müller

1965 Restoration by Ahrend and Brunzema

1993 Restoration by Henk van Eeken

3.2.4 Organ in the National Church, Torguust  
*Featured on CD Vol 2*

1741 Joachim Wagner (1691(?) - 1749)

15499308  
15E225049

Specification
HOOFDWERK

Prestant 16'  
 Prestant 8'  
 Roerfluit 8'  
 Quintadeen 8'  
 Octaaf 4'  
 Quint 3'  
 Gemshoorn 2'  
 Mixtuur IV-VI  
 Trompet 16'  
 Trompet 8'  
 Vox Humana 8'

RUGWERK

Prestant 8'  
 Holpijp 8'  
 Octaaf 4'  
 Quint 3'  
 Octaaf 2'  
 Terts  $1\frac{3}{5}$ '  
 Mixtuur II-IV  
 Scherp VI

PEDAAL

Bourdon 16'  
 Prestant 8'  
 Roerquint 6'  
 Octaaf 4'  
 Nachthoorn 2'  
 Fagot 16'  
 Trompet 8'

Manual coupler

Pedal coupler

Tremulant

Hoofdwerk

Rugwerk

Pitch: semi-tone above  $a^1=440$  Hz

Temperament: after Neidhardt

### 3.2.4 Organ in the Nidaros Cathedral, Trondheim

*Featured on CD Vol 3*

1741 Joachim Wagner (1691(?)-1749)

11589938x  
 615225069



Wagner was a German builder who emulated the work of Silbermann and was active in Prussia from c.1719 (Williams & Owen 1988: 393).

### Specification

#### HAUPTWERK

Bordun 16'  
 Principal 8'  
 Rohrflöte 8'  
 Octav 4'  
 Spitzflöte 4'  
 Quinta 3'  
 Octav 2'  
 Waldflöte 2'  
 Cornet 3fach  
 Scharff 5fach  
 Mixtur 3fach  
 Trompete 8'

#### OBERWERK

Gedackt 8'  
 Quintadena 8'  
 Principal 4'  
 Rohrflöte 4'  
 Nasat 3'  
 Octav 2'  
 Tertia 1 <sup>3</sup>/<sub>5</sub>'  
 Quinta 1 <sup>1</sup>/<sub>2</sub>'  
 Mixtur 4fach  
 Vox Humana 8'

#### PEDAL

Subbass 16'  
 Principal 8'  
 Octav 4'  
 Quinta 6'  
 Mixtur 5fach  
 Posaune 16'  
 Trompete 8'  
 Cleron 4'

Manual coupler

Tremulant

Schwebung

Zimbelstern/Sonne

Calcantglocke

Pitch: a<sup>1</sup>=453 Hz

Temperament: Werckmeister II (modified by Jürgen Ahrend)

### 3.2.5 Organ of the Bovenkerk, Kampen (Netherlands)

*Featured on CD Vol 4*

1741-43 Albertus Anthoni Hinsz (1700-1785)

Hinsz was an employee of Frans Caspar Schmitger and built a number of organs in Groningen.

Specification

HOOFDWERK

Prestant 16'  
 Bourdon 16'  
 Prestant 8'  
 Holpijp 8'  
 Octaaf 4'  
 Fluit 4'  
 Quint 3'  
 Superoctaaf 2'  
 Mixtuur III-V  
 Scherp III  
 Tertiaan II  
 Trompet 16'  
 Trompet 8'

RUGWERK

Prestant 8'  
 Holpijp 8'  
 Octaaf 4'  
 Fluit 4'  
 Gedakt quint 3'  
 Octaaf 2'  
 Fluit 2'  
 Sifflet 1'  
 Mixtuur III-IV  
 Sexquialter III  
 Fagot 16'

BOVENWERK I

Prestant 8'  
 Roerfluit 8'  
 Quintadeen 8'  
 Woudfluit 4'  
 Octaaf 4'  
 Speelfluit 3'  
 Woudfluit 2'  
 Nasard 1'  
 Scherp III  
 Vox Humana 8'

BOVENWERK II

Holpijp 8'  
 Salicionaal 8'  
 Fluit travers 8'  
 Principaal 4'  
 Spitsfluit 2'  
 Flageolet 1'  
 Carillon III  
 Trompet 8'

BORSTWERK

Gedakt 8'  
 Fluit 4'  
 Woudfluit 2'  
 Dulciaan 8'

PEDAAL

Prestant 16'  
 Subbas 16'  
 Octaaf 8'  
 Gedakt 8'  
 Roerquint 6'  
 Octaaf 4'  
 Open fluit 2'  
 Bazuin 16'  
 Trompet 8'  
 Cornet 4'

Couplers

HW/RW

HW/BWI

BWI/BWII

BW/BORSTW

HW/PEDAAL

Tremulants

Rugwerk

Borstwerk

Bovenwerk I

Bovenwerk II

CHAPTER 4

REGISTRATION

of registration is a complex task, and it is not surprising that the art of registration has been the subject of much discussion and debate. The multiple spectra of timbres of the various North German city organs, for example, are a testament to the diversity of registration. As developments took place through most parts of Europe, the art of registration became a challenge of choosing and blending different timbres. The earliest treatises on the art of registration can be traced back to the 16th century (Williams & Owen 1983: 253). The German school of organists was particularly influential in this regard, and by the 16th century, ultimately reaching its peak in the work of J. Bach (Kirkman & Ireland 1982: 7).

Registration according to Wolf (1991: 247) is the art of a skilled organist to choose and blend timbres being purchased and is thus dependent on the particular organ and the factors of performance, practice, organ thinking and composition. The art of registration is the selection of appropriate pitches and timbres available on an organ to produce desired tonal values in accordance with the style of the specific genre.

Information on the subject of registration has two basic sources (Williams & Owen 1983: 253):

- practical advice, usually supplied by organ builders and,
- instructions from composers or theoreticians.

## CHAPTER 4

### REGISTRATION

#### 4.1 Introduction

The history of registration is undoubtedly bound up with the development of styles in organ building itself. The earliest observations on the subject of registration are almost as ancient as the oldest known music for the keyboard. Developments spread from the period of the so-called *Blockwerk* in the 15<sup>th</sup> century, which consisted of only a single tonal character, to the multiple spectra of timbres of the massive North German organs of the 17<sup>th</sup> and 18<sup>th</sup> centuries. As developments took place through most parts of Europe, organists were confronted with the challenge of choosing and blending different kinds of registers. The earliest instructions in the art of registration can be traced back to the 15<sup>th</sup> century. (Williams & Owen 1988: 253.) The German school of organists was in certain respects the first to attain maturity by the 16<sup>th</sup> century, ultimately reaching its climax in the works of J.S. Bach (Clutton & Niland 1982: 7).

Registration according to Wills (1993: 247) is the art of selecting registers or stops suitable to the work being performed and is thus dependent on the player's knowledge of historical performance practice, organ building and composition. It can thus be said that registration is the selection of appropriate pitches and timbres available on an organ to give the desired tone colour in accordance with the style of the specific genre.

Information on the subject of registration has two basic categories (Williams & Owen 1988: 253):

- practical advice, usually supplied by organ builders and;
- instructions from composers or theoreticians.

Registration treatises during the Baroque era are very sparse and one wishes that some of those that are available could have been more specific on this topic. The most important reference of the German registration practice during the Baroque period can be found in the following sources by theoreticians, organ builders and composers (Davidsson 1990: 47; Kooiman, Weinberger & Busch 1995: 162):

Syntagma Musicum II de Organographia	1619	Michael Prætorius (1571-1621)
Tabulatura Nova	1624	Samuel Scheidt (1587-1654)
The Pelpin Tablature	c.1630	
The Lüneburg Tablature KN 209		
Organistenchronik		Johann Kortkamp (c.1615-1664/65)
Erweiterte und Verbesserte Orgel-Probe	1681	Andreas Werckmeister (1645-1706)
The Plauener Orgelbuch	1708/10	Johann G. Walther (1684-1748)
Registrations for the organs of Waltherhausen, Altenburg and Eisenberg	c.1722	Gottfried H. Trost (1681-1759)
Registrations for the organ of the Berliner Garnisonkirche	1726	Johann F. Walther
Harmonische Seelenlust	1733	Georg F. Kauffmann (1679-1735)
Der Vollkommene Capellmeister	1739	Johann Mattheson (1681-1764)
Registrations for the organ in Grosshartmannsdorf and Fraureuth	1741/42	Gottfried Silbermann (1683-1753)
Historisch-Kritische Beyträge zur Aufnahme de Musik	1758	Johann F. Agricola (1720-1774)
Musica mechanica organoedi	1768	Jacob Adlung (1699-1762)
Choralvariationen	1740	Daniel Magnus Gronau (d 1747)

Choralvariationen	1732	Lahm
-------------------	------	------

Most of Alain and Van Oortmerssen's choice of registers are mainly based on these sources and their principals to bring about the desired *affekt* required by each individual work (Davidsson 1990: 49). In light of this aspect Davidsson mentions that "clarity, character, structure and figuration" should be the important factors in illustrating a specific *affekt* through registration.

## 4.2 The "Bach organ"

Bach's life spanned more than a half-century in a time when the organ in Germany was increasingly being developed. He knew, played and tested a great number of organs, not only in his immediate region but as far as some of the Hanseatic cities in North Germany such as Lübeck and Hamburg. Bach himself effected the construction of organs so that generalisation could be avoided. He was thus recognised as an expert and church authorities sought his advice on the maintenance of their valuable instruments as well as by the builders themselves.

The most general style of organ building during Bach's lifetime can be traced to two main streams: that of Arp Schnitger and that of Gottfried Silbermann (the latter in Bach's later life) (Newman 1995: 238). Many scholars have considered questions about the ideal Bach organ. The controversial question is whether the organs of Gottfried Silbermann are the best instruments for Bach's organ works. Bach most definitely knew Silbermann's organs and his son Wilhelm Friedemann (1710-1784) was appointed organist at the Sophienkirche in Dresden in 1773, which contained an organ built by Silbermann (Boyd 1995: 255). It should however be kept in mind that Bach played other organs and recommended or approved the organ builders themselves who worked in a different style other than that of Silbermann. Bach also had an extensive knowledge of organ building including the styles that differed from the normal German traditions. It can therefore only be said that the Bach organ is unattainable and a utopian ideal. His

works represent a synthesis between the Central German approach, the North German monumentalism, harmonic development from the West and the South German structure, which ultimately can be realised on almost any good organ. (Owen 1997: 169; Van Oortmerssen Vol. 5 1998: 3.)

In the year 1708 when Bach became organist of the Blasiuskirche in Mühlhausen, he recommended and supervised the rebuilding of the organ in collaboration with the builder Johann Friedrich Wender (1655-1729). Wender also built the organ in Arnstadt (1701-1703) where Bach was organist from 1703-1707. (Faulkner 1997: 214.)

Specification of the organ in the Blasiuskirche, Mühlhausen.

HAUPTWERK

Quintadena 16'  
 Prinzipal 8'  
 Viola da gamba 8'  
 Oktave 4'  
 Gedackt 4'  
 Nazard 2<sup>2</sup>/<sub>3</sub>'  
 Oktave 2'  
 Sesquialtera II  
 Mixtur IV  
 Zimbel II  
 Fagott 16'

RÜCKPOSITIV

Quintadena 8'  
 Gedackt 8'  
 Prinzipal 4'  
 Salizional 4'  
 Oktave 2'  
 Spitzflöte 2'  
 Quintflöte 1<sup>1</sup>/<sub>3</sub>'  
 Sesquialtera II  
 Zimbel III

BRUSTWERK

Stillgedackt 8'  
 Flauto dolce 4'  
 Quinte 2<sup>2</sup>/<sub>3</sub>'  
 Oktave 2'  
 Terz 1<sup>3</sup>/<sub>5</sub>'

PEDAL

Untersatz 32'  
 Prinzipal 16'  
 Subbass 16'  
 Oktave 8'  
 Oktave 4'

Mixtur III	Rohrflöte 1'
Schallmey 8'	Mixtur IV
	Posaune 16'
	Trompet 8'
	Kornett 2'

Couplers

HW/BW

HW/RP

PED/HW

Tremulant

Cymbelstern

Pauke

Bach's recommendations are very similar to the "ideal stoplist" found in Adlung's *Musica mechanica organoedi* (1768). The alterations to the organ of Mühlhausen should give a general idea of what Bach was looking for in an organ. It seems that he only wanted to bring this specific organ up to the latest trends in organ building of Central Germany (Stauffer & May 1986: 6; Owen 1997: 164-165; Schouten & Stuijbergen 1980: 177):

- Bach requested a 32' Subbass or a so-called Untersatz to give the organ more "gravität" as mentioned by authors such as Adlung and builders like Silbermann and Trost;
- the existing 16' Posaunebaß was to be constructed with larger resonators also for more gravity;
- in the *Oberwerk* the Trompet 8' was to be replaced with a Fagotto 16' as mentioned by Kauffmann to be used for a typical left hand *basso continuo* line;

HAUPTWERK

OPERWERK

PEDA



- the *Hauptwerk* Gemshorn was replaced with a Viola da Gamba to be used with the 4' Salizional in the *Ruckpositiv*;
- the principal-scaled  $2^{2/3}$ ' register was changed to a flute-scaled register in the *Hauptwerk*, a general trend followed by Central German builders of the time;
- a coupler was installed between the *Oberwerk* and the *Brustpositiv*;
- for the new *Brustpositiv* Bach suggested the following:
  - i) a mild Stillgedackt 8'
  - ii) a Flauto dolce 4'
  - iii) a Schallmeyer 8'
  - iv) a Quint  $2^{2/3}$ '
  - v) an Oktave 2'
  - vi) a Tertia  $1^{3/5}$ '

The rebuilding of the Mühlhausen organ should not be viewed as the alpha and omega of Bach's registration preferences. Many of the organs on which Bach played are no longer extant, and consequently we have a very vague idea of how these instruments really sounded. Furthermore, there is no evidence whatsoever confirming that these organs conformed to Bach's tonal ideal. We are only aware of a few organs that exist in their original condition that were approved by Bach himself. One example of such an organ is that in the Schlosskirche (or the so-called Castle Church) in Altenburg built by Tobias Heinrich Gottfried Trost (1681-1759) from 1735-1739, which was examined and approved by Bach in September 1738 or 1739. (Thistlethwaite & Webber 1998: 244.) He judged the construction "durable" and the quality of the registers as "lovely and very successful" (Stauffer & May 1986: 18). Bach's pupil Johann Friedrich Agricola (1720-1774) mentioned that the imitative stops of the Altenburg organ such as the Querflöte 16' and Gamba 8' "comes as close to the attack of a bowstroke on a [stringed] bass as is possible to achieve with pipes" (Owen 1997: 159).

#### Specification of the organ in the Schlosskirche, Altenburg

HAUPTWERK

OBERWERK

PEDAL

Groß Quintadena 16'	Geigen-Principal 8'	Principalbaß 16'
Flaute travers 16'	Quintadena 8'	Violonbaß 16'
Principal 8'	Vugara 8'	Subbaß 16'
Bordun 8'	Lieblich gedackt 8'	Octavbaß 8'
Rohr-Flöte 8'	Holh-flöte 8'	Posaunenbaß 32'
Spitz-Flöte 8'	Gemshorn 4'	Posaunenbaß 16'
Viola di Gamba 8'	Flaute douce 4'	Posaunenbaß 8'
Octava 4'	Naßat 3'	Quintadenbaß 16'
Klein-Gedakt 4'	Octava 2'	Bordunbaß 8'
Quinta 3'	Wald-Flöte 2'	Flaute traversenbaß 16'
Super Octava 2'	Super Octava 1'	Octavbaß 4'
Block-Flöte 2'	Cornett V	Mixturbaß VI-VII
Sesquialtera II	Mixtur IV-V	
Mixtura VI-IX	Vox humana 8'	
Trompete 8'		

### Couplers

OW/HW

HW/Ped

### Tremulant

Hauptwerk

Oberwerk

Tremulant to Vox humana (The Tremulant is connected to Vox Humana stopknob)

Glockenspiel

The specification of the Altenburg organ is a typical Thuringian disposition with an enormous collection of 8' stops. Also worth mentioning is the fact that there are only two reeds on the manuals, i.e. the Trompete on the *Hauptwerk* and the Vox humana on the

*Oberwerk.* The Altenburg organ possesses a relatively “darker” *plenum* than its North German counterparts, which includes Mixtures containing third ranks (Thistlethwaite & Webber 1998: 245).

Bach’s expertise in organ building and design was again called upon and he was delegated, together with Gottfried Silbermann, to inspect and approve another organ in 1746. This was the organ in the Wenzelskirche in Naumburg and Bach praised it for its collaboration of North and Central German characteristics. Dänhert suggests that Bach could have had a direct influence on the design of the stoplist himself (Stauffer & May 1986: 20). A student of Silbermann named Zacharias Hilderbrandt (1688-1757) built the organ from 1743-1746 (Boyd 1983: 184; Thistlethwaite & Webber 1998: 245-246). The original spelling of the stoplist has been preserved.

Specification of the organ in the Wenzelskirche, Naumburg

HAUPTWERK

Principal 16'

Quintadehn 16'

Octav 8'

Spillflött 8'

Gedackt 8'

Octav 4'

Spillflött 4'

Quinta 3'

Weit Pfeiffe 2'

Octav 2'

Sex quintaltra II

Cornet IV

Mixtur VIII

Bombart 16'

Trompet 8

OBERWERK

Burdun 16'

Principal 8'

Hollflött 8'

Praestant 4'

Gemshorn 4'

Quinta 3'

Octav 2'

Tertia 1  $\frac{3}{5}$ '

Waldflött 2'

Quinta 1  $\frac{1}{3}$ '

Süflött 1'

Scharff V

Vox humana 8'

Unda maris 8'

RÜCKPOSITIV

Principal 8'  
 Quintaden 8'  
 Rohrflööt 8'  
 Violdigamba 8'  
 Praestant 4'  
 Rohrflööt 4'  
 Fugara 4'  
 Nassat 3'  
 Octav 2'  
 Rausch Pfeiffe II  
 Cimbel V  
 Fagott 16'

PEDAL

Principal 16'  
 Violon 16'  
 Subbaß 16'  
 Octav 8'  
 Nachthorn 2'  
 Mixtur VII  
 Posaune 32'  
 Posaune 16'  
 Trompett 8'  
 Clarin 4'

Tremulant

Rückpositiv

Cimbelstern

Windkoppel

4 Ventils

A few important characteristics of this organ are worth mentioning (Kooiman 1992: 72; Thistlethwaite & Webber 1998: 245):

- the organ has an abundance of 8' registers, most notably the Violdigamba 8' on the *Rückpositiv* and the Unda maris 8' on the *Oberwerk*;
- an interesting quality in this instrument is that Hildebrandt used the original old case which included a *Rückpositiv*. None of Hildebrandt's instruments contained such a division.
- the organ consists of powerful reeds that add considerable brilliance and force to the massive *Organo plenum*;

- the mixtures do not contain thirds.

David Yearsley (Thistlethwaite & Webber 1998: 245) states the following concerning Hildebrandt: “[His] ability to draw on influences taken from Silbermann, Hamburg and contemporary trends in Thuringian organ building parallels Bach’s own genius for synthesising.”

### 4.3 The art of registration in Bach

It is an interesting enigma that a meticulous, organised and an exacting composer such as Bach should have left the organist with a handful of registration indications. This tendency was nothing exceptional among German organ composers of the time, probably due to the fact that they were not as prescribing and dogmatic as the French composers in terms of registration. French Classical organs differed in many respects from their German counterparts most notably in their Pedal division, and the music written for it (Newman 1995: 238). The French organs were all standardized in the Baroque period and consequently composers devised and developed a specific system of registration for their organs. This system was used throughout France at the time. The German organ on the other hand, varied in size, timbre and other diversities depending on the specific region’s preferences and tastes. This diverse character of the German organ therefore prevented the composers from creating and developing a registration system as codified and exact as that of their French counterparts. (Douglass 1995: 3; Stauffer & May 1986: 193-194.)

Bach however, had a few basic preferences (Lamprecht 1995: 37):

- organs consisting of three manuals that could be coupled;
- an independent pedal division;
- bright principal choruses;
- a palette of diverse mutation registers ( $2^{2/3}$ ;  $1^{3/5}$ ;  $1^{1/3}$ ; Sesquialtera);
- a good and equal distribution of reeds over all manuals and pedal;

- additional colour variation in the form of a Quintadena, Gemshorn, Salicional and Viola da Gamba;
- the inclusion of two compound mutation registers to the principal chorus and;
- the importance of flue foundation registers.

Bach's registration indications are very limited and he is not always clear as to the type of register(s) to be used. Altogether there are approximately 20 registration guidelines in Bach's organ works. It should be noted that some of these indications are not all originally by Bach himself (Faulkner 1997: 226):

- the designation *Organo pleno* at the beginning of some preludes and fugues and some chorale-based works;
- the instruction '*à 2 claviers et pédale*' in some chorale-based works and the six trio sonatas;
- a registration indication for "Gottes Sohn ist kommen" (BWV 600) from the *Orgelbüchlein*: viz. manual Principal 8', pedal Trompete 8' (according to Alfred Dürr this practice is influenced by the style of Samuel Scheidt (1587-1654) (Badura-Skoda 1993: 136).
- registration indications in Bach's transcription of Vivaldi's *Concerto Grosso in D minor* (BWV 596);
- registration and manual designations for *Ein feste Burg ist unser Gott* (BWV 720), in the hand of Johann Gottfried Walther;
- indications of pitch levels but not specific registers for the six so-called Schübler chorales (BWV 645-650) and;
- manual change indications using terms such as *forte* and *piano* as well as *Oberwerk* and *Rückpositiv*.

#### 4.4 Contemporary registration practices

The sources of Bach's contemporary registration practices can basically be divided into three main categories (Faulkner 1997: 224-226):

Category 1: writings on general principles of registration not applying to any specific type of work. Examples are those from Mattheson's *Vollkommene Capellmeister*, Adlung's *Musica mechanica organoedi* and Agricola's essay on registration.

Category 2: detailed and specific combination of registers or remarks on the use of specific registers. Examples are the registration instructions of Silbermann for Grosshartmannsdorf and Fraureuth, and Johann Friedrich Walther's instructions for the organ of the Berliner Garnisonkirche.

Category 3: specific registration indications or instructions applied to specific works of organ music. This category provides the most detailed and accurate information. An example is the registrations supplied by Kauffmann in his *Harmonische Seelenlust*.

#### 4.4.1 *Plenum* registrations

According to Harald Vogel (Stauffer & May: 1986: 32) the *plenum* as we know it today, with its doublings of ranks emphasising the octave and the fifth, was an inheritance from the so-called Gothic *Blockwerk*. *Plenum* registrations (or "full organ") were mainly used for all the free compositions such as preludes, toccatas, fugues, fantasias and other non-chorale-based works. The ongoing endeavour to strengthen the *plenum* was also a result of the fact that the organ was in its embryo stages to be used as an accompanying instrument for congregational singing. As a direct result of the organ's new function as an accompanying instrument, the *plenum* became the tonal center in the late 17<sup>th</sup> century and the 18<sup>th</sup> century. During the 17<sup>th</sup> century reed stops were gradually being used and added specifically to the North German *plenum*, first to the Pedal and later to the manuals.

We know that Bach used the *plenum* – which is unique to the organ among all musical instruments – to an unprecedented degree. He was without any doubt the first Central German composer to succeed in combining the concept of strict polyphony and

counterpoint with the true tonal identity of the organ, the *plenum*. Bach did not record his view of the construction of the *plenum*, but fortunately some of his contemporaries did. These writings confirm that the *plenum* did not call for a random use of the *tutti* [in the sense of the Romantic symphonic organ of Aristide Cavallé-Coll (1811-1899) for example] but rather a carefully chosen group of both manual and pedal registers. (Stauffer 1986: 31-34 & 195-199.)

The most important authors on the subject of *plenum* registration are Johann Mattheson, Jacob Adlung and Johann Friedrich Agricola. Their overall and general composition of the *plenum* is basically identical in certain aspects, except for a few differences.

Mattheson's composition of the *plenum* is as follows (Owen 1997: 145):

*To the plenum belong the Principals, Sorduns, Salicionals (WeidenPfeiffen), Rauschpfeifes, Octaves, Quints, Mixtures, Scharfs, Quintadenas, Zimbels, Nasats, Terzians, Sesquialteras, Superoctave, and the Posaunes in the Pedal – not in the manual, for the Posaunes are the reed pipes, excluded from the manual plenum.*

Adlung gives a fuller description (Stauffer & May 1986: 199):

*Anyone who would like to know what to draw in the manual for the plenum need only remember this: One must have registers, which brighten. To this end the Principal serves together with all the Octaves and the Quints and Terzes and best of all the mixed voices such as the Terzian, the Sesquialtera, the Mixtures, the Scharfs, the Cymbels, and so forth. If one does not wish such a strong combination, then one should leave something out - whatever one wishes. But if one desires an even brighter plenum then one should pull the appropriate stops on another manual and couple it into the main keyboard. One must also have stops, however, which add gravity. For this purpose, the Gedackts act as well as*



*the Quintaton 16', or even better, the Gedackt 16' or Rohrflute 16' or a Bourdon of similar size (according to what is available), the Gedackt 8', Rohrflute 8', Gemshorn 8', and so forth.*

*What has been said about the manual plenum is also true for the Pedal plenum, for it must be very strong in order to be heard above the manual. One usually depends more on gravity in the Pedal, although sometimes one brightens it as well. In order to obtain gravity one should use the Contrabass 32', Subbass 16', Gedackt 8', Principal 32' and 16', Violon 16', and the Octave 8'. All these stops may be drawn together when the organ has enough wind (and especially when the Pedal division has its own bellows). Sometimes one employs bright voices in the Pedal, such as the Octave 4' and 2' and perhaps Mixtures, too. If the organ does not have such stops, then one can bring manual registers into the Pedal through the use of the coupler. If several bright ranks are already found in the Pedal, then one does not need to use the coupler at all. The Posaune 32' and 16' along with the Trumpet and other reeds can be included in the plenum. Often the Posaune 16' is sufficient, however, especially in rapid passages where 16' stops work better than 32' stops.*

Mattheson and Adlung's principals can thus be summarised and reduced to the following (Stauffer & May 1986: 200; Kooiman, Weinberger & Busch 1995: 146-148):

### Manuals

- The Principal chorus of all pitches and Mixtures are used, including stops that add gravity (16') or brightness to the ensemble.
- Reed stops are excluded from the manual *plenum*.
- The *plenum* is mostly concentrated on the sound of one manual (usually the *Hauptwerk*) while secondary manuals are coupled to add power or brilliance to the main division.

## Pedal

- The Principal chorus and Mixtures of all pitches are to be drawn plus stops that add gravity to the *plenum*. Thirty-two-foot registers are to be included if the music is not to fast.
- Reed stops are to be drawn in the Pedal division.
- The manual divisions need not to be coupled to the Pedal unless the latter lacks sufficient power to support the manuals.

Agricola's construction of the *plenum* does not differ considerably from that of Mattheson and Adlung, yet he differs on two accounts. Firstly he suggests that the manual reeds be added to the *plenum* (Faulkner 1997: 227):

*When one wishes to play quite loudly, one draws the full organ, to which all of the principal stops described above belong. To these one may add the Trompets 16', 8' and 4', if they are in good tune. It is indeed also possible to couple to it a second manual, on which the full organ is likewise drawn.*

Secondly, he makes it clear that he considers any flue stops other than the principals as flutes. Thus when he writes, "The flutes are not drawn with the full organ" he means both flute and string registers are to be omitted. He therefore follows the advice of authors such as Michael Praetorius (1571-1621) (*Syntagma musicum*) and Andreas Werckmeister (1645-1706) (*Erweiterte und Verbesserte Orgel-Probe*) (Faulkner 1997: 228; Kooiman, Weinberger & Busch 1995: 150).

Silbermann's *plenum* for the Grosshartmannsdorf organ (1741) is also of considerable interest. The contact between organ builder and organist has always been very close during this epoch. It is also a fact that many an organ builder was also an organist (Douglass 1995: 1). Notably the Grosshartmannsdorf organ's *plenum* is based on a Principal 8' in the *Hauptwerk* and a Gedackt 8' in the *Oberwerk*. His *plenum* recipes could not involve 16' manual stops because the organ had none. These registrations

(together with that for the organ of Fraureuth) were probably used to assist the new organists of the two churches. Silbermann's "pure" *plenum* (as he personally named it) for Grosshartmannsdorf is as follows (Owen 1997: 170):

<u>HW</u>	<u>OW</u>	<u>PED</u>
Principal 8'	Gedackt 8'	Subbaß 16'
Rohrflöte 8'	Rohrflöte 4'	(probably with coupler)
Octave 4'	Octave 2'	
Quinta 2 <sup>2</sup> / <sub>3</sub> '	Quinta 1 <sup>1</sup> / <sub>3</sub> '	
Octave 2'	Cymbel II	
Mixtur IV	Sifflöte 1'	

From the above-mentioned information it is clear that eighteenth-century material on registration present a rather detailed picture on the composition of the *Organo plenum*. It can therefore be reduced to the fact that most of Bach's German contemporaries do agree on these general principles.

The differences of the *plenum* as described by the aforementioned authors, can be compared according to the standardised tendencies of the different regions, schools and perceptions. Both Mattheson and Adlung include the flutes, strings and compound mutation stops on the manuals in combination with the compulsory Principals and Mixtures. This blending ability was significantly strengthened by the pure-thirds, or "Prætorian" temperaments in common use during the 17<sup>th</sup> century. Silbermann also uses the flutes in his manual *plenum*, but also applies flute-scaled mutations e.g. cornets. In total contrast to this, Agricola follows the examples of Michael Prætorius (author of *Syntagma musicum*) and Andreas Werckmeister, whereby only the principal-scaled registers are employed and the omitting of flutes and strings. (Faulkner 1997: 228.) In terms of this aspect Agricola states the following exception (Faulkner 1997: 227):

*The flutes are not drawn with the full organ. There is an exception to this: if the Principal is only an 8', then a 16' Gedackt, Bordun, Quintadena or Rohrflöte can and must be drawn with it. A 16' Bordun also greatly augments the gravity of a 16' Principal. A similar [precept] should be observed if the Principal is only a 4': in that case, it is necessary to draw an eight-foot flute with it, as a foundation stop.*

#### 4.4.2 Non-plenum registrations

This category includes all the remaining diverse variation possibilities other than the *Organo plenum*. Mattheson describes this division as “*alle übrige vielfältige Veränderungen, die sich mit verschiedenen Clavieren besonders, und mit schwagen, jedoch ausgesuchten Stimmen machen lassen.*” [All the remaining (register) variations best realised through the use of different manuals and with softer but nevertheless carefully selected stops]. (Kooiman 1992: 33.) This category mostly includes a boundless variety of flute, string and reed combinations. Registrations such as this were either used as solos on two or more manuals or as a type of consort registration. Consort registration is a concept defined by Harald Vogel, which is primarily a combination between reed and flue stops. Vogel also mentions that it is possible to register a homogeneous consort corresponding to a complete family of instruments, or it can be made up of a mixed consort using different families of instruments, ranging from bass to soprano. (Stauffer & May 1986: 32.)

Very particular re the non-*plenum* registrations is the fact that it was employed in genres such as *bicinia*, trios, chorale partitas, duets, canons and works with a *coloratura cantus firmus* (Stauffer & May 1986: 200).

Some of Bach's contemporaries wrote specific registration combinations in their manuscripts or prints of their chorale preludes. An interestingly detailed and important example is that of Georg Friedrich Kauffmann (1679-1735) in his *Harmonische Seelenlust*

(Leipzig, 1733-1739). This work consists of 63 chorale preludes of which many have detailed registration directions. The most obvious quality of these works is the employing of a 16' stop used in the left hand. Registers that are usually used in such an instance are the Principal, Quintadena, Bordun, or (most important) a Fagott. Such an applying of the 16' (and notably the Fagott) corresponds with Bach's description of these registers' function. The use of the 16' in the left hand as *basso continuo* was also influenced by the cantata setting practice of the day. (Owen 1997: 160; Stauffer & May 1986: 201.)

### Trio registrations

The trio as an instrumental idiom for the organ does not appear much in the organ literature before the time of Bach although there are a wealth of rather simple trios, mostly written for manuals only. Some of Bach's movements in his trio sonatas are in fact transcriptions from his own instrumental works. An example is a movement from the fourth Trio Sonata (BWV 528) that was originally composed for oboe d'amore, gamba, and *basso continuo*. (Owen 1997: 164.) Owen also suggests the use of stops that imitate these timbres and which therefore give an atmosphere of authenticity. Mattheson supplies an interesting and well-known registration combination for trios on two manuals and pedal (Kooiman 1992: 67-68):

RH: Prestant 8'

LH: Octaaf 4' (played an octave lower)

PED: Prestant or Subbaß 16' + Octaaf 8'

RH & LH: Prestant 8' + 4'

PED: Prestant 16' + 8'

or

RH & LH: Flutes 8' + 4'

PED: Subbaß 16' + Gedackt 8'

Kauffmann's trio registration somewhat corresponds with the tradition and conservatism of the first above-mentioned combination. He suggests the use of this registration for a chorale prelude in the style of a trio (Faulkner 1997: 231):

*Jesus Christus unser Heiland:*

Manual: Principal 8'

Rückpositiv: Principal 4' (played an octave lower)

Pedal: Subbaß 16' + Oktaven Baß 8'

Kauffmann also left the performer with a few less conservative and orthodox trio combinations (Faulkner 1997: 231):

*Ach Gott, vom Himmel sieh darein:*

Haupt-Manual: Gemshorn 8'

Oberwerck: Vox humana 8' + Spiell Pfeiffe 4'

Pedal: Sub-Bass 16' + Gemshorn 8'

*Wie schön leuchtet der Morgenstern:*

Haupt-Manual: Principal 8'

Oberwerck: Vox humana 8' + Principal 4'

Pedal: Sub-Bass 16' + Oktaven Bass 8'

Silbermann (who received his training in France and Alsace) supplied an instruction for a trio registration added to the list of other registrations for the Fraureuth organ, employing the typical French combination of the so-called *Jeu de tierce en dialogue* (called *Tertien-Zug zweystimmig*) (Williams & Owen 1988: 133-134):

RH: Prinzipal 8'

Rohrflöte 8'

Oktave 4'

Quinte  $2 \frac{2}{3}$ '

Prinzipal 2'

Tierce  $1 \frac{3}{5}$ '

LH: Gedackt 8'

Rohrflöte 4'

Nasard  $2 \frac{2}{3}$ '

Oktave 2'

Quinte  $1 \frac{1}{3}$ '

Sifflöte 1'

PED: Sub-Bass 16'

Posaune 16'

It is interesting to note Silbermann's unusual addition of the Posaune 16' in this trio combination.

#### 4.4.3 The *Äqualstimmenverbot*

The *Äqualstimmenverbot* is basically a rule in registration practice whereby the combination of any two or more registers of different scaling of the same pitch is forbidden. In early times when organs were not sufficiently bellowed, the air supply was not enough for all the organ's registers to be used simultaneously. If all the stops were to be used at the same time, there would usually be a sudden drop in wind pressure that would make the overall sound and timbre of the organ unstable. Andreas Werckmeister in his *Orgel-Probe* (1681) discusses in detail this wind deficiency, which precluded the use of more than a few stops of the same pitch simultaneously. Consequently this unstable wind supply to the pipes literally forced organists to employ registers more

economically. It therefore became a rule: the less registers that were used, the better the sound effect. (Kooiman, Weinberger & Busch 1995: 142-145; Stauffer & May 1986: 45 & 50.)

The combination of two or more 8' registers on the manuals seems to have been a specifically sensitive and, to an extent, a forbidden practice during the Early Baroque and beginning of the High Baroque. Both Werckmeister and Mattheson advised that “thin” (principals) and “fat” (flutes) stops should not be mixed, specifically in the manual *plenum*. This was perhaps a citing of a concern for tuning and wind stability of the time. Mattheson in his *Der Volkommene Capellmeister* also states clearly that only one register of each pitch length should be used in any given combination. (Owen 1997: 144-145.)

In later theoretical writings of Werckmeister, Niedt, Adlung and even Friedrich Wilhelm Marpurg (1718-1795), there evolved a more relaxed attitude towards the rigid and strict rules concerning the *Äqualstimmenverbot*. Adlung mentioned that a “good” wind system would not affect the air supply when two or more 8' registers were combined (Williams & Owen 1988: 259). Mattheson surprisingly enough also states later (in his *Der Volkommene Capellmeister*) that both narrow and wide-scaled stops are to be included in the *Organo plenum* (Owen 1997: 145). The “gravity” that is so often mentioned by many authors of the Baroque era was thus partially achieved by the addition and combination of low-pitched stops. This change in ideas of the above-mentioned authors is perhaps not surprising due to fact that that there was a gradual improvement in the development of wind stability in organs.

Lynn Edwards (Faulkner 1997: 212) mentions that many organs in Bach's area, especially the instruments of Georg Christoph Sterzing, were very rich in eight-foot stops. She goes on to say that even modestly sized instruments had three to four stops on each manual division. These registers were undoubtedly used in combination with each other in some instances. An interesting example outside Northwest and Central Germany is the rebuilding of the organ in the St. Laurenskerk, Alkmaar in the Netherlands. In 1685 Johannes Duytschot (an organ builder from Amsterdam) built six new bellows



instead of upgrading the existing ones, which were in an excellent condition (Jongepier 1987: 83). It therefore became a necessity to provide organs with the proper amount of wind in the 18<sup>th</sup> century.

Worth mentioning is that Adlung made a special point of writing in his *Musica mechanica organoedi* about the organ in the Bergkirche in Langensalza saying that it had four new large bellows “like those in the castle church of in Weissenfels.” This organ was built by Tobias Gottfried Trost from 1697 to 1701. (Faulkner 1997: 213.) It is obvious that the brand new wind supply system made an enormous impression on Adlung.

Bach’s pupil, Agricola made this following observation concerning the abolishment of the *Äqualstimmenverbot* (Faulkner 1997: 228):

*Our ancestors believed that two voices of different scale at the same pitch level would of necessity sound bad if they were drawn together. But if such stops are well constructed and purely voiced, then one can refute our ancestors any day merely by drawing and using them together. I have heard a Lieblich Gedackt, Vugara, Quintadene and Hohlflöte played together on a certain organ, all at 8' and without any other stop, which produced a beautiful and strange effect.*

Registrations used by the performers

Adlg

St Bonaventura, Hildesheim

CTC Vol. 32

Miller 1738

## CHAPTER 5

# ANALYSIS AND COMPARISON OF REGISTRATIONS USED BY PERFORMERS

### FREE ORGAN WORKS

#### 5.1 Toccata in D minor BWV565

This is an early work, probably written in Weimar or even in Arnstadt before 1706. Bach had just returned from Lübeck to hear the famous organist, Dietrich Buxtehude (c.1637-1707). The work has unfortunately not been preserved in Bach's own hand explaining the different titles under which it is known, e.g. 'Toccata' or 'Toccata con Fuga pedaliter'. It is the only genre of Bach's organ music in this style and comparable works cannot be found during this period. (Alain Vol. 12 1993: 21; Van Oortmerssen Vol. 4 1997: 6.) According to Krummacher (Stauffer & May 1986: 167) the work consists of a tripartite form in the style of a typical North German toccata: a virtuosic introduction, a fugue based on a simple subject and a free Recitativo. Lamprecht (1978: 55-56) writes that the overall character of the work is based on seriousness, as noted in the key, which is associated with greatness and dedication.

#### Registrations used by the performers

Alain

St Bavokerk, Haarlem

CD: Vol. 12

Müller 1738

HW

Praestant 16'  
Octaaf 8'  
Roerfluit 8'  
Octaaf 4'  
Quint Praestant 3'  
Mixtuur IV-VI  
Scherp VI-VII  
Trompet 16'  
Trompet 8'  
Trompet 4'

RP

Praestant 8'  
Octaaf 4'  
Super Octaaf 2'  
Mixtuur VI-VIII

BW

Quintadeen 16'  
Praestant 8'  
Octaaf 4'  
Mixtuur IV-VI  
Cymbel III

PEDAL

Praestant 16'  
Octaaf 8'  
Octaaf 4'  
Mixtuur VI-X  
Bazuin 32'  
Trompet 16'  
Trompet 8'  
Trompet 4'

Couplers

BW/HW  
RP/HW  
RP/Pedal

Fugue

HW

Praestant 8'

RP

Praestant 8'

PEDAL

Praestant 16'

Octaaf 8'	Octaaf 4'	Octaaf 8'
Roerfluit 8'	Super Octaaf 2'	Octaaf 4'
Octaaf 4'	Mixtuur VI-VIII	Mixtuur VI-X
Quint Praestant 3'		Trompet 16'
Scherp VI-VII		

Couplers

RP/HW

RP/Pedal

**Measure 127:** same registration as Toccata

Van Oortmerssen

Bovenkerk, Kampen

CD: Vol. 4

Hinsz 1743

<u>HW</u>	<u>RW</u>	<u>PEDAL</u>
Prestant 16'	Prestant 8'	Prestant 16'
Prestant 8'	Octaaf 4'	Subbas 16'
Holpijp 8'	Octaaf 2'	Octaaf 8'
Octaaf 4'	Mixtuur III-IV	Gedakt 8'
Quint 3'		Roerquint 6'
Superoctaaf 2'		Octaaf 4'
Mixtuur III-V		Open fluit 2'
Scherp III		Bazuin 16'
Tertiaan II		Trompet 8'
Trompet 8'		Cornet 4'

Couplers

HW/RW

HW/Pedal

**Bar 30**

<u>HW</u>	<u>BWI (Echoes)</u>	<u>PED</u>
Prestant 16'	Prestant 8'	Prestant 16'
Prestant 8'	Octaaf 4'	Subbas 16'
Holpijp 8'	Scherp III	Octaaf 8'
Octaaf 4'		Gedakt 8'
Quint 3'		Roerquint 6'
Superoctaaf 2'		Octaaf 4'
Mixtuur III-V		Open fluit 2'
Scherp III		Trompet 8'

**Bar 127**

<u>HW</u>	<u>RW</u>	<u>PED</u>
Prestant 16'	Prestant 8'	Prestant 16'
Prestant 8'	Octaaf 4'	Subbas 16'
Holpijp 8'	Octaaf 2'	Octaaf 8'
Octaaf 4'	Mixtuur III-IV	Gedakt 8'
Quint 3'		Roerquint 6'
Superoctaaf 2'		Octaaf 4'
Mixtuur III-V		Open Fluit 2'
Scherp III		Bazuin 16'
Tertiaan II		Trompet 8'
Trompet 8'		

**Couplers**

**HW/RW**

**HW/Pedal**

Both Alain and Van Oortmerssen employ a non-typical German “reed *plenum*” as described by Agricola whereby full-scaled reeds are added to the normal *Organo pleno* (Owen 1997: 167). Alain uses all available reeds on the HW and therefore conforms with Agricola’s guideline (Faulkner 1997: 227): “To this [the full organ] one may add the Trompets 16', 8', and 4', if they are in good tune.” Van Oortmerssen only uses the Trompet 8' on the HW of the Hinsz organ, although he has a 16' reed at his disposal. According to Faulkner (1997: 229) Agricola was the first author of registration sources to suggest the inclusion of the manual reeds to the *plenum* and also mentions that Bach was “a great friend of the reeds”. This practice is totally in contrast to the instructions of both Mattheson and Adlung (Stauffer & May 1986: 199). The difference between the normal Baroque “mixture *plenum*” and the “reed *plenum*” as documented by Agricola (used by the performers), are much like the difference between the *Plein Jeu* and the *Grand Jeu* of the French Classical School of the same period (Owen 1997: 145). Harald Vogel states the following in terms of the reed *plenum* (Owen 1997: 143):

*Because of the great blending quality of the North German reeds, they can be registered not only singly but also in combination with principals or flutes or in the plenum. This arrangement applies equally to the reeds with full-length resonators (Trompet, Posaune, Schalmey, Cornet) and to those with half-length [resonators] (Regal, Krummhorn, Dulcian, Vox Humana). In a reed plenum (based on a low-pitched reed stop such as the Trompet 16' or 8' or the Dulcian 16', with the principal chorus including the mixture), each individual voice in the polyphony retains its identity much more than in a pure principal plenum.*

The two *plena* on the HW that are used in BWV 565 also consist of the addition of the two normal compound registers added to the principal chorus. These registers are found on almost every German organ of the time, namely the Mixtur (III-X ranks) and a smaller compound register, e.g. Cimbel, Scharff, Scherp, etc. usually II-III ranks.

In each instance the *Rugpositief/Rugwerk* serves as a secondary manual coupled to the main manual, i.e. to the *Hoofdwerk* to add brilliance to the plenum. In this case Agricola suggests (Faulkner 1997: 227): “It is indeed possible to couple to it [the full organ] a second manual on which the full organ is likewise drawn.” Both performers’ registration on the secondary manual consists of the normal smaller version of the main *Hoofdwerk plenum* usually based on an 8', i.e. Prestant 8', Octaaf 4', Super Octaaf 2' and Mixtuur.

Van Oortmerssen uses a Tertiaan II to compliment the powerful 8' Trompet of the Hinsz organ. According to Johann Friedrich Walther in his guidelines for registration for the organ in the Garnisonkirche (1726), the thirds “gives the plenum a beautiful strength” (Faulkner 1997: 230). Alain on the other hand omits the Tertiaan II on the *Hoofdwerk*. She could probably be adhering to Gottfried Silbermann’s guidelines intended for the organs of Grosshartmannsdorf and Fraureuth (1741/1742), which is the only known registration sources that excludes third-sounding ranks from the *plenum*. This practice is perhaps the result of the training that Silbermann received in France and Alsace, when wide-scaled cornets and narrow-scaled principals were not used together (Faulkner 1997: 230; Owen 1997: 170-171). Mixtures containing third-ranks were built by Central German craftsmen such as Sterzing, Finke, Trost and Thielemann, a characteristic of the organs in the Thuringian area. Bach tested and approved many of the instruments created by these organ builders. It can therefore be deduced that some of the organs Bach played made the omitting of thirds in the *Organo pleno* impossible. It is also known that Werckmeister considered the third as an essential part of the *Organo pleno* (Faulkner 1997: 230).

In the Pedal division both performers employ a full *plenum* for the first and last Toccata section. This resembles the teaching of both Mattheson and Adlung (Stauffer & May 1986: 200):

- the principal chorus of all pitches and Mixtures are used;
- reed stops of all pitches (including 32' stops) are used.

It is interesting that Alain couples the RP to the Pedal. This was probably not necessary seeing that the Müller organ has a totally independent Pedal division with sufficient brilliance in the Mixtuur VI-X. In Van Oortmerssen's case the HW had to be coupled to the Pedal because of the absence of a compound register on the Pedal of the Hinsz organ. In the fugal section he however creates a totally independent Pedal against the full HW *plenum*, which balances perfectly. The coupling of manual to Pedal is supported by Adlung's instructions saying (Stauffer & May 1986: 199):

*Sometimes one employs voices in the Pedal, such as the Octave 4' and 2' and perhaps Mixtures, too. If the organ does not have such stops, then one can bring manual registers into the Pedal through the use of the coupler.*

Most of the larger organs in Holland had a Pedal division of significant size, and was a "perculiary Lutheran phenomenon" with the increased importance of reeds from 32' to 2' to clarify the psalm melody. (Owen 1997: 142.)

The performers also ignore the *Äqualstimmenverbot* whereby two or more registers of the same pitch are not used together due the lack of wind supply in early historical organs (Schouten & Stuijbergen 1980: 106). On the HW Alain and Van Oortmerssen use the Roerfluit 8'/Octaaf 8' combination and the Holpijp 8'/Prestant 8' combination, respectively.

In the fugal section of BWV565 both performers employ a smaller *plenum* in relation to the Toccata section. This tendency is quite normal according to the writings of Friedrich Wilhelm Marpurg, indicating that a change in *plena* could be employed using the same manual (Stuijbergen & Schouten 1980: 180-181). In the Pedal division Van Oortmerssen could probably have used the Bazuin 16' instead of the Trompet 8' or even combined the two stops, seeing that the Bazuin of the Hinsz organ has both gravity and transparency.



In the last section of BWV565 both organists returned to their original *plena* used in the Toccata section.

Manual changing in Bach's organ works is a controversial subject. Bach is sometimes very ambiguous in this aspect. For this reason it is interesting that Van Oortmerssen plays the whole work on the HW and only changes manuals in the fugal section to highlight the echo effects. This is done by the alternation between the two *plena* of the HW and the BWI. In the BWI section the normal Octaaf 2' is not used because of the absence thereof on this manual. He thus uses only Prestant 8', Octaaf 4' and Scherp III. This type of registration was normal for this type of organ in the 18<sup>th</sup> century and even Mattheson encourages this in his *Der Volkommene Cappellmeister* (1739) to be used in the *Organum plenum* (Stuifbergen & Schouten 1980: 142; Owen 1997: 146). The balance between the *plena* of Van Oortmerssen seems to compliment each other in the vast, acoustic-rich Bovenkerk and the effect is astounding. Alain alternates between HW, RW and BW and probably could have done the same as Van Oortmerssen by employing the *Bovenwerk* of the Müller organ, using the following as an echo: Praesant 8', Octaaf 4', Mixtuur IV-VI/Cymbel III.

## 5.2 Prelude and Fugue in B minor BWV 544

This work is one of the six Preludes and Fugues that have come down to us in Bach's autograph manuscript. It dates from the early years in Leipzig (1725-1730) when Bach was Kantor at the Thomaskirche. According to the *Affektenlehre* the key of B minor is a key of suffering and sorrow and is distinctly evident in both the Prelude and the Fugue. The Prelude takes on the form of a typical Italian concerto containing a *ritornello*. The Prelude is one of the most spacious and well articulated of all Bach's *ritornello* compositions. (Alain Vol.1 1985: 18; Van Oortmerssen Vol. 2 1994: 30.) Bach's original autograph requires a *plenum* registration and no change of manuals (Stauffer & May 1986: 205). The work is full of lyricism and probably reflects the unhappy period of Bach's life at the time. According to Herman Keller the chromatic sequences of the

Prelude indicates the relation to that of the Mass in B minor (BWV 232) and the melismatic character of the St. Matthew's Passion (BWV 245) (Lamprecht 1978: 67-68).

### Registrations used by the performers

Alain                      Martinikerk, Groningen                      CD: Vol. 1  
    Schnitger 1740

#### Prelude

<u>HW</u>	<u>RP</u>	<u>PED</u>
Octaaf 8'	Praestant 8'	Praestant 16'
Octaaf 4'	Octaaf 4'	Praestant 8'
Octaaf 2'	Octaaf 2'	Octaaf 4'
Mixtuur IV-VI	Mixtuur IV-VI	Octaaf 2'
Scherp IV		Mixtuur IV
		Bazuin 16'
		Trompet 8'

#### Couplers

RP/HW

#### Fugue

<u>HW</u>	<u>RP</u>	<u>PED</u>
Praestant 16'	Praestant 8'	Praestant 32'
Praestant 8'	Octaaf 4'	Praestant 16'
Octaaf 4'	Octaaf 2'	Octaaf 8'
Octaaf 2'	Mixtuur IV	Rohrquin't 6
Mixtuur IV-IV	Cimbel III	Octaaf 4'
Scherp IV		Octaaf 2'
		Mixtuur IV
		Bazuin 16'

Trompet 8'

Couplers

RP/HW

**Van Oortmerssen**

Waalse Kerk, Amsterdam

CD: Vol.1

Müller 1734

Prelude & Fugue

HW

RW

PED

Prestant 16'

Prestant 8'

Bourdon 16'

Prestant 8'

Octaaf 4'

Prestant 8'

Octaaf 4'

Mixtuur II-IV

Octaaf 4'

Mixtuur IV-VI

Nachthoorn 4'

Fagot 16'

Trompet 8'

Couplers

Mancoupler

Pedalcoupler

The subtitle of the work indicates '*pro Organo pleno*', one of the few registration guidelines that Bach left to the performer as to the type of sound and atmosphere that he had intended for the specific work. Many composers and theorists of the time include the phrase '*pro Organo pleno*' or similar expressions that basically confirms the employing of a *plenum* sound. This type of registration indication regularly appears in the works of composers such as Dietrich Buxtehude (c.1637-1707), Johann Ludwig Krebs (1713-1780), Johann Christian Kittel (1732-1809) and other contemporaries of Bach (Stauffer

& May 1986: 195). Both Alain and Van Oortmerssen's registrations are based on the *Organo pleno* concept, but subtle yet distinct differences exist between the two combinations.

An interesting feature in the Prelude of BWV 544 is Alain's registration that is based on an 8' mixture *plenum* in the coupled manuals (*Hauptwerk* and *Rückpositiv*). Alain personally mentions the following concerning this specific type of *plenum* (Stauffer & May 1986: 51): "In the Baroque period, the *plenum* generally consisted of only a single stop at each pitch [the *Äqualstimmenverbot*]: 8', 4', 2', Mixture, Cymbel." This registration guideline is exactly copied and implemented by Alain on the *Hauptwerk* of the Schnitger organ. Alain's *plenum* is also similar to the *plenum* combination given by Daniel Magnus Gronau (d. 1747), a composer and organist from Danzig in the then East Prussia. He named his *plenum* combinations "forte" registrations. Gronau states clearly that this type of registration should be "without 16' stops" in the manuals. (Owen 1997: 147.)

During the High Baroque many Central German organs contained a main manual such as *Hauptwerk* or *Oberwerk*, which only had an 8' Principal as a fundamental tone without any 16' registers. Examples are the Wender organ in the Bonifatiuskirche, Arnstadt and the Weimar Castle Chapel organ, both played by Bach (Owen 1997: 150; Stauffer & May 1986: 3). It can thus be said that Bach did construct and played *plena* that were based on an 8' in the manuals where no 16' was available. However, Alain's *plenum* for the Prelude of BWV 544 is perhaps too "thin" to portray the serious *affekt* of B minor. Most registration sources concur in their fondness for 16' pitch in the manual *plenum*. The writer's opinion is that Alain could probably have added a more fundamental depth in sound quality if the *Hauptwerk* 16' Prestant was added to the *plenum*. According to the indications for *Organo pleno* by Mattheson and Adlung, the Principal choruses of all pitches are to be added to the *plenum* to add gravity (Stauffer & May 1986: 200). This "gravity" is definitely an important component to reflect the appropriate *affekt* of melancholy and melismatic character in the Prelude of BWV 544.

Van Oortmerssen's *plenum* sounds satisfactory despite the fact that it lacks the Prestant 2' (Super Octaaf) because of the absence thereof on the *Hoofdwerk* of the Müller organ. Interestingly enough he compliments this *plenum* of the *Hoofdwerk* by omitting the Octaaf 2' of the *Rugwerk*. The combined *plenum* is fundamentally well balanced because of the so-called double trebles of the Müller organ. It is noteworthy to mention that many German organs in Bach's time did lack a 2' principal-scaled register on the main manual. Examples are the Marienkirche organ in Lübeck where Buxtehude was organist, the Sterzing organ in the church of St. George, Eisenach and the organ in the Bonifatiuskirche, Arnstadt (Kooiman 1992: 30 Owen 1997: 151).

Both performers use the *Rugwerk* as a secondary coupled manual consisting of its own *petit plenum* to add brilliance and therefore adhering to the instructions of Agricola (Stauffer & May 1986: 199).

The two organists' pedal registrations are constructed according to the normal *plenum* for this division, i.e. 16', 8', 4', 2' Principal chorus and 16' and 8' reeds (Stauffer & May 1986: 200). Van Oortmerssen couples the manual to the Pedal. This is done due to the lack of a compound mutation stop in the Pedal division of the Müller organ. He does this to obtain the desired "brightness" according to Adlung's instruction (Stauffer & May 1986: 199). Alain on the other hand has a full range of registers on the Pedal division of the Schnitger organ, ranging from 16' to an independent Mixture. She therefore had no need to use the manual/Pedal coupler seeing that the Schnitger organ has a totally independent Pedal division. Adlung makes it clear (Stauffer & May 1986: 199): "If several bright ranks are already in the Pedal, then one does not need to use the coupler at all."

In the Fugue of BWV 544 both organists' registration on the manuals are based on a 16' mixture *plenum*. Van Oortmerssen retains the registration used in the Prelude, but Alain brightens the *plenum* by adding a Cimbel III in the RP and adding the 16' Praestant of the *Hauptwerk*. Alain also adds to the Pedal more "gravity" by using the Praestant 32' and the Roerquint 6' ( $5 \frac{1}{3}'$ , which is an acoustical 16') as described by Adlung (Stauffer & May 1986: 199). The tempo of the BWV 544 Fugue is not too quick for the 32' Praestant

to be added and this therefore agrees with the advice of Adlung saying that this register can be used if the pedal passages does not move too rapidly (Owen 1997: 167).

Alain's change in the *plenum* structure heard in the Fugue is most probably supported by the fact that it was a general trend up to as far as the 19<sup>th</sup> century to use a specific *plenum* for Preludes and a different *plenum* for Fugues (Kooiman 1992: 67).

### 5.3 Toccata and Fugue in D minor BWV 538

This work is also known as the "Dorian" Toccata and Fugue because of its modal character. There is widespread uncertainty about the actual composition date of this work, but Wolfgang Schmieder suggests round about the year 1727. On the other hand it resembles the style and certain similarities of the Toccata and Fugue in F major (BWV 540), which dates from about the year 1716. (Alain Vol. 12 1991: 21; Van Oortmerssen Vol. 2 1995: 9.) Lamprecht (1978: 115) states that the work was not composed in the Weimar era, but rather originates from the mature Leipzig period.

Bach was a master in transferring instrumental writing of composers such as Arcangelo Corelli (1653-1713) and Antonio Vivaldi (1678-1741) in an idiom for the organ and this style is very much evident in BWV 538. The work is written in a typical *concertato* style that incorporates the alteration between *tutti* and *solli*. It therefore includes a dialogue with typical echo effects. (Alain Vol. 12 1991: 21; Van Oortmerssen Vol. 2 1995: 9.) The Toccata has a fully worked out structure and a Fugue that is cumulative in effect that is in total contrast to the Toccata, yet brilliantly thematic in its own right. Stauffer (Stauffer & May 1986: 143) classifies this Fugue as a so-called *Allabreve* Fugue with distinctive characteristics of Palestrina's *stilo antico*. It is also one of the great organ works where Bach personally added and specified the change of manuals (Lamprecht 1978: 115).

According to Boyd (1995: 59) this is the only organ work for which there is concrete evidence that it was played at a recital given personally by Bach. He played this work at the inauguration of the rebuilt organ in the Martinskirche, Kassel in September 1732. The rebuilding of the organ was done by Johann Friedrich Sterzing and was completed after his death by Nicolaus Becker of Mühlhausen. The specification of the organ, which had been altered between 1730 and 1732, is not known. (Stauffer & May 1986: 17.)

**Registrations used by performers**

**Alain**                                      Freiberg Cathedral (Domkirche)                                      CD: Vol. 2  
Silbermann 1714

**Toccata**

<u>HW</u>	<u>BW</u>	<u>PED</u>
Principal 8	Gedackt 8	Posaunbaß 16
Octava 4	Principal 4	Octavbaß 8
Quinta 3	Octava 2	Octavbaß 4
Superoctav 2	Mixtur III	Pedalmixtur VI
Mixtur IV		
Zimbeln III		

**Fugue**

<u>HW</u>	<u>PED</u>
Principal 8	Principalbaß 16
Octava 4	Octavbaß 8
	Octavbaß 4

**Measure 101**

<u>BW</u>	<u>PED</u>
Gedackt 8	Posaun 16
Principal 4	

Octava 2

Mixtur III

**Measure 167**

HW

(as beginning +)

Superoctav 2

Mixtur IV

OW

Principal 8

Octava 4

Superoctav 2

Mixtur III

Zimbeln II

PED

(as beginning +)

Posaunbaß 16

Trompetenbaß 8

Pedalmixtur VI

Coupler

OW/HW

**Jacques van Oortmerssen**

Roskilde Cathedral

CD: Vol. 2

Mülich 1654

**Toccata**

MAN

Principal 8'

Octava 4'

Super Octava 2'

Mixtur IV-V

RYG

Gedact 8'

Principal 4'

Octava 2'

Mixtur III

PED

Principal 16'

Octava 8'

Octava 4'

Mixtur IV

Trompet 8'

**Fugue**

MAN

(as Toccata plus)

Bordun 16'

RYG

(as Toccata plus)

Sesquialt II

PED

(as Toccata plus)

Posaun 16'



Trompet 8' (minus Mixtur III)

### Coupler

RYG/MAN

### Toccat

Alain again employs an 8' mixture *plenum* in the manual corresponding with the registration used in the Prelude of BWV 544. In this instance however, the distinct difference is that the Quinte 3' is added to the manual *plenum* for a much more full timbre. The addition of this register to the main ensemble is supported by the instructions of numerous authors, most notably Johann Baptiste Samber who was an organist of Salzburg Cathedral, Austria, during the High Baroque. In his *Continuatio ad manuductionem organicam* (1707) he supplies *plenum* registrations (“Völlige Anschlag”) of which most contain a Quinte 3'. (Owen 1997: 179-180; Stuifbergen & Schouten 1980: 146.) It is undoubtedly a controversial subject to suggest that Bach sometimes or even frequently omitted the Quinte 3' in the manual *plenum*. This is evident in the fact that Bach, during the rebuilding of the Mühlhausen organ, had the Quinte 2 <sup>2</sup>/<sub>3</sub>' (3' principal-scaled stop) replaced with a Nasat 2 <sup>2</sup>/<sub>3</sub>' (flute-scaled) on the *Hauptwerk* (Kooiman 1992: 69). However it may seem that the Quinte, as advised by Mattheson, Adlung, Agricola, and others, was an indispensable part of the *plenum* in both the manual and pedal (Stauffer & May 1986: 200). Johann Friedrich Walther in his registrations for the Wagner organ in the Berliner Garnisonkirche (1726) states the following concerning the Quinte 3': “[...] sind damit unterschiedlich Veränderungen zu machen, jedoch wir selbige eigentlich zum vollen Werken gezogen.” (Kooiman, Weinberger & Busch 1995: 163). Agricola disapproved of a Quint [3'] being used without combining it with the necessary 8', 4' and 2' [Principal] stops (Owen 1997: 166).

Another interesting facet about the performers' *plena* is that the two manual divisions that are used are uncoupled. The Toccata of BWV 538 is composed and worked out in a

style that contains typical echo effects that enhances stereophonic capabilities. Thus, for the manuals to have been coupled the effect would be totally unsatisfactory and contradictory to what Bach had intended. In this case the *Brustwerk* (used by Alain) and the *Rygpositiv* (used by Van Oortmerssen) are not employed as secondary manuals to add the required brilliance or brightness, but rather in dialogue with the main manual. It could have been possible for Alain to add the Nasat 3' to the *Brustwerk* to emphasise and highlight the echo effects and to make a smaller version of the *Hauptwerk*.

Bach's indication for manual changing in the Toccata specifies the divisions *Oberwerk* and *Positiv*. The organ that Alain uses only has one of these prescribed divisions namely *Oberwerk*. Van Oortmerssen on the Roskilde organ only has a (Ryg) *Positiv* at his disposal. Why then does the effect of both performers' registrations remain within the instructions and guidelines of Bach? Owen (1997: 158) gives a detailed explanation: "Sometimes the term "*Oberwerk*" came to designate the main division, and in some two-manual organs "*Oberwerk*" is synonymous with "*Hauptwerk*". This confusion of terminology is not limited to central Germany; it occurs in the northern region as well. Generally, if the term *Oberwerk* occurs in a context that mentions other divisions (*Unterwerk*, *Brustwerk*, *Positiv*) but not anything specifically named *Hauptwerk*, it may be taken to designate the main division. If any organ has both a *Hauptwerk* and an *Oberwerk*, however, the *Oberwerk* is a subsidiary division located above the *Hauptwerk*."

Interestingly most Thuringian organs in Bach's time contained a *Positiv* that was also portrayed as a *Brustpositiv* or an *Oberwerk*, both found in one case (Stinson 1999: 72).

In both Alain and Van Oortmerssen's *plenum* of the secondary "echo" manual, we find a Gedackt 8' as foundation for the combination with the 4' and 2' Principals plus a Mixture. This is because many average sized organs of Germany and other countries such as the Netherlands had a 4' Principal as main register on a subsidiary manual. Lynn Edwards (Faulkner 1997: 213) states in her article that the only four-foot stop on Thuringian organs were usually represented by an Octave on the main manual and/or the subsidiary manual. This feature was very prominent in some of the instruments of Trost and

Sterzing. The main manual was then based on an 8' Principal and the Pedal division on a 16' Principal, depending on the size of the organ. Examples of such dispositions are the organ of the Blasiuskirche, Mühlhausen, the organ in SS. Peter & Paul, Weimar, and the organ in the Bonifatiuskirche, Arnstadt (Kooiman, Weinberger & Busch 1995: 126-128; Owen 1997: 151-125). This combination of a 4' Principal with a Flute or Gedackt 8' in a *plenum* was also used in a manuscript by Alessandro Poglietti (d. 1683), which was a didactic publication written in Austria around 1676 (Owen 1997: 86). Agricola in his *Musica mechanica organoedi* mentions the following about the four-foot Principal in the *plenum* situation (Faulkner 1997: 227): "A similar [precept] should be observed if the Principal is only a 4': in that case, it is necessary to draw an eight-foot flute with it, as a foundation stop."

The two organists' Pedal registrations for the Toccata are both very interesting. None of the Pedal divisions of the two registrations are coupled to the manuals due to an independent compound register found on both organs, i.e. the Mixture. The Pedal part in the BWV 538 Toccata is also more supportive to the echo effects and actively takes part in the dialogue between the two manual divisions. Alain interestingly does not make use of the 16' Principalbaß in combination with the 16' Posaunbaß on the Silbermann organ. A superb character of the German Baroque organ (and especially the instruments of Silbermann) is the great quality of its 16' reeds on the Pedal that can be used independently from a 16' Principal basis. The reconstruction of the Mühlhausen organ's 16' Posaune with larger resonators according to Bach's specification was perhaps his intention to add greater gravity to the Pedal division and probably to be used without the 16' Principal in the *plenum*. Edwards (Faulkner 1997: 211) states more interestingly that the three major pedal stops in Thuringia in Bach's time came to be the Posaune 16', Subbass 16' and Violone 16'. This was especially evident in the instruments of Georg Christoph Sterzing and only a small number of organs in this area and epoch contained a Principal 16'.

Van Oortmerssen's Pedal *plenum*, contradictory to Alain's combination, contains an 8' Trompet instead of a 16' reed! This exceptional variation of using an 8' reed instead of a

16' reed in the Pedal could probably be what Adlung meant by saying: "The Posaune 32' and 16' along with the Trumpet [8'] can be included in the *plenum*." (Stauffer & May 1986: 199.) Could this statement imply that an 8' Trumpet can sometimes be used without a 16' or 32' reed in the Pedal *plenum*?

### Fugue

Both performers make alterations and additions in their registrations in the Fugue of BWV 538. Van Oortmerssen's *plenum* becomes a reed *plenum* with the addition of the HW Trumpet 8' and Bourdon 16', according to the description by Agricola. This registration is almost similar to the *Grand Jeu* of the French Classical School with the addition of a Trompette 8', which distinguishes it from the normal *Plein Jeu*. (Owen 1997: 145.) As mentioned before, Agricola was the first to suggest that the Trompette stop to be used in the manual *plenum*. He also states that this stop can be used in this manner "if they are in good tune." (Faulkner 1997: 229.) Kauffmann was also a great admirer of the Trompette in an ensemble as seen in the following examples from his *Harmonische Seelenlust* (Faulkner 1997: 229):

#### *In dich hab ich gehoffet, Herr:*

Trompeta [8'] + Principal 8' + Octav 4'; or "*das volle Werk*"

#### *Komm, heiliger Geist:*

*Oberwerk:* Vox humana + Salicional 8' + Spillpfeiffe 4'

*Pedal:* Violon 16' + Trompet 8' + Nachthorn 4' + Cornet 2'

Faulkner (1997: 229) also states that the texture of these types of pieces might suggest the use of a *plenum*.

The use of the Bourdon 16' as a solid foundation in the *plenum* is normally advised by both Adlung and Agricola. Both writers actually suggest and even prefer the inclusion of

a Bourdon 16' as to a Principal 16'! Adlung states that the Bordun 16' speaks more clearly and quickly in rapid moving passages. In his *Orgel-Probe* of 1698, Werckmeister recommended that a Gedackt 16' (which more or less sounds like a Bordun) was more useful than a Principal 16' and suggests that a Bordun should be placed on the *Hauptwerk* instead of a Principal (Faulkner 1998: 212 & 229). Lynn Edwards (Faulkner 1997: 212) also mentions that in the large organs that was built by Georg Christoph Sterzing (active c.1690-1714), the two manuals had 16-foot stops, including a Bordun 16' on the *Hauptwerk*.

In the *Rygpositiv* of the Roskilde organ, Van Oortmerssen subtracts the Mixtuur III and adds a Sesquialt(era). This register blends well with the Trompet 8' and the absence of the Mixtuur III is scarcely heard. By adding the Sequialt to the *Organo pleno*, Van Oortmerssen automatically adds a third-sounding rank to the ensemble. Both Adlung and Mattheson call for the Sesquialtera in the *plenum* (Kooiman, Weinberger & Busch 1995: 147). Edwards (Faulkner 1997: 213) is of the opinion that although the Sesquialtera was mainly used as a solo stop in Thuringia in Bach's time, it was definitely an essential part of the full organ.

In the Pedal division of the Fugue, Van Oortmerssen gives "gravity" to the *plenum* by adding the Posaun 16'. Mattheson states the following concerning the addition of this stop: "...when there is proper wind, it [the 16' Posaune] sounds splendid in the pedal because of the depth of its tone." (Stauffer & May 1986: 199.)

Alain has a totally different approach to the interpretation of the Fugue of BWV 538. In the beginning of this work, an Octav 8' and 4' in the *Hauptwerk* are employed and 16', 8' and 4' Principals in the Pedal. This registration is rather exceptional for an *Allabreve* Fugue of Bach as described by Stauffer in his article (Stauffer & May 1986: 143). Alain uses a similar registration on the HW as that which is found in Adlung's *Musica mechanica organoedi* (1768) where he supplies many combination possibilities of the following registers:

Principal 8'

Ocktave 4'

Ocktave 2'

Gedackt 16'

Quintatön 8'

The very first combination that he supplies is that of Principal 8' + Ocktave 4' used by Alain in the beginning of the Fugue. (Stuifbergen & Schouten 1980: 144-145.)

As from measure 101, Alain makes use of a very controversial technique. She changes manuals (to the BW) containing an 8' mixture *plenum* in the middle of the Fugue. Christoph Wolff's (1991: 315-316) explanation of changing sonorities in Bach's Passacaglia BWV 582 could perhaps also apply to the Fugue of BWV 538:

*Considering the work [the Passacaglia] as a whole, the changing sonorities of the variation part will find a convincing conclusion only with an even level of sound for the fugue, for the formal and textural contrast will in principle require a corresponding expression in sound. The highly articulated variation part finds its complement in the expansively unified contrapuntal nature of the fugue, which does not lend itself to sectionalizing.*

Only a few years before Alain herself mentioned the following concerning the changing of manuals in an article: "We ought not to change the registration during a work unless the score explicitly indicates it." (Stauffer & May 1986: 50.)

From measure 167 Alain's registration becomes a textbook example of an *Organo pleno*, which includes a Pedal division with "gravity" and a fully *pleno* registered secondary manual for "brightness". It is the writer's opinion that this full organ sound could have been more succesful and effective if it was employed at the commencement of the Fugue.

In conclusion the writer would like to quote a statement made by the distinguished Bach scholar, Christoph Wolff (1991: 314):

*It need not to be stressed that the realisation of an organ work in performance – the registration and manual changes – must be based on its structure. [...] If directions by the composer are absent, analysis of form becomes the point of departure for an image in sound. It falls to the organist to determine and observe, on the basis of such analysis, the guiding principle of the work – to subject his interpretation to it in a fine balance of musical imagination and clear comprehension of the work's architecture. Merely to render a methodical analysis in performance or to succumb to an arbitrary of effects – to name the extremes – can never be the artistic goal of performance.*

#### **5.4 Fantasia in C minor BWV 562**

The date of this work is uncertain. Some sources suggest that it was written between 1712 and 1716. Other sources indicate that the original autograph dates from the period 1706-1712 and probably had an accompanying Fugue especially written for this work. This Fugue was later to be added to the work that is known as the Prelude in C minor BWV 546. Around 1730 Bach made alterations to the Fantasia and composed another Fugue for it, but unfortunately only the first page has survived. No other organ work of Bach better illustrates the complexity that characterises his experiments with other styles than in the Fantasia in C minor. The work also demonstrates that while a French model influenced Bach's compositional style, it only partially accounts for the work's overall structure and plan.

As mentioned before, the work is greatly influenced by the French style of composition and is the closest example that Bach comes to this style of writing in any of his organ works. In 1713 Bach had copied out the *Livre d'orgue* (1699) by Nicolas de Grigny

(1672-1703). Bach's Fantasia shows striking similarities with de Grigny's compositions in the five-part texture, expressivity, musical material, its development plan, the identical pairing and the contrapuntal use of parallel thirds and sixths. The most prominent connection between the two works however, is the thematic relation with the first Fugue from the *Gloria* in de Grigny's *Livre d'orgue*. It is strikingly similar in melody, rhythm and ornamentation. Bach probably wanted to pay homage to De Grigny whose music he knew, played and taught. (Alain Vol. 9 1991: 28; Boyd 1995: 62; Stauffer & May 1986: 266-268; Van Oortmerssen Vol. 4 1997: 8.)

### Registrations used by performers

#### Alain

Grote St Laurenskerk, Alkmaar

CD: Vol. 9

Van Hagerbeer/Schnitger (1646/1725)

#### HW

Prestant 8'

Octaaf 4'

Octaav 2'

Ruyschpijp II

Mixtuur VI

Trompet 16'

Viool de Gamba 8'

Trompet 4'

#### RP

Prestant 8'

Octaaf 4'

Superoctaav 2'

Sexquialter II

Mixtuur V-VI

#### PED

Prinsipaal 22'

Prestant 16'

Octaav 8'

Quinta 6'

Octaav 4'

Ruyschpijp III

Mixtuur VIII

Basuin 16'

Trompet 8'

#### Coupler:

RP/HW

#### Jacques van Oortmerssen

Bovenkerk, Kampen

CD: Vol. 4

Hinsz 1743



<u>HW</u>	<u>RW</u>	<u>PED</u>
Prestant 16'	Prestant 8'	Prestant 16'
Prestant 8'	Octaaf 4'	Subbas 16'
Holpijp 8'	Octaaf 2'	Octaaf 8'
Octaaf 4'	Sexquialter III	Gedakt 8'
Quint 3'		Roerquint 6'
Superoctaaf 2'		Octaaf 4'
Mixtuur III-V		Open Fluit 2'
Tertiaan II		Bazuin 16'
Trompet 8'		Trompet 8

Couplers:

RW/HW

HW/PED

Both Alain and Van Oortmerssen employ a reed *plenum* based on 16' pitch as advised by Agricola and also Mattheson in his *Der Vollkommene Capellmeister*. This becomes the case when full-length reed or reeds are added to the normal mixture *plenum*. (Owen 1997: 145.) Van Oortmerssen only uses a Trompet 8' in the *Hoofdwerk* division although he also has a 16' Trompet on this manual available. Alain on the other hand employs all the available reeds on the *Hoofdwerk* of the Alkmaar organ, i.e. the Trompet 16', the Viool de Gamba 8', and the Trompet 4'.

An interesting aspect about Alain's *plenum* is the inclusion of a Viool de Gamba in the manual *plenum* on the Van Hagerbeer/Schnitger organ. This stop is typical in Dutch organs of the time and it is strange that here it is a substitution for a full-length Trompet 8' usually found on the *Hoofdwerk* of such organs. Another interesting fact is that the Trompet 4' was changed to an eight-foot stop in 1782, with the Viool de Gamba remaining on an eight-foot basis. The Trompet was eventually changed again to a four-

foot reed during the restoration in the period, 1947-1949. (Jongepier 1987: 69.) What should be kept in mind is that the *Viool de Gamba* on the Van Hagerbeer/Schnitger organ is not a string-toned register in the sense of a Romantic idiom. Instead it is a copy of a stop known as the 'Viola', which in Italy and Spain around c.1750, often denoted a reed register such as a powerful regal stop of one or other kind. (Williams & Owen 1988: 290.)

Van Oortmerssen, in his construction of the manual *plenum* on the *Hoofdwark*, is disregarding the *Äqualstimmenverbot*. He does this by combining the *Hoofdwark* Prestant 8' and the Holpijp 8' in the manual *plenum*, and the Prestant 16' + Subbas 16', and the Octaaf 8' + Gedakt 8' in the pedal *plenum*.

Van Oortmerssen adds a Quint 3' to his manual *plenum* that gives it much more depth and colour. As mentioned before, Mattheson, Adlung and Agricola regarded the Quint as an indispensable part of the *Organo plenum* in both the manual and pedal (Stauffer & May 1986: 200).

Lynn Edwards (Faulkner 1997: 212) states that a characteristic of Georg Christoph Sterzing's organs (which Bach knew and played) is that the *plenum* includes the Quinte 3' if the main manual is based on an eight-foot and a Quinte 6' if based on a sixteen-foot. The latter is found either in the manual or pedal.

Van Oortmerssen also employs the Tertiaan II of the *Hoofdwark* in the manual *plenum* that also adds brilliance to the greater ensemble. Generally this stop was used both as a solo and as a chorus Tierce Mixture especially in central and northern Europe during the 17<sup>th</sup> and 18<sup>th</sup> centuries. It also had a much wider scaling than that of the Principal. (Williams & Owen 1988: 287.)

Both organists use a Sesquialtera in the coupled secondary manuals, which was encouraged and called for by authors such as Adlung and Mattheson. We also know that

many organs that Bach played did in fact contain third-sounding ranks in the Mixtures and other compound mutation stops. (Faulkner 1997: 230.)

Alain makes use of the exceptional and one of a kind Prinsipaal 22' of the Van Hagerbeer/Schmitger organ in the pedal *plenum*. This register adds considerable depth and gravity to the global *plenum* as described by Adlung (Faulkner 1997: 215). This register's largest pipe is the note G that is placed on the C key, creating a Quint 21  $\frac{1}{3}$ ' and consequently an acoustical 64' (Jongepier 1987: 69).

Van Oortmerssen's pedal *plenum* is coupled to the *Hoofdwerk* to attain the required brilliance as mentioned and advised by Adlung (Stauffer & May 1986: 199). The Open Fluit 2' is probably a substitution for a principal-scaled two-foot register that is not available in the Pedal division of the Bovenkerk organ.

Both performers' registrations show the typical influence of the French Classical School. The use of registers includes full-length reeds such as the Trompet at 16', 8' and 4' level, the addition of third-sounding ranks (Tertiaan II), and the inclusion of Sesquialteras, all this help to emphasise the "Frenchness" of the Fantasia BWV 562.

Alain's manual registration resembles to an extent to the instructions for the *Dialogue à deux Choeurs* given by Gaspard Corrette in the preface to his *Messe du 8e ton* (1703) (Williams & Owen 1988: 261): "On the *Grand jeu*, the Bourdon, Prestant, Trompette, Clairon and Cornet."

It would appear that Van Oortmerssen tries to emulate a type of French *Grand Jeu*. (Nicolas LeBègue, *Livre d'orgue* of 1678 (Douglass 1995: 198): "For a *Grand Jeu*, draw the Bourdon, Montre... Prestant, Doublette, Nazard, Tierce, Cornet, Trompette...")

It is clear that both Alain and Van Oortmerssen try to create a French *Grand Jeu* with German means.

The pedal *plenum* in both registrations is used in a “German” idiom as indicated by Friedrich Wilhelm Marpurg in his *Der critische Musicus an der Spree* (1750). Marpurg, although a native of Germany, was very much up to date with the standardised registration instructions of the French Classical School. All his suggestions for playing *Plein Jeu*, Fugues and most important, the *Grand Jeu*, include the Posaune 16' and the Trompette 8' in the Pedal division as employed by both Alain and Van Oortmerssen. (Kooiman 1992: 134.)

### 5.5 Trio Sonata in D Minor BWV 527

The six Trio Sonatas are yet again singular contributions to organ composition in their more highly profiled continuo bass-lines, idiomatic writing for manual, and the use of ritornello structures. Nikolaus J. Forkel (1749-1818) mentions that Bach “took the trouble to write short pieces which, combined with exercises, were suited to his pupils’ abilities. Bach wrote them during the lesson, while also keeping an eye on the pupil’s immediate needs. Afterwards, he transformed these pieces into magnificent and expressive works of art.” (Alain Vol. 13 1993: 21).

Bach’s autograph of the six Trio Sonatas (BWV 525-530) dates from about 1730, but some movements were arranged from earlier chamber compositions. Some sources suggest that the drafting of these works took place between 1723 and 1727. Forkel states that these compositions were written as pedagogical works for Bach’s eldest son, Wilhelm Friedemann, who, “by practising them, prepared himself to become the great performer on the organ that he afterwards was.” (Boyd 1995: 63.) These works must truly have been very educational for Wilhelm Friedemann because he was known to be the greatest organist of his generation (Van Oortmerssen 1994: 5).

In the title of these works Bach’s autograph each manuscript indicates the phrase ‘*Sonata à 2 clav: et Pedal.*’ The texture of the Trio Sonatas for organ with its three independent parts does in fact resemble that of the violin and flute sonatas with harpsichord obbligato.

The pedal *plenum* in both registrations is used in a “German” idiom as indicated by Friedrich Wilhelm Marpurg in his *Der critische Musicus an der Spree* (1750). Marpurg, although a native of Germany, was very much up to date with the standardised registration instructions of the French Classical School. All his suggestions for playing *Plein Jeu*, Fugues and most important, the *Grand Jeu*, include the Posaune 16' and the Trompette 8' in the Pedal division as employed by both Alain and Van Oortmerssen. (Kooiman 1992: 134.)

### 5.5 Trio Sonata in D Minor BWV 527

The six Trio Sonatas are yet again singular contributions to organ composition in their more highly profiled continuo bass-lines, idiomatic writing for manual, and the use of ritornello structures. Nikolaus J. Forkel (1749-1818) mentions that Bach “took the trouble to write short pieces which, combined with exercises, were suited to his pupils’ abilities. Bach wrote them during the lesson, while also keeping an eye on the pupil’s immediate needs. Afterwards, he transformed these pieces into magnificent and expressive works of art.” (Alain Vol. 13 1993: 21).

Bach’s autograph of the six Trio Sonatas (BWV 525-530) dates from about 1730, but some movements were arranged from earlier chamber compositions. Some sources suggest that the drafting of these works took place between 1723 and 1727. Forkel states that these compositions were written as pedagogical works for Bach’s eldest son, Wilhelm Friedemann, who, “by practising them, prepared himself to become the great performer on the organ that he afterwards was.” (Boyd 1995: 63.) These works must truly have been very educational for Wilhelm Friedemann because he was known to be the greatest organist of his generation (Van Oortmerssen 1994: 5).

In the title of these works Bach’s autograph each manuscript indicates the phrase ‘*Sonata à 2 clav: et Pedal.*’ The texture of the Trio Sonatas for organ with its three independent parts does in fact resemble that of the violin and flute sonatas with harpsichord obbligato.

It is currently a controversial subject whether these works were in fact intended for a two-manual harpsichord/clavichord or a two-manual organ. (Boyd 1995: 63; Van Oortmerssen Vol. 1 1994: 5-6.) Alain's (1993: 21) opinion is that the lyricism of the themes, the sustained counterpoint, the long-note values and the concertante use of the Pedal undoubtedly suggest the use of the organ.

The D minor Trio Sonata has known links with an instrumental work of the *musica de camera* character, being revised (around 1730) to create the second movement of the Concerto in A minor for flute, violin, harpsichord and strings (BWV 1044). Scholars have suggested that other movements can also be traced back to instrumental pieces from Bach's Cöthen period where he served a secular court rather than an ecclesiastical authority (Mellers 1980: 16).

The tempo indications in BWV 527 are *Andante*, *Adagio e dolce*, and *Vivace*. The outer movements are written in a typical A-B-A form, while the middle movement's character already shows the style of the futuristic *Empfindsame Stil*. (Van Oortmerssen 1994: 8-9.)

### Registrations used by performers

Alain Aa-Kerk, Groningen (Netherlands) CD: Vol. 13  
 De Mare/Schnitger (1678/1702)

#### a. Andante

<u>HW (rh)</u>	<u>RP (lh)</u>	<u>PED</u>
Holpijp 8'	Gedekt 8'	Prestant 8'
Nazard 2 <sup>2</sup> / <sub>3</sub> '	Roerfluit 4'	

#### b. Adagio e dolce

HW (lh)

Holpijp 8'

Salicional 8'

RP (rh)

Dulciaan 8'

Roerfluit 4'

PED

Bourdon 16'

Violon 8'

**c. Vivace**

HW (lh)

Holpijp 8'

Octaaf 2'

RP (rh)

Gedekt 8'

Roerfluit 4'

Sifflet 1 1/3'

PED

Bourdon 16'

Violon 8'

Octaaf 4'

**Jacques van Oortmerssen**

Waalse Kerk, Amsterdam

CD: Vol. 1

Müller (1734)

**a. Andante**

HW (lh)

Prestant 8'

RW (rh)

Prestant 8'

PED

Bourdon 16'

Prestant 8'

**b. Adagio e dolce**

HW (rh)

Roerfluit 8'

Quintadeen 8'

RW (lh)

Holpijp 8'

PED

Bourdon 16'

Prestant 8'

c. Vivace

<u>HW (lh)</u>	<u>RW (rh)</u>	<u>PED</u>
Prestant 8'	Prestant 8'	Bourdon 16'
Octaaf 4'	Octaaf 4'	Prestant 8'

a. Andante

Alain uses a typical so-called gapped registration in the right hand part of this movement. This continues to be a problematic aspect and question in terms of 18<sup>th</sup> century German registration practice. Adlung for instance does not favour these combinations especially when they contain mutations such as the Nazard (Faulkner 1997: 230). Agricola states the following: “It is inadvisable to omit an octave in the middle.” In choosing such combinations he mentions contradictory further that much depends on whether one is playing a single line (as in a trio) or a full texture on one manual. (Faulkner 1997: 227.)

Gottfried Silbermann on the other hand supplied a few combinations for three parts that include a registration combination with a Nazard used as a solo. One of such combinations is found in the registration instructions for Grosshartmannsdorf (Owen 1997: 170; Kooiman, Weinberger & Busch 1995: 172). Alain’s combinations on the manuals are almost similar to the “Nassat registration” (“*Nassat-Zug*”) supplied by Silbermann for two manuals and pedal. The difference in timbre between the solo and accompaniment does not seem to be vast and could probably qualify as a typical trio registration. The only difference is the omitted four-foot flute in the right hand:

HW “*zum accompagniren*”

Rohrflöte 8'

Spitzflöte 4'



OW “Solo”

Gedackt 8'

[Rohrflöte 4']

Nasat 2 <sup>2</sup>/<sub>3</sub>'

Interesting is Alain's Pedal registration that only contains an eight-foot Prestant. This is another controversial aspect where registration sources are not clear whether the Pedal division in the Trio Sonatas is to be based on a sixteen-foot or an eight-foot. The imitation of three individual instruments based on the normal pitch becomes the point of departure, yet it must be kept in mind that Bach's Trio Sonatas were written for the organ that has an individual idiom and character of its own. It is noteworthy that all of Kauffmann's chorale trios for two manuals and Pedal in his *Harmonische Seelenlust* are based on a sixteen-foot foundation in the Pedal.

Van Oortmerssen's registration is mainly based on a Principal character to imitate the sound of stringed instruments. His registration resembles exactly the indication for a trio combination given by Mattheson. He (Mattheson) however suggests that the left-hand part should be played an octave lower because of the inclusion of a four-foot Principal for the left hand (Kooiman 1992: 67.) In several of his chorale preludes, Kauffmann also indicates a 4' stop where the player is directed to play an octave lower. This seems to avoid awkward crossings of the hands and gives independence to the left-hand part. (Owen 1997: 161.) Mattheson's registration as used by Van Oortmerssen is as follows:

RH: Prestant 8'

LH: Octaaf 4' (played an 8ve lower)

PED: Prestant 16' or Subbas 16' + Octaaf 8'

### b. Adagio e dolce

Alain's registration definitely resembles the combination supplied by Kauffmann in one of his trio chorale preludes namely, *Ach Gott, vom Himmel sieh darein*:

Kauffmann

Alain

HW: Gemshorn 8'

HW: Holpijp 8' + Salicional 8'

OW: Vox humana 8' (reed)+ Spiellpfeife 4'    RP: Dulciaan 8' (reed) + Roerfluit 4'

PED: Sub-Baß 16' + Gemshorn 8'

PED: Bourdon 16' + Violon 8'

The Gemshorn 8' supplied in the HW division of Kauffmann is actually a combination of Alain's HW combination. The Gemshorn is in fact a sharply tapering, wide, metal Flute stop, with a combination of tone between those of flute and string (Williams & Owen 1988: 276). Alain also uses multiple stops at eight-foot pitch in the HW of this movement and thus discredits the advice of authors such as Niedt and Werckmeister (Faulkner 1997: 233).

In the RW registration Alain draws a reed with a flue stop, i.e Dulciaan 8' and Roerfluit 4'. Agricola definitely prized smooth reed tone and therefore mentions that a reed is rarely used on its own, but rather in combination with 8' or 4' flue stops. He advises that one should always use a reed in combination with a flue stop "to muffle the reed's rattle." (Faulkner 1997: 227 & 232.)

Alain employs a Violon 8' in the Pedal division in combination with a Bourdon 16'. Adlung points out that the Violon is "an open pedal register at 16' and 8' pitches, [made] of metal or wood, with which one imitates the bowing of a Violone. [...] It is especially useful in the Pedal division, and when it is exactly right, it buzzes like a Violone." (Faulkner 1997: 212.) Walther adds the following concerning the Voilon (Kooiman, Weinberger & Busch: 1995: 165): "...ist dannenhero zum Fundament einer Music gut zu gebrauchen."

Van Oortmerssen, as Alain, also disregards the advice given by Niedt and Werkmeister whereby multiple eight-foot stops are used in combination, i.e. the Roerfluit 8' and Quintadeen 8' in the right hand part. Adlung points out the following about combining eight-foot stops of such a nature (Faulkner 1997: 216): "...because the sound changes somewhat when, for example, to the Principal 8' one adds a Gedackt 8', or Quintatön, or Violdigamba, or Querflöte, one should freely make use of such variation." The combination of a Quintadena 8' with another flue stop(s) is by no means a concept restricted to the High Baroque. A contract of 1537 for the organ in the Trier Cathedral contains a few suggestions that employs the Quintadena quite considerably (Owen 1997: 25):

*"Kuppel"* (combinations including the 8' Principal)

- a. With Quintadena
- b. With Quintadena and Zimbel
- c. With Quintadena, Hohlpfeife, and Zimbel

*Quintadein*

- a. Quintadena alone
- b. With Hohlpfeife [as in Van Oortmerssen's case]
- c. With Zimbel

Van Oortmerssen uses a Prestant 8' in combination with the Bourdon 16' because of the absence of a Gedackt 8' on the Pedal division of the Müller organ. However, the singing quality of the Müller 8' Principal really compliments the Bourdon 16' and has a rather string-type quality that adds a steady support for the manual divisions.

### c. Vivace

In this movement Alain again employs gapped registration but this time in both manual divisions. Interesting is the combination of a Gedekt 8' and Roerfluit 4' with a Sifflet 1 <sup>1</sup>/<sub>3</sub>'. During its period of popularity the Sifflet (Sifflöte) could be either 1' or 1 <sup>1</sup>/<sub>3</sub>'.

Builders and authors such as Silbermann preferred the 1' and others such as Schnitger were fond of the 1  $\frac{1}{3}$ '. (Williams & Owen 1988: 285.) Silbermann's suggestions are perhaps the best known of such gapped registrations (Faulkner 1997: 231). Although he does not supply a mutation stop in his so-called "*Siffleten-Zug*", the registration of Alain in the RP for the right hand on the Schnitger organ is almost similar to this (Kooiman, Weinberger & Busch 1995: 172):

OW: Gedackt 8'  
 Rohrflöte 4'  
 Siffflöte 1' [Sifflet 1  $\frac{1}{3}$ ']

Alain's left-hand combination on the HW resembles part of the registration supplied by the less familiar source of Johann Friedrich Walther for the Berliner Garnisonkirche organ (1726) (Faulkner 1997: 231):

"Manual: Octave 2',...may be used with an 8-foot stop alone."

The addition of the Octaaf 4' in the Pedal is probably to create a balance between this division and the manuals. Agricola says that the Pedal must always conform itself to the loudness of the manual (Faulkner 1997: 227). This is especially the case in a trio sonata.

Van Oortmerssen's trio combination once again resembles the registration supplied by Mattheson for this type of genre (Kooiman 1992: 69):

Both hands: Prestant 8' + [Octaaf] 4'  
Pedal: Prestant 16' + 8'

Instead of a Prestant 16' Van Oortmerssen uses a Bourdon 16' because of the lack of a principal-scaled sixteen-foot on the Pedal division of the Müller organ.

## 5.6 Concerto in G major BWV 592

Johann Ernst (1696-1745) who was Duke of Sachsen-Weimar during the years 1696-1715 employed Bach from 1708-1717. At this time Bach composed works that were influenced by the Italian style of writing. In Weimar he came into close contact with the style of Venetian composers and arranging works by Antonio Vivaldi, Arcangelo Corelli, Tomaso Albinoni and others. Most of these works were composed and rearranged in the years 1713-1714 probably for the instruction and enjoyment of the young prince Johann Ernst. There are twenty transcriptions in all, sixteen for harpsichord (BWV 972-987) and four for organ (BWV 592-594, 596) (Boyd 1995: 74-75). Paul Peeters (Van Oortmerssen Vol. 5 1998: 5) suggests that six were written for organ (BWV 592-596) and 16 for a keyboard instrument without pedal (BWV 972-987). Nine of the concertos are by Vivaldi and the Venetians Alessandro Marcello (1684-1750) and Benedetto Marcello (1686-1739). Georg Philipp Telemann (1681-1767) represents the German composers whose works were also used for transcriptions. Importantly is the fact that these arrangements include concertos by Johann Ernst himself. (Boyd 1995: 74-75.)

Johann Ernst studied at Utrecht University in the Netherlands from 1711 to 1713. During this period he also visited Amsterdam where he heard the blind organist of the Nieuwe Kerk, Jan Jacob de Graaf (c.1672-1738), play. De Graaf played Italian sonatas and concertos and the prince was undoubtedly impressed and influenced by the beauty of these works.

Johann Ernst had composed a concerto for violin, strings and continuo, and commissioned Bach (who was his teacher then) to transcribe the work for organ. It clearly shows the clear Italian concerto influence and entails the typical 'Solo' and 'Ripieno' passages, which were well known during the first half of the 18<sup>th</sup> century. (Alain Vol 11 1992: 23; Van Oortmerssen Vol. 5 1998: 7.)

The BWV 592 Concerto has three movements, i.e. [*Allegro*], *Grave* and *Presto*. The first

movement, which is clearly structured, is composed in a typical “Vivaldian” idiom. The *Grave* has a richly polyphonic five-part texture. The *Presto* is rhythmically very lively with a bass line that appears to be Bach’s own invention. (Alain Vol. 11 1992: 23-24.)

### Registrations used by performers

Alain                      l’Eglise Saint-Martin, Masevaux                      CD: Vol. 11  
 Alfred Kern (1975)

#### a. [Allegro]

<u>GO</u>	<u>OW</u>	<u>PED</u>
Montre 8'	Bourdon 8'	Flûte 16'
Prestant 4'	Flûte à fuseau 4'	Flûte conique 8'
Gemshorn 2'	Doublette 2'	Prestant 4'
Cymbale IV	Larigot 1 1/3'	

#### Coupler:

OW/PED

OW/GO

#### b. Grave

<u>GO</u>	<u>POS</u>
Flûte à cheminée 8'	Bourdon 8'

PED

Flûte 16'

OW

Chalumeau 8'  
Flûte à fuseau 4'  
Tremulant

Coupler:  
POS/PED

**c. Presto**

<u>GO (lh)</u>	<u>POS (rh)</u>	<u>PED</u>
Flûte à cheminée 8'	Bourdon 8'	Bourdon 8' (from POS)
Gemshorn 2'	Quarte 2'	

Coupler:

POS/PED

**Jacques van Oortmerssen** St. Laurenskerk, Alkmaar CD: Vol. 5  
Van Hagerbeer/Schnitger (1646/1725)

**a. [Allegro]**

<u>GM</u>	<u>RP</u>	<u>PED</u>
Prestant 8'	Prestant 8'	Prestant 16'
Octaav 4'		Prestant 8'
		Octaav 4'

**b. Grave**

<u>RP</u>	<u>BW</u>	<u>PED</u>
Prestant 8'	Baarpijp 8'	Prestant 16'

**c. Presto**

<u>RW</u>	<u>PED</u>
Prestant 8'	Prestant 16'
	Prestant 8'

**a. [Allegro]**

Alain creates a small mixture *plenum* based on an eight-foot on the *Grand-Orgue* for this movement. It is however coupled to a combination of flutes on the *Oberwerk*. An interesting aspect is the addition of a Larigot 1 <sup>1</sup>/<sub>3</sub>' in the OW combination. In the 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> centuries it was used for both chorus and solo registrations (Williams & Owen 1988: 278). Alain uses it in a trio situation in which instance it is also very well balanced in combination with the *Grand-Orgue*.

The *Oberwerk* combination is used as a secondary manual where Bach indicates the use of a *Rückpositiv*. This combination has the effect of a light registration usually found on the *Rückpositivs* of many German organs of Bach's time, therefore corresponding with the instructions of Bach and highlighting the effect between 'ripieno' and 'solo' passages. Alain could have used the *Positif de dos* in this case, but most probably would not have had the same effect. It is not clear why Alain coupled the OW to the Pedal. This is probably to retain independence from the G.O. for it to be louder; however she could have coupled the *Positif* instead.

Van Oortmerssen uses a Principal-based registration for this movement. His combination on the *Groot manuaal* is similar to one of the combinations given by Adlung in his



*Musica mechanica organoedi* for the use of several foundation stops, i.e. Principal 8' and Octave 4'. This combination is used to imitate the strings of the orchestral ('*ripieno*') part. In the *Rugpositief* registration he employs only a Prestant 8'. In the trios of the *Harmonische Seelenlust* many of the manual divisions indicates the use of only an 8' Principal in its respective part (Kauffmann 1924: 41, 48, & 138). This registration is to imitate the solo violin part of the original work composed by Prince Johann Ernst.

### b. Grave

Bach's indications in this movement are also '*Oberwerk*' and '*Rückpositiv*' for the '*ripieno*' and '*solo*' passages, respectively.

Alain draws a reed and a flue stop in combination for the solo part, i.e. Chalumeau 8' and Flûte à fuseau 4'. This is also done in the second movement of BWV 527. Agricola states that a reed is seldom used alone but rather in combination with a flue register (Faulkner 1997: 232). According to Prætorius in his *Syntagma musicum* (1619) the tremulant is added in a registration to change the timbre of the combination (Stuifbergen & Schouten 1980: 107).

Van Oortmerssen uses an 8' Prestant for the (violin) solo part in the *Rugpositief* for this movement. The Prestant of the Van Hagerbeer/Schnitger organ does in fact have a string quality to it and Owen (1997: 164) points out that employing registers of similar timbre and character as that of the original composition gives a sense and feeling of authenticity. Lynn Edwards (Faulkner 1997: 214) mentions that stops with a string character (including Principals) won general acceptance in the 18<sup>th</sup> century and also states that the Baroque orchestra had a great influence on the pipe sounds of Thuringia.

A rather unusual aspect of Van Oortmerssen's Pedal registration is the use of the Prestant 16' on its own as a *basso continuo* line. This stop is surprisingly successful in this task and speaks clearly, even in the lower register. Werckmeister says that "The open [registers] such as Principal, Octave, etc., have their proper sharpness, and at the same

time are *gravitatisch*.” (Faulkner 1997: 215.)

### c. Presto

This movement does not contain any indications for manual changes as in the previous ones but the distinctions between ‘solo’ and ‘ripieno’ are clear in the original composition. A performance on two manuals is therefore not discarded.

Alain uses gapped registrations in both manuals for this movement. As mentioned before, German registration sources on this subject are not always clear in their respective opinions. Agricola suggests that it is not advisable to use such combinations, but if it is used in playing single melodic lines as in a trio, it can be applied (Faulkner 1997: 227).

Van Oortmerssen only uses one manual for this last movement. He also only makes use of an 8' Prestant. Bach seemed to have favoured such a registration of using single stops. An example of this is notable in his indications for the first part of the D minor concerto BWV 596 (after Vivaldi) where he specifies three individual Principals to imitate strings (Williams & Owen 1988: 259). Even Kauffmann (1924: 115) in his chorale prelude, *Schönster Immanuel*, suggests that the Principal 8' should be used alone (“...oder *Principal 8' allein*”) if the organ does not contain a Quintaden 16' to be combined with this eight-foot.

## CHORALE-BASED WORKS

### **5.7 Partita diverse sopra: Sei gegrüßet, Jesu gütig / O Jesu, du edle Gabe. BWV 768**

Bach wrote '*Partita diverse*' on the following chorales: *Christ, der du bist der helle Tag* (BWV 766); *O Gott, du frommer Gott* (BWV 767); and *Sei gegrüßet, Jesu gütig* (or *O Jesu, du edle Gabe*) (BWV 768). The partitas were presumably written after the Neumeister Chorales but before the *Orgelbüchlein*. These compositions follow the trend that was instigated by Georg Böhm (1661-1733) who was the forerunner and most of his influence is evident and apparent in Bach's *Partite diverse*. A recent study has come to the conclusion that there is a stylistic concordance in some partitas between the specific variations and the corresponding verses in the chorale text. It can therefore be said that that Bach's *Partite diverse* are perfect models of *Musica sub Communione*. There is confirmation from sources that the BWV 768 Partita was written in two different stages. Research has shown that BWV 768 was later rewritten to function as the basis of the ten variations on '*O Jesu, du edle Gabe*', a text written by Johann Böttiger (1613-1672). The work has not survived in Bach's own hand but can be found in many important 18<sup>th</sup> century sources. It is probable that the work dates from the early period 1710-1714 and is an example of Bach's rare high degree of musical architecture. (Alain Vol. 8 1990: 24; Stinson 1999: 65; Van Oortmerssen Vol.5 1998: 6 & 9.)

In some sources variations 6 and 7 are reversed and in recent studies also on the inner organisation of BWV 768. Alain plays the 12/8 variation as the normal number 7 and Van Oortmerssen plays it as number 6. Albert Schweitzer stated that because the number and order of variations differ in certain sources, the Partita BWV 768 does not serve as an example of the relation between text and the organ setting. Phillip Spitta's conclusion is that the variations were written in different periods in Bach's lifetime. (Williams 1980: 309-310.)

The text of C. Keimann's hymn was published in 1663 (Williams 1980: 309):

<i>Sei begrüßet, Jesu gütig,</i>	Hail to you, Jesus,
<i>Über alles Mass sanftmütig,</i>	Beyond all measure gentle,
<i>Ach! wie bist du doch zerschmissen,</i>	O, how you are dashed in pieces,
<i>und dein gantzer Leib zerrissen!</i>	your whole body torn to bits!
<i>(R) Lass mich deine Lieb ererben,</i>	(R) Let me inherit your love
<i>und darinnen selig sterben.</i>	and die happy in it

Johann Böttiger's *O Jesu, du edle Gabe*, a so-called *Jesulied* for Holy Communion, has a different refrain (Williams 1980: 309):

<i>Dein Blut mich von Sünden wäschet</i>	Your blood washes me from sin
<i>Und der Höllen Glut auslöchet.</i>	And extinguishes the fires of Hell.

### **Registrations used by performers**

#### **Choral**

This choral is written in a typical keyboard style as an interlude and differs from the same settings of the other partitas.

**Alain** Grote St. Laurenskerk, Alkmaar CD: Vol. 8  
 Van Hagerbeer/Van Hagerbeer (1646/1725)

**GM**

Prestant 16'

**PED**

Prestant 16'

Prestant 8'	Octaav 8'
Octaav 4'	Octaav 4'
Octaav 2'	Ruyschpijp III
Ruyschpijp II	Basuin 16'
Mixtuur VI	

Van Oortmerssen

Grote St. Laurenskerk, Alkmaar CD: Vol. 5  
 Van Hagerbeer/Schnitger (1646/1725)

GM

RP

PED

Prestant 16'

Prestant 8'

Prestant 16'

Prestant 8'

Octaav 4'

Rohrquint 12'

Octaav 4'

Octaav 8'

Couplers:

P/GM

P/RP

RP/GM

Alain makes use of most of the principal-scaled registers of the *Groot manuaal*, thus employing the mixture *plenum* or the so-called *Vollem Werk* as suggested by Johann Mattheson. The reeds are therefore excluded from this combination in the manual. The Pedal division is also made out of the normal principal chorus based on a 16' *plenum* or the so-called *Vollem Werk* as suggested by Johann Mattheson. The Pedal division is also made out of the normal principal chorus based on a 16' *plenum* including a Basuin 16'. This combination also adheres to Mattheson's instruction saying that a sixteen-foot reed may be added to the Pedal if the manual consists of the normal *Vollem Werk*. (Owen 1997: 145.)

Registrations used by performers

Van Oortmerssen employs a rather “strange” *plenum* for this chorale. Adlung, Mattheson and Agricola promote a good 16' foundation in the manual *plenum* even if no compound registers are used, as Van Oortmerssen does. Kauffmann was very fond of sixteen-foot tone and many of his chorale preludes indicate the use of this register as foundation stop (Faulkner 1997: 229):

Herr, ich habe misgehandelt:

Principal 16' + Octava 8'

Schönster Immanuel:

Quintadena 16' + Principal 8'

Lahm in his chorale variations of 1732 has the following registration in the *Hauptwerk* of one of his works (Faulkner 1997: 229). This combination is almost similar to that of Van Oortmerssen:

Quintatön 16' + Principal 8' + Gedackt 8' + Octav 4'

Van Oortmerssen also adds a Rohrquint 12' to the Pedal. The inclusion of this register brings about an acoustical 32' effect and is in actual fact a  $10 \frac{2}{3}'$  register. By combining this stop to the total ensemble, Van Oortmerssen gives ‘gravity’ to the combination as pointed out by Agricola (Owen 1997: 167).

### Variation I

This variation is a *bicinium* and is organised into three paragraphs, each concerned with two lines of the choral.

### Registrations used by performers

### Alain

#### GM (lh)

Prestant 16'

Viool de Gamba 8'

Octaav 4'

#### RP (rh)

Prestant 8'

Fluit 4'

Quintfluit 3'

### Jacques van Oortmerssen

#### GM

Prestant 16'

Prestant 8'

Viool de Gamba 8'

#### RP

Prestant 8'

Fluit 4'

Quintfluit 3'

This is a rare example where both performers use an almost identical registration on the same organ, i.e. the Grote St. Laurenskerk in Alkmaar.

The left-hand combination used by both performers is a very popular registration for the accompaniment of *bicinia* such as the first variation of BWV 768. Both organists' left-hand combination is based on a sixteen-foot foundation that is common in many chorale preludes of Kauffmann's *Harmonische Seelenlust*. As mentioned before, the use of a 16' as basis for accompaniment is perhaps the influence of the *basso continuo* practice in many cantata settings of the time (Owen 1997: 160). A similar combination of the left-hand part as used by Alain and Van Oortmerssen can be found in Kauffmann's registration indication for the chorale prelude *Wie schön leuchtet der Morgenstern*. This registration combines a 16', an 8' reed and another flue stop (Kooiman, Weinberger &

Busch 1995: 169):

Bourdon 16' + Vox humana 8' + Spillpfeife 4'

Both performers also combine the reed stop with flue registers. Alain uses a Prestant 16' and an Octaav 4' with the Viool de Gamba, and Van Oortmerssen uses the Prestants 16' and 8' with the Viool de Gamba, therefore conforming to Agricola's advice (Faulkner 1997: 232).

The right-hand combination employed by both organists is also a very popular registration for *cantus firmus* use in a *bicinia*. The Quintfluit 3' used in this combination is a  $2\frac{2}{3}$ ' flute-scaled register. Gottfried Silbermann supplied the following combination for the Grosshartmannsdorf organ called a "*Nassat registration*". This combination is used as a solo and Alain and Van Oortmerssen employ it in such a manner except for the Prestant 8' (Owen 1997: 170):

*Oberwerk*: Gedackt 8' + Rohrflöte 4' + Nassat  $2\frac{2}{3}$ '

By using this right-hand registration the performers are actually discarding the advice given by Agricola saying (Faulkner 1997: 227): "A Quint or a Terz must always have a higher Octave or Superoctave on top of it. For example, if the the Quint is a 3-foot, then a 2-foot stop must be drawn together with an 8' and 4'."

## Variation II

### Registrations used by performers

#### Alain



GM

Prestant 8'

Octaav 4'

**Jacques van Oortmerssen**

RP

Prestant 8'

Octaav 4'

Once again Alain and Van Oortmerssen use exactly the same registration but on different manuals, i.e. Alain the *Groot manuaal* and Van Oortmerssen the *Rugpositief*.

The combination of an eight-foot Prestant with a four-foot Prestant is a common combination found in many registration sources. Kauffmann (1928: 26) for example, uses the combination of Prestants 8' and 4' as an alternative for the *Organo pleno* ('item: *das Volle Werk*') in the chorale prelude *Ein feste Burg is unser Gott*. This is also one of the first combinations that Adlung supplies for the combining of foundation stops of 16', 8', 4' and 2' pitch (Kooiman, Weinberger & Busch 1995: 167; Stuifbergen & Schouten 1980: 144).

**Variation III**

**Registrations used by performers**

**Alain**

RP

Fluit 4'

**Jacques van Oortmerssen**

BW

Roerfluit 8'

Fluit Dous 4'

Tremulant

Van Oortmerssen uses a popular combination that can also be found in many 18<sup>th</sup> century registration sources. This combination of two flute-scaled stops of 8' and 4' pitch is an example of one of the registrations found in the guidelines supplied by Gottfried Heinrich Trost in c.1722 for the Waltherhausen organs in Altenburg and Eisenberg. These combinations he named “für die Music” (Kooiman, Weinberger & Busch 1995: 163):

Nachthorn 8' + Lieblich Gedackt 4'

Gottfried Silbermann supplies a similar combination in his suggestions for Grosshartmannsdorf called “Flöten-Züge.” (Owen 1997: 165):

HW

Rohrföte 8'

Spitzflöte 4'

OW

Gedackt 8'

Rohrflöte 4'

The addition of the tremulant is probably to alter the tone-colour of this combination as pointed out by Prætorius in his *Syntagma musicum* (1619). He stated that with this stop one can have many variations (“viel Verenderung haben kan”). (Stuifbergen & Schouten 1980: 107.)

Alain employs a four-foot flute for Variation III. Neither Kauffmann nor Gronau suggests the use of a single four-foot on its own in any registration indication (Owen 1997: 160). Kauffmann (1924: 1) does indicate the use of a 4' pitch in some chorale preludes in his *Harmonische Seelenlust* (mostly trios) but in the preface he makes it clear that this part should be played an octave lower. Agricola is not in favour of a four-foot stop without an appropriate eight-foot register beneath it. He, however, makes the exception saying that a 4' may be used if "one intends to play very rapid passages on it." (Faulkner 1997: 230.) Variation III of BWV 768 can surely qualify as a work with "rapid passages".

#### Variation IV

#### Registrations used by performers

##### Alain

##### BW

Quintadena 8'

Fluit Dous 4'

##### Jacques van Oortmerssen

##### BW

Roerfluit 8'

Quintadena 8'

Fluit Dous 4'

Alain and Van Oortmerssen's registrations are basically the same in terms of stop

combination and manual selection. Alain's combination is more or less similar to the registration that was used by Van Oortmerssen in the previous variation, i.e. the combining of two flute-scaled registers. Van Oortmerssen's combination only differs from the one in Variation III in the fact that the Quintadena 8' is added to the ensemble and the omitting of the tremulant. Kauffmann (1924: 90) also suggests the combination used by Alain in the chorale prelude *Nun komm, der Heiden Heiland*. This work is for two manuals with the *Rückpositiv* having the following combination:

Quintadena 8' + Flûte douce 4'

The above-mentioned registration (and also that of Van Oortmerssen) can also be found in the suggestions that was given by Silbermann for Grosshartmannsdorf, which he called "*Lieblich* [elegant] flute registration (Owen 1997: 170):

Quintadena 8' with Spitzflöte 4' or [and] Rohrflöte 8'

### Variation V

#### Registrations used by performers

##### Alain

##### OW

Prestant 8'

Octaav 4'

##### RP

Fagot 8'

Octaav 4'

Waldfluit 2'

Quintanus 1 1/2'

## Jacques van Oortmerssen

### RP

Prestant 8'

Octaav 4'

Quintfluit 3'

Fagot 8'

Williams (1980: 313) suggests that this variation is written in the style of the French *Basse de trompette* explaining why Alain employs two manuals (*Bovenwerk* and *Rugpositief*) although Bach did not specify any manual divisions. In terms of the use of two manuals, Agricola sates that “If one voice of a piece to be performed is to predominate, then louder stops must be drawn on the manual on which it is played than on the other manual.” (Faulkner 1997: 227.)

Alain’s right-hand registration coincides with the statement made by Agricola saying (Faulkner 1997: 227): “A reed stop is also suitable to serve as a foundation for several high stops.”

The most interesting aspect of both organists’ registration is the inclusion of the Fagot 8' in the *Rugpositief* of the Van Hagerbeer/Schnitger organ. The organ builder, J. Strumphler, replaced the original Trechterregaal 8' of the *Rugpositief* with the Fagot 8' in 1782 (Jongepier 1987: 75).

Van Oortmerssen’s combination is based on a typical North German consort registration as defined by Harald Vogel. He plays it on one manual, therefore discarding the idea of a *Basse de trompette*. These combinations imitate the sound of the existing instruments and bear the name of the specific models, in this case the timbre of a Fagot. Vogel comments that it was possible to register a homogeneous timbre that corresponds to a complete family of stops from bass to soprano. This type of combination is a legacy

from the late 16<sup>th</sup> and early 17<sup>th</sup> centuries when organ builders experimented with various tone-colours. (Stauffer & May 1986: 32.)

## Variation VI

### Registrations used by performers

#### Alain

<u>GM (rh)</u>	<u>RP (lh)</u>	<u>PED</u>
Prestant 8'	Prestant 8'	Prestant 16'
Viool de Gamba 8'	Fagot 8'	Octaav 8'
Octaav 4'	Octaav 4'	Octaav 4'
Trompet 4'	Superoctaav 2'	Ruyschpijp III
Octaav 2'	Mixtuur VI	Trompet 8'
Ruyschpijp II		
Tertiaan II		

#### OW

Prestant 8'  
 Octaav 4'  
 Scherp IV

#### Coupler:

OW/GM

## Variation VI as VII

Variation V.11

**Jacques van Oortmerssen**

Registration as used by performers

<u>BW</u>	<u>RP</u>	<u>PED</u>
Roerfluit 8'	Quintadena 8'	Prestant 16'
Fluit Dous 4'	Fluit 4'	Octaav 4'
		Nachthoorn 2'

It is clear that Alain's combination suggests some sort of reed *Organo pleno* with a *cantus firmus* in the Pedal division, resembling a type of French *Grand Jeu*. This registration is somehow identical to the combination that is given by Friedrich Wilhelm Marpurg for the so-called *Nachspiel* showing the clear influence of the French Classical School (Kooiman 1992: 134):

*Hoofdwerk:* Principal 8', Principal 4', Nasard, Terz, Waldflöte 2', Cornet, Trompete 8', Clairon 4', Cromhorn 8'.

*Rugwerk:* Principal 8', 4', Nasard, Terz, Cromhorn 8', Clairon 4'

*Pedaal:* Posaune 16', Trompete 8', Clairon 4'

Van Oortmerssen employs the normal combination of two flute-scaled registers in the two manual divisions as used in the previous variations, but this time against a *cantus firmus* in the Pedal. Van Oortmerssen makes use of a gapped registration omitting an eight-foot in the Pedal to highlight the *cantus firmus*. In this respect Agricola mentions that one should use this type of combination depending on the fact whether a single line or a full texture is played (Faulkner 1997: 227).

*Nachspielum* (1924-38) gives a similar combination for the *Nachspiel* to provide for a full texture.

**Variation VII**

**Registrations used by performers**

Variation VII

**Alain**

**RP**

Octaav 4'

Alain

**Variation VII as VI**

RP

RP

**Jacques van Oortmerssen**

RP

**RP**

RP

Quintadena 8'

Quintadena 8'

Fluit 4'

Fluit 4'

Wald fluit 2'

Wald fluit 2'

Jacques van Oortmerssen

Alain uses a four-foot principal-scaled stop for this variation. Agricola makes it clear that a four-foot may only be used if one intends to play fast and rapid music (Faulkner 1997: 227).

The combination of 8', 4' and 2' flute-scaled stops is a very common registration found in almost any registration source. Silbermann supplies such a combination that is part of his "Lieblicher Flöten-Zug" for the organ of Grosshartmannsdorf (Kooiman, Weinberger & Busch 1995: 165):

*Oberwerk:* Gedackt 8' + Rohrflöte 4' + Gemshorn 2'

Kauffmann (1924: 38) gives a similar combination for the chorale prelude *Freu dich sehr, o meine Seele*:

Van Oortmerssen uses only principal-scaled registers for this variation. He uses the



Gedackt 8' + Flute octav 4' + Spitzflöte 4' or 2'

### Variation VIII

#### Registrations used by performers

##### Alain

###### RP

Prestant 8'

Fluit 4'

Waldfluit 2'

###### PED

Prestant 16'

Octaav 8'

Octaav 4'

##### Jacques van Oortmerssen

###### RP

Prestant 8'

###### PED

Prestant 16'

Octaav 8'

Alain chooses a light-textured registration on the *Rugpositief* and Pedal for this variation with its lively character and so-called *circulatio motif*. Due to the lack of an 8' Flute on the RP, the Prestant 8' is used as a foundation register.

Alain's Pedal combination is very much effective in the sense that is both surportive and fundamental in relation to the manual division. Werckmeister says that these open stops such as Principals (that are used by Alain) have the correct sharpness and are at the same time *gravitatisch* (Faulkner 1997: 215).

Van Oortmerssen uses only principal-scaled registers for this variation. By using this

combination on the Van Hagerbeer/Schnitger organ he brings out the excellent vocal qualities of these principals of 8' and 16' pitch. Vogel (Stauffer & May 1986: 32) points out that this concept of imitating the human voice is actually a Renaissance organ ideal. The Italian organ builders concentrated entirely on pipe sounds to imitate the human voice by developing only the *Principale* (8'), while the North Germans retained this quality mostly in the foundation principals at 16', 8' and 4' pitches.

## Variation IX

### Registrations used by performers

#### Alain

<u>GM (lh)</u>	<u>RP (rh)</u>	<u>PED (one octave lower)</u>
Prestant 8'	Prestant 8'	Octaav 4'
Octaav 4'	Fluit 4'	Trompet 4'
	Quintfluit 3'	Nachthoorn 2'

#### Jacques van Oortmerssen

<u>GM</u>	<u>RP (lh)</u>
Octaav 4'	Prestant 8'
	Quintadena 8'

<u>BW (rh)</u>	<u>PED</u>
Prestant 8'	Octaav 4'
Vox Humana 8'	

#### Coupler:

P/GM

Alain's right-hand combination is controversial in the fact that Adlung opposes the addition of a Quint in a registration unless it has a higher stop on top of it such as a two-foot (Faulkner 1997: 227). The two manuals nonetheless balance perfectly with each other.

Van Oortmerssen's right-hand combination is also of great importance. Firstly he combines a reed stop with a flue register as suggested by Agricola that a reed should never be used on its own. This is also to change the timbre of the reed and to muffle the rattle of this stop. (Faulkner 1997: 227.) Furthermore, the Vox Humana was a very popular reed in Bach's time and used in many combinations. Trost describes this stop as the "closest of all to the human voice, a [register] which demands great care so that it has its intended effect." (Faulkner 1997: 213; Owen 1997: 159.) Kauffmann also promotes the use of the Vox Humana and there are a few examples of his suggestion for the use of this register in his chorale preludes (Kauffmann 1924: 44 & 48):

Gelobet seist du, Jesu Christ (Alto modo):

*Oberwerk:* Vox humana + Salicional 8'

*Haupt-Manual:* Fagott, Quintadena 16' + Gemshorn 8' + Kleingedackt 4'

Herr Christ, der einge Gottes Sohn:

*Haupt-Werk:* Principal 8' + Vox Humana

*Ober-Werk:* Gemshorn + Gedackt 8'

*Pedal:* [-]

The most interesting aspect of the two organists' registration is the employing of a four-foot stop as the lowest sounding pitch in the Pedal division. Both Alain and Van Oortmerssen play the *cantus firmus* in the Pedal an octave lower for it to sound on an 8' basis. This situation is also evident in the six Schübler Chorales where the indication is "4 Fuß", which merely implies the chorale is in the tenor register (Faulkner 1997: 230).

Van Oortmerssen probably coupled the Octaav 4' of the *Groot manuaal* to the Pedal Octaav 4' to give it more body and depth.

### Variation X

#### Registrations used by performers

##### Alain

###### OW (lh)

Prestant 8'

Octaav 4'

Spitsfluit 3'

Superoctaav 2'

###### RP (rh)

Prestant 8'

Trompet 8'

Octaav 4'

Nasaat 3'

Superoctaav 2'

Quintanus 1 <sup>1</sup>/<sub>2</sub>'

###### HW (lh)

Prestant 8'

Octaav 4'

###### PED

Prestant 16'

Octaav 8'

Octaav 4'

##### Jacques van Oortmerssen

###### GM (lh)

Prestant 8'

Octaav 4'

###### RP (rh)

Prestant 8'

Fluit 4'

Nasaat 3'

Fagot 8'

###### PED

Prestant 16'

Octaav 8'

Octaav 4'

Nachthoorn 2'

Registrations used by performers

Alain interestingly uses three manuals for this variation in spite of the fact that Bach only indicates “*a 2 Clav. e Ped.*” The first seven bars are thus also treated as a division for two manuals and pedal with the *cantus firmus* entering in bar eight.

Alain and Van Oortmerssen’s solo combinations in the right-hand are examples of typical early Baroque consort registrations. This combination of reeds and flues, wide- and narrow-scaled stops, is also a practice of the late Renaissance and point to a long tradition of spicy and often bizarre sounds. According to Johann Kortkamp, Matthias Weckmann used a similar registration on the *Oberwerk* and *Positiv* in auditioning for the organist’s post at St. Jakobi, Hamburg in 1655 when he improvised on the chorale *An Wasserflüssen Babylon*. Kortkamp also states that the following combination was also a favourite registration used by Jacob Prætorius (Owen 1997: 80):

*Oberwerk:* Trommete 8'+ Zincke 8' + Hohlflaute 4' + Nassat 2 <sup>2</sup>/<sub>3</sub>' [3'] + Gemshorn 2'

*Positiv:* (“for the soft middle part”) Principals 8' and 4'

Both organists use the *Rugpositief* as a solo manual. The concept of using a secondary manual or specifically the *Positiv* for *cantus firmus* settings accompanied on the *Hauptwerk* is an age-old tradition. It was used well into the High Baroque and especially flourished in North Germany and the surrounding areas. (Owen 1997: 80.)

In both cases the vocal quality of the Pedal principals gives excellent foundation to the manuals even up to the four-foot and two-foot pitch.

## Variation XI

### Registrations used by performers

### Alain

#### PED

Principaal 22'

Prestant 16'

Rohrquint 12'

Octaav 8'

Octaav 4'

Ruyschpijp III

Mixtuur VIII

Basuin 16'

Trompet 8'

#### GM

Prestant 16'

Prestant 8'

Octaav 4'

Octaav 2'

Ruyschpijp II

Mixtuur VII

Trompet 16'

Viool de Gamba 8'

Trompet 4'

#### RP

Prestant 8'

Octaav 4'

Superoctaav 2'

Mixtuur VI

Sexquialtra II

Trompet 8'

#### Couplers:

PED/GM

RP/GM

### Jacques van Oortmerssen

#### GM

Prestant 16'

Prestant 8'

Prestantquint 6'

Octaav 4'

Quint 3'

Octaav 2'

Ruyschpijp II

Mixtuur VI

#### RP

Prestant 8'

Octaav 4'

Superoctaav 2'

Sexquialtra II

Mixtuur V-VI

Trompet 8'

#### PED

Principaal 22'

Prestant 16'

Rohrquint 12'

Octaav 8'

Quinta 6'

Octaav 4'

Nachthoorn 2'

Ruyschpijp III

Mixtuur VIII

Basuin 16'

## Trompet 8'

### Couplers:

PED/GM

RP/GM

Both organists use typical reed *plena* as suggested by Johann Mattheson (Owen 1997: 145). Alain however constructs a larger *plenum* than Van Oortmerssen by using most of the full-length reeds. Van Oortmerssen only employs the Trompet of the *Rugpositief*.

Both performers add considerable gravity to their *plena* by employing the Principaal 22' and the Rohrquint 12' of the Pedal as described by Adlung (Stauffer & May 1986: 199).

Both performers add third-sounding ranks to the *plenum* in the form of the Sexquialtra II of the *Rugpositief*. Johann Friedrich Walther in his guidelines for registration of the organ in the Garnisonkirche (1726) states that the thirds “gives the *plenum* a beautiful strength” (Faulkner 1997: 230).

Alain and Van Oortmerssen also make the *plenum* brighter by coupling the manuals and manual/Pedal as advised by Adlung (Stauffer & May 1986: 199).

## The Six Schübler Chorales

The six ‘Schübler Chorales’ are named after the engraver and publisher of the printed edition, Johann Georg Schübler. The title page of the edition reads: “Six Chorales of various kinds to be played as preludes on an organ with two manuals and Pedal, prepared by Johann Sebastian Bach, Royal Polish and Electoral Saxon Court Composer, Kapellmeister and Director of the *chourus musicus*, Leipzig. Published by Johann Georg Schübler at Zella in the Thuringian Forest.” Five of the six settings are movements composed earlier for the Leipzig Cantatas. These movements were very popular during

the time and Bach transcribed them for organ using the same procedure employed for the concertos by Italian composers. (Alain Vol. 14 1993: 26; Van Oortmerssen Vol. 3 1997: 7.)

<b>Alain</b>	Stiftskirche, Grauhof, Goslar Treutmannn (1737)	CD: Vol. 14
<b>Van Oortmerssen</b>	Trondheim Cathedral Wagner (1741)	CD: Vol. 3

## 5.8 Wachet auf, ruft uns die Stimme BWV 645

The indication in the title suggests ‘à 2 Clav: et Pedal, Canto fermo in Tenore’. This work is an arrangement of the fourth verset of Cantata 140, which is ‘Zion hört die Wächter singen’. The original is scored for a tenor with violins, viola and *basso continuo*. Bach’s registration indication only designates pipe lengths: “Dextra [right hand]: 8'; Sinistra [left hand]: 8'; Pedal: 16'.” (Alain Vol. 14 1993: 26; Owen 1997: 163; Van Oortmerssen Vol. 3 1997: 8.)

### Registrations used by performers

#### Alain

<u>HW</u>	<u>OW</u>	<u>PED</u>
Trommet 8'	Principal 8'	Principal 16'
Octava 4'	Octava 4'	Octava 8'

#### Van Oortmerssen



Registrations used by performers

<u>MAN I</u>	<u>MAN II</u>	<u>PED</u>
Principal 8'	Gedackt 8'	Subbass 16'
Trompete 8'	Principal 4'	Principal 8'
	Rohrflette 4'	

Both performers basically use more or less the same registration. The original work only has strings for the accompaniment, which may suggest the use of stops with string qualities. The Principal-based combination used by both organists in the subsidiary manual and the Pedal therefore qualifies perfectly to imitate the required timbre. The customary use of a powerful reed register such as the Trumpet for the solo part can be ascribed to the symbolism of the calling of the watchmen and probably also to imitate the tenor voice of the original work. Both performers use the Trompete 8' in combination with a flue register, adhering to the instruction of Agricola (Faulkner 1997: 232).

One of the combinations supplied by Lahm for a similar work as *Wachet auf*, asks for the following registration on the *Hauptwerk* (Faulkner 1997: 232):

Trompete 8' + Principal 8' [4'].

## 5.9 Wo soll ich fliehen hin/ Auf mienen lieben Gott BWV 646

The original cantata from which this work comes is no longer extant. Bach's original registration indication is '*à 2 Clav. et Pedal*' and calls for an 8' stop in the right hand, a 16' stop in the left hand and a 4' stop on the Pedal division.

### Registrations used by performers

#### Alain

<u>HW (lh)</u>	<u>HI (rh)</u>	<u>PED</u>
Principal 16'	Gedackt 8'	Schalmey 4'
Lieblich principal 8'	Principal 4'	

#### Van Oortmerssen

<u>MAN I (lh)</u>	<u>MAN II (rh)</u>	<u>PED</u>
Bordun 16'	Gedackt 8'	Octav 4'
Rohrflöte 8'	Rohrflette 4'	Cleron 4'
Spitzflöte 4'	Nasat 3'	
	Octav 2'	
	Tertia 1 <sup>3</sup> / <sub>5</sub> '	

The left-hand combinations used by the two performers show the clear influence of Kauffmann's registration guidelines, especially in the use of a sixteen-foot register. This, as mentioned before, was probably the influence of the *basso continuo* practice in the cantata settings of the day (Owen 1997: 160).

Van Oortmerssen's right-hand combination is interesting in the fact that he constructs a Cornet registration consisting of five ranks. Silbermann, Kauffmann and even Gronau supply combinations in which the highest pitch is a third-sounding rank such as the Tertia 1 <sup>3</sup>/<sub>5</sub>'. This was a registration favoured by Bach, and Agricola also mentions the following concerning this combination (Faulkner 1997: 232):

[...] an 8' Gedackt may be drawn with a Sesquialtera and a 1-foot Octave for rapid arpeggios. A Quint or a Terz must always have a

higher Octave or Superoctave on top of it. For example, if the Quint is 3-foot, then a 2-foot stop must be drawn together with an 8' and 4'

Alain and Van Oortmerssen both use a four-foot reed as solo stop in the Pedal division. Alain, however, ignores Agricola's advice that a reed should never be used on its own. (Faulkner 1997: 232.) Van Oortmerssen conforms to this advice.

### 5.10 Wer nur den lieben Gott läßt walten BWV 647

This work originates as a duet known as 'Er kennt die rechten Freudenstunden' written for soprano, alto, violins, viola, and *basso continuo*. It is the fourth movement from the cantata *Wer nur den lieben Gott läßt walten* BWV 93, which was performed on the 9<sup>th</sup> July 1724. Bach's original registration indication only specifies 'Pedale 4 Fuß' and there is no indication whether it should be played on one or two manuals. (Owen 1997: 163; Van Oortmerssen Vol. 3 1997: 8.)

#### Registrations used by performers

##### Alain

##### HI

Gedackt 8'

##### PED

Superoctava 4'

##### Van Oortmerssen

##### MAN I

Rohrflöte 8'

##### PED

Octav 4'

Both Alain and Van Oortmerssen use exactly the same registration as partially suggested by Bach for the Pedal division. In this instance the Pedal has the *cantus firmus* and Bach's indication merely suggests and places the chorale in the tenor. (Kooiman, Weinberger & Busch 1995: 182.)

The use of a principal-scaled stop by the organists is very much applicable seeing that the original work assigns the melody to the strings. The four-foot principal timbre of these two organs actually almost sound like strings.

### 5.11 Meine Seele erhebt den Herren BWV 648

The work is transcribed from the duet 'Er denkt der Barmherzigkeit' which is scored for alto, tenor, oboes, trumpet, and *basso continuo*. This work is found in the Cantata *Meine Seele erhebt den Herren* (BWV 10) that was composed for Sunday 2<sup>nd</sup> July 1724. The *cantus firmus* is located in the right hand with Bach's indication marked "dextra forte". (Owen 1997: 163; Van Oortmerssen Vol. 3 1997: 8.)

#### Registrations used by performers

##### Alain

<u>HW (lh)</u>	<u>OW (rh)</u>	<u>PED</u>
Viola di gamba 8'	Vox humana 8'	Soubbas 16'
Spitzflöte 8'	Octava 4'	Flachflöte 8'

##### Van Oortmerssen

<u>MAN I (rh)</u>	<u>MAN II (lh)</u>	<u>PED</u>
Principal 8'	Gedackt 8	Subbass 16'

Spitzflöte 4'	Rohrflette 4'	Principal 8'
Quinta 3'	Vox humana 8'	
Trompete 8'		

Interesting about the performers' combinations is the fact that both use the Vox humana, but in a different way. Alain employs this stop as a solo in combination with a flue register as instructed by Agricola. (Faulkner 1997: 232.) Van Oortmerssen on the other hand, use it as an accompaniment also in combination with other flue registers.

Van Oortmerssen's right-hand registration coincides with the statement made by Agricola saying (Faulkner 1997: 227): "A reed stop is also suitable to serve as a foundation for several high stops." This registration is also a typical North German consort combination which has come down to us as a legacy of the late 16<sup>th</sup> and early 17<sup>th</sup> centuries. (Stauffer & May 1986: 32.)

Alain's left-hand combination contains a Viola di Gamba. String tone was very popular in the 18<sup>th</sup> century probably because of the influence of the Baroque orchestra on pipe sounds in Thuringian organs of Bach's time. (Faulkner 1997: 214.)

## 5.12 Ach bleib bei uns, Herr Jesu Christ BWV 649

There are no directions given beyond '*à 2 Clav. et Pedal.*' The original setting is the third movement for soprano, violincello piccolo, and *basso continuo* from the Cantata with the same name, BWV 6. It was composed for Easter Monday, 1725. (Van Oortmerssen Vol. 3 1997: 8.)

### Registrations used by performers

#### Alain

<u>HW (lh)</u>	<u>OW (rh)</u>	<u>PED</u>
Lieblich principal 8'	Rohrflöte 8'	Soubbas 16'
Octava 4'	Octava 4'	Octava 8'
	Sesquialtera II	

### Van Oortmerssen

<u>MAN I</u>	<u>MAN II</u>	<u>PED</u>
Rohrflöte 8'	Gedackt 8'	Subbass 16'
Spitzflöte 4'	Rohrflöte 4'	Principal 8'
	Vox humana 8'	
Schwebung		

Interesting about the two organists' combinations is the registration in the right hand. Alain employs a Cornet registration that was favoured by Bach and also advised by Agricola to be used as a solo combination. (Faulkner 1997: 232.)

Van Oortmerssen uses a reed solo that is a typical Kauffmann registration for such a work. He also heeds to Agricola's suggestion that a reed should not be used alone. (Faulkner 1997: 232.) Trost stated that the Vox humana is the "closest of all to the human voice" when he heard the organ in the Altenburg Castle in 1733 (Owen 1997: 159) and therefore Van Oortmerssen's registration is closer to the original.

### **5.13 Kommst du nun, Jesu, vom Himmel herunter BWV 650**

This work is transcribed from the second movement of the Cantata *Lobe den Herren, der alles so herrlich regieret* (BWV 137). It is a three part aria for alto, solo violin, and *basso continuo*. The cantata was first performed on 19<sup>th</sup> August 1725.

### Registrations used by performers

#### Alain

<u>HI (rh)</u>	<u>HW (lh)</u>	<u>PED</u>
Gedackt 8'	Spitzflöte 8'	Schalmey 4'
Flöte travers 4'	Octava 4'	
Waldtflöte 2'		

#### Van Oortmerssen

<u>MAN I (lh)</u>	<u>MAN II (rh)</u>	<u>PED</u>
Principal 8'	Gedackt 8'	Octav 4'
	Rohrflöte 4'	

An interesting aspect about the combinations of the two organists is that both use different stops for the *cantus firmus* in the Pedal. Alain once again discards the advice given by Agricola regarding the use of reeds. Van Oortmerssen employs a four-foot principal as was used in BWV 647 to bring out the “human” quality of this register and therefore to imitate the voice.

Alain’s right-hand registration was a favoured combination that was used by Kauffmann in many of his chorale preludes such as *Ein feste burg is unser Gott* and *Helfft mir Gottes Güte preisen*. (Kauffmann 1924: 26 & 46.)

### **5.14 Wir glauben all’ an einen Gott, Vater BWV 740**

There is no surviving autograph of this work in Bach’s own hand. There is however still widespread uncertainty as to who the actual composer of this work is. Some scholars

ascribe the work to Johann Ludwig Krebs (1713-1780). One 19<sup>th</sup> century copy mentions Bach as the composer and other editions attributes it either to Krebs or Bach. The chorale melody is in the soprano accompanied by four voices, including two parts in the Pedal, which reminds one of the compositional style of *An Wasserflüssen Babylon* BWV 653a. (Alain Vol. 9 1991: 28; Van Oortmerssen Vol. 4 1997: 7.)

### Registrations used by performers

Alain Grote St. Laurenskerk, Alkmaar CD: Vol. 9  
 Van Hagerbeer/Schnitger (1646/1725)

<u>GM (lh)</u>	<u>RP (rh)</u>	<u>PED</u>
Viool de Gamba 8'	Trompet 8'	Octaav 8'
Octaav 4'		

Van Oortmerssen Bovenkerk, Kampen CD: Vol. 4  
 Hinsz (1743)

<u>HW (rh)</u>	<u>BW I (lh)</u>	<u>PED</u>
Prestant 8'	Prestant 8'	Octaaf 8'
Fluit 4'	Vox humana 8'	Octaaf 4'
Quint 3'		
Trompet 8'		

Alain and Van Oortmerssen's Pedal registrations are typical for a chorale prelude of this style that contains two separate parts for this division. Both use an eight-foot as the lowest sounding pitch. Van Oortmerssen's combination of eight- and four-foot principals in the Pedal was a combination that was favoured even by early composers and authors such as Arnold Schlick. In describing the ideal stops and combinations for an organ in



1511, Schlick states the following (Owen 1997: 24-25): “Principal 8' and Octave 4' in the Pedal, or Octave alone”, as used by both Alain and Van Oortmerssen. Samuel Scheidt in his *Tabulatura Nova* of 1624 suggests an alternative way to play four-part works. He says that the soprano can be played on the *Hauptwerk*, the alto on the *Rückpositiv*, and most importantly, both the tenor and bass on the Pedal, provided that the tenor does not go higher than middle C. (Owen 1997: 79.)

Alain uses only the Trompet 8' for the right-hand. Van Oortmerssen's right-hand combination is a typical consort registration as defined and described by Harald Vogel (Stauffer & May 1986:32). Van Oortmerssen is also following Agricola's advice whereby a reed stop is suitable to serve as a foundation for several higher stops that can be used as a solo. (Faulkner 1997: 227.) This combination also has similarities to the *Oberwerk* registration that was used by Matthias Weckmann for the audition as organist at St. Jakobi, Hamburg in 1655 (Owen 1997:80):

*Oberwerk:* Trommete 8' + Zinke 8' + Hohlflaute 4' + Nassat 3' + Gemshorn 2'

Van Oortmerssen's right-hand registration combines a reed with a flue, thus following the advice given by Agricola (Faulkner 1997:227). As mentioned before, the Viool di Gamba on the Van Hagerbeer/ Schnitger organ is not a string register but rather a reed built in the style of a kind of regal that was popular in Italy and Spain from c.1750. (Williams & Owen 1988: 290.) Van Oortmerssen uses the common combination of the Vox Humana plus a Prestant that was suggested by Kauffmann in many of his chorale preludes. (Kauffmann 1924: 44 & 48.) Van Oortmerssen is also conforming to Agricola's advice of a reed stop being used with a flue register (Faulkner 1997: 227). Interestingly, both Alain and Van Oortmerssen use a reed combination in the accompaniment.

### 5.15 Wo soll ich fliehen hin BWV 694

This work was formerly part of the so-called Kirnberger Collection. It is written as a trio with an ostinato and syncopated rhythms. This work is not preserved in an autograph copy and was probably written before 1708.

#### Registrations used by performers

Alain Freiberg Domkirche, Allemagne CD: Vol. 3  
 Silbermann (1714)

<u>HW (lh)</u>	<u>BW (rh)</u>	<u>PED</u>
Rohrflöte 8'	Gedackt 8'	Octavbaß 8'
Octava 4'	Rohrflöte 4'	Octavbaß 4'
	Quinta 1 ½'	

Van Oortmerssen Bovenkerk, Kampen CD: Vol. 4  
 Hinsz (1743)

<u>HW</u>	<u>RW (lh)</u>	<u>BW I (rh)</u>
Bourdon 16'	Prestant 8'	Quintadeen 8'
Holpijp 8'	Holpijp 8'	Roerfluit 8'
Octaaf 4'		Woudfluit 4'

Coupler:  
 PED/HW

combination he discards the *Äqualstimmenverbot* that was advised by writers such as Werckmeister and Niedt whereby “fat” and “thin” stops are not to be combined (Stuifbergen & Schouten 1980: 106). This combination, however, can be found in the registration combinations for the organ in St. Leonhard’s Church in Zoutleeuw from about 1620 (Owen 1997: 71): “Principal 8’ and Holpyp 8’, with or without the Tremulant.”

Alain constructs a so-called gapped registration in the right-hand combination. Adlung is cautious about such registrations especially if they contain mutation stops. Agricola also does not favour this, but approves of its use in the context of a trio. (Faulkner 1997: 230.)

Alain’s Pedal registration is similar to the indications given by Arnold Schlick for this division (Owen 1997: 25): “Principal 8’ and Octave 4’ in the Pedal, ...” Van Oortmerssen makes use of a similar registration suggested by Kauffmann (1924: 44) for the chorale prelude *Gottes sohn ist kommen*. Kauffmann uses the registers of the HW coupled to the Pedal for this combination:

Quintadena 16’ + Spillfeife 8’ + Octave 4’.

## CHAPTER 6

### CONCLUSION

Wilfrid Mellers (1980: 307) states that authenticity in all its aspects is a complex ideal. It has two related aspects: one that has to do with what is known of historical evidence, while the other respects a given sequence of musical events. The two aspects may coincide, but need not. When they don't, it must be music that makes history, not the other way round.

Bach in his music offers the greatest challenge precisely because his art is least rigidly tied to a specific epoch. His position in European music history is regarded as crucial because, while firmly rooted in the Baroque, he took from a remote medieval past and consequently anticipated a future which is typical nineteenth-century Romanticism. (Mellers 1980: 307.)

Registration in itself is as old as the earliest known organ music and relates to the handling of a specific instrument and in particular to the organ in relation to a specific stylistic era. Style is therefore the hall-mark of a good performance and in terms of registration is the manner of expression characteristic to an organ of a specific period.

In each of the fifteen works discussed, analysed and compared both organists' performances tend to be a definite revelation. They perform Bach's music using the resources available and are not afraid to make adaptations in terms of registration.

Their existing and growing knowledge of historical performance practices have contributed immensely to the writer's personal understanding of Bach and his music. In

his closing statements Mellers (1980: 307) states: “Without historical knowledge sensitivity may mislead; but without sensitivity historical knowledge is impotent.”

Alain and Van Oortmerssen’ registrations are clearly based on a thorough knowledge and following the guidelines supplied by composers, theoreticians and organ builders as discussed in this thesis. They both implement fundamental principals of registrations in its entirety and more specific in relation to the contemporary suggestions and advice of Bach and his contemporaries.

In some instances Van Oortmerssen tends to be too dogmatic and rigid in his approach to registration as advised and suggested by theoreticians and composers such as Adlung and Kauffmann. Alain is more flexible and tends to let the music and most importantly, the instrument guide and decide for her. She shows greater respect for the instruments in this way and sometimes astonishes us with the results, however unorthodox it may seem theoretically. Forkel (Faulkner 1997: 233) tells us of Bach’s unorthodox registrations saying “Such observations [on acoustics] could and naturally did lead him to attempt to produce, by the unusual combination of different stops of the organ, effects unknown before and after him.”

In her unrelenting desire to learn and grow in the understanding and implementing of historical performance practices, Alain shows to be more experienced in her selection of registers. In the light of Alain’s vision of a performer, it is understandable why she believes that each performance is a creative work in its own right (Alain 1996:98). Considering her previous complete recordings of Bach’s organ works of 1960 and 1978, she has obviously put in much work and devotion over the years in an act of recovery and rediscovery.

Van Oortmerssen has the gift to bring out and clarify , with thoroughly researched registration, the complexity of texture and polyphony in the organ music of Bach. This is especially evident in the free works. He possesses an outstanding metrical precision completed with gracious and sometimes delicate registration to bring about the desired

*affekt*. His registration also amplifies a collaboration of vertical density with horizontal independence.

APPENDIX A

It is an arguable fact that both Marie-Claire Alain and Jacques van Oortmerssen approach the music of Bach with a romantically passionate humanity. Both organists have a streak of genius as far beyond intelligence as Bach's art is beyond his superlative craft.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

WORKS CONSULTED

- STU 20601 - BACH, J. S. *Prelude in G major BWV 825*  
 Liban Chamber Soloists recorded in France  
 1961
- STU 20602 - BACH, J. S. *3-part Invention BWV 779*  
 Chamber orchestra directed by J. Boulet 1961
- STU 20603 - MOZART, W. A. *Sonata in E-flat major BWV 595*  
 Chamber orchestra directed by P. Koenig 1961
- STU 20604 - COULENC, F. *Chaconne in G minor for organ, BWV 562*  
 Organ by Gonzalez, Chamber orchestra directed by J. Martineau 1970
- STU 20605 - SAINT-SAENS, C. *Symphonic 2* Organ by Gonzalez, Chamber Orchestra  
 Paris L. Orff orchestra directed by J. Martineau  
 1965.

APPENDIX A

SELECTED DISCOGRAPHY OF MARIE-CLAIRE ALAIN

ERATO:

MUSIQUE CONCERTANTE

- STE 50 074/77 HAENDEL, G.F. *Première Intégrale.* Organ of Notre-Dame-du-Liban. Chamber orchestra directed by J.-F. Paillard. 1961.
- STE 71097/101 HAENDEL, G.F. *Seconde Intégrale.* Organ of Saint-Donat Chamber orchestra directed by J.-F. Paillard. 1976.
- STU 70159/60 MOZART, W.A. *Sonates d'Église.* Organ by Haerpfher-Erman Chamber orchestra directed by P. Kuentz. 1958.
- STU 70637 POULENC, F. *Concerto in G minor for organ and orchestra.* Organ by Gonzalez. L'Ortf orchestra directed by J. Martinon. 1970.
- STU 70631 SAINT-SAËNS, C. *Symphonie 3.* Organ by Gonzalez, Maison Radio, Paris. L'Ortf orchestra directed by J. Martinon. 1965.

MUSIC OF THE FRENCH CLASSICAL SCHOOL

- DF-172 COUPERIN, F. *Messe des Paroisses.* Organ of Saint-Merry, Paris. 1956.
- DF-173 GRIGNY, N. De *Cinq Hymnes.* Organ of Saint-Merry, Paris. 1955.
- STE 50296 GRIGNY, N. De *Livre d'orgue.* Clicquot organ in Sarlat. 1955.
- EDO 254 GUILAIN, J.A. *Intégrale des 4 Suites de pièces pour le Magnificat.* Valtrin-Calliner-Scwenkedel organ in Belfort. 1972.
- STU 70949 MARCHAND, L. *Livre d'orgue.* Lefebure organ of Caudebec-en-Caux. 1975.
- LDE 3336 *LES GRANDES  
PAGES DE  
L'ORGUE  
FRANÇAIS.* Clicquot organ in Sarlat. 1964.

MUSIQUE BAROQUE ALLEMANDE

- STU 70030 BACH, J.S. *Première Intégrale.* Organs in Denmark, Suède & Allemagne. 19 volumes. 1959-1967.
- 2292-45732-2 BACH, J.S. *Deuxième Intégrale.* Organs in France, Suisse & Denmark. 5 volumes. 1978-1980.
- 4509-96358-2 BACH, J.S. *Troisième Intégrale.* Bach on historic organs in Allemagne, Netherlands & France. 14 volumes. 1985, 1990-1993.



- EDO 257/58 BÖHM, G. *Intégrale*. Marcussen organ in Viborg. Andersen organ in Nyborg. 1973.
- EDO 256 BRUHNS, N. *Première Intégrale*. Marcussen organ in Viborg. 1973.
- 2292-45665-2 LÜBECK, V. *Praeludia & Partitas*. Alfred Kern organ in Masevaux. 1990.
- EDO 260 TUNDER, F. *Praeludia & Chorales*. Marcussen organ in the Laurenskerk, Rotterdam. 1974.
- EDO 228/29 WALTHER, J.G. *14 Concerto transcriptions*. Haerper-Erman organ of Saint-Quentin. 1970.

MUSIQUE ROMANTIQUE, SYMPHONIQUE ET CONTEMPORAINE

- EDO 250/2 ALAIN, J. *Première Intégrale*. Valtrin-Callinet-Schwenkedel organ in Belfort. 1972.
- 4509-95538-2 BOËLLMANN, L. *Suite Gothique*. Cavallé-Coll organ of Saint-Sulpice. 1993.
- STU 71035/37 FRANCK, C. *Première Intégrale*. Cavallé-Coll organ of Saint-François-de-Sales, Lyon. 1976.
- 50011 LISZT, F. *Prelude & Fugue on B.A.C.H.* Haerper-Erman organ in Friedrichstal. 1958.
- 75503 MESSIAEN, O. *La Nativité du Seigneur; Le Banquet céleste;*

*Apparition de l'Église éternelle.* Kuhn organ in the Hofkirche, Lucerne. 1988.

2292-45485-2 VIERNE, L.

*Symphonies.* Cavallé-Coll organ of Saint-Étienne, Caen. 1989.

0630-15343-2 WIDOR, C.-M.

*Symphonies.* Cavallé-Coll organ of Saint-Étienne, Caen. 1989

VANGUARD CLASSICS

- 9501-15 Bach Organ Works Vol. I
- 9501-20 Bach Organ Works Vol. II
- 9501-25 Bach Organ Works Vol. III
- 9501-30 Bach Organ Works Vol. IV
- 9501-35 Bach Organ Works Vol. V

- 9501-40 Bach Chamber Organs
- 9501-45 Romantic masterpieces

HPD

- 470 The organ of San Lorenzo, Rotterdam
- 471 W.A. Mozart
- 472 F. Bréval complete organ works
- 473 J.S.B. Bach complete organ works

DINON

**APPENDIX B**

**DISCOGRAPHY OF JACQUES VAN OORTMERSSEN**

**VANGUARD CLASSICS:**

- 99101 J.S. Bach Organ Works Vol. I  
99102 J.S. Bach Organ Works Vol. II  
99103 J.S. Bach Organ Works Vol. III  
99104 J.S. Bach Organ Works Vol. IV  
99105 J.S. Bach Organ Works Vol. V

- 99060 Dutch Chamber Organs  
99207 French Romantic master pieces

**BIS:**

- 316 The organ of Sint Lambertus, Helmond  
418 W.A. Mozart  
479 J. Brahms complete organ works  
569 C.P.E. Bach complete organ works

**DENON:**

- 38C37-7024 J.P. Sweelinck organ works  
38C37-7120 St. Nicolas, Kampen  
33C37-7376 Bach at Waalse Kerk, Amsterdam  
33C37-7492 St. Cosmae, Stade

**ASTORIA:**

- 90003 Organ Works

**IMPOGRAM:**

- 95045 Organ Works

## SOURCES

- ALAIN, M-C. 1996. *L'Orgue. Cahiers et Mémoires*. Paris: AZ & Vous Gravure.
- BADURA-SKODA, P. 1993. *Interpreting Bach at the Keyboard*. Translated by Alfred Clayton. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- BOYD, M. 1995. Bach. In *Master Musicians*. Edited by Stanley Sadie. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- CLUTTON, C. & NILAND, A. 1982. *The British Organ*. London: Eyre Methuen.
- DAVIDSSON, H. 1990. *Matthias Weckmann: the Interpretation of his Organ Music*. Volume I. Doctoral dissertation. School of Music and Musicology, University of Göteborg, Sweden. Stockholm: AB Carl Gehrman's Musikförlag.
- DOUGLASS, F. 1995. *The Language of the Classical French Organ. A musical tradition before 1800*. New Haven and London: Yale University Press.
- FAULKNER, Q. 1997. J.S. Bach (1685-1750). Basic Organ Works. Volume II. In *Historical Organ Techniques and Repertoire. An historical survey of Organ Performance Practice and Repertoire*. Massachusetts: Wayne Leopold Editions, Inc.

- JONGEPIER, J. 1987. *Het Van Hagerbeer/Schnitger-orgel in de Grote-of St Laurenskerk te Alkmaar*. Alkmaar: Alkmaar Drukkerij Ter Burg BV.
- KAUFFMANN, G.F. 1924. *Harmonische Seelenlust*. Edited by P. Pidoux. Kassel: Bärenreiter.
- KOOIMAN, E. 1992. *Uitvoeringspraktijk voor organisten*. Baarn: Gooi & Sticht.
- KOOIMAN, E., WEINBERGER, G., BUSCH, H. 1995. *Zur Interpretation der Orgelmusik Johann Sebastian Bachs*. Kassel: Edition Merseburger.
- LAMPRECHT, G.P. 1978. *Vertolkings van Johann Sebastian Bach se vrye orrelwerke. 'n Stylkritiese analise van bestaande plaatopnames en Bach-edisies*. M.Mus. thesis. University of the Orange Free State.
- LAMPRECHT, G.P. 1995. *Notes on Organ Registration*. Unpublished.
- MELLERS, W. 1980. *Bach and the dance of God*. London and Boston: Faber & Faber Limited.
- NEWMAN, A. 1995. *Bach and the Baroque. European Source Materials from the Baroque and Early Classical Periods with Special Emphasis on the Music of J.S. Bach*. New York: Pendragon Press.
- OWEN, B. 1997. *The Registration of Baroque Organ Music*. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press.

- STAUFFER, G. & MAY, E. 1986. *J.S. Bach as Organist. His instruments, music, and performance practices.* Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- STINSON, R. 1999. *Bach. The Orgeibüchlein.* New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- STUIFBERGEN, L. & SCHOUTEN, H. 1980. *Voordracht en Registratie der Orgelliteratuur.* Naarden: A.J.G. Strengholt's Boeken BV.
- WILLIAMS, P. 1980. *The Organ Music of J.S. Bach.* Two volumes. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- WILLIAMS, P. & OWEN, B. 1988. *The Organ.* London: Macmillan.
- WILLS, A. 1984. Organ. In *Yehudi Menuhin Music Guides.* London and Sydney: Macdonald & Co.
- WOLFF, C. 1991. *Bach. Essays on his life and music.* Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- YEARSLEY, D. 1998. The Organ Music of J.S. Bach. In *The Cambridge Companion to the Organ.* Edited by N. Thistlethwaite and G. Webber. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- BACH, J.S. *Complete Organ Works Volume VI. Clavier Übung 1-11*  
BWV 669-679 Canon Variations BWV 769 Preludes 2

## DISCOGRAPHY

### Recordings by Marie-Claire Alain

All cover notes by Marie-Claire Alain, translated by Stewart Spencer.

- BACH, J.S.            *Complete Organ Works*. Volume I. Preludes & Fugues BWV 548, 544. Chorale Preludes BWV 662-664. Played on the Schnitger organ of the Martinikerk, Groningen. Erato 4509-96718-2. 1985
- BACH, J.S.            *Complete Organ Works*. Volume II. *Orgelbüchlein* BWV 618-632. Toccata and Fugue BWV 538. Played on the Silbermann organ of the Domkirche, Freiberg. Erato 4509-96719-2. 1991
- BACH, J.S.            *Complete Organ Works*. Volume III. Preludes & Fugues BWV 539 and 551. Partita BWV 767. Played on the Silbermann organ of the Domkirche, Freiberg. Erato 4509-96720-2. 1991
- BACH, J.S.            *Complete Organ Works*. Volume IV. Preludes & Fugues BWV 531 and 533. Chorale Preludes BWV 724-739. Played on the Silbermann organ of the Georgenkirche, Rötha. Erato 4509-96721-2. 1991
- BACH, J.S.            *Complete Organ Works*. Volume V. Preludes & Fugues BWV 537 and 549. Chorale Preludes BWV 690-721. Played on the Silbermann organ of the Georgenkirche, Rötha. Erato 4509-96722-2. 1991
- BACH, J.S.            *Complete Organ Works*. Volume VI. *Clavier Übung* Part III BWV 669-679. Canonic Variations BWV 769. Preludes &



- BACH, J.S. Fugues BWV 547 and 552. Played on the Schnitger organ of the Martinikerk, Groningen. Erato 4509-96723-2. 1985
- BACH, J.S. *Complete Organ Works*. Volume VII. *Clavier Übung* Part III BWV 680-689. Fugue BWV 552. Played on the Schnitger organ of the Martinikerk, Groningen. Erato 4509-96724-2. 1990
- BACH, J.S. *Complete Organ Works*. Volume VIII. Preludes & Fugues BWV 534 and 546. *Orgelbüchlein* BWV 633-644. Partita BWV 768. Played on the Van Hagerbeer/Schnitger organ of the St. Laurenskerk, Alkmaar. Erato 4509-96725-2. 1990
- BACH, J.S. *Complete Organ Works*. Volume IX. *Orgelbüchlein* BWV 599-617. *Pièce d'Orgue* BWV 572. Played on the Van Hagerbeer/Schnitger organ of the St. Laurenskerk, Alkmaar. Erato 4509-96742-2. 1991
- BACH, J.S. *Complete Organ Works*. Volume X. Prelude & Fugue BWV 532. Chorale Preludes BWV 651-661. Played on the Van Hagerbeer/Schnitger organ of the St. Laurenskerk, Alkmaar. Erato 4509-96743-2. 1990
- BACH, J.S. *Complete Organ Works*. Volume XI. Preludes & Fugues BWV 536 and 550. Concertos BWV 592-596. Played on the Kern organ of the l'Eglise Saint-Martin, Masevaux. Erato 4509-96744-2. 1992
- BACH, J.S. *Complete Organ Works*. Volume XII. Fantasia and Fugue BWV 542. Toccatas BWV 565 and 564. Played on the Müller organs of the St. Bavokerk, Haarlem and the Jakobijnekerk, Leeuwarden. Erato 4509-96745-2. 1993

BACH, J.S. *Complete Organ Works*. Volume XIII. The Six Trio Sonatas BWV 525-530. Played on the Schnitger organ of the AA-kerk, Groningen. Erato 4509-96746-2. 1993

BACH, J.S. *Complete Organ Works*. Volume XIV. The Schübler Chorales BWV 645-650. Passacaglia BWV 582. Played on the Treutman organ of the Stiftskirche in Grauhof, Goslar. Erato 4509-96747-2. 1993

### Recordings by Jacques van Oortmerssen

All cover notes by Dr. Paul Peeters, translations by Andrew McCrea (English), Anne Faulborn (German), and Vincent Dequevauviller (French).

BACH, J.S. *Organ Works*. Volume I. Played on the Müller organ of the Waalse Kerk, Amsterdam. Vanguard Classics 99101. 1994.

BACH, J.S. *Organ Works*. Volume II. Played on the historic organ of Roskilde Cathedral. Vanguard Classics 99102. 1995.

BACH, J.S. *Organ Works*. Volume III. Played on the Wagner organ of Trondheim Cathedral. Vanguard Classics 99103. 1997.

BACH, J.S. *Organ Works*. Volume IV. Played on the Hinsz organ of the Bovenkerk, Kampen. Vanguard Classics 99104. 1997.

BACH, J.S. *Organ Works*. Volume V. Played on the Van Hagerbeer/Schnitger organ of the St. Laurenskerk, Alkmaar. Vanguard Classics 99105. 1998.