

CHAPTER 5

ANALYSIS AND COMPARISON OF REGISTRATIONS USED BY PERFORMERS

FREE ORGAN WORKS

5.1 Toccata in D minor BWV565

This is an early work, probably written in Weimar or even in Arnstadt before 1706. Bach had just returned from Lübeck to hear the famous organist, Dietrich Buxtehude (c.1637-1707). The work has unfortunately not been preserved in Bach's own hand explaining the different titles under which it is known, e.g. 'Toccata' or 'Toccata con Fuga pedaliter'. It is the only genre of Bach's organ music in this style and comparable works cannot be found during this period. (Alain Vol. 12 1993: 21; Van Oortmerssen Vol. 4 1997: 6.) According to Krummacher (Stauffer & May 1986: 167) the work consists of a tripartite form in the style of a typical North German toccata: a virtuosic introduction, a fugue based on a simple subject and a free Recitativo. Lamprecht (1978: 55-56) writes that the overall character of the work is based on seriousness, as noted in the key, which is associated with greatness and dedication.

Registrations used by the performers

Alain

St Bavokerk, Haarlem

CD: Vol. 12

Müller 1738

HW

Praestant 16'
Octaaf 8'
Roerfluit 8'
Octaaf 4'
Quint Praestant 3'
Mixtuur IV-VI
Scherp VI-VII
Trompet 16'
Trompet 8'
Trompet 4'

RP

Praestant 8'
Octaaf 4'
Super Octaaf 2'
Mixtuur VI-VIII

BW

Quintadeen 16'
Praestant 8'
Octaaf 4'
Mixtuur IV-VI
Cymbel III

PEDAL

Praestant 16'
Octaaf 8'
Octaaf 4'
Mixtuur VI-X
Bazuin 32'
Trompet 16'
Trompet 8'
Trompet 4'

Couplers

BW/HW
RP/HW
RP/Pedal

Fugue

HW

Praestant 8'

RP

Praestant 8'

PEDAL

Praestant 16'

Octaaf 8'	Octaaf 4'	Octaaf 8'
Roerfluit 8'	Super Octaaf 2'	Octaaf 4'
Octaaf 4'	Mixtuur VI-VIII	Mixtuur VI-X
Quint Praestant 3'		Trompet 16'
Scherp VI-VII		

Couplers

RP/HW

RP/Pedal

Measure 127: same registration as Toccata

Van Oortmerssen

Bovenkerk, Kampen

CD: Vol. 4

Hinsz 1743

<u>HW</u>	<u>RW</u>	<u>PEDAL</u>
Prestant 16'	Prestant 8'	Prestant 16'
Prestant 8'	Octaaf 4'	Subbas 16'
Holpijp 8'	Octaaf 2'	Octaaf 8'
Octaaf 4'	Mixtuur III-IV	Gedakt 8'
Quint 3'		Roerquint 6'
Superoctaaf 2'		Octaaf 4'
Mixtuur III-V		Open fluit 2'
Scherp III		Bazuin 16'
Tertiaan II		Trompet 8'
Trompet 8'		Cornet 4'

Couplers

HW/RW

HW/Pedal

Bar 30

<u>HW</u>	<u>BWI (Echoes)</u>	<u>PED</u>
Prestant 16'	Prestant 8'	Prestant 16'
Prestant 8'	Octaaf 4'	Subbas 16'
Holpijp 8'	Scherp III	Octaaf 8'
Octaaf 4'		Gedakt 8'
Quint 3'		Roerquint 6'
Superoctaaf 2'		Octaaf 4'
Mixtuur III-V		Open fluit 2'
Scherp III		Trompet 8'

Bar 127

<u>HW</u>	<u>RW</u>	<u>PED</u>
Prestant 16'	Prestant 8'	Prestant 16'
Prestant 8'	Octaaf 4'	Subbas 16'
Holpijp 8'	Octaaf 2'	Octaaf 8'
Octaaf 4'	Mixtuur III-IV	Gedakt 8'
Quint 3'		Roerquint 6'
Superoctaaf 2'		Octaaf 4'
Mixtuur III-V		Open Fluit 2'
Scherp III		Bazuin 16'
Tertiaan II		Trompet 8'
Trompet 8'		

Couplers

HW/RW compound registers added to the principal stops. These registers are found in many German organs of the time, namely the Mixtur (III-X ranks) and the compound registers, e.g. Cornet, Schattl, Scherp, etc. usually II III ranks.

Both Alain and Van Oortmerssen employ a non-typical German “reed *plenum*” as described by Agricola whereby full-scaled reeds are added to the normal *Organo pleno* (Owen 1997: 167). Alain uses all available reeds on the HW and therefore conforms with Agricola’s guideline (Faulkner 1997: 227): “To this [the full organ] one may add the Trompets 16', 8', and 4', if they are in good tune.” Van Oortmerssen only uses the Trompet 8' on the HW of the Hinsz organ, although he has a 16' reed at his disposal. According to Faulkner (1997: 229) Agricola was the first author of registration sources to suggest the inclusion of the manual reeds to the *plenum* and also mentions that Bach was “a great friend of the reeds”. This practice is totally in contrast to the instructions of both Mattheson and Adlung (Stauffer & May 1986: 199). The difference between the normal Baroque “mixture *plenum*” and the “reed *plenum*” as documented by Agricola (used by the performers), are much like the difference between the *Plein Jeu* and the *Grand Jeu* of the French Classical School of the same period (Owen 1997: 145). Harald Vogel states the following in terms of the reed *plenum* (Owen 1997: 143):

Because of the great blending quality of the North German reeds, they can be registered not only singly but also in combination with principals or flutes or in the plenum. This arrangement applies equally to the reeds with full-length resonators (Trompet, Posaune, Schalmey, Cornet) and to those with half-length [resonators] (Regal, Krummhorn, Dulcian, Vox Humana). In a reed plenum (based on a low-pitched reed stop such as the Trompet 16' or 8' or the Dulcian 16', with the principal chorus including the mixture), each individual voice in the polyphony retains its identity much more than in a pure principal plenum.

The two *plena* on the HW that are used in BWV 565 also consist of the addition of the two normal compound registers added to the principal chorus. These registers are found on almost every German organ of the time, namely the Mixtur (III-X ranks) and a smaller compound register, e.g. Cimbel, Scharff, Scherp, etc. usually II-III ranks.

In each instance the *Rugpositief/Rugwerk* serves as a secondary manual coupled to the main manual, i.e. to the *Hoofdwerk* to add brilliance to the plenum. In this case Agricola suggests (Faulkner 1997: 227): “It is indeed possible to couple to it [the full organ] a second manual on which the full organ is likewise drawn.” Both performers’ registration on the secondary manual consists of the normal smaller version of the main *Hoofdwerk plenum* usually based on an 8', i.e. Prestant 8', Octaaf 4', Super Octaaf 2' and Mixtuur.

Van Oortmerssen uses a Tertiaan II to compliment the powerful 8' Trompet of the Hinsz organ. According to Johann Friedrich Walther in his guidelines for registration for the organ in the Garnisonkirche (1726), the thirds “gives the plenum a beautiful strength” (Faulkner 1997: 230). Alain on the other hand omits the Tertiaan II on the *Hoofdwerk*. She could probably be adhering to Gottfried Silbermann’s guidelines intended for the organs of Grosshartmannsdorf and Fraureuth (1741/1742), which is the only known registration sources that excludes third-sounding ranks from the *plenum*. This practice is perhaps the result of the training that Silbermann received in France and Alsace, when wide-scaled cornets and narrow-scaled principals were not used together (Faulkner 1997: 230; Owen 1997: 170-171). Mixtures containing third-ranks were built by Central German craftsmen such as Sterzing, Finke, Trost and Thielemann, a characteristic of the organs in the Thuringian area. Bach tested and approved many of the instruments created by these organ builders. It can therefore be deduced that some of the organs Bach played made the omitting of thirds in the *Organo pleno* impossible. It is also known that Werckmeister considered the third as an essential part of the *Organo pleno* (Faulkner 1997: 230).

In the Pedal division both performers employ a full *plenum* for the first and last Toccata section. This resembles the teaching of both Mattheson and Adlung (Stauffer & May 1986: 200):

- the principal chorus of all pitches and Mixtures are used;
- reed stops of all pitches (including 32' stops) are used.

It is interesting that Alain couples the RP to the Pedal. This was probably not necessary seeing that the Müller organ has a totally independent Pedal division with sufficient brilliance in the Mixtuur VI-X. In Van Oortmerssen's case the HW had to be coupled to the Pedal because of the absence of a compound register on the Pedal of the Hinsz organ. In the fugal section he however creates a totally independent Pedal against the full HW *plenum*, which balances perfectly. The coupling of manual to Pedal is supported by Adlung's instructions saying (Stauffer & May 1986: 199):

Sometimes one employs voices in the Pedal, such as the Octave 4' and 2' and perhaps Mixtures, too. If the organ does not have such stops, then one can bring manual registers into the Pedal through the use of the coupler.

Most of the larger organs in Holland had a Pedal division of significant size, and was a "perculiary Lutheran phenomenon" with the increased importance of reeds from 32' to 2' to clarify the psalm melody. (Owen 1997: 142.)

The performers also ignore the *Äqualstimmenverbot* whereby two or more registers of the same pitch are not used together due the lack of wind supply in early historical organs (Schouten & Stuijbergen 1980: 106). On the HW Alain and Van Oortmerssen use the Roerfluit 8'/Octaaf 8' combination and the Holpijp 8'/Prestant 8' combination, respectively.

In the fugal section of BWV565 both performers employ a smaller *plenum* in relation to the Toccata section. This tendency is quite normal according to the writings of Friedrich Wilhelm Marpurg, indicating that a change in *plena* could be employed using the same manual (Stuijbergen & Schouten 1980: 180-181). In the Pedal division Van Oortmerssen could probably have used the Bazuin 16' instead of the Trompet 8' or even combined the two stops, seeing that the Bazuin of the Hinsz organ has both gravity and transparency.

In the last section of BWV565 both organists returned to their original *plena* used in the Toccata section.

Manual changing in Bach's organ works is a controversial subject. Bach is sometimes very ambiguous in this aspect. For this reason it is interesting that Van Oortmerssen plays the whole work on the HW and only changes manuals in the fugal section to highlight the echo effects. This is done by the alternation between the two *plena* of the HW and the BWI. In the BWI section the normal Octaaf 2' is not used because of the absence thereof on this manual. He thus uses only Prestant 8', Octaaf 4' and Scherp III. This type of registration was normal for this type of organ in the 18th century and even Mattheson encourages this in his *Der Volkommene Cappellmeister* (1739) to be used in the *Organum plenum* (Stuifbergen & Schouten 1980: 142; Owen 1997: 146). The balance between the *plena* of Van Oortmerssen seems to compliment each other in the vast, acoustic-rich Bovenkerk and the effect is astounding. Alain alternates between HW, RW and BW and probably could have done the same as Van Oortmerssen by employing the *Bovenwerk* of the Müller organ, using the following as an echo: Praesant 8', Octaaf 4', Mixtuur IV-VI/Cymbel III.

5.2 Prelude and Fugue in B minor BWV 544

This work is one of the six Preludes and Fugues that have come down to us in Bach's autograph manuscript. It dates from the early years in Leipzig (1725-1730) when Bach was Kantor at the Thomaskirche. According to the *Affektenlehre* the key of B minor is a key of suffering and sorrow and is distinctly evident in both the Prelude and the Fugue. The Prelude takes on the form of a typical Italian concerto containing a *ritornello*. The Prelude is one of the most spacious and well articulated of all Bach's *ritornello* compositions. (Alain Vol.1 1985: 18; Van Oortmerssen Vol. 2 1994: 30.) Bach's original autograph requires a *plenum* registration and no change of manuals (Stauffer & May 1986: 205). The work is full of lyricism and probably reflects the unhappy period of Bach's life at the time. According to Herman Keller the chromatic sequences of the

Prelude indicates the relation to that of the Mass in B minor (BWV 232) and the melismatic character of the St. Matthew's Passion (BWV 245) (Lamprecht 1978: 67-68).

Registrations used by the performers

Alain Martinikerk, Groningen CD: Vol. 1
 Schnitger 1740

Prelude

<u>HW</u>	<u>RP</u>	<u>PED</u>
Octaaf 8'	Praestant 8'	Praestant 16'
Octaaf 4'	Octaaf 4'	Praestant 8'
Octaaf 2'	Octaaf 2'	Octaaf 4'
Mixtuur IV-VI	Mixtuur IV-VI	Octaaf 2'
Scherp IV		Mixtuur IV
		Bazuin 16'
		Trompet 8'

Couplers

RP/HW

Fugue

<u>HW</u>	<u>RP</u>	<u>PED</u>
Praestant 16'	Praestant 8'	Praestant 32'
Praestant 8'	Octaaf 4'	Praestant 16'
Octaaf 4'	Octaaf 2'	Octaaf 8'
Octaaf 2'	Mixtuur IV	Rohrquin't 6
Mixtuur IV-IV	Cimbel III	Octaaf 4'
Scherp IV		Octaaf 2'
		Mixtuur IV
		Bazuin 16'

Trompet 8'

Couplers

RP/HW

Van Oortmerssen

Waalse Kerk, Amsterdam

CD: Vol.1

Müller 1734

Prelude & Fugue

HW

RW

PED

Prestant 16'

Prestant 8'

Bourdon 16'

Prestant 8'

Octaaf 4'

Prestant 8'

Octaaf 4'

Mixtuur II-IV

Octaaf 4'

Mixtuur IV-VI

Nachthoorn 4'

Fagot 16'

Trompet 8'

Couplers

Mancoupler

Pedalcoupler

The subtitle of the work indicates '*pro Organo pleno*', one of the few registration guidelines that Bach left to the performer as to the type of sound and atmosphere that he had intended for the specific work. Many composers and theorists of the time include the phrase '*pro Organo pleno*' or similar expressions that basically confirms the employing of a *plenum* sound. This type of registration indication regularly appears in the works of composers such as Dietrich Buxtehude (c.1637-1707), Johann Ludwig Krebs (1713-1780), Johann Christian Kittel (1732-1809) and other contemporaries of Bach (Stauffer

& May 1986: 195). Both Alain and Van Oortmerssen's registrations are based on the *Organo pleno* concept, but subtle yet distinct differences exist between the two combinations.

An interesting feature in the Prelude of BWV 544 is Alain's registration that is based on an 8' mixture *plenum* in the coupled manuals (*Hauptwerk* and *Rückpositiv*). Alain personally mentions the following concerning this specific type of *plenum* (Stauffer & May 1986: 51): "In the Baroque period, the *plenum* generally consisted of only a single stop at each pitch [the *Äqualstimmenverbot*]: 8', 4', 2', Mixture, Cymbel." This registration guideline is exactly copied and implemented by Alain on the *Hauptwerk* of the Schnitger organ. Alain's *plenum* is also similar to the *plenum* combination given by Daniel Magnus Gronau (d. 1747), a composer and organist from Danzig in the then East Prussia. He named his *plenum* combinations "forte" registrations. Gronau states clearly that this type of registration should be "without 16' stops" in the manuals. (Owen 1997: 147.)

During the High Baroque many Central German organs contained a main manual such as *Hauptwerk* or *Oberwerk*, which only had an 8' Principal as a fundamental tone without any 16' registers. Examples are the Wender organ in the Bonifatiuskirche, Arnstadt and the Weimar Castle Chapel organ, both played by Bach (Owen 1997: 150; Stauffer & May 1986: 3). It can thus be said that Bach did construct and played *plena* that were based on an 8' in the manuals where no 16' was available. However, Alain's *plenum* for the Prelude of BWV 544 is perhaps too "thin" to portray the serious *affekt* of B minor. Most registration sources concur in their fondness for 16' pitch in the manual *plenum*. The writer's opinion is that Alain could probably have added a more fundamental depth in sound quality if the *Hauptwerk* 16' Prestant was added to the *plenum*. According to the indications for *Organo pleno* by Mattheson and Adlung, the Principal choruses of all pitches are to be added to the *plenum* to add gravity (Stauffer & May 1986: 200). This "gravity" is definitely an important component to reflect the appropriate *affekt* of melancholy and melismatic character in the Prelude of BWV 544.

Van Oortmerssen's *plenum* sounds satisfactory despite the fact that it lacks the Prestant 2' (Super Octaaf) because of the absence thereof on the *Hoofdwerk* of the Müller organ. Interestingly enough he compliments this *plenum* of the *Hoofdwerk* by omitting the Octaaf 2' of the *Rugwerk*. The combined *plenum* is fundamentally well balanced because of the so-called double trebles of the Müller organ. It is noteworthy to mention that many German organs in Bach's time did lack a 2' principal-scaled register on the main manual. Examples are the Marienkirche organ in Lübeck where Buxtehude was organist, the Sterzing organ in the church of St. George, Eisenach and the organ in the Bonifatiuskirche, Arnstadt (Kooiman 1992: 30 Owen 1997: 151).

Both performers use the *Rugwerk* as a secondary coupled manual consisting of its own *petit plenum* to add brilliance and therefore adhering to the instructions of Agricola (Stauffer & May 1986: 199).

The two organists' pedal registrations are constructed according to the normal *plenum* for this division, i.e. 16', 8', 4', 2' Principal chorus and 16' and 8' reeds (Stauffer & May 1986: 200). Van Oortmerssen couples the manual to the Pedal. This is done due to the lack of a compound mutation stop in the Pedal division of the Müller organ. He does this to obtain the desired "brightness" according to Adlung's instruction (Stauffer & May 1986: 199). Alain on the other hand has a full range of registers on the Pedal division of the Schnitger organ, ranging from 16' to an independent Mixture. She therefore had no need to use the manual/Pedal coupler seeing that the Schnitger organ has a totally independent Pedal division. Adlung makes it clear (Stauffer & May 1986: 199): "If several bright ranks are already in the Pedal, then one does not need to use the coupler at all."

In the Fugue of BWV 544 both organists' registration on the manuals are based on a 16' mixture *plenum*. Van Oortmerssen retains the registration used in the Prelude, but Alain brightens the *plenum* by adding a Cimbel III in the RP and adding the 16' Praestant of the *Hauptwerk*. Alain also adds to the Pedal more "gravity" by using the Praestant 32' and the Roerquint 6' ($5 \frac{1}{3}'$, which is an acoustical 16') as described by Adlung (Stauffer & May 1986: 199). The tempo of the BWV 544 Fugue is not too quick for the 32' Praestant

to be added and this therefore agrees with the advice of Adlung saying that this register can be used if the pedal passages does not move too rapidly (Owen 1997: 167).

Alain's change in the *plenum* structure heard in the Fugue is most probably supported by the fact that it was a general trend up to as far as the 19th century to use a specific *plenum* for Preludes and a different *plenum* for Fugues (Kooiman 1992: 67).

5.3 Toccata and Fugue in D minor BWV 538

This work is also known as the "Dorian" Toccata and Fugue because of its modal character. There is widespread uncertainty about the actual composition date of this work, but Wolfgang Schmieder suggests round about the year 1727. On the other hand it resembles the style and certain similarities of the Toccata and Fugue in F major (BWV 540), which dates from about the year 1716. (Alain Vol. 12 1991: 21; Van Oortmerssen Vol. 2 1995: 9.) Lamprecht (1978: 115) states that the work was not composed in the Weimar era, but rather originates from the mature Leipzig period.

Bach was a master in transferring instrumental writing of composers such as Arcangelo Corelli (1653-1713) and Antonio Vivaldi (1678-1741) in an idiom for the organ and this style is very much evident in BWV 538. The work is written in a typical *concertato* style that incorporates the alteration between *tutti* and *solli*. It therefore includes a dialogue with typical echo effects. (Alain Vol. 12 1991: 21; Van Oortmerssen Vol. 2 1995: 9.) The Toccata has a fully worked out structure and a Fugue that is cumulative in effect that is in total contrast to the Toccata, yet brilliantly thematic in its own right. Stauffer (Stauffer & May 1986: 143) classifies this Fugue as a so-called *Allabreve* Fugue with distinctive characteristics of Palestrina's *stilo antico*. It is also one of the great organ works where Bach personally added and specified the change of manuals (Lamprecht 1978: 115).

Octava 2

Mixtur III

Measure 167

HW

(as beginning +)

Superoctav 2

Mixtur IV

OW

Principal 8

Octava 4

Superoctav 2

Mixtur III

Zimbeln II

PED

(as beginning +)

Posaunbaß 16

Trompetenbaß 8

Pedalmixtur VI

Coupler

OW/HW

Jacques van Oortmerssen

Roskilde Cathedral

CD: Vol. 2

Mülich 1654

Toccata

MAN

Principal 8'

Octava 4'

Super Octava 2'

Mixtur IV-V

RYG

Gedact 8'

Principal 4'

Octava 2'

Mixtur III

PED

Principal 16'

Octava 8'

Octava 4'

Mixtur IV

Trompet 8'

Fugue

MAN

(as Toccata plus)

Bordun 16'

RYG

(as Toccata plus)

Sesquialt II

PED

(as Toccata plus)

Posaun 16'

Trompet 8' (minus Mixtur III)

Coupler

RYG/MAN

Toccatà

Alain again employs an 8' mixture *plenum* in the manual corresponding with the registration used in the Prelude of BWV 544. In this instance however, the distinct difference is that the Quinte 3' is added to the manual *plenum* for a much more full timbre. The addition of this register to the main ensemble is supported by the instructions of numerous authors, most notably Johann Baptiste Samber who was an organist of Salzburg Cathedral, Austria, during the High Baroque. In his *Continuatio ad manuductionem organicam* (1707) he supplies *plenum* registrations (“Völlige Anschlag”) of which most contain a Quinte 3'. (Owen 1997: 179-180; Staufbergen & Schouten 1980: 146.) It is undoubtedly a controversial subject to suggest that Bach sometimes or even frequently omitted the Quinte 3' in the manual *plenum*. This is evident in the fact that Bach, during the rebuilding of the Mühlhausen organ, had the Quinte 2 ²/₃' (3' principal-scaled stop) replaced with a Nasat 2 ²/₃' (flute-scaled) on the *Hauptwerk* (Kooiman 1992: 69). However it may seem that the Quinte, as advised by Mattheson, Adlung, Agricola, and others, was an indispensable part of the *plenum* in both the manual and pedal (Stauffer & May 1986: 200). Johann Friedrich Walther in his registrations for the Wagner organ in the Berliner Garnisonkirche (1726) states the following concerning the Quinte 3': “[...] sind damit unterschiedlich Veränderungen zu machen, jedoch wir selbige eigentlich zum vollen Werken gezogen.” (Kooiman, Weinberger & Busch 1995: 163). Agricola disapproved of a Quint [3'] being used without combining it with the necessary 8', 4' and 2' [Principal] stops (Owen 1997: 166).

Another interesting facet about the performers' *plena* is that the two manual divisions that are used are uncoupled. The Toccata of BWV 538 is composed and worked out in a

style that contains typical echo effects that enhances stereophonic capabilities. Thus, for the manuals to have been coupled the effect would be totally unsatisfactory and contradictory to what Bach had intended. In this case the *Brustwerk* (used by Alain) and the *Rygpositiv* (used by Van Oortmerssen) are not employed as secondary manuals to add the required brilliance or brightness, but rather in dialogue with the main manual. It could have been possible for Alain to add the Nasat 3' to the *Brustwerk* to emphasise and highlight the echo effects and to make a smaller version of the *Hauptwerk*.

Bach's indication for manual changing in the Toccata specifies the divisions *Oberwerk* and *Positiv*. The organ that Alain uses only has one of these prescribed divisions namely *Oberwerk*. Van Oortmerssen on the Roskilde organ only has a (Ryg) *Positiv* at his disposal. Why then does the effect of both performers' registrations remain within the instructions and guidelines of Bach? Owen (1997: 158) gives a detailed explanation: "Sometimes the term "*Oberwerk*" came to designate the main division, and in some two-manual organs "*Oberwerk*" is synonymous with "*Hauptwerk*". This confusion of terminology is not limited to central Germany; it occurs in the northern region as well. Generally, if the term *Oberwerk* occurs in a context that mentions other divisions (*Unterwerk*, *Brustwerk*, *Positiv*) but not anything specifically named *Hauptwerk*, it may be taken to designate the main division. If any organ has both a *Hauptwerk* and an *Oberwerk*, however, the *Oberwerk* is a subsidiary division located above the *Hauptwerk*."

Interestingly most Thuringian organs in Bach's time contained a *Positiv* that was also portrayed as a *Brustpositiv* or an *Oberwerk*, both found in one case (Stinson 1999: 72).

In both Alain and Van Oortmerssen's *plenum* of the secondary "echo" manual, we find a Gedackt 8' as foundation for the combination with the 4' and 2' Principals plus a Mixture. This is because many average sized organs of Germany and other countries such as the Netherlands had a 4' Principal as main register on a subsidiary manual. Lynn Edwards (Faulkner 1997: 213) states in her article that the only four-foot stop on Thuringian organs were usually represented by an Octave on the main manual and/or the subsidiary manual. This feature was very prominent in some of the instruments of Trost and

Sterzing. The main manual was then based on an 8' Principal and the Pedal division on a 16' Principal, depending on the size of the organ. Examples of such dispositions are the organ of the Blasiuskirche, Mühlhausen, the organ in SS. Peter & Paul, Weimar, and the organ in the Bonifatiuskirche, Arnstadt (Kooiman, Weinberger & Busch 1995: 126-128; Owen 1997: 151-125). This combination of a 4' Principal with a Flute or Gedackt 8' in a *plenum* was also used in a manuscript by Alessandro Poglietti (d. 1683), which was a didactic publication written in Austria around 1676 (Owen 1997: 86). Agricola in his *Musica mechanica organoedi* mentions the following about the four-foot Principal in the *plenum* situation (Faulkner 1997: 227): "A similar [precept] should be observed if the Principal is only a 4': in that case, it is necessary to draw an eight-foot flute with it, as a foundation stop."

The two organists' Pedal registrations for the Toccata are both very interesting. None of the Pedal divisions of the two registrations are coupled to the manuals due to an independent compound register found on both organs, i.e. the Mixture. The Pedal part in the BWV 538 Toccata is also more supportive to the echo effects and actively takes part in the dialogue between the two manual divisions. Alain interestingly does not make use of the 16' Principalbaß in combination with the 16' Posaunbaß on the Silbermann organ. A superb character of the German Baroque organ (and especially the instruments of Silbermann) is the great quality of its 16' reeds on the Pedal that can be used independently from a 16' Principal basis. The reconstruction of the Mühlhausen organ's 16' Posaune with larger resonators according to Bach's specification was perhaps his intention to add greater gravity to the Pedal division and probably to be used without the 16' Principal in the *plenum*. Edwards (Faulkner 1997: 211) states more interestingly that the three major pedal stops in Thuringia in Bach's time came to be the Posaune 16', Subbass 16' and Violone 16'. This was especially evident in the instruments of Georg Christoph Sterzing and only a small number of organs in this area and epoch contained a Principal 16'.

Van Oortmerssen's Pedal *plenum*, contradictory to Alain's combination, contains an 8' Trompet instead of a 16' reed! This exceptional variation of using an 8' reed instead of a

16' reed in the Pedal could probably be what Adlung meant by saying: "The Posaune 32' and 16' along with the Trumpet [8'] can be included in the *plenum*." (Stauffer & May 1986: 199.) Could this statement imply that an 8' Trumpet can sometimes be used without a 16' or 32' reed in the Pedal *plenum*?

Fugue

Both performers make alterations and additions in their registrations in the Fugue of BWV 538. Van Oortmerssen's *plenum* becomes a reed *plenum* with the addition of the HW Trompet 8' and Bourdon 16', according to the description by Agricola. This registration is almost similar to the *Grand Jeu* of the French Classical School with the addition of a Trompette 8', which distinguishes it from the normal *Plein Jeu*. (Owen 1997: 145.) As mentioned before, Agricola was the first to suggest that the Trompette stop to be used in the manual *plenum*. He also states that this stop can be used in this manner "if they are in good tune." (Faulkner 1997: 229.) Kauffmann was also a great admirer of the Trompette in an ensemble as seen in the following examples from his *Harmonische Seelenlust* (Faulkner 1997: 229):

In dich hab ich gehoffet, Herr:

Trompeta [8'] + Principal 8' + Octav 4'; or "*das volle Werk*"

Komm, heiliger Geist:

Oberwerk: Vox humana + Salicional 8' + Spillpfeiffe 4'

Pedal: Violon 16' + Trompet 8' + Nachthorn 4' + Cornet 2'

Faulkner (1997: 229) also states that the texture of these types of pieces might suggest the use of a *plenum*.

The use of the Bourdon 16' as a solid foundation in the *plenum* is normally advised by both Adlung and Agricola. Both writers actually suggest and even prefer the inclusion of

a Bourdon 16' as to a Principal 16'! Adlung states that the Bordun 16' speaks more clearly and quickly in rapid moving passages. In his *Orgel-Probe* of 1698, Werckmeister recommended that a Gedackt 16' (which more or less sounds like a Bordun) was more useful than a Principal 16' and suggests that a Bordun should be placed on the *Hauptwerk* instead of a Principal (Faulkner 1998: 212 & 229). Lynn Edwards (Faulkner 1997: 212) also mentions that in the large organs that was built by Georg Christoph Sterzing (active c.1690-1714), the two manuals had 16-foot stops, including a Bordun 16' on the *Hauptwerk*.

In the *Rygpositiv* of the Roskilde organ, Van Oortmerssen subtracts the Mixtuur III and adds a Sesquialt(era). This register blends well with the Trompet 8' and the absence of the Mixtuur III is scarcely heard. By adding the Sequialt to the *Organo pleno*, Van Oortmerssen automatically adds a third-sounding rank to the ensemble. Both Adlung and Mattheson call for the Sesquialtera in the *plenum* (Kooiman, Weinberger & Busch 1995: 147). Edwards (Faulkner 1997: 213) is of the opinion that although the Sesquialtera was mainly used as a solo stop in Thuringia in Bach's time, it was definitely an essential part of the full organ.

In the Pedal division of the Fugue, Van Oortmerssen gives "gravity" to the *plenum* by adding the Posaun 16'. Mattheson states the following concerning the addition of this stop: "...when there is proper wind, it [the 16' Posaune] sounds splendid in the pedal because of the depth of its tone." (Stauffer & May 1986: 199.)

Alain has a totally different approach to the interpretation of the Fugue of BWV 538. In the beginning of this work, an Octav 8' and 4' in the *Hauptwerk* are employed and 16', 8' and 4' Principals in the Pedal. This registration is rather exceptional for an *Allabreve* Fugue of Bach as described by Stauffer in his article (Stauffer & May 1986: 143). Alain uses a similar registration on the HW as that which is found in Adlung's *Musica mechanica organoedi* (1768) where he supplies many combination possibilities of the following registers:

Principal 8'

Ocktave 4'

Ocktave 2'

Gedackt 16'

Quintatön 8'

The very first combination that he supplies is that of Principal 8' + Ocktave 4' used by Alain in the beginning of the Fugue. (Stuifbergen & Schouten 1980: 144-145.)

As from measure 101, Alain makes use of a very controversial technique. She changes manuals (to the BW) containing an 8' mixture *plenum* in the middle of the Fugue. Christoph Wolff's (1991: 315-316) explanation of changing sonorities in Bach's Passacaglia BWV 582 could perhaps also apply to the Fugue of BWV 538:

Considering the work [the Passacaglia] as a whole, the changing sonorities of the variation part will find a convincing conclusion only with an even level of sound for the fugue, for the formal and textural contrast will in principle require a corresponding expression in sound. The highly articulated variation part finds its complement in the expansively unified contrapuntal nature of the fugue, which does not lend itself to sectionalizing.

Only a few years before Alain herself mentioned the following concerning the changing of manuals in an article: "We ought not to change the registration during a work unless the score explicitly indicates it." (Stauffer & May 1986: 50.)

From measure 167 Alain's registration becomes a textbook example of an *Organo pleno*, which includes a Pedal division with "gravity" and a fully *pleno* registered secondary manual for "brightness". It is the writer's opinion that this full organ sound could have been more succesful and effective if it was employed at the commencement of the Fugue.

In conclusion the writer would like to quote a statement made by the distinguished Bach scholar, Christoph Wolff (1991: 314):

It need not be stressed that the realisation of an organ work in performance – the registration and manual changes – must be based on its structure. [...] If directions by the composer are absent, analysis of form becomes the point of departure for an image in sound. It falls to the organist to determine and observe, on the basis of such analysis, the guiding principle of the work – to subject his interpretation to it in a fine balance of musical imagination and clear comprehension of the work's architecture. Merely to render a methodical analysis in performance or to succumb to an arbitrary of effects – to name the extremes – can never be the artistic goal of performance.

5.4 Fantasia in C minor BWV 562

The date of this work is uncertain. Some sources suggest that it was written between 1712 and 1716. Other sources indicate that the original autograph dates from the period 1706-1712 and probably had an accompanying Fugue especially written for this work. This Fugue was later to be added to the work that is known as the Prelude in C minor BWV 546. Around 1730 Bach made alterations to the Fantasia and composed another Fugue for it, but unfortunately only the first page has survived. No other organ work of Bach better illustrates the complexity that characterises his experiments with other styles than in the Fantasia in C minor. The work also demonstrates that while a French model influenced Bach's compositional style, it only partially accounts for the work's overall structure and plan.

As mentioned before, the work is greatly influenced by the French style of composition and is the closest example that Bach comes to this style of writing in any of his organ works. In 1713 Bach had copied out the *Livre d'orgue* (1699) by Nicolas de Grigny

(1672-1703). Bach's Fantasia shows striking similarities with de Grigny's compositions in the five-part texture, expressivity, musical material, its development plan, the identical pairing and the contrapuntal use of parallel thirds and sixths. The most prominent connection between the two works however, is the thematic relation with the first Fugue from the *Gloria* in de Grigny's *Livre d'orgue*. It is strikingly similar in melody, rhythm and ornamentation. Bach probably wanted to pay homage to De Grigny whose music he knew, played and taught. (Alain Vol. 9 1991: 28; Boyd 1995: 62; Stauffer & May 1986: 266-268; Van Oortmerssen Vol. 4 1997: 8.)

Registrations used by performers

Alain

Grote St Laurenskerk, Alkmaar

CD: Vol. 9

Van Hagerbeer/Schnitger (1646/1725)

HW

Prestant 8'
 Octaaf 4'
 Octaav 2'
 Ruyschpijp II
 Mixtuur VI
 Trompet 16'
 Viool de Gamba 8'
 Trompet 4'

RP

Prestant 8'
 Octaaf 4'
 Superoctaav 2'
 Sexquialter II
 Mixtuur V-VI

PED

Prinsipaal 22'
 Prestant 16'
 Octaav 8'
 Quinta 6'
 Octaav 4'
 Ruyschpijp III
 Mixtuur VIII
 Basuin 16'
 Trompet 8'

Coupler:

RP/HW

Jacques van Oortmerssen

Bovenkerk, Kampen

CD: Vol. 4

Hinsz 1743

<u>HW</u>	<u>RW</u>	<u>PED</u>
Prestant 16'	Prestant 8'	Prestant 16'
Prestant 8'	Octaaf 4'	Subbas 16'
Holpijp 8'	Octaaf 2'	Octaaf 8'
Octaaf 4'	Sexquialter III	Gedakt 8'
Quint 3'		Roerquint 6'
Superoctaaf 2'		Octaaf 4'
Mixtuur III-V		Open Fluit 2'
Tertiaan II		Bazuin 16'
Trompet 8'		Trompet 8

Couplers:

RW/HW

HW/PED

Both Alain and Van Oortmerssen employ a reed *plenum* based on 16' pitch as advised by Agricola and also Mattheson in his *Der Vollkommene Capellmeister*. This becomes the case when full-length reed or reeds are added to the normal mixture *plenum*. (Owen 1997: 145.) Van Oortmerssen only uses a Trompet 8' in the *Hoofdwerk* division although he also has a 16' Trompet on this manual available. Alain on the other hand employs all the available reeds on the *Hoofdwerk* of the Alkmaar organ, i.e. the Trompet 16', the Viool de Gamba 8', and the Trompet 4'.

An interesting aspect about Alain's *plenum* is the inclusion of a Viool de Gamba in the manual *plenum* on the Van Hagerbeer/Schnitger organ. This stop is typical in Dutch organs of the time and it is strange that here it is a substitution for a full-length Trompet 8' usually found on the *Hoofdwerk* of such organs. Another interesting fact is that the Trompet 4' was changed to an eight-foot stop in 1782, with the Viool de Gamba remaining on an eight-foot basis. The Trompet was eventually changed again to a four-

foot reed during the restoration in the period, 1947-1949. (Jongepier 1987: 69.) What should be kept in mind is that the *Viool de Gamba* on the Van Hagerbeer/Schnitger organ is not a string-toned register in the sense of a Romantic idiom. Instead it is a copy of a stop known as the 'Viola', which in Italy and Spain around c.1750, often denoted a reed register such as a powerful regal stop of one or other kind. (Williams & Owen 1988: 290.)

Van Oortmerssen, in his construction of the manual *plenum* on the *Hoofdwerk*, is disregarding the *Äqualstimmenverbot*. He does this by combining the *Hoofdwerk* Prestant 8' and the Holpijp 8' in the manual *plenum*, and the Prestant 16' + Subbas 16', and the Octaaf 8' + Gedakt 8' in the pedal *plenum*.

Van Oortmerssen adds a Quint 3' to his manual *plenum* that gives it much more depth and colour. As mentioned before, Mattheson, Adlung and Agricola regarded the Quint as an indispensable part of the *Organo plenum* in both the manual and pedal (Stauffer & May 1986: 200).

Lynn Edwards (Faulkner 1997: 212) states that a characteristic of Georg Christoph Sterzing's organs (which Bach knew and played) is that the *plenum* includes the Quinte 3' if the main manual is based on an eight-foot and a Quinte 6' if based on a sixteen-foot. The latter is found either in the manual or pedal.

Van Oortmerssen also employs the Tertiaan II of the *Hoofdwerk* in the manual *plenum* that also adds brilliance to the greater ensemble. Generally this stop was used both as a solo and as a chorus Tierce Mixture especially in central and northern Europe during the 17th and 18th centuries. It also had a much wider scaling than that of the Principal. (Williams & Owen 1988: 287.)

Both organists use a Sesquialtera in the coupled secondary manuals, which was encouraged and called for by authors such as Adlung and Mattheson. We also know that

many organs that Bach played did in fact contain third-sounding ranks in the Mixtures and other compound mutation stops. (Faulkner 1997: 230.)

Alain makes use of the exceptional and one of a kind Prinsipaal 22' of the Van Hagerbeer/Schmitger organ in the pedal *plenum*. This register adds considerable depth and gravity to the global *plenum* as described by Adlung (Faulkner 1997: 215). This register's largest pipe is the note G that is placed on the C key, creating a Quint 21 $\frac{1}{3}$ ' and consequently an acoustical 64' (Jongepier 1987: 69).

Van Oortmerssen's pedal *plenum* is coupled to the *Hoofdwerk* to attain the required brilliance as mentioned and advised by Adlung (Stauffer & May 1986: 199). The Open Fluit 2' is probably a substitution for a principal-scaled two-foot register that is not available in the Pedal division of the Bovenkerk organ.

Both performers' registrations show the typical influence of the French Classical School. The use of registers includes full-length reeds such as the Trompet at 16', 8' and 4' level, the addition of third-sounding ranks (Tertiaan II), and the inclusion of Sesquialteras, all this help to emphasise the "Frenchness" of the Fantasia BWV 562.

Alain's manual registration resembles to an extent to the instructions for the *Dialogue à deux Choeurs* given by Gaspard Corrette in the preface to his *Messe du 8e ton* (1703) (Williams & Owen 1988: 261): "On the *Grand jeu*, the Bourdon, Prestant, Trompette, Clairon and Cornet."

It would appear that Van Oortmerssen tries to emulate a type of French *Grand Jeu*. (Nicolas LeBègue, *Livre d'orgue* of 1678 (Douglass 1995: 198): "For a *Grand Jeu*, draw the Bourdon, Montre... Prestant, Doublette, Nazard, Tierce, Cornet, Trompette...")

It is clear that both Alain and Van Oortmerssen try to create a French *Grand Jeu* with German means.

The pedal *plenum* in both registrations is used in a “German” idiom as indicated by Friedrich Wilhelm Marpurg in his *Der critische Musicus an der Spree* (1750). Marpurg, although a native of Germany, was very much up to date with the standardised registration instructions of the French Classical School. All his suggestions for playing *Plein Jeu*, Fugues and most important, the *Grand Jeu*, include the Posaune 16' and the Trompette 8' in the Pedal division as employed by both Alain and Van Oortmerssen. (Kooiman 1992: 134.)

5.5 Trio Sonata in D Minor BWV 527

The six Trio Sonatas are yet again singular contributions to organ composition in their more highly profiled continuo bass-lines, idiomatic writing for manual, and the use of ritornello structures. Nikolaus J. Forkel (1749-1818) mentions that Bach “took the trouble to write short pieces which, combined with exercises, were suited to his pupils’ abilities. Bach wrote them during the lesson, while also keeping an eye on the pupil’s immediate needs. Afterwards, he transformed these pieces into magnificent and expressive works of art.” (Alain Vol. 13 1993: 21).

Bach’s autograph of the six Trio Sonatas (BWV 525-530) dates from about 1730, but some movements were arranged from earlier chamber compositions. Some sources suggest that the drafting of these works took place between 1723 and 1727. Forkel states that these compositions were written as pedagogical works for Bach’s eldest son, Wilhelm Friedemann, who, “by practising them, prepared himself to become the great performer on the organ that he afterwards was.” (Boyd 1995: 63.) These works must truly have been very educational for Wilhelm Friedemann because he was known to be the greatest organist of his generation (Van Oortmerssen 1994: 5).

In the title of these works Bach’s autograph each manuscript indicates the phrase ‘*Sonata à 2 clav: et Pedal.*’ The texture of the Trio Sonatas for organ with its three independent parts does in fact resemble that of the violin and flute sonatas with harpsichord obbligato.