University of Pretoria etd – Naidoo, G (2005)

Leadership and governance for a sustainable public service. The case for selected South African public service organizations

by

GOONASAGREE NAIDOO

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

Philosophiae Doctor (Public Affairs)

In the Faculty of Economic and Management Sciences
University of Pretoria

Promoter: Professor Dr. J.O. Kuye
Co-Promoter: Professor Dr. C. Thornhill

October 2004

University of Pretoria etd – Naidoo, G (2005)

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

To my dearest Lord Krishna, who guides me, and willingly gives me all the support and knowledge that I need, I am totally devoted to you.

To my promoter and Mentor, Professor Jerry O Kuye for always asking for more and demanding the best of me. Thank you for sharing your wisdom and for giving so much to this project.

To my co-promoter, Professor C. Thornhill, thank you for your comments and suggestions.

To Dr. Morgan Pillay, I graciously thank you for your continual support and encouragement.

To my mother, I thank you for the wisdom you have shared, the lessons you have taught me, and the love you have given me.

To my brothers and their families, thank you for your support.

To all my friends, I treasure and support your friendship.

To all the people in the South African public service who have assisted me, I graciously thank you.

Goonasagree Naidoo
Pretoria; South Africa
2004

University of Pretoria etd – Naidoo, G (2005)

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that the research report submitted for the Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) to the University of Pretoria, apart from the works recognized, is my own work and has not been submitted to another university for any degree.

Goonasagree Naidoo
Pretoria
South Africa
2004

ABSTRACT

The research proposes that the adoption of a hybrid leadership and governance framework by the South African public service is crucial for improving service delivery in South Africa. The leadership and governance framework of the South African public service has had a negative impact on its effectiveness and efficiency. The study analysed service delivery performance in four South African public service departments against the backdrop of their leadership and governance frameworks, namely: Departments of Health, Housing, Justice and Constitutional Development and Safety and Security. The study found that the frameworks currently in use are not very effective in redressing service delivery imbalances and inequities in South Africa, especially in previously disadvantaged communities. The needs and demands of the South African public are not being adequately met. The study found that there are a number of interrelated variables, which were hampering the effectiveness of the public service. The most important of these variables were identified as human resource and financial constraints, the lack of technical skills, the lack of co-ordination, ineffective intergovernmental relations (IGR) between the three spheres of government, ineffective policy implementation, conflict between the classical public administration model and the new public management (NPM) paradigm, and the lack of effective monitoring and evaluation systems. In view of the challenges facing the South African public service, this thesis presents an alternative, hybrid leadership and governance model. This model has been designed in response to the unique circumstances faced by the public service in the post-apartheid era (post-1994) public service. It requires a conception of public service leadership and governance that draws on various relevant approaches while adapting these to the prevailing local narratives already existing in the country. It incorporates traditional African ethics and values, transformational leadership and team leadership, and encompasses effective governance approaches, such as civic governance. It also includes accountability, transparency and public participation. It is evident from the four cases presented herein, that such transformation is crucial for improving the effectiveness and efficiency of the South African public service. The leadership and governance framework developed in this study is flexible, as it can be applied to diverse settings and circumstances. This study thus advances a pragmatic transformational African model for the improvement of service delivery in South Africa.

University of Pretoria etd – Naidoo, G (2005)

Leadership and governance for a sustainable public service. The case for selected South African public service organizations

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS I
DECLARATION II
ABSTRACT III
LIST OF ACRONYMS vii

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY

GENERAL OVERVIEW OF THE STUDY 1
HISTORICAL OVERVIEW OF THE SOUTH AFRICAN CONTEXT 2
General overview of South Africa and its history 3
Apartheid era: The South African public service and service delivery (1949 to 1994) 6
Post-apartheid era: The South African public service and service delivery (Post-1994 to 2003) 8
DEFINITIONS AND OPERALIZATION OF KEY CONCEPTS 15
South African public service 15
Service delivery 18
Leadership 20
Governance 26
Transformational African leadership and governance framework 34
MOTIVATION FOR RESEARCH 35
PROBLEM STATEMENT 35
RESEARCH QUESTION 36
OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY 36
CHAPTER OUTLINE 37

CHAPTER 2: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

INTRODUCTION 40
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY 41
Case study approach 45
TARGET POPULATION (SAMPLE) / SELECTION OF STUDY PARTICIPANTS 50
DATA AND INFORMATION COLLECTION 51

DATA ANALYSIS, VALIDATION AND REPORTING 53
SCOPE AND LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY 61
SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY 62
SUMMARY 63

CHAPTER 3: CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK OF THE STUDY: RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION, LEADERSHIP, GOVERNANCE AND SERVICE DELIVERY

INTRODUCTION 64
PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION, LEADERSHIP, GOVERNANCE AND SERVICE DELIVERY 65
Public administration 68
Public management as an integral component of public administration 70
A new approach to public administration 72
New public management 72
Relationships between public administration, leadership, governance and service delivery: A relational model 75
TRENDS IN PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION WITHIN THE SOUTH AFRICAN CONTEXT 79
Towards a new public administration model for effective service delivery by the South African public service 80
Mechanisms to promote a sustainable public service for effective service delivery 86
The Constitution 88
Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) 92
White Paper on the Transformation of the Public Service (WPTPS) (1995) 94
Batho Pele -'People First' White Paper on Transforming Public Service Delivery (1997) 98
SUMMARY 103

CHAPTER 4: AN OVERVIEW OF LEADERSHIP AND GOVERNANCE APPROACHES

INTRODUCTION 104
A PLETHORA OF LEADERSHIP AND GOVERNANCE APPROACHES 104
TRADITIONAL AFRICAN LEADERSHIP AND GOVERNANCE APPROACHES 111
CLASSICAL WESTERN LEADERSHIP APPROACHES (1841 TO 1987) 117
POST-1985 WESTERN LEADERSHIP APPROACHES 163
WESTERN GOVERNANCE APPROACHES 171
FUNDAMENTALS OF EFFECTIVE GOVERNANCE 180
Accountability 182

University of Pretoria etd – Naidoo, G (2005)

Transparency and access to information 190
Human resources management, development and training 192
Information and communication technology (ICT) 196
INTEGRATION OF LEADERSHIP AND GOVERNANCE APPROACHES 207
SUMMARY 214

CHAPTER 5: ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS OF SELECTED CASES IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN PUBLIC SERVICE

INTRODUCTION 216
Selective overview of service delivery by the South African public service 217
Case study one: Department of Health 226
Case study two: Department of Housing 249
Case study three: Department of Justice and Constitutional Development 262
Case study four: Department of Safety and Security 280
ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS OF CASES 291
Future trends 319
SUMMARY 323

CHAPTER 6: SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

SUMMARY 326
CONCLUSION 330
RECOMMENDATIONS 332

LISTS OF SOURCES

BOOKS 356
JOURNALS 366
PAPERS 369
GREEN AND WHITE PAPERS OF THE SOUTH AFRICAN GOVERNMENT 370
PUBLISHED OFFICIAL REPORTS AND DOCUMENTS 371
REVIEWS 372
CONFERENCE PAPERS 373
NEWSPAPERS 374
WEBSITES AND ELECTRONIC JOURNALS 375
ACTS AND LEGISLATION 381

University of Pretoria etd – Naidoo, G (2005)

UNPUBLISHED PAPERS 382
UNPUBLISHED DISSERTATIONS 382
PUBLISHED THESIS 383
DISCUSSIONS 383
OTHER 384

University of Pretoria etd – Naidoo, G (2005)

TABLES

Table 1/1: Service delivery backlogs in urban and rural areas at 1994 9
Table 1/2: Service delivery backlogs in urban and rural areas of the provinces in 1995 10
Table 2/1: A comparison of data analysis and verification methods 57
Table 3/1: Public administration in South Africa (pre-1994 and post-1994) 80
Table 4/1: Evolutionary stages of leadership approaches (1841 to 1987) 120
Table 4/2: Studies of leadership traits (1948 to 1991) 124
Table 4/3: Personality characteristics and behaviors of leaders and its effects on followers 131
Table 4/4: Stages of electronic-governance 202
Table 5/1: Selected service delivery programmes from 1995 to 2001 223
Table 5/2: Selected service delivery programmes from 1994 to 2003 224
Table 5/3: Selected service delivery housing programmes from 1994 to 2003 225
Table 5/4: Service delivery performance - Department of Health 227
Table 5/5: Challenges impacting on service delivery performance - Department of Health 246
Table 5/6: Service delivery performance - Department of Housing 250
Table 5/7: Challenges impacting on service delivery performance - Department of Housing 261
Table 5/8: Service delivery performance - Department of Justice and Constitutional Development 265
Table 5/9: Challenges impacting on service delivery performance - Department of Justice and Constitutional Development 278
Table 5/10: Service delivery performance - Department of Safety and Security 281
Table 5/11: Challenges impacting on service delivery performance - Department of Safety and Security 285

FIGURES

Figure 3/1: Relationships between public administration, leadership, governance and service delivery: A relational model 66
Figure 4/1: Contingency model of leadership 138
Figure 4/2: Path-goal theory of leadership 139
Figure 4/3: Leadership behaviors in path-goal theory 141
Figure 4/4: Leadership styles 145
Figure 4/5: Leadership continuum 153
Figure 4/6: Components of transformational leadership 157

University of Pretoria etd – Naidoo, G (2005)

Figure 4/7: Leadership factors 158
Figure 4/8: Model of team leadership 166

LIST OF ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

AFIS	Automated Fingerprint Identification System
AIDS	Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
ANC	African National Congress
CBO	Community based organization
CJSP	Criminal Justice Strengthening Programme
DLGH	Department of Local Government and Housing
DOTS	Directly observed treatment short-course
DPSA	Department of Public Service and Administration
EXCO	Executive Council of the Province
G&A	Governance and Administration
GDH	Gauteng Department of Housing
GDP	Gross domestic product
HIV	Human immune deficiency virus
HPCSA	Health Professional Council of South Africa
HRD	Human Resources Development
HRM	Human Resources Management
IC	Individualised consideration
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
IDP	Infrastructure Development Plan
IGR	Intergovernmental Relations
II	Idealised influence
IJS	Integrated Justice System
IM	Inspirational motivation

IPSP	Integrated Provincial Support Programme
IS	Intellectual Stimulation
IT	Information Technology
LMX	Leader-member exchange theory
MEC	Member of Executive Council
MIIF	Municipal Infrastructure Investment Framework
MRC	Medical Research Council
MTEF	Medium Term Expenditure Framework
NACF	National Anti-Corruption Forum
NAAIRS	The National Automated Archival Information Retrieval System
NHLS	National Laboratory Service
NCPS	National Crime Prevention Strategy
NEPAD	New Partnership for Africa Development
NMIR	National minimum information requirements
NGO	Non-governmental organizations
NPM	New Public Management
PFMA	Public Finance Management Act, 2002
PMTCT	Prevention of Mother-to-Child Transmission
PHC	Primary Health Care
PPPs	Public Private Partnerships
PSC	Public Service Commission
RDP	Reconstruction and Development Programme
SADC	Southern African Development Community
SAP	South African Police Services
SANAC	South African National AIDS Council

SANDF	South African Defence Force
SARS	South African Revenue Services
SCOPA	Standing Committee on Public Accounts
SITA	State Information Technology Agency
SMS	Senior Management Services
TB	Tuberculosis
TRC	Truth and Reconciliation Commission
WHO	World Health Organization
WPTPS	White Paper on Transforming the Public Service