



A framework for managing risk in a changing business

STEPHEN BOSMAN

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements of
the degree of

PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR (ENGINEERING)

in the

FACULTY OF ENGINEERING

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

June 1998

Thesis Summary



The rate of change in the business environment and its corresponding challenges present organisations with varying degrees of risk. Recent literature alludes to a growing concern that current business change initiatives provide less than satisfactory results. There are some methods available that address specific issues related to business change, but they lack a coherent and integrated approach to managing the risks associated with change. The aim of this research is to put forward a framework that provides the means for managing the risks of business change in an integrated and comprehensive fashion.

The research reviews the environment of the business under change, including the various business types, their industries, the types of change and the range of disciplines which provide the tools to manage the risks. The literature and business review provides the basis for testing a set of propositions by means of market research. All these facets are synthesised into a conceptual framework for managing risk through the complete solution life cycle; from risk identification through to process design, monitoring and control.

The framework is tested against an application that covers a wide range of business change types. This evaluation draws attention to the substantiation of the general framework while highlighting gaps. Software is key to supporting the framework. Available software offerings are reviewed and their shortcomings highlighted. Some supporting software has been developed to complement the existing range of market offerings.

In conclusion, the success of the research is evaluated, hypotheses are postulated and recommendations for further areas of study are made.

Proefskrif Samevatting

Die tempo van verandering in die besigheidsomgewing en die ooreenkomsstige uitdagings, stel organisasies bloot aan verskeie risikos. Volgense onlangse literatuur toon huidige besigheidsveranderingsinisiatiewe nie die verlangde resultate nie. Metodes is beskikbaar wat sekere besigheidsveranderingsaspekte aanspreek, maar in meeste gevalle ontbreek 'n

duidelike en geïntegreerde benadering, *uit TSHOSI*, tenkende die verandering, te bestuur. Die doel van hierdie navorsing is om ‘n raamwerk daar te stel vir geïntegreerde en omvattende risikobestuur van besigheidsverandering.

Die besigheidsomgewing onder verandering word ondersoek, daar word gekyk na die verskeie besigheidstipes, industrieë, tipe veranderings en die reeks disiplines wat risikobestuurs riglyne verskaf. Die literatuurstudie en besigheidsoorsig verskaf die basis vir die evaluering van voorstelle deur middel van marknavorsing. Al hierdie fasette word saamgevat in ‘n konseptuele raamwerk vir risikobestuur oor die volledige lewenssiklus van ‘n oplossing, vanaf risiko-identifisering tot proses ontwerp, monitering en beheer.

Hierdie raamwerk is getoets teen ‘n toepassing wat verskeie besigheidsveranderingstipes insluit. In die evaluasie word die aandag gevvestig op die belangrikheid van so ‘n raamwerk en terselfdertyd word gapings uitgelig. Die regte programmatuur is noodsaaklik vir die ondersteuning van so ‘n raamwerk. Beskikbare programmatuur is ondersoek en tekortkomings is uitgelig. Ondersteunende programmatuur is ontwikkel om dit wat in die mark bestaan, aan te vul.

In die samevatting, is die sukses van die navorsing geëvalueer, hipoteses gestel en aanbevelings vir verdere studie gemaak.

Acknowledgements

This work would not be possible without the support of the following individuals and the researcher would like to acknowledge their assistance accordingly:

- Michelle, my partner, for her patience.
- Paul Kruger for his guidance.
- Robert Radley for his assistance with the market research and for being a sounding board for the research method.

Contents

1. Introduction	1
1.1 Chapter context.....	2
1.2 Background	2
1.3 Problem definition.....	4
1.3.1 Problem statement	4
1.3.2 Purpose	5
1.3.3 Significance of the study	6
1.4 Research questions.....	6
1.4.1 Grand tour question	6
1.4.2 Sub-questions	6
1.5 Objectives.....	7
1.6 Delimitations and limitations.....	7
1.6.1 Delimitations.....	7
1.6.2 Limitations.....	8
1.7 Research method.....	8
1.7.1 Overview of the method.....	8
1.7.2 Assumptions and rationale	11
1.7.3 Type of design used	12
1.7.4 Role of the researcher	12
1.7.5 Data collection.....	13
1.7.6 Data analysis.....	13
1.8 Thesis outline.....	14
1.9 Chapter conclusion	15
2. Fundamentals	16
2.1 Chapter context.....	17
2.2 Systems approach.....	17
2.2.1 System.....	17
2.2.2 Cybernetics	18
2.2.3 Equifinality	19
2.2.4 Steady state	19
2.3 Industrial engineering.....	19
2.4 Operations research	20
2.5 Business	22

2.5.1	Value, utility and benefit	25
2.5.2	Value Chain concepts.....	26
2.5.3	Process and functional paradigms.....	29
2.5.4	Production factors	29
2.5.5	Productivity	30
2.5.6	Business drivers	31
2.5.7	Benchmarking.....	31
2.5.8	Core competencies, capabilities and competitiveness	32
2.6	Change and transformation.....	35
2.7	Business engineering.....	38
2.8	Management.....	43
2.9	Leadership.....	43
2.10	Uncertainty and risk	45
2.11	Management of Risk	45
2.11.1	Management of risk	46
2.11.2	The risk management process.....	49
2.11.3	The practice of managing risk	51
2.12	Business process redesign	52
2.13	Total quality management.....	53
2.14	Learning	55
2.15	Qualitative and quantitative methods.....	57
2.16	Chapter conclusion	57
3.	Analysis.....	58
3.1	Chapter context.....	59
3.2	Literature study: risk management of business change	59
3.2.1	Business process re-engineering	60
3.2.2	Transforming company culture.....	68
3.2.3	Business transformation	69
3.2.4	Strategic alliances	73
3.2.5	Total quality management	75
3.3	Market research: managing the risks of business change	80
3.3.1	Method	80
3.3.2	Analysis of results	88
3.3.3	Interpretation of results	117
3.3.4	Conclusions	134
3.4	Critique: literature study and market research.....	135
3.4.1	Literature study	135
3.4.2	Market research	136
3.5	Assessment of risk management approaches in other fields.....	137

3.5.1	Financial	137
3.5.2	Banking	138
3.5.3	Technological	141
3.5.4	Insurance	144
3.5.5	Environmental	147
3.5.6	Business investment risks	149
3.5.7	Perceived product risks	150
3.5.8	Engineering projects	151
3.5.9	Systems reliability engineering	152
3.6	Appropriate Risk Management Techniques	153
3.7	Chapter conclusion	169
4.	Synthesis.....	170
4.1	Chapter context.....	171
4.2	Framework requirements	171
4.3	Baseline case.....	172
4.4	Modelling.....	173
4.4.1	Overview concepts.....	173
4.4.2	Business change risk management process	186
4.4.3	Derivation of strategic risks	187
4.4.4	Definition of business problem or opportunity	189
4.4.5	Risk analysis	189
4.4.6	Design risk management portfolio and philosophy	207
4.4.7	Implement and integrate risk management portfolio and philosophy	209
4.4.8	Phase-out.....	210
4.5	Risk management framework.....	210
4.6	Chapter conclusion	217
5.	Application.....	218
5.1	Chapter context.....	219
5.2	Background	219
5.3	The Opportunity	220
5.4	Approach.....	221
5.4.1	Overview	221
5.4.2	Risk analysis	222
5.4.3	Risk management design	224
5.4.4	Implementation	225
5.4.5	Operation and phase-out	225
5.5	Relevance of the application	226
5.6	Evaluation	227

5.6.1	Analysis	227
5.6.2	Verification.....	238
5.6.3	Hypotheses	239
5.7	Chapter conclusion	240
6.	Conclusion.....	241
6.1	Chapter context.....	242
6.2	Highlights of the study.....	242
6.3	Appraisal.....	242
6.3.1	Compliance with the research questions	243
6.3.2	Evaluation of theoretical contribution.....	245
6.4	Recommendations	246
6.5	Concluding remarks.....	246
7.	Appendices.....	247
8.	Appendix A - Change management approaches	249
9.	Appendix B - Expected monetary value	251
9.1	Risk Assessment	251
9.2	Calculating EMVs.....	252
9.3	Steps in determining EMVs for project parameters.....	252
10.	Appendix C - Risk analysis worksheets	254
11.	Appendix D - Markovian theory and application.....	255
11.1	Introduction	255
11.2	Project risk	255
11.3	Markovian analysis	255
11.4	Application	257
11.4.1	Case background	257
11.4.2	Application modelling	258
11.5	Conclusion	262
12.	Appendix E - Application documentation.....	263
13.	Appendix F - Steps to developing scenarios	264
14.	Appendix G - Fastchicks theoretical case study	265
14.1	Consultant's findings	267
14.2	Alternatives for improvement.....	269
15.	Appendix H - Competence and an organisation's capability.....	271
16.	Appendix I - Covering letter and questionnaire.....	275

Section 1: Information regarding respondent	276
Section 2: Demographic Information	276
Section 3 - Organisation's experience with business change.....	277
Section 4 - Organisation's approach to risk management	279
Section 5 - Respondent's opinion of risk management in business change	283
17. Appendix J - Detailed descriptive statistics of responses.....	285
18. Appendix K - Question 7 - Contingency table	292
19. Appendix L - Question 7 - Correspondence analysis	293
20. Appendix M - Question 7 - Transformed data: Descriptive statistics and factor analysis	295
21. Appendix N - Products used in risk management practice.....	297
22. Appendix O - Tables for randomised block design on question 7	298
23. Appendix P - Software.....	300
23.1 Overview design	300
23.2 Criteria	301
23.3 Available software.....	302
23.4 Software development.....	304
23.5 Conclusion	304

List of Figures

Figure 1 - Relationship between Qualitative and Quantitative Components of the Research	9
Figure 2 - Research Method	10
Figure 3 - Elements of a System.....	18
Figure 4 - Winston's Operations Research Methodology.....	20
Figure 5 - Business Environment	22
Figure 6 - Process of Producing Chicken Product.....	23
Figure 7 - Value Curves.....	25
Figure 8 - Porter's Value Chain Structure.....	27
Figure 9 - Relationship between Effectiveness and Efficiency	30
Figure 10 - Benchmarking Hierarchy and Effectiveness.....	32
Figure 11 - Components of Core Capabilities.....	34
Figure 12 - Core Capabilities Value Chain.....	35
Figure 13 - Macro Task of Management	36
Figure 14 - Transformation in Business State.....	37
Figure 15 - Daisy Model - Principles of Business Engineering	41
Figure 16 - Watson's Business Systems Engineering Model	42
Figure 17 - Generic Engineering Model.....	42
Figure 18 - Charette's Risk-Opportunity Combinations (Modified).....	46
Figure 19 - Charette's Risk Helix	47
Figure 20 - Charette's Risk Analysis and Management Process	49
Figure 21 - Incremental versus Radical Business Performance Improvement.....	53
Figure 22 - Risks during BPR Design Phase	66
Figure 23 - Risks during BPR Implementation Phase	66
Figure 24 - Risks during BPR Operation Start-up Phase	67
Figure 25 - Martin's Risks Associated with Different Change Methods	72
Figure 26 - Number of Employees in Organisation.....	88
Figure 27 - Primary Nature of the Business	89
Figure 28 - Recentness of Change Initiative	90
Figure 29 - Success of Change Initiative(s)	90
Figure 30 - Type of Change Initiative	91
Figure 31 - Business Change Initiatives	92
Figure 32 - Risks of Business Change (Individual Rankings)	95
Figure 33 - French Plot of Lickert Scale Ratings	96
Figure 34 - Scree Plot: Eigenvalues for Factor Analysis	98
Figure 35 - Practice of Risk Management	100
Figure 36 - Intention of Introducing Risk Management.....	100
Figure 37 - Nominated Responsibility for Risk Management.....	101
Figure 38 - Life-cycle Exploitation.....	102
Figure 39 - Current Focus on Risk Management Factors	104
Figure 40 - Required Focus on Risk Management Factors	105
Figure 41 - Importance of Factors in Risk Management	106
Figure 42 - Use of Risk Management Techniques	108
Figure 43 - Effectiveness of Risk Management Techniques	109
Figure 44 - Use of Risk Management Tools	111
Figure 45 - Effectiveness of Risk Management Tools	112
Figure 46 - Modern Day Initiatives Aimed at Changing Behaviour	113
Figure 47 - Failure of Business Change and Risk management	113
Figure 48 - Perceived Benefits of a Formal Risk Management Approach	114
Figure 49 - Perceived Disadvantages of a Formal Risk Management Approach.....	116
Figure 50 - Generic Approach to Risk Management.....	116
Figure 51 - Most Recent Change Initiatives	118
Figure 52 - Success/Failure and Use of Risk Management.....	129
Figure 53 - The Desired Relationship between Risk and Reward in R&D Investments	142

Figure 54 - Roussel et al's Linkage between Objectives and Practice in R&D Management	144
Figure 55 - Moilanen et als' Environmental Investment Evaluation Methodology	149
Figure 56 - Frigenti and Kitching's Risk Management Cycle	153
Figure 57 - Traditional Business Improvement Life Cycle.....	155
Figure 58 - Corporate Growth Model	158
Figure 59 - Scott-Morgan's Unwritten Rules Model	162
Figure 60 - EMV Triangulation	164
Figure 61 - Simplistic State Space Diagram	165
Figure 62 - Life Cycle Cost Profile.....	167
Figure 63 - Balanced Scorecard Framework	168
Figure 64 - Role of Strategy in Business Change Initiatives	173
Figure 65 - Modified Charette's Risk Analysis and Management Process	174
Figure 66 - Interaction between Risk Philosophy and Risk Process.....	175
Figure 67 - Conceptual Risk Management Framework	176
Figure 68 - Generic Phases of Business Change Initiatives.....	177
Figure 69 - Arthur Andersen's Model for a Common Language	180
Figure 70 - Relationship between Business Risk Control Levels	181
Figure 71 - Strategic Risk Controls	182
Figure 72 - Management Risk Control	183
Figure 73 - Business Process Risk Controls	184
Figure 74 - Interaction between Business Risk Management and Business Change Risk Management	185
Figure 75 - High Level Generic Process for the Management of Risk in Business Change.....	186
Figure 76 - Normalised Risk Estimation Scorecard	194
Figure 77 - Relationship between Financial and Index Based Evaluations	196
Figure 78 - Standard Rating Functions.....	198
Figure 79 - EIU's Model for Business Controls	200
Figure 80 - Business Dynamics and Risk Management	201
Figure 81 - Structural and Cultural Impacts of Business Change Types.....	202
Figure 82 - Financial Leverage vs. Effort of Business Change Initiatives	202
Figure 83 - Risk Evaluation Scorecard	205
Figure 84 - Risk Exposure vs. Management Cost	207
Figure 85 - Overview Business Change Risk Management Process	213
Figure 86 - Risk Analysis Process Elements	213
Figure 87 - Risk Design Process Elements	214
Figure 88 - Risk Implementation Process Elements.....	214
Figure 89 - Risk Operation and Phase-out Process Elements	215
Figure 90 - Phases of the commercialisation project	221
Figure 91 - Risk Identification Framework for the Commercialisation Project	223
Figure 92 - Iterative Strategy Analysis and Design Process	235
Figure 93 - Simple 3 State Repairable System.....	256
Figure 94 - Textile Business State Change Diagram	258
Figure 95 - Scenarios Using Various Repair and Hazard Rates	261
Figure 96 - Entities of Fastchicks Limited.....	265
Figure 97 - Geographical Distribution of Fastchicks	266
Figure 98 - Current vs. Benchmark Product Quality of Fastchicks	269
Figure 99 - Relationship between Core Competencies, Strategic Processes and Core Capabilities.....	271
Figure 100 - Competencies / Process Matrix	273
Figure 101 - Organisational Dynamics, Competencies and Processes	274
Figure 102 - Ideal Software Architecture for Risk Management System	300
Figure 103 - Composition of the Risk Management System	301

List of Tables

Table 1 – Assumptions of the Quantitative and Qualitative Methods.....	11
Table 2 - Classification of Change Management Approaches	38
Table 3 - Change Types Aimed at Business Improvement.....	39
Table 4 - The Behaviour and Attitudes of Leaders.....	44
Table 5 - Description of Stages in the Risk Helix	48
Table 6 - Description of Risk Analysis and Management Components	49
Table 7 - Analytical Quality Control Toolkit.....	54
Table 8 - Practices, Principles and Essences of the Learning Organisation.....	56
Table 9 - Creating the Learning Organisation on 3 Fronts	56
Table 10 - Hammer and Stanton's Approach to Managing Risks in BPR.....	60
Table 11 - Carr and Johansson's Risks and Best Practices for Managing BPR Initiatives.....	64
Table 12 - Martin's Characteristics and Barriers to Achieving a "Re-engineered Enterprise".....	65
Table 13 - Drennan's Approach to Managing Risks in Transforming Company Culture.....	68
Table 14 - Kotter's Approach to Managing the Risks of Transformation Efforts.....	70
Table 15 - Risk Profiles of the 5 Change Types.....	71
Table 16 - Badaracco's Approach to Managing the Risks of Strategic Alliances.....	74
Table 17 - Ackoff's Approach to Managing the Risks of TQM/Continuous Improvement.....	76
Table 18 - Brown et al's Approach to Managing the Risks of TQM – Phase I.....	77
<i>Table 19 - Brown et al's Approach to Managing the Risks of TQM – Phase II.....</i>	78
<i>Table 20 - Brown et al's Approach to Managing the Risks of TQM – Phase III</i>	79
Table 21 - Link between Objectives, Propositions and Questions.....	85
Table 22 - Approach to Analysing Data per Question	86
Table 23 - Rescaled Lickert Scale	97
Table 24 - Risks During Change Initiative - Statements Loading in Factor 1	98
Table 25 - Risks During Change Initiative - Statements Loading in Factor 2	99
Table 26 - Risks During Change Initiative - Statements Loading in Factor 3	99
Table 27 - Risks During Change Initiative - Statements Loading in Factor 4	99
Table 28 - External Validity Calculation.....	118
Table 29 - Change Types by Industry Sector	119
Table 30 - Relationship between Initiatives, Types of Initiative and Sectors	122
Table 31 - Success/Failure of a Change Initiative based on Type and Sector.....	124
Table 32 - Analysis of Variance Table	126
Table 33 - Analysis of Variance Table for Risks per Sector	126
Table 34 - Analysis of Variance Table for Risks per Business Change Type	127
Table 35 - Ranking of Use and Effectiveness of Techniques.....	133
Table 36 - Ranking of Use and Effectiveness of Tools	134
Table 37 - Financial Investment Risks and Techniques	137
Table 38 - Evaluation of Approaches Determining the Cost of Capital	138
Table 39 - Summary of Risk Management in Banking	139
Table 40 - Characteristics of the Three Types of R&D	143
Table 41 - Summary of Risk Management in the Environmental Field.....	148
Table 42 - Risks Consumers Face	151
Table 43 - Approaches to Treating Risk in Engineering Projects.....	152
Table 44 - Categories of Forecasting Methods and Examples of their Application	160
Table 45 - Unwritten Rules and Risks of Business Change.....	162
Table 46 - Major Advantages and Disadvantages of a Formal Risk Management Approach	172
Table 47 - Strategic Level Methods and Deliverables for Risk Identification	189
Table 48 - Problem Definition Methods and Deliverables.....	189
Table 49 - Prioritised Framework for Sources of Risk in Business Change	191
Table 50 - Profile of Preferred Risk Management Tools	192
Table 51 - Business Initiative Attractiveness Calculation	195
Table 52 - Risk Analysis Methods and Deliverables.....	206
Table 53 - Risk Management Portfolio and Philosophy Design Methods and Deliverables	209

Table 54 - Integrated Risk Management Framework	211
Table 55 - Distribution of Risk Intervention Strategies	224
Table 56 - Application's Relevance to the Business Change Types	226
Table 57 - Use and Effectiveness of Techniques in the Application	230
Table 58 - Use and Effectiveness of Tools in the Application	231
Table 59 - Summary of Potential Techniques and Tools on Other Fields	232
Table 60 - Effectiveness of Other Techniques and Tools in the Application	233
Table 61 - Analysis of "Derive Strategic Risks"	234
Table 62 - Analysis of "Define Business Problem"	235
Table 63 - Analysis of "Analyse the Risks"	236
Table 64 - Analysis of "Design Risk Portfolio and Philosophy"	237
Table 65 - Analysis of "Implement and Integrate the Portfolio and Philosophy"	238
Table 66 - Analysis of "Phase out the Risk Management Intervention"	238
Table 67 – Scenarios Using Various Repair and Hazard Rates	261
Table 68 - Results of Fastchicks Benchmarking Performance	268

Abbreviations

ABC	Activity based costing
AIM	Applied implementation methodology
APT	Arbitrage pricing theory
BPR	Business process redesign
CAPM	Capital asset pricing model
CBA	Cost benefit analysis
CID	Consumer idealised design
CNV	Cumulative net value
DBMS	Database management system
EIS	Executive information system
EMV	Expected monetary value
ERP	Enterprise requirements planning
EVA	Economic value added
IIE	Institute of Industrial Engineers
IRR	Internal rate of return
IT	Information technology
JIT	Just in time
LOB	Line of business
MCDM	Multiple criteria decision model
MIS	Management information system
MOR	Management of risks
MOT	Management of technology
NPV	Net present value
OPT	Option pricing theory
OR	Operations research
PE	Process element
PRIMA	Process industries manufacturing advantage
ROI	Return on investment
RONA	Return on net assets
RTC	Resistance to change
SD	System dynamics
SQC	Statistical quality control
TOC	Theory of constraints
TOP	Total operational performance
TQM	Total quality management