

***A PHENOMENOLOGICAL APPROACH TO FAMILIES
VICTIMIZED BY POLITICAL VIOLENCE***

by

ZINZISWA C. NQWENI

Submitted in partial fulfilment
of the requirements for the Degree
Doctor of Philosophy (Psychotherapy)
in the Faculty of Arts
Department of Psychology
University of Pretoria

May 2000

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to thank the families who testified in the Truth and Reconciliation Commission for their co-operation and assistance in making this study possible.

I express my gratitude to Professor Rex van Vuuren for his infinite patience and academic guidance as my chief advisor, not only for this thesis but throughout my doctoral programme. He was available to offer insight and support throughout this process.

I thank my friends, colleagues and my family, with deepest gratitude to my husband, my three daughters and my grandson who, despite the emotional experience of separation for brief periods while I attended lectures, have been supportive in every way.

Lastly, I am indebted to the National Research Foundation for the financial assistance towards this research. The opinions that are expressed and the conclusions that have been reached in this thesis are those of the author and are not necessarily to be attributed to the National Research Foundation.

TITLE : A phenomenological approach to families victimized by political violence

NAME : Zinziswa C. Nqweni

SUPERVISOR : Prof. R.J. van Vuuren

DEPARTMENT : Psychology, University of Pretoria

DEGREE : Doctor of Philosophy (Psychotherapy)

Abstract

The focus of this study is to establish how victimization through violence has affected the families who are interviewed. The purpose is to describe how the family's world has changed in different moments during the political strife in South Africa. The different contexts or moments are those of political inactivity, the struggle years, the period after the struggle when the Truth and Reconciliation Commission was constituted and the new world order in which the families continue with their lives. Using a phenomenological approach, the experiences of families subjected to different forms of political violence, such as disappearances of victims, torture in detention and death in detention, are discussed.

The literature review on violence in the South African context situates any discourse which occurred within the broader social, historical and political context. Systems Theory, Social Identity Theory and an Integrated Theory of Political Violence are used as theoretical perspectives in understanding the interconnectedness between violence which affected the families in the present study and the whole society.

The qualitative research interview method postulated by Kvale (1996) has been used to collect data from the families. This procedure has enabled the researcher to study the data as it emerged thus allowing an understanding of the essential meanings implicit in the participants' descriptions of their experiences. The data consists of audio taped interviews conducted with twenty-two members from ten families. This resulted in twenty-two protocols which were

transcribed and analysed. The analysis of the protocols, though used differently from the situated structure identified by Wertz (1983), brought essential themes common to all participants.

The research findings reveal themes which demonstrate that experiences of the families subjected to political violence had an impact on their lives. They remember living routinely before the struggle against the apartheid structures. This is remembered as a very long time. The struggle years brought disintegration of the family unit as people fled their homes into exile. Others disappeared, were detained, tortured and died in prison. The relationship between the families and their children was that of concern, as parents discouraged their children to participate in the political activities. The effects of violence culminated in hardship for many families as they experienced an absence of a helpful community, alienation from political organizations, and distrust of the State during the time that missing family members could not be traced by the security police. This distrust also existed among the communities who were experiencing suffering through incidents of black on black violence.

The introduction of the TRC, as a major theme with sub-themes of healing and forgiveness, is perceived positively by these families. At last, they feel that through this process their suffering of loss of their children, husbands and wives is acknowledged. However, there are divergent opinions about this acknowledgement, as research findings point to an incomplete sense of individual healing for these families though they have told their stories of pain and suffering. This is a controversial issue which needs further research to explicate if individual experience of the victim is perceived to be similar to the collective experience of the broader community. The performance of rituals and memories on behalf of their dead fulfills an important healing role for the families. There is ambivalence about forgiveness for many families as they feel that perpetrators who seek amnesty have not made full disclosures about their activities.

There is polarization that surfaces between the present government and the families who testified with regard to reparation which was included as a clause in the TRC process. The families in the present study perceive that in order to continue with the new world order, they have to be compensated for their suffering. Further research should investigate if reparations to individuals who testified before the TRC would be healing, before implementing processes that would heal the whole nation.

TITEL : 'n Fenomenologiese benadering tot families wat onderworpe was aan politieke geweld

NAAM : Zinziswa C. Nqweni

PROMOTOR : Prof. R.J. van Vuuren

DEPARTEMENT : Sielkunde, Universiteit van Pretoria

GRAAD : Doktor in Filosofie (Psigoterapie)

Opsomming

Die fokus van hierdie ondersoek is om te bepaal hoe viktimisasie deur geweld die families waarmee onderhoude gevoer is, beïnvloed het. Die doel is om te beskryf hoe die betrokke families se wêreld tydens verskillende momente gedurende die politieke stryd in Suid-Afrika verander het. Die verskillende kontekste, of momente is dié voor aktiewe politieke betrokkenheid, die strydjare, die periode na die stryd waartydens die Waarheid-en-Versoeningskommissie (WVK) gekonstitueer is, en die nuwe wêreldorde waarbinne die families voortgaan met hul lewens. Met behulp van 'n fenomenologiese benadering word die ervaringe van families onderworpe aan verskillende vorme politieke geweld, soos die verdwyning van slagoffers, marteling en dood in aanhouding, bespreek.

Die literatuuroorsig rakende geweld binne die Suid-Afrikaanse konteks plaas enige diskoers wat plaasgevind het binne die breër sosiale, historiese en politieke konteks. Sistemiese Teorie, Sosiale Identiteitsteorie en n' Integrasieteorie van Politieke Geweld word gebruik as teoretiese perspektiewe in die ondersoek na die onderliggende verband tussen geweld wat die families in hierdie ondersoek geraak het en dié van die breër samelewing.

Die kwalitatiewe navorsingsonderhoud voorgestel deur Kvale (1996) is gebruik om inligting van die families te verkry. Hierdie prosedure het die navorser in staat gestel om die data te bestudeer soos dit verkry word en dra dus by tot begrip van essensiële betekenis ingesluit in die betrokke persone se beskrywings van hul ervarings. Die data in hierdie ondersoek bestaan uit die onderhoude wat met altesaam twee en twintig familielede uit die tien families gevoer is met behulp van 'n videokassetopnemer. Hieruit is twee en twintig protokolle getranskribeer en geanaliseer. Die analise van die protokolle, alhoewel verskillend benader van die voorgestelde struktuur soos geïdentifiseer deur Wertz (1983), dui op belangrike temas wat alle deelnemers in gemeen het.

Die navorsingsbevindinge onthul temas, wat demonstreer dat die ervaringe van die families wat onderworpe was aan politieke geweld, 'n impak op hul lewens gemaak het. Hulle herroep 'n geroetineerde lewe voor die stryd teen die apartheidstruktuur. Dit word onthou as 'n baie lang tydperk. Die strydjare het die disintegrasië van familie-eenhede ingehou aangesien mense hul huise verlaat het en in ballingskap gaan woon het. Andere het verdwyn, is aangehou en gemartel in tronke, gevolg deur dood in aanhouding. Die verhouding tussen die familie en hul kinders was een van kommer, waartydens ouers hul kinders afgeraai het teen deelname aan politieke aktiwiteite. Die geweld het gelei tot ontberinge vir baie families, soos die afwesigheid van 'n ondersteunende gemeenskap, vervreemding van politieke organisasies, en wantroue in die staat gedurende die betrokke tyd, aangesien vermiste familielede nie deur die veiligheidspolisie opgespoor kon word nie. Hierdie wantroue het ook bestaan binne gemeenskappe wat gelyk het onder voorvalle van swart-teen-swart geweld.

Die instelling van die WVK as 'n hooftema met die subtemas van genesing en vergifnis, is as positief ervaar deur hierdie families. Uiteindelik voel hulle dat hierdie proses help om hul lyding, met betrekking tot die verlies van hul kinders, eggenote, te erken. Tog is daar uiteenlopende opinies oor hierdie erkenning soos die navorsingsbevindinge ook wys op 'n onvoltooide gevoel van individuele genesing vir hierdie families, alhoewel hulle hul stories van pyn en lyding vertel het. Hierdie is 'n kontroversiële kwessie, wat verdere navorsing verg om vas te stel of individuele ervaringe dieselfde is as die kollektiewe ervaring van die breër samelewing. Die verrigting van rituele en herinneringe aan afgestorwenes vervul 'n belangrike genesingsrol vir die families. Daar bestaan ambivalensie rondom vergifnis vir baie families, aangesien hulle voel dat skuldiges wat aansoek gedoen het om amnestie nie volledige onthulling oor hul bedryghede gemaak het nie.

Daar bestaan 'n tweespalt tussen die huidige regering en die families wat getuig het rakende kompensasië, soos ingesluit as 'n klousule in die WVK-proses. Die families in hierdie ondersoek dring daarop aan dat hulle vergoed moet word vir hul lyding, sodat hulle kan voortgaan met hul lewens in die nuwe wêreldorde. Verdere navorsing behoort ondersoek in te stel of kompensasië van individue wat voor die WVK getuig het genesend blyk te wees voor implementering van prosesse vir genesing van die nasie as geheel.

INTRODUCTION TO THE STUDY

- 1.1 Background to the study
- 1.2 Statement of the problem

CHAPTER THREE

PSYCHOLOGICAL THEORIES ON VIOLENCE AND ITS REPAIR

- 3.1 Theoretical perspectives
- 3.2 Aggression versus violence
- 3.3 Biological theories of violence
- 3.4 Psychological theories
- 3.5 Summary

12

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
CHAPTER ONE	
INTRODUCTORY CHAPTER	1
1.1 Motivation for the study	1
1.2 Description of the chapters	1
CHAPTER TWO	
INTRODUCTION TO THE LITERATURE ON VIOLENCE IN SOUTH AFRICA	3
2.1 Literature survey on violence in South Africa	3
2.2. Literature on studies of violence and the family	5
CHAPTER THREE	
PSYCHOLOGICAL THEORIES ON VIOLENCE AND ITS IMPACT ON FAMILIES	10
3.1 Violence: a theoretical perspective	10
3.2 Aggression versus violence	12
3.3. Systems' theory on violence	13
3.4 Social Identity Theory and violence	15
3.5. Toward an Integrated Theory of Political Violence	18
CHAPTER FOUR	
EXPLICATION OF THE METHOD	21
4.1 Rationale and aim of the study	21
4.2 Method	24
4.3 Collection of data	25
4.4 Selection of participants	26
4.5 Constituting the interview	27
4.6 Dialogical context of the interview	28
4.7 Method of protocol analysis	30

CHAPTER FIVE

PSYCHOLOGICAL REFLECTION AND ANALYSIS	76
5.1 The 'before' of the struggle	76
5.2 The struggle years	78
5.3 The Truth and Reconciliation Commission	82
5.4 The 'after' of the TRC and the new world	88

CHAPTER SIX

CONCLUDING CHAPTER	92
6.1 My own reflections	92
6.2 Contributions to psychotherapy	98
6.3 Contributions to future research	100

REFERENCES	102
-------------------	-----

APPENDICES	109
Protocol 4: Jeff's family	109
Protocol 5: Emma's family	130
Protocol 6: Linksy's family	141
Protocol 7: Pandora's family	150
Protocol 8: Gordon's family	160
Protocol 9: Rickie's family	169
Protocol 10: Zelda's family	176

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTORY CHAPTER

1.1 MOTIVATION FOR THE STUDY

This study was motivated as a result of my observations during the Truth and Reconciliation Commission sessions. As part of national healing process, the TRC was constitutionally established by the government in 1995. The institution of this commission emerged as the government's inspired need toward the healing and the reconciliation among the people of South Africa after the gross violation of human rights during the years of apartheid. As a result of active participation in providing counselling to the victims and families who testified during the TRC sessions, it became necessary to conduct research on their experiences. The research enquiry is based on effects of the historical process of apartheid amongst the survivors of political violence. The present study aims to investigate victimization by critically evaluating and describing the lived experiences of those families who were subjected to political violence. The present study used qualitative research interviews in order to describe the experiences reported by the families. The chapters are as follows:

1.2 DESCRIPTION OF THE CHAPTERS

Chapter One: introduces the rationale behind undertaking this study as the author describes the structure of this thesis.

Chapter Two: introduces the reader to the literature on different forms of violence in South Africa and its implications on families. An overview of how political violence caused disruption and instability amongst family members is discussed. It is also the author's contention that the literature on the concept and definition of the family is not static. In tracing the literature it becomes necessary to punctuate the context in order to indicate how the concept is defined differently over time.

- Chapter Three:** describes the theoretical considerations on violence and reviews research conducted in this area while situating the context of violence within a perspective which includes systems' theory, social identity theory and an integrated theory of political violence. The families in the present study, though micro-systemic in nature, are part of the larger whole, the macro-system. The antagonistic attitude of the families towards the apartheid regime brings to the fore how regulation of the apartheid laws brings changes to the life world of the family. In addition, the experience of these regulations by different groups in South Africa is manifested in social categorization. The social identity theory further explicates the significance of this categorization and the results of the intergroup conflict between the oppressor and the oppressed.
- Chapter Four:** explicates the method which is employed in conducting the study. This explains why the phenomenological approach and the use of a qualitative research interview is perceived as appropriate method for generating data in this study. The presentation of protocol analysis by using three families for ideographic interpretation in this chapter is intended to reveal thematically what is involved in the experience of being victimized.
- Chapter Five:** expands and deepens the understanding of the themes that emerge from the analysis and discusses implications of these themes for the lives of family and family members, the common themes that emerge from the extended discussions of the individual families' interviews and the impact of these on the life world of the family.
- Chapter Six:** summarizes the implications of the present study by pondering issues such as reconciliation, forgiveness and national versus individual healing, as they emerge during the interviews with participants. Limitations of the research are discussed while recommendations for further research are also made.

CHAPTER TWO

INTRODUCTION TO THE LITERATURE ON VIOLENCE IN SOUTH AFRICA

2.1 LITERATURE SURVEY ON VIOLENCE IN SOUTH AFRICA

It is essential that any discourse in this country be situated within the broader social, historical and political context. However, it is beyond the scope of this thesis to discuss comprehensively the history and socio-political dynamics of South Africa. Therefore the aim is to provide a broad overview of the context out of which the present study of victimization of families emerges. In 1948 the National Party came into power and the era of apartheid began. Although discrimination on the basis of race had been practised for decades, it was with apartheid and its cornerstone, the Population Registration Act of 1950, that racial separation and discrimination became enshrined in law in South Africa. Along with the classification of people in different groups also came the segregation of resources, with "whites" (or people of European descent) receiving disproportionately more than people of other races, and "Blacks" (or people of African descent) receiving the least. In effect what this meant was gross disparities in access to adequate land, housing, education, health care, welfare, employment and so on.

Resistance to minority domination and protest against the oppressive legislation of apartheid by the disenfranchised black majority were met by further repression from the State. Even prior to the events of Sharpeville in 1960, black uprisings in organised forms of protests had become frequent. This culminated in the 1970's with the youth protesting against "Bantu Education", thus creating contending forces which became sharply polarized. Riots during 1976, began in Soweto, and rapidly spread into other townships. The polarization emerged as the State increased the reach of its coercive and repressive powers. The opposition responded with a mood of greater determination than ever before (Stadler,1987). Almost invariably the government reacted to that opposition by unleashing more violence. According to Cock (1990), capital punishment, death squads accompanied by disappearances and assassinations, legal police killings, detention without trial, torture, arson and armed attacks were some of the many forms of violence that the State used to subdue opposition by blacks.

Minnaar (1992b) argues that in South Africa we should look at the socio-political conditions which existed during the political upheaval. For instance, these conditions included a lack of formal control and the presence of alternative structures in shanty towns. In most of these shanty towns there were "kangaroo courts" or "peoples courts" (Scheper-Hughes 1994), where popular justice was practised in opposition to formal (that is State-recognised) justice. These conditions promoted the escalation and legitimisation of violence where instigators were often not brought to book. Even though such violence occurs variously according to its context, its impacts are universal.

Mehlwana (1996) mentions that one can compare the impacts of political violence in South Africa with that in other states in Africa. An example is the way in which political violence has brought genocide to the tiny state of Rwanda. Hundreds of thousands of peoples' lives were lost in what has been described as the most violent civil conflict in Africa (Drum, July 1994). To date, thousands of people have fled their homes and taken refuge in neighbouring African countries (mainly Uganda, Burundi and Sudan). The political genocide will, without a doubt, leave a serious impact on the structure of such families (Glanz & Spiegel, 1996).

Chikane (1987:344) wrote that, " the most tragic reflection of the war situation in which South Africa finds itself is that it faces the years to come with children who have been socialized to find violence completely acceptable and human life cheap". This is not only true for South Africa, but applicable in most social situations where such forms of violence occur.

Although violence in South Africa had become institutionalized (or became the norm, the so-called culture of violence) the government in February 1990, announced its intention to dismantle apartheid. Gradually, political prisoners were released and apartheid legislation repealed as a process of negotiation towards a political settlement in South Africa was undertaken. During this spasmodic negotiation process violence increased further. According to Kimaryo (1993), in 1992 alone almost 3,500 people were killed in political violence. This number exceeds that of people killed in over 20 years of conflict in Northern Ireland (Harbison and Harbison, 1980, in Garmezy & Rutter, 1985). Following an agreement being reached on an interim constitution and in the months preceding the country's first democratic elections, threats of civil war from various groups were rife. On the 31st March 1994, a state of emergency was declared in KwaZulu-Natal. The Natal Witness (18 May 1994) reported that 337 people were killed in that province in April 1994. Although the expectations were that the levels of violence would abate, since the apartheid legislation was truly buried, the violence took another

turn as crime-related incidents increased.

The extent and dimensions of violence in South Africa are well-known and continue to be extensively researched. A review of all local research would be a project on its own. Some of the well-known studies include the effects of political violence on children (Dawes, 1990), the experience of having one's house attacked and bombed (Cleaver, 1988) and Turton, Straker and Moosa's (1991) work on the experiences of violence by township youths. The task at hand is to study families who were subjected to political violence and their experience of being victimized.

2.2 LITERATURE ON STUDIES OF VIOLENCE AND THE FAMILY

The most recent literature (McKendrick & Senoamadi, 1996, Mehlwana, 1996, Ross, 1996) on violence and the family (in Glanz & Spiegel, 1996) provides information with regard to the impact of violence on squatter camp families, effects of domestic violence and political violence on informal settlements. There is a dearth of research with regard to how these changes affect the life world of the family. Although this is so, most research seems to look at the changes that occur in the family through the incidents or experiences that have affected children, as will be discussed below.

Globally there are many studies that have been conducted on children exposed to violence (Ziv & Israeli, 1973, Lyons, 1971 & 1979). Reports of these studies showed that these children generally showed no remarkable or longstanding distress. Some arguments support the view that children's resilience was due to their active participation as well as their social support network during these violent times. It would appear as if when a community fails to protect children, a more profound relationship between exposure and distress emerges. Raviv and Klingman (1983) discovered that Israeli children who were held hostage in an incident in which twenty two were killed, showed symptoms of disturbances up to two years later. Both studies in South America (Gibson, 1983) and in South Africa (Swartz & Levett, 1989) discovered that children of detained parents or those of parents who fled into exile experienced emotional disturbances. In addition, studies in Northern Ireland showed that youngsters suffer more than adults. Fraser (1973) confirmed that the reaction of children rests very much on the perception of threat by significant adults in their lives, that is, parents and teachers. McWhitier (1983) documented the effects of bombing and terrorist acts on children.

Before the democratic elections of 1994 in South Africa, the South African State was viewed as having committed systematic violence against the institution of the family among blacks (Reynolds, 1995). Her findings on the effects of the State violence against the family included disruption of ties between children and adults, and those between children and children alike. Most political activists' relations within their families were deeply affected by this violence.

Most research conducted in South Africa (Swartz & Levett, 1989, Seedat, Cloete & Shochet, 1988) during this time focussed on violence which accompanied the political acts of resistance to apartheid on the one hand, and the attempts made by the State and its allies to contain and eliminate this resistance on the other hand.

Researchers (Turton, Straker & Moosa, 1991) moved beyond the status quo mentioned above as they investigated the experiences of violence on cohorts of township youths. These authors confirmed one of the limitations of their study as neglecting to look at the experiences of adults or of family relationships in the context of violence because of their assumption that children are not very different from adults regarding the stress of violence. Dawes (1989) also showed that there was a significant relationship between the post traumatic stress disorders in mothers and the presence of multiple stress symptoms in children exposed to political violence.

Haysom (1986) reports that during 1985, violence and conflict in South Africa increased rapidly. It appears to have started years earlier when protests in black townships against apartheid escalated. He goes on to say that the security forces responded very severely. In the ensuing unrest many people died. During 1985 various regional right wing vigilante groups had been formed. The targets for these vigilantes were members or leaders of groups who resisted apartheid. Haysom (1986) goes on to say that the vigilantes believed that they were supported by the police and in some cases it was alleged that they did in fact receive police support. The vigilantes sought out people whom they considered to be trouble makers. Haysom (1986:2) further points out that in South Africa the term "vigilante is associated with potentially murderous gangs, intent on intimidating, injuring or killing anti-apartheid activists".

School pupils began boycotting schools in protest against inadequate education at about the same time that the vigilante groups appeared. This too resulted in conflict and in deaths. In major urban areas administrative structures lost their power and control. The police and security forces reinforced their coercive activities. Thousands of people were detained under laws of public safety or State security. Vigilante activity was backed by the town councils who

opposed groups who threatened these councils. In this way vigilante and official agencies' interests were served (Haysom, 1986).

Vigilante activity included house burnings and beatings of people. Thus the position was reached that right wing vigilantes were attacking activists against the apartheid system while at the same time, the houses of persons who were perceived to co-operate with the system were attacked by left wing activists. Many anti-apartheid activists were detained and tortured in prison. Some of them disappeared and were later discovered to have died in prison, as their names surfaced in the Truth and Reconciliation Commission (Boraine, 1995).

The situation in the townships was highly complex. The outline given here does not purport to cover all eventualities, but reflects that the family relationships during these times were disrupted in some way or other. It is within this context that torture in detention and abduction or disappearance, and the subsequent deaths in detention of activists described in this study took place. The study does not seek to elucidate the political struggle but only to describe the lived experiences of victimization by families.

As it can be deduced from the above discussions, theorists or researchers arrived at similar findings regarding the individuals' or childrens' experiences of violence but there is a lack of descriptive work of the experiences of violence and its effects on family relationships, especially those families who have been subjected to political violence. Leeb (1988:10) has made the following comments about the family: "As a nation we purport to care about that great god, the family". She mentions that the disruption of family life in the townships cannot be ignored, as families who were forced to flee from their own homes because of violence, find themselves in a state of dissolution. Members of the family become disorientated because their roles lose definitions, separation is often necessary and family intimacy is no longer possible. Very often one or more members of the family have been killed and there is no chance for members of the family to mourn together.

The following vignettes will illustrate what Leeb (1988) refers to:

One family forced to flee because a brother had been killed in mistaken identity for the father was lucky enough to relocate, temporarily, in a house where they could be together. The father was depressed, because, although he was still a bread-winner he had lost his role as the head of the family. Part of this desperation were his five children who had to leave school. They were confined, unable to make a noise because of fear of drawing attention to the situation and were unhappy.

Another family, with children ranging from three years to seventeen years old were faced with the same problem. The father had been shot, one of the children wounded and the teenage son was trying to be the head of the household. The mother was strong and was coping by playing her role no matter where she was but she was having to contend with children who were fairly disturbed.

The above anecdotes are two of hundreds. Research has isolated psychological effects of men, who lose their self esteem, become depressed or start drinking heavily due to these circumstances, and children (Brehm, 1966) who react with depression followed by aggression (Leeb, 1988). This suggests a lack of published research on the experiences of the family I mentioned previously, as the experiences within the family are made known according to how the man or husband, child or wife experienced violence separately rather than as a family unit. It is in the light of this lack of information that I undertook to investigate this phenomenon of lived experiences of families who were subjected to political violence.

It can also be discerned from these anecdotes that these families have experienced victimization which is related to social change. According to Cleaver (1988 :76), "a victim is anyone who suffers either as a result of a ruthless design or accidentally". It would appear that the aim of the victimizers during this period was to curtail socio-political activities of the victims.

Scholars like Bernades (1985b, 1988 and Luepnitz, 1988) highlight a very important dilemma about the the definition of the family. They postulate that the term "family" is widely used as though it represents a "natural" and universal concrete entity, and yet there is increasing recognition that the boundaries of what constitutes a family are more difficult to define (Soal,1996). Bernades (1985b) further refers to the fact that the term "family" could be used in different contexts to mean different things, for example, an isolated domestic unit, members of the extended kin network, even perhaps some image of solidarity. Hoffmann (1990), has pointed out that definitions of the family are value-based and moreover, will differ according to whether structure, household or function is selected as the central concept. In reality, most empirical researchers, as Lee (1987 in Viljoen, 1987:7) claims, have had to settle for a pragmatic, operational definition of the family as " a group of co-resident kin, those who share a household".

For the purpose of this study, the family was defined as the extended family structure which links a wider circle of people who are related by blood or marriage in a network of relatives who normally identify with and care for one another. Although African society and culture has been

affected in many ways through acculturation, it is not uncommon to find a household with parents, children, grandparents, aunts, uncles and nephews or nieces interrelated by many mutual obligations of support and help.

This chapter surveyed the context of violence and its impact on families. The implications point to a deeper understanding of the nature of political violence, how it occurred, and the families' response to the violence. The following chapter will focus on theoretical perspectives on violence.

CHAPTER THREE

PSYCHOLOGICAL THEORIES ON VIOLENCE AND ITS IMPACT ON FAMILIES

3.1 VIOLENCE: A THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVE

The violence which affected the families in the present study can be situated within a context which was characterized by inequality in social relations due to the apartheid structures. Baron, (1977) and Depennar (1990), in McKendrick & Hoffmann, 1990) have defined violence as the intentional use of physical force, involving the violation of physical, social and psychological integrity of another person.

Gil (1981, in Bulhan, 1985:134-135) positioning himself in a humanistic psychological framework sees,

“violence as human originated relations, processes and conditions, which obstruct free and spontaneous unfolding of innate human potential, the human drive towards growth, development and self-actualization, by interfering with the fulfilment of inherent biological, psychological and social needs”.

Bulhan (1985) further calls for the broadening of the concept of violence as he sees human violence as inhibiting human growth, negating inherent potential, limiting productive living and causing death. For instance, he sees human violence as occurring at personal, institutional and structural levels.

Of the three forms that Bulhan (1985) refers to, personal violence is the easiest to identify and its effects are the easiest to assess. It is also a phenomenon expressed in dyads or triads which often involves direct actions and means and is restricted to place as well as time. It is therefore possible to identify a specific perpetrator whose aim can be verified and a victim whose injuries can be assessed in this type of violence. There also usually exists a perpetrator - victim relation preceding or subsequent to the violent incident. Violence can permeate the relationship as a whole in some cases. Nonetheless, personal violence permits the ordinary procedure of imputing intent, rendering judgement and exacting retribution (Bulhan, 1985).

Structural violence is said to be a feature of social structures. It is thus inherent in the established models of social relations, distribution of goods and services, and legal practices of dispensing injustice. It determines the models of relations and practices that permeate everyday living (Bulhan, 1985). This is so because individuals are born and socialized into it as nations or perpetrators and they play out their ascribed roles which then cause structural violence hard to discern. Such structural violence leads to hidden but lethal inequities, which can lead to the death of those who lack power or influence in the society. Thus, according to Kotze (1978), structural violence is simply underdevelopment of a society, which arises from unfair distribution of material and non-material commodities as a result of a racially or class-based stratification system. The connotations called forward by this term are applicable to the South African context. Shramm and Shuda (1991) see structural violence as present when individuals are manipulated or forced into a position where their actual realisation is below their potential realisation.

The institutional aspect is at the intermediate level of complexity and duration and it mediates personal and structural violence (Bulhan, 1985). Although institutional and structural violence are higher order phenomena that subsume and supercede personal violence, all three forms of violence are related and neither of them can be understood without reference to the other two. All three also reinforce and depend on one another. Also their expression varies from one society to another (Bulhan, 1985).

Bulhan's (1985:135) proposal of a succinct definition of violence, though related to that of other authors (Newman, 1979, Wolfgang, 1976, Straus & Steinmetz, 1974 and Gelles & Straus, 1979) is defined as:

"Violence is any relation, process or condition by which an individual or a group violates the physical, social and or psychological integrity of another person or group"

Some psychological theories locate the cause of violence as internal to the personalities of the abuser (Segal, in Dangor, 1990). These then focus on personality traits, internal defence systems and the presence of mental illness or psychopathology. According to McKendrick & Hoffmann (1990), the theories of Freud (1948), Hartman (1949) and Storr (1970) attributed the cause of violence to instinctual conceptions of aggression. Violence is thus linked to a human need to be aggressive.

Because of the difficulty of defining this concept of violence, it is often used interchangeably with the concept of aggression. This is so because aggression and violence are aspects of human life that according to Siann (1985) quite understandably give rise to considerable alarm and concern. To explain these two concepts, Siann (1985) has given a summatorial description of them both as discussed below.

3.2 AGGRESSION VERSUS VIOLENCE

According to Siann (1985) aggression involves the intention to hurt or dominate others and does not necessarily involve physical injury. It may also not be regarded as being underpinned by different kind of motives. In addition, it is not always sanctioned but is more likely to be so when one of the participants does not enter willingly into the interaction. Siann (1985) further states that the label aggression, when applied in a pejorative manner to a person or persons, is a matter of subjective judgement on the part of the labeller. The labeller will be afflicted both by his or her perception of the extent to which the person or persons to whom the label is applied is acting provocatively or defensively.

In contrast to aggression, violence involves the use of great force or physical intensity and is often impelled by aggressive motivation. It may occasionally be used by individuals engaged in a mutual interaction which is regarded by both parties as intrinsically rewarding. Violence tends always to be negatively sanctioned and the use of great physical force is often legitimised or condemned, depending both on the values of the person making the judgement and the extent to which the use of force is seen as provocative or defensive.

The above characteristics include the aspects of intentionality and the use of physical force emphasized in the definition of violence, since the perpetrator's actions may result in humiliation or the destruction of the self-respect of the victim.

McKendrick & Hoffman (1990) describe violence by distinguishing the following three types:

(a) Illegitimate force

This has to do with the legalistic definition that is usually advocated by governments. This is the illegitimate or unauthorized use of force to effect decisions against the will or desires of others.

(b) **Injurious physical force**

Here violence is narrowly defined as behaviour designed to inflict physical injury to people or damage to property.

(c) **Avoidance injury**

Violence is suffered not only when a person is caused physical pain or disabled or killed, but also when he is deprived of freedom, opportunity or pleasure. This broader definition of violence includes not only overt physical violence but also hidden institutional violence.

From the above definitions, both McKendrick and Hoffman (1990) conclude that the manifestation of violence falls into two broad categories, those accruing in nature and those made by people. All in all, violence in all its manifestations at family, community, national and international levels affects people and tends to be destructive. The experiences of violence in these situations are invariably socialized into a cycle of violence which can be manifested or perpetuated in wider society in many forms, thus affecting both interpersonal and community life. In the present study violence will be explained from the Systems' Theory, Social Identity Theory and Integrated Theory of Political Violence perspectives.

3.3 SYSTEMS' THEORY OF VIOLENCE

From the Systems' Theory perspective, the concept of violence can be seen as a process in which certain ideals or causes and effects exist but is often in practical terms, destructive behaviour which escalates in vicious cycles inherently disrespectful of human life and values. For instance, Nell & Butchart (1989) seem to be convinced that racial domination and oppression created very sharp differences between the living conditions of the oppressed and the oppressor and an exceptionally high level of violence.

These differences and inequality of the racial groups in the South African context culminated in protests against the State by the oppressed, political movements which intensified as activists called for equality amongst all people of South Africa. This provoked the State to curtail these political activities through various mechanisms like arrests, torture in detention, abductions or disappearances of family or relatives of some families, in this context. From the systemic approach this political violence, associated with oppression and divisions in the community,

points to interacting and distinguishable factors. It did not only remain a confrontation with the State. Much violence was directed at businesses, such as business owners and their customers. Frantz Fanon (1968) has observed that oppressed people tend to internalize the cruelty and viciousness of violence and make it their own. In South Africa this has been demonstrated by high the rate of “black on black” violence that spilled over since 1983 as Black municipal policemen were killed in the communities, and by such massacres as Boipatong (Kane-Berman, 1993).

Secondly, violence can not only be understood in terms of cause and effect. It can thus be described as a process and although certain moments can be punctuated, for example, victim or attacker, both are part of a sequence of events or behaviours in the process of violence taking place. Although it is possible to describe one person as the attacker and the other as a victim, both are part of a larger system of which violence has become a part.

This is illustrated by the fact that even after democratic changes in South Africa, violence did not end, instead it escalated. This suggests that these changes, though they reflected positive intentions, threatened the stability in the system, highlighting that change and stability in a system go hand in hand. According to Keeney & Ross (1992), for change to take place, attempts should be made simultaneously to establish stability, as the conflict between change and stability processes may result in discomfort.

It can be argued that the Manichean Psychology (Fanon, 1968) and the violence that nurtures it were unambiguously reflected in all manner of things, actions and attitudes during the apartheid era in South Africa (in Bulhan, 1985). The contrasting arrangement of the environment, the unequal distribution of economic resources in relation to white and black cities resulted in the legitimized violence of the State. This largely affected most black families, as police harshly enforced (Bulhan, 1985) influx control and pass laws. Even prisons and the educational system privileged whites. All these institutions and laws were designed to destroy blacks, subject them into becoming insecure, obedient, underpaid labourers. The rejection of the oppression resulted in antagonistic attitudes towards the State. These attitudes were expressed in political protests and boycotts of white owned shops and stayaways from work and schools. The rejection of Bantu Education was epitomized in 1976 by the Soweto school uprisings which aimed at destabilising the government. However, these attempts led to victimization of black family members who were opposed to the apartheid system as they were arrested, tortured in detention or even disappeared without trace. These events affected the

families and introduced changes into their life world.

A recent development in the field of psychology is towards making a theoretical shift from a cause and effect model, that is, from a linear point of view, towards a circular model of thought. This suggests that positivistic thought is replaced by a constructivist perspective. From this point of view, there is a shift away from emphasizing observed systems to emphasizing observing systems (Keeney & Ross, 1992). In the context of violence or any social research, this means that the researcher is not removed from such a researched context. Similarly, the people involved in violence, cannot objectify their thoughts and feelings on their experience of violence, and the researcher on violence can only co-create experienced reality with the participation of people in the context of violence.

3.4 SOCIAL IDENTITY THEORY AND VIOLENCE

Foster (1991) provides a detailed critical review of social psychological theories of crowd violence in the light of their ability to account for political violence in South Africa. He concludes that Social Identity Theory provides the most useful existing framework for understanding this phenomenon.

According to Tajfel (1972:3), Social Identity Theory has been defined as, “the individual's knowledge that he belongs to certain social groups, together with some emotional and value significance to him of group membership” . Turner (1982:15) understands a social group as, “two or more individuals who share a common social identification of themselves, or, which is nearly the same thing, perceive themselves to be members of the same social category” .

Foster (1991) goes on to point to the concept of ideology as a key conceptual tool for expanding Social Identity Theory to give an account of the social context of identity formation and, in particular, the impact of power relations on identity. Foster(1991:385) conceptualizes ideology in terms of the following four components:

- “a set of significations and representations (meanings) historically and collectively constructed and organized;
- which is analytically distinct from but closely related to material and institutional social relations;

- which assists in the creation, maintenance and change of individual's social identities;
- and serves to maintain power relations of discrimination”

According to Campbell (1992a), Social Identity Theory views violent behaviour as a recipe for living, coherently related to social group memberships and power relations. This is in line with the general trend in the most recent literature on collective violence, where there has been a general move away from analyses of violence either in terms of mob psychosis and deindividuation or as the product of anomic and chaos brought on by factors such as social disintegration and poverty. Crowd violence is viewed as a comprehensible response by a particular group of people to a particular set of social circumstances, a coherent form of intergroup conflict.

Applying Social Identity Theory to crowd violence, one would say that within a crowd, individuals define themselves in terms of particular group membership. Manganyi (1990:293) also applies this framework to the South African situation as he postulates,

‘According to this perspective, individuals define themselves in terms of membership of a social category. This condition of self stereotyping on the basis of a social category is the dynamic which influences how the ideological content of a particular identity is translated into crowd behaviour. This means that in the contemporary South African politics of resistance, a crowd member is likely to self-stereotype either as a comrade or a ‘system’s’ person and so on’.

Under particular circumstances this presents crowds with the behavioural possibility of violent action against political enemies or targets as one potential recipe for living associated with that group membership. For instance, one person in the crowd behaves in a way that seems to represent the feelings of other group members in an extreme and exaggerated way, for example, by throwing a stone at a policeman. His behaviour becomes the current recipe for living for all the crowd members who may then all begin to throw stones.

The significance of self-categorization according to Reicher (1987), is that a category membership becomes salient, so the individual conforms to those attributes which define the category. The consequence is that the content of group members’ behaviour is dictated by the definition of a social category, which itself is social and an ideological product.

As described in the introduction of this chapter, the events in the South African context during the political struggle seem to be explainable by the Social Identity Theory. To maintain the dominance of those who were in power during the apartheid era, the State oppression confronted protests by the disadvantaged who established comradeship within the liberation movements which were groups separated by different political ideals. It was not uncommon for the individual during those times to find himself/herself a victim of the comrades, especially if he/she was suspected of being a systems' person. For instance, participants in the crowd which killed Maki Skosana acted on the basis of the definition of themselves as members of the Duduza Community, a community that was poor, oppressed and subjected to violent repression by representatives of the State. Maki Skosana was believed to have been one of the collaborators. Therefore in identity terms, Maki was an enemy of the community and there existed an ideological advantage in attacking her.

In the same vein, individuals who opposed the State, became victims of the State (in the 1980's) in South Africa. The State produced law and order violence as a social form of control and violence in the name of social and political change. The victims were later detained and tortured in prison. In extreme incidents, victims disappeared from their communities and were later discovered to have been abducted by the agents of the State and eventually stories were told about how these individuals met their deaths in prison.

Reicher (1987) emphasizes that the behaviours that occur in the immediate context of the crowd situation need to be located in terms of the broader ideological context of the intergroup relations between the group membership of those involved in the encounter. In their applications of these principles to concrete instances of crowd violence in South Africa and Britain, writers such as Manganyi (1990) and Reicher (1987) focus on power relations of race and class as the broader ideological contexts of crowd behaviour.

One would argue that there is a relation between these theories and the family. Hoffmann (1990) states that violence within the wider society is related to experiences of violence in childhood and family life. Because the family is a microcosm of society, the prevalence of violence in a particular society is invariably linked into a cycle of violence manifested in families and perpetuated in wider society in many forms (McKendrick & Hoffmann, 1990).

Analyses of the violence that affected families in the South African context during the political struggle could be linked to a macro-system level of that time where ideology sanctioned power

relations between the poor and the wealthy, the ruling classes and the governed. Most black families then, were the governed and were opposed to the inequality between the oppressor and the oppressed. This resulted in intergroup conflict explicable in terms of power relations between the different participants in the conflict, for example the crowd belonging to the communities and the police who arrested people who were protesting against the State. The argument posited here links with Social Identity Theory and is thus helpful in understanding how violence, which is based on ideology, resulted in victimization of the families in the present study.

3.5 TOWARD AN INTEGRATED THEORY OF POLITICAL VIOLENCE

Gurr (1970) writes that the institutions, persons and policies of rulers have inspired the violent wrath of their nominal subjects throughout the history of organized political life. In such institutions it is not uncommon to find political violence. Political violence refers to all collective attacks within a political community against the political regime, its actors, including competing political groups as well as incumbents or its policies. The concept subsumes revolutions, ordinary defined as fundamental socio-political change accomplished through violence. It also includes guerilla wars, *coups det'ats*, rebellions and riots. Political violence is in turn subsumed under 'force', the use of threat of violence by any party or institution to attain ends within or outside the political order. Authoritative coercion in the service of the State is a crucial concept in political theory and an issue of continuing dispute. Some have identified the distinctive characteristics of the State as its monopoly of physical coercion. Max Weber, in Mohr (1958:494) wrote that violence is a "means specific", to the State and that, "the right of the physical violence is assigned to all other associations or individuals only to the extent permitted by the State, it is supposed to be the exclusive source of the right to use violence".

This theoretical point of view becomes congruent with violence which had an impact on the families in the present study, as they were affected by overtly political acts of resistance to the Apartheid regime on the one hand, and the attempts by the State and its allies on the other hand to contain and eliminate this resistance. For instance in April 1986, violence reached high levels with attacks on residents by vigilantes. The occupation of the township of Alexandria by security forces in June 1986, was marked by a week of violence which came to be known as 'Alexandria's six day war' (Mahabela, 1988). While overt violence was reduced in the following months, it is widely perceived that harassment, intimidation and detentions continued throughout the townships in South Africa.

The basic model of conditions leading to political violence incorporates psychological and societal variables. According to Gurr (1970) the primary causal sequence in political violence is first, the development of discontent, second the politicization of that discontent, and finally, its actualization in violent action against political objects and actors. He further argues that discontent arises from the perception of relative deprivation which is the basic instigating condition for participants in collective violence. The linked concepts of discontent and deprivation comprise most of the psychological states implicit or explicit in such theoretical notions about the causes of violence as frustration, alienation, drive and goal conflicts.

Relative deprivation is defined as perceived discrepancy between mens' value expectations and their value capabilities. Value expectations are the goods and conditions of life to which people believe they are rightfully entitled to. Value capabilities are the goods and conditions they think they are capable of attaining or maintaining, given the social means available to them. Societal conditions that increase the average level of intensity of expectations without increasing capabilities, increase the intensity of discontent. Societal conditions that decrease mens' average value position without decreasing their value expectations similarly increase deprivation, hence the intensity of discontent (Gurr, 1970).

The issue of relative deprivation which is well known in South Africa cannot be over-emphasized here. The political philosophy of Apartheid which was practised in South Africa for more than forty years contributed to the exceptionally high rate of political violence to which these families in this study were subjected to. Turton (1986) notes and links this to problems such as poverty, unemployment and these are factors which are in turn linked to the material effects of Apartheid policies in education, labour laws, accommodation, influx control, health and welfare and others. Although it is impossible to prove if the township conditions mostly occupied by the blacks would have been different under other political structures, Lilli and Rehm, 1988, (in Berry, Segall and Kagitcibasi, 1988) point out that social categorizations lead individuals to make evaluative judgements about other members of other groups. For instance, the sharp differences of the social conditions between the oppressor and the oppressed which existed during the Apartheid regime cannot be discounted. When social identities are enhanced by intergroup comparisons, devaluation of out-groups can lead to conflicts worse when persistence of being negatively categorized or labelled occurs. For example, even the fragmented education system which existed in South Africa over forty years was aimed at training blacks for cheap labour and to keep them inferior. This conventional education system was part of the Apartheid political system hence it resulted in social unrest and burning of the schools by school children during

the 1976 uprisings. Manganyi (1976) states that this has contributed to black South Africans internalising negative views about themselves and their low status in South Africa.

The point of argument here is that many of the attitudes and societal conditions that facilitate political violence may be present and relatively unchanging in a society over a long period. They become relevant or operative in the genesis of violence only when relative deprivation increases in scope and intensity. Gurr (1970) argues that intense politicized discontent also can be widespread and persistent over a long period without overt manifestation because a regime monopolizes coercive and institutional support. A weakening of regime control or the development of dissident organizations in such situations is highly likely to lead to massive violence as it did in Hungary in 1956, and in China in 1966 to 1968. According to Mc Kendrick and Hoffmann (1990) the mobilization of resources in South Africa at political, economic and ideological levels during the Apartheid regime increased resistance to minority rule. This was a State's response to defeat liberation movements without engaging in full-scale conventional war. However the military approach adopted by the State which engaged in forced removals, monitoring protest demonstrations, suppressing resistance to homeland independence, strike-breaking and maintaining beach apartheid was met with acts of counter-violence from the liberation movements. The State was faced with a revolutionary onslaught which weakened the regime as national and international calls were made for apartheid to be dismantled. The arguments explained in this theory, while reflecting the understanding of victimization experienced by the families in the present study, also espouses discussions revealed by both the Systems' and Social Identity Theories above.

The theoretical perspectives in this chapter attempted to explain the context of violence in which families under investigation in the present study found themselves. The explanatory power here lies in the fact that individuals, families, communities and even societies can be understood in terms of their mutual interconnections. Systems do not represent physical bodies but what transpires between the parts, the underlying meaning - a social construction. This meaning as described is that of both the victim and the attacker which have been part of the larger system in the context of political violence which affected their families. The three theories discussed above are insightful in providing an expanded analysis of accounts of violence, and this knowledge will provide a better link with the following chapters. The next chapter will explicate the method.

CHAPTER FOUR

EXPLICATION OF THE METHOD

4.1 RATIONALE AND AIM OF THE STUDY

The aim of phenomenological psychology is to understand the meaningfulness of human experience as it is actually lived. It is my aim in this study therefore to understand and convey the meaningfulness of the victims' experience of being subjected to political violence. According to Aanstoos (1984:2):

"For phenomenological psychology, the fundamental psychological reality is human being-the-world, a term indicative of an essential relation of person and world".

It is my task to make this structure of relation of person and world explicit hence the data generating questions were open ended to allow subjects to tell their own story about the situation in which they experienced victimization.

The arguments posited in Chapter One of this study gave rise to the present investigation. Rabinowitz (1988) states that although political violence is only one form along the broad spectrum of violence to which children and adults alike are exposed to in South Africa, criminal and domestic violence must also be considered. This exposure results in people being victims who are killed, injured or whose property is damaged .

In the South African context, literature about political violence has been described in detail (McKendrick and Hoffman, 1990), with specific reference to a militarized society, agencies of violence and forms of violence. During the height of the freedom struggle, the former head of the South African Defence Force, General C.J. Viljoen reiterated that, "South Africans must be prepared to accept certain levels of discomfort, disruption and even violence in their every day lives" (in Hough, 1984).

Even in the context of this statement, there is very little information that has been documented about the experiences of this disruption or violence on the life world of the family. Although the South African media is available to depict in detail the horrendous forms of violence that victims

of political violence have endured, these detailed narrative events remain pure descriptions related by journalists as observers rather than descriptions of experiences from the families themselves.

Therefore the purpose of the present study is to describe how the family's world has changed in different moments and different contexts. The different contexts during the political strife in South Africa are torture, harassment, death in detention, a long wait for liberation and post apartheid South Africa. Also in post apartheid South Africa, reconciliation processes are in place through the Truth and Reconciliation Commission. This process is aimed at achieving reconciliation between the perpetrators of the State-sanctioned violence and their victims. It was believed that through the revelation of the truth of what really took place, the deep divisions of the past in this society would be healed. This would then create a moral climate in which reconciliation and peace would flourish (Boraine, 1995). In fact through this process South Africa has attempted to lift the blanket of shame from the well of our common grief.

It would appear that South Africa's truth and reconciliation process is modelled on the post war process similar to that of other countries such as Chile, El Salvador, Argentina and Germany. In Germany fifty years ago, at the end of the war, effective structures to establish truth and promote reconciliation were erected, younger generations were told about what happened in the past through history books and monuments in the museums were put in place as memoirs of that history (Frescura, 1996, personal communication). For the purpose of the present study, only the events that included disappearances or abductions, exposure to torture in detention followed by deaths in detention were investigated. It is understandable that the different events referred to in this study symbolize traumatic moments for the families that were subjected to political violence.

The rationale behind this investigation is to examine whether the family's life world has in any way been changed by victimization. It is my belief that since human beings are self interpreting beings, these experiences would be better articulated by the families themselves rather than being attributed by the researcher in gaining knowledge at a distance as an observer. This belief is supported by Aanstoos's (1984:4) reference to phenomenological research:

“Furthermore in phenomenological research I remain faithful to experience by proceeding descriptively. I begin by obtaining naive descriptions from subjects. Moreover this descriptive emphasis is not compromised by the later imposition of hypothetical constructs. My aim as researcher is rather to reflectively determine and explicate the essential structure of the experience. I achieve this by making explicit the meaningful coherence that may have been lived only problematically and hence described only implicitly by the subjects. In this way, phenomenological research is not caught by the same dilemmas that plagued introspectionism. It does not require that the subject grasp the essential structure of their experience, only that they describe their experience as they lived it”.

It has to be understood that this study is an investigation of the experiences of the families as victims in the state of political upheaval in South Africa and encompasses a broad definition of victimization. The aim is to understand and describe the meaning of this particular type of victimization. This suggests that the description of experiences of families who have been subjected to political violence will be documented. It is hoped that the study of this type of victimization will also add to the understanding of victimization in general.

According to Aanstoos (1984:2)

“For phenomenological psychology, the fundamental psychological reality is human being-in-the-world, a term indicative of an essential relation of person and world”.

Many of the processes which psychology studies, for example, thinking, emotion, perception, memory, learning and motivation are specific modes by which people relate to the world.

Aanstoos (1984:2-3) refers:

“Phenomenology’s most basic discovery is that this relation is lived as an intentional unity, a correlation of experiencer-experienced. Thus, psychologically speaking, a person is always in relation “to” or directed “toward” or “intending” something. Furthermore, by virtue of this intentional unity, that toward which the person is directed coheres, that is, it presents itself to experience as always already meaningful in some way”.

Accordingly, the research task at hand is to study the meaningful coherence of experience of victimization as it is lived. In the present study the forms of political violence which these families lived through are disappearances, abductions and torture in detention followed by death in detention (McKendrick & Hoffmann, 1990).

4.2 METHOD

A psychometric approach was not considered as appropriate. Firstly, a questionnaire forces a subject into a particular mode, and secondly, such a questionnaire can only be constructed after the researcher has particularized the structure of the experience of the participant. The procedure used here enabled the researcher to study the data as it emerged and not according to particular pre-selected aspects. According to Giorgi (1983:137), “the phenomenologist seeks to understand behaviour within the context of experience”, and therefore a phenomenological approach seemed appropriate. This approach does not assume that we understand psychological reality, it seeks to describe the life-world of the participant. The question of the validity of this method of research has been dealt with by Kvale, (1996), Kruger (1979) and Wertz (1984). The reliability of this method of research can be, and has in this case been dealt with by presenting the analysis to a colleague and the promoter for verification.

In the present study a form of qualitative analysis, the empirical phenomenological method (de Koning, 1979, Giorgi, 1975 and Stones, 1988) was employed. One of the principles of this method is to suspend one’s assumptions and theoretical presuppositions in order to obtain comprehensive subjective descriptions.

According to Moustakas (1994:13), these descriptions provide the basis for “a reflective structural analysis that portrays the essence of the experience”. Essence refers to those constituent meanings which define the experience, and which cannot be sacrificed without compromising the integrity of the experience (Kvale, 1983). The researcher not only interprets what is said but how it is said, as observations of facial expressions, vocalization and other bodily gestures give meaning to the experience. For example in Sally’s family, during the interview with Alex about his son who disappeared, I observed how painful it was to talk about his disappearance and death as he sobbed bitterly (see protocol two: example of the text).

The objective of phenomenological research is to uncover and accurately describe the essential meanings implicit in the participants’ naive description of their experience. Such explication yields a condensed specific description or situated structure which illuminates the essence of each individual’s unique experience. By identifying essential themes common to all or most participants a general description or structure of the experience in question is derived.

In the present study the data which would identify these themes was obtained by using a qualitative interview as a research tool (Kvale, 1996). Using the interview as a research tool met the criteria of the aim of the study as families understanding of the meanings of victimization in their lived world were described (Kvale, 1996). Some of the criteria, to mention a few, are that the families have had an experience relating to victimization, they are fluent in communicating their feelings, thoughts and perceptions in relation to this victimization, have the same home language as the researcher and expressed willingness to be open to the researcher (Kruger, 1988).

4.3 COLLECTION OF DATA

The data was collected by means of unstructured interviews. The interviews were recorded on an audio tape. The present writer acted as an interviewer. The interviewer conducted meetings with the participants which lasted for about an hour to an hour and a half a week prior to the session scheduled for the interview. This conversation was held to explain the steps of what was to happen and was crucial to establish rapport with the participants. This was important in this study as explanation of all the procedures and steps also allayed participants' anxieties. For instance they were anxious about the use of an audio tape as they wanted to know who would have access to this data. The participants were told that the information given would be used to analyse their experiences and that their identities would remain anonymous. They were told that what they experienced was important and not their political views.

As an interviewer *my bona fides* were accepted by the subjects who obviously placed a great store on the confidence they gained from the present writer who acted as a counsellor to the families before and after they testified at the Truth and Reconciliation Commission. Although this is so, it would not be uncommon for the victims to refuse to participate in a study of this nature due to association with people who are perceived as powerful or authority figures. Another fact is that previous research on political imprisonment and torture (Foster, Davis & Sandler, 1987) had no significant impact on the legal process. No court accepted the psychological claim that South African versions of solitary confinement were harmful, thus subjecting victims to a more helpless situation. These perceptions have been inherited from the authoritarian political system. When the data gathering interview phase began, the tape recorder was switched on and the subjects were asked the following:

“I would like you to tell me what your experience was of being detained and tortured in prison. Tell me what happened, how it affected you and what you felt during and after the incident. Take your time, you can start whenever you like”.

To those participants whose family members disappeared and subsequently died while detained the following question was asked:

“I would like you to tell me about the experience of having your (father or mother your boyfriend or girlfriend or spouse, your husband or wife, your son or daughter or your brother or sister) disappear and his/her subsequent death in prison. Tell me what happened, how it affected you and what you felt during and after the incident. Take your time, you can start whenever you like”.

The last question was conveyed according to the interviewee’s status relation to the family. In other words the relationship of the interviewee with the person who had either disappeared, tortured or died in detention. During the interview, the interviewer used phrases such as, “Could you tell me more about that”, or “Could you explain that to me?” in order to encourage the subjects. Although the duration of the interview is determined by the participants, in the present study, it differed from participant to participant but was on average ninety minutes with the longest interviews not more than two hours. According to Giorgi (1970) an interview can last any length of time.

4.4 SELECTION OF PARTICIPANTS

Participants were selected on the basis of an experience of being subjected to political violence. The families were sampled from the present writers’ direct contact with them while providing counselling during the Truth and Reconciliation Commission sessions. This led to the present writer being a facilitator at a group meeting of all those who had testified, where families themselves were afforded a supportive role for each other, to share their experiences of the past and to explore meaningful ways of healing their souls. This sample then, was a sample of convenience.

Using the guidelines of Van Kaam (1969) the participants met the following criteria:

- the ability to express themselves linguistically with ease;
- the ability to sense and to express inner feelings and emotions without shame and inhibitions;

- the ability to sense and to express organic experiences that accompany these feelings;
- the experience of the situation under investigation;
- a spontaneous interest in their experience;
- the ability to report orally or write what was going on with themselves (in Valle and Halling, 1989).

This procedure meant that the researcher studied the data as it emerged as opposed to a procedure which involves particular pre-selected aspects.

For the present study twenty two members from ten families were selected and included the family members of the household ranging from high school age level to adults who were not older than seventy years. They were subjected to political violence which occurred from 1980-1990.

I explained the nature of the investigation to each family. The interviewing of the families continued until the present writer became satisfied that the question under investigation was answered.

4.5 CONSTITUTING THE INTERVIEW

A formal consent form was provided for all participants before the interview. All the persons interviewed were asked to sign a consent form. Since the families are from a Xhosa-speaking ethnic group, the interviews were conducted in IsiXhosa.

According to Kvale (1983) the status accorded to the interview is that ordinary people are able to describe their own life world, their opinions and acts in their own words. It is hoped that this method made it possible for the subjects to organize their own descriptions emphasizing what they themselves found important.

The descriptive data were derived from dialogal interviews which involved the method of imaginative listening. The interviews were both unstructured and semi-structured as questions were open-ended. An interview guide was used as there were similar questions that were asked across all families (Kvale, 1983) who experienced political victimization. More specifically the interview followed the guidelines of Kvale's (1983) qualitative research interview (pp171-

196). For instance the question or interview was centered on the life world of the interviewees, it focussed on certain themes, was descriptive and it took place in an interpersonal interaction.

The interviews were taped on an audiocassette recorder. After the interviews were completed the data were analysed in IsiXhosa. After the analysis of the protocols, some aspects of the data were transcribed by an experienced transcriber from IsiXhosa into English. The transcriber and I came to an understanding about the necessity of maintaining the confidential nature of the interviews in order to maintain a relationship of trust with the participants. The rationale behind this translation was to produce an English text or some data pertaining to the analysed protocols that would be understandable to the promoter.

4.6 DIALOGICAL CONTEXT OF THE INTERVIEW

Another level of description was introduced by conducting a conversation amongst the family members and the present writer. After individual members of the families were interviewed separately, a session was organised whereby all the members participated in a conversation about their experiences. The same research questions posed when they responded as individuals were repeated here. This was more a process-orientated approach than a procedurally orientated approach. For instance, together, the family members expressed their attitudes, thoughts and feelings about victimization, thus enlarging the interpretation rather than simply being an individual's perspective. Also I was able to reflect on what was meant. This provided an opportunity for me to evaluate if I had not overlooked aspects of the family members' experience that were important.

According to Halling & Leifer (1991), genuine dialogue occurs where there is structure and freedom. The structure that provided the backbone of this conversation amongst the family members was that of experiencing victimization. It was important for the participants to experience a non-threatening milieu. This allowed an opportunity for the participants to focus on the theme of the experience of victimization rather than talking about other topics which were not related to what they experienced. Also it was important for the participants to experience this sense of freedom as it allowed them to be genuinely open and receptive to what was new and different in the others' experiences and expressions.

For instance before the research interviews began, one parent remarked that they had never discussed as family members how each member felt about victimization. It was also important

to establish a basic trust amongst all participants including myself during this dialogue. This trust was influenced by the following factors:

- a sense of acceptance that what a person says or shares is heard and valued,
- a sense of direction, that there is something specific the group is trying to understand together (in this instance if victimization did change their lives as a family),
- a sense of freedom that group members feel unrestricted in their ability to question, risk and be creative in relation to the phenomenon being studied,
- a sense of respect for the unfolding of the specific group process, an awareness and appreciation that every group or family will develop in accordance with its own dynamics and that their needs to be supported and nurtured,
- a sense of universalization, a validation or confirmation of the qualitative aspects of the group members' personal experience (Halling, Kunz & Rowe, 1994).

Various levels of dialogue postulated by Leifer (1986) emerged in this dialogue of these family members in the present study. Firstly, the preliminary dialogue was evident during the initial meetings within the group. Secondly, the transitional dialogue brought the phenomenon into the group in the sense that it was experienced in a more immediate and direct way. Thirdly, fundamental dialogue occurred where the discussion was not only of personal accounts but descriptions collected from participants as well. For instance during the preliminary dialogue, I had initial meetings or interviews with individual members of the families as they responded with individual opinions about the victimization. This was important as a starting point as it allowed for sharing of preconceptions and gradually getting to know one another fully.

It was important for me to share my own experiences with regard to the phenomenon of victimization which was experienced indirectly when burglars had broken into my own home and stolen my car. This meant that a transitional level of dialogue had emerged and was experienced in a more immediate and direct way by all the group.

The fundamental level of dialogue was characterised by discussion not only of personal accounts of victimization but of the descriptions collected from all the group members. During this dialogue, there was a building on previous themes and an interweaving of these themes

as they were illuminated by the data. Fischer & Wertz (1979) refer to the themes of victimization as the following; living routinely, being disrupted, being violated, reintegration, and going on (in Giorgi et al, 1979).

In the present study, the sequence followed in the analyses of the protocols is dealt with in the following section.

4.7 METHOD OF PROTOCOL ANALYSIS

All the interviews were analysed using the method set out by Stones (1988). According to Patton (1990) this method has its foundations in phenomenological studies which focus on descriptions of what people experience and how it is that they experience what they experience. The transcribed interviews were broken down into spontaneously emerging natural meaning units (NMU's), statements expressing single, delimited aspects of the subjects' experiences (Kruger, 1988).

The method entails reading and re-reading the protocols, delineating natural meaning units (NMU's), reflection and reducing NMU's, a repetition of the aforementioned phases and then an analysis of the experience. Wertz's (1983) methodology was also utilized in the present study by applying a psychological structure which is composed of several moments or interrelated substructures.

Three protocols were chosen at random for the ideographic interpretation as will be shown below. Pseudonyms have been used to conceal the identity of the participants.

Example:

Dick's family

Dick - (tortured in detention)

Delia - (cousin who stayed with Dick during the period of his detention)

PROTOCOL 1: DICK'S FAMILY
VERBATIM DESCRIPTION
DICK: TORTURED IN DETENTION
DELIA: COUSIN WHO STAYED WITH DICK DURING THE PERIOD
OF DICK'S DETENTION

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me what your experience was of being detained and tortured in prison. Tell me what happened, how it affected you, and what you felt during and after the incident.

DICK: I was one of those people who talked so that government officials of that time could hear. I opposed Government, speaking publicly about the oppressive laws during the 1980's. You see, I was still a youngster then, who had just left school after passing Matric. I received this influence¹ of speaking publicly about apartheid laws from student activities we had in our schools. One of the forms of fighting the enemy was to use the strategies that would be effective.

RESEARCHER: Meaning what? Go on

DICK: Like organising school boycotts, and boycott of businesses in the city that were white-owned, and this made the police to be angry.

Look! This was like war, because one day the police caught me while I was about to distribute pamphlets to inform people in our communities not to buy from the white-owned businesses in town. They arrested me but later released me, not believing that I was the one who organised

1

Dick attended political meetings where he learned to speak in public

this as I was still young. So, they warned me.

But, there's this year which we organised this consumer boycott successfully with other comrades and this really crippled the shops in town. The community supported our call and for a period of 9 months, no buying at all from the shops in town. The police hunted us and eventually arrested most of the comrades under the state of emergency. So I was also detained.

RESEARCHER: What happened then?

DICK: In prison? It was shocking. The security police used to tell us that we had no chances to live. They told us the stories of the past, how people died in prison. That on its own was threatening. The only thing that one could do was to succumb in those conditions and let things go as they were. All the time you were terrified.

They tortured me causing severe bodily pains to persuade me to talk or answer their questions. That caused severe physical and mental suffering. Sometimes they threatened me with guns. They also swung me through the window in a high building called ABC. They connected electric shocks to my toes, wrapped my head in a sock, switched off the lights in the room and slapped me. Psychologically, they would tell me that a certain 'so and so' had told them that I am an informer (impimpi). They made people to be negative about me as they used to say to them I am working for the State.

The only thing I told myself was that I am not turning back. Bitter things had happened then. I had no choice. When you're detained you don't know your release date. Sometimes when you hear the keys you think there is someone coming to release you only to find that police are just fooling you.

RESEARCHER: Tell me more about this

DICK: At times police would go to my home at night, wake my family, kick the doors and threaten my relatives that they should show them the guns I was harbouring as they said I was a terrorist. They would mislead my family by telling them that I would stay in jail for the rest of my life. It is so painful when people threaten your family. At times they would come in disguised cars, like private cars, and this made people very suspicious of me, wanting to believe that perhaps I was really an informer (impimpi).

My family as a result thought that I was just a silly boy who was giving white people lot of trouble but they realized what I was doing when things started happening.

RESEARCHER: Like what?

DICK: You see!, we thought that liberation would come after our deaths. In fact in 1988 I was sure to be sentenced for 25 years in jail. My life was in jeopardy, but through the change of things political leaders were released, liberation movements unbanned, so we were released when talks about these changes began.

RESEARCHER: Your reactions to this?

DICK: Well, happy that I was out but the struggle was only beginning as we would not compromise until the government was prepared to introduce new changes which we saw in 1994 in the elections. I know others are cursing the President of South Africa for not doing enough for them as they also fought for liberation.

My real concern is about those who became more victims than I am, like those who suffered paralysis on wheelchairs now, they need compensation but the TRC process is there to look at these issues.

I think the TRC was a platform to voice my experience but I tell you now, memories of what happened in detention came back when I saw who tortured me. For example, when I was tortured in Village B police cells,

one man told me that when liberation comes I'll be dented. There, I was humiliated, honestly, when I was undressed in front of women.

I can say I'm happy that I am independent, because I studied further after release from jail, so I am not expecting any support from the government. But, I surely wish as I mentioned even in my testimony with the TRC, that this government should recognise the homes and families of those who suffered fighting this struggle as some families are really in a bad situation. I think the community should also support them in some way or other but the leaders of this government should take responsibility. For instance our veterans, these are the people who forfeited their lives to die, so there has to be a way to remember them.

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me what your experience was of being detained and tortured in prison. Tell me what happened, how it affected you, and what you felt during and after the incident.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 1 I was one of those people who talked so that the government officials of that time could hear. I opposed Government, speaking publicly about the oppressive laws during the 1980's.
- 2 You see, I was still a youngster then, who had just left school after passing Matric. I received this influence of speaking publicly about apartheid laws from student activities we had in our schools. One of the forms of fighting the enemy was to use the strategies that would be effective.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

- Dick voiced his opposition of the oppressive laws of the government publicly.
- Dick's protest actions were influenced by students' activities which helped him to speak publicly about activities in the struggle.

RESEARCHER: Meaning what? Go on

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

Like organising school boycotts, boycott of business in the city that were white owned, and this made the police to be angry. Look! This was like war, because one day the police caught me while I was about to distribute pamphlets to inform people in our communities not to buy from the white owned businesses in town. They arrested me but later released me, not believing that I was the one who organised this as I was still young. So, they warned me.

- 3 But, there's this year which we organised this consumer boycott successfully with other comrades and this really crippled the shops in town. The community supported our call and for a period of 9 months, no buying at all from the shops in town. The police hunted us and eventually arrested most of the comrades under the state of emergency. So I was detained.

RESEARCHER: What happened then?

- 4 In prison? It was shocking. The security police used to tell us that we had no chances to live. They told us stories of the past, how people died in prison. That on its own was threatening. The only thing one could do was to succumb in those conditions and let things go as they were. All the time you were terrified.

- 5 They tortured me causing severe bodily pains to persuade me to talk or answer their questions. That caused severe physical and mental suffering. Sometimes they threatened me with guns. They also swung me through the window in a high building called ABC. They connected electric shocks to my toes, wrapped my head in a sock, switched off the lights in the room and slapped me. Psychologically, they would tell me that a certain 'so and so' had told them that I am an informer (impimpi). They made people to be negative about me as they used to say to them I am working for the State.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Dick makes it clear that from his perspective it was a war with racial prejudice and oppression as the main thrust of the struggle hence they participated in the activities they used to fight back. This culminates in his arrest by police but later release with a warning.

Dick and his comrades organize a successful consumer boycott which had an impact on businesses, leading to their arrest and detention by the police.

Dick describes life threatening experiences to which he was subjected to by the police which conveyed the impression that detainees would die in prison.

Dick describes inhumane and vicious methods of torture which were inflicted upon him. These were life threatening. They caused mental and physical suffering.

He also describes his unwillingness to give in, his determination in spite of psychological manipulation of the prospect of being released.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 6 The only thing I told myself was that I am not turning back. Bitter things had happened then. I had no choice. When you're detained you don't know your release date. Sometimes when you hear the keys you think there is someone coming to release you only to find that police are just fooling you.

RESEARCHER: Tell me more about this.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 7 At times police would go to my home at night, wake my family, kicked the doors and threaten my relatives that they should show them the guns I was harbouring as they said I was a terrorist. They would mislead my family by telling them that I would stay in jail for the rest of my life. It is painful when people threaten your family. At times they would come in disguised cars, like private cars and this made people very suspicious of me wanting to believe that perhaps I was really an informer (impimpi). My family as a result thought that I was just a silly boy who was giving white people lots of trouble but they realized when things started happening.

RESEARCHER: Like what?

- 8 You see! we thought that liberation would come after our deaths. In fact in 1988 I was sure to be sentenced for 25 years in jail. My life was in jeopardy, but through the change of things political leaders were released, liberation movements unbanned, so we were released when talks about changes began.

I'm happy I was out but the struggle was only beginning as we would not compromise until the government was prepared to introduce new changes which we saw in the 1994 elections.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Dick describes how even the prospect of being released was used against him as a form of psychological torture.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Dick explains the intensity of life threats (kicking doors at night, misleading family into believing that Dick would never come out of prison, confusing the family and community by disguising) which are painful; of having his family harassed by police and their acts which resulted in paranoia of the community while Dick's family lacked understanding of his actions as an activist.

Dick thought they would never experience the success of the liberation struggle but to their disbelief were released sooner than they had imagined.

Dick was happy to be released from jail but wouldn't give up fighting until changes occurred in the government and the society.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 9 I know others are accusing the President of South Africa of not doing enough for them as they also fought for liberation. My concern is about those who became more victims than I am, like those who suffered paralysis, on wheelchairs now, they need compensation that the TRC process is there to look at these issues.
- 10 I think the TRC was a platform to voice my experiences but I tell you now, memories of what happened in detention came back when I saw those who tortured me. For example, when I was tortured in Village B police cells, one man told me that when liberation comes I'll be dented. There, I was humiliated honestly, when I was undressed in front of women.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Dick feels that people expect the President to compensate them for their involvement in the struggle while his altruistic behaviour is towards those who became disabled. However, he expresses hope of the TRC to address the needs of those who were severely disabled.

Dick's thoughts of the TRC are of a platform to make public his experience as he remembers and mentions an incident of being humiliated by his captors.

RESEARCHER: What happens now?

- 11 Well, I can say I'm happy that I am autonomous, because I studied further after release from jail, so I am not expecting any support from the government
- 12 But, I surely wish as I mentioned even in my testimony with the TRC, that this government should recognise the homes and families of those who suffered fighting the struggle as some families are really in a bad situation. I think the community should also support them in some way or other but the leaders of this government should take responsibility. For instance our veterans, these are the people who forfeited their lives to die, so there has to be a way to remember them.

Dick takes pride in being an independent autonomous citizen.

While showing an awareness of suffering and destruction of homes and families, Dick feels very strongly that both the government and the community should make supportive resources available to heal the suffering which occurred during the struggle.

DELIA - DICK'S COUSIN

VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me about the experience of having your cousin detained and tortured in prison. Tell me what happened, how it affected you and what you felt during and after the incident.

DELIA:

It is a very long story sisi, (sister) but I'll tell you what I can remember as this happened a long time, like ten years or more. As far as I can remember Dick was popular amongst students at school as he spoke a lot. He appeared more upfront with student politics, and even when he had left school he was involved in community political affairs.

For instance during civic organisation activities he was amongst the group which protested against discriminatory laws against blacks. This made Dick unpopular with the police as they would come and look for him in our house. He would hide away though.

His activities became worse in 1985 when together with civic organisations, he organised a consumer boycott of all businesses in town, as a strategy to force the security authorities to release civic members who were detained. I mean the police saw red with this act as it became successful because the community heeded the call. There were posters all over and gatherings held which reinforced the slogan, 'Akuthengwa eDolophini' (no buying from city centre).

This appeared to be trouble for Dick as police came to our house, kicking doors, threatening to sjambok us if we don't tell them where he was. His parents were older, and this worried them a lot. They were concerned that Dick would be arrested if police caught up with him. Sometimes the police would bundle us in their vans pretending they were going to arrest us if we do not tell the truth. I was scared and also feared for the old parents as they didn't understand why Dick was involved in all of this.

Eventually, Dick was arrested and detained with others. As his family we were refused permission to visit him or change his clothes while in detention. This was frustrating and we were concerned about his condition in prison.

RESEARCHER:

And then, what happened?

DELIA:

It was a chaotic period even in the communities. For some reason a rumour was spread that Dick (while in jail) was an informer. Our community became hostile against us now. During these days, just to label a person with this word was enough for your house to be burnt down and also your family necklaced² (killed by a burnt tyre over the neck). We lived in fear and Dick's parents' health deteriorated. But the comrades corrected this rumour.

At times police would come during the night when we are asleep and wake us up to search for guns they alleged were in the house. So, when we slept each day we knew that once or twice a week the house would be raided by police.

Our fears worsened when one of Dick's friends died in a freak accident while detained. The police gave a report that they thought other prisoners pushed him over the high wall and he fell to his death. I thought this could be the same for Dick. After some time we were allowed to see him, relieved to see him but not happy with his physical outlook, as he was thin. He related that things were not good in detention but they were surviving.

When he was released after nine or ten months he was still determined to protest against the laws that were discriminating but was distracted from this by an offer he got to study overseas. By this time things had started happening, like unbanning of political movements that were banned a long time ago. He stayed for four years overseas and returned an independent person, who was working in a business sector.

I was happy about his progress as I had thought that he would not survive in jail, and his mother is thankful that he is alive really.

Now, we are proud of him as a relative, brother and the story of what happened to us as a family was relived when he had to testify about his

2

A method that was used to kill people during political upheaval by putting a burnt tyre around the neck of the victim

torture in detention during the TRC hearings/sittings. We cried with him during that day, having mixed feelings about his survival but sad about some of his friends in the struggle who died. Oh! well, what can we do? We have to be positive that we will never experience these ordeals again in this country.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 1 It is a very long story sisi, (sister) but I'll tell you what I can remember as this happened a long time, like ten years or more. Dick, as far as I can remember he was popular amongst students at school as he spoke a lot. He appeared more upfront with student politics and even when he had left school he was involved in community political affairs.
- 2 For instance during civic organisation activities he was amongst this group which protected against discriminatory laws against blacks. This made Dick unpopular with the police as they would come and look for him in our house. He would hide away though.
- 3 His activities became worse in 1985 when together with civic organisations organized a consumer boycott of all businesses in town, as a strategy to force the security authorities to release civic members who were detained. I mean, the police saw red with this act as it became successful because the community heeded the call, posters all over, gatherings held which reinforced the slogan, 'Akuthengwa eDolophini' (no buying from city centre).
- 4 This appeared to be trouble for Dick as police came to our house, kicking doors, threatening to sjambok us if we don't tell them where he was. His parents were older, and this worried them a lot and were concerned that Dick would be arrested if police caught up with him. Sometimes the police would bundle us in their vans pretending as if they are going to arrest us if we do not tell the truth. I was scared and also feared for the old parents as they didn't understand why Dick was involved in all of this.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Delia recounts Dick's political activities as a young student. His activism expanded to community political affairs.

According to Delia, Dick protested against discriminatory laws which resulted in his unpopularity with the police.

Delia remembers that police were angered by a successful consumer boycott by Dick and others, which was a strategy to persuade police to release civic members.

Delia describes intimidating and aggressive experiences initiated by police acts, thus affecting Dick's elderly parents who did not understand Dick's activist's role.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

5 Eventually Dick was arrested and detained with others. We as his family were refused permission to visit him or change his clothes while in detention. This was frustrating and we were concerned about his condition in prison.

RESEARCHER: And then, what happened?

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

6 It was a chaotic period, even in the communities. For some reason a rumour was spread that Dick while in jail was an informer. Our community became hostile against us now. During those days, just to label a person with this word was enough for your house to be burnt down and also your family neck-laced. We lived in fear and Dick's parents health have deteriorated over time. But the comrades corrected this rumour.

7 At times police would come during the night when we are asleep and wake us up to search for guns they alleged were in the house. So, when we slept each day we knew that once or twice a week the house will be raided by police.

8 Our fears were worsened when one of Dick's friends died in a freak accident while detained. The police gave a report that they think other prisoners pushed him over the high wall and he fell to his death. I thought that this could be the same for Dick.

9 After some time we were allowed to see him, relieved to see him but not happy with his physical outlook as was thin. He related that things were not good in prison but they were surviving.

10 When he was released after 9 or 10 months he was still determined to protest against the laws that were discriminating but was distracted from this by an offer to study overseas. By this time things had started happening, like unbanning of political movements that were banned long time ago. He stayed for four years overseas and returned an independent person who was working in the business sector.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

During Dick's detention, his family, according to Delia, was refused permission to see him, causing frustration and concern about Dick's well-being.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Delia explains the negative experiences of her family from the community due to a stigma attached to Dick while in prison. This resulted in the family living in torment and fear that their home would be destroyed or family subjected to torture by community people due to aggressive acts that occurred during those unrest days.

Delia's family seemed to have adapted to their life style of police raids that occurred in their home.

Delia's family fears were intensified when Dick's friend died in detention under mysterious circumstances reported by police.

Delia and family were relieved to find Dick alive in detention but unhappy about his physical condition as he related that it was tough to survive torture in prison.

Although Dick was determined to continue his commitment to the struggle, he was diverted by his business-related studies overseas.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 11 I was happy about his progress as I had thought that he would not survive in jail and his mother is thankful that he is alive, really!
- 12 Now, we are proud of him as a relative, brother and the story of what happened to us as a family was relived when he had to testify about his torture in detention during the TRC sittings.
- 13 We cried with him during that day, having mixed feelings about his survival but sad about some of his friends in the struggle who died. Oh! well, what can we do? We have to be positive that we will never experience these ordeals again in this country.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Delia is happy with the outcomes of Dick's life as the family never thought he would survive detention.

Dick's family, according to Delia, takes pride in his achievement but reminisce about this torment which Dick related during the TRC sittings.

This story evoked ambivalent feelings in Delia and Dick's family as he was alive but his comrades dead. However, Delia has a positive outlook about the future.

SITUATED STRUCTURE

DICK'S FAMILY

Both Dick and Delia seem to have a similar understanding in their views of the trouble that confronted the family when Dick became an opponent of apartheid laws. His activist attitude provoked anger amongst the security police who arrested and detained him especially when he organized successful protest actions in his community.

While Dick details explicitly his life-threatening situation in detention, his family was not free from this kind of experience as well. It would appear both physical and psychological effects had an impact on the family including Dick. The family members in some way:

- feared for the safety of their son in prison
- were anxious about his condition as they were refused permission to see him
- were threatened and alienated by their community due to labels attached to Dick that were damaging
- were subjected to harassment acts of the police
- were anguished by horror stories of death of other comrades in prison.

This ordeal affects the physical health of Dick's parents negatively, as it deteriorated over time. However, the family's emotional state was relieved when they saw Dick in prison though they were disheartened by his physical condition.

Although torture in detention seemed not to have discouraged Dick from his activities, his continuation with the struggle was put off when he had decided to study overseas. He relates passionately how his achievement that made him independent changed his life. However, he will be happy only if his comrades who suffered physical disabilities during the struggle can be recognised. This was Dick's greatest concern when he testified about his detention during the TRC³ sittings. He feels very strongly that the present government should compensate these veterans who have become victims. Dick has thus become a voice which pleads for others. His intention tends to be altruistic as he is concerned about those severely disabled through the struggle.

Dick's family as alluded to by Delia can only reminisce about their past pain during the TRC process, but this has not prevented the family from thinking positively about future happenings.

PROTOCOL 2 - SALLY'S FAMILY

SALLY: MOTHER

ALEX: FATHER

MACY: DAUGHTER (SIBLING)

VERBATIM DESCRIPTION: MACY (SIBLING TO THE DECEASED)

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me about the experience of having your brother disappear and his subsequent death in detention. Tell me what happened, how it affected you and what you felt during and after the incident.

MACY: My brother was one of the student leaders during the political unrest of 1976 and 1977 in the township. He used to mobilize other students to protest against Bantu Education. One of their activities was to disrupt classes and encourage boycotts, so he was always clashing with the police. One day I was preparing to go to school, the police arrived to arrest my brother. They searched the whole house. That was very embarrassing as our family names were always in the forefront at school. We were seen as my brother and teachers thought I and my sisters would also disrupt schools.

When he was detained for the first six months, I missed him as he could not help me with my school work. He was also a good encourager as he used to motivate us to study while he fought against the oppressive laws of that time.

After six months he was released but continued mobilizing students. He was arrested and detained on and off. The last time he was released from jail, he didn't look well at all. He couldn't walk properly, with swollen feet and he was admitted to the hospital. While hospitalized, he became paralysed in the lower part of the body and his hair started to fall off. The doctors' tests confirmed that he was poisoned while in prison. When he was discharged from the hospital, he was in a wheel chair. This was most upsetting to me and my family as we knew my brother as an active person. When he had gone for his check up, in the hospital,

we never saw him again. He disappeared with his friend.

My parents started to search for him inside the country and in the neighbouring countries but in vain. My parents reported the matter to the police who promised to help with the search. What became funny was that police now searched for my brother in my house. They would come during the night, kicked our doors while hurling stones through our windows. This was confusing. When asked about their actions, they responded that we were actually hiding my brother whom they labelled as a terrorist. At times they would take my mother with them to interrogate her about my brothers' whereabouts. Every time the police van passed by, we became terrified as we anticipated these searches which were conducted during the night.

When others returned from exile, my brother did not return. I never thought he was killed, as I thought that maybe he had escaped into exile but didn't wish us to know. Instead we received information that he was abducted with his friend and they were both killed on the day they returned from the hospital. This was very hurting. My family was hurtful, and I became very angry towards the police.

I became demotivated at school. I could no longer be interested. I know he would never like to hear of that but I cared less as I thought of him dying while struggling for a better education for us all. This was too much to bear. I just wanted to look for work to help my father who was the breadwinner while his physical health was not good.

At home we participated in a ritual to cleanse our hands on behalf of my dear brother. This was sort of a memorial service which also gave the community a chance to grieve for him. After this ceremony friends became scarce and even the youth organizations which my brother belonged to never visited us. This was troubling as we needed the emotional support. We felt abandoned.

Even when the president of this country was released from jail, I didn't see the point of celebrating and chanting in the streets as others did. My wish was for my brother to be present as he would have loved to see the fruits of his campaigns. I became more disillusioned.

I cried a lot, my heart ached as my mother testified during the TRC hearings. My pain became worse when I listened to the Amnesty applicants' testimony. My father suffered a stroke during their testimony. He was diagnosed as having high blood pressure. He was boarded off from work from then and we all depend on his pension. It is a terrible feeling inside to look at my two brothers' children who struggle to be educated because of lack of funds. Their mothers are married. The TRC promised to look into these issues and I'll be happy if their body can investigate or bring back my brother's remains for us to bury. We can at least put this bad omen behind us to continue our lives.

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me about the experience of having your brother disappear and his subsequent death in prison/detention. Tell me what happened, how it affected you and what you felt during and after the incident.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 1 Macy: My brother was one of the student leaders during the political unrest of 1976 and 1977 in the township. He used to mobilize other students to protest against Bantu Education. One of their activities was to disrupt classes and encourage boycotts, so he was always clashing with the police. One day when I was preparing to go to school, the police arrived to arrest my brother. They searched the whole house. That was very embarrassing as our family names were always in the forefront at school. We were seen as my brother, and teachers thought I and my sisters would also disrupt schools.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Macy explains her brother's political involvement as a student leader during 1976/1977. The political activities gave rise to his clashes with the police that arrested him. This led to the police anticipating that Macy and her sisters would also be troublesome at school.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 2 When he was detained for the first six months, I missed him as he could help me with my school work. He was also a good encourager as he used to motivate us to study while he fought against the oppressive laws of that time.
- 3 After six months he was released but continued mobilizing students. He was arrested and detained on and off. The last time he was released from jail, he didn't look well at all. He couldn't walk properly, with swollen feet and he was admitted to the hospital.
- 4 While hospitalized he became paralysed in the lower part of the body and his hair started to fall off. The doctors' tests confirmed that he was poisoned while in prison. When he was discharged from the hospital, he was on a wheel chair. This was most upsetting to me and my family as we knew my brother an active person. This also de-pressed him a lot. He disappeared when he had gone for his check-up in the hospital. We never saw him again and he disappeared with his friend.
- 5 My parents started to search for him inside the country and in the neighbouring countries but in vain. My parents reported the matter to the police who promised to help with the search. What became funny was that police now searched for my brother in my house. They would come during the night, kicked our doors while hurling stones through our windows. This was confusing.
- 6 When asked about their actions, they responded that we were actually hiding my brother whom they labelled as a terrorist. At times they would take my mother with them to interrogate her about my brother's whereabouts. Everytime the police van passed by, we became terrified as we anticipated their searches which were conduct-ed during the night.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

According to Macy, she missed the encouragement she was used to from her brother when he was detained for the first six months.

Macy noticed that her brother was ill on his last release which necessitated him to be hospitalized due to swollen feet.

Both Macy and her family were upset by the incidence of her brother's paralysis who in turn also became depressed. According to Macy, her brother disappeared with his friend while attending follow-up visits at hospital.

Macy and her family were confused and terrified by the polices' actions of harassment while her parents were searching for her brother without success.

According to Macy police believed that her brother was a terrorist whom the family was hiding and her mother was also subjected to interrogation about his whereabouts.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 7 When others returned from exile, my brother did not return. I never thought he was killed, as I thought that may be he had escaped into exile but didn't wish us to know. Instead we received an information that he was abducted with his friend and were both killed on the day they returned from the hospital. This was very hurting. My family grieved and I became very angry towards the police.
- 8 I became demotivated at school. I could no longer be interested. I knew he would never like to hear of that but I care less as I thought of him dying while struggling for a better education for us all. This was too much to bear. I just wanted to look for work to help my father who was the breadwinner while his physical health was not good.
- 9 At home we participated in a ritual to cleanse our hands on behalf of my dead brother. This was sort of a memorial service that also gave the community a chance to grieve for him.
- 10 After this ceremony, friends became scarce and even the youth organizations which my brother belonged to never visited us. This was troubling as we needed the emotional support. We felt abandoned.
- 11 Even when the president of this country was released from jail, I didn't see the point of celebrating and chanting in the streets as others did. My wish was for my brother to be present as he would have loved to see the fruits of his campaigns. I became more disillusioned.
- 12 I cried a lot, my heart ached as my mother testified during the TRC hearings. My pain became worse when I listened to the Amnesty applicants' testimony. My father suffered a stroke during their testimony. He was diagnosed as having high blood pressure. He was boarded off from work from then, and we all depend on his pension.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Macy and her family experienced grief when they received the news of her brother's death while they had thought he was in exile, resulting in Macy's feelings of anger towards the police.

Macy loses interest in her schooling as she tries to understand her brother's death, and directs her attention towards helping her father whose health was troubling.

Macy reveals how both her family and the community grieved for her dead brother.

Macy confesses to the troubling experiences of feeling alienated and abandoned by political organizations while they needed emotional support.

Macy speaks of her feelings of disillusionment at the release of the president and others while others were celebrating. She feels the absence of her brother who would be happy to see what he struggled for and thus finds no joy in celebrating.

Macy's heartache and pain are aroused when her mother testifies about the story of her brother's abduction during the TRC sessions. This pain is worsened by Amnesty applicants' testimony during which her father suffers from stroke due to hypertension. The stroke resulted in her father being boarded off from his work thus living on pension.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

ESSENTIAL THEMES

13 It is a terrible feeling inside to look at my two brothers' children who struggle to be educated because of lack of funds. Their mothers are married. The TRC promised to look into these issues and I'll be happy if the body can investigate or bring back my brother's remains for us to bury. We can at least put this bad omen behind us to continue our lives.

Macy struggles to come to terms with financial difficulties that confront her brothers' two children who experience difficulty with their education. Her hopes lies in the TRC's investigation in helping the family to deal with this as she hopes investigation would also help in bringing the remains of her brother for burial at home.

ALEX - (FATHER TO THE DECEASED)

VERBATIM DESCRIPTION

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me about the experience of having your son disappear and his subsequent death in detention or prison. Tell me what happened, how it affected you and what you felt during and after the incident.

ALEX: Are you aware that he was my first and the only son?

RESEARCHER: No, I am not aware of that. Does that make it harder to talk about this incident?

ALEX: Yes. It saddens me every time I think or speak about it but I'll try.

RESEARCHER: This is understandable.

ALEX: My son was involved with other students in their politics. I don't know what others saw in him to choose him as a student leader. During 1976/77 he was studying in the rural areas and was dismissed due to his involvement in protests against authorities. The teachers saw him as a trouble-maker. When we found a school for him in the urban area he continued his activities. He would mobilize other pupils, hold meetings to discuss strategies to fight Bantu Education. As a group of students they would march into school and disrupt classes. These actions then,

resulted in his clash with the police. I together with his mother worried and discouraged him from these activities but ag!, our cautions fell into deaf ears. He was arrested and as a result his schooling was disrupted as well.

RESEARCHER: And then?

ALEX: He disappeared in 1982 when he was convalescing from the effects of severe torture in detention. When released during this time, he couldn't walk and was in a wheel chair. The doctors said his lower body was paralysed by some poison he might have ingested while in prison. I was suing the security police for his loss of functioning of his lower body. He disappeared with his friend.

We searched for him from all the contacts we knew including political and apolitical organizations. With some caring friends my wife travelled to our neighbouring countries, thinking that he might have escaped into exile. All these searches proved futile. I couldn't sleep at night. I lost weight and constantly worrying about his whereabouts. I thought more about what he had said to me the last time he was released from prison as he convinced me of the danger he was in as he spoke like this, 'Hayi tata, andigqibile amopolisa kule gem' (translated: 'you know Dad, this time the security police have destroyed me') (Alex: sobbing, sobbing).

We lived through hell. Somedays we were hopeful that he would return, other days this hope faded. My body became weak and I was diagnosed high blood pressure while working as a security guard. I became lonely inside, missing him daily. I mean he is my only son who would look after the home while I am no longer in this world. His political organizations also became withdrawn from us. It was very difficult to cope with his disappearance.

RESEARCHER: Why?

ALEX:

I think not knowing what had happened caused uncertainty. I wanted to believe that he is alive while also thinking about his possible death. It was only during 1990 that there was a clue from a policeman Mr Skeels who spoke about the manner in which they killed all the political activists who disappeared during the 1980s. My son was amongst the lot. It was unbelievable at first. I think I didn't want to face that he is dead. Mr Skeels also gave information about how they disposed of his body. His friend also suffered the same consequences. It was devastating. My family was overwhelmed with shock at this kind of atrocity.

I decided to hold a memorial service on behalf of my son. Many people supported us during this difficult time. I also thought that this was the beginning of our healing, to give up, so that we continue with our lives as the family. It was not easy as his remains were still not brought home, and this is troubling me even today.

It is so sad to see his two children he fathered as a teenager, who are to grow up without a father figure. I can't even support their education as I am boarded off work due to a mild stroke I suffered during the TRC hearings. I hope the TRC body holds up to the promises of some bursary fund to help these children otherwise they will be bitter throughout their lives. My wife, I think is stronger than me, because she was able to testify about this painful chapter of our lives. I think for me this became more stressful and I could no longer cope.

I also think that the Amnesty applicants have not told the whole truth with regards to my son's remains. How can I forgive the people that are lying? I am sorry, I won't be able to do that and my wife made that clear to the TRC body. I don't decide about how these applicants should be prosecuted, the law has to take care of that but my forgiveness is abundant if they tell the truth.

RESEARCHER:

I would like you to tell me about the experience of having your son disappear and his subsequent death in prison/detention. Tell me what happened, how it affected you and what you felt during and after the incident.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

1 Are you aware that he was my first and the only son?

RESEARCHER: No, I am not aware of that. Does that make it harder to talk about this incident?

2 Yes, it saddens me every time I think or speak about it, but I'll try.

RESEARCHER: This is understandable.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

3 My son was involved with other students in their politics. I don't know what others saw in him to choose him as a student leader. During 1976/77 he was studying in the rural areas and was dismissed due to his involvement in protests against authorities. The teachers saw him as a trouble-maker. When we found a school for him in the urban area he continued his activities. He would mobilize other pupils, hold meetings to discuss strategies to fight Bantu Education. As a group of students they would march into schools and disrupt classes. These actions then resulted in his clash with the police. I together with his mother warned and discouraged him from these activities but, ag!, our cautions fell into deaf ears. He was arrested on and off as a result his schooling was disrupted as well,

RESEARCHER: And then?

4 He disappeared in 1982 when he was convalescing from the effects of severe torture in detention. When released during this time, he couldn't walk and was on a wheelchair. The doctors said his lower body was paralysed by some poison he might have ingested while in prison. I was suing the security police for his loss of functioning of his lower body. He disappeared with his friend.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Alex experiences difficulty in relating the story about his son as he questions the interviewer about her knowledge of his son.

Alex, though saddened every time when he speaks about his son, will try to do so.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Alex describes how his son was involved in students' political activities which resulted in his arrest. As parents they were greatly concerned about his activities, did discourage and tried to move him to another school. These strategies did not help as he continued his actions which resulted in clashes with the police.

Alex describes in detail the circumstances surrounding his son's disappearance together with his friend in 1982 while convalescing from the effects of severe torture in prison

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 5 We searched for him from all the contacts we knew including political and apolitical organizations. My wife with some friends travelled to our neighbouring countries, thinking that he might have escaped into exile. All these searches proved futile. I couldn't sleep at night, I lost weight and constantly worrying about his whereabouts.
- 6 I thought more about what he had said to me the last time he was released from prison as he convinced me of the danger he was in as he spoke like this, 'Hayi Tata, andigqibile amopolisa kule gem' (translated: 'you know, Dad!, this time the security police destroyed me') (Alex - sobbing, sobbing!).
- 7 We lived though hell. Somedays we were hopeful that he would return, other days this hope faded. My body became weak and I was diagnosed high blood pressure while working as a security guard. I became lonely inside, missing him daily, I mean he is my only son who would look after the home while I am no longer in this world. His political organizations also became withdrawn towards us. It was very difficult to cope with his disappearance.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

While Alex experienced both sleepless nights and physical weight loss he worried more about the outcome of his son's disappearance. He couldn't be found in the country or neighbouring countries.

Alex became convinced of the danger his son might be subjected to as he thought about his words 'Hayi Tata, andigqibile amopolisa kule gem' (translated: 'you know, Dad!, this time the security police destroyed me') (Alex - sobbing, sobbing!).

Alex shares deeply how his physical health was affected by his son's disappearance, when he missed him terribly, feeling empty. He also felt alienated from political organizations thus making coping more difficult.

RESEARCHER: Why?

- 8 I think not knowing what had happened caused uncertainty. I wanted to believe that he is alive while also thinking about his possible death. It was only during 1990 that there was a clue from a policeman Mr Skeels who spoke about the manner in which they killed all the political activists who disappeared during the 1980s. My son was amongst the lot. It was unbelievable at first, I think I didn't want to face that he is dead. Mr Skeels also gave information about how they disposed off his body. His friend also suffered. It was devastating. My family was over-whelmed with shock of this kind of atrocity.

According to Alex his family lived in limbo during his son's disappearance. In 1990 when this news of Alex's son's death was disclosed this was overwhelming and shocking, causing devastation and disgusting shock amongst the family members.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 9 I decided to hold a memorial service on behalf of my son. Many people supported us during this difficult time. I also thought that this was the beginning of our healing, to give up, so that we continue our lives as the family. It was not easy as his remains were still not brought home, and this is troubling me even today.
- 10 It is so sad to see his two children he fathered as a teenager who are to grow up without a father figure. I can't even support their education as I am boarded off work due to a mild stroke I suffered during the TRC hearings.
- 11 My wife, I think, is stronger than me, because she was able to testify about this painful chapter of our lives. I think for me this became more stressful and I could no longer cope. I hope the TRC body holds up to the promises of some bursary fund to help these children other-wise they will be bitter throughout their lives.
- 12 I also think that the Amnesty applicants have not told the whole truth with regards to my son's remains. How can I forgive the people that are lying? I am sorry, I won't be able to do that and my wife made that clear to the TRC body. I don't decide about how these applicants should be prosecuted, the law has to take care of that but my forgiveness is abundant if they tell the truth.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Alex, though he managed to hold a memorial on behalf of his son with the support from the community, feels troubled about the missing remains of his son thus causing healing of the family to be difficult.

Alex is saddened by his inability to support the education of his two grandchildren as he cannot work due to his ill health.

Alex, while recognizing the impact of stress on him and his family, acknowledges his wife as stronger than him in coping with their loss as she was able to testify in the TRC about their son. He remains hopeful about the TRC to keep their promises of a bursary fund to educate the children fathered by his son.

Alex believes that the Amnesty applicants didn't disclose enough truth about his son's remains thus making it hard for him to forgive them, as his wife had communicated their conditions of forgiving through the TRC.

SALLY - (MOTHER TO THE DECEASED)

VERBATIM DESCRIPTION

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me about the experience of having your son disappear and his subsequent death in detention or prison. Tell me what happened, how it affected you and what you felt during and after the incident.

SALLY: I can say, I knew that my son was involved in students' political activities as he was a student leader. He was detained by the police several times

before his disappearance. His clash with the police stemmed from his actions of disrupting classes, encouraging school boycotts by mobilizing students to protest against inferior education systems. One time he was arrested for wearing a T-shirt that had prints of political slogans. His activities were really wild at times, as he would terrorize teachers at school. So the police saw him as a person who was always in the forefront.

His last detention was awful, as he became sick a day after his release from prison. He couldn't walk, was vomiting and I was confused about what was happening. He was admitted to hospital with severe pains all over the body. I thought that maybe this was due to electric shock he said was applied in detention while he was tortured. The doctors said their tests showed that he was poisoned. This was disturbing and we as a family took legal action to sue the police as my child was wheel chair bound. He disappeared during this process, while he had gone for one of his check-ups in the hospital. His friend was with him when he disappeared.

I looked for him all over the country and the neighbouring countries. I thought that he might have gone into exile. The police also came to search for him in my house after having reported him missing. They harassed my family, breaking my doors and my windows with allegations that my son was back in the country as a trained terrorist. These remarks angered me. At times the police would take me into their interrogating rooms to ask me about my son's whereabouts.

RESEARCHER: And then?

SALLY: The search for him here at home and the neighbouring countries was in vain. I also became doubtful of his exile status and I anchored more on his possibility of being arrested. The community also became distrustful of us as rumours that he was an askari spread all over. This aggravated our pain and loss that we were experiencing. There was no direction from political organizations about what to do. It is only my church

organization that was supportive through prayers all the way. I felt alone and detached from the organizations my child belonged to until the TRC body emerged. I watched my husband's health gradually being weak as he is not a talkative person, so he kept all what he felt inside him, and I think that's what caused him to be sick.

After about nine to ten years the news from the security policeman Mr Skeels revealed what befell my son and his friend. I cried until no more. I was very bitter, thinking about this cruelty of killing my son while he couldn't even walk properly due to poison effects. Even today, I don't have a category to place these cruel police, to me they come short of being human beings. Once I think about how he might have suffered being tortured, I become outraged. As a family we conducted a memorial service to bury him. It was a fitting tribute though painful as his remains could not be traced. For me there is still something missing, as a result I feel this empty hole in my heart everyday I wake up. I think my mourning for him is still incomplete.

I think the TRC did an honourable thing by asking us as mothers, fathers, wives or children etc of those who were killed during the struggle to share our painful stories. Just to be listened to by others alleviated most of the burden I have been carrying all this time. This also was not free of hiccups as I was prevented to testify three times by the lawyers of the police who were alleged to have killed my son.

RESEARCHER: And then?

SALLY: The last time they told that I was not to testify, I collapsed in the hall. My children were all crying and the community supporters in the hall became uncontrollable, calling for my testimony. I was attended to by doctors and nurses there, and when I came round I felt humbled by that overwhelming support during that day. I was given another date to testify.

At least I came face to face with the abductors during the Amnesty hearings. I would like them to tell me what they did with my child's body. I can only forgive them if they do that. I promise you, I'll go and dig up those bones and bury them with our cultural rituals as this was the only son in the family.

I cannot look at his two children without crying. Who is going to educate them? Their lives are doomed without education these days. They came before time⁴ which was a mistake I couldn't prevent but they are here now. The TRC has promised to look into future arrangements of bursaries. This becomes a thin hope as we are experiencing hardship now, with my husband not working, sickly, with no proper medical aid cover, it's a helpless situation really!.

I've asked during my testimony that the TRC body investigate my son's remains. I think this will be helpful but as for now we're rejecting the application for Amnesty until the whole truth is told.

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me about the experience of having your son disappear and his subsequent death in detention or prison. Tell me what happened, how it affected you and what you felt during and after the incident.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 1 I can say, I knew that my son was involved in students' political activities as he was a student leader. He was detained by police several times before his disappearance. His clash with the police stemmed from his actions of disrupting classes, encouraging school boycotts by mobilizing students to protest against inferior education system. One time he was arrested for wearing a T-shirt that had prints of political slogans. His activities were really wild at times as he would terrorize teachers at school. So the police saw him as a person who was always in the forefront.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Sally depicts in detail the political activities in which her son was engaged and which resulted in his confrontation with the police.

4

He fathered the children whilst still being a teenager

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 2 His last detention was awful, as he became sick a day after his release from prison. He couldn't walk, was vomiting and I was confused about what was happening. He was admitted to hospital with severe pains all over the body. I thought that maybe this was due to electric shock he said was applied in detention while he was tortured.
- 3 The doctors said their tests showed that he was poisoned. This was disturbing and we as a family took legal action to sue the police as my child was wheel chair bound with paralysis of the lower body. He disappeared during this process, while he had gone for one of his check-ups in the hospital. His friend was with him when he disappeared.
- 4 I looked for him all over the country and the neighbouring countries. I thought that he might have gone into exile. The police also came to look for him in my house after having reported him missing. They harassed my family, breaking my doors and my windows with allegations that my son was back in the country as a trained terrorist. These remarks angered me. At times the police would take me into their interrogating rooms to ask me about my son's whereabouts.

RESEARCHER: And then?

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 5 The search for him here at home and the neighbouring countries was in vain. I also became doubtful of his exile status and I hoped more on his possibility of being arrested. The community also became mistrustful of us as rumours that he was an askari spread all over. This aggravated our pain and loss that we were experiencing.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Sally explains the frightening sickness of her son after his release from detention which confused her not knowing what had happened to her son. This sickness resulted in her son's hospitalization.

According to Sally the results of the tests conducted on her son disturbed the family, as he disappeared while the family was suing the police for alleged poisoning which had resulted in her son's paralysis of the lower body.

Sally's search for her son proves futile and her reports of him missing to the police resulted in police harassment of the family with allegations that he was a terrorist. These allegations provoked anger from Sally.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Sally's experience of loss and pain of her son is aggravated by rumours that he is a trained askari - thus working for the police which resulted in distrust of the family by the community.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

6 There was no direction from political organizations about what to do. It is only my church organisation that was supportive through prayers all the way. I felt alone and detached from the organizations my child belonged to until the TRC body emerged. I watched my husband's health gradually becoming weak as he is not a talkative person, so he kept all what he felt inside him and I think that what caused him to be sick.

7 After about nine to ten years the news from the security policeman Mr Skeels revealed what befell my son and his friend. I cried until no more, I was very bitter, thinking about this cruelty of killing my son while he couldn't even walk properly due to poison effects. Even today, I don't have a category to place these cruel police, to me they come short of being human beings. Once I think about how he might have suffered being tortured, I become outraged.

8 As a family we conducted a memorial service to bury him. It was a fitting tribute though painful as his remains could not be traced. For me there is still something missing, as a result I feel this empty hole in my heart everyday I wake up. I think my mourning for him is still incomplete.

9 I think the TRC did an honourable thing by asking us as mothers, fathers, wives or children etc of those who were killed during the struggle to share our painful stories. Just to be listened to by others, alleviated most of the burden I have been carrying all this time. This also was not free of setbacks as I was prevented to testify three times by the lawyers of the police who were alleged to have killed my son.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Sally experienced no direction and felt alienated from the political organizations

Her source of support was from the church she belonged to.

Sally expresses how she felt detached from the youth political organizations which her son belonged to.

The TRC's emergence gives hope to Sally but she also made observations of her husband's condition of health which deteriorated gradually.

Sally in her bitterness fails to understand the actions of the police who killed her son and finds it difficult to equate them with human beings. She cannot help being outraged by how her son might have suffered when tortured by the police.

Sally feels emptiness and incomplete sense of mourning since her son's remains cannot be found, though a memorial service was conducted on his behalf.

Sally believes that testifying in the TRC was an honour for all victims as sharing Sally acknowledges the TRC's role as honourable in allowing her to share the painful stories with others as this alleviated the pain though she encountered problems or setbacks before she could testify.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

ESSENTIAL THEMES

10 The last time they told me I was not to testify, I collapsed in the hall. My children were all crying and the community supporters in the hall became uncontrollable demanding my testimony. I was attended by doctors and nurses present there. When I came round, I felt humbled by the overwhelming support during that day. I was given another day to testify.

Sally's feelings of victimization by the lawyers representing the police to prevent her testimony causes her to collapse thus calling for immediate medical attention. She is humbled by the overwhelming support she receives during that emotional time from those present in the hearings.

11 At least I came face to face with the abductors during the Amnesty hearings. I would like them to tell me what they did with my child's body. I can only forgive them if they do that. I promise you. I'll go and dig up those bones and bury them with our cultural rituals as this was the only son in the family.

Sally is willing to forgive the Amnesty applicants if they make full disclosure about the remains of her son as she is prepared to rebury them according to her cultural beliefs.

12 I cannot look at his two children without crying. Who is going to educate them? Their lives are doomed without education these days. They came before time which was a mistake which I couldn't prevent but they are here now. The TRC has promised to look into future arrangements of bursaries. This becomes a thin hope as we are experiencing hardship now, with my husband sickly, with no proper medical aid cover, it's a helpless situation really!

Sally's hope that the TRC will find bursaries to help educate her son's children is thin. She is depressed further by the poor situation in her family.

13 I have asked during my testimony that the TRC body investigates my son's remains. I think this will be helpful but as for now we are rejecting the application for Amnesty until the whole truth is told.

Sally wants the TRC to investigate further about her son's remains as this will also be helpful in decisions about the fate of the Amnesty applicants as her family rejects their application until they disclose the truth.

SITUATED STRUCTURE

SALLY'S FAMILY

The descriptions by Sally, Alex and Macy of what occurred amongst the family with regard to the death of their son and brother seem to be consistent with each other. Though as parents both Sally and Alex had discouraged their son's political activities, this was not helpful as he continued with his activities.

The family is taken by surprise at the sudden onset of their son's illness on his immediate release from prison. This illness necessitated his admission to hospital, where the family learnt that in prison he had ingested poison which could kill him. The incident of this sickness and the effects becomes upsetting for Macy. It becomes worse when her brother is discharged from hospital, with paralysis of the lower body and his hair falling out. This incident leads to the family suing the police for damages suffered by their son.

Yet another shock, unanticipated by the family was to come as their son disappeared together with his friend while attending his medication follow-ups at hospital. This experience, according to Sally, throws the family into a state of more confusion. While they search for him inside the country and in the neighbouring countries, the police search their home for him, harassing the whole family. The community begins to be suspicious as the seeds of doubt are sown above their son's askari⁵ activities. These events seem to be disturbing and influence more of the pain and loss in Sally's family. The family experiences more alienation from the political organizations and the community.

From Alex's point of view the disappearance of his only son kept him worried most of the time, and deprived him of sleep, contributing towards deterioration of his health. His feelings of uncertainty whether he was dead or alive precipitated his physical illness of hypertension and he experienced loneliness as he missed his son.

The only clue about what befell their son surfaces after ten years as Mr Skeels from the security police tells all about what happened to anti-apartheid activists. The family's experience of this shocking news is articulated in their expressions of feelings of bitterness, anger towards the police. The disgusting shock that he could be dead causes more devastation as they hear about how their son's body was disposed. Sally reveals more of her outraged feelings towards the police actions whom she discounts as human due to their actions.

The community support is experienced by the family when they conduct a funeral memorial service on behalf of their son whose remains are said to be not untraceable during this time. This, according to Sally, leaves her with feelings of emptiness and sense of incomplete mourning as they would have liked to bury the remains with befitting family rituals which are healing to the family.

5

Askari is a political activist who turns around and now works for the police

The TRC sessions are filled with drama for Sally and her family as she is prevented from giving her testimony three times before she makes it to the stage with her full testimony. The feelings of her voice being muzzled causes her to collapse in the hall, and this incident arouses an uproar from the community supporters in the hall. The nature of this support, she says, becomes a humbling experience for her and her family.

Sally seems to hold high regard for the TRC process for allowing her and others to share their pain with the world at large, but she is adamant that she will not forgive the Amnesty applicants, alleged to have killed her son, until they disclose the whole truth.

It appears that Sally and Alex together with their daughter Macy believe in the TRC's ability to help with the education of the two children fathered by their dead son. It is apparent that the whole family will be happier if the remains of the deceased son can be located and brought home for burial.

PROTOCOL 3 - DOLLY'S FAMILY

DOLLY - MOTHER/WIFE

MOLLY - DAUGHTER

VERBATIM DESCRIPTION

RESEARCHER: I want you to tell me about the experience of having your husband disappear and his subsequent death in prison. Tell me what happened, how it affected you and what you felt during and after the incident.

DOLLY: In 1985 my husband was involved in a civic organization in our community. This organization was fighting for just laws for township residents and this was not received well by the government of the day. My husband received a telephone message to meet a guest to the organization offices that day. So he left with two of his compatriots to fetch this guest from a destination they knew. They never came back till today.

I suspected that they might have been arrested or skipped the country. The local newspapers published their disappearance. I was hurt and feared for his life as the police used to look for him even before this incident. The comrades from his organization came to check if the news on newspapers were true. They then mandated that my house be guarded as there was also political fighting in the community during those days.

During the same day the police came into my house, hurled stones, tear gas and petrol bombs inside the house, as you see half of the house is burnt. There was exchange of fire as comrades guarding my house decided to fight back. My son lost fingers in one of his hands as he was razed by bullets. I was arrested for harbouring people who fought with the police.

On arrival at the police station, I was told that, they (the police) have killed my husband and burnt his body. I didn't show them my weakness and pain on hearing these news, as I knew that they use tactics to

demoralize a person. I told them that they were lying. Inside I was scared, thinking of how am I to cope if my husband is really dead. Ag! I dismissed these thoughts as unfounded.

At the police station, they used vulgar language accusing me of harbouring criminals in my house. They told me that my husband was a communist and I'll also die the same death as he did. Though I felt hurt and discouraged inside about the possibility of my husband's death, I became strong. In my mind the police wanted to break my spirit, so as to tell them of my husband's activities. I was detained for four days and taken to court where the case was postponed.

By this time lawyers from my husband's organization had organized a bail on my behalf. Outside the prison, now, I was confronted by other people from the community telling me of the rumours that my husband was working for the police. Others said they had seen him with his two compatriots in one police station handcuffed. This caused more confusion and I felt no vigour to do anything. I didn't know where to start.

Together with the other families whose husbands, sons, etc had disappeared with my husband we organized a search party. There's not a single police station, prison and morgue in this country that we have not visited to check for them. There was no trace of them. There was a time when I received a false letter from him, from another prison which was a false hope. I went there, but I was told nobody like that was ever jailed there. I believe these were police tactics to lead me astray. I filed a court case of a missing person after three years had gone by without trace of my husband. The case took another two years and eventually nobody could be blamed for his disappearance. I felt helpless. What caused pain was not to know whether he was dead or alive. Some days I was hopeful some days I gave up.

I didn't work, my house needed repairs from the fire destruction and my children were schooling. We literally lived on handouts from the charity organizations. Something that destroys one's pride. But what could I

do? The police kept on coming to check for my husband. They told me that they had also informed the community that I and my family were working as informers as a way of turning the community against us.

This was bad news because if people believed these stories my family could be killed. This suggested that I had to live in fear of death, not only from the police agents but the community. I suffered from nerves, I felt lonely, we closed ourselves indoors. My children stopped schooling as I didn't have money. When they looked for work, could not be employed since my husband's surname had a bad label 'terrorist'. There were days when we would sleep without food. It was difficult, I felt helpless, worse that I couldn't even feed my children.

It is only after ten years that the clue came from newspapers' article that a certain Mr Skeels from the police revealed that my husband and his two compatriots were killed the same day of his abduction.

RESEARCHER: And then?

DOLLY: I was devastated. I had thought about it but hopeful that he might come back. I cried for weeks and after that I felt calm and sorrowfulness inside me. Part of me was relieved that there was a piece of truth, but wanted to know more about his remains. I wanted to speak to Mr Skeels personally but this was not allowed by the justice system.

I was approached by the TRC body to testify about my husband's disappearance. I felt more anger and pain during this period and I asked the TRC to investigate about the remains of my husband. I was not happy at all with the amnesty applicants' testimony, who claimed that they burnt my husband and had thrown away his ashes in the river. I still believe that those bodies are dumped in one mass grave somewhere. I would like to bury them, more so because one body is that of my husband.

I am ailing as the years go by, I do not sleep well at night. I don't have money to support my kids. We've been promised by the TRC that there will be compensation but it will really come when we are six feet underground^{6*}. I mean that! These promises are lip service.

One of the tormentors of my husband asked to meet us as families. He spoke to us personally during the Amnesty hearings. It was very overwhelming. We prayed and cried together and ended up embracing each other. I think he was a lost sheep when he tortured people of his own kind but I have forgiven him. I think what has made me to survive now is to pose a question, 'who was more suitable to die if not my husband'? So I have accepted that he also had to die for others to live and be free.

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me about the experience of having your husband disappear and his subsequent death in prison. Tell me what happened, how it affected you and what you felt during and after the incident.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 1 In 1985 my husband was involved in a civic organization in our community. This organization was fighting for just laws for township residents and this was not received well by the government of the day. My husband received a telephone message to meet a guest to their offices that day. So, he left with two of his compatriots to fetch the guest from a destination they knew. They never came back till today.
- 2 I suspected that they might have been arrested or skipped the coun-try. The local newspapers pu-blished their disappearance. I was hurt and feared for his life as the police used to look for him even before this incident. The comrades from his organization came to check if the news on the newspapers were true. They, then, mandated that my house be guarded as there was also political infighting in the community during those days.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Dolly details her husband's involvement in civic politics fighting for just laws which led him to be lured to an unknown destination disappear and never be found.

Dolly suspected that her husband and his compatriots might be in jail or might have left the country but the story published in the newspapers about their disappearance caused her to be hurt as she feared for her husband's safety.

On learning about his disappearance the comrades decided to guard Dolly's house to protect the family from other political threats which were due to political infighting.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 3 During the same day the police came into my house, hurled stones, tear gas and petrol bombs inside the house, as you see half of the house is burnt. There was exchange of fire as comrades guarding my house decided to fight back. My son lost fingers in one of his hands as he was razed by bullets. I was arrested for harbouring people who fought with the police.
- 4 On arrival at the police station, I was told that they (the police) have killed my husband and burnt his body. I didn't show them my weakness on hearing these words as I knew that they use tactics to demoralize a person. I told them that they were lying. Inside I was scared, thinking of how am I to cope if my husband is really dead. Ag! I dismissed those thoughts as unfounded.
- 5 At the police station they used vulgar language, accusing me of harbouring criminals in my house. They told me that my husband was a terrorist, and I'll also die the same death as he did. Though I felt hurt and discouraged inside about the possibility of my husbands' death, I became strong. In my mind the police wanted to break my spirits so as to tell them of my husband's activities. I was detained for four days and taken to court where the case was postponed.
- 6 By this time lawyers from my husband's organization had organized a bail on my behalf. Outside the prison, now, I was confronted by other people from the community telling me of the rumours that my husband was working for the police. Others said they had seen him with his two compatriots in one police station handcuffed. This caused more confusion and I felt no vigour to do anything. I did not know where to start.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Dolly relates how violence and destructive clashes between the police and comrades in her house, ended with her arrest and detention while her son lost fingers during this clash.

Although Dolly felt terrified of the news from the police regarding her husband she was brave not to reveal her frightening thoughts and feelings of how she would cope if her husband was dead. However, she dismissed these news as lies.

Dolly experienced feelings of threat and intimidation with death from the police during her detention, which resulted in her hurt and discouragement though she acted bravely, avoiding to give in to the demoralizing effects of the police's threats.

Dolly felt confused and pathetic about what to believe from the stories told about her husband's disappearance when she came out of prison as accusations from the community spread widely about her husband's involvement with the police.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 7 Together with the other families whose husbands, sons, etc had disappeared with my husband, organized a search party. There's not a single police station, prison and morgue in this country we have not visited to check for them. There was no trace of them. There was a time when I received a false letter from him, from another prison which was a false pretense. I went there, but I was told nobody like that was ever jailed there. I believe these were police tactics to lead me astray.
- 8 I filed a court case of a missing person after 3 years had gone by without trace of my husband. The case took another two years and eventually nobody could be blamed for his disappearance. I felt hopeless. What caused pain was not to know whether he is dead or alive. Somedays I was hopeful of his home coming, some days I gave up.
- 9 I didn't work, my house needed repairs from the fire destruction and my children were schooling. We literally lived on handouts from the charity organisations, something that destroys one's pride. But, what could I do?
- 10 The police kept on coming to check for my husband. They told me that they had also informed the community that I and my family were working as informers as a way of turning the community against us. This was bad news because if people believed these stories my family could be killed. This suggested that I had to live in fear of death not only from the police but the community.
- 11 I suffered from nerves, I felt lonely, we closed ourselves indoors. My children stopped schooling as I didn't have money. When they looked for work, could not be employed since my husbands' surname had a bad label 'terrorist'. There were days when we would sleep without food. It was difficult, I felt helpless that I couldn't feed my children.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

All attempts to locate Dolly's husband and those of her colleagues were in vain as every possible avenue at their disposal was followed up.

Dolly's sense of pain and hopelessness grew more when nobody could be found responsible for his disappearance after having filed a court case for missing persons. Her pain and double-edged fear were aggravated by not knowing whether her husband was dead or alive.

Dolly's family experienced hardship and while nervous, lonely, and helpless survived on charity funds and these circumstances were humiliating her sense of pride and self-esteem.

Dolly's family lived in fear of death not only from the police but from the community due to rumours spread by the police which would result in negative consequences if they were believed by their community.

Dolly's health seems to be affected by her bad conditions of living thus inducing a sense of helplessness.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

12 It is only after ten years that the clue came from the newspapers article that a certain Mr Skeels from the police revealed that my husband and his two compatriots were killed the same day of his abduction.

RESEARCHER: And then?

13 I was devastated. I had thought about it but hopeful that he might come back. I cried for weeks and after that I felt calm and sorrowfulness inside me. Part of me was relieved, that there was a piece of truth, but wanting to know more about his remains. I wanted to speak to Mr Skeels personally but this was not allowed by the justice system.

14 I was approached by the TRC body to testify about my husbands' disappearance. I felt more anger and pain during this period and I asked the TRC to investigate about the remains of my husband.

15 I was not happy at all with the amnesty applicants testimony, who claimed that they burnt my husband and had thrown away his ashes in the river. I still believe that those bodies are dumped in one mass grave somewhere. I would like to bury them, more so, because one body is that of my husband's.

16 I am ailing physically, I do not sleep well at night. I don't have money to support my kids. We've been promised by the TRC that there will be compensation but it will really come when we are six feet underground. I mean that! This is just a lip service.

17 One of the tormentors of my husband and his comrades asked to meet us as these families. He spoke to us personally during the amnesty hearings. It was very overwhelming. We prayed and cried together and ended up embracing each other. I think he was a lost sheep when he tortured people of his own kind but I have forgiven him.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Dolly receives news of her husband's disappearance after ten years which resulted in her devastation and sorrow-fulness though relieved of this piece of information, though prevented from directed conversations with Mr Skeels.

Dolly is devastated when she learns about her husband's death and her sense of mourning results in calmness and sorrowfulness since there was truth at last about her husband's disappearance. Attempts to seek clarity about her husband's remains are prevented by the justice system.

Dolly's anger and pain is aroused more when she testifies during the TRC, as she asked the TRC to investigate her husband's remains.

Dolly expresses her unhappiness about the testimony of the amnesty applicants with regards to her husbands' remains as she believes that one mass grave is burying her husband with others.

Dolly seems to have lost hope of reparation measures from the TRC as she sees her health failing her thus doubting if she will live to see reparation for her family.

Dolly explains about her feelings of being overwhelmed when she had a face to face talk with one of her husband's tormentors in an emotionally charged situation which according to Dolly ended by forgiving the said tormentor as they prayed and cried together.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

18 I think what has made me to survive now is to pose a question; 'who was more suitable to die if not my husband?' So I have accepted that he also had to die for others to live and be free.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Dolly attributes her survival to her search of answers from meaning for her husband's death sacrificed his life for others to live to see the freedom.

MOLLY: DOLLY'S DAUGHTER

VERBATIM DESCRIPTION

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me about the experience of having your father disappear and his subsequent death in prison. Tell me what happened, how it affected you and what you felt during and after the incident.

MOLLY: I can say that I knew about my father's activities as I was also a young woman who was involved at school with political protests. I knew about his underground mission, so we had an understanding of each other regarding these. I didn't tell my mother as she would be worried. I later got married to one of the political activists that I met in our meetings. As you know "amaphuti ahlathinye" (birds of a feather flock together). I moved away from my local township and city to my husband's location. We kept open communication with my father, but we had a premonition about his abduction as he had mentioned that the police visited and interrogated him regularly.

When he disappeared the police also came to look for him in my house, thousands and thousands of miles from my original home. They even terrorised my family and left with a promise that if we had hidden my father, the police would make our lives hell.

My husband started to search for my father as well but in vain. He was later arrested and jailed for eight years for his political activities. Here I was, with a father who has disappeared, a husband who is in prison, pregnant without work. How much can one take really? This was the most trying time of my life.

RESEARCHER: What do you mean?

MOLLY: I was helpless, lost and less hopeful everyday. I lived in turmoil as police continued to harass me and my family. In fact one day when my mother was in one of her search parties for my father, she and her fellow women comrades came to sleep in my house. We were petrol bombed that very same day. God knows how the police knew that she was my visitor. We saw their cars moving away after the fire had started. It was chaotic, and we were saved from that terrible situation by neighbours who helped extinguish the fire.

My mothers' health, I could observe was deteriorating. I could see the worry in her face. I only cried for her, for what she was going through while she was not observing me. I had fears that she might even die, before discovering the truth about my father and I prayed to God not to let that happen.

We only received information about my fathers' death after ten years when Mr Skeels gave a story in one of the country's newspapers. This story confirmed my suspicion as I anticipated this had happened. I was angry at the police whom I believe knew all along but did not want to be implicated. I mean, we had done all appeals from the government, there was a court case filed for missing persons, which suggests they played hide and seek with us all the time.

During my mother's testimony at the TRC sessions, our experiences as a family were painfully related. It was tough. It provoked more anger and hatred on my part as I feel that there's no room in my heart to forgive these police. What they did is unforgivable. They robbed me of a happy family life, abducting and killing my father, putting my husband in jail. "Nawe zicingele ukuba umntu okule meko uva njani" (translated: just imagine how the person confronted with this situation must be feeling).

My siblings suffered a lot, their schooling interrupted as they were seen as troublemakers at school, have difficulty in finding work. The surname

they bear is a ticket to dismissal from work. So I have gone through a lot and I hope healing will come very slowly. I just hope things can become much better in this democracy for all of us, so that no other persons can experience what we went through.

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me about the experience of having your father disappear and his subsequent death in prison. Tell me what happened, how it affected you and what you felt during and after the incident.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

ESSENTIAL THEMES

- | | | |
|---|--|---|
| 1 | I can say that I knew about my fathers' activities as I was also a young woman who was involved at school and community with political protests. I knew about his under-ground mission, so we had an understanding of each other regarding these. I didn't tell my mother as she would be worried. | Molly admits to her understanding about her father's political activities as she was also an activist but kept this information to herself for fear of worrying her mother. |
| 2 | I later got married to one of the political activists that I met in our meetings. As you know in Xhosa, 'amaphuthi ahlathi inye' (translated: birds of a feather flock together). I moved away from my local town-ship and city to my husband's location. We kept open communication with my father but we had a premonition about his abduction as he had mentioned that the police visited and interrogated him regularly. | Although Molly married a political activist she kept contact with her father and shared her presuppositions about his abduction as police interrogated him regularly. |
| 3 | When he disappeared the police also came to look for him in my house, thousand and thousand miles from my original home. They even terrorised my family and left with a promise that if we had hidden my father, the police would make our lives hell. | According to Molly her father's disappearance also subjected her together with her husband's family to harassment by police who would search their house. |
| 4 | My husband started to search for my father as well but in vain. He was also later arrested and jailed for eight years for his political activities. Here I was, with a father who has disappeared, a husband who is in prison, pregnant without work. How much can one take really? This was the most trying time of my life. | Molly was overwhelmed by cumulative incidents that occurred as her husband was also detained, leaving her pregnant and also unemployed. |

RESEARCHER: What do you mean?

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 5 I was helpless, lost and less hopeful everyday. I lived in turmoil as police continued to harass me and my family. In fact when my mother was in one of her search parties for my father, she and her fellow women comrades came to sleep in my house. We were petrol bombed that very same day. God knows how the police knew that she was my visitor. We saw their cars moving away after the fire had started. It was chaotic, and we were saved from that terrible situation by neighbours who helped to extinguish the fire.
- 6 My mother's health, I could observe was not good. I could see the worry in her face. I only cried for her, for what she was going through while she was not observing me. I had fears that she might even die before discovering the truth about my father and I prayed to God not to let that happen.
- 7 We only received information about my father's death after 10 years when Mr Skeels gave a story in one of the country's newspapers. This story confirmed my suspicion as I anticipated this to happen. I was angry at the police system whom I believe knew all along but did not want to be implicated. I mean one had made all appeals possible to the government. We even filed a missing person complaint, which suggests they played hide and seek with us all the time.
- 8 During my mother's testimony at the TRC sessions, our experiences as a family were painfully related. It was tough. It provoked more anger and hatred on my part as I feel, that there's no room in my heart to forgive these police. What they did is unforgivable. They robbed me of a happy family life, abducting and killing my father, putting my husband in jail. 'Nawe zicingele ukuba umntu okule meko uva njani' (translated: just imagine how the person confronted with this situation must be feeling).

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Molly's experiences of helplessness and turmoil were perpetuated more by further police acts harassing the family by subjecting them to life-threatening situations e.g. use of petrol bombs.

Molly became concerned about her mother's ailing health as she feared that her mother might die before knowing the truth about her father's disappearance. This made her to bargain with God to keep her well until they had unraveled the truth.

Molly's discovery about her father's fate caused her to be angry towards the police who had fooled the family all along, though the story confirmed her suspicions about his death which she thinks the police knew all along.

Molly's experiences of herself and the family were recounted during her mother's testimony which on her part provoked more anger and hatred which makes her unable to forgive the police whom she feels robbed her happy experiences of family life.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 9 My siblings suffered a lot, their schooling interrupted as they were seen as troublemakers at school, have difficulty in finding work, the surname they bear is a ticket to dismissal from work.
- 10 So I have gone through a lot and I hope healing will come very slowly. I just hope things can become much better in this democracy for all of us, so that no other persons can experience what we went through.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Molly sees her whole family as victims of what occurred, as her siblings experienced difficulty with schooling, work opportunities etc, since their fathers' family name was known to be notorious.

It is Molly's belief that she has suffered much. As such her healing will not be easy but has faith in the new order to protect the repetition of what happened to her and her family.

SITUATED STRUCTURE

DOLLY'S FAMILY

Dolly and her daughter seem to have had a different understanding of her husband's (to Dolly) and father (to Molly) activities which resulted in his disappearance. From the day of her husband's disappearance to an unknown destination, Dolly suspected his arrest or detention by police.

The trouble between Dolly and the police intensified during the confrontation which took place in her house resulting in one of her sons losing some of his fingers. Dolly is arrested and subjected to torture and police harassment which are attempts to demoralize, degrade and destroy her self-esteem. Molly's husband, is also arrested while she is pregnant. This throws the whole family into a state of chaos and increases their confusion and sense of hopelessness.

Dolly searches for her husband all over the country without avail. Molly is continuously harassed by the police who come to search for her missing father. This resulted in the family's anger and frustration at the police, everyone else and the justice system. They experience alienation from the community structures once embraced by the missing father and husband.

The family also live in fear of the community as rumours about the missing man surface with regard to his work for the police. All this does increase the confusion. When news about her husband's disappearance is revealed, Dolly experiences mixed emotions. She is bitter, sorrowful but relieved that there is some clue to the mystery disappearance.

The poor living conditions and hardship experienced by this family is relived during the testimony during the TRC sessions. This provokes more anger and hatred from Molly towards the police. She sees her healing as a slow process that will come with time. Dolly, on the other hand, forgives the amnesty applicants, though not trustful of their information with regards to her husband's remains.

Although Dolly continues to live under the severe poor conditions she finds meaning for her husband's death is seen as a sacrifice so that others could survive.

This chapter deals with the analysis of the data. The result is the description and understanding of the central themes the families experienced and lived through. What reverberates throughout the analysis is that before being victimized their existence proceeded in a manner which can be termed the usual or routine which was disrupted. The following chapter will focus on the psychological reflection

CHAPTER FIVE

PSYCHOLOGICAL REFLECTION AND ANALYSIS

Wertz (1983) describes life before being victimized as the existence that proceeds in the manner of the usual. He postulates sequential themes about victimization which are described as living routinely, being disrupted, being violated and reintegration. In the present study, description of the victimization which these families were subjected to, though similar to Fischer & Wertz's (1979), will follow the structure below:

- 1 The 'before' of the struggle
- 2 The struggle years or victimization
- 3 The Truth and Reconciliation Commission
- 4 The 'after' of the TRC and the new world.

5.1 THE 'BEFORE' OF THE STRUGGLE

My discovery about the experience of victimization by the families in the present study is that they reflect it as disruption and radical re-organisation of the routine living that they enjoyed before. This 'before' is remembered as a very long time. The family structure during this time was characterized by an extended system. In describing their living arrangements at his home, Jeff in Protocol 4 (Appendix) says the following:

"For the first nine years I never knew my father, I never questioned his whereabouts or why I did not have one. This is because I lived with a big family in the same house, for example, five uncles, two grandparents and my mother".

For most families the social life was regarded as open and free as they were able to choose their own activities. This means that for these families life proceeded as usual. Some family members were unaware of the possibility of victimization as they were not potential victims due to their non-affiliative status to political organizations. Although they were not living-in-expectation of what might happen to them, there was a moderate awareness of vulnerability to their indirect involvement with potential victims who played the activists' role. For instance both Lorna and Zelda in Protocols

6 and 10 (Appendix) talked about their lack of awareness of their family members' involvement in political activities.

The alertness of those who were directly involved as activists, living-in-expectation of what might happen to disrupt their routine living was due to their perception of unbridgeable gaps which existed between people of different races and cultures. Dick in Protocol 1 (ideographic example) confirms this experience when he says:

“This was like war because, one day the police caught me while I was about to distribute pamphlets to inform people in our community not to buy from the white-owned businesses in town”.

This statement by Dick reflects the views also posited by Africanists such as Davidson (1992) and Mamdani (1996). Though it is a long time ago, they state that the political, ideological and local cultural forces, operating before and during the colonial period, have played a major role in the production of structural and direct violence in modern Africa. Dawes (1998) also mentions that the South African apartheid system is an exemplary case of structural violence as both its political design and its economic order were centered on ethnic power. The architects of the system both constructed and drew on existing ethnicities, employing them for purposes of white political and economic domination. Race classification underpinned all practices as impoverishment of those that were not classified as white was achieved by reserving a large percentage of the land for whites and by limiting educational and job opportunities for blacks. Systematic efforts were made to construct and entrench ethnic histories and practices so as to justify racial separation. These were sometimes taken up and used for personal power and ethnic chiefs appointed to oversee the black population. These ideas are also supportive of Gurr's (1970) notion of relative deprivation which increases discontent, referred to in Chapter Three. For instance the apartheid regime characterized abnormal conditions of open resistance and reactions to this resistance culminated in clashes between black and white which are referred to by Dick (Protocol 1).

Although it can be said that victims in the present study are those who suffered at the hands of the apartheid security forces due to their resistance of oppression, Hayes (1998) argues that we are all victims in having allowed apartheid to form and deform us. Thus, we awaken some conscience in us all to act in the interest of the future so as to bridge those unbridgeable gaps.

5.2 THE STRUGGLE YEARS OR VICTIMIZATION

A radical re-organization of the daily living of the families in the present study occurred during the struggle years. During this political upheaval, some family members were either abducted, detained and tortured in prison or killed. The life world of those who were not detained became limited although they were not restricted to their homes. They sought shelter elsewhere to hide for fear of being detained. Emma in Protocol 5 (Appendix) confirms this observation from her own experience as she says:

“I became scared for my other kids, as I would not sleep at home during the night”.

The struggle is perceived as the cause of more chaos amongst the family members. The parents whose children were directly involved in political activities during the Soweto uprisings became concerned about their involvement. Instead of supporting the struggle Alex and his family in Protocol 2 (Ideographic example) discouraged their son and even made attempts to remove him from schools which they thought were more active politically than they anticipated. Other parents became directly involved to support their children's activity as Pandora in Protocol 7 (Appendix) relates:

“I became involved because of the children. I joined the political group of women which supported me to press the police to look for my sons who were missing”.

Those who were detained became uncertain about what would happen to them. In prison they had to tell the truth about their political activities or withstand torture. While in detention Dick in Protocol 1 (Ideographic example) lost hope of being released alive, for the security forces threatened him with elimination if he did not co-operate with them. Dolly, in Protocol 3 (Ideographic example) on the other hand, revealed her experiences of being frightened, helpless and demoralized as inhumane strategies were used to break her down. While others were detained or missing, those remaining at home were also turned into victims as they were subjected to police harassment, made worse if the alleged victims were not found. They lived in fear and anguish of what would happen every time the police raided their homes. Macy in Protocol 2 (Ideographic example) reported her experiences this way:

“What became funny was that police now searched for my brother in my house. They would come during the night, kicking the doors while hurling stones through our windows. This was confusing”.

This kind of police behaviour created more distrust of the security system, as a result families in the present study were reluctant to report the disappearance of their relatives who were political activists. This reaction concurs with what Ndabandaba (1987) refers to, when he states that the victims may not believe that the police will do anything to solve the crime.

The damaged trust relationship between the community, the families and the police, provided in some way a bond between some family members. A sense of cohesiveness which prevailed might be attributed to the experiences of despondency and despair in their seeking help from the police. For instance, Betty in Protocol 4 (Appendix), reports her ex-husband's tireless search for their missing son which consoled her. Other family members whose relatives had disappeared were treated for psychiatric disorders as they could not cope with the thoughts that their siblings or husbands and wives might have died. Other families were pulled involuntarily into the dynamics of the circumstances of the struggle. Despite the fact that Sally and Alex in Protocol 2 (Ideographic example) initially discouraged their son from participating in political activities at his school, when he disappeared they looked for him countrywide. This reflects the deep feelings and relationship of the children and their parents during this time.

Most family members that were interviewed recount the experiences of strangeness, confusion and helplessness as their relatives disappeared or were detained. The search for missing victims was experienced as frustrating, and levels of frustrations were increased when the police could not solve the mystery of those who had disappeared. Dolly in Protocol 3 (Ideographic example) talked about how she filed a report of her missing husband with the court which yielded no satisfactory results as nobody could be blamed for his disappearance. The actions of the judiciary were experienced as an absence of a potentially helpful community by the families in the present study. This perception was also extended to the communities they belonged to. Many family members expressed how alienated and detached they felt from the very political organizations their husbands, wives and children belonged to as Sally in Protocol 2 (Ideographic example) reports:

“There was no direction from the political organizations about what to do. I felt alone and detached from the organizations my child belonged to until the TRC emerged”.

The findings point to the families in the present study discovering after many years (ranging from nine to twelve years) what became of their relatives who had disappeared. According to the information shed by the security police some died in detention while others were killed and their bodies burnt and disposed of. This news brought devastation, grief, emptiness and a sense of confusion among the families in the present study. More heartache was caused by the manner in which the relatives were killed as described by the police agents. Zelda in Protocol 10 (Appendix) explains:

“Mr Skeels from the police described to journalists how they killed my husband together with his compatriots. This was published in all the newspapers. It was shocking, devastating to read this news. I cried bitterly. The grief was too much to bear. I was not even impressed by the Amnesty applicants' testimony, as I thought they are lying about the manner in which they disposed my husband's ashes after killing him”.

Those who were detained in prison were released after experiencing both physical and psychological trauma. Some returned to disintegrated families, as parents had died while they were in prison and other family members died through senseless killings which occurred during the unrest situation in the townships. For instance Ricky in Protocol 9 (Appendix) revealed how the effects of torture in detention resulted in his psychiatric problems while experiencing loss of his younger brother who died by being necklaced during the community clashes. The actions by the police agents that are described by these family members confirm the views postulated by the theory of political violence (Chapter Three) as the individuals employed by the State exercised the exclusive of the right to use violence.

What reverberates across this analysis is the hardship experienced by the families as husbands or wives who were breadwinners had disappeared or detained. The power and the autonomy of the family was removed as roles shifted. Pete in Protocol 7 (Appendix) related his difficulties in coping with his children who did not have the guidance and discipline from their mother because she was detained. This resulted in the children being involved in unruly behaviours. All the families expressed feelings of humiliation and loss of the sense of pride when they depended on the handouts from charity organizations and neighbours.

The families also spoke about the relationship of distrust which existed between themselves and their communities while coping with their relatives who were detained or missing. This manifested itself in rumours that those who had disappeared or were detained were working for the State as *impimpi*⁷ (informers). This resulted in the families being shunned by the community, living in fear for their homes and their lives, as people who were suspected to be police informers were either killed or their homes burnt. Marlana in Protocol 4 (Appendix) related how she feared for herself and her parents' home as Jeff's father, who was missing, was rumoured to be an informer.

The worthiness of healing rituals that befit each family are reported to have played an important role in the healing and maintenance of families. The family members in the present study spoke about how they participated in cleansing rituals and memorials on behalf of their dead relatives. According to them, these were held symbolically 'to let go', even if the remains of those who were reported dead were not brought home. Although this is so, families still wish that these remains are brought to them for burial.

For these families, involvement in the struggle which began as early as 1912 (Tutu, 1999) is a reflection of Frantz Fanon's (1967a, 1967b, 1968) psychology of liberation which not only informed revolutionary action against the structural violence of the French colonists but also informed other struggles such as the Black Consciousness Movements in the United States and South Africa (Biko, 1978). In his argument Fanon (1967b) firstly sees individual psychological health as inseparable from political liberty. He further states that under conditions of structural violence, a situation of national psychological distress is present. Dawes (1988) asserts that for Fanon, the structural violence of colonization and apartheid produces a Manichean psychological state which is characterized by the defense mechanism of splitting. Internal psychological constructions of people and social groups are separated by distinct categories of good and bad. Thus, splitting ensures that the worldview and cultural goals of the colonizer are viewed as positive, while those of the colonized or the oppressed are considered to be negative and to be denied. It is beyond the scope of this thesis to detail how apartheid in South Africa succeeded in dehumanising those deemed to be inferior as the emphasis in differences between the rulers and indigenous groups were prominent. What can be argued though, is that the theme of the Black Consciousness Movement (BCM) which was taken up within the liberation strategy, starting amongst African

7

Means whistle-blowing or informer

Americans (Burlaw, et al, 1992) and spreading to South African blacks (Biko, 1978) was the reversal of the internalized negative view of the self and culture. It is within the parameters of these liberation movements that most families referred to in the present study experienced victimization as per the findings discussed above. Their engagement in revolutionary actions of protest against the dominant apartheid structures can be seen as the beginning of the struggle years. These actions reveal Gurr's (1970) reflections in Chapter Three of this study which point to widespread discontent among the deprived as conditions such as systematic discrimination against ethnic, linguistic or religious communities existed. Discrepancies between the norms of distributive justice and the actual distribution patterns and events such as restrictions on political participation aroused protest actions which resulted in violence.

In the literature surveyed in Chapter Two of this study, congruencies about another argument posed by Fanon (1967b) seem to exist. It was his belief that the oppressed would be psychologically freed by confronting the colonizer with violence. He argued that this was because the latter relied on violence to rule and did not understand reasoned arguments for liberation. Although this call was rejected by many, such as Arendt (1970) and Bulhan (1985), there seems to be an acknowledgement that Fanon in his time, like Nelson Mandela, had tried to reason with the authorities without success (Bulhan, 1985). As this minority rule and domination was resisted by the majority of blacks through organized liberation movements in South Africa, it was met with further political and economic oppression, hence the State violence and revolutionary resistance co-existed.

5.3 THE TRUTH AND RECONCILIATION COMMISSION

The turning point in South Africa, according to Tutu (1999) happened in 1990. This change paved the way for the families in the present study to tell their stories of victimization before the TRC. The families participated in the TRC process with greater expectations that they would receive more information about the detention and abductions of their relatives. The TRC was founded under the auspices of the Promotion of National Unity and Reconciliation Act (Asmal, 1995). Although its inception was met with controversy, de la Rey and Owens (1998) mention that the key words that were often repeated in the motivations for a TRC, were truth, healing and reconciliation.

The families in the present study acknowledged the salutary effect of the TRC process on their well-being. Participating in the TRC hearings alleviated their suppressed emotions, made them feel relieved, and lightened the burden they seemed to carry within them. However, they re-experienced their pain of loss when they re-lived their stories during the TRC hearings. As a counsellor during the group therapy sessions after their testimonies I observed that they demonstrated some vulnerabilities as they would cry a lot, were irritable and reported lack of sleep when they thought about the stories they had told. Even during the interviews of the present study I noticed that they were still grieving. To me these observations and reports suggested that the individuals would each have built their own unique and elaborate defense mechanisms against the negative feelings associated with the original trauma. However, the act of telling their stories tended to weaken their defenses, thereby precipitating a crisis for some individuals. This suggests that violence has long-lasting effects on the people who suffer it, as victims carry the effect in their bodies, in their hearts and subconscious minds for years or even the rest of their lives.

There are also mixed reactions about the TRC process amongst the families. Some saw it as a platform to voice their experiences of torture while others relied on it to investigate further circumstances surrounding their relatives' abductions and killings. Some families saw it as a process that brought divisions rather than unity among the family members. For instance, Emma in Protocol 5 (Appendix) related how the TRC official taking her statement asked for her submission of a statement but allowed her daughter-in-law to testify in her place. This caused a rift in the family which the TRC cannot heal.

Some families were threatened by the whole process of testifying before an audience. Linksy in Protocol 6 (Appendix) explained her rationale for submitting a written statement to the TRC rather than testifying personally. According to her, the effects of torture in detention were still haunting her. Whenever she had to tell her story, she experienced the onset of new symptoms that might be related to an actual traumatisation episode. As a counsellor during the TRC hearings, I counselled many families and individuals who were experiencing anxieties and symptoms of panic as the days of telling their stories came closer. Sally in Protocol 2 (Ideographic example) experienced a setback during the TRC hearings because, although she was ready to testify, she was prevented by the judicial process. She reported this as an experience of re-victimization. However, she was humbled by the overwhelming support of those present in the hearings as they called for her testimony. All the families interviewed in the present research expressed a need to

the TRC to ask the government to help them. They stated that they were experiencing hardship with medical costs for those who returned sick from prison, education of the children who were fatherless and rebuilding of their homes which were burnt during the struggle years.

An important finding which emerged during the interviews was that the families were sceptical of the truthfulness of the disclosures made by the Amnesty applicants with regard to the disposal of the remains of their relatives who were killed. This remains a difficult issue for these families. For them the stories told by the alleged perpetrators are unconvincing. What is at stake here is whether the TRC has helped these families to find the truth or not, as their experiences of the truth as expressed by certain perpetrators does not bring relief or satisfaction. These unconvincing stories, referred to as lies by some families in the present study, have resulted in forgiveness and reconciliation being a difficult task for them. Both Alex and Sally in Protocol 2 (Ideographic example) attested that they will forgive the Amnesty applicants only if they disclose the whole truth about their son's remains. However, other families seem to have understood the issue of forgiveness as a motivation for reconciliation founded by the ex-president Nelson Mandela. The responses from Rietta (Protocol 8, Appendix), "it is said one must forgive, so that there is reconciliation in this country", and Betty (Protocol 4, Appendix), "I've forgiven them, the President of this country preaches the reconciliation daily", indicate this motivation.

Some families were open and willing to forgive the alleged perpetrators. This occurred in private, emotionally-charged face to face contacts with the Amnesty applicants where they cried, prayed and embraced each other. Jeff, in Protocol 4 (Appendix), was encouraged by his mother to speak to his father's abductors during the TRC hearings. Dolly in Protocol 3 (Ideographic example) confirms this contact, which involved trying to understand the perpetrators, to stand in their shoes and to appreciate the sort of pressures and influences that might have brought them to commit these deeds. She says:

"We prayed together and ended up embracing each other. I think he was a lost sheep when he tortured people of his own kind but I have forgiven him".

These findings from this analysis are affirmed in various ways by literature or arguments that are put forward by other scholars. Hayes (1998) states that the TRC offers an extraordinary opportunity to engage in the beginnings of a democratic conversation about the politics of change

in this country. Tutu (1999) also shares these views when he observes that the TRC was expected to promote national unity and reconciliation rather than achieving these worthwhile objectives. However, he admits to the controversial issue of the perpetrators being granted amnesty as soon as their applications were successful. However, in the case of the victims the TRC could only make recommendations of reparation to the President, some years into the process. He further comments about the criticisms levelled at the TRC as a flawed method. The arguments against the TRC, he says, were that it was packed with those who were described as struggle types and so biased in favour of the ANC. Tutu (1999), further states that the supporters of the old apartheid dispensation declared, without the benefit of any evidence, that this Commission was intended to be a witch-hunt against the old order, specifically, against the Afrikaners. Others spoke passionately about the moral requirements of justice which the TRC process seemed to undermine.

One of the pertinent points of debate surrounding the TRC (de la Rey & Owens, 1998; Hayes, 1998; Swartz, 1999) has revolved around whether storytelling in a public audience constitutes healing for the individuals who shared their stories. A further question, is whether the healing focuses on these storytellers or on the whole nation. Hayes (1999), like Swartz (1999) speaks of the TRC banner, 'Truth: the road to reconciliation, revealing is healing', as capturing the release of the emotions and accounts of apartheid atrocities. However, there are concerns and questions around these processes of revealing the truth, of telling the stories, and of how this will translate into a social process of healing, reconciliation and forgiveness. These authors see the TRC as a social process which unfortunately confirms its focus on a minority of the subjects of apartheid, that is, the victims and the perpetrators (those agents of apartheid who actively victimized people). While this involves a large number of people, it is still only a small minority of apartheid's casualties, as millions of black people who suffered under apartheid and fewer millions of those whites who benefited seem not to have been accommodated in the process of healing and reconciliation.

While acknowledging his lesser credentials as a trained psychologist, Tutu (1999) agrees that the TRC offered the kind of safe and welcoming environment that enabled catharsis to take place. This statement is congruent with de la Rey and Owens' (1998) arguments that, when used as a therapeutic technique aimed at the individual, testimony is often effective within a psycho-dynamic framework. Swartz (1998) explains how psycho-analysts and psychotherapists who attended an international psycho-analytic conference in Cape Town in April 1998, declared in various ways that

the TRC was good for the country and the peoples' mental health. These declarations were based on the TRC language which is inherently psycho-analytic. In fact Hayes (1998) attests to the fact that in psycho-analytic terms, the profoundly social and historical necessity of reconciliation is being displaced onto the TRC, as it has been given the responsibility of healing the past, healing the nation and putting us onto the road to reconciliation. The findings already discussed above have referred to this cathartic effect which was experienced by the families in the present study. After his relative had testified at the TRC's first hearings, a brother of an ANC activist who was murdered by the police made comments which according to Tutu's report (1999:33) read this way: "We have told our story to many on several occasions, to newspapers and to the TV. This is the first time, though, that after telling it we feel as if a heavy load has been removed from our shoulders".

The cathartic reactions which are expressed even by the families in the present study seem to conform to what, according to Tutu (1999) was set to be achieved by the TRC. One of the proposed achievements was for the TRC to rehabilitate and affirm the dignity and humanity of those who were marginalised and victimized. Thus it was hoped that through the TRC these people would be empowered to tell their stories, to recount their individuality by crying and opening their hearts to expose the anguish that had remained locked up for so long. The acceptance, the affirmation and the acknowledgement that they had indeed suffered is cathartic for them.

In contrast, scholars like de la Rey and Owens (1998), De Ridder (1998) and Swartz (1999) have pointed to some weaknesses of the TRC. Their views illustrate differences between the TRC as a social instrument and the role it plays on a more personal level. De Ridder (1998), for instance, mentions that those who sought counselling after the TRC process reported that this was the first time they had spoken about the psychological impact of the original violation. What was unspeakable in the past was now possible to be talked about in public. However, a worrying number of these individuals found, in the weeks following their deposition, that there was a return and intensification of symptoms associated with the original violations. This view also supports the findings in the present study as revealed by the analysis. These experiences emphasise what De Ridder (1998) refers to as the underlying tension between the TRC's role as a 'national therapeutic process' and its responsibility for caring for the individuals who have been violated. These experiences, then, seem to challenge the notion that the TRC is necessarily a positive healing experience for the individual. These arguments are reflected more by de la Rey and Owens (1998:260) as they explain the TRC public hearings:

“The South African public hearings address experiences of trauma not merely at the individual levels but also at the level of the collective-social. In this context, testimony-giving in the form of the public hearing is not simply about the reconstruction of private individual trauma, but also a social-political process through which the past abuses are reconstructed and documented as public knowledge. Thus, it is a constitutive narrative in which boundaries between individual and social are not clearly distinguishable”.

De Ridder (1998) also notes that the TRC has created an opportunity to make the ‘collective’ experience, of the survivors of gross violations of human rights, ‘individual’ by making statements about their personal stories. However, the negative outlook on this process, is its failure to provide long term counselling and support for the victims. While the public process of healing and testimony-giving has the potential to heal many members of South Africa’s new nation, the need for privacy amid the very public nature of the TRC is important. To me the TRC missed an opportunity of a private environment for the containment of these feelings. Although I contributed minimally by facilitating group therapy sessions after these families had testified, it would have been so much better had this important service been an integral part of the therapeutic process of the TRC. Tutu (1999), the Chairman of the TRC, himself admits to the fact that it was possible that there were people who, because they re-opened their wounds before the TRC, did not receive sufficient professional help to deal with the anguish and went away more traumatized than before. De la Rey and Owens (1998) assert that counselling as a source of support was viewed as problematic during the TRC testimonies. The indications were that most professionals think about counselling within a pathology model rather than a wellness model. Instead, medical and religious sources of support were seen as important in bringing about healing. Also, there was support for models of African healing from the NGO personnel who had tried to step into this yawning need for support.

The issue of forgiveness and difficulties in forgiving, as revealed by the findings in this study, has filled the TRC with much debate. The study of forgiveness has become a growing industry. It is gaining attention as an academic discipline studied by psychologists, philosophers, physicians and theologians. This undertaking by these scholars together with an International Forgiveness Institute attached to the University of Wisconsin dismisses the idea that forgiveness is only linked with spiritual and religious themes (Tutu, 1999). In the study of ‘forgiving another’, Rowe et. al. (1989) state that the need for forgiveness arises when someone has acted in such a way as to bring about a fundamental disruption in the wholeness or integrity of one’s life. On a deep, almost organic level

there is the tearing of the fabric of one's life world. One of the conditions for gaining amnesty by alleged perpetrators was to make a full disclosure of all the relevant facts relating to the offence (for example, abduction, killing, torture, severe maltreatment) for which amnesty was being sought. Those who were violated had the right to oppose the application for amnesty by trying to demonstrate that these conditions had not been met. They, however, had no right of veto over amnesty (Tutu, 1999). These conditions were met with antagonism in many community circles as the government, in its constitution of the TRC, was seen as counter-productive. It was felt that the pain of the many people who had suffered during the apartheid era was being sacrificed at the gain of the alleged perpetrators. Some believe that there should be no amnesty at all.

Tutu (1999) perceives forgiveness as crucial, especially when a relationship has been damaged. He asserts that the perpetrator should acknowledge the truth and be ready and willing to apologise as this helps the process of forgiveness and reconciliation immensely. The findings of the present study as already discussed, point to the fact that forgiveness is a risky undertaking in that the abuse, pain, degradation and truth may in the end not result in real healing. Many interviewees, expressed categorically, "I'll forgive but never forget", and "at least we can let go and forgive those who are asking for amnesty for the tortures but we cannot forget what happened". Others expressed difficulty in forgiving the amnesty applicants. The latter category hoped that with time this forgiveness would happen.

5.4 THE 'AFTER' OF THE TRC AND THE NEW WORLD

The participation in the TRC by the families in the present study raised certain expectations about some assistance that they would receive. However, after their testimony there were no instant solutions but promises that individual reports would be written and recommendations would be made to the President. This meant further waiting and frustration for most families.

The findings point to the families' expressions of suffering and hardship continuing in their lives. According to Emma in Protocol 5 (Appendix), healing is living her life as it was before she was subjected to this victimization. This she said can happen if the TRC and the government fulfil the promises of compensation for the loss of her son and her house which was burnt during the unrest period.

This is only one example out of thousands of requests for reparations by families. The requests they made through the submissions of their testimony varied from moral support, medical attention, bursary funds for education of their children, rebuilding their homes and locating the remains of their dead relatives so that they can bury them. According to them the reparations would help erect memorials to honour them since they sacrificed their lives.

Dick in Protocol 1 (Ideographic example) sees 'going on' of all those who suffered during the struggle as possible if the present government and the whole community can recognise and remember them as veterans who devoted themselves to the struggle. Many family members continue to live their lives as active participants in community projects that aim at capacity building.

Most families spoke openly about their hopes of reparation from the TRC process. (Pete in Protocol 7 and Gordon in Protocol 8 - Appendix, have since died without receiving any word from the government with regard to compensation). Although this is so, some families are positive about their spiritual belief system which they explained as making sense and meaning in their difficult life experiences and in the traumatic experiences they have encountered. Many families during the interviews commented that no matter what happened, God was with them.

All these incidents and statements point to the fact that reconciliation is a long drawn-out and difficult process. It is something that cannot be quickly accomplished, certainly not by the TRC, however effective. Tutu (1999) states that the TRC has only been able to make a contribution towards reconciliation which should be the concern of every South African.

It appears that the families in the present study experienced the TRC as similar to the help they needed in coping with the struggle to restructure their world. Their requests could only be documented and forwarded as recommendations to the President. Tutu (1999) states that their legal mandate was more to research and recommend the reparation measures than to implement them. This meant that the victims lived in anticipation and expectation of more time for the results of the recommendations to happen.

A question which needs to be raised is whether reparations are seen as a means of helping people to heal. According to Genfeugos and Moneli (1983), symbolizing the experience of suffering can be important in healing. De la Rey and Owens, (1998) state that the TRC legislation's reparations

include any form of compensation, *ex gratia* payment, restitution, rehabilitation or recognition. Bennie Bunsee (1998) who is the public relations officer for the Ministry of Justice, writes that reparations are an integral part of the process of healing and reconciliation which constitute the core work of the TRC. Although this might sound as a poor and even insulting compensation for the pain that victims have had to endure, the best international practice has shown that it can be fruitful (Sowetan, Thursday, October 29, 1998). These definitions, obviously raise expectations in the victims of gross violation of human rights as the stories of the TRC hearings were dominated by needs which seem to be visible and concrete. However, the lengthy time taken by the TRC to respond is perceived as frustrating.

Tutu (1999) also agrees that it would be less than honest and entirely counter-productive to pretend that the TRC was perfect. In fact, all the above arguments point to a system which was serviced by human beings who possess both gifts and faults, hence the TRC cannot be seen as flawless. Gobodo-Madikizela (1997:272) also comments that the TRC cannot be seen as a panacea to fix all that is not well in South Africa. She argues that:

“This is a long process that can best be addressed through the interpersonal contacts that ultimately are the best way to break down stereotypes and antagonisms. However, given the stark patterns of social segregation in this country, this may appear to be non-utopian at this point in history. The issue of reconciliation should at least be addressed in every boardroom or hall of power. There may be different ways of achieving reconciliation and none could guarantee a flawless process “.

The families in their ‘going on’ with their lives still await the results of the TRC recommendations to come forth. It was only at the end of 1998 that compiled reports of the TRC were handed to The President. Although only a few of the victims who applied through the TRC have received urgent interim reparations, this can be seen as the beginning of rehabilitation for communities that need improved access to services. In fact, many commissioners who participated in the TRC have expressed mixed feelings about what they have been able to achieve concretely for the victims. Hlengiwe Mkhize, who is the Reparation and Rehabilitation Committee Chairperson, calls for the question of monetary reparations to be settled by the government as soon as possible. She says that aside from the interim reparation process, there remains the outstanding issue of a long term reparation policy. She goes to say that:

“Silence, whether it be passive or active on the issue of addressing the consequences of gross human rights violations, drives the survivors to withdraw and disengage from society. In the process of keeping to themselves, all negative symptoms are played out within the family, schoolyard, workplace, marketplace, infecting the innocents who become burdened by the transmitted symptoms of secondary victimisation” (Evening Post, 28 March 2000).

Mr Trevor Manuel, Minister of Finance, was questioned by the Chairperson of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission with regard to lack of provision in the budget for the victims of apartheid and the reparation process. In response, Mr Trevor Manuel said the following:

“There is a big legal hassle about whether you could only provide relief to people who appear before the TRC, whether they are the only victims of human rights abuses, or whether you would be creating a precedent in law that you might not be able to sustain” (Eastern Province Herald, Monday, 28 February 2000).

This suggests that, for the families in the present study, the TRC is not yet the end of the road, as in their restructuring of the new world they require forms of concrete help. Above all they deserve reparation which will defend their dignity, integrity, and help them accept their own worth as people. All this will take the process of reconciliation much further than the TRC will ever be able to do.

Looking at the phenomenon of victimization, during the interviews I empathized with the families' experiences of pain and of being threatened. I have also had similar experiences as the interviewees which made it easier to understand their experiences of pain and threat. While telling their stories they relived the hardship and pain of those difficult years which made it even more difficult for them to forgive the victimizers. Molly in Protocol 3 (Ideographic example) says: “I feel that there is no room in my heart to forgive these police. What they did is unforgivable. They robbed me of a happy family life abducting and killing my father, putting my husband in jail”. (Andinayo indawo entliziyweni yam yokuxolela la mapolisa. Bafana namasela athatha ubomi obumnandi ethu ekhaya, xa babamba utata wam bambulala, bavalela nomyeni wam entolongweni)'.

This chapter deals with psychological reflection and analysis. The ideas which emerged from this chapter point to the fear and anguish that families lived through, the suspicion which existed in the communities and also the sceptical attitude by the families towards the truth disclosed in the TRC hearings. The function of the following chapter is to articulate the conclusions from this study.

CHAPTER SIX

CONCLUDING CHAPTER

6.1 MY OWN REFLECTIONS

In most studies of victimology (Kaufman, 1985; Snare, 1984; Wertz, 1985) the intent of the victimizer is own gain, for example in cases of rape or theft where the victim is in a sense a prey. In this study, it was part of the struggle to effect social change. Thus it must be seen in relation to the great inequalities and conflicts of mass social life. Fanon's (1979) notion of 'Manichean' thinking posits the emergence of a psychological structure in which groups are divided into 'good' and 'bad' particularly in contexts of political oppression and violence. For instance, in the present study the victims have been or acted as antagonists against apartheid laws, a factor which bound them to a political cause. This cause was fundamentally founded on a basic premise of a culture of survival characteristic of economic deprivation and political repression in which the space for exercising democratic ideals was either severely constrained or simply not permitted. Most family members of victims in this study have explained the circumstances surrounding the detention and abduction of their kin, as they opposed publicly the unjust laws of the apartheid regime.

The content of Chapter Two of this thesis dealt extensively with violence in the South African context and how it impacted on the families. Although these families have experienced victimization discussed in Chapter Four, they came across as resilient. For instance, not all of them are stuck in despair or resignation. On the contrary some of them long for the healing of the broken community as revealed in their expressions of forgiveness even during the interviews. Thus, it can be said that they have regained a certain measure of control over their own lives, by, for example, going about their own affairs. Some family members show their resilience through community involvement in projects that are aimed at capacity building in those who are unemployed so that they attain self sufficient skills.

Wertz's (1984) suggestion that victimization endangers individual survival is taken further by Young-Rifai (1979) who argues that, by extension, society may be endangered and this may lead to its collapse. It can be argued here that the possible demise of society due to the social instability

that occurred (during these families' era of political struggle) during the political upheaval which resulted in victimization of these families was averted by mechanisms of change in the South African context. These mechanisms attempt and are still engaged in attempts of de-emphasizing separateness which has created a split, not only between persons or humans, or relationships with others and nature, but also a split within the nation's psyche or soul. For instance the whole nation is presented with the idea and possibility of being able to heal the rifts, splits and ruptures of the past apartheid structure which denied people their humanity and had also caused deep-seated effects on the psyche (Hayes, 1998). The repeated calls by the former President Nelson Mandela to forget the past is motivated by a political anxiety that by dwelling on the past, reconciliation and democratic reconstruction will be discouraged. The commitment of such calls is in the hope of avoiding further political violence.

One of these calls resulted in the emergence of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission (Asmal, 1996) through which families in the present study were allowed to tell their stories. According to Jordaan and Jordaan (1998:740), the TRC was designed "as a unique, politically negotiated instrument to effect peace and reconciliation with regard to gross abuses and violations of human rights during the armed struggle in South Africa".

Firstly, as a concept the TRC (Lubbe, 1996) has as its ideal the healing of the whole country, which theoretically includes everyone, victims, perpetrators, the public at large, as well as those taking authority over and responsibility for the process. Authors like Cone (1975), Krog (1994), Nuttall and Coetzee (1998) have elaborated that recognised psychotherapeutic principles maintain that anybody who has been subjected to pain and suffering of the kind attested by these families in front of the TRC needs an opportunity to tell their story. This implies that communication of bottled up suffering, grief, anger and bitterness is an essential component of the reconciliation process, not because there is anything magical in the facts of the peoples' stories but because the act of the party talking and another listening creates an opportunity for an encounter in which unspoken minority is articulated and thus creates shared memory. In this way reconciliation is placed in a dialogical framework of speaking and listening. For instance one family member, Dick says:

"I think the TRC was a platform to voice my experience", while Zelda said: "It was a relief to share my story with others".

Other authors like Napier (1993), Schafer (1982) and Spence (1982) also support the contention that psychotherapy is mainly concerned with helping people construct healthier life stories and in so doing, give the person a new sense of life's coherence and continuity. What is achieved on an individual level may also be true for a group. This was confirmed in the present study. Even though the testimonies of families were related by individuals, in some way this represented the communities in the South African context. It is through the story telling of their bitter hardships that many people came to a reconciled understanding of their pain as well as the motives of the alleged perpetrators.

For instance individuals at grass root levels of the community made the following remarks on 'Two Way' a SABC television programme debate, during September 1996, which expressed their perception of the TRC:

- some families were relieved by the cathartic method of telling their stories and crying with others but found it difficult to reconcile if alleged perpetrators were not disclosing the whole truth;
- many people were unhappy about the composition of the TRC as they thought that it had disregarded the element of justice;
- there were fears that the TRC process might backfire, causing more violence especially if the expectations of the communities endangered during the struggle were not met;
- there were fears, concerns and anxieties by the Amnesty applicants before the testimonies as others had been terrorized with death after they told their stories of how they victimized people;
- the TRC process has opened wounds while mechanisms to deal with them are not in place yet.

In the present study, some family members also experienced the detachment and separation that the TRC process brought amongst family members. Emma remarked:

“I was approached to make a statement to testify in the TRC. I did that but I didn’t testify as my daughter-in-law went to testify without my knowledge and in my absence.”

The above statements support what Young-Rifai (1979) envisages as the individual being intertwined with the environment on a variety of spatial levels. Chapter Three of this thesis has touched on a theoretical mode, laying out comprehensive theoretical constructs in ‘systems’ theory’ congruent with individuals being intertwined with their environments on a variety of spatial levels. Social actions according to Young-Rifai (1979) depend on effective communication, social exchange and mediation between the individual and the environment. She further suggests that individuals interact with one another in order to fulfill needs and establish physical well being and that behaviours are conceived as a reward-cost system. This concept according to Kelly and Thibault (1978) is based on an exchange theory which postulates that the outcome in an interaction is visualized in terms of rewards received and costs incurred by participants. People expect reciprocity in this exchange with the environment, hence the victims that testified through the TRC also communicated their expectations that the government would make reparations by educating their children, covering medical costs of those who are sick and setting up memorials on behalf of their dead. If these expectations are not met, the perceptions exist that serious social imbalances are created, which might lead to the collapse of the society that Young-Rifai (1979) refers to.

It is beyond the scope of this thesis to consider in any detail the work of the TRC or to review its many and varied functions. Swartz (1998) argues that this model of finding the truth, as a basis of healing which the families in the present study went through, is of course at the centre of psycho-analytic approaches to individual psychotherapy. These views maintain that in order to solve a problem in living, one must understand how the problem came about, to get at the ‘truth’ of that problem. Although collective truth seeking was the task of the TRC process, it is difficult for me and may be for many in the South African context to conceptualize how the notion of understanding the past does come to be seen as a basis for collective healing.

Owens (1996) states that in South Africa the effects of this historical process on the creation of a category of survivors of political violence and abuse are clear. He further questions if this collective abuse becomes the same thing as individual abuse, and if national healing is the same as individual healing.

During the struggle in South Africa funerals were extremely important vehicles for community mobilization and, it could be argued, for community healing. But in this large community audience, as in the larger drama of the TRC, the needs of the individual may be sacrificed to those of the group. Ramphele (1996) has commented on how a political widow of the 1980's complained that her husband's coffin was wrapped in the flag of the South African Communist Party (SACP) when, in fact, he had been a member of the African National Congress.

The taking over of the suffering and grief of individuals by the larger community in the name of a greater communal aim is not an isolated event. Swartz (1998) recalls that during the 1980's, individuals who had lost family members in political violence were suddenly being asked to speak at meetings, and to come to symbolize something more than themselves as private mourners. This was very difficult for some of these people, but very hard to refuse to participate in rituals which seemed to be helpful to the broader community.

Many families interviewed in the present study still showed residual symptoms of grieving as individual families. They were mourning the loss of their material possessions, such as, burnt houses. Some were also deeply hurt about the non-traceable remains of their loved ones while others experienced grief about 'living' abnormally from handouts distributed by charity organizations. Most of these families had gone through the process of testifying in the TRC, admitting to being relieved immediately after their stories were heard. But individual concerns and grief remain part of those individuals rather than that of the whole community.

It can be summarized then that national healing and individual healing are not necessarily the same. Individuals who, through their actions or their experiences of being subjected to human rights abuses, are given the role of speaking for the nation's pain are not necessarily healed or helped by this process. Swartz (1998: 184) puts it in nutshell as he remarks:

"In fact national healing is perhaps centrally a communal, political effort! It will never fit seamlessly with the needs of every individual".

The above arguments as supported by Swartz (1998), sensitize mental health professionals to the fact that public and political processes may be unhelpful or distressful to some individuals. In their awareness, mental health professionals need to understand further the interface between the

individual suffering and that of the society, a matter which cannot be debated in this thesis.

Although I come from a background that is similar to that of the participants in this research, as an investigator in the South African context, suspicions about what I wanted to achieve were raised by the families. Schutte (1983) documents that the investigator in South Africa experiences many difficulties. One becomes a stranger if one lacks familiarity with the group one studies. Most of the families, though my credibility was established by being involved in the counselling role during the TRC sessions, still had questions about whose ideals I was advocating. Other families were cautious and guarded about responding to questions as they saw me as representing the interests of the bureaucracy.

This suspicion and mistrust is a theme that reverberated throughout the text of the present study. It stems from distrust of investigators by the black people, since most researchers have documented their lifestyles in the context of apartheid. In Chapter Four and in the Appendix, most family members are shown to have disclosed how negative information about being informers or working for the security police were spread to their communities. According to the participants, this created disharmony and havoc amongst the black people themselves thus creating black on black violence.

The foregoing statements confirm that though I was known, to some families, my credibility was not secure. My position of authority in an institution which the community regarded as having been founded on apartheid designs made the families suspicious. However, the therapeutic group sessions that I spent with the families gradually paved the way for the development of trust and confidence between ourselves. During these group sessions I explored ways and the meaning of the trauma experienced and of providing a safe milieu to be supportive to each other.

It was not uncommon for some families to have higher expectations of what I could do on their behalf, especially in influencing the TRC body in making decisions with regard to their need as families, for reparation. This anticipated help by the families fits in with Schutte's (1983:12) notion that when the researcher is trusted by the subjects he/she is regarded as an "advocate or champion of his/her subjects' cause".

6.2 CONTRIBUTIONS TO PSYCHOTHERAPY

Studies on victimization as a broader social issue can contribute not only towards an individual's healing but to that of the whole society as well. In fact, the present study reveals that psychological themes which emerged from interviews with these selected families, speak to experiences of most families and people in our context.

Peltzer (1995) refers to a theory of ethno-psychotherapy which can be applied in contexts where individuals have been subjected to trauma or torture as it touches the areas of the concept of healing the professional, trauma therapy and coping styles. This becomes a possible contribution that psychotherapy can make to all South Africans which would translate into national healing that has often been a theme of reference by the Truth and Reconciliation Commission. For instance, traditional healers often undergo an initiation illness before they become healers, just like psychotherapists working in the Western paradigm, have to undergo a shorter or longer process before they engage themselves in healing others. This concept of the wounded healer, as he/she is the medium of authority over the age group or myth of the client is what transpired during the TRC sessions as the commissioners and briefers also received psychotherapeutic intervention, for they could no longer cope with the intensity of the emotions from testimonies or stories told by the victims.

Debriefing is part of trauma-focussed psychological assistance. It is believed (Peltzer, 1995) that positive outcomes require that patients be encouraged to reveal as many details as possible about the torture to allow catharsis and re-evaluation of the meaning of the trauma by the victim. The goals of therapy are to help patients understand that torture presents victims with impossible choices. This allows patients to recognise that all responsibility and guilt for their trauma must be placed on the torturers. The therapist attempts to free victims from excessive guilt about their responses during the torture. During my involvement in psychological debriefing of the families before and after they had testified, families conveyed relief at being able to ventilate impressions and feelings about the hearings, as well as the strange reactions they experienced. This experience also evoked thinking about group issues and tensions as well as the mobilization of resources amongst the kin members of the family. It can be said that the detailed recollection of past trauma revealed their suppressed anger, rage, grief or hatred towards those who had violated

their rights. These experiences shared by the families point to the flexibility that psychotherapists could engage in the future when working with their clients either as groups or families, as it places great value in working with people as part of their environment. According to Swartz (1998) family therapy is by its very nature a more public activity than individual work and may help people feel included in a process which otherwise may feel foreign and strange to them.

Coping styles in non-Western societies can be classified according to this theory of ethno-psychotherapy that Peltzer (1995) refers to. This suggests that social support, including 'trust in leadership' increases group cohesion, recreating a flexible family support system and community support network. Most families in the present study talked about how they were humbled by the overwhelming support of their communities during the times of their turmoil when they were looking for missing family members and when they had to give their testimonies. The 'trust in leadership' seems to be an ongoing expectation as victims make references to how the present leadership in the government has to fulfil its obligation with reparations to the families concerned. One of the members from the Khulumani victim support group recommended as follows::

"I would like to see parliament decide on just reparations. They must make sure that people who were victimized and whose lives are still in tatters, have something to rebuild their lives" (Sowetan: August 16, 1999:5).

This perspective, as seen from the trauma experienced by victims, becomes an important dimension for psychotherapy because it encompasses the person's totality and his/her milieu. It is not only their emotionality but also the scars of those who left orphans without food and with educational disabilities or deficiencies.

The role of religion in instilling coping mechanisms in the search for a deeper meaning of the traumatic events experienced by these families, is perceived as healing. Centering their life style in God is seen as helpful, so as to gain freedom from the bondage of victimization. Many families in this study kept on referring to helpful prayers which promoted the binding effect of one's particular loss to the losses of the other people. It would appear that one's personal trauma becomes resonant with history and part of a life cycle of recovery.

Another important aspect of psychotherapy, especially amongst non-Western societies is the use of rituals. These are of central importance for the construction of individual and social reality. I recall how an elderly woman (whose son disappeared and died during the political upheaval) talked about how she experienced uncertainty about going on with her life as a born again Christian since she was guilty of failing to perform appropriate cultural rituals on behalf of her dead son. Westermeyer (1987) describes these experiences as grieving death at a distance that presents special problems. The absence of a corpse and a funeral ritual, as experienced by many families in the present study, undermines the culturally supported healing process whereby individuals demonstrate the experience of healing in burying or cremating the body. This happens in a context of mutual support, of renegotiating kith and kin ties, of replacing obligations to, and support from the deceased and of initiating the period of grief work. These practices serve a mental health function, hence, according to Gilligan (in Peltzer, 1995), the tradition of rituals may be used in psychotherapy by applying a four-step model namely: suggesting a ritual as a possible solution; planning the ritual; enacting the ritual, and post-ritual activities.

6.3 CONTRIBUTIONS TO FUTURE RESEARCH

In South Africa during the past decades there has been little academic freedom to research certain areas which would be considered risky to be investigated, such as the experience of detainees. This study and others which might have been conducted previously, contributes to the premise that Kruger (1998) refers to, of human science which has to be based on unbiased and faithful description of human phenomena illuminated and enriched by hermeneutic understanding.

This suggests that a meaningful contribution to both psychology and psychotherapy in South Africa can be made using a phenomenological method of research. This enquiry not only involves the researcher but community participation in action oriented research, where, not only the researcher is empowered about the cultural issues in research but community dialogue is enhanced. The therapist or researcher's experience during the undertaking of the research could also be interrogated more astutely as an independent study so as to evaluate the effect between documentation of the experiences as they emerged and pre-selected aspects of the researcher.

The general themes such as suspicion and mistrust, absence of helpful community and the problem of forgiveness which emerged from this phenomenon of victimization can be researched further by others because these need to be amplified. Carefully researched ethnographic accounts of mental health issues and psychotherapy are scarce but such accounts can provide very useful information which would facilitate the culturally appropriate delivering of psychotherapy for all in the South African context.

PROTOCOL 4

VERBATIM DESCRIPTION - JEFF (SON OF DECEASED)

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me about the experience of having your father disappear and his subsequent death in detention or prison. Tell me what happened, how it affected you and what you felt during and after the incident.

JEFF: For the first nine years of my life I never knew my father. I never questioned his whereabouts or why I did not have one. This is because I lived with a big family in the same house, for example, five uncles, two grandparents and my mother.

It was only in some time April 1989, I was approached by my fathers' family, including his mother to take a picture for the Herald Newspaper, then I realized what happened to my father. At first I was filled with confusions, people expecting some sort of emotion and I keeping my anger, to think, how someone could do such a thing and I was experiencing it at hand (personally), the loss of my father.

RESEARCHER: Which thing are you talking about?

JEFF: I mean, the death of my father at the hands of those who abducted him.

RESEARCHER: What happened then?

JEFF: I received sympathy from fellow primary school mates and teachers, not that I was in a state of such anger that it needed to be sympathized. After that, as time passed I began to think less of what happened, until I was told to prepare for the TRC at the age of sixteen to seventeen years (in 1996). Remaining anger was calmed and rationalized after seeing a school counsellor (psychologist). I was taught that feelings are a result of what I thought and thus the main issue was understanding what happened to my father.

At the first TRC hearings of my father, in Durban 1996, I saw people who were involved in the death of my father (Mr Skeels and others). I felt some rage inside of me that I couldn't and wouldn't act on. I once had tested myself to imagine what it would be like if I made an outburst in a public place and the thought felt uncomfortable and unusual for me, so I remained calm throughout the hearing.

I was again called to go to the final hearing (of my fathers' case) in Cape Town, early in February this year. I felt more at ease and relaxed, but a bit frustrated to how the hearings went. Repetition of incidents and questions and denials were really irritating, especially after Mr Skeels confessed his acts and those of his colleagues. I was expecting this hearing to be of the applicants to admit their crimes and ask for forgiveness which is the idea of applying for amnesty with the TRC. The hearing was continued for a week from Monday to Friday, increasing the frustration.

I am not angry with anyone but only upset with their deeds and their denials. I personally believe everyone is the same, and the only difference is in the way that they're brought up (or grow up).

RESEARCHER: Could you tell me or explain about whose deeds and denials?

JEFF: Oh! I mean the people who abducted and later killed my father.

RESEARCHER: Okay, go on.

JEFF: And for not questioning the absence of a father in the first nine years of my life, I believe is due to living with a large family and the issue of my father not being brought up. Another important thing is that I don't ever recall us using titles for each other, but called each other by name, unless, of course you just come from initiation and would receive title "Buti", otherwise we called each other on a first name basis.

Only time I have thought of my father is being in other friends' homes and when seen with my father's brother, being asked if he was my father, otherwise I never thought much of having a father until 1989.

'So the way I was brought up never allowed space for anger or hate' only sympathy to family members who knew him personally.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 1 For the first nine years I never knew my father as I lived with my grandparents, my mother and five uncles. I never questioned his whereabouts nor why I did not have one.
- 2 It was only in April 1989 that my fathers' family asked me to take a photo with them.
- 3 When this photo was published for the Herald Newspaper, it is then I realized what happened to my father.
- 4 At first I was filled with confusions, people expecting some sort of emotion and I, keeping my anger, to think how someone could do such a thing and I was experiencing it at hand (personally), the loss of my father.
- 5 I received sympathy from fellow primary school mates and teachers, not that I was in a state of such anger that needed to be sympathized.
- 6 After then, as time passed I began to think less about what happened until I was told to prepare for the TRC at the age of sixteen to seventeen years.
- 7 Remaining anger was calmed and rationalized after seeing a school counsellor (psychologist) I was taught feelings are as a result of what I thought and thus the main issue was under-standing what happened to my father.
- 8 At the first TRC hearings of my father, I saw people who were involved in the death of my father (Mr X and others).

ESSENTIAL THEMES

- Jeff stayed with maternal grandparents in an extended family system for example with five uncles and his mother. He never questioned the absence of a father.
- Jeff was asked to take a photo with his paternal family.
- Jeff was introduced to the information about his father's death via the newspaper article.
- Jeff became confused, as people expected him to show his emotions while he suppressed his anger. He wondered how one could do such a thing as he was experiencing the loss of his father.
- Jeff's school mates and teachers supported him though he was not in a state of anger that needed sympathy.
- With the passage of time Jeff thought less of what had happened until he was informed about his preparation for the TRC hearings.
- The school counsellor helped Jeff to rationalize his anger and to be calm about it and in this way he was made to understand about the origin of his feelings and to focus on understanding his father's death.
- For the first time Jeff met the people who were involved in his father's death.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 9 I felt rage inside of me that I couldn't act on and wouldn't act on. I once had tested myself to imagine what it would be like if I made an outburst in a public place, and the thoughts felt uncomfortable and unusual for me, so I remained calm throughout the hearing.
- 10 I was again called to the final hearing of my father's case. I felt more at ease and relaxed but a bit frustrated to how the hearings went
- 11 Repetition of incidents and questions and denials were imitating especially after Mr Skeels confused his acts and those of his colleagues. I was expecting this hearing to be of the applicants to admit their crimes and ask for forgiveness which is the idea of applying for amnesty with the TRC.
- 12 The hearing was continued for a week from Monday to Friday, increasing the frustration.
- 13 I am not angry with anyone but only upset with their deeds and their denials.
- 14 I personally believe that everyone is the same and the only difference is in the way that they are brought up (or grow up).
- 15 And for not questioning the absence of a father in the first nine years of my life, I believe is due to living with a large family and the issue of my father not being brought up.
- 16 Another important thing, is that I don't even recall us using titles for each other, but called each other by name, unless of course you just come from initiation and would receive title 'Buti', otherwise we called each other on a first name basis.
- 17 Only time I have thought of my father is being in other friends' homes and when seen with my father's brother, being asked if he was my father, otherwise I never thought much of having a father until 1989.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Jeff controlled the rage he experienced during the hearing by using imaginary techniques, thus remaining relaxed and comfortable throughout the hearing.

During the final hearing, though he felt at ease and relaxed Jeff was frustrated about the manner in which the hearing proceeded.

Jeff was irritated by the applicant's denials as he expected them to speak the truth about their crimes and to ask for forgiveness in order to qualify for amnesty.

Jeff's level of frustration was increased by the lengthy duration of the hearing.

Jeff does not have feelings of anger towards applicants but he is upset at what they did and denied.

Jeff believes that people are the same but differ in the manner of their upbringing.

Jeff believes that his unquestioning attitude with regards to his father was influenced by his family system as it was an issue that was not discussed.

Jeff recalls that they used first names to address each other at home instead of titles (Mr, Ms, etc) unless one had undergone circumcision when he would be referred to as 'Buti' (big brother).

Jeff is reminded about his father when he is visited by his uncle as questions are raised about their relationship. He never thought about not having a father until 1989.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

18 So, the way I was brought up never allowed space for anger or hate only sympathy to family members who knew him personally.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Jeff does not harbour any feelings of hate or anger due to his upbringing but feels sorry for family members who had a relationship with his father.

MARLENA - JEFF'S MOTHER

VERBATIM DESCRIPTION

RESEARCHER: I want you to tell me about the experience of having your boyfriend disappear and his subsequent death in prison. Tell me what happened, how it affected you and what you felt during and after the incident.

MARLENA: May be let me start by explaining to you how I got to know Jeff's father. Our families were family friends so we grew up together and we even played together as children. When we were older we went our different ways as we studied in different boarding institutions. In 1978 our friendship became intense and we went to the same university where we began dating. I fell pregnant with Jeff and gave birth to him in 1980. When I returned to the University there was an unrest situation as students were boycotting classes. Jeff's father and some of his friends were arrested as they were identified as student leaders who were involved in this boycott. When they were released they were remanded to appear in court at a later date and the authorities at school decided to close the institution for the whole year. During this time while appearing in court on and off for this case, he would come to my house, help in caring for Jeff and play with him. Our relationship as lovers was over but we were friends with a child, so we had an understanding about Jeff.

On returning home one day, from my typing lessons, I discovered that Jeff's father had stopped by, played with Jeff and waited for me. I returned late that day, so he left before I could arrive, but when I got the message I didn't think much about this as I knew that he would come again. After two days I was told by one of his friends that, he had skipped the country. This was odd. What about our child?, I thought. Why, he never hinted this? Also not believing if this was true. After

some weeks, I received a lengthy letter from him explaining things, but this did not make an impact on me. After some time he started phoning me and would talk to Jeff as well but wouldn't tell us where he was. I understood as the security policy would also make trouble for me if they knew this.

There is this particular day when he called again, talked to Jeff first, and then myself. For some reason I didn't want him to put the phone down, I didn't want him to say good-bye and he kept promising that he was going to phone again. The conversation was abruptly ended, as if the phone is interrupted and it was just dead. I waited, not knowing what happened, thinking that he's going to call again but nothing. That was the last day I spoke to him, and remember!, by this time I was so used to receive his calls that I missed them a lot. I missed him too.

RESEARCHER: What happened then?

MARLENA: After this, rumours were circulated about him that he was an 'impimpi' (informer). Most of his friends shunned me now. I was uncomfortable, worried about this, as during those days to say this word 'impimpi' about people was just enough to cause people to be burnt or their homes to be petrol bombed. I feared for my parents, Jeff and myself.

His father (grandfather-paternal to Jeff) enquired about Jeff's father's disappearance but the security police agreed that they had arrested but had later released him. During this time, I had gone back to study further at university and my parents were caring for Jeff.

In 1991 a certain Mr Skeels from the security police came with the information regarding hit squads and revealed what happened to apartheid victims including Jeff's father, my ex-boyfriend. Jeff's paternal grandparents came to my house and asked permission from my parents to take a photo with Jeff. This photo with an article detailing what happened to Jeff's father appeared in the local newspaper. When I heard this, I phoned home to ask my parents to conceal this information

in the paper from Jeff.

RESEARCHER: Why?

MARLENA: Because we as a family, had never informed Jeff of his father as he called my father, 'Daddy'. My phone was late¹, as he had heard from his friends at school asking what was he doing in the paper. He responded to them, that it was not him but his cousin, but the real matter is that he got to know about his father for the first time.

RESEARCHER: Go on.

MARLENA: I noticed a change in Jeff. When I got home for holidays, he's normally a quiet person but he was awfully quiet and morosed. After we chatted about those events, difficult as it was to explain to him all this, he suffered from meningitis and was hospitalized. I thought that this was caused by stress raised by the whole issue. Things quietened down until 1996 and he was in Standard 8 now.

We heard about the TRC process as Jeff's paternal grandmother was interviewed over the Radio Xhosa news about her missing son (Jeff's father). As we listened, she quoted Jeff, as her grandson who has to accompany or to be present in the TRC hearings. I did not like this as she (paternal grandmother) did not consult with my family about this but we decided that we would all go to the hearings. I noticed that Jeff became awfully quiet again, would lock himself in his room and complained of being awake most of the nights. I phoned his school and he was referred to a school counsellor. His principal was considerate and gave me supporting words.

We went to the TRC hearings sitting both in Durban and Port Elizabeth. There was a lot of irritating and painful information but the denials of how Jeff's father was abducted was frustrating. They (the security police

1

The phone call was made too late as the information had already been given to the child

applicants) lied about what they did with his remains after they had burnt him. I think Jeff handled these very well as he refused counselling on site stating that he had his own shrink. He passed Std 8 at the end of that year. I was happy with his progress as I am striving for his education since his father is no more.

The final amnesty hearing was in Cape Town and we listened to applicants' testimony. This made me to be depressed. I consulted a psychologist who helped me to come to terms with the loss. I had feelings that Jeff's father had also betrayed me by dying as I wanted him to be there for his son. My son needed a role model as his uncles (brothers to Jeff's father) are staying in a town far away from us. Now Jeff, has to go to an initiation school and his paternal family would play a big role in his make up. His paternal grandmother also keeps on promising that he will send him this and that but at the end never does.

One thing that scares me about this whole thing is that Jeff does not share much of his feelings with me as his mother and I am in an awkward position as I don't know how to get through to him. Right now I'm doing all I can to deal with the situation, and I pray all the time that I don't fail him. In the last hearing in Cape Town, I encouraged him to talk to his fathers' abductors, Mr Skeels and others, and he agreed, so I told him to say what he wants to say, and what he feels inside him. I think that the whole situation has helped him to grow as a person.

I guess I am doing fine, to try to live my life but providing for what I can until he is independent. We are trying to put all things behind us, accepting that we will never see Jeff's father again, as we see him in pictures only of the albums we keep. We can look at the past happenings and analyse what happened. Even talking to you today in this conversation has helped me to do just that.

RESEARCHER:

I want you to tell me about the experience of having your boyfriend disappear and his subsequent death in prison. Tell me what happened, how it affected you and what you felt during and after the incident.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 1 May be let me start by explaining to you how I got to know Jeff's father. Our families were family friends so we grew up together and we even played together as children. When we were older we went our different ways as we studied in different boarding institutions. In 1978 our friendship became intense and we went to the same university where we began dating.
- 2 I fell pregnant with Jeff and gave birth to him in 1980.
- 3 When I returned to the University there was an unrest situation as students were boycotting classes. Jeff's father and some of his friends were arrested as they were identified as student leaders who were involved in the boycott.
- 4 When they were released, they were remanded to appear in court at a later date and the authorities at school decided to close the institution for the whole year.
- 5 During this time while appearing in court on and off for this case, he would come to my house, help in caring for Jeff and play with him. Our relationship as lovers was over but we were friends with a child, so we had an understanding about Jeff.
- 6 On returning home one day, from my typing lessons, I discovered Jeff's father had stopped by, played with Jeff and waited for me. I returned late that day, so he left before I could arrive, but when I got the message I didn't think much about this as I knew that he would come again.
- 7 After two days, I was told by one of his friends that he had skipped the country. This was odd! What about our child? I thought, why he never hinted this? Also not believing if this was true.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

- Marlena fell pregnant from this relationship and delivered Jeff in 1980.
- On returning to the university, Marlena finds an unrest situation as students had boycotted classes. Jeff's father together with his friends, were identified as students leaders and arrested.
- Jeff's father and his friends were released but remanded to appear in court at a later date but the authorities decided to close the institution for a year.
- According to Marlena, Jeff's father and friends were remanded to appear in court and lost the whole year of schooling as the institution was closed.
- Although, according to Marlena, her relationship with Jeff's father was over, they had an understanding with regards to Jeff's care, so Jeff's father was available to help babysit in between his trials.
- On returning late from the typing lessons, Marlena finds that Jeff's father had visited, played with Jeff but Marlena was not worried by him leaving before she could reach home as she hoped he would visit again.
- Marlena is informed after two days that Jeff's father has left the country and she registers anxiety about this act, doubting if there was truth in it, while wondering at the reason of Jeff's father keeping it a secret from her.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 8 After some weeks, I received a lengthy letter from him explaining things, but this did not make an impact on me. After some time, he started phoning me and would talk to Jeff as well but wouldn't tell us where he was. I understood as the security police would also make trouble for me if they knew this.
- 9 There is this particular day when he called again, talked to Jeff first and then myself. For some reason, I didn't want him to put the phone down. I didn't want him to say 'good-bye' and he kept promising that he was going to phone again.
- 10 The conversation was abruptly ended, as if the phone is interrupted and it was just dead. I waited, not knowing what happened, thinking that he's going to call again but nothing. That was the last day I spoke to him, and remember!, by this time I was so used to receive his calls that I missed them a lot. I missed him too. (Marlena - emotional, crying).

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Marlena receives a lengthy letter from Jeff's father explaining his position. Subsequent phone calls followed and the caller would talk to Jeff as well but would not disclose his hideout. Marlena seems to have understood the secrecy as the police would make trouble for the whole family.

When Jeff's father phoned this day, talked to his son, and lastly to Marlena who experienced a need to talk more, not wishing Jeff's father to put the phone down, not wishing him to say 'good-bye'.

Marlena experienced their conversation as being cut off as the telephone became dead. She waited in vain for another call as she became confused about what had happened, not knowing it was the last day they spoke to each other. She states that she missed both those calls and Jeff's father (emotional - crying).

RESEARCHER: What happened then?

- 11 After this rumours were circulated about him, that he was an 'impimpi' (informer). Most of his friends shunned me now.
- 12 I was uncomfortable and worried about this, as during those days, to say this word, 'impimpi' people was just enough to cause people to be burnt and their homes to be petrol-bombed. I feared for my parents, Jeff and myself.
- 13 His father (paternal grandfather to Jeff) enquired about Jeff's father's disappearance but the security police agreed that they had arrested but had later released him. During this time I had gone back to study further at university and my parents were caring for Jeff.

Marlena learns about rumours circulated about Jeff's father being an 'impimpi' (informer) resulting in Jeff's father's friends shunning Marlena.

Marlena was uncomfortable and worried about these rumours as people labelled with this name 'impimpi', were burnt to death together with their homes. She lived in anguish of what might happen to her family.

According to Marlena, Jeff's paternal grandfather started enquiries about the disappearance of his son from the security police who were knowledgeable about his arrest but stated to have released him at a later stage. Marlena had returned to school while her family cared for Jeff.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 14 In 1991 a certain Mr Skeels from the security police came with the information regarding hit squads and revealed what happened to apartheid victims including Jeff's father, my ex-boyfriend.
- 15 Jeff's paternal grandparents came to my house and asked permission from my parents to take a photo with Jeff. This photo with an article detailing what happened to Jeff's father appeared in the local newspaper. When I heard this, I phoned home to ask my parents to conceal this information in the paper from Jeff.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Marlena states that in 1991 Mr Skeels from the security police leaked information about hit squads, recounting the events that occurred to apartheid victims and Jeff's fathers' name was included.

Jeff's paternal grandparents asked permission from Marlena's parents to take a photo with Jeff which appeared in a local newspaper a story about Jeff's father disappearance. On hearing this, Marlena asked her parents to conceal this information from Jeff.

RESEARCHER: Why?

- 16 Because we as a family, had never informed Jeff of his father as he called my father, 'Daddy'. My phone was late, as he heard from his friends at school asking what was he doing in the paper. He responded to them, that it was not him but his cousin, but the real matter is that he got to know about his father for the first time.
- 17 I noticed a change in Jeff. When I got home for holidays, he's normally a quiet person but he was awfully quiet and morose.
- 18 After we chatted about these events, difficult as it was to explain all this to him, he suffered from meningitis and was hospitalized. I thought that this was caused by stress raised by the whole issue. Things quietened down until 1996 and he was in Std 8 now.
- 19 We heard about the TRC process as Jeff's paternal grandmother was interviewed over the Radio Xhosa news about her missing son (Jeff's father). As we listened, she quoted Jeff, as her grandson who has to accompany or to be present in the TRC hearings.

Marlena agrees that her family, never told Jeff of his father as he referred to his maternal grandfather as 'Daddy'. When she phoned it was too late, as Jeff had already been told by his friends at school about this photo in the paper. He denied it was him but had stated it was his cousin. According to Marlena he heard this information for the first time.

On arrival at home for the vacation, Marlena noticed a change in her son as he seemed to be awfully quiet and morose.

Marlena experienced difficulty in talking to her son about all the events that had happened, after which, Jeff suffered from meningitis which required hospitalization. Marlena attributed this sickness to stress induced by all these events but in 1996 it was a settling time for Jeff.

Marlena and her family heard about the TRC process as Jeff's paternal grandmother was interviewed over the radio news with regards to her son's disappearance. She quoted Jeff as her grandson who she wanted to be present in the TRC hearings.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

ESSENTIAL THEMES

- | | | |
|----|---|---|
| 20 | I did not like this as she (paternal grandmother) did not consult with my family about this but we decided that we would all go to the hearings. | Though dissatisfied with paternal grandmother's actions, Marlana felt it necessary to attend the TRC hearings with Jeff. |
| 21 | I noticed that Jeff became awfully quiet again, would lock himself in his room and complained of being awake most of the nights. I phone his school and he was referred to a school counsellor. His principal was considerate and gave me supporting words. | On observing that Jeff had become withdrawn again, Marlana consulted his school and Jeff was referred to a school counsellor. Marlana found the school principal considerate and supportive. |
| 22 | We went to the TRC hearings/sittings both in Durban and Port Elizabeth. There was a lot of irritating and painful information but the denials of how Jeff's father was abducted was frustrating. They (the security police) lied about what they did with his remains after they had burnt him. | Marlana's family attended two sittings of the TRC hearings which were irritating, frustrating and painful as Marlana thinks there were denials about Jeff's fathers' abduction. Marlana thinks the police lied about the disposal of Jeff's fathers' remains. |
| 23 | I think Jeff handled these very well as he refused counselling on site stating that he had his own shrink. | Marlana thinks that her son coped well with these hearings as he objected to the coined-selling services which were offered on site believing in his own counsellor/psychologist. |
| 24 | He passed Std 8 at end of that year. I was happy with his progress as I am striving for his education since his father is no more. | Marlana is determined to strive for her son's education and was happy with his progress at school during that year as he passed Std 8. |
| 25 | The final amnesty hearing was in Cape Town and we listened to applicants' testimony. This made me to be depressed. I consulted a psychologist who helped me to come to terms with the loss. | According to Marlana the final amnesty hearing resulted in her experiencing depression which was relieved by a therapeutic intervention by a psychologist who helped Marlana to accept her loss. |
| 26 | I had feelings that Jeff's father had also betrayed me by dying as I wanted him to be there for his son. My son needed a role model as his uncles (brothers to Jeff's fathers) are staying in a town far away from us. | Marlana also experienced feelings of being betrayed by Jeff's fathers' death as she needed a role model for his son. |
| 27 | Now Jeff, had to go to an initiation school and his paternal family would play a big role in his make up. His paternal grandmother also keeps promising she will send him this and that but never does anything at the end. | Marlana is concerned about imminence Jeff's rites of passage which would be meaningful for him if his fathers' family would participate. She seems not to be convinced by Jeff's paternal grandmother's promises which are never fulfilled. |

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

ESSENTIAL THEMES

- 28 One thing that scares me about this whole thing is that Jeff does not share much of his feelings with me as his mother and I'm in an awkward position as I don't know how to get through to him.

- 29 Right now, I'm doing all I can to deal with the situation and I pray all the time that I don't fail him.

- 30 In the last hearing in Cape Town, I encouraged him to talk to his father's abductors, Mr Skeels and others, and he agreed. So, I told him to say what he wants to say and what he feels inside him. I think that the whole situation has helped him to grow as a person.

- 31 I guess I am doing fine, to try to live my life but providing for what I can, until he is independent. We are trying to put all things behind us, accepting that we will never see Jeff's father again as we see him in pictures only of the albums we keep. We can look at the past happenings and see what happened. Even talking to you in this conversation has helped me to do just that.

- Marlena raises her fears about her son's lack of self-disclosure to her as a mother because this prevents her from reaching out to him.

- Marlena states that she tries to deal with this situation but can only pray that she does not fail her son.

- Marlena encouraged her son to talk to his fathers' abductors during the last TRC hearing session, persuading him to state what he wanted or felt from within. She hopes that this whole situation has led to Jeff's personality growth.

- Marlena thinks she is going on with her life while providing for her son until he is independent. She states her wish to put all that has happened in the past but accepts the reality of Jeff's father absence for good, though reminded of him in the pictures she keeps. She testifies to the importance of the analyses of past happenings. She sees the interview as a medium of revisiting the past.

VERBATIM DESCRIPTION

(BETTY - GRANDMOTHER PATERNAL TO JEFF)

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me about the experience of having your son disappear and his subsequent death in prison. Tell me what happened, how it affected you, and what you felt during and after the incident.

BETTY: I knew my son was involved in politics at school. He used to be amongst the student leaders when doing a law degree, who were arrested at one time at university. He was released and had a trial that went on for a long time as he was accused of inciting other students. He was expelled at the university, and the same year the whole university closed for a year, so he came back to stay at home. I used to talk to him to stop all this as it would hamper him in finishing his degree.

He escaped because he was harassed by the police. He was supposed to go for a trial, maybe he knew that he was going to get a heavy sentence. He went to Maseru and while there had a problem with his girlfriend. According to the story he wanted the girlfriend to go to Maseru. He got a car from Vic so that he could go and phone his girlfriend. According to the story, the telephone at Maseru were not working and he decided to go to the border gates to phone, that is where he was arrested. Perhaps because he was driving Vic's car, I think, the security police thought that he was Vic. I understand that he was close to Vic. He used to look after Vic's house when he was away.

I did not know that he was arrested. I used to phone him but all of a sudden he was nowhere to be found. I phoned his father (my ex-husband) to enquire about him. He told me that they were busy tracing my son's matter (his son as well). All in all he told me that my son was missing. I never thought that he had been arrested. I thought that he might have gone to another country. His father wrote to the Commissioner of Police concerning my son's disappearance. The police commissioner told him that my son, Wally, was arrested but was later released. He told him (Wally's father) that Wally was arrested from July until August of that year. The police said that they released him, where he went they did not know. I, the mother, claimed that after his release I never saw him.

Wally's story was confusing, the liberation movement or organisation said that his father must pay for the organisation's car since Wally stole it. When I got to Maseru in a house where I used to stay, to look for Wally, my son, the people of that house told me to leave Maseru immediately. Organisation members told me they knew where Wally was. Others claimed that Wally was not kidnapped by the boers, as the boers could not get into Maseru. To me this was surprising because the boers did get into Maseru and kidnapped people. They said that Wally was kidnapped in the outskirts of Maseru, not in Maseru. I used to pray day in and night asking God to reveal the whereabouts of my son. We were even alienated by the liberation movement he was fighting for, it

was difficult to attend meetings.

I used to read each and every newspaper hoping to get clues about what might have happened to my son. Police would come to my home and my in-laws' home to look for him.

It is only after nine years that there was a clue which was denied by the police when the security police Mr Skeels revealed what happened to my son and others as he claimed responsibility for abducting and killing him. The whole story was in the newspapers and my sisters brought the New Nation newspaper to me which contained the whole story, how he was abducted, killed and his body burnt. That is how I got the information.

RESEARCHER: What was your reaction to this news?

BETTY: I was confused not knowing how to mourn appropriately. I used to wear half-dark clothes, worsened by the fact that the remains of my son were not brought to me. His father wanted us not to talk about this. This was a difficult time, also saddened by the fact that the liberation movement never apologised about the labels they used against my son when they said he was an 'impimpi' (informer or blowing the whistle).

I travelled to the site which Mr Skeels had identified as a place where they killed him and collected some soil which I hope we will bury one day appropriately, to give my son the respect he deserves as he would be proud even today of what he fought for.

The news people took a photograph of my grandson Jeff with the paternal grandparents and wrote stories which were heartbreaking for me as Jeff did not know about his father. This happened before I testified in the TRC as I said something about Jeff's father to an interview over the radio news. Meanwhile, Jeff never knew about his father.

As far as I am concerned, Jeff should be treated by a psychologist. It was necessary before going to the TRC that Jeff should have been told about his father but everything went wrong. During the last TRC Amnesty hearing it was certified that he was Wally's son, and I think each child needs a sense of belonging.

I see no point in the boers killing the children instead of taking them to jail or sending them home. What did they get? There are police who were named in the TRC, I see nothing that is being done by the TRC. The only thing that I like about it, is that we are informed of what happened to our family members. The problem is left with the Amnesty.

As a family we're trying to cope against all odds, for instance one of my children, a sister to Wally, was badly affected by all this matter. She is receiving psychiatric treatment even at present. His brothers miss him as he was the older one who was a role model to them. We will continue to live to cherish what Wally stood for, and I can say though he died painfully but he died a hero, of what he believed in and I am a proud mother as he honoured us by dying such a death.

You do not stop living because one child has died you live for the others, so I have to go on to give support to Wally's siblings. We hope that one day we as a family will bury the soil I picked up from the site where he was killed and we will honour him by building a memorial on his name. He would have loved that, and this will also help us to complete this chapter of our lives.

The other things, not forgiving these security police who killed my son, will not help me, so I've forgiven them although they denied about what they did to the remains of his body, as you know the President of this country preaches this reconciliation daily, so I've forgiven them.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

ESSENTIAL THEMES

- | | | |
|---|--|--|
| 1 | I know my son was involved in politics at school. He used to be amongst the student leaders when doing a law degree, who were arrested at one time at university. | Betty explains in detail her son's involvement in political activities at University which resulted in his arrest. |
| 2 | He was released and had a trial that went on for a long time as he was accused of inciting other students. He was expelled at university and the same year the whole university was closed for a year, so he came back to stay at home. I used to talk to him to stop all this as it would hamper him in finishing his degree. | After his release the trial continued as her son was accused of inciting others resulting in expulsion from the university which later closed its doors for the whole year. Betty discouraged her son from these activities as she feared that he might not complete his degree. |
| 3 | He escaped because he was harassed by the police. He was supposed to go for a trial, maybe he knew that he was going to get a heavy sentence. | According to Betty her son escaped before his trial due to police harassment, maybe in anticipation of a heavy sentence. |
| 4 | He went to Maseru and while there had a problem with his girlfriend. According to the story, he wanted his girlfriend to go to Maseru. He got a car from Vic so that he could go and phone his girlfriend. According to the story, the telephones at Maseru were not working and he decided to go to the border gates to phone, that is where he was arrested. | Betty's son escaped to Maseru where he wanted his girlfriend to join him. He received a car from Vic to travel to the telephone centres in Maseru but unfortunately was arrested at the border gates as the telephone in Maseru were not working. |
| 5 | Perhaps, because he was driving Vic's car, I think, the security police thought it was Vic. I understand that he was close to Vic. He used to look after Vic's house when he was away. | Betty thinks that her son was arrested in a case of mistaken identity but understands that he was close to Vic as he would take care of Vic's house while away. |
| 6 | I did not know that he had been arrested. I used to phone him but all of a sudden he was nowhere to be found. | Betty seems to have been unaware of her son's arrest. |
| 7 | I phoned his father to enquire about him. He told me that they were busy tracing my son's matter. All in all he told me that my son was missing. | To enquire about her son, Betty contacted her son's father who told her that he was tracing him as it was reportedly that he was missing. |
| 8 | I never thought that he had been arrested. I thought that he might have gone to another country. | Betty never thought her son was arrested but thought that he had escaped into exile. |

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

9 His father wrote to the Commissioner of Police concerning my son's disappearance. The Police Commissioner told him that my son, Wally, was arrested but was later released. He told him (Wally's father) that Wally was arrested from July until August of that year. The police said they released him where he went they did not know. I, as a mother, claimed that after his release I never saw him.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

According to Betty, her son's father enquiries from the Commissioner of Police revealed that he was indeed arrested for 3 months but was later released. The mystery was his whereabouts.

RESEARCHER: And then, what happened?

10 Wally's story is confusing, the liberation movement or organisation said his father must pay for the organisation's car since he stole it. When I got to Maseru in a house where I used to stay, to look for Wally, my son, the people of that house told me to leave Maseru immediately. Organisation members told me they knew where Wally was. Others claimed that Wally was not kidnapped by the boers as the boers could not get into Maseru. To me this was confusing as the boers did get into Maseru and kidnapped people. They said that W was kidnapped in the outskirts of Maseru, not in Maseru.

Betty finds Wally's disappearance confusing as in Maseru the liberation organisation demands that his father pays the car he allegedly stole.

The confusing situation is exacerbated by the unwelcoming attitude shown to Betty and by the denials by members of this organisation that Wally could not have been kidnapped by the boers as they could not get into Maseru.

11 I used to pray day in and night asking God to reveal the whereabouts of my son. We were even alienated by the liberation movement he was fighting for, it was difficult to attend meetings.

Betty sought her answers about her missing son from prayers and newspapers as the police seemed to be looking for him too.

I used to read each and every newspaper hoping to get clues about what might have happened to my son. Police would come to my home and my in-laws' home to look for him.

12 It is only after nine years that there was a clue which was denied by the police when the security police Mr Skeels revealed what happened to my son and others as he claimed responsibility for abducting and killing him. The whole story was in the newspapers and my sisters brought the New Nation newspaper to me which contained the whole story, how he was abducted, killed and his body burnt. That is how I got the information.

Betty learns after nine years about her son's abduction when the story is published in the New Nation newspaper, as a certain Mr Skeels from the security police leaks this information. However, the police denied this information.

RESEARCHER: What was your re-action to this news?

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

13 I was confused not knowing how to mourn appropriately. I used to wear half-dark clothes, worsened by the fact that the remains of my son were never brought to me. His father wanted us not to talk about this. This was a difficult time, also saddened by the fact that the liberation movement never apologised about the labels they used against my son when they said he was an 'impimpi' (selling out other or blowing the whistle).

14 I travelled to the site which Mr Skeels had identified as a place where they killed him and collected some soil which I hope we will bury one day, appropriately, to give my son the respect he deserves as he would be proud even today of what he fought for.

15 The news people took a photograph of my grandson Jeff with his paternal grandparents and wrote stories which were heartbreaking for me as Jeff did not know about his father. This happened before I testified in the TRC as I said something about Jeff's father on an interview over the radio news. Meanwhile Jeff never knew about his father.

16 As far as I am concerned Jeff should be treated by a psychologist. It was necessary before going to the TRC that Jeff should have been told about his father but everything went wrong. During the last TRC Amnesty hearing it was certified that he was W's son and I think each child needs a sense of belonging.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Betty experiences uncertainty about mourning rituals, her father seems to be in denial. The situation is aggravated by the inability of the liberation movement to apologise for the labels attached to her son.

Betty hopes to bury the soil linked to the site of her son's killing and this seems to her an appropriate task that will befit her dead son.

Betty experiences sorrow on learning about the newspaper publishing stories of her grandson who did not know about his father until this incident.

Betty feels that psychological intervention is necessary for Jeff who she feels, had a right to know about his father before the TRC sittings.

RESEARCHER: How do you feel about what happened?

17 I see no point in the boers killing the children instead of taking them to jail or sending them home. What did they get? There are police who were named in the TRC, I see nothing that is being done by the TRC. The only thing that I like about it is that we are informed of what happened to our family members. The problem is left with the TRC.

Betty sees that police wasted the lives in killing children instead of bringing charges against them. She experiences ambivalent feelings about the TRC process but she is happy about revelations with regards to their family members.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

ESSENTIAL THEMES

- 18 As a family we're trying to cope against all odds, for instance one of my children a sister to Wally, was badly affected by all this matter. She is receiving psychiatric treatment even at present. His brothers miss him as he was the older one who was a role model to them.

- 19 We will continue to live to cherish what Wally stood for and I can say though he died painfully but he died a hero of what he believed in and I am a proud mother as he honoured us by dying such a death. You do not stop living because one child has died, you live for the others, so I have to go on to give support to Wally's siblings.

- 20 The other thing, not forgiving these security police who killed my son, will not help me, so I've forgiven them though they denied about what they did to the remains of his body, as you know, the President of this country preaches this reconciliation daily, so I've forgiven them.

Betty discloses hardships experienced by the family since this loss.

Betty stresses her will to find sense and meaning in her existence while remembering with pride what her son died for. This to her, seems to be an honour.

Betty forgives the police who killed her son though they denied certain information. Seemingly she is motivated by the action of the President of South Africa who advocates reconciliation.

SITUATED STRUCTURE

JEFF'S FAMILY

The experiences of the loss of a son by Betty, a son's father by Marlana, and a father from Jeff's point of view is reflected in different ways by this family. Jeff's life is placed in turmoil when he learns about his father for the first time as he has grown up in an extended family system. Jeff becomes confused about his emotions but has a supportive network in his school that helps him to cope with this situation. Jeff becomes part of the story through the public acknowledgement that he had a father and that his father had been killed. It seems that Betty, Jeff's paternal grandmother, who knew about his son's political movements while at law school is confronted with the similar confusion when she travelled to Maseru to look for her son who had disappeared. To her surprise, the liberation organisation accuses her son of stealing a car, which makes her feel alienated and rejected. These feelings becomes worse when they accused him of being an 'informer'. Marlana is also doubtful about the news of Jeff's fathers' disappearance but is reassured by a letter and phone calls which were ended abruptly leaving her in limbo. In her own way she struggles with this pain of separation while having to cope with

labels of Jeff's father as being an informer, which resulted in her being shunned by Jeff's fathers' friends. She lives in anguish of what might happen to her family.

When the news about what became of Jeff's father is leaked in newspapers, the whole family is thrown into a difficult situation. They become unsure of 'mourning processes' as the remains of Jeff's fathers' body were never brought to the fore. Jeff is expected to respond to this news as a person who had a meaningful relationship with his father. He becomes angry about the killing, not so much about the loss of the father he never knew, whose presence is introduced paradoxically through the newspapers which detailed the circumstances surrounding his death. This revelation leads to the TRC process which requires that they all sit and listen to the stories. The reliving of this story becomes painful, they are frustrated and irritated by the denials and the duration of the TRC process. Although Jeff remains angry and describes 'rage inside me' he does not describe the source of the anger as he tries hard not to make a spectacle of himself in the public. Marlina is helped by the psychologist to cope with the side effects of this story which is relived, while Jeff handles this situation well due to Marlina's encouragement for him to continue his therapy sessions with his psychologist. The effect of blaming each other does not escape this family as Jeff's paternal grandmother feels that Jeff had a right to information about his father while Marlina was trying by all means to conceal this from Jeff fearing its consequences.

However, Jeff manages to come through as a better person from this experience because he had the opportunity to articulate his feelings to his father's abductors. While Marlina has fears about her son's guarded self disclosure to her as a mother she is positive about supporting Jeff until he is independent. At times Marlina feels that Jeff's father betrayed her by dying because she wanted him to be a role model for Jeff.

Betty, feels that her son's death was unnecessary as he could have been imprisoned, but she will continue to live in order to support other children. She takes strength from the fact that her son died fighting for what he believed in. As a family they hope to honour him by putting up a memory one day in his name.

PROTOCOL 5 - EMMA'S FAMILY

EMMA - MOTHER WHOSE SON ABDUCTED AND LATER KILLED

EDNA - GRANDDAUGHTER (WHOSE FATHER IS EMMA'S SON)

RESEARCHER: I want you to tell me about the experience of having your son disappear and his subsequent death in prison. Tell me what happened, how this affected you during and after the incident.

EMMA: What happened is that my son was a general secretary of a civic organisation movement in our townships. This disappearance with two others during 1985 follows incidents that had happened before. He stayed underground for 3 months as the police were looking for him. It was war, since my son and other comrades were fighting with local councillors of that time, who were not looking after the interest of the masses. His car was burnt down by people we don't know, as well as the vice-president's home. The day of his disappearance, he had received a message that he and two other comrades should meet their guest from a certain venue, and this message was from the President of the organisation. So, they went to that venue in 1985, May, I think it was the 8th of May if I still remember. We never saw them till today.

RESEARCHER: And then?

EMMA: I didn't pay attention to this at first thinking that he was in some hideout, as he used not be at home for days. I was alerted by a phone that I received while at work in the clinic as a nurse. The person who phoned did not identify himself, but the words are still clear in my mind terrifying, as he said, 'you'll never see your son again, tell Willie and Kenny that we are going to hunt them as well and do the same thing we did to your son'. Willie and Kenny are the other comrades who sent my son and the other two to the venue of the meeting. So I became aware that maybe he was arrested. I approached the other relatives of the two comrades who had disappeared with him, and we all suspected the arrest. The vice-president of the organisation also confirmed that they are missing and would help in looking for them till today.

I became scared, for my other kids. I would not sleep at home during the night with them. I had concentration problems at work, my health deteriorated and I was going up and down looking for my son. In 1986 to 1987 I filed a case of a missing person with the police who played hide and seek. There was a small hint during this time that a certain witness had seen my son in chains with the two comrades in another police station during 1985, immediately after their disappearance. I went there to trace but police denied this information, in fact denied all this.

When this circulated, my house was burnt down during the night and few victims inside were injured. I was not at home during that day otherwise I would have died myself. My children who are siblings of this missing son were banned from school, as a result one took three years to complete Matric. It was only after twelve years that a security policeman owned up that they killed these people in 1985 already. The way he related it, to me it seems they died cruelly and now are asking for Amnesty after this policeman revealed this, but they are still not speaking the truth.

RESEARCHER: What happened after this revelation?

EMMA: It took another line now, the TRC and the Amnesty. I was approached to make a statement to testify in the TRC. I did that but I didn't testify as my daughter-in-law went to testify without me. Lets not talk about that now, as it is a long story and it caused pain amongst us as a family. So what I'm trying to say, is that I never buried my son and I am not the only person responsible for him, he has his uncles, brothers who also feel that this cloud is still hanging over us since we didn't bury him. I feel through the TRC - a person has come forward and owned up after twelve years that my son was killed in a gruesome way. I'm waiting for the judgement of the judges but as far as I'm concerned there should be no Amnesty for these killers, the law has to take its cause, they should feel that they have done something wrong.

In the same vein I feel much better having knowledge of what happened to my son, as I used to pray to God, alone, without relatives and even the church community seemed to run away but I called to my Lord, 'God let me not die without having knowledge of what happened to my son'. My prayers were answered as I know now and the case has been put to rest. I'll forgive but never forget, and I'm pleased that I'll do the ritual to remove the black cloud (ilifu elimnyama) on behalf of him. Although I'll do the ritual, this still leaves a question mark, because right deep in my heart, I feel these people were never burnt, but put in one deep grave and buried, even if we could know where the grave is, we would find them in one hole. Really! I would forget about this if they could tell me about the whereabouts of my child's bones to fetch them.

Despite all this life has to go on, my general health is deteriorating, my other children are not working at all, I was boarded off from work so one cannot live on that meagre wages. I've applied for social pension fund, but results are not back yet. If you ask me about healing, healing comes from 'living' normally. Even you as you have come to ask this questions you write all what you need as a researcher without doing anything to help. How do I do that when my house needs to be repaired since it was burnt? But there is hope as I am alive and continuing to do voluntary work in the community and community support is overwhelming. One of my daughters has completed a teaching course but she cannot find a job we keep hoping that things will be better.

RESEARCHER: I want you to tell me about the experience of having your son disappear and his subsequent death in prison. Tell me what happened, how this affected you and what you felt during and after the incident.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

ESSENTIAL THEMES

- 1 Emma: what happened was that my son was a general secretary of a civic organisation in our township. Their disappearance with two others during 1985 follows incidents that happened before. He stayed underground for three months as the police were looking for him. It was war, since my son and other comrades were fighting with local councillors of that time, who were not looking after the interests of the masses. His car was burnt down by people we don't know as well as the vice-president's house. The day of his disappearance, he had received a message that he and two other comrades should meet their guest from the airport, and this message was from the president of the organisation. So, they went to that airport in 1985, May, I think, it was 8 May if I still remember. We never saw them till today.

Emma explains the circumstances surrounding the disappearance of her son.

RESEARCHER: And then?

- 2 Emma: I did not pay attention to this at first, thinking that he was in some hideout, as he used not to be at home for days. I was alerted by a phone that I received while at work in the clinic as a nurse.
- 3 The person who phoned did not identify himself, but the words are still clear in my mind, terrifying, as he said, 'you'll never see your son again, tell Willie and Kenny that we are going to hunt them as well and we will do the same thing we did to your son'. Willie and Kenny are the other comrades who sent my son and the other two to the venue of the meeting. So I became aware that maybe he was arrested. I approached the other relatives of the two comrades who had disappeared with him, and we all suspected the arrest.

Emma never focussed herself on her son's disappearance thinking that he was hiding for a few days until she received a telephone call at work.

Though the person who phoned Emma concealed his identity, the terrifying words in the call made her think that he was arrested. This suspicion was shed by the relatives of his comrades.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 4 The vice-president of the organization also confirmed that they are missing and would help in looking for them till today.

- 5 I became scared for my other kids, I would not sleep at home during the night with them. I had concentration problems at work, my health deteriorated and I was going up and down looking for my son.

- 6 In 1986 to 1987 I filed a case of a missing person with the police who played hide and seek. There was a small hint during this time that a certain witness had seen my son in chains with the other two comrades in another police station during 1985, immediately after their disappearance. I went there to trace this information but the police denied all this.

- 7 When this circulated, my house was burnt down during the night and four victims were injured. I was not at home during that day otherwise I would have died myself. My children who are siblings to this missing son were banned from school, as a result one took three years to complete matric.

- 8 It was only after twelve years that a security policeman owned up that they killed these people in 1985 already. The way he related it, to me, it seems they died cruelly and now are asking for Amnesty after this policeman revealed this, but they are still not speaking the truth.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

- While confirming the comrades' arrest, the vice president of the organisation promised to help in finding them.

- Emma lived in fear as she ran away from home during the nights, experienced health problems but kept looking for her son.

- Emma filed a case of a missing person with police who, she believes did not take cognisance of her plight. A hint by a witness about the missing comrades proved to be futile when Emma followed up as the police denied this information.

- While Emma escapes death due to her absence at home while her house burns down, four other people are injured. She also believes that her children were prevented from completing their studies.

- Emma learns after twelve years about the death of her son through information revealed by a security policeman. She believes that her son and others died in a cruel manner but is surprised that the polices' plea for Amnesty when they have not been truthful.

RESEARCHER: What happened after this revelation?

- 9 E: It took another line now, the TRC and the Amnesty. I was approached to make a statement to testify in the TRC. I did that but I didn't testify as my daughter-in-law went to testify without me. Let us not talk about that now as it is a long story on its own and it caused pain amongst us as a family.

 - 10 So, what I'm trying to say is that I never buried my son, and I am not the only person responsible for him, he has uncles, brothers who feel that this cloud is still hanging over us since we didn't bury him.
- According to Emma events changed as she was approached to testify in the TRC about her story, which she never managed to do as her daughter-in-law testified instead. She finds it difficult to talk more about this, as it caused pain in the family.

 - Emma emphasizes the concern of the whole extended family about their inauthentic sense of feelings with regard to her son's death.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 11 I feel through the TRC, a person has come forward and owned up after twelve years that my son was killed in a gruesome way. I'm waiting for the judgement of the judges but as far as I am concerned there should be no Amnesty for these killers, the law has to take its course, they should feel that they have done something wrong.
- 12 In the same vein, I feel much better having knowledge of what happened to my son, as I used to pray to God, alone, without relatives and even the church community seemed to run away but I called on my Lord, 'God let me not die without having knowledge of what happened to my son'. My prayers were answered as I know now and the case has been put to rest.
- 13 I'll forgive but never forget and I am pleased that I will do the ritual to remove the black cloud on behalf of him. Although I'll do the ritual, this still leaves a question mark, because right deep in my heart, I feel these people were never burnt, but put in one deep grave and buried, even if we would know where the grave is, we would find them in one hole. Really! I would forget about this if they could tell me about the whereabouts of my child's bones to fetch them.
- 14 Despite all this life has to go on, my general health is deteriorating, my other children are not working at all, I was boarded from work so one cannot live on that meagre wages. I have applied for social pension fund, but results are not back yet.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Emma believes in the TRC's breakthrough as she was informed about the gruesome death of her son and expects the law to take its course as she feels strongly that the police should be denied Amnesty.

Emma says that she feels better since she knows about the outcome of her son's disappearance. She sees these revelations as answers in her spiritual meaning and explanations.

Although Emma is determined to do a ritual that will befit her son's death, she is sceptical about the way his body was disposed of. Her will to forgive and forget about what happened seems to be founded on her being able to locate her son's remains.

Emma is determined to continue living despite all the hardship she and her family experience.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 15 If you ask me about healing, healing comes from 'living' normally. Even you, as you are asking these questions, you will write down all that you require for your research. How do I do that when my house needs to be repaired since it was burnt? But there is hope as I am alive and continuing to do voluntary work in the community and the community support is overwhelming. One of daughters has completed a teaching course but she cannot find a job. we keep hoping that things will be better.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Emma believes that healing can only be achieved if her life returns to what it was before and continues to find meaning in her voluntary community work. However, she questions how the researcher can provide help.

**EDNA - EMMA'S GRANDDAUGHTER
(HER FATHER IS EMMA'S SON WHO DIED IN PRISON)**

RESEARCHER: I want you to tell me about your experience of having your father abducted and his subsequent death in prison. Tell me what happened before, and how this affected you and what you felt during and after the incident.

EDNA: To tell you the honest fact is that this is like a story from the book for me. Firstly I was younger when this happened but I learnt about this when I was told by my grandmother (Emma). I think I was fourteen or fifteen years when she told me. So, I cannot say how I felt when younger but I know exactly how I feel now especially with what has been going on with police in the TRC, testimonies from different people who mentioned this incident. Since my grandmother told me, I have also followed these events, reading each and every paper but I have been worried by all what happened to my grandmother.

I mean, these police treated her badly, I feel for her and wonder how she managed to escape during the nights when her house was attacked. What makes me angry is for her to be seen as one who is against the authorities when it was actually my father who was involved in these activities.

I think the most painful realization is that I don't have a father, it is difficult for me to have money to go to school, unless his brothers who are my uncles try and help. This becomes a constant worry as a result, since the TRC hearing began I have had nightmares, bad dreams as if people are trying to surround my house to kill my family. It's frightening and my work at school is not good at all.

RESEARCHER: Meaning?

EDNA: I am performing poorly really, I think my concentration is not focussed well since I am following the events of the Amnesty applicants who were involved in my father's death. I so wish for my grandmother's sake that my father's body could be located so that we bury him. At least I'll be relieved and I know my grandmother has made peace with some of the tormentors who were involved.

RESEARCHER: And you?

EDNA: I respect my grandmother and all her wishes but I am angry, may be I don't understand things yet as my grandmother does. I want to have that peace with these people, but I was robbed of my father, that is a difficult situation.

I am in high school now hoping to go to a university but when I think how will I do that, I become powerless. Hopefully, if the family gets something from whatever fund set up by the government, I will see that day. My mother does not have money as she does part-time domestic work and my grandmother lives on pension. Something has to be done by this government.

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me about the experience of having your father disappear and his subsequent death in prison. Tell me what happened, how this affected and what you felt during and after the incident.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

ESSENTIAL THEMES

1 To tell you the honest fact is that this is like a story from the book for me. Firstly I was younger when this happened but I learnt about this when I was told by my grandmother (Emma). I think I was fourteen or fifteen years when she told me.

Edna explains how she got to know about her father's disappearance as she was younger when the incident occurred.

2 So, I cannot say how I felt when younger but I know exactly how I feel now especially with what has been going on with the police in the TRC, testimonies from different people who mentioned this incident. Since my grandmother told me I have also followed these events, reading each and every paper but I have been worried by all what happened to my grandmother.

Edna explains that she is more aware of her feelings at present than when she was younger but she is worried about how her grandmother endured this incident.

3 I mean, these police treated her badly, I feel for her and wonder how she managed to escape during the nights when her house was attacked. What makes me angry is for her to be seen as one who is against the authorities when it was my father who was involved in these activities.

Edna believes that her grandmother received harsh treatment at the hands of the police and wonders how she survived these circumstances and is angered by police acts who also targeted her grand-mother.

4 I think the most painful realization is that I don't have a father, it is difficult for me to have money to go to school, unless his brothers who are my uncles try and help. My grandmother does not have money.

Edna speaks about her painful insights regarding her father's absence.

5 This becomes a constant worry as a result since the TRC hearings began, I have had nightmares, bad dreams as if people are trying to surround my house to kill my family. It is frightening and my work at school is not good at all.

Edna has relived her frightening experiences in her dreams, thus affecting her school performance.

RESEARCHER: Meaning?

6 I am performing poorly really, I think my concentration is not focussed well since I am following the events of the Amnesty applicants who were involved in my father's death.

Edna's distracted attitude from her school work seems to be influenced by her interest in the outcome of Amnesty applicants involved in her father's death incident.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 7 I so wish for my grandmother's sake that my father's body could be located so that we bury him. At least I'll be relieved and I know my grandmother has made peace with some of the tormentors who were involved.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Edna expresses her wish to bury her father which would please her grandmother who has settled for peace with tormentors of her father.

RESEARCHER: And you?

- 8 I respect my grandmother and all her wishes but I am angry, may be I don't understand things yet as my grandmother does. I want to have that peace with these people but I was robbed of my father, that is a difficult situation.

Edna explains her difficulties to be at peace with the amnesty applicants involved and experiences anger at surviving without a father.

- 9 I am in high school now hoping to go to a university but when I think, how will I do that, I become powerless. Hopefully if the family gets something from whatever fund set up by the government, I will see that day. My mother does part-time domestic work and my grandmother lives on pension. Something has to be done by this government.

Edna's dream of university education becomes vivid, and she finds herself helpless, when she considers the realities of her family situation. However, she hopes the government fund towards these families could make her see that day.

SITUATED STRUCTURE

EMMA'S FAMILY

As a mother depicts painfully how her son's disappearance affected her physically, cognitively and emotionally, while her granddaughter came to this awareness as an adolescent. To the adolescent teenager this was experienced as a story from a novel as this is related to her during her teenage period. She does not own how she feels except worrying about how her grandmother survived this ordeal.

Although Emma dismissed thoughts about her son being missing, her awareness of the news turned to a nightmare as she was also subjected to police harassment. Things worsened when she started looking for her son, because she was threatened with death when her house was burnt and her health deteriorated. Despite all this, she filed a case of a missing person, a mystery which became known only after twelve years.

From the revelations of a security policeman who testifies in the TRC hearings, Emma's family understands painfully the cruel manner in which their son, brother and father died. Although

this news seems to bring a sense a relief an incomplete experience of mourning leaves the family in limbo about the rituals that befit the family and their dead son. To them, burying his remains would be more meaningful than the tales of his body burnt away.

Edna, on the other hand, acknowledges the pain of not having a father around and seems to experience terrifying nightmares about her family being killed. This has affected her school performance as she feels distracted at times by the Amnesty testimony of those who killed her father.

All Emma's family is experiencing difficulties such as other children without jobs, without a father which culminates in a helpless situation, the family continues to search for authentic living from spiritual meaning.

There are conflicting ideas about forgiving and peace in Emma's family. Emma, as an adult, has an understanding from her life experiences to be at peace with killers of her son while her granddaughter finds it difficult to do this since she feels deprived of her father through this senseless killing.

The family believes that healing from them can be true 'living of life' which is normal especially if their basic needs are met, hopefully, through a fund that is set up by the government of today for all those families with similar experiences. Emma also questions what help can be provided by the researchers who come and go only to seek information. From Edna's point of view, since her father is dead, her dreams to be educated are thwarted thus inducing a powerless situation for her. She can only hope that a bursary will come from the government resources.

PROTOCOL 6 - LINKSY'S FAMILY
LINKSY - TORTURED IN DETENTION (VERBATIM DESCRIPTION)
LORNA - LINKSY'S MOTHER

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me about your experience of being tortured in detention. Tell me what happened before and how this affected you during and after the incident.

LINKSY: I was still younger than I am now, very involved in mobilising the youth. I was a leader of a certain youth group called "Amabatho" and we formed street committees. These were community committees that dealt with people that didn't tow the line especially if there were guidelines on how the community had to act in certain instances.

RESEARCHER: What do you mean by towing the line?

LINKSY: For instance if we organized school and consumer boycotts, we expected all people to follow these instructions and those who deviated would be disciplined like throwing away the things they bought from the shops during the boycott. We even caned the pupils who went to school while there was a boycott. I was one of the organizers so the police arrested me in their raids with other comrades. We were detained but when we are in jail you are separated from others so I had a single cell.

RESEARCHER: And then?

LINKSY: Things got pretty bad. When I was interrogated, I was sjambokked with a black plastic tube in my body and legs several times. At times they would burn me with cigarettes in the soles of my feet, and I would scream on top of my voice. The police accused me of inciting others and causing anarchy in the community, and wanted me to tell them who was masterminding this as I was young. The moment I did not come up with any names, they kicked me, banged my head against the wall and threatened to shoot me. They continued to do so whenever they like and I was so stubborn prepared to die than yielding to their demands. Some

days, I would go without food as the food is terrible. I also kept worrying about my mother as I knew that she would be worried sick about my detention. At times police would tell me that they have seen my mother at home and told her that she will never see me again. This was frightening. I was not allowed visitation rights by my family and friends as I was in solitary confinement and went without a drop of water to bath myself for a month. I remained filthy and as a woman you feel that odour. One time the police told me that my mother had died, and I cried for a whole week and yet there was nothing like that. I was so vulnerable and this led me believing what they said, "Hayi angcolile kodwa amabhula, soze ndiwalibole" (Translated: "The boers are evil and I will never forget them").

I came out of prison after six months because the lawyers asked a bail on my behalf. I was thin as ever, to my surprise, other comrades arrested with me, were reported to have died in prison. Although I was thankful for escaping death, I grieved for my friends in the struggle.

I tell you, though, we won our case as comrades, one suffers deep scars from these experiences. My life was affected in some way because I wanted to forget all this but it still haunts me. Even in work-shops organised by our NGO's once topics like these are brought to the fore, I become stuck and tremble and wish that we should not talk about these.

Even with the TRC hearings, I didn't testify about this torture I submitted a statement. I felt that I didn't have strength to do it maybe you can best tell me if I need any psychological help.

RESEARCHER: I think you do - but I can supply you with a list of references.

LINKSY: Now, South Africa has changed, and maybe our struggle was not in vain. My mother in her prayers everyday does not forget to be thankful for my safety as she thought I would die in prison. I admire the people who testify in the TRC as their stories are being listened to by the whole

world, as this may ease the burden we have been carrying all these years.

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me about your experience of being detained and tortured in prison. Tell me what happened before and how this affected you during and after the incident.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

ESSENTIAL THEMES

1 I was still younger than I am now, very involved in mobilising the youth. I was a leader of a certain youth called "Amabutho" and we formed street committees. These were community committees that dealt with people who did not tow the line especially if there were guidelines on how the community had to act in certain instances.

Linksy explains her role in mobilizing a youth group called "Amabutho" which disciplined community people who transgressed.

RESEARCHER: What do you mean by towing the line?

2 For instance if we organised school and consumer boycotts, we expect-ed all people to follow these in-structions and those who deviated would be disciplined like throwing away all the things they bought from the shops during the boycott. We even caned the pupils who went to school while there was a boycott. I was one of the organizers so the police arrested me in their raids with other comrades. We were detained but when we were in jail you are separated from others so I had a single cell.

Linksy explains the disciplinary measures applied to those who didn't tow the line while relating circumstances surrounding her detention.

RESEARCHER: And then?

3 Things got pretty bad. When I was interrogated, I was sjambokked with a black plastic tube in my body and legs several times. At times these would burn me with cigarettes in the soles of my feet, and I would scream on top of my voice. The police accused me of inciting others and causing anarchy in the community and wanted me to tell them who was masterminding this as I was young. The moment I did not come up with any names, they kicked me, banged my head against the wall and threatened to shoot me. They continued to do so whenever they liked and I was so stubborn prepared to die than yielding to their demands.

Linksy details the experiences of torture in detention where she was implicated by police as causing trouble in the community, but she did not yield to the demands of the police as she was prepared to die.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 4 Somedays, I would go without food as the food is terrible. I also kept worrying about my mother as I knew that she would be worried sick about my detention. At times police would tell me that they have seen my mother and told her that she will never see me again. This was frightening. I was not allowed visitation rights by my family and friends as I was in solitary confinement and went without a drop of water to bath myself for a month. I remained filthy and as a woman you feel that odour. One time the police told me that my mother had died, and I cried for a whole week and yet there was nothing like that. I was so vulnerable and this led me believing what they said. "Hayi angcolile kodwa amabhulu soze ndinolibole" (translated: The boers are cunning, and I'll never forget them).
- 5 I came out of prison after six months because the lawyers asked a bail on my behalf. I was thin as ever, to my surprise, other comrades arrested with me were reported to have died in prison. Although I was thankful for escaping death I grieved for my friends in the struggle.
- 6 I tell you, though we won our case as comrades, one suffers deep scars from these experiences. My life was affected in some way because I wanted to forget all this but it still haunts me. Even in workshops organized by our NGO's once topics like these are brought to the fore, I become stuck and tremble and wish that we should not talk about these.
- 7 Even with the TRC hearings, I didn't testify about this torture but submitted a statement. I felt that I didn't have strength to do it, may be you can best tell me if I need any psychological help.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Linksy explains the intensely horrifying tactics used to torture her while in prison. These resulted in her vulnerability which led her to believe the lies that the police told her, as she was terrified that she would never see her mother again. All these led to her perception that the police are evil.

When Linksy was released from prison, she discovered that some of her friends had died in prison and was saddened by these news.

Linksy emphasizes the effects of torture that have left her scarred. She also wishes to forget it as she experiences debilitating effects whenever they talk about them.

Linksy explains her experience of helplessness that made her submit a statement to the TRC rather than testifying. She wonders if this behaviour warrants therapeutic intervention.

RESEARCHER: I think you do but I can supply you with a list of reference.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 8 Now South Africa has changed, and may be our struggle was not in vain. My mother in her prayers everyday does not forget to be thankful for my safety as she thought I would die in prison. I am proud the people who testify in the TRC as their stories are being listened to by the whole world as this may ease the burdens we have been carrying all these years.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Linksy perceives her struggle as a vehicle towards positive outlook while her mother is thankful of her safety and takes pride in those who have shown courage in sharing their pain with the world.

LORNA - LINKSY'S MOTHER

VERBATIM DESCRIPTION

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me about your experience of having your daughter being detained and tortured in prison. Tell me what happened before and how this affected you during and after the incident.

LORNA: "Mntanam" (my child) it's something that I don't want to talk about if possible. It reminds me of the terrible time we had as the family. I thought that God had cursed me and I pray that we never go back to those terrible times. I did not understand the younger peoples' actions well, but I was aware of Linksy's absence from home most of the time. She told me she was attending meetings every time. She did not tell me of her involvement in these groupings they had. But her brother told me that Linksy was involved in politics and I warned her that I didn't know anything about politics, so she better stop this nonsense.

One night I was awoken by heavy bangs on my door during the night, while preparing to open, the door was kicked open. Oh! it's the police, were already inside, pushing me aside, entering in room by room searching for Linksy. When I asked what they were doing and the warrant to search, they threatened to arrest me. I was scared to death, a lot of noise as my other children were crying, and the neighbours came to check what was happening. Outside my house it was just vans, surrounding the house, looking for one person. This was strange to me. They didn't find Linksy and I think she has a premonition because she

did not sleep at home that day. They left with a message, "Siyabuya", yaye sizakubamba next time", (We'll be back and we will² take you in next time").

Linksy was arrested two days later in another raid in one of her friends house. She stayed in prison for six months without bail. I didn't rest, it was living hell. The police would come and ransack my house searching for the guns they said were hidden by "Amabutho" group. At times they would tell me that I would never see my daughter again as she was the one responsible for chaos and politicizing other people in the community. I couldn't fight the law, I became helpless and prayed for a miracle to happen.

To tell you the honest truth, I never expected her to return alive. I feared more when some of her friends were reported dead in prison without valid explanations from the police. It was like living in a nightmare, I was even refused permission to see her, as I was told that she is in solitary confinement, so, no visitors allowed.

RESEARCHER: What happened then?

LORNA: When she was bailed out she was thin as ever. I cried for my child, sympathetic to her state but happy to see her alive. I think, though this had an effect on her. She would not want to talk about her detention at all and I understood that she had pain. Even when she was approached to testify in the TRC hearings, she only wrote down her statement and submitted it. I can see she wants to forget all but how do you just wash away a misdeed like this?

I know I want to continue my life by my mind revisits in thoughts about what occurred to us. I'm happy that she is out of prison as I thought that I would die before she is released. I have also taken strength from other horror stories which are worse than Linksy's as those parents are also

surviving.

RESEARCHER: I want you to tell me about your experience of having your daughter being detained and tortured in prison. Tell me what happened before, and how this affected you during and after the incident.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

ESSENTIAL THEMES

- | | | |
|---|---|---|
| 1 | Lorna: "Mntanam" (my child) it's something I don't want to talk about if possible. It reminds me of the terrible time we had as the family. I thought that God had cursed me and I pray that we never go back to those terrible times. | Lorna voices her reluctance to relive the terrible experiences of her family. |
| 2 | I did not understand the younger people's actions well, but I was a-ware of Linksy's absence from home most of the time. She told me she was attending meetings every time. She did not tell me of her involvement in these groupings they had. But her brother told me that Linksy was involved in politics and I warned her that I didn't know anything about politics, so she better stop this nonsense. | Lorna seems to have lacked awareness of her daughter's involvement in politics but tried to stop her when she discovered this. |
| 3 | One night I was awoken by bangs in my door during the night, while preparing to open, the door was kicked open. Oh! it's the police, were already inside, pushing me aside, entering in room by room searching for Linksy. When I asked what they were doing and the warrant to search they threatened to arrest me. I was scared to death, a lot of noise as my other children were crying and the neighbours came to check what was happen-ing. Outside my house, it was just vans, surrounding the house, looking for one person. This was strange to me. They didn't find M and I think she had a premonition because she did not sleep at home that day. They left with a message "siyabuya, yaye sizalubamba next time" (we will be back and we will take you in next time) | Lorna relates the threatening and terrifying experiences of harassment by police who came to search for her daughter who was away from home during this raid. |

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

ESSENTIAL THEMES

- 4 Linksy was arrested two days later in another raid in one of her friend's house. She stayed in prison for six months before her bail. I didn't rest, it was living hell. The police would come and ransack my house searching for guns they said were hidden by the "amabutho" group. At times they would tell me I would never see my daughter again as she was the one responsible for chaos and politicizing other people in the community. I couldn't fight the law, I became helpless and prayed for a miracle to happen..
- 5 To tell you the honest truth, I never expected her to return alive. I feared more when some of her friends were reported dead in prison without valid explanations from the police. It was like living in a nightmare, I was even refused permission to see her, as I was told that she is in solitary confinement, so no visitors allowed.

According to Lorna, when Linksy was arrested the police intensified harassment of her family causing helplessness.

Lorna never anticipated that Linksy would be back from prison as some of her friends died in detention.

RESEARCHER: What happened then?

- 6 When she was bailed out, she was thin as ever. I cried for my child, sympathetic to her state but happy to see her alive. I think though, this had an effect on her. She would not want to talk about her detention at all.
- 7 I understood that she had pain. Even when she was approached to testify in the TRC hearings, she only wrote down her statement and submitted it. I can see she wants to forget all but how do you just wash away a misdeed like this?
- 8 I know I want to continue my life but my mind revisits in thoughts about what occurred to us. I am happy that she is out of prison as I thought that I would die before she is re-leased. I have also taken strength from the horror stories which are worse than M's as those parents are also surviving.

Lorna was disturbed by Linksy's physical state when she was released from prison though she was happy to see her alive.

Lorna understood Linksy's need to repress all that had happened to her.

Although Lorna seems to want to live in the future she is reminded of the past experiences and takes strength from stories shared by other parents.

SITUATED STRUCTURE
LINKSY'S FAMILY

Although Linksy was an active participant in the struggle as a young teenager, it seems her mother was not aware of these activities. When she discovered her involvement, Lorna tried to prevent her daughter from continuing but in vain. This family realizes that it is in trouble when Linksy is detained. Her experiences of torture in detention resulted in her vulnerabilities as her emotions are aggravated also by police who lied that her mother is dead. She physically survives the vicious, humiliating tactics by police but sustains internal scars that are painful whenever mention of trauma is brought to the fore. Linksy's mother finds it difficult to cope with police harassment while Linksy is in detention, and her frightening experiences of her daughter's safety are worsened by death of other young people in detention. She lives in turmoil and anguish because she is helpless to fight the law. She continued praying for her daughter.

Although Linksy's mother is relieved when Linksy is released she is saddened by her physical appearance. She also learns of her need to repress the pain she endured in detention as Linksy won't share much of it. This is revealed when Linksy is invited to testify in the TRC about her experiences but opts to write a statement for submission instead of testifying. She seems to be wounded but to avoid hurt and disorganisation she represses all that happened.

Linksy's experiences and that of her family are relived when other similar stories of torture and detention are related, and this to Linksy and her family in some way has been a breakthrough towards healing.

PROTOCOL 7 - PANDORA'S FAMILY
PANDORA - WIFE DETAINED AND TORTURED IN PRISON
VERBATIM DESCRIPTION
PETE - PANDORA'S HUSBAND

RESEARCHER: I want you to tell me about your experiences of being detained and tortured in prison. Tell me what happened before, and how this affected you during and after the incident.

PANDORA: I became involved indirectly because of the children. You see my two sons were very active students during the uprising of 1976 riots at schools, as they were members of students' organization. an illiterate mother, I never paid attention to what they did, as I could not follow the events from the newspapers as I am not educated. Things became worse when in 1976 school children were massacred in front of school gates by police and as parents we felt this was enough. As women and parents we took to the streets, protesting against the security police for killing children. My sons got lost during that same year and I was not sure whether they had ran away or were killed. We neve saw them again.

I became more angry, thinking that if the police didn't do what they did, my sons would be here. I joined the political group of women which supported me to press the police to look for my sons. My husband, as you see him, even today was already a TB sufferer, sickly, so he couldn't really go up and about looking for our sons.

I was detained under the state of emergency during the 1980's, as I was an active member of the women's group, and I stayed in prison for two years. It was very hard, but inside me I was determined as I felt guilty for letting my children to take up the struggle while I did nothing. I was terrorized and tortured in prison by the same police who are asking for amnesty today. The ridiculed me about my illiteracy, they used all sorts of fear tactics, like I will never see my husband again. Everyday I was interrogated and asked about the whereabouts of my two sons. I

became cheeky, and told the police that they knew better, and this angered them as they beat me up. They sjambokked me, sometimes stripped me naked in the presence of police males, suffocated me as well. I would scream on top of my voice too, as you know, we women can scream.

After the interrogation they took me to my cell where I would be left without water for days. It was a very difficult situation, but I became determined the more I thought about my missing sons.

I was released after two years imprisonment, and soon after this release I was hospitalized for eight months. The doctors said my nerves were affected as the whole body was aching. This became more hard for me as my husband whose health was worse could not be looked after by me. Instead he had to care for our children who also had disciplinary problems as they got involved in petty crimes like stealing from the shops in our communities. This was too much to take as I thought to myself if the police did not kill our children in 1976 I would not be in this situation.

After my release I thought I would be free from police harassment but this was the opposite. They came often, looking for my sons, with information that they know they're back in the country and are trained terrorists. This hurt a lot because both my husband and myself were longing for our children and we were clueless about this whereabouts.

RESEARCHER: And then?

PANDORA: We kept approaching the Commissioner of Police to look for them as we had reported this matter to them. It was only after thirteen years that we received a letter stating that one son was killed in a raid by South African Security Police in Maseru, while the other one died in the military camps in Angola. I was devastated. Their father's health deteriorated. I never thought he would even survive to see the freedom of elections in 1994. I cried until the tears were dry in my face, I felt emptiness in my heart.

How come? I asked myself several times but there were no answers. I demanded the political organisation they were fighting for, to bring their bodies home even if they were bones. I did not mind. What was important was to bury my children and be able to point to their graves. This did not happen until after 1992, and we were able to bury those bones side by side. By this time I was strong, strong for my husband who felt weak in health, also helpless and blaming himself for not fighting the regime.

At least I am relieved that I buried those remains and that makes one feel better than those parents who don't even know where the graves of their children are. No money can compensate for the losses we have experienced but I think it was appropriate for us to tell these stories through the commission. At least we can let go now and forgive those who are asking for amnesty for the tortures and killings but we cannot forget what happened.

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me about the experience of being detained and tortured in prison. Tell me what happened before and how this affected you during and after the incident.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

1 I became involved indirectly because of the children. You see, my two sons were very active students during the uprising of 1976 riots at schools, as they were members of students' organizations. As an illiterate mother, I never paid attention to what they did, as I could not follow the events from the newspapers as I am not educated. Things became worse when in 1976 school children were massacred in front of school gates by police and as parents we felt this was enough. As women and parents we took to the streets protesting against the security police for killing children. My sons got lost during the same year and I was not sure whether they had ran away or killed. We never saw them again.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

According to Pandora she became involved in political activities during 1976 when she witnessed school children being shot by police.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

2 I became more angry, thinking that if the police didn't do what they did, my sons would be here. I joined the political group of women which supported me to press the police to look for my sons. My husband, as you see him, even today, was already a TB sufferer, sickly, so he couldn't really go up and about looking for our sons.

3 I was detained under the state of emergency during the 1980's as I was an active member of a political womens' group, and I stayed in prison for two years.

4 It was very hard, but inside me I was determined as I felt guilty for letting my children to take up the struggle while I did nothing. I was terrorized and tortured in prison by the same police who are asking for amnesty today. They ridiculed me about my illiteracy, they used all sorts of fear tactics, like I will never see my husband again. Everyday I was interrogated and was asked about the whereabouts of my two sons. I became cheeky and told the police that they knew better and this angered them as they beat me up. They sjambokked me, some-times stripped me naked in the pre-sence of police males, suffocated me as well. I would scream on top of my voice too, as you know, we women can scream. After the interrogation they took me to my cell where I would be left without water for days. It was a very difficult situation, but I became determined the more I thought about my missing sons.

5 I was released after two years of imprisonment and soon after this release I was hospitalized for eight months. The doctors said my nerves were affected as the whole body was aching. This became more hard for me as my husband whose health was worse could not be looked after by me. Instead he had to care for our children who also had disciplinary problems as they got involved in petty crimes like stealing from the shops in our community. This was too much to take as I thought to myself if the police did not kill our children in 1976 I would not be in this situation.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Pandora explains the rationale behind her joining womens' political organisation as she wanted support to look for her missing sons.

Pandora was detained in the 1980's for a period of two years.

Though determined with her struggle, Pandora experienced difficult conditions of prison as the police used all forms of torture to break her.

When Pandora was released from prison she became so sick that she was hospitalised while her ailing husband looked after their children. She also blames police for her painful experiences of having her other children involved in criminal activities.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 6 After my release I thought I would be free from police harassment but this was the opposite. They came often, looking for my sons, with information that they knew they're back in the country and are trained terrorists. This hurt a lot because both my husband were longing for our children and we were clueless about their whereabouts.

RESEARCHER: And then?

- 7 We kept approaching the Commissioner of Police to look for them as we had reported this matter to them. It was only after thirteen years that we received a letter stating that one son was killed in a raid by South African security police in Maseru, while the other one died in the military camps in Angola.
- 8 I was devastated. Their father's health deteriorated. I never thought he would even survive to see the freedom of elections in 1994. I cried until the tears were dry in my face, I felt emptiness in my heart. How come? I asked myself several times but there were no answers.
- 9 I demanded the political organisation they were fighting for to bring their bodies home, even if they were bones I didn't mind. What was important was to bury my children and be able to point to their graves. This did not happen until after 1992, and we were able to bury those bones side by side. By this time I was strong, strong for my husband who felt weak in health, also helpless and blaming himself for not fighting the regime.
- 10 At least I am relieved that I buried these remains and that makes me feel better than those parents who don't even know where the graves of their children are.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Although Pandora was released from prison, police harassment still continued and this was experienced as painful by her family.

Pandora's enquiries from the Commissioner of Police about her missing sons proved fruitless. She learnt of their separate deaths after thirteen years.

Pandora talks about their devastation of her sons' death and their father's health deteriorated. She experienced emptiness.

Pandora asked the liberal movements to bring the remains of her sons to South Africa to be buried, and this request was successful.

Although Pandora was strong at this time her husband experienced a state of helplessness, blamed himself for not fighting against the regime.

Pandora felt relieved when she buried her sons herself as other parents have not achieved this.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 11 No money can compensate for the losses we have experienced but I think it was appropriate for us to tell these stories through the Commission. At least we can let go now and forgive those who are asking for Amnesty for the tortures and killings but we cannot forget what happened.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Pandora explains that money cannot compensate for what they went through, but telling the stories was appropriate. Seemingly they are ready to let go and forgive but would not forget these experiences.

**PETE - PANDORA'S HUSBAND
VERBATIM DESCRIPTION**

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me about the experience of having your wife detained and tortured in prison. Tell me what happened before and how this affected you during and after the incident.

PETE: It is a difficult story and a painful one for me. My life was turned upside down within no time. My wife was outraged by the acts of the police in 1976 when they shot school children. It was an uprising as school children protested against Bantu Education. Our sons were amongst this lot, and we were certain they were going to be shot at as well. All the women in our communities joined forces and protested against this shooting, marched to the police station to hand over a memorandum to the head of security police to stop these killings. It is when my wife became active and joined the women's political group of that time. She ended up being detained with others during the unrest and was jailed for two solid years.

RESEARCHER: What happened to you?

PETE: I stayed at home by myself looking after the other children. I was sick on treatment. I asked one of our relatives to come and stay with us to play a role of being a mother to our children. By this time the realization that our two sons were missing became true. It was worrying, I feared for my wife's safety in jail, I knew she would not escape torture while detained.

It was also difficult to supervise or even discipline the younger ones at home. They took advantage of the situation, got involved in stealing from the shops. You know, all children require a mother's firm hand. I became helpless day by day not knowing what to do. Those days you even saw few friends visiting as people became afraid to be associated with us.

When my wife was released from jail, my health was deteriorating. While thinking that she was to nurse me, she was admitted to hospital. I think the cold cement conditions in jail affected her health. The police still continued to visit my home, looking for our missing sons, they just broke the doors, ransacked the house. Maybe they saw that I was already in my death bed so it would not help them to beat me up.

We only heard about the outcome of my sons towards the year that liberation movements were banned, that they both died long time ago. I was saddened by this, as you know, in our culture boys are to take care of the home if the father dies. Now, who would look after my kraal?

I also blamed myself for not taking part in this struggle as I had sacrificed my children now. I was happy when their remains were brought home to be buried by us. I felt bitter that day, hatred towards the whole apartheid regime that had placed all my family under this condition.

Even if I die now, I am relieved that their graves are here. My wife has never looked back, this incident made her to be much stronger and she tells me everyday that it is a conviction she will never forfeit.

I don't have much hope on the promises for compensation on victims. There are many of them. Where would this money come from? My only consolation is to rest in peace while my wife is nearer to me.

(Pete died beginning of 1998).

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me about the experience of having your wife detained and tortured in prison. Tell me what happened, and how this affected you during and after the incident.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

ESSENTIAL THEMES

1 It is a difficult story and a painful one for me. My life was turned upside down within no time. My wife was outraged by the acts of the police 1976 when they shot school children. It was an uprising as school children protested against the Bantu Education. Our sons were amongst this lot, and we were certain that they were going to be shot at as well. All the women in our communities joined forces and protested against this shooting, marched to the police station to hand over memorandum to the head of security police to stop these killings. It is when my wife began active and joined the women's political group of that time. She ended up being detained with others during the unrest in the 1980's and was jailed for two solid years.

Pete explains his painful story that brought drastic changes to his life.

He talks in detail about the circumstances surrounding his wife's political activities which resulted in her detention of two years.

RESEARCHER: What happened to you?

2 I stayed at home by myself, looking after other children. I was sick on treatment. I asked one of our relatives to come and stay with us to play a role of being a mother to our children.

Pete explains how he arranged the role of a surrogate mother-relative to look after the children while his wife was detained.

3 By this time, the realization that our two sons were missing became true. It was worrying, I feared for my wife's safety in jail. I knew she would not escape torture while detained.

Pete lived in anguish about his missing sons and his wife's safety in detention.

4 It was also difficult to supervise or even discipline the younger ones at home. They took advantage of the situation, got involved in stealing from the shops. You know, all children require a mother's firm hand.

Pete explains the hardship of how his other children experienced disciplinary problems while his wife was detained.

5 I became helpless day by day not knowing what to do. Those days you even saw few friends, visiting as people became afraid to be associated with us.

Pete felt helpless and experienced alienation from friends who became scared to be associated with Pandora's family.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

ESSENTIAL THEMES

- | | | |
|----|---|--|
| 6 | When my wife was released from jail, my health was deteriorating. While thinking that she was to nurse me, she was admitted to hospital. I think the cold cement conditions in jail affected her health. | According to Pete his health was deteriorating when his wife was released from jail. His wife was also hospitalized after this release. |
| 7 | The police still continued to visit my house, looking for our missing sons, they just broke the doors, ransacked the house. May be they saw that I was already in my death bed so it would not help them to beat me up. | Pete explains how the police continued to harass the family even after his wife's release from jail. |
| 8 | We only heard about the outcome of my sons towards the year that liberation movements were banned, that they both died long time ago. I was saddened by this, as you know, in our culture boys are to take care of the home if the father dies. Now, who would look after my kraal? | Pete expresses how he was saddened by the news of the death of his two missing sons. He was concerned about the caretaker of his kraal when he was no longer alive. |
| 9 | I also blamed myself for not taking part in this struggle as I had sacrificed my children now. I was happy when their remains were brought home to be buried by us. I felt bitter that day, hatred towards the whole apartheid regime that had placed all my family under this condition. | Pete blamed himself for his failure to participate in the struggle but happy when his sons' remains were brought home. Pete also felt bitter and hated the apartheid regime. |
| 10 | Even if I die now, I am relieved that the graves are here. My wife has never looked back, this incident made her to be much stronger and she tell me everyday that it is a conviction she will never forfeit. | According to Pete he is relieved that his sons' graves are at home. He testifies to his wife's strength in the struggle since this incident. |
| 11 | I don't have much hope on the promises for compensation on victims. There are many of them. Where would this money come from? My only consolation is to rest in peace while my wife is nearer to me. | Pete is not hopeful about reparation but is consoled by the fact that he will die peacefully. |

SITUATED STRUCTURE

PANDORA'S FAMILY

Both Pandora and Pete seem to have survived traumatic experiences differently during Pandora's struggle. When Pandora joined the political struggle, it was apparent that her husband's health was already failing. In spite of it, she was determined to continue struggling with other women, as her sons had already disappeared.

Her detention in prison for two years resulted in accumulated family's problems as her husband had to cope with raising other children with the help of a surrogate next of kin. The effects of an absent mother however became significant, when disciplinary problems manifested themselves in the unruly behaviour of the children who would steal and engage in petty crimes. In the meantime police continued to visit Pandora's husband to ask about the missing sons.

Pandora's horrific experiences of torture in detention fail to undermine her political will to continue her fight against the system. On her release from prison, health side effects warrant her being hospitalized. She becomes bitter about the situation as she attributes all that happened to her family, to the police who killed her children. While in hospital, Pandora worries more about her husband's ailing health.

This family's world became shattered on learning of the outcome of their sons' disappearance after thirteen years. As a mother, Pandora weeps until no more tears appear in her eyes while feeling empty. The lack of her husband's coping mechanisms with this news shows through his physical weakness. Both parents blame themselves for this loss and voice their anger and bitterness against the apartheid laws. Pete feels that he should have been more active in the struggle rather than letting his children take the risks.

They are consoled by their successive attempts to bring the remains of their sons from exile to bury them at home. This brings relief since other parents do not know where the remains of their children are.

This family is not hopeful about reparation effects because they understand that this mechanisms would never compensate for what they have gone through. Though they will not forget, they are open to forgiving others, especially those who violated the rights of their family and Pandora is relieved that her painful story was heard by an audience during the TRC sessions.

PROTOCOL 8 - GORDON'S FAMILY
GORDON - TORTURED IN PRISON (SENTENCED AT 22 YEARS)
RIETTA - GORDON'S WIFE
VERBATIM DESCRIPTION: GORDON

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me about your experience of being detained and tortured in prison. Tell me what happened before, how this affected you during and after the incident.

GORDON: I was a member of the liberation movement. As the movement we were fighting for equal rights and opposing vehemently the apartheid structures during those years. I was arrested for treason with others. This case took a long time and eventually I was sentenced to an effective twenty two years, which we reduced to fourteen years. So I stayed in jail a first time from 1963-1977. Even when I came back I was under house arrest because the 1976 uprising by the young people had already begun.

I worked underground now, but when my house arrest banning order was lifted in 1980 I worked freely as a member of the civic organisation in my community. My activities then, sent me back to jail in 1986 under the state of emergency act.

Here the torture became worse than digging the stone quarry in Robben Island which I had experienced before. Sjamboks, electric shocks all over the body, a mark over my head as the police did something called "helicopter training". It was a terrible, awful experience. I remember one policeman saying to us, "you'll get freedom over our dead bodies". While I was detained my house was burnt, and I suspect the police with the one, and my son was murdered in an acid attack by other unknown forces in our communities. I can go on, and on. My family was put through hell as a result my wife even today is being treated for nervous breakdown.

I came back from detention after two years having suffered stroke while in detention. As you see I'm on wheel chair. Now, I am like a child, being helped to dress and feed by my wife. It is so painful and discouraging especially if you know how you used to be before.

RESEARCHER: And now?

GORDON: I am helpless. I cannot look after my family as a husband and father. We are struggling to have food on the table, and the grant applications are taking a long time to be processed. I have even applied from the emergency relief fund that we were promised to receive as victims who testified in the TRC hearings but till today nothing has happened. What does one do in these conditions? You just wish sometimes you were dead.

Although I feel worthless now, I do not regret what I stood for, the struggle of equality for all in this country. Even during the TRC, I told the Commissioners to judge for themselves my state at present and think for a moment if the material (money) things could compensate for what I am going through. No, not all, but my dignity and integrity can be enhanced if those who tortured me can say to me, "we are sorry for what we did".

I think I would accept that apology, as the damage cannot be undone now. As I wake up everyday still breathing, I anticipate that the present government does deliver to the people, that's what we fought for. I keep hoping that in their delivery, they do not forget the casualties like me all over this country.

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me about your experience of being detained and tortured in prison. Tell me what happened before, how this affected you during and after the incident.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

ESSENTIAL THEMES

- | | | |
|---|---|--|
| 1 | I was the member of the liberation movement. As the movement we were fighting for equal rights and opposing vehemently the apartheid structures during those years. I was arrested for treason with others. This case took a long time and eventually I was sentenced to an effective twenty two years, which was reduced for fourteen years. I stayed in jail for the first time from 1963-1977. Even when I came back I was under house arrest because the 1976 uprising by the young people had already begun. | Gordon speaks about his political activities which resulted in his being charged for treason that saw him sentenced to fourteen years of jail term. On his release he was banned under house arrest. |
| 2 | I worked underground now, but when my house arrest banning order was lifted in 1980, I worked freely as a member of the civic or-ganisation in my community. My active role then sent me back to jail in 1986 under the state of the emer-gency act. | Gordon's activities seem to have continued underground while he was banned, until 1980 when he took an activists role that lead to his detention in 1986. |
| 3 | Here the torture became worse than digging the stone quarry in Robben Island which I had experienced before. Sjamboks, electric shocks all over the body, a mark over my head as the police did something they called "helicopter training". I remember one policeman saying to us, "you'll get freedom over our dead bodies". | Gordon experienced torture in prison worse than what he went through in Robben Island. |
| 4 | While I was detained my house was burnt down, and I suspect the police, with this one, and my son was murdered in an acid attack by other unknown forces in our community. I can go on, and on. My family was put through hell as a result my wife even today is being treated for nervous breakdown. | Gordon relates the painful experiences of his family, i.e. his house burnt, his son murdered while Gordon was in detention. These led to his wife's nervous breakdown. |
| 5 | I came back from detention after two years, having suffered a stroke while in detention, as you see, I am in a wheelchair. Now, I am like a child, being helped to dress and feed by my wife. It is so painful and discouraging especially if you know how you were before. | When Gordon was released from prison after two years he was suffering from a stroke and is discouraged by his present reduced capabilities. |

RESEARCHER: And now?

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

ESSENTIAL THEMES

6 I am helpless, I cannot look after my family as a husband and father. We are struggling to have food on the table, and the grant applications are taking a long time to be processed. I have even applied from the emergency relief fund that we were promised to receive as victims who testified in the TRC hearings but till to-day nothing has happened. What does one do in these conditions? You just wish sometimes you were dead.

Gordon explains about his disillusionment with exhaustive attempts to provide basic needs for his family. At times he has wishes to be dead.

7 Although I feel worthless now, I do not regret what I stood for, the struggle of equality for all in this country. Even during the TRC, I told the Commissioners to judge for themselves my state at present and think for a moment if the material (money) things could compensate for what I am going through. No!, not all, but my dignity and integrity can be enhanced if those who tortured me can say to me, "we are sorry for what we did".

While Gordon feels worthless, he is not regretful of his beliefs. He states that his integrity and dignity can be enhanced if victimizers could show remorse about their deeds.

8 I think I would accept that apology, as the damage cannot be undone now. As I wake up everyday still breathing, I anticipate that the pre-sent government does deliver to the people, that's what we fought for. I keep hoping that in their delivery they do not forget the casualties like me all over this country.

While Gordon demonstrates willingness to accept the apology from the victimizers, his wishes are for good governance that will not forget them as casualties of the struggle.

RIETTA - GORDON'S WIFE

VERBATIM DESCRIPTION

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me about the experience of having your husband detained and tortured in prison. Tell me what happened before, how this affected you during and after the incident.

RIETTA: Would it suffice if I say to you it was the most terrible time of my life and my children? Really! I don't want to disappoint you by crying, as I cry when I think about this.

RESEARCHER: Yes and no!, as I would like you to tell me more about it.

RIETTA: Oh! I understand. My husband was involved in political movements. So he would not tell me about his activities but I sensed his movements. When I think about it now, and when he was jailed, may be he thought that I would inform the police of his activities when they came to look for him. When he was first sentenced for fourteen years, I became more educated about politics as I was in court to listen to his charges.

His first sentence shattered me as my children were younger but when he was released I thought this was over but the worst was to come. He became involved in community politics like civics. It was chaotic in the communities those days, the police detained him, labelling him as causing trouble in the community. He stayed for two years but seeing him today as he is I think the police succeeded in disrupting his life.

While he was detained, my son also as a young person became an active participant amongst the youth politics. He was killed in an acid attack by other opposing political groups in the community. Our house was burnt down. I was overwhelmed with fear, anticipating to be eliminated as well. I became depressed and the doctors said I was suffering from a nervous breakdown.

I had to find work, as a domestic worker. It was so humiliating to live on handouts from charity organisations, I mean as person you have your own pride. I was helpless, really helpless! (crying).

When my husband was released after two years he came back paralysed one side. This was devastating. How am I going to nurse him while I have to work? I sought help from welfare offices, I tell you I have filled in hundreds of forms till to date, no response. It's so frustrating. Also after his testimony in the TRC, we were advised to apply for an emergency relief fund set up for victims. He have had no response. We survive because there are still good people who share our pain, as they open their hearts and give us what they can offer. But, I tell you, even

that aches me inside as I feel we should be supporting ourselves if the circumstances of this country were otherwise.

My children do struggle at school. Uniforms are never bought in time and even the school books. It is so hard but they understand their home circumstances now as they are growing older.

As you see now, my husband is inactive on a wheelchair. Even if he has to attend the clinic, I have to be around to push his wheelchair. I see that he is frustrated at times by all this but what can we do? "Kuthina masixolele ke, ukuze eli lizwe limanyane". Nathi siyazama, kodwa yona imeko yethu imbi". (It is said we must forgive so that there is reconciliation in this country, we are trying though our situation is bad).

I have a hope that as the time goes on, becoming used to our situation and living conditions, the pain will be eased day by day and within our hearts will find forgiveness.

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me about the experience of having your husband detained and tortured in prison. Tell me what happened before, how this affected you during and after the incident.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 1 Would it suffice if I say to you it was the most terrible time of my life and children? Really! I don't want to disappoint you by crying, as I cry when I think about this

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Rietta expresses her reluctance to relive her past experiences of her husband's torture in prison.

RESEARCHER: Yes and no, as I would like you to tell me more about it.

- 2 Oh! I understand. My husband was involved in political movements. So he would not tell me about his activities but I sensed his movements. When I think about it now, and when he was jailed, maybe he thought that I would inform the police of his activities when they came to look for him. When he was first sentenced for fourteen years, I became more educated about politics as I was in court to listen to his charges.

Although Rietta experienced exclusion as a confidante in her husbands' activities she seems to have been aware of them. She understands this stance as her husbands' protective role from the police who would harass her.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

ESSENTIAL THEMES

- 3 His first sentence shattered me as my children were younger but when he was released I thought this was over but the worst was to come. He became involved in community politics like civics. It was chaotic in the communities those days, the police detained him, labelling him as causing trouble in the community. He stayed for two years, but seeing him today as he is, I think the police succeeded in disrupting his life.
- 4 While he was detained, my son also as a young person became an active participant amongst the youth politics. He was killed in an acid attack by other opposing political groups in the community. Our house was burnt down. I was overwhelmed with fear, anticipating to be eliminated as well. I became depressed and the doctors said I was suffering from a nervous breakdown.
- 5 I had to find work, as a domestic worker. It was so humiliating to live on handouts from charity organisations, I mean, as person you have your own pride. I was helpless, really, helpless (crying).
- 6 When my husband was released after two years, he came back paralysed one side. How am I going to nurse him while I have to work? I sought help from welfare offices, I tell you I have filled in hundreds of forms till to date, no response. It's so frustrating.
- 7 We survive because there are still good people who share our pain, as they open their hearts and give us what they can offer. But, I tell you, even that aches me inside as I feel we would be supporting ourselves if the circumstances of this country were otherwise.
- 8 My children do struggle at school. Uniforms are never bought in time and even the school books. It is so hard but they understand their home circumstances now as they are growing older.

According to Rietta she was shattered by her husbands' first prison sentence. She also believes the second detention destroyed her husband's life.

Rietta explains her feelings of being overwhelmed with fear of death as both her house was burnt and her son murdered while her husband is detained.

Rietta relates the humiliating experiences of surviving by receiving handouts while working as a domestic, resulting in a state of helplessness (crying).

During her husband's release after two years, Rietta was faced with uncertainty about nursing him as a stroke sufferer or supporting the family.

Rietta testifies to their survival with help from people with good hearts while blaming the apartheid regime for their situation.

Rietta appreciates her childrens' understanding of their state though they struggle to meet school requirements.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 9 As you see now, my husband is inactive on a wheelchair. Even if he has to attend the clinic, I have to be around to push him around. I see that he is frustrated at times by all this, but what can we do? "Kuthiwa masixolele ke, ukuze elilizwe limanyane". Nathi siyazama, kodwa yona imeko yethu imbi". (It is said we must forgive so that there is reconciliation in this country, we are trying though our situation is bad).
- 10 I have a hope that as time goes on, becoming accustomed to our situation and living conditions, the pain will be eased day by day and within our heart will find forgiveness.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Rietta seems to be concerned about her husband's frustration about being in a wheelchair but hopeful about forgiveness in the near future.

Rietta hopes to derive faith of forgiveness from the daily desensitization experiences of their situation.

SITUATED STRUCTURE

GORDON'S FAMILY

It appears that both Gordon and Rietta are not articulate about the fourteen-year sentence passed on Gordon before his second detention during the 1980s. Though Gordon's wife was overwhelmed by this experience, its impact seems to have had moderate effects.

Gordon also seems to have experienced more severe torture in prison during the recent detention of 1980s than his earlier imprisonment in Robben Island. His family also survived hazardous experiences as both his house was destroyed by fire and his son murdered while he was in detention. All these culminated in Rietta's fear for her own life.

His humiliating experiences of how his family had to survive on handouts from charity, are noticeable when he relates the painful story during the interaction. It is apparent that the aftermath of these incidents left the family more helpless and worthless of living a meaningful life.

Gordon's release from detention, with complications of being a stroke sufferer in a wheelchair, while his wife was on continuous medication for nervous breakdown is a reality that this family is confronted with. All these seem to deplete of their coping mechanisms more than ever before.

This family is uncertain about the means to survive as applications for disability grants have proved frustrating. However, the community support and network for satisfaction of basic needs is appreciated by both Gordon and Rietta, though it destroys the sense of their human pride. Gordon feels worthless about his limited capabilities and his wife senses his frustrations.

The family believes that they are capable of reaching a level of readiness to forgive their tormentors in order to promote reconciliation. In addition, Gordon's hopes lie in the good governance which will remember all victims of the political struggle.

PROTOCOL 9 - RICKIE'S FAMILY
RICKIE - TORTURED IN DETENTION
ROSA - RICKIE'S ELDER SISTER
VERBATIM DESCRIPTION

RESEARCHER: *I want you to tell me about your experience of being detained and tortured in prison. Tell me what happened before and how this affected you during and after the incident.*

RICKIE: My detention took place during 1985-86 unrest which claimed innocent lives in our area. There was a feud between political groups or organisations and as young men in our community were active in guarding the house of our president of the organisation. It was a routine to do this as we feared that it would be attacked by a rival group. I was arrested and charged with intimidation. I was sentenced to eight years imprisonment. I became so confused and frightened as I thought to myself this was harsh.

The prison life started pretty bad. In fact during the first week, I thought I would die before the first month has ended. The inmates were rough, as soon as I was locked in the cells. I had to fight in order to survive amongst other prisoners while I faced beatings from the police. The police used all sorts of torture, to make us feel that we were not in our homes. Beatings, electric shocks, stripped naked to stand in a cold shower, what am I counting? It was terrible. Even now I'm being treated by a psychiatrist as this played on my emotions. I had palpitations on my chest all the time fearing to die in prison.

While I was there, my younger brother died through a necklace, killed by others in the community. I was devastated, he did not know anything about politics. I felt it was better for me to die in his place, I was angry towards what was happening during those times, I still don't understand why he was killed.

When I was released after five years for good behaviour in jail, I wanted to investigate his death but was scared at the same time as sporadic incidents of violence were still visible. I think that's what concerns me, what's contributing to my sickness is the thought that he died as an innocent victim.

Both my parents died while I was serving this sentence. I live with my elder sister now who works and taking care of my parents' home. I am working and independent enough to help myself, but the thoughts of how my parents could have been unhappy about my imprisonment and the death of their last born haunt me everyday.

I've testified in the TRC, and I've pleaded with this body to investigate the circumstances surrounding my brothers' death. I hope this comes true and I want those who committed this barbaric act to be brought to book. I'll be relieved if this can happen.

RESEARCHER

I want you to tell me about your experience of being detained and tortured in prison. Tell me what happened before and how this affected you during and after the incident.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 1 My detention took place during 1985-86 unrest which claimed innocent lives in our area. There was a feud between political groups or organisations and as young men in our community were active in guarding the house of our president of the organisation. It was a routine to do this, as we feared that it would be attacked by a rival group. I was arrested and charged with intimidation. I was sentenced to eight years imprisonment.
- 2 I became so confused and frightened as I thought to myself this was harsh.
- 3 The prison life started pretty bad, in fact during the first week I thought I would die before the first month has ended. The inmates were rough, as soon as I was locked in the cells, I had to fight in order to survive amongst other prisoners while I faced beatings from the police.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

- Rickie relates circumstances surrounding his detention and eight years imprisonment.
- Rickie seemingly experienced feelings of fear and confusion of his harsh sentence.
- Rickie's experience of prison life seems to be that of the survival of the fittest as he had to fight two antagonistic forces.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

ESSENTIAL THEMES

- | | | |
|----|---|--|
| 4 | The police used all sorts of torture, to make us feel that we were not in our homes. Beatings, electric shocks, stripped naked to stand in a cold shower, what am I counting? It was terrible. Even now I am being treated by a psychiatrist as this played on my emotions. I had palpitations on my chest all the time fearing to die in prison. | Rickie gives an account of all forms of torture he encountered in prison which resulted in this emotional instability. He says this has necessitated psychiatric intervention. |
| 5 | While I was there, my younger brother died through a necklace killed by others in the community. I was devastated, he did not know anything about politics. | Rickie becomes devastated when he learns of his younger brother's death through a necklace. |
| 6 | I felt it was better for me to die in his place, I was angry towards what was happening during those times, I still don't understand why he was killed. | Rickie expresses his feelings of anger and lack of understanding of his brother's senseless murder. |
| 7 | When I was released after five years for good behaviour in jail, I wanted to investigate his death but was scared at the same time as sporadic incidents of violence were still visible. | Rickie experiences ambivalent feelings about finding out the cause of death of his brother due to residual violent incidents. |
| 8 | I think that's what concerns me, what's contributing to my illness is the thought that he died as an innocent victim. | Rickie seems to understand his source of his psychiatric illness, and voices his loss of parents while in prison. |
| 9 | Both my parents died while I was serving this sentence. I live with my elder sister now who works and taking care of the parents' home. | Rickie whose parents died while he was in prison lives with his sister at their parents' home. |
| 10 | I am working and independent enough to help myself, but the thoughts of how my parents could have been unhappy about my imprisonment and the death of their last born haunt me everyday. | Rickie seems to be haunted by his parents' inauthentic situation of the loss of their son through death and his imprisonment. |
| 11 | I've testified in the TRC and I've pleaded with this body to investigate the circumstances surrounding my brother's death. I hope this comes true and I want those who committed this barbaric act to be brought to book. I will be relieved if this can happen. | Rickie seems to be hopeful of the TRC's investigation to shed light of his brother's death. |

ROSA - RICKIE'S SISTER
VERBATIM DESCRIPTION

RESEARCHER: I would like you to tell me of your experience of having your brother detained and tortured in prison. Tell me what happened before and how this affected you during and after the incident.

ROSA: I think their problems with other young activists began when there was an unrest in our communities. Not only the police were after them but feuds with other political organisations were rife. I remember that police would come looking for him while he was on guard duty, looking after some political figures' house. He was arrested for incitement and intimidation and was sentenced to eight years.

This became a tearful day for all of us at home. My parents were old, and I watched them suffering in silence. They would not normally talk about this or their pain, but when they prayed, their souls were indeed troubled. While Rickie was still in prison, we had another tragedy at home, as my other brother younger than Rickie, was necklaced by other comrades. We were called to that scene of horror, that remains indelible in my mind even today. To see you own flesh and blood in ashes! (shaking). I was so helpless, I cried wishing to die myself. Just think about it yourself! It was so devastating as he never knew anything about politics nor the feud between organisations.

We were overcome by grief and my parents find it difficult to forget this experience. We feared how we were to tell these news to Rickie in prison, and he went berserk. He had to be treated in hospital for some days. It was hard. He is still nervous today but on treatment from a psychiatrist.

This changed my parents' physical outlook completely. I watched them deteriorating, forgetful about everything, even forgetting our names as their children at times. They died one month apart from each other while Rickie was still doing his time in prison. I consoled myself by accepting

their death as being better than to live suffering.

RESEARCHER: And you?

ROSA: I have had my ebbs and flows. It has not been easy. I am mistrustful of other people, keep on playing safe, watchful as if I'm to be attacked. When Rickie was released from prison, he still cried a lot. One never think these things could happen to him/her when one hears about them at a distance but they do. Both myself and Rickie are there for each other, we think of ourselves as surviving orphans. Rickie is troubled though by the fact that he never got a chance to say 'good-bye' to his younger brother and our parents.

We just want to be left alone, and we resent people pitying us, rather they should genuinely share our pain.

RESEARCHER: I want you to tell me about your experience of having your brother detained and tortured in prison. Tell me what happened before and how this affected you during and after the incident.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

ESSENTIAL THEMES

- 1 I think their problems with other young activists began when there was an unrest in our communities. Not only the police were after them, but feuds with other political organisations were rife. I remember that police would come looking for him while he was on guard duty, looking after some political figures' house. He was arrested for incitement and intimidation, and was sentenced to eight years.
- 2 This became a tearful day for all of us at home. My parents were old, and I watched them suffering in silence. They would not normally talk about his or their pain, but when they prayed, their souls were indeed troubled.

- Rickie's sister explains the circumstances surrounding Rickie's arrest which resulted in his eight years imprisonment.
- According to Rosa, the whole family was troubled by Rickie's imprisonment.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

3 While Rickie still in prison, we had another tragedy at home, as my other brother younger than Rickie was necklaced by other comrades. We were called to that scene of horror, that remains indelible in my mind even today. To see you own flesh and blood in ashes! (shaking). I was so helpless, I cried, wishing to die myself. Just think about it yourself. It was so devastating as he never knew anything about politics nor the feud between organisations.

4 We were overcome by grief and my parents find it difficult to forget this. We feared, how we were to tell these news to Rickie in prison, and he went berserk. He had to be treated in hospital for some days. It was hard. He is still nervous today but on treatment from a psychiatrist.

5 This changed my parents' physical outlook completely. I watched them deteriorating, forgetful about everything, even forgetting our names as their children at times. They died one month apart from each other while Rickie was still doing his time in prison. I consoled myself by accepting their death as being better than to life suffering.

RESEARCHER: And then?

6 I have had my ebbs and flows. It has not been easy. I am mistrustful of other people, keep on playing safe, watchful as if I am to be attacked. When Rickie was re-leased from prison, he still cried a lot. One never think these things could happen to him/her when one hears about them at a distance but they do.

7 Both myself and Rickie are there for each other, we think of ourselves as surviving orphans. Rickie is troubled though by the fact that he never got a change to say 'good-bye' to his younger brother and our parents.

8 We just want to be left alone and we resent people pitying us, rather they should genuinely share our pain.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

While Rickie is in prison, his younger brother dies in a necklaced situation, and this tragedy leaves the family devastated.

Rosa states their difficulty in breaking the bad news to Rickie who later suffered from a nervous breakdown on hearing the bad news about the loss of his brother.

According to Rosa these events experienced by the family affected their parents who later died a month apart from each other.

Rosa believes that she has become paranoid since these events occurred in her family.

Both Rosa and Rickie are optimistic about surviving though Rickie is troubled by not having been able to bid farewell to his kin before they died.

According to Rosa, their wish is for those concerned to be empathic towards them rather than being sympathetic.

SITUATED STRUCTURE
RICKIE'S FAMILY

Rickie's family seems to have suffered feelings of overwhelmment by the tragic incidents that befell their family members. Although the family viewed Rickie's imprisonment of eight years as loss, the intensity of their grief was further aggravated when the younger child (Rickie's younger brother) died in a horrific manner called 'necklacing'.

It is apparent that this becomes a painful turning point for their older parents whose physical health is observed as deteriorating over time by Rosa until they died. Though released from prison Rickie is fearful of conducting investigations of his brother's death and thrusts this responsibility on the TRC.

While Rosa has to cope with indelible memories of her younger brother's death, Rickie blames his silence and his anxiety disorder on the experiences he was subjected to in prison. Both siblings have a positive attitude of their survival, enhanced by 'being there for each other'. According to them, they would rather benefit from empathic actions of those who want to share their pain than those who want to sympathize with them.

PROTOCOL 10 - ZELDA'S FAMILY
ZELDA - WIFE OF HUSBAND ABDUCTED AND DIED IN DETENTION
TERRENCE - ZELDA'S SON
VERBATIM DESCRIPTION

RESEARCHER: I want you to tell me about your experience of having your husband disappear and his subsequent death in prison. Tell me what happened, how it affected you and what you felt during and after the incident.

ZELDA: Well I can say that I noticed during those times my husband was involved in politics. He did not tell me of this involvement. Maybe he feared that I would tell the police when they came to look for him as I was not politically aware at the time. The police also came on and off into our house, to interrogate him about his political movements. At his place of employment, he was retrenched as his bosses complained of his activities which would lead workers to protest against management.

In May 1985, while working at the offices of the civic organization, one of his compatriots fetched my husband. He informed my husband that they had to fetch a guest who visited their offices that day. The guest was assumed to be from outside this country. He came home to tell me of their departure, but they were never seen till today.

RESEARCHER: And then, what happened?

ZELDA: I became unhappy and uncertain of what had happened. At first I thought that they were arrested. It was unsettling in our communities those days as people were also killed in political feuds. I became frightened also of those acts, thinking that they might have been assassinated.

Due to the unrest situation, the comrades from his organization decided to come to my house and guard it. They feared that we might be killed as the feud between political organizations was intense. This created more trouble for me as the comrades without my awareness brought

guns, petrol bombs and hand grenades to fight whatever came their way. I didn't sleep at home most of the times.

The police raided my house and the confrontation between them and the comrades ensued. The police found all these grenades, petrol bombs etc and also arrested me. They detained me for a week and while in detention, used all the types of swearing words, sjambokking me, threatening me of not getting out of prison alive. It was the most humiliating experience of my life. I was released on bail after a week and my case postponed for a month.

I decided to look for my husband with other family members of my husbands' compatriots joined in the search. We visited all police cells, prisons, mortuaries in the country but there was not sign nor trace of them. My fears of his possible death grew more. False information by certain witnesses who claimed to have seen them in one of the police stations made me helpless. I filed a case of a missing person via the police and the court case took two solid years. Eventually, the court found nobody responsible for his disappearance. This was very upsetting as I felt no confidence on the justice system. I mean they didn't try enough to follow the clues of his disappearance. In fact, they did nothing.

I was angry towards the political organization which he belonged to, angry towards the police and the whole system. Here I was, having to raise two sons, who didn't understand what had happened. It was difficult enough to explain all this, and their questions about their father caused me to cry every time these questions were asked.

My life turned into misery. Bear in mind, my husband disappeared while I was recovering from severe burns of my body from the face to the abdomen as the gas refrigerator had exploded while I was cleaning it. Physically, I was still weak, not working, nobody to support us. It was and still is humiliating even today to live only on handouts from the kind people or charity organizations. It destroys one's pride but what can I

do? I couldn't even find domestic employment. Only a person who had travelled the same path as I, would understand what type of life I am talking about.

My pain and sorrow became worse when my eldest son was stabbed to death in the township. He was about eighteen years old during the time of his death. I blamed this on my husband's absence as he would be there to be a role model to his son. I became so sick, helpless and bitter inside. Only God knows how I survived. I don't go to church but I prayed hard during this time.

It took ten years to know about the outcome of my husband's disappearance. Mr X from the police detailed in a conversation with journalists how they killed my husband together with his two compatriots. This was published in all the papers. It was shocking!, devastating to read those newspaper. I cried bitterly, the grief was too much to bear and I was admitted to hospital. My youngest son and the only one left with me as a family failed to understand all this. He has a vivid memory of his father. I thought, my God!, how am I to educate this child while I am struggling like this?

The TRC events followed this information and I had to testify about my husband's disappearance. It was a relief to share my story with others how I have survived till today. I was not impressed by the Amnesty applicants as I thought that they're lying about the manner in which they disposed my husband's ashes after killing him. Even today, I do believe that his body is buried somewhere.

Part of me is grateful to the TRC for letting me to testify and bringing the amnesty applicants to shed light on this mystery disappearance, but unhappy about the fact that nothing is done by this government to help me survive. I asked the TRC to investigate. It will help me to bury those bones as I feel an incomplete sense of mourning as I didn't bury him.

I have trusted my faith with God who has been with me all this time. He is the one who will guide me to bring up and educate my son. My life though will never be the same without my husband and my eldest son who died. If the TRC can help with some fund, I'll try and set up a small vegetable rack in front of my yard and sell them so that we have a plate of food on the table. That wish might be realized longer than I need but I have to be patient. Because I believe in peace, I have even forgiven those who killed my husband as I would not be able to go on if I hold a grudge against them.

RESEARCHER: I want you to tell me about your experience of having your husband disappear and his subsequent death in prison. Tell me what happened, how it affected you and what you felt during and after the incident.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

1 Well I can say that I noticed during those times my husband was involved in politics. He did not tell me of this involvement. Maybe he feared that I would tell the police when they came to look for him as I was not politically aware at the time. The police also came on and off into our house, to interrogate him about his political movements. At his place of employment, he was retrenched as his bosses complained of his activities which would lead workers to protest against management

2 In May 1985, while working at the offices of the civic organization, one of his compatriots fetched my husband. He informed my husband that they had to fetch a guest who visited their offices that day. The guest was assumed to be from outside this country. He came to tell me of their departure, but they were never seen till today.

RESEARCHER: And then, what happened?

3 I became unhappy and uncertain of what had happened. At first I thought that they were arrested. It was unsettling in our communities those days as people were also killed in political feuds. I became frightened also of those acts, thinking that they might have been assassinated.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Zelda explains how her husband was involved in political activities.

Zelda relates the events surrounding her husband's disappearance.

It seems Zelda became unhappy, uncertain and fearful about her husband's disappearance as she thought of the possibility of being assassinated.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 4 Due to the unrest situation the comrades from his organization decided to come to my house and guard it. They feared that we might be killed as the feud between political organization was intense. This created more trouble for me as the comrades without my awareness brought guns, petrol bombs and hand grenades to fight whoever came their way. I didn't sleep at home most of the times to escape with my children.

- 5 The police raided my house and the confrontation between them and the police ensued. The police found all these grenades, petrol bombs etc and also arrested me. They detained me for a week and while in detention used all the types of swearing words, sjambokking me, threatening me of not getting out of prison alive. It was the most humiliating experience of my life. I was released on bail after a week and my case was postponed for a week.

- 6 I decided to look for my husband and other family members of my husband's compatriots joined me in the search. We visited all police cells, prisons, mortuaries in the country but there was no trace of them. My fears of his possible death grew more. False information by certain witnesses who claimed to have seen them in one of the police stations made me helpless.

- 7 I filed a case of a missing person via the police and the court case took two solid years. Eventually the court found nobody responsible for his disappearance. This was very upsetting as I felt no confidence on the justice system. I mean they didn't try enough to follow the clues of his disappearance. In fact they did nothing.

- 8 I was angry towards the political organization which he belonged to, angry towards the police and the whole system. Here I was, having to raise two sons, who didn't understand what had happened. It was difficult enough to explain all this, and their questions about their father caused me to cry every time these questions were asked.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Zelda believes that more trouble for her family was created by the comrades who came to protect her house as they brought along weapons.

When police searched Zelda's house, the clash between the police and the comrades resulted in Zelda's arrest and detention. Zelda felt humiliated by these experiences.

Zelda's search of her husband proved futile and her fears about his death became intense. Her feelings of helplessness were induced more by false information.

Zelda seems to have been upset by the findings of the court about her husband's disappearance. As such, she expresses a motion of no confidence in the justice system.

It seems Zelda's anger was directed towards all, mostly provoked by the difficulties she faced in bringing up her two sons.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 9 My life turned into misery. Bear in mind, my husband disappeared while I was recovering from severe burns of my body from the face to the abdomen as the gas refrigerator had exploded while I was cleaning it. Physically, I was still weak, not working, nobody to support us. It was and still is, humiliating, even today to live only on handouts from the kind people or charity organizations. It destroys one's pride but what can I do? I couldn't even find domestic employment. Only a person who has travelled the same path as I, would understand what type of life I am talking about.
- 10 My pain and sorrow became worse when my eldest son was stabbed to death in the township. He was about eighteen years old during the time of his death. I blamed this on my husband's absence as he would be there to be a role model to his son. I became so sick, helpless and bitter inside. Only God knows how I survived. I didn't go to church but I prayed hard during this time.
- 11 It took ten years to know about the outcome of my husband's disappearance. Mr Skeels from the police detailed in a conversation with journalists how they killed my husband together with his two compatriots. This was published in all the papers. It was hocking!, devastating to read those newspapers. I cried bitterly, the grief was too much to bear and I was admitted to a hospital. My youngest son and the only one left with me as a family failed to understand all this. He has a vivid memory of his father. I thought, my God!, how am I to educate this child while I am struggling like this?
- 12 The TRC events followed this information and I had to testify about my husband's disappearance. It was a relief to share my soul with others how I have survived till today. I was not impressed by the amnesty applicants as I thought that they're lying about the manner in which they disposed my husband's ashes after killing him. Even today, I do believe that his body is buried somewhere.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Zelda explains her life experiences as that of misery which can only be understood by those with similar experiences.

It seems Zelda's state of sorrow was worsened by her eldest son's death as a result of the township acts of violence. She regretted her husband's disappearance and attributes her survival to her prayers to God.

Zelda seems to be overwhelmed by grief when the knowledge about her husband's disappearance is revealed. She is concerned about her poor living which might impact on her son's education.

Zelda appears to be relieved by her participation in sharing part of her soul with others during her TRC testimony. However, she disbelieves the amnesty applicants with regards to her husband's remains.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

ESSENTIAL THEMES

13 Part of me is grateful to the TRC for letting me to testify and binging the amnesty applicants to shed light on this mystery disappearance, but unhappy about the fact that nothing is done by this government to help me survive. I asked the TRC to investigate my husband's remains. It will help me to bury those bones as I feel an incomplete sense of mourning as I didn't bury him.

Zelda appreciates the work of the TRC as the evidence regarding her husband's disappearance surfaced but she is sceptical about the government's help towards families.

14 I have trusted all my faith with God who has been with me all this time. He is the one who will guide me to bring up and educate my son.

Zelda finds a spiritual meaning and explanation to her will to educate her son.

My life though will never be the same again without my husband and my eldest son who died. If the TRC can help with some fund, I'll try and set up a small vegetables' rack in front of my yard and sell them so that we have a plate of food on the table. That wish might be realized longer that I need but I have to be patient. Because I believe in peace, I have forgiven those who killed my husband as I would not be able to go on if I hold a grudge against them.

Zelda acknowledges a different life style without her members of the family who died but positive about going on with her life.

VERBATIM DESCRIPTION

TERRENCE - ZELDA'S SON (16 YEARS)

RESEARCHER: I want you to tell me about your experience of having your father disappear and his subsequent death in prison. Tell me what happened, how if affected you and what you felt during and after the incident.

TERRENCE: Ma (mother), I think I would be telling lies if I say to you I know what happened. I was very young during this time. My brother who died in 1996 would be able to tell you the story than me. I have read and also heard about the events surrounding my father's death.

I do remember though, my mother hiding us from the police when I was young. We would sleep in neighbours' houses. We did not know nor

understand what was happening.

Now that I am older and at high school, I worry a lot when my mother cannot afford my school fees or uniforms and books. I feel the absence of my father very much. Sometimes I lie awake the whole night dreaming about how I will be able to help my mother, worse if I do not finish school. It is very hard. It was worse when my brother was stabbed to death. I wanted to die myself. We were so close. He was my role model too, very neat and energetic. He was always sensitive to our needs at home. I cursed the day of his death, I curse the township life which contributed to the hooliganism that took my brother away from us.

I have got to grips of what happened to my father as I listened to my mother's testimony during the TRC. I felt pain inside, this affected my school work, as I failed my examinations. My class teacher consoled me when I explained my concerns. At least things are improving for me at school now. I can forgive the police who killed my father but they have to tell us the truth about his whereabouts of his remains. I don't believe this story they are telling us now.

I think the TRC has done a good job by organising that these police come forward to give us this clue. Not only for me and my mother but for others as well in this country. I hope I can have money to study and finish school so that I help my mother who is struggling to make ends meet. I'm having my hopes on the compensation the TRC promised my mother, but the question is when will that happen? My dad would have loved to see me studying and become an important person. I'll work hard to make him proud wherever he is.

RESEARCHER:

I want you to tell me about your experience of having your father disappear and his subsequent death in prison. Tell me what happened, how it affected you and what you felt during and after the incident.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

- 1 Mama! (mother) I think I would be telling lies if I say to you I know what happened. I was very young during this time. My brother who died in 1996 would be able to tell you the story than me. I have read and also heard about the events surrounding my father's death. I do remember though, my mother hiding us from the police when I was young. We would sleep in neighbours' houses. We did not know or understand what was happening.
- 2 Now that I am older and at high school, I worry a lot when my mother cannot afford my school fees or uniforms and books. I feel the absence of my father very much. Sometimes I lie awake the whole night dreaming about how I will be able to help my mother, worse if I do not finish school. It is very hard.
- 3 It was worse when my brother was stabbed to death. I wanted to die myself. We were so close. He was my role model too, very neat and energetic. He was always sensitive to our needs at home. I cursed the day of his death. I curse the township life which contributed to the hooliganism that took my brother away from us.
- 4 I have got grips of what happened to my father as I listened to my mother's testimony during the TRC. I felt pain inside, this affected my school work as I failed my examinations. My class teacher consoled me when I explained my concerns.
- 5 At least things are improving for me at school now. I can forgive the police who killed my father but they have to tell the truth about the whereabouts of his remains. I do not believe this story they are telling us now.
- 6 I think the TRC has done a good job by organizing that the police come forward to give us this clue. Not only for me and my mother but for others as well in this country.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

- Though younger when his father disappeared Terrence seems to have a recollection of memories regarding activities undertaken by his mother to protect them from the public.
- Terrence's understanding of life without a father seems too hard for him and his mother.
- Terrence seems to have been emotionally aroused by the death of his brother.
- Terrence's understanding of circumstances of the death of his father that emerged from the TRC had a negative effect on his school performance.
- Terrence feels better with school work but emphasizes his willingness to forgive those involved in his father's death if they tell the whole truth.
- Terrence praises the TRC's work for all those involved as information about their families was revealed.

NATURAL MEANING UNITS

7 I hope I can have money to study and finish school so that I help my mother who is struggling to make ends meet. I'm having my hopes on the compensation the TRC promised my mother, but the question is when will that happen? My dad would have loved to see me studying and become an important person. I'll work hard to make him proud wherever he is.

ESSENTIAL THEMES

Terrence's ambitions to study to help his mother seem to be filled with uncertainty if reparation will occur.

SITUATED STRUCTURE

ZELDA'S FAMILY

Both Zelda and her son seem to experience the loss of their family members differently. While Zelda thought about the possibility of her husband's arrest during the political turmoil, Terrence was a small child who didn't understand what happened.

Although Zelda dismisses the possibility of her husband's death, she becomes fearful of these consequences. Although her husband disappears while Zelda is convalescing from severe burns of the body, she tries hard to take care of her two sons.

The police harassment, such as being subjected to torture while detained, play on Zelda's emotions that are already vulnerable as she becomes helpless. Although she does not give up, as she searches for her husband, her fears of his death become intense. She experiences feelings of both anger and sadness. Terrence, on the other hand, feels the effects of an absent father when demands from school cannot be fulfilled by his mother.

Zelda's anguish is influenced further by the tragic death of her eldest son in township violence. This causes her to regret the life without a husband while Terrence loses a role model.

The news of her husband's disappearance have a severe impact on the family as they experience shock and devastation. Zelda experiences an incomplete sense of mourning rituals as the remains of her husband are never traced. The family feels humiliated about their conditions of living.

Zelda is thankful for the TRC process which brought the evidence of her husband's disappearance to the fore, but sceptical about the capability of the present delivery system to help the families to live. She finds solace in her spiritual meaning of living as she and her son are positive about forgiveness in order to live a meaningful life.

REFERENCES

- Aanstoos, M. (Ed). (1984). *Exploring the lived world. Readings in phenomenological psychology*, Vol XXIII. Pittsburgh: Duquesne University Press.
- Arendt, H. (1970). *On violence*. London: Allen Lane.
- Asmal, K. (1996). (Asmal, L. & Roberts, R.S. (1996)). *Reconciliation through Truth: A Reckoning of Apartheid's Crucial Governance*. Claremont: David Philip Publishers (Pty) Ltd.
- Bernades, J. (1985b). "Family Ideology": identification and exploration'. *Sociological Review*, 33(2):275-97.
- Bernades, J. (1988a). Whose 'family'? A note on the changing sociological construct of the family. *The Sociological Review*, 36, 267-272.
- Berry, J.W., Segall, M.H. & Kagitcibasi, C. (1997) (Eds.). *Handbook of Cross-Cultural Psychology* Second Edition, Volume 3, Boston: Allyn & Bacon.
- Biko, S.B. (1978). *I write what I like*. London: The Baverdean Press.
- Boraine, A. (1995). *Truth and Reconciliation Commission: Rondebosch: Justice in Transition* on behalf of the Ministry of Justice.
- Bulhan, H.A. (1985). *Frantz Fanon and the Psychology of Oppression*. New York: Plenum Press.
- Bunsee, B. (1998). Reparations will help our healing. *Sowetan*, Thursday, October 29, 1998, p13.
- Burlew, A.K.H., Banks, W.C., McAdoo, H.P. & Ajamiya-Azibo, D. (Eds). (1992). *African American Psychology*. New York: Sage.
- Burman, S. & Reynolds, P. (Eds). (1986). *Growing up in a divided society: The context of childhood in South Africa*. Johannesburg: Raven.
- Butchart, A. & Nell, V. (1989). Studying violence in a South African City. *Clinical Health*, (28), 44-49.
- Chikane, F. (1987). Children in Turmoil. The effects of unrest on township children. In Burman, S. & Reynolds, P. (Eds). (1986). *Growing up in a divided society*. Illinois: North Western University Press.
- Cleaver, G. (1988). A phenomenological analysis of victimization. The experience of having one's house attacked and damaged. *South African Journal of Psychology*, 18, (3), 76-83.
- Cock, J. 1990. Political violence. In: McKendrick, B.W. & Hoffmann, W. (Eds). (1990). *People and violence in South Africa*. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.
- Cone, I. (1975). *God of oppressed*. New York: Seabury Press.

- Dangor, Z. (1990). *Violence against women*. Paper presented at the Apartheid and Crisis in Psychology Workshop in Cape Town.
- Davidson, B. (1992). *The black man's burden. Africa and the curse of the nation state*. London: James Currey.
- Dawes, A. (1989). Emotional status of children exposed to political violence in the cross-roads squatter area during 1986/87. *Psychology in Society*, 12, 33-47.
- Dawes, A. (1998). Psychologies for liberation. Views from elsewhere. A paper prepared for Christie, D., Wagner, R., & Winter, D. (Eds). *Peace, conflict and violence. Peace Psychology for the 21st century*. Cape Town. UCT Press.
- De Koning, A. (1979). The qualitative method of research in the phenomenology of suspicion. In: A. Giorgi, R. Knowles & D. Smith (Eds). (1979). *Duquesne studies in Phenomenological Psychology*, Vol 3, (pp 135-158). Pittsburgh: Duquesne University Press.
- De la Rey, C. & Owens, I. (1998). Perceptions of Psychosocial Healing and the Truth and Reconciliation Commission in South Africa. *Peace and Conflict: Journal of Peace Psychology*, 4, (3), 257-270.
- Degenaar, J. (1990). The concept of violence. In: N.C. Manganyi and A. du Toit, (Eds). (1990). *Political violence and the struggle in South Africa*. (Pp 71-85). Halfway House: Southern Books.
- De Ridder, T. (1998). Tension between individual and collective healing: A psychological perspective of some deponents' experience of the Truth & Reconciliation Commission. Paper delivered at the annual Psychological Society of South Africa (PSYSSA) Conference, Cape Town, September.
- Evening Post, *Promises must be honoured*, 28 March 2000, p4.
- Fanon, F. (1967a). *Black skies and white masks*. New York: Grove Press.
- Fanon, F. (1967b). *Toward the African revolution*. New York: Grove Press.
- Fanon, F. (1968). *The wretched of the earth*. New York: Grove Press.
- Foster, D. (1991). Introduction. In: Foster, D., and Louw-Potgieter, J. (Eds). (1991). *Social Psychology in South Africa*. Johannesburg: Lexicon.
- Fraser, M. (1974). *Children in Conflict*. England: Penguin Books.
- Frescura, L. (1996). What is the Truth and Reconciliation Commission? Paper presented at Port Elizabeth, Human Rights Workshop, October 1996. Pretoria: The Lawyer's Committee for Human Rights.
- Garmezzy, N. & Rutter, M. (1985). Acute reactions to stress. In: Rutter, M. & Hernov, L. (Eds). (1985). *Child and adolescent psychiatry: Modern approaches*, Oxford: Blackwell.

- Geofeugos, A.J. & Moneli, C. (1983). The testimony of political repression as a therapeutic instrument. *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry*, 53, 43-53.
- Gibson, K. (1989). Children in political violence. *Social Science and Medicine*, 28, 659-667.
- Giorgi, A. (1975). An application of phenomenological method in psychology. In: A. Giorgi, C. Fischer & E. Murray (Eds) (1975). *Duquesne studies in Phenomenological Psychology*, Vol 12, (pp 82-103). Pittsburgh: Duquesne University Press.
- Giorgi, A. (1970). Toward a phenomenologically based research in psychology. *Journal of Phenomenological Psychology*, 11, (1), 75-98.
- Giorgi, A., Knowles, R. & Smith, D. (Eds). (1979). *Duquesne Studies in Phenomenological Psychology*, Vol 13. Pittsburgh: Duquesne University Press.
- Giorgi, A. (1983). Concerning the possibility of phenomenological psychological research. *Journal of Phenomenological Psychology*, 14, 2.
- Glanz, L.E. & Spiegel, D. (Eds). (1996). *Violence and family life in contemporary South Africa: Research and Policy issues*. Pretoria: HSRC Publishers.
- Gobodo-Madikizela, P. (1997). Healing the racial divide? Personal reflections in the Truth and Reconciliation Commission. *South African Journal of Psychology*, 27, 4, 271-272.
- Gurr, T.R. (1970). *Why men rebel*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press
- Halling, S. & Leifer, M. (1991). The Theory and practice of dialogal research. *Journal of Phenomenological Psychology*, 22, (1), 1-15.
- Halling, S., Kunz, G.D. & Rowe, J.Q. (1994). The contributions of dialogal psychology to phenomenological research. *Journal of Humanistic Psychology*, 34(1), 109-131.
- Hayes, G. (1998). We suffer our memories: Thinking about the past, healing and reconciliation. *American Imago: Psycho-analysis culture*. Volume 55, 1, Spring 1999, South Africa: James Say & Donald Moss (special editors).
- Haysom, N. (1986). Mabangalala: The rise of Right-Wing vigilantes in South Africa. *Occasional Paper No 10*. Johannesburg: Centre for Applied Legal Studies.
- Hoffmann, W. (1990). Social work practice in family and children's services. In: B.W. McKendrick, (Ed). *Social Work in Action*. Pretoria: HAUM.
- Hough, M. (1984). Institute for Strategy Studies Review, August 1984.
- Jordaan, W. & Jordaan, J. (1998). *People in context*. 3rd Edition. Johannesburg: Heinemann.
- Kane-Berman, J. (1993). *Political violence in South Africa*. Johannesburg: South African Institute of Race Relations.

- Kaufman, I. (1985). Child abuse - family victimology. *Victimology*, 10, (1), 62-71.
- Keeney, B.P. & Ross, J.M. (1992). *Mind in therapy: constructing system family therapies*: Pretoria.
- Kelly, H.H. & Thibault, T.W. (1978). *Interpersonal relations: A theory of interdependence*. New York: Wiley.
- Kimaryo, S. (1993). State of South Africa's children: an agenda for action. *Report from Unicef*, June 1993, 1-29.
- Kotze, D. (1985). Development and structural violence. *Politikum*. Volume 5.
- Krog, A. (1994). Untold damage of Anglo-Boer War. *Democracy in Action*, August 19.
- Kruger, D. (1979). An Introduction to phenomenological psychology. Johannesburg: Juta & Co.
- Kruger, D. (1988). In search of human science psychology. *Journal of South African Psychology*, 18 (1), 1-9.
- Kvale, S. (1996). *Interviews: An introduction to qualitative research interviewing*. London: Sage Publication.
- Kvale, S. (1983). The qualitative research interview: A phenomenological and Hermeneutical mode of understanding. *Journal of Phenomenological Psychology*, Volume 14, 2, 171-196.
- Leeb, W. (1988). Misplaced, displaced and abandoned: the problem of refugees in Pietermaritzburg. A paper presented at the seminar on Political violence organized by the Centre of Adult Education at the University of Natal, Pietermaritzburg. (18-04-1988).
- Leifer, M. (1986). *The dialogical approach to phenomenological research*. Papers presented at the Fifth International Human Sciences Research Conference. Berkeley, L.A.
- Lubbe, T. (1996). Victims, perpetrators and healers at the Truth and Reconciliation Commission. *Being in the same book*. Paper produced from a daily documentation of events during the TRC sessions in Cape Town.
- Lyons, H. A. (1971). Psychiatric sequelae of the Belfast riots. *British Journal of Psychiatry*, 118, 265-273.
- Mamdani, M. (1996). *Citizen and subject. Contemporary Africa and the legacy of late colonialism*. London: James Currey.
- Manganyi, C.N. (1976). *Being Black in the world*. Johannesburg: Ravan Press
- Manganyi, C.N. (1990). Crowds and their vicissitudes: Psychology and Law in the South African courtroom. In: Manganyi, C.N. & Du Toit, A. (Eds) (1990). *Political violence and the struggle in South Africa*. Johannesburg: Southcom.
- Mashabela, H. (1988). *Townships of the PWV*. Johannesburg: S.A. Institute of Race Relations.

- McKendrick, B. & Hoffmann, W. (Eds). (1990). *People and violence in South Africa*. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.
- McWhirter, L. (1983). Looking back and looking forward: an inside perspective. In Harbison, J. (Ed). (1983). *Children of the Troubles - children in Northern Ireland*. Stanmillis College: Belfast Learning Resource.
- Minnaar, A. (1992b). 'Undisputed Kings', warlordism in Natal. In: Minnaar, A. (Ed) (1992). *Patterns of violence case studies of conflict in Natal*. Pretoria: HSRC.
- Mohr, J.C.B. (1958). "Politik ds Beruf" Gesammelt Politische Schriften Tubingen.
- Moustakas, C. (1994). *Phenomenological research methods*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Napier, N.J. (1993). Living our stories. Discovering and replacing limiting family myths. In: C. Simpkinson & A. Simpkinson. (1993). (Eds.). *Sacred stories*. San Francisco: Harper Collins.
- Natal Witness. (1994). 18 May, 1994, 'May a Massacre' in Kwa-Zulu Natal.
- Ndaba-Ndaba, G.C. (1987). *Crimes of violence in black townships*. Durban: Butterworth Publishers.
- Nuttall, S. & Coetzee, C. (1968). (Eds). *Negotiating the past. The making of memory in South Africa*. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.
- Owens, I. (1996). *Reconstruction of the nation: Embracing the multiple paths of healing*. Unpublished psychology honours research project. University of Cape Town.
- Patton, M.Q. (1990). *Qualitative evaluation and research methods* (2nd edition). London: Sage Publications.
- Peltzer, K. (1995). *Psychology and health in African cultures: examples of ethmopschotherapeutic practice*. Frankfurt: IKO-verslug für Interkulturelle Kommunikation.
- Rabinowitz, S. (1988). *The impact of exposure to civil unrest on childrens' evaluation of violence*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, University of Cape Town.
- Ramphela, M. (1996). Political widowhood in South Africa. The embodiment of ambiguity. *Daedus*, 125, (1) 99-117.
- Raviv, A. & Klingman, A. (1983). Children under stress. In: S. Breznitz (1983) (Ed). *Stress in Israel*. New York: Van Nostrand.
- Reicher, S. (1987). Crowd behaviour as social action. In: Turner, J. (Ed) (1987). *Rediscovering the social group: A self-categorisation theory*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Reynolds, P. (1985). 'The ground of all making, state violence, the family and political activist'. *Co-operative Research Programme in Marriage and Family Life*. Pretoria: HSRC.

- Rowe, J.O., Halling, S., Davies, E., Leifer, M. Powers, D. & von Bronkhorst, J. (1989). The Psychology of Forgiving Another: A Dialogal Research Approach. In Valle, R.S. & Halling, S. (1989) (Eds). *Existential-Phenomenological Perspectives in Psychology. Exploring the Breadth of Human Experience*. New York: Plenum Press.
- Schafer, R. (1982). *The analytic attitude*. New York: Basic Books.
- Scheper-Hughes, N. (1994). Who's the killer? Popular justice and human rights in a new squatter camp. Paper read at the African Studies Seminar, University of Cape Town, 25 May 1994.
- Schramm, W.K. & Shuda, S. (1991). The perceptual field of participants in student violence. *South African Journal of Psychology*, 21, 84-89.
- Schutte, G. (1983). *Familiars and strangers: Empirical social research as social relationship*. Inaugural lecture. Johannesburg: Witwatersrand University Press.
- Seedat, M., Cloete, N. & Shochet, I. (1988). Community Psychology: panic or panacea: *Psychology in Society*, 11, 39-54.
- Siann, G. (1985). *Accounting for aggression: perspectives on aggression and violence*. Boston: Allen and Unwin.
- Snare, A. (1984). Sexual violence against women. A Scandanavian perspective. *Victimology*, 9, (2). 195-210.
- Soal, J. & Kottler, A. (1996). Damaged, deficient or determined? Deconstructing narratives in family therapy. *South African Journal of Psychology*, 26, 3, 123-134.
- Spence, D. (1982). *Narrative truth and historical truth*. New York: Norton.
- Stadler, A. (1987). *The political economy of modern South Africa*. Cape Town: David Phillips.
- Stones, C. (1988). Research: Towards a phenomenological praxis. In: D. Kruger, *An Introduction to phenomenological psychology*, Chapter 4, (pp 141-156). Cape Town: Juta & Co.
- Swartz, L. & Levett, A. (1989). Political repression and children in South Africa. The Social Construction of damaging effects. *Social Science and Medicine*, 28, 741-750.
- Swartz, L. (1998). *Culture and mental health: A Southern African view*. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.
- Swartz, L & Drennan, G. (1999). *The cultural construction of healing in the Truth and Reconciliation Commission: implications for mental health practice*. Cape Town: UCT Press (unpublished paper).

- Tajfel, H. (1972). Experiments in a vacuum. In: Israel & H. Tajfel (Eds) (1992). *The context of social psychology*. London: Academic Press.
- Turner, J. (1982). Towards a cognitive redefinition of the social group. In: H. Tajfel, (Ed) (1982). *Social identity and intergroup relations*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Turton, R. W. (1986). *Stressful life events and illness among urban blacks*. Unpublished Masters' dissertation. University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg.
- Turton, R., Straker, G. & Moosa, F. (1991). Experiences of violence in the lives of township youths in 'unrest' and 'normal' conditions. *South African Journal of Psychology*, 21, 2, 77-84.
- Tutu, D. (1999). *No future without forgiveness*. Parow East: CTP Book Printers (Pty) Ltd.
- Valle, R. & Halling, S. (1989). *Existential-phenomenological perspectives in psychology: Exploring the breadth of human experience*. New York: Plenum Press.
- Viljoen, S. (1987). Family structure and support networks: situating the theme theoretically and empirically in the South African context. In: Steyn, A.F. et al (Eds). *Marriage and family life in South Africa: research priorities*. Pretoria: HSRC.
- Wertz, F.J. (1985). Methods and findings in a phenomenological psychological study of a complex life event. Being criminally victimized. In A. Giorgi (1985) (Ed.). *Phenomenology and psychological research*. Pittsburgh: Duquesne University Press.
- Wertz, F.J. (1984). Procedure in phenomenological research and the question of validity. In: M. Aanstoos (Ed). (1984). *Exploring the lived world readings in phenomenological psychology*, (Vol XXIII). Pittsburgh: Duquesne University Press.
- Westermeyer, J. (1987). Cultural factors in clinical assessment. *Journal of Counselling and Clinical Psychology*, 55, 471-478.
- Young-Rifai, M.A. (1979). Victimology: A theoretical framework. In H.S. Schneider, (1979) (Ed). *The victim in international perspective*. New York: Wiley.
- Ziv, A. & Israeli, R. (1973). Effects of bombardment on the manifest anxiety level of children living in Kibbutzim. *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology*, 40, 287-291.